



CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLITICS

VOLUME ONE

Struggles for Power and Governmental Accountability

SIXTH EDITION

David M. O'Brien



CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLITICS

VOLUME ONE

*Struggles for Power and
Governmental Accountability*

SIXTH EDITION

DAVID M. O'BRIEN

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA



W • W • NORTON & COMPANY • NEW YORK

For Claudine, Benjamin, Sara, and Talia

W. W. Norton & Company has been independent since its founding in 1923, when William Warder Norton and Mary D. Herter Norton first published lectures delivered at the People's Institute, the adult education division of New York City's Cooper Union. The Nortons soon expanded their program beyond the Institute, publishing books by celebrated academics from America and abroad. By mid-century, the two major pillars of Norton's publishing program—trade books and college texts—were firmly established. In the 1950s, the Norton family transferred control of the company to its employees, and today—with a staff of four hundred and a comparable number of trade, college, and professional titles published each year—W. W. Norton & Company stands as the largest and oldest publishing house owned wholly by its employees.

Copyright © 2005, 2003, 2000, 1997, 1995, 1991 by David M. O'Brien

All rights reserved.

Printed in the United States of America.

Composition by PennSet, Inc.

Manufacturing by the Courier Companies—Westford Division.

Book design by Martin Lubin Graphic Design.

Production manager: Benjamin Reynolds.

Drawn art by John McAusland.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

O'Brien, David M.

Constitutional law and politics / David M. O'Brien.— 6th ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Contents: v. 1. Struggles for power and governmental accountability—
v. 2. Civil rights and civil liberties.

ISBN 0-393-92565-X (v. 1 : pbk.) — ISBN 0-393-92566-8 (v. 2 : pbk.)

1. Constitutional law—United States—Cases. 2. Constitutional history—
United States—Cases. 3. Political questions and judicial power—United
States—Cases. 4. Civil rights—United States—Cases. I. Title.

KF4541.A7027 2005

342.73—dc22

2005040573

W. W. Norton & Company, Inc., 500 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10110
www.wwnorton.com

W. W. Norton & Company Ltd., Castle House, 75/76 Wells Street,
London W1T 3QT

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

The Supreme Court, 2003	85
Figure 2.1 Avenues of Appeal	106
Figure 2.2 Jurisdictional Map of the U.S. Courts of Appeal and U.S. District Courts	109
Figure 2.3 Docket and Filings, 1800–2004	171
Page from Docket Book	177
Members of the Burger Court	179
Figure 2.4 Opinion-Writing, 1937–2004	183
The Justices' Private Conference Room	189
Chief Justice William Howard Taft	224
Alternatives to Treaties	241
Japanese-Americans in an Internment Camp during World War II	275
Cartoon of the Constitution and the Seizure of Private Property	318
Jagdish Rai Chadha	405
President Richard Nixon after His Resignation	426
President William Jefferson Clinton	446
Representative Adam Clayton Powell	463
Formal Amendments and Methods of Amending the Constitution	518
Chief Justice John Marshall	526
Herblock Cartoon on FDR's Court-packing Plan	566
Moreton Rolleson, Jr., Owner of the Heart of Atlanta Motel	580
Chief Justice Roger B. Taney	655
Chief Justice William H. Rehnquist	690
The Warren Court	828
Cartoon of the Original Gerrymander in 1812	830
Map of the Redistricted Tuskegee, Alabama	833
Congressional District 12, Challenged in <i>Shaw v. Reno</i> (1993)	860
Congressional District 12 as Drawn and Redrawn in 1992, 1997, and 1998	866
"Hooverville" during the Great Depression	969
Cartoon Depicting the Supreme Court's Backlog of Cases in 1883	984

PREFACE

Because there is no dearth of casebooks, the appearance of another one needs a defense, or at least a further explanation of how it still differs from others. What distinguishes this casebook is its treatment and incorporation of material on constitutional history and American politics. Few casebooks pay adequate attention to the forces of history and politics on the course of constitutional law. Yet constitutional law, history, and politics are intimately intertwined.

