

PRINCIPLES
OF EUROPEAN
CONSTITUTIONAL
LAW

REVISED SECOND EDITION

Edited by
Armin von Bogdandy
and Jürgen Bast

Hart · CH Beck · Nomos

Principles of European Constitutional Law

Second Revised Edition

Edited by
Armin von Bogdandy
and
Jürgen Bast



• HART •
PUBLISHING



Verlag CH Beck

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530 Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Co-published with Verlag CH Beck oHG,
Wilhelmstraße 9
80801 München
Germany
Email: bestellung@beck.de

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA

Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
E-mail: orders@isbs.com
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© The editors and contributors severally 2010

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright,
Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a
retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior
permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms
agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning
reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart
Publishing at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84113-822-0 (Hart Publishing)
ISBN: 978-3-406-59584-4 (Verlag CH Beck)

Typeset by Forewords, Oxford
Printed in the UK by CPI William Clowes Beccles NR34 7TL

PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

For the time being, the political project of basing the European Union on a document entitled 'Constitution' has failed. The second, revised and enlarged edition of this volume retains its title nonetheless. Building on a scholarly rather than black-letter law account, it shows European constitutional law as it presently stands and as it will look following the Treaty of Lisbon, with the EU's foundational treaties mandating the exercise of public authority, establishing a hierarchy of norms and legitimising legal acts, providing for citizenship, and granting fundamental rights. In this way the treaties shape the relations between legal orders, between public interest regulation and market economy, and between law and politics. The contributions demonstrate in detail how a constitutional approach furthers understanding of the core issues of EU law, how it offers theoretical and doctrinal insights, and how it adds critical perspective.

Armin von Bogdandy is director at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg.

Jürgen Bast is a senior research fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg.

From Reviews of the First Edition

'... should be mandatory reading for anyone who wants to get a holistic perspective of the academic debate on Europe's constitutional foundations. ... It is impossible to present the richness of thought contained in the 833 pages of the book in a short review.'

Common Market Law Review

'an enduring scholarly work, which gives an English-speaking audience important, and overdue, access to the long-standing and forever-vigorous traditions of (European) constitutional law ... unhesitatingly recommend[ed].'

European Law Journal

'... real scholarship in the profound sense of the word ...'

K Lenaerts, Professor of European Law, Leuven

Preface

The friendly reception of this book's German as well as English edition has encouraged its second edition six years after it first appeared. It handles the developments of the subject and takes up suggestions that arose from the many reviews. This requires considerations that go beyond the scope of a preface; the new introduction on *The Constitutional Approach to EU Law* is dedicated to them.

At this place it remains to express our gratitude and appreciations. This project continues to be indebted to the Fritz Thyssen Stiftung. Again it enabled the authors' co-operation in a generous and unbureaucratic manner. The editorial team was headed by Franziska Sucker, acting jointly with the signers. It consisted of Victoria Beinert, Nicole Betz, Anuscheh Farahat, Felix Hanschmann, Marc Jacob, Daniel Oberhofer, Johannes Pötzl, Maja Smrkolj, Ingo Venzke, and Christian Wohlfahrt. Marc Jacob, Grant Van Eaton, and Naila Widmaier have been proof-reading the draft English versions.

