

American Constitutional Law Introductory Essays and Selected Cases 16

Executive Editor: Reid Hester

Senior Marketing Manager: Lindsey Prudhomme

Production Manager: Kathy Sleys

Project Coordination, Text Design, and Electronic Page Makeup: Hemalatha/Integra

Cover Design Manager: Jayne Conte

Cover Designer: Suzanne Duda

Cover Illustration/Photo: Fotolia Supreme Court Statue © scoutingstock

Printer/Binder/Cover Printer: Courier Companies

Copyright © 2012, 2009, 2005 by Pearson Education, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher. Printed in the United States. To obtain permission to use material from this work, please submit a written request to Pearson Education, Inc., Permissions Department, 1900 E. Lake Ave., Glenview, IL 60025 or fax to (847) 486-3938 or e-mail glenview.permissions@pearsoned.com. For information regarding permissions, call (847) 486-2635.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Mason, Alpheus Thomas.

American constitutional law: introductory essays and selected cases /Alpheus Thomas Mason, Donald Grier Stephenson, Jr.—16th ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-205-10899-2 (alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-205-10899-7 (alk. paper)

1. Constitutional law—United States—Cases. I. Stephenson, D. Grier. II. Title.

KF4550.M2687 2012

342.73—dc22

2010046301

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 —CRS 13 12 11 10

Longman is an imprint of



ISBN-13: 978-0-205-10899-2

ISBN-10:

0-205-10899-7

AMERICAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

In memory of Lucy Williams Warnock, 1944–2010

PREFACE

The devastating terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001, the U.S. government's responses to them and to more recent attempted terrorist attacks, continue to illustrate the recurring tension in American constitutional law between security and freedom. Understandably, Americans demand security. Yet the nation that is defended is defined by its devotion to individual liberty and constitutional limitations. This tension is reflected throughout this book and is expressly addressed in Chapter Fifteen—Security and Freedom in Wartime.

The tension is itself a reminder of the Supreme Court's central place in American government, a development that must be considered alongside two facts: First, on a substantial number of major constitutional issues in recent terms, the Court has split 5–4 or 6–3. Second, President Obama's recent appointments to the Court, like those of his predecessors, have a substantial influence not only on the makeup of the Court but therefore on the future of American constitutional law. With that prospect in mind, the Introduction retains its distinctive focus on institutional development and the politics of judicial selection.

This edition, following the pattern set in earlier ones, is rooted in the conviction that constitutional law is an intricate blend of politics, history, and competing values. Even though judicial decisions are couched in the language and method used by lawyers, constitutional cases are proper turf for students of politics and government. This is because the judiciary is the place where law and politics meet.

Accordingly, the book emphasizes the ongoing importance of constitutional interpretation. Interpretation represents choices made about the meaning of the Constitution. These choices in turn affect the operation of the political system, help to define individual rights and freedoms, and influence the quality of life that Americans enjoy. Constitutional interpretation has thus made the justices participants in the governing process. Their decisions embody selections among hard (and consequential) alternatives, rather than the easy dictates of a cold mechanical process. The book invites students to become party to the dialogue that the Court has maintained with the American people for over two centuries, a dialogue that reflects a historic attraction to, and suspicion of, majority rule—on the part of both the people and the Court.

NEW TO THIS EDITION

New material in both essays and cases reflects recent developments, especially from the 2007–2008 and 2009–2010 terms. Moreover, all data in tables have been updated.

The Introduction, which is the first substantive chapter in the book, includes new material
on the Obama appointments of Judge Sonia Sotomayor and Solicitor General Elena Kagan
to the Supreme Court.

- Chapter Three expands the discussion of the theories of presidential powers to include the unitary executive theory.
- Chapter Three includes an update of the Supreme Court's most recent decisions relating to the Guantanamo detainees.
- Chapter Five adds the decision on campaign finance regulation in *Citizens United* v. *Federal Election Commission* (2010)
- Chapter Nine has been reorganized to include not only materials relating to the Bill of Rights but new material on the developing law on the Second Amendment as well.
- Chapter Nine adds District of Columbia v. Heller (2008) and McDonald v. City of Chicago (2010).
- Chapter Ten has been updated to include the most recent data on FISA and other types
 of electronic surveillance.
- Chapter Fifteen adds the important detainee case of Boumediene v. Bush (2008).
- Tables 1 and 2 in the Appendix have been updated to reflect changes at the White
 House and in the personnel of the Supreme Court. The tables are organized both by
 natural or discrete court and by presidential term respectively.

FEATURES

- Essays. A distinctive feature of the book remains the essay preceding the cases in each
 chapter. These essays supply the historical and political contexts and trace the meandering thread of constitutional doctrine across major decisions.
- Case Excerpts. The case excerpts that follow the essays—essential for learning and in
 depicting constitutional interpretation at work—are as generous as space allows. As
 shown in the contents, cases in each chapter are grouped by subtopic within that
 chapter, loosely corresponding to the organization of the essay itself.
- Tips on reading a Supreme Court decision are presented in Chapter One.
- Court-related publications as well as the abundant Court-related resources available on the Internet are surveyed in Chapter One.
- Glossary. Complementing both the essays and case excerpts is the glossary, which contains
 a definition of every term that is set in boldface in the essays and listed among the key terms
 at the conclusion of each chapter essay.
- Epilogue. It displays a table on American constitutional development, which also serves
 as a chronology of all cases reprinted in the book.
- Selected Readings. To complement both the essays and excerpted cases, each chapter essay concludes with a short and updated list of suggestions for further reading.

Throughout, names of cases discussed in the essays that are also reprinted in the book appear in boldface italics. Each case headnote features the voting alignment for that case. The few footnotes scattered about are numbered consecutively by chapter. In every instance, text appearing within excerpted opinions is the Court's, except for brief insertions within brackets for dates or case names or unless specially marked "— ED." as having been inserted for this book.

• Web site: www.prenhall.com/mason. The site complements the sixteenth edition and facilitates teaching and learning in at least three ways: (1) The site contains important decisions handed down after this edition went to press, which are edited in the same manner as cases excerpted in the book. (2) The site retains cases from previous editions that were displaced