The Constitution and Bill of Rights, of course, are political documents. Rooted in historic struggles and based on political compromises, their provisions and guarantees continue to invite competing interpretations and political contests over, for example, the separation of powers between Congress and the president, federalism, and civil rights and liberties. Because the Constitution says nothing about *who* should interpret it or about *how* it should be interpreted, constitutional law is animated by the politics of interpretation and the interpretation of politics. Neither do we have a single accepted theory of constitutional interpretation, nor do the justices write on a clean slate. Instead, we face constitutional choices and competing judicial and political philosophies.

The Supreme Court's decisions do not occur in a political vacuum, standing apart from history and the political struggles within the Court and the country. Virtually every major political controversy raises questions of constitutional law, no less than do technological changes and social movements and economic forces. The development and direction of constitutional law also shift (more or less quickly) with the Court's changing composition. Members of the Court, just as other citizens, differ in their readings of the Constitution. Moreover, major confrontations in constitutional law and politics, such as those over the powers of the national government, or slavery, school desegregation, and abortion, involve continuing struggles that run from one generation to another. In the course of those struggles, constitutional law evolves with changes in the Court and the country. The Constitution and the Bill of Rights bind the Court, other political institutions, and the people in an ongoing dialogue over the exercise of and limitations on governmental power.

By providing the historical context and explaining the political

contests among the justices and between the Court and the country, this casebook aims to make constitutional law more accessible for students. History and politics are also important for students' analyzing of particular decisions and their relation to developments and changes in constitutional law and politics. They are crucial as well for students trying critically to evaluate competing interpretations and to appreciate the political consequences of alternative interpretations. And they are essential if students are to engage in the dialogue of constitutional law, confront constitutional choices, and come to terms with their and others' views of the Constitution and the Bill of Rights.

The casebook remains different in several ways. First, it comes in two very comprehensive, anthology-like volumes. Volume I, *Struggles for Power and Governmental Accountability*, deals with separation of powers, federalism, and the democratic process. Volume II, *Civil Rights and Civil Liberties*, is devoted to the enduring struggles to limit governmental power and guarantee civil rights and liberties. As a two-volume set, it not only includes more Court decisions than other casebooks but also permits more introductory background material. Instructors, therefore, have greater flexibility when assigning cases, and students will find useful the additional cases and guides to other cases and resources.

Second, two chapters dealing with the politics of constitutional interpretation and Supreme Court decision making contain material not usually found in casebooks. Chapter 1 goes beyond dealing with the establishment of the power of judicial review, and political criticisms of the Court's exercise of that power, to examining rival theories of constitutional interpretation. Students are introduced to differing judicial and political philosophies and referred to cases and opinions found in subsequent chapters that illustrate these different positions on constitutional interpretation. Chapter 2 combines an introduction to jurisdictional matters, such as standing, with a discussion of how the Court operates as an institution and in relation to other political institutions, which may help promote compliance with and implementation of its rulings, or thwart and even reverse them. In short, Chapter 1 prepares students for critically evaluating competing interpretations of constitutional provisions in subsequent chapters. And Chapter 2 prepares them for understanding the political struggles that take place within the Court as well as between the Court and other political institutions over its decisions. While the volumes together are designed for a two-semester course, both of these chapters, as well as *The Constitution of the United States*, are included in each volume for the convenience of teachers and students who might be involved in only one of the two-semester constitutional law course sequence.

As already noted, each chapter and subsection contains a lengthy

introductory essay. These essays focus on particular provisions of the Constitution and the Bill of Rights, why they took the form they did, and what controversies surrounded them during the Founding period and later. Most begin with the debates at the Constitutional Convention of 1787 and those between the Federalists and Anti-Federalists during the ratification period, and then review subsequent cases and controversies. Besides providing a historical and political context for the cases in each chapter, the essays highlight the continuity and changes in the debates over constitutional law and politics that run from the Founding period to those rulings of the Rehnquist Court.