Armin von Bogdandy and Jürgen Bast
Heidelberg, March 2008

List of Contributors

- Dr Jürgen Bast, Dipl-Soz, Senior Research Fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg.
- Dr Armin von Bogdandy, MA, Director at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg, Professor of Public Law at the Goethe-University of Frankfurt/Main.
- Dr Philipp Dann, LL.M. (Harvard), Senior Research Fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and Public International Law, Heidelberg, Schumpeter-Fellow of the Volkswagen Foundation.
- Dr. Josef Drexler, LL.M. (Berkeley), Managing Director at the Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law, Munich, Professor at the University of Munich.
- Dr Dr hc Ulrich Everling, Professor at the University of Bonn, former Judge at the European Court of Justice.
- Dr Dr Christoph Grabenwarter, Professor of Public Law, Business Law and International Law at the Vienna University of Economics, Judge at the Constitutional Court of Austria.
- Dr Ulrich Haltern, LL.M. (Yale), Professor of German and European Constitutional and Administrative Law and Director of the Institute for National and Transnational Integration Studies of the Leibniz University of Hanover.
- Dr Armin Hatje, Professor of Public Law, European and International Law and Managing Director of the Department of European Community Law Seminar at the University of Hamburg.
- Dr Stefan Kadelbach, LL.M. (Virginia), Professor of Public Law, European Law and International Law and Co-Director of the Wilhelm Merton Center for European Integration and International Economic Order at the Goethe-University, Frankfurt/Main.
- Dr Thorsten Kingreen, Professor of Public Law, Social and Health Law at the University of Regensburg.
- Dr Dr hc Paul Kirchhof, Professor of Public Law and Director of the Institute for Financial and Tax Law at the University of Heidelberg, former Judge at the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany.
- Dr Jürgen Kühling, LL.M. (Brussels), Professor of Public Law and Real Estate Law at the University of Regensburg.
- Dr Franz C Mayer, LL.M. (Yale), Professor of Public Law, European Law, International Law, Comparative Law and Legal Policy at the University of Bielefeld.
- Dr Christoph Möllers, LL.M. (Chicago), Professor of Public Law, Comparative Law and Constitutional Theory at the University of Göttingen.
- Dr Dr Jörg Monar, Professor of Contemporary European Studies and Co-Director of Sussex European Institute at the University of Sussex, Director of Studies at the College of Europe, Brussels.
- Dr Martin Nettesheim, Professor of Constitutional and Administrative Law, International Law, European Law and Foreign Policy at the University of Tübingen.

Dr Stefan Oeter, Professor of German and Comparative Public Law and International Law and Director of the Institute for International Affairs at the University of Hamburg.

Dr Florian Rödl, MA, Head of Junior Research Group at the Cluster of Excellence 'The Formation of Normative Orders' at the Goethe-University of Frankfurt/Main.

Dr Daniel Thym, LL.M (London), Private Lecturer and Senior Research Associate at the Walter Hallstein-Institute for European Constitutional Law, Humboldt-University, Berlin.

Dr Robert Uerpmann-Witzack, maître en droit, Professor of Public Law and International Law at the University of Regensburg.

Dr Dr hc Manfred Zuleeg, Professor Emeritus of Public Law at the Goethe-University of Frankfurt/Main, former Judge at the European Court of Justice.

Table of Cases

European Court of Justice (Judgments and Orders)

8/55 Fédéchar v High Authority [1956] ECR 245	778
7/56 and 3/57–7/57 Algera et al v Common Assembly [1957] ECR 39	349, 378
9/56 Meroni v High Authority [1958] ECR 133	36, 45, 198
36/59–38/59 and 40/59 Geitling v High Authority [1960] ECR 887	483
7/61 Commission v Italy [1961] ECR 317	17
17/61 and 20/61 Klöckner-Werke at al v High Authority [1962] ECR 325	511
16/62 and 17/62 Confédération nationale des producteurs de fruits et légumes et al v Council [1962] ECR 471	352, 371, 396
24/62 Germany v Commission [1963] ECR 63	384
25/62 Plaumann v Commission [1963] ECR 95	366
26/62 van Gend en Loos [1963] ECR 1	15, 23, 29, 39, 94, 320, 409, 443, 520, 596, 677, 779
23/63, 24/63 and 52/63 Usines Émile Henricot et al v High Authority [1963] ECR 467	349
90/63 and 91/63 Commission v Belgium and Luxembourg [1964] ECR 625	35, 279, 369
111/63 Lemmerz-Werke v High Authority [1965] ECR 677	281, 379
6/64 Costa v ENEL [1964] ECR 585	23, 29–30, 32, 39, 84, 94–5, 161, 189, 320–1, 351, 409, 426, 432, 443, 520, 777
56/64 and 58/64 Grundig et al v Commission [1966] ECR 299	671
16/65 Schwarze [1965] ECR 877	352
56/65 Société Technique Minière [1966] ECR 235	671
8/66–11/66 Cimenteries CBR Cementbedrijven et al v Commission [1967] ECR 75	369, 371, 384
2/67 De Moor [1967] ECR 197	405
6/67 Guerra [1967] ECR 219	405
14/67 Welchner [1967] ECR 331	403
17/67 Neumann [1967] ECR 441	403
22/67 Goffart [1967] ECR 321	405
5/68 Sayag [1968] ECR 395	405
6/68 Watenstedt v Council [1968] ECR 409	371
14/68 Walt Wilhelm [1969] ECR 1	295, 306, 408
2/69 and 3/69 Brachfeld [1969] ECR 211	779
15/69 Südmilch [1969] ECR 363	403
29/69 Stauder [1969] ECR 419	446, 483, 497, 596
38/69 Commission v Italy [1970] ECR 47	35, 280
40/69 Bollmann [1970] ECR 69	351
41/69 ACF Chemiefarma v Commission [1970] ECR 661	377
48/69 ICI v Commission [1972] ECR 619	383
9/70 Grad [1970] ECR 825	29, 355

