EDITED BY

K. W. M. FULFORD

MARTIN DAVIES

RICHARD G. T. GIPPS

GEORGE GRAHAM

JOHN Z.
SADLER

GIOVANNI STANGHELLINI

TIM
THORNTON

The Oxford Handbook of PHILOSOPHY AND PSYCHIATRY

PHILOSOPHY AND PSYCHIATRY

Edited by

K. W. M. FULFORD

MARTIN DAVIES

RICHARD C.F. G

GEORGE (

JOHN Z.

GIOVANNI STANGHEI

and

TIM THORNTON





Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP, United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Oxford University Press 2013

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First published in 2013

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

ISBN 978-0-19-957956-3

Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CRO 4YY

Whilst every effort has been made to ensure that the contents of this work are as complete, accurate and-up-to-date as possible at the date of writing, Oxford University Press is not able to give any guarantee or assurance that such is the case. Readers are urged to take appropriately qualified medical advice in all cases. The information in this work is intended to be useful to the general reader, but should not be used as a means of self-diagnosis or for the prescription of medication

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

THE OXFORD HANDBOOK OF

PHILOSOPHY AND PSYCHIATRY

INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES IN PHILOSOPHY AND PSYCHIATRY

Series editors: Bill (K. W. M.) Fulford, Katherine Morris, John Z. Sadler, and Giovanni Stanghellini

Volumes in the series:

Portrait of the Psychiatrist as a Young Man: The Early Writing and Work of R.D. Laing, 1927–1960

Beveridge

What is Mental Disorder?

Bolton

Mind, Meaning, and Mental Disorder 2e

Bolton and Hill

Delusions and Other Irrational Beliefs

Bortolotti

Postpsychiatry Bracken and Thomas

Philosophy, Psychoanalysis, and the A-Rational Mind

Brakel

Unconscious Knowing and Other Essays in

Psycho-Philosophical Analysis

Brakel

Psychiatry as Cognitive Neuroscience

Broome and Bortolotti (Eds)

Free Will and Responsibility: A Guide for Practitioners

Callender

Reconceiving Schizophrenia Chung, Fulford, and Graham (Eds)

Darwin and Psychiatry
De Block and Adriaens (Eds)

Nature and Narrative: An Introduction to the

New Philosophy of Psychiatry

Fulford, Morris, Sadler, and Stanghellini (Eds)

Oxford Textbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry

Fulford, Thornton, and Graham (Eds)

The Mind and its Discontents

Gillett

Thinking Through Dementia

Hughes

Dementia: Mind, Meaning, and the Person

Hughes, Louw, and Sabat (Eds)
Talking Cures and Placebo Effects

Ionling

Philosophical Issues in Psychiatry II: Nosology

Kendler and Parnas

Discursive Perspectives in Therapeutic Practice

Lock and Strong (Ed.)

Schizophrenia and the Fate of the Self

Lysaker and Lysaker

Responsibility and Psychopathy

Malatesti and McMillan

Body-Subjects and Disordered Minds

Matthews

Rationality and Compulsion: Applying Action

Theory to Psychiatry

Nordenfelt

Philosophical Perspectives on Technology and

Psychiatry Phillips (Ed.)

The Metaphor of Mental Illness

Pickering

Mapping the Edges and the In-between

Potter where

Trauma, Truth, and Reconciliation: Healing Dam-

aged Relationships

The Philosophy of Psychiatry: A Companion

Radden

The Virtuous Psychiatrist

Radden and Sadler

Autonomy and Mental Disorder

Radoilska (Ed.)

Recovery of People with Mental Illness: Philosophical

and Related Perspectives

Rudnick

Feelings of Being

Ratcliffe

Values and Psychiatric Diagnosis

Sadler

Disembodied Spirits and Deanimated Bodies: The

Psychopathology of Common Sense

Stanghellini

Emotions and Personhood Stanghellini and Rosfort

Essential Philosophy of Psychiatry

Thornton

Empirical Ethics in Psychiatry

Widdershoven, McMillan, Hope, and Van der Scheer

(Eds)

The Sublime Object of Psychiatry: Schizophrenia in

Clinical and Cultural Theory

Woods

One Century of Karl Jaspers' General

Psychopathology

Stanghellini and Fuchs (Eds)

Addiction and Weakness of Will

Radoilska

PREFACE

"Madness," the Oxford philosopher Anthony Quinton commented in a lecture to the British Academy published in 1985, "is a subject that ought to interest philosophers; but they have had surprisingly little to say about it." What a difference three decades have made! As the contributions to this book so richly illustrate, there is nowadays hardly a psychiatric stone that philosophers have left unturned. Nor is the trade one-way. If philosophers are now interested in psychiatric research and practice, so, too, are researchers and practitioners—including an increasingly vocal and effective service user community—interested in philosophy.