Something should also be said about the case excerpts. Most are preceded by “headnotes,” short explanations of the facts and why the case was appealed to the Court. But, unlike the brief (and usually dry) headnotes typically found in casebooks, these reveal something about the personal and political struggles of those who appeal to the Court. Throughout, there is an attempt to help students understand the judicial and political process and appreciate how questions of constitutional law are embedded in everyday life. For this reason, students will also find excerpts from oral arguments before the Court and other materials bearing on the political struggles that they represent. Along with excerpts of the opinion announcing the decision of the Court, students will frequently encounter excerpts from separate concurring and dissenting opinions. These are included to help students appreciate the choices that the Court and they must make when interpreting the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. Related to this is a good suggestion made by a number of adopters of the first edition: the headnotes now record the actual Court vote.

In addition, each volume contains four types of boxes, which include materials that further place constitutional interpretation and law in historical and political perspective. One set of boxes, CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY, presents important background material, such as excerpts from John Locke on the connection between property and liberty and explanatory notes on the “Watergate crisis” and the battle over the Equal Rights Amendment. Another set, THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW, shows changes and patterns in constitutional law and refers students to other cases on topics of special interest. The third, INSIDE THE COURT, illustrates the internal dynamics of the Court when engaged in the process of constitutional interpretation and deciding cases. Finally, IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE boxes illustrate how courts around the world have dealt with similar constitutional controversies. These boxes are indicated by □ in the contents. Also included at the end of each volume are brief biographies of the current sitting justices.

This sixth edition updates the introductions, the cases, and the four types of boxes, as well as incorporates the highlights of the Court's terms through the 2003–2004 term. Along with adding a number of new boxes on CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY, THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW, and IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE, this edition includes a number of other new features. RESEARCHING LEGAL MATERIALS provides a guide for students to access and to search for legal materials and law-related sources on the Internet. THE HOW, WHY, AND WHAT TO BRIEFING AND CITING COURT CASES discusses the how, why, and what to briefing and citing court decisions and opinions. In response to requests from adopters of past editions, the chapter titled “Economic Rights and American Capitalism” is included in both volumes; it appears as Chapter 9 in Volume One and remains Chapter 3 in Volume Two. Besides maintaining the SUPREME COURT WEB WATCH (at www.wwnorton.com/scww/), with links to pertinent information on the Supreme Court and the Constitution, in order to keep the sixth edition up to date, I will continue to write, and Norton to publish each September, an annual supplement that we call SUPREME COURT WATCH.

What follows will, it is hoped, enrich students' understanding of constitutional law, politics, and history, as well as open them to the possibilities in interpreting the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. But the Constitution is where students should begin their study, and it is assuredly where they will return again and again.

D. M. O.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am indebted to my students and colleagues for the favorable reception that they gave earlier editions, but I still owe a larger debt to Claudine, my wife, for giving me the freedom to work as I do and to enjoy life's pleasures with Benjamin, Sara, and Talia. I continue to be grateful for the inspiration and support of my teacher, C. Herman Pritchett, University of California, Santa Barbara, and my colleagues at the University of Virginia, Henry J. Abraham and David Klein. Ira Carmen, University of Illinois; Phillip Cooper, University of Vermont; Jerome Hanus, The American University; and Gerald Rosenberg, University of Chicago, read and made very helpful suggestions on the first edition for which I am grateful. Also, I thank Thomas Baker, Texas Tech University; Sue Davis, University of Delaware; Susan Fino, Wayne State University; Christine Harrington, New York University; and H. N. Hirsch, University of California, San Diego, for offering comments that helped shape the casebook early on in its development.