11/70 Internationale Handelsgesellschaft [1970] ECR 1125	84, 94–5, 409, 464, 484, 496, 523
22/70 Commission v Council [1971] ECR 263	192, 282, 290–1, 309, 317–18, 368–9, 384
25/70 Köster [1970] ECR 1161	36, 351, 483
30/70 Scheer [1970] ECR 1197	378
34/70 Syndicat national du commerce extérieur des céréales [1970] ECR 1233	405
36/70 Getreide-Import [1970] ECR 1107	403
41/70–44/70 International Fruit Company et al v Commission [1971] ECR 411	371
78/70 Deutsche Grammophon [1971] ECR 487	546
93/71 Leonasio [1972] ECR 287	408
6/72 Europemballage et al v Commission [1973] ECR 215	613, 664, 666
21/72–24/72 International Fruit Company [1972] ECR 1219	144, 149, 321
39/72 Commission v Italy [1973] ECR 101	54, 351
57/72 Westzucker [1973] ECR 321	37
4/73 Nold v Commission [1974] ECR 491	156, 496, 504
5/73 Balkan-Import-Export [1973] ECR 1091	352
34/73 Variola [1974] ECR 981	351
36/73 Nederlandse Spoorwegen [1973] ECR 1299	405
181/73 Haegeman [1974] ECR 449	30, 139, 321
185/73 König [1974] ECR 607	351
2/74 Reyners [1974] ECR 631	446, 599
8/74 Dassonville [1974] ECR 837	520, 535
9/74 Casagrande [1974] ECR 773	286
15/74 Centrafarm [1974] ECR 1147	405
16/74 Centrafarm [1974] ECR 1183	546
32/74 Haaga [1974] ECR 1201	403
33/74 van Binsbergen [1974] ECR 1299	446, 520, 599
36/74 Walrave [1974] ECR 1405	545–6
41/74 van Duyn [1974] ECR 1337	322, 355, 446, 599, 779
100/74 CAM v Commission [1975] ECR 1393	372
43/75 Defrenne [1976] ECR 455	35, 192, 223, 279, 629
59/75 Manghera [1976] ECR 91	192, 279
87/75 Bresciani [1976] ECR 129	142
113/75 Frescassetti [1976] ECR 983	369
119/75 Terrapin [1976] ECR 1039	546
3/76, 4/76 and 6/76 Kramer [1976] ECR 1279	289, 318
13/76 Donà [1976] ECR 1333	545–6
15/76 and 16/76 France v Commission [1979] ECR 321	384, 775
33/76 Rewe [1976] ECR 1989	359
41/76 Donckerwolcke [1976] ECR 1921	289
87/76 Hoffmann-La Roche v Commission [1979] ECR 461	666
101/76 Koninklijke Scholten Honig v Council [1977] ECR 797	372, 396
114/76 Bela-Mills [1977] ECR 1211	614
114/76 Bela-Mühle Josef Bergmann [1977] ECR 1211	773
38/77 Enka [1977] ECR 2203	357
87/77 Salerno et al v Commission and Council [1985] ECR 2523	371
94/77 Zerbone [1978] ECR 99	351