The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry brings together what we hope is a representative cross-section of the new field. Like other Oxford Philosophy Handbooks, it is written mainly by philosophers for philosophers. In this respect it balances other contributions to the book series with which it is co-branded, the IPPP (International Perspectives in Philosophy and Psychiatry) series: The Oxford Textbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry, for example, is oriented more towards practice. Yet this Handbook, although primarily philosophical in focus, incorporates a number of novel features reflecting the lively dynamic between theory and practice that is such a distinctive characteristic of the new field. Thus a number of our contributors are practitioners and empirical researchers as well as philosophers; others write from first-hand experience of mental disorder; and the book as a whole is structured around the stages of the clinical encounter rather than within traditional philosophical disciplines. Nor are the Handbook's ambitions in this respect merely colligative. As we describe more fully in our introductory Chapter 1, the Handbook is supported by a website (www.oup.co.uk/companion/fulford) of narrative and other case-based materials offering what we hope will be a unique one-stop resource for philosophers entering the field.

A project as complex and ambitious as *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry* would have been impossible without the combined skills of many, and diversely talented, people. Our thanks go first to our contributors to both the book and the website: each and every one has been wonderfully generous with their time and commitment in responding to the editorial challenges of synthesis and integration across the book as a whole. Our thanks go also to the members of our International Advisory Board who made many crucial suggestions in the early stages of planning the book and have given continuing support throughout. Our two graduate researchers, Will Davies and Gemma Copsey, showed great skill and dedication and we are grateful to them for their crucial work respectively on an initial literature review and on the development of the website. George Graham was ably supported by Casey Landers. We are grateful also to David Crepaz-Keay, Jayasree Kalathil, Toby Williamson, and others at the Mental Health Foundation, a voluntary sector organization that in uniquely combining policy and service user perspectives has brought an important additional dimension to the book and its supporting website. And all of us, finally, editors and contributors alike, are grateful to the publishing team at Oxford University Press who

have gone way beyond the merely professional in their commitment to the project: our thanks go particularly to Martin Baum and Peter Momtchiloff whose collaboration as commissioning editors respectively for psychiatry (and related areas) and philosophy made the book possible; to Abigail Stanley and to Beth McAllister and their respective production and marketing teams; and to Charlotte Green as project lead for her boundless energy and for her consistently good humoured and problem-solving approach.

No single volume however compendious can hope to capture, still less keep up with, every important development in this vigorously expanding field. The IPPP series will continue to publish cutting edge work. Future Oxford Handbooks in Philosophy will offer further state-of-the-art collections: the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook of Psychiatric Ethics* was conceived as a sister volume to this book; and there are clear gaps in the market for future Handbooks covering the relationships between psychopathology and such areas as phenomenology and the cognitive and neurosciences. But thirty years on from Quinton's prescient lecture our hope is that the publication of this book in what is the centenary of Karl Jaspers' *General Psychopathology* will help to secure the place of psychiatry as a subject that is and remains permanently among the interests of philosophers.

REFERENCE

Quinton, A. (1985). Madness. In A.P. Griffiths (Ed.), *Philosophy and Practice*, pp. 17–41. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

THE OXFORD HANDBOOK OF PHILOSOPHY AND PSYCHIATRY

Editors

K.W.M. Fulford Martin Davies Richard G.T. Gipps George Graham John Z. Sadler Giovanni Stanghellini Tim Thornton

Editorial Research Assistants

Will Davies Gemma Copsey

International Advisory Board

Anita Avramides Gloria Ayob Lisa Bortolotti Matthew Broome Tim Bayne John Campbell Rachel Cooper

Thomas Fuchs

Gerrit Glas

Guy Kahane

Josef Parnas

Hanna Pickard

Nancy Potter

Matthew Ratcliffe

Johannes Roessler

Louis Sass

Julian Savulescu

Nicholas Shea

Werdie van Staden

Website

V.Y. Allison-Bolger David Crepaz-Keay Jayasree Kalathil Toby Williamson

Contributors

V.Y. Allison-Bolger Consultant Psychiatrist, UK

Katherine Arens Department of Germanic Studies, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX, USA