This sixth edition incurs even more debt. I very much appreciate the support and suggestions made by countless undergraduate and graduate students. In particular, several current and former graduate students deserve special recognition: Christopher Banks, Cindy Boyles, Stephen Bragaw, Steve Brown, John Blakeman, Richard Drew, Scott Gerber, Jeffrey Hockett, Robert Hume, Edward Kelly, Charles Kromkowski, William Mandel, Rick Mayes, Laura Mirsky, Darby Morrisroe, Stacy Nyikos, Gavin Reddick, James Staab, Jon Talotta, Stephen Tauber, and James Todd. Numerous colleagues around the country offered support and very helpful suggestions for changes and corrections that have improved this edition. Among many other colleagues, I am grateful to the following: John Q. Adams, Maria Antonini, Gordon Baker, Jack Barlow, John Brigham, Joseph Callahan, David Carrithers, Richard Claude, George F. Cole, Ronald Collins, Sheila Collins, Akiba Covitz, John Domino, Louis Fisher, Jack Fruchtman, Jr., Hal Goldman, Leslie Goldstein, Susan Grogan, Robert Hardgrave, Jr., Harry N. Hirsch, Milton Heumann, Elizabeth Hull, Sidney Heyman, Michael Horan, Carolyn Johnson, Robert M. Johnstone, Nancy Kassop, Paul Kens, Byron Lander, Susan Lawrence, James Lennertz, Robert Katzmann, J. Morgan Kousser, Thomas Lewis, Kevin McGuire, Pricilla Macadeo, David T. Mason, Eddie L. Meaders,

Vincent Michelot, Lucas Morel, Bruce Murphy, Jill Norgren, Karen O'Connor, Jack W. Peltason, Marie Provine, Stephen Ross, John Scheb, Guy Scoffoni, David Skover, Rogers Smith, Neil Snortland, Donald Songer, Gene Straughan, Harold Sullivan, John Taylor, James Todd, and Mary Volcansek.

In preparing this sixth edition I benefited from the comments of several reviewers and remain indebted to John C. Blakeman, J. M. Bordelon, Steven Brown, Michelle D. Dearorff, Milton Heumann, Paul Kens, S. A. Dwyer-Shick, Cary Federman, Jack Fruchtman, Jr., David R. Manwaring, Wendy L. Martinek, W. McKercher, David Pogue, Alisa Rosenthal, Daniel E. Smith, Mark Caleb Smith, Steve Tauber, and Paul Weber.

Finally, the generous support of the American Philosophical Society and the Earhart Foundation contributed to this project as well. Donald Fusting, a patient and wise editor, worked with me on the first two editions, as did Steve Dunn on the third, Sarah Caldwell on the fourth, Ann Marcy on the fifth edition, and Aaron Javicas on the sixth. Work on these volumes, I should also acknowledge, was indirectly but significantly helped by the U.S. Fulbright Commission. The first edition was largely completed during 1987–1988 while I was a Fulbright Lecturer in Constitutional Studies at Oxford University. The third edition was completed while I was a Fulbright Research Fellow in Japan. And the fourth edition was completed while I held the Fulbright Chair in History and Political Science at the University of Bologna. I am thus deeply indebted to the Fulbright Commission and a number of scholars who made my stays so productive. In particular, I am grateful to Byron Shafer, Yasuo Ohkoshi, Vincent Michelot, and Tiziano Bonazzi. I am grateful as well for permission to reproduce materials here granted by the following individuals and organizations: Justices William J. Brennan, Jr., and Antonin Scalia; the curator of the Supreme Court of the United States; the Library of Congress; Justice Hans Linde of the Oregon State Supreme Court; the Supreme Court Historical Society; the National Portrait Gallery/Smithsonian Institution; *The New York Times*; the Roosevelt Library; Sygma/*New York Times Magazine*; Paula Okamoto; and Wide World Photos.

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLITICS

VOLUME ONE

SIXTH EDITION

CONTENTS

Cases [within brackets] are discussed and extensively quoted in the topic introductions.