106/77 Simmenthal II [1978] ECR 629	84, 94, 359, 409, 777
123/77 UNICME et al v Council [1978] ECR 845	352
26/78 Viola [1978] ECR 1771	278
31/78 Bussone [1978] ECR 2429	351
83/78 Pigs Marketing Board [1978] ECR 2347	599
92/78 Simmenthal v Commission [1979] ECR 777	30, 354
98/78 Racke [1979] ECR 69	383, 504
101/78 Granaria [1979] ECR 623	779
110/78 and 111/78 van Wesemael [1979] ECR 35	538
120/78 Rewe [1979] ECR 649	521, 538, 541
138/78 Stölting [1979] ECR 713	607
141/78 France v UK [1979] ECR 2923	387
151/78 Sukkerfabriken Nykøbing [1979] ECR 1	405
175/78 Saunders [1979] ECR 1129	453
230/78 Eridania [1979] ECR 2749	351
32/79 Commission v UK [1980] ECR 2403	38, 318
34/79 Henn and Darby [1979] ECR 3795	405
44/79 Hauer [1979] ECR 3727	156, 496, 598, 768
61/79 Denkvit Italiana [1980] 1205	358
66/79 Salumi [1980] ECR 1237	774
138/79 Roquette Frères v Council [1980] ECR 3333	36, 47, 372, 378, 723, 772
789/79 and 790/79 Calpak et al v Commission [1980] ECR 1949	372
804/79 Commission v UK [1981] ECR 1045	289–90
58/80 Dansk Supermarked [1981] ECR 181	546
66/80 International Chemical [1981] ECR 1191	354
113/80 Commission v Ireland [1981] ECR 1625	17, 539
155/80 Oebel [1981] ECR I-1993	649
169/80 Gondrand Frères [1981] ECR 1931	504
182/80 Gauff v Commission [1982] ECR 799	369
188/80–190/80 France et al v Commission [1982] ECR 2545	377
203/80 Casati [1981] ECR 2595	515
270/80 Polydor [1982] ECR 329	322
279/80 Webb [1981] ECR 3305	648
8/81 Becker [1982] ECR 53	30, 355, 779
15/81 Gaston Schul [1982] ECR 1409	525
45/81 Moksels v Commission [1982] ECR 1129	371
60/81 IBM v Commission [1981] ECR 2639	371
76/81 Transporoute [1982] ECR 417	405
104/81 Kupferberg [1982] ECR 3641	137, 139, 323
108/81 Amylum v Council [1982] ECR 3109	607
230/81 Luxembourg v Parliament [1983] ECR 255	41–2, 281, 774
231/81 Spijker Kwasten v Commission [1983] ECR 2559	352
261/81 Rau [1982] ECR 3961	540
283/81 CILFIT [1982] ECR 3415	402
307/81 Alusuisse Italia v Commission and Council [1982] ECR 3463	372
96/82 et al NV IAZ International Belgium et al v Commission [1983] ECR 3369	384

168/82 Ferriere Sant'Anna [1983] ECR 1681	353
205/82–215/82 Deutsche Milchkontor [1983] ECR 2633	30
237/82 Jongeneel Kaas [1984] ECR 483	351
239/82 and 275/82 Allied et al v Commission [1984] ECR 1005	372
264/82 Timex v Council [1985] ECR 849	372
286/82 and 26/83 Luisi [1985] ECR 377	447
13/83 Parliament v Council [1985] ECR 1513	37, 602
14/83 von Colson [1984] ECR 1891	356, 778
15/83 Denkavit [1984] ECR 2171	543
16/83 Prantl [1984] ECR 1299	540
37/83 Rewe-Zentral [1984] ECR 1229	355, 614
69/83 Lux v Court of Auditors [1984] ECR 2447	376
70/83 Kloppenburg [1984] ECR 1075	355
107/83 Klopp [1984] ECR 2971	520
117/83 Könecke [1984] ECR 3291	504
142/83 Nevas [1983] ECR 2969	405
177/83 Kohl [1984] ECR 3651	539
182/83 Fearon [1984] ECR 3677	405
207/83 Commission v UK [1985] 1201	540
229/83 Leclerc [1985] ECR 1	667
254/83 Commission v Italy [1984] ECR 3395	778
294/83 Les Verts v Parliament [1986] ECR 1339	2, 15, 29, 34, 189, 193, 278, 354, 395, 409, 443, 741, 766, 773–4, 777
44/84 Hurd [1986] ECR 29	35, 280, 368, 775
152/84 Marshall [1986] ECR 723	355, 358
175/84 Krohn v Commission [1986] ECR 753	369
178/84 Commission v Germany [1987] ECR 1227	536
205/84 Commission v Germany [1986] ECR 3755	515
216/84 Commission v France [1988] ECR 793	621
222/84 Johnston [1986] ECR 1651	33, 359, 497, 501, 774
5/85 AKZO Chemie v Commission [1986] ECR 2585	258
89/85 et al Ahlström Osakeyhtiö et al v Commission (Cellulose) [1988] ECR 5193	136
281/85 et al Germany et al v Commission [1987] ECR 3203	283, 286, 296
311/85 VVR [1987] ECR 3801	546
314/85 Foto-Frost [1987] ECR 4199	354, 401, 408, 778
407/85 Drei Glocken [1988] ECR 4233	536
12/86 Demirel [1987] ECR 3719	134, 322
14/86 Pretore di Salò [1987] ECR 2545	358
31/86 and 35/86 LAISA et al v Council [1988] ECR 2285	369
45/86 Commission v Council [1987] ECR 1493	292
46/86 Romkes [1987] ECR 2671	380
65/86 Bayer [1988] ECR 5249	546
68/86 UK v Council [1988] ECR 855	35–6, 192, 279
126/86 Giménez Zaera [1987] ECR 3697	53
197/86 Brown [1988] ECR 3205	462
204/86 Greece v Council [1988] ECR 5323	378
222/86 Heylens [1987] ECR 4097	359