Richard Askay University of Portland, Portland, OR, USA

Anita Avramides Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Tim Bayne Department of Philosophy, School of Social Science, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK

Michael A. Bishop Department of Philosophy, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL, USA

Derek Bolton King's College London, Institute of Psychiatry, London, UK

Lisa Bortolotti Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

Pat Bracken West Cork Mental Health Service, Bantry, Ireland

Matthew Broome Department of Psychiatry, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK; Highfield Adolescent Unit, Warneford Hospital, Oxford Health NHS Foundation Trust, Oxford, UK

John Campbell Department of Philosophy, University of California, Berkeley, CA, USA

Louis C. Charland Departments of Philosophy and Psychiatry & Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Western Ontario, London, ON, Canada

Jennifer Church Department of Philosophy, Vassar College, Poughkeepsie, NY, USA

Stephen R. L. Clark Department of Philosophy, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

Giovanna Colombetti Department of Sociology, Philosophy and Anthropology, University of Exeter, Exeter, UK

Rachel Cooper Lancaster University, Lancaster, UK

Kelso Cratsley Department of Philosophy, University of Massachusetts, Boston, MA, USA

David Crepaz-Keay Mental Health Foundation, London, UK

Roger Crisp Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Larry Davidson Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA

Martin Davies Faculty of Philosophy and Department of Experimental Psychology, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Andy Egan Department of Philosophy, Rutgers University, New Brunswick, NJ, USA; Arché Philosophical Research Centre, University of St Andrews, St Andrews, Scotland

Barbara Von Eckardt Rhode Island School of Design, Providence, RI, USA

Jensen Farquhar Retired therapist and current mediator, Portland, OR, USA

Owen Flanagan Department of Philosophy, Duke University, Durham, NC, USA

Bennett Foddy Oxford Centre for Neuroethics and Oxford Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Thomas Fuchs Psychiatric Department, University of Heidelberg, Heidelberg, Germany

K. W. M. Fulford Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Paolo Fusar-Poli Department of Psychoses Studies, Institute of Psychiatry, London, UK

Shaun Gallagher Department of Philosophy, University of Memphis, Memphis, TN, USA; School of Humanities, University of Hertfordshire, Hatfield, UK

S. Nassir Ghaemi Department of Psychiatry, Mood Disorders Program, Tufts Medical Center, Tufts University School of Medicine, Boston, MA, USA; Department of Psychiatry, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

Grant Gillett Department of Philosophy, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

Richard G.T. Gipps Oxford University Disability Advisory Service, Oxford, UK

Gerrit Glas Institute for Mental Health, Zwolle, The Netherlands; Department of Philosophy, VU University Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

George Graham Department of Philosophy, Georgia State University, Birmingham, AL, USA

Thor Grünbaum Philosophy Section, Department of Media, Cognition and Communication, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark

Edward Harcourt Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Nick Haslam Department of Psychology, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, VIC, Australia

Rom Harré Georgetown University, Washington, DC, USA; Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

R. Peter Hobson Tavistock Clinic and Behavioural and Brain Sciences Unit, Institute of Child Health, University College London, London, UK

Jim Hopkins Department of Philosophy, Kings College London, London, UK

Julian C. Hughes Northumbria Healthcare NHS Foundation Trust and the Institute for Ageing and Health, Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne, UK

Daniel D. Hutto School of Humanities, University of Hertfordshire, Hatfield, UK

Terence Irwin Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

David A. Jopling Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Arts, York University, Toronto, ON, Canada

Guy Kahane Oxford Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Jayasree Kalathil Independent researcher, Survivor Research, London, UK

Elselijn Kingma Department of History and Philosophy of Science, Cambridge University, Cambridge, UK

Robert F. Krueger Department of Psychology, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, USA

Michael Lacewing Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, University of London, London, UK

Federico Leoni Università degli Studi di Milano, Dipartimento di Filosofia, Milan, Italy

Eric Matthews Philosophy, School of Divinity, History and Philosophy, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, UK

Katherine J. Morris Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Christoph Mundt University of Heidelberg, Heidelberg, Germany

Dominic Murphy History and Philosophy of Science, University of Sydney, Camperdown, NSW, Australia

Marilyn Nissim-Sabat Department of Philosophy, Lewis University, Romeoville, IL, USA

Nancy Nyquist Potter Department of Philosophy, University of Louisville, Louisville, KY, USA

James Phillips Department of Psychiatry, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA

Hanna Pickard Oxford Centre for Neuroethics, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Elizabeth Pienkos Graduate School of Applied and Professional Psychology, Rutgers University, Piscataway, NJ, USA