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS xvii

PREFACE xix

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS xxiii

THE UNITED STATES CONSTITUTION AND AMENDMENTS 1

CHAPTER 1 ■ *The Supreme Court, Judicial Review, and Constitutional Politics* 23

A. ESTABLISHING AND CONTESTING THE POWER OF JUDICIAL REVIEW 27

- HOW TO LOCATE DECISIONS OF THE SUPREME COURT 28
 - [*Calder v. Bull*] 29
- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Decisions of the Supreme Court Overruled and Acts of Congress Held Unconstitutional, and State Laws and Municipal Ordinances Overturned, 1789–2004 36

James Kent's Introductory Law School Lecture in 1794 40

The Virginia and Kentucky Resolutions of 1798 43

Marbury v. Madison 46

Eakin v. Raub 55

President Jackson's Veto Message of 1832 59

President Roosevelt's Radio Broadcast, March 9, 1937 62

B. THE POLITICS OF CONSTITUTIONAL INTERPRETATION 67

- IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE: Written and Unwritten Constitutions: Britain's and Israel's Constitutions 69
 - (1) The Text and Historical Context 76
 - (2) In and Beyond the Text 86
- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: What Is the Constitution? Could a Constitutional Amendment Violate the Constitution? 89

- THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Comparative Constitutional Interpretation 96

CHAPTER 2 ■ Law and Politics in the Supreme Court: Jurisdiction and Decision-Making Process 103

A. JURISDICTION AND JUSTICIABLE CONTROVERSIES 104

- FIGURE 2.1 Avenues of Appeal: The two main routes to the Supreme Court 106
- [*Frothingham v. Mellon*] 108
- FIGURE 2.2 Jurisdictional map of the U.S. courts of appeal and U.S. district courts 109

[*Northeastern Florida Chapter of the Associated General Contractors of America v. City of Jacksonville, Florida*] 111

[*Wyoming v. Oklahoma*] 111

- THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Other Important Rulings on Standing 112

- THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Class Action Suits 117

[*Luther v. Borden*] 119

[*Colegrove v. Green*] 119

- INSIDE THE COURT: Standing and the Connecticut Birth Control Cases 120

[*Nixon v. United States*] 123

- INSIDE THE COURT: The Supreme Court's Reversal of Precedent in Historical Perspective 128

Flast v. Cohen 130

Valley Forge Christian College v. Americans United for Separation of Church and State, Inc. 137

Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife 141

Baker v. Carr 145

Goldwater v. Carter 157

Elk Grove Unified School District v. Newdow 161

- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Rules for Judicial Self-Restraint and Avoiding Constitutional Questions 169

B. THE COURT'S DOCKET AND SCREENING CASES 170

C. THE RULE OF FOUR AND AGENDA SETTING	170
□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Figure 2.3. Docket and filings, 1800–2004	171
□ IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE: The “European Model” of Constitutional Courts and Judicial Review	173
D. SUMMARILY DECIDED CASES	175
E. THE ROLE OF ORAL ARGUMENT	176
F. CONFERENCE DELIBERATIONS	178
□ INSIDE THE COURT: On the Tentativeness of Votes and the Importance of Opinion Writing	180
G. POSTCONFERENCE WRITING AND CIRCULATION OF OPINIONS	181
□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Figure 2.4. Opinion writing, 1937–2004	183
H. OPINION DAYS AND COMMUNICATING DECISIONS	184
□ INSIDE THE COURT: Voting Alignments in the Rehnquist Court, 1986–2002 Terms	185
I. THE IMPACT OF SUPREME COURT DECISIONS: COMPLIANCE AND IMPLEMENTATION	186
□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: The Southern Manifesto: A Declaration of Constitutional Principles	191
<i>Linkletter v. Walker</i>	199
<i>Griffith v. Kentucky</i>	204
<i>Jaffree v. Board of School Commissioners of Mobile County</i>	206
<i>Commonwealth of Kentucky v. Jeffrey Wasson</i>	208
□ THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Other Recent State Supreme Court Decisions Declining to Follow the U.S. Supreme Court’s Rulings	212
CHAPTER 3 ■ Presidential Power, the Rule of Law, and Foreign Affairs	220

A. OFFICE AND POWERS: THE TWO PRESIDENCIES	220
□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Alexander Hamilton, <i>The Federalist</i> , No. 70	225