292/86 Gullung [1988] ECR 11	451
297/86 CIDA et al v Council [1988] ECR 3531	365
46/87 and 227/88 Hoechst v Commission [1989] ECR 2859.	497, 501, 503, 542, 614, 774
70/87 Fediol v Commission [1989] ECR 1781.	146–7, 365, 372
97/87–99/87 Dow Chemical Ibérica et al v Commission [1989] ECR 3165	157
165/87 Commission v Council [1988] ECR 5545	379
206/87 Lefebvre v Commission [1989] ECR 275	352
235/87 Matteucci [1988] ECR 5589	280, 451
241/87 MacLaine Watson v Council and Commission [1990] ECR I-1797	328
242/87 Commission v Council [1989] ECR 1425	296, 365, 447
265/87 Schröder v Commission [1989] ECR 2237.	510, 773–4
2/88 Imm Zwartveld [1990] ECR I-3365	41, 765, 775
5/88 Wachauf [1989] ECR 2609	162, 223, 329, 497, 504, 777
6/88 and 7/88 Spain v Commission [1989] ECR 3639.	380
8/88 Germany v Commission [1990] ECR I-2321.	774, 779
16/88 Commission v Council [1989] ECR 3457	380
25/88 Wurmser [1989] ECR 1105.	539–40
68/88 Commission v Greece [1989] ECR 2965.	774, 778
70/88 Parliament v Council [1990] ECR I-2041	36, 378, 768
103/88 Fratelli Costanzo [1989] ECR 1839.	779
C-143/88 and C-92/89 Zuckerfabrik Süderdithmarschen [1991] ECR I-415	354, 408, 414, 504, 778
C-145/88 B & Q [1989] ECR 3851	516
C-213/88 and C-39/89 Luxembourg v Parliament [1991] ECR I-5643	775
C-217/88 Commission v Germany [1990] ECR I-2879	775
C-303/88 Italy v Commission [1991] ECR I-1433.	602
C-322/88 Grimaldi [1989] ECR 4407.	296, 356, 369
C-361/88 Commission v Deutschland [1991] ECR I-2567	356
C-366/88 France v Commission [1990] ECR I-3571.	370
C-10/89 CNL-SUCAL [1990] ECR I-3711	598
C-59/89 Commission v Germany [1991] ECR I-2607.	356
C-69/89 Nakajima v Council [1991] ECR I-2069	146–7, 157–8, 328
C-106/89 Marleasing [1990] ECR I-4135	323, 356
C-113/89 Rush Portuguesa [1990] ECR I-1417.	648
C-205/89 Commission v Greece [1991] ECR I-1361.	539
C-213/89 Factortame [1990] ECR I-2433	30, 89, 359, 409, 416, 775, 777
C-244/89 Commission v France [1991] ECR I-163	775, 778
C-248/89 Cargill v Commission [1991] ECR I-2987.	384
C-251/89 Athanasopoulos [1991] ECR I-2797	775
C-260/89 ERT [1991] ECR I-02925	47, 162, 223, 497–8, 543
C-290/89 Commission v Belgium [1991] ECR I-2851.	775
C-298/89 Gibraltar v Council [1993] ECR I-3605	368
C-300/89 Commission v Council [1991] ECR I-2867	47, 50, 378, 772
C-309/89 Codorniu v Council [1994] ECR I-1853	372
C-312/89 Conforama [1991] ECR I-997.	516, 649
C-314/89 Rau [1991] ECR I-1647	16
C-332/89 Merchandise [1991] ECR I-1027.	649