Jeffrey Poland Department of History, Philosophy, and Social Science, Rhode Island School of Design, Providence, RI, USA; Department of Molecular Biology, Cell Biology, and Biochemistry, Brown University, Providence, RI, USA

Jennifer Radden Philosophy Department, University of Massachusetts, Boston, MA, USA

Lubomira Radoilska Faculty of Philosophy, Cambridge University, Cambridge, UK

Matthew Ratcliffe Department of Philosophy, University of Durham, Durham, UK

Daniel N. Robinson Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Johannes Roessler Philosophy Department, Warwick University, Coventry, UK

Jasna Russo Centre for Citizen Participation, Brunel University, London, UK

John Z. Sadler Division of Ethics, Department of Psychiatry, UT Southwestern, Dallas, TX, USA

Richard Samuels Department of Philosophy, Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA

Louis A. Sass Graduate School of Applied and Professional Psychology, Rutgers University, Piscataway, NJ, USA

Julian Savulescu Oxford Centre for Neuroethics and Oxford Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Kenneth F. Schaffner University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

Nicholas Shea Department of Philosophy, King's College London, London, UK

Debra Shulkes Survivor Activist and Editor, Australia/Czech Republic

Walter Sinnott-Armstrong Department of Philosophy and the Kenan Institute for Ethics at Duke University, Durham, NC, USA

Giovanni Stanghellini G. d'Annunzio University, Chieti, Italy; D. Portales University, Santiago, Chile

Fredrik Svenaeus Centre for Studies in Practical Knowledge, Department of Philosophy, Södertörn University, Huddinge, Sweden

Philip Thomas Social Science and Humanities, University of Bradford, Bradford, UK

Tim Thornton School of Health, University of Central Lancashire, Preston, UK

J. D. Trout Philosophy Department, Loyola University Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA

C. W. van Staden Division of Philosophy and Ethics of Mental Health, Department of Psychiatry, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

Somogy Varga University of Osnabrück, Osnabrück, Germany

Lisa Ward STAR Team, Thames Valley Initiative, Oxford, UK

Toby Williamson Mental Health Foundation, London, UK

Philippe Wuyts UPC KU Leuven, Leuven, Belgium

Peter Zachar Department of Psychology, Auburn University at Montgomery, Montgomery, AL, USA

Dan Zahavi Center for Subjectivity Research, Department of Media, Cognition and Communication, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark

Contents

Co	mirioulors	XV
1	The Next Hundred Years: Watching our Ps and Q	1
	SECTION I HISTORY	
2	Introduction: History	15
3	The Insanity Defense as a History of Mental Disorder Daniel N. Robinson	18
4	Mental Health as Moral Virtue: Some Ancient Arguments TERENCE IRWIN	37
5	Aristotle, Plato, and the Anti-Psychiatrists: Comment on Irwin Edward Harcourt	47
6	Wilhelm Griesinger: Philosophy as the Origin of a New Psychiatry Katherine Arens	53
7	The Philosophical Roots of Karl Jaspers' <i>General Psychopathology</i> Снгізторн Миndт	68
8	From Madness to Mental Illness: Psychiatry and Biopolitics in Michel Foucault FEDERICO LEONI	85
9	The Epistemological Value of Depression Memoirs: A Meta-Analysis Jennifer Radden and Somogy Varga	99
	SECTION II CONTEXTS OF CARE	
10	Introduction: Contexts of Care	119
11	Challenges to the Modernist Identity of Psychiatry: User Empowerment and Recovery PAT BRACKEN AND PHILIP THOMAS	123

X CONT	DATH

12	Race and Gender in Philosophy of Psychiatry: Science, Relativism, and Phenomenology Marilyn Nissim-Sabat	139
13	Why Psychiatry Should Fear Medicalization Louis C. Charland	159
14	Technology and Psychiatry JAMES PHILLIPS	176
15	Cure and Recovery LARRY DAVIDSON	197
	SECTION III ESTABLISHING RELATIONSHIPS	
16	Introduction: Establishing Relationships	217
17	Varieties of Self-Awareness Thor Grünbaum and Dan Zahavi	221
18	Interpersonal Relating Daniel D. Hutto	240
19	Intersubjectivity and Psychopathology Shaun Gallagher	258
20	Other Minds, Autism, and Depth in Human Interaction ANITA AVRAMIDES	275
21	Empathic Foundations of Clinical Knowledge NANCY NYQUIST POTTER	293
22	Discourse and Diseases of the Psyche Grant Gillett and Rom Harré	307
23	Philosophical Resources for the Psychiatric Interview GIOVANNI STANGHELLINI	321
	SECTION IV SUMMONING CONCEPTS	
24	Introduction: Summoning Concepts	359
25	Naturalist Accounts of Mental Disorder Elselijn Kingma	363