B. AS COMMANDER IN CHIEF AND IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS 226*United States v. Curtiss-Wright Corporation* 229*Dames & Moore v. Regan* 231*Sale v. Haitian Centers Council, Inc.* 237**C. THE TREATY-MAKING POWER AND EXECUTIVE INDEPENDENCE 239**

- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Alternatives to Treaties: The Rise of Executive Agreements and Arrangements 241

Missouri v. Holland 243

- THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Senate Rejection of Proposed Treaties 244

United States v. Pink 246

- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: The Treaty-Reinterpretation Controversy 248

Goldwater v. Carter (reprise) 250*United States v. Alvarez-Machain* 250**D. WAR-MAKING AND EMERGENCY POWERS 254**

- CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Citizens, Noncitizens, “Enemy Combatants,” and Civil Rights in Wartime 258

The Prize Cases 264*Ex parte Milligan* 268*Korematsu v. United States* 274*Rasul v. Bush* 283*Hamdi v. Rumsfeld* 288*War Powers Resolution* 302

- THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: The USA PATRIOT Act of 2001, Wiretaps, and the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court 307

CHAPTER 4 ■ The President as Chief Executive in Domestic Affairs 310

A. NATIONAL SECURITY AND INHERENT AND EMERGENCY POWERS 311

- INSIDE THE COURT: The Argument for Inherent and Emergency Presidential Powers in “the Steel Seizure Case” 314

[*United States v. The Progressive, Inc.*] 315
Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer 316
New York Times Co. v. United States 331

B. APPOINTMENT AND REMOVAL POWERS 340

□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Supreme Court Nominations
 Rejected, Postponed, or Withdrawn due to Senate
 Opposition 344
Myers v. United States 345
Humphrey's Executor v. United States 357
Bowsher v. Synar 360
Morrison v. Olson 370

C. LEGISLATIVE POWERS IN THE ADMINISTRATIVE STATE 387

[*Chevron v. Natural Resources Defense Council*] 391
Schechter Poultry Corporation v. United States 394
*Industrial Union Department, AFL-CIO v. American Petroleum
 Institute* 400
Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha 403
Clinton v. City of New York 414
 □ THE DEVELOPMENT OF LAW: Presidential Vetoes,
 1789–2004 424

D. ACCOUNTABILITY AND IMMUNITIES 425

[*Cheney v. U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia*] 430
United States v. Nixon 433
 □ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Unraveling the Watergate
 Affair 434
*Articles of Impeachment against President Richard M. Nixon
 Recommended by the House Judiciary Committee* 441
Clinton v. Jones 444
*Articles of Impeachment against President William Jefferson Clinton
 Recommended by the House Judiciary Committee and Approved
 by the House of Representatives* 450

CHAPTER 5 ■ Congress: Membership, Immunities, and Investigatory Powers 455

A. MEMBERSHIP AND IMMUNITIES 456

[*U.S. Department of Commerce v. Montana*] 458

Powell v. McCormack 463

U.S. Term Limits, Inc. v. Thornton 468

Gravel v. United States 476

Eastland v. United States Servicemen's Fund 480

Hutchinson v. Proxmire 483

B. INVESTIGATORY, CONTEMPT, AND IMPEACHMENT POWERS 485

Watkins v. United States 490

Barenblatt v. United States 498

Gibson v. Florida Legislative Investigation Committee 505

Walter L. Nixon v. United States 511

□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Impeachment Trials 514

CHAPTER 6 ■ Congress: Legislative, Taxing, and Spending Powers 516

□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: Formal Amendments and Methods of Amending the Constitution 518

□ CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY: A Twenty-seventh Amendment after 203 years 520

A. THE CLASSIC VIEW OF CONGRESS'S LEGISLATIVE POWERS 522

McCulloch v. Maryland 527

Gibbons v. Ogden 538

B. FROM LEGAL FORMALISM TO THE NEW DEAL CRISIS 544

[*Swift & Company v. United States*] 547

[*The Shreveport Rate Case*] 548