C-353/89 Commission v Netherlands [1991] ECR I-4069.	541
C-369/89 Piageme [1991] ECR I-2971.	402
C-1/90 and C-176/90 Aragonesa [1991] ECR I-4151.	539–41
C-2/90 Commission v Belgium [1992] ECR I-4431.	540
C-6/90 and C-9/90 Francovich [1991] ECR I-5357.	15, 30–1, 323, 356, 361, 778
C-33/90 Commission v Italy [1991] ECR I-5987.	376, 778
C-41/90 Höfner [1991] ECR I-1979.	523
C-62/90 Commission v Germany [1992] ECR I-2575.	498
C-159/90 Society for the Protection of Unborn Children [1991] ECR I-4685.	89, 497, 508
C-208/90 Emmott [1991] ECR I-4269.	31, 356, 779
C-269/90 Technische Universität München [1991] ECR I-5469.	774
C-286/90 Poulsen [1992] ECR I-6019.	136, 329
C-295/90 Parliament v Council [1992] ECR I-4193.	447
C-332/90 Steen [1992] ECR I-341.	523
C-369/90 Micheletti [1992] ECR I-4239.	451
C-2/91 ILO Convention No 170 [1993] ECR I-1061.	291
C-15/91 Commission v Council [1993] ECR I-939.	612
C-31/91 et al Lageder [1993] ECR I-1761.	774
C-72/91 and C-73/91 Sloman Neptun [1993] ECR I-887.	650
C-97/91 Oleificio Borelli v Commission [1992] ECR I-6313.	369
C-98/91 Herbrink [1994] ECR I-223.	16
C-106/91 Ramrath [1992] ECR I-3351.	517
C-112/91 Werner [1993] ECR I-429.	453
C-126/91 Yves Rocher [1993] ECR I-2361.	523
C-168/91 Konstantinidis [1993] ECR I-1191.	222–3, 464, 500
C-181/91 and C-248/91 Parliament v Council and Commission [1993] ECR I-3685.	290, 369
C-188/91 Deutsche Shell [1993] ECR I-363.	369
C-189/91 Kirsammer-Hack [1993] ECR I-6185.	650
C-267/91 and C-268/91 Keck [1993] ECR I-6097.	162–3, 293, 437, 500, 516, 524, 532–7, 539–40, 544, 599
C-320/91 Corbeau [1993] ECR I-2533.	621
C-325/91 France v Commission [1993] ECR I-3283.	376
C-327/91 France v Commission [1994] ECR I-3641.	315, 327
C-2/92 Bostock [1994] ECR I-955.	497
C-13/92 et al Driessen [1993] ECR I-4751.	773
C-37/92 Vanacker [1993] ECR I-4947.	293
C-91/92 Faccini Dori [1994] ECR I-3325.	356
C-93/92 CMC Motorradcenter [1993] ECR I-5009.	516
C-137/92 P Commission v BASF [1994] ECR I-2555.	36, 280, 385
C-188/92 Textilwerke Deggendorf [1994] ECR I-833.	354
C-228/92 Roquette Frères [1994] ECR I-1445.	354
C-292/92 Hünermund [1993] ECR I-6787.	537
C-332/92 et al Eurico Italia [1994] ECR I-711.	775
C-350/92 Spain v Council [1995] ECR I-1985.	612
C-379/92 Peralta [1994] ECR I-3453.	535
C-391/92 Commission v Greece [1995] ECR I-1621.	533