26	Values-Based Practice: Topsy-Turvy Take-Home Messages from Ordinary Language Philosophy (and a Few Next Steps) K. W. M. Fulford and C. W. van Staden with commentary by Roger Crisp	385
27	Cognitive Science and Explanations of Psychopathology Kelso Cratsley and Richard Samuels	413
28	What is Mental Illness? Derek Bolton	434
29	Vice and Mental Disorders John Z. Sadler	451
30	Rationality and Sanity: The Role of Rationality Judgments in Understanding Psychiatric Disorders LISA BORTOLOTTI	480
31	Boundary Problems: Negotiating the Challenges of Responsibility and Loss JENNIFER CHURCH	497
32	Ordering Disorder: Mental Disorder, Brain Disorder, and Therapeutic Intervention GEORGE GRAHAM	512
33	Mental Disorder: Can Merleau-Ponty Take Us Beyond the "Mind–Brain" Problem? ERIC MATTHEWS	531
	SECTION V DESCRIPTIVE PSYCHOPATHOLOGY	
34	Introduction: Descriptive Psychopathology	547
35	Anxiety and Phobias: Phenomenologies, Concepts, Explanations Gerrit Glas	551
36	Depression and the Phenomenology of Free Will MATTHEW RATCLIFFE	574
37	Body Image Disorders Katherine J. Morris	592
38	The Phenomenology of Affectivity Thomas Fuchs	612

39	Delusion: The Phenomenological Approach Louis A. Sass and Elizabeth Pienkos	632
40	Thought Insertion, Self-Awareness, and Rationality Johannes Roessler	658
41	The Disunity of Consciousness in Psychiatric Disorders TIM BAYNE	673
42	Delusion: Cognitive Approaches—Bayesian Inference and Compartmentalization MARTIN DAVIES AND ANDY EGAN	689
	SECTION VI ASSESSMENT AND DIAGNOS CATEGORIES	TIC
43	Introduction: Assessment and Diagnostic Categories	731
44	Mapping the Domain of Mental Illness Jeffrey Poland and Barbara Von Eckardt	735
45	Values in Psychiatric Diagnosis and Classification John Z. Sadler	753
46	Conceptual and Ethical Issues in the Prodromal Phase of Psychosis Matthew Broome, Paolo Fusar-Poli, and Philippe Wuyts	779
47	Understanding Mania and Depression S. Nassir Ghaemi	803
48	Autism and the Philosophy of Mind R. Peter Hobson	820
49	Dementia is Dead, Long Live Ageing: Philosophy and Practice in Connection with "Dementia" JULIAN C. HUGHES	835
50	What is Addiction? Walter Sinnott-Armstrong and Hanna Pickard	851
51	Identity and Addiction: What Alcoholic Memoirs Teach Owen Flanagan	865
52	Personality Disorder and Validity: A History of Controversy PETER ZACHAR AND ROBERT F. KRUEGER	889

	CONTENTS	XII
53	Personal Identity and Identity Disorders STEPHEN R. L. CLARK	91
	SECTION VII EXPLANATION AND UNDERSTANDING	
54	Introduction: Explanation and Understanding	931
55	Causation and Mechanisms in Psychiatry JOHN CAMPBELL	935
56	Natural Kinds Rachel Cooper	950
57	The Medical Model and the Philosophy of Science Dominic Murphy	966
58	Reliability, Validity, and the Mixed Blessings of Operationalism NICK HASLAM	987
59	Reduction and Reductionism in Psychiatry Kenneth F. Schaffner	1003
60	Diagnostic Prediction and Prognosis: Getting from Symptom to Treatment MICHAEL A. BISHOP AND J. D. TROUT	1023
61	Clinical Judgment, Tacit Knowledge, and Recognition in Psychiatric Diagnosis TIM THORNTON	1047
62	Neural Mechanisms of Decision-Making and the Personal Level NICHOLAS SHEA	1063
63	Psychopathology and the Enactive Mind GIOVANNA COLOMBETTI	1083
64	Could Psychoanalysis be a Science? MICHAEL LACEWING	1103

SECTION VIII CURE AND CARE

65 Introduction: Cure and Care 1131