C-393/92 Almelo [1994] ECR I-1477	621
C-404/92 P X v Commission [1994] ECR I-4737	504
C-405/92 Mondiet [1993] ECR I-6133	289
C-431/92 Commission v Germany [1995] ECR I-2189	408
C-9/93 IHT Internationale Heiztechnik [1994] ECR I-2789	546
C-23/93 TV10 [1994] ECR I-4795	498
C-46/93 and C-48/93 Brasserie du pêcheur [1996] ECR I-1029	23, 41
C-51/93 Meyhui [1994] ECR I-3879	543
C-143/93 Van Es Douane Agenten [1996] ECR I-431	376
C-280/93 Germany v Council [1994] ECR I-4973	329, 501
C-306/93 SMW Winzersekt [1994] ECR I-5555	511
C-415/93 Bosman [1995] ECR I-4921	520, 525, 534, 540, 545–6
C-417/93 Parliament v Council [1995] ECR I-1185	380
C-443/93 Vougioukas [1995] ECR I-4033	405
C-450/93 Kalanke [1995] ECR I-3051	119, 511
C-465/93 Atlanta [1995] ECR I-3761	408
C-469/93 Chiquita Italia [1995] ECR I-4533	142
C-473/93 Commission v Luxembourg [1996] ECR I-3207	409
C-476/93 Nutral v Commission [1995] ECR I-4125	243
C-55/94 Gebhard [1995] ECR I-4165	517
C-58/94 Netherlands v Council [1996] ECR I-2169	281, 365
C-70/94 Werner Industrie-Ausrüstungen [1995] ECR I-3189	146
C-83/94 Leifer et al [1995] ECR I-3231	146
C-84/94 UK v Council [1996] ECR I-5755	37
C-96/94 Centro Servizi Spediporto [1995] ECR I-2883	535
C-120/94 Commission v Greece [1996] ECR I-1514	328
C-134/94 Esso Española [1995] ECR I-4241	535
C-157/94 Commission v Spain [1997] ECR I-5699	589
C-158/94 Commission v Italy [1997] ECR I-5789	589
C-159/94 Commission v France [1997] ECR I-5815	589
C-160/94 Commission v Spain [1997] ECR I-5851	589
C-163/94, C-165/94 and C-250/94 Sanz de Lera [1995] ECR I-4821	599
C-178/94 et al Dillenkofer [1996] ECR I-4845	356
C-192/94 El Corte Ingles [1996] ECR I-1281	356
C-214/94 Boukhalfa [1996] ECR I-2253	227
C-233/94 Germany v Parliament and Council [1997] ECR I-2405	37, 329, 594
C-237/94 O'Flynn [1996] ECR I-2617	538
C-253/94 P Roujansky v Council [1995] ECR I-7	34
C-271/94 Parliament v Council [1996] ECR I-1689	35, 279
C-1/95 Gerster [1997] ECR I-5253	118
C-10/95 P Asocarne v Council [1995] ECR I-4149	355
C-34/95, C-35/95 and C-36/95 De Agostini [1997] ECR I-3843	540
C-43/95 Data Delecta [1996] ECR I-4661	406
C-57/95 France v Commission [1997] ECR I-1627	281
C-84/95 Bosphorus [1996] ECR I-3953	327
C-120/95 Decker [1998] ECR I-1831	610

C-188/95 Fantask [1997] ECR I-6783	356
C-259/95 Parliament v Council [1997] ECR I-5303	379
C-261/95 Palmisani [1997] ECR I-4025	30
C-265/95 Commission v France [1997] ECR I-6959	493, 547
C-284/95 Safety Hi-Tech [1998] ECR I-4301	614
C-299/95 Kremzow [1997] ECR I-2629	157, 497
C-341/95 Bettati [1998] ECR I-4355	543
C-368/95 Familiapress [1995] ECR I-3689	493–4, 498, 543
C-392/95 Parliament v Council [1997] ECR I-3213	48
C-409/95 Marschall [1997] ECR I-6363	119, 511
C-51/96 and C-191/97 Deliège [2000] ECR I-2549	545–6
C-53/96 Hermès International [1998] ECR I-3603	140, 146
C-54/96 Dorsch Consult [1997] ECR I-4961	408
C-64/96 Uecker [1997] ECR I-3171	453
C-67/96 Albany [1999] ECR I-5751	650
C-85/96 Martínez Sala [1998] ECR I-2691	227–30, 454–5, 461–2, 658
C-106/96 UK v Commission [1998] ECR I-2729	281, 368
C-114/96 Kieffer [1997] ECR I-3629	543
C-149/96 Portugal v Council [1999] ECR I-8395	53, 138, 141–6, 323, 329, 380, 383
C-157/96 National Farmers' Union [1998] ECR I-2211	614
C-158/96 Kohll [1998] ECR I-1931	610
C-162/96 Racke [1998] ECR I-3655	23, 136–7, 139, 144, 330
C-170/96 Commission v Council [1998] ECR I-2763	360, 565
C-176/96 Lehtonen [2000] ECR I-2681	545–6, 548
C-180/96 UK v Commission [1998] ECR I-2265	614
C-262/96 Sürül [1999] ECR I-2685	446
C-266/96 Corsica Ferries France [1998] ECR I-3949	535
C-274/96 Bickel & Franz [1998] ECR I-7637	228–9, 454, 463, 466
C-326/96 Levez [1998] ECR I-7835	778
C-348/96 Calfa [1999] ECR I-11	405
C-369/96 and C-376/96 Arblade [1999] ECR I-8498	648
C-412/96 Kainuun Liikenne [1998] ECR I-5141	406
C-77/97 Unilever [1999] ECR I-431	778
C-93/97 Fédération belge des chambres syndicales de médecins [1998] ECR I-4837	405
C-107/97 Rombi and Arkopharma [2000] ECR I-3367	357
C-158/97 Badeck [2000] ECR I-1875	511
C-189/97 Parliament v Council [1999] ECR I-4741	325
C-224/97 Ciola [1999] ECR I-2517	31, 540–1
C-241/97 Försäkringsaktiebolaget Skandia [1999] ECR I-1879	406
C-255/97 Pfeiffer [1999] ECR I-2835	538
C-273/97 Sirdar [1999] ECR I-7403	118
C-310/97 P Commission v AssiDomaen Kraft Products et al [1999] ECR I-5363	372
C-378/97 Wijsenbeek [1999] ECR I-6238	228–30, 454–5, 555
C-387/97 Commission v Greece [2000] ECR 5047	776
C-7/98 Krombach [2000] ECR I-1935	502
C-17/98 Emesa Sugar [2000] ECR I-665	437

C-64/98 P Petrides v Commission [1999] ECR I-5187	378
C-165/98 Mazzoleni [2001] ECR I-2213	648
C-174/98 P and C-189/98 P Netherlands v Commission [2000] ECR I-1	502
C-190/98 Graf [2000] ECR I-493	649
C-224/98 d'Hoop [2002] ECR I-6191	229, 463
C-235/98 Pafitis [2000] OJ C63	405
C-281/98 Angonese [2000] ECR I-4139	547
C-285/98 Kreil [2000] ECR I-69	30, 118–19, 286, 409, 414
C-287/98 Linster [2000] ECR I-6719	39
C-300/98 and C-392/98 Dior [2000] ECR I-11307	139, 141, 146
C-376/98 Germany v Parliament and Council [2000] ECR I-8419	28, 35–6, 194, 286, 291–2, 301, 435, 503, 606, 717, 784
C-377/98 Netherlands v Parliament and Council [2001] ECR I-7079	138, 146, 287, 291, 479
C-379/98 PreussenElektra [2001] ECR I-2099	437, 540
C-405/98 Gourmet International Products [2001] ECR I-1795	533, 535
C-407/98 Abrahamsson [2000] ECR I-5539	511
C-423/98 Albore [2000] ECR I-5965	328
C-473/98 Toolex [2000] ECR I-5681	535
C-9/99 Échirolles Distribution [2000] ECR I-8207	596, 667–8
C-29/99 Commission v Council [2002] ECR I-11221	296
C-89/99 Schieving-Nijstad [2001] ECR I-5851	138
C-95/99 et al Khalil [2001] I-7413	292
C-107/99 Italy v Commission [2002] ECR I-1091	385
C-143/99 Adria-Wien Pipeline [2001] ECR I-8365	406
C-157/99 Smits [2001] ECR I-5473	506, 599
C-163/99 Portugal v Commission [2001] ECR I-2613	352
C-164/99 Portugaia Construções [2002] ECR I-787	648
C-169/99 Schwarzkopf [2001] ECR I-5901	543
C-172/99 Liikenne [2001] ECR I-745	406
C-184/99 Grzelczyk [2001] ECR I-6193	54, 229–30, 444, 462, 609, 658
C-192/99 Kaur [2001] ECR I-1237	451
C-239/99 Nachi Europe [2001] ECR I-1197	354
C-255/99 Humer [2002] ECR I-1205	374
C-262/99 Louloudakis [2001] ECR I-5547	506
C-268/99 Jany [2001] ECR I-8615	44
C-274/99 P Connolly v Commission [2001] ECR I-1611	492, 501–2, 508
C-307/99 OGT Fruchthandels-gesellschaft [2001] ECR I-3159	141
C-324/99 Daimler Chrysler [2001] ECR I-9897	293
C-340/99 TNT Traco [2001] ECR I-4112	486
C-364/99 P (R) Senator Lines v Commission [1999] ECR I-8733	437
C-413/99 Baumbast [2002] ECR I-7091	454
C-424/99 Commission v Austria [2001] ECR I-9285	359
C-453/99 Courage [2001] ECR I-6297	677–8, 694
C-20/00 and C-64/00 Booker Aquacultur and Hydro Seafood [2003] ECR I-7411	357
C-27/00 and C-122/00 Omega Air [2003] ECR I-2569	142
C-37/00 Weber [2002] ECR I-2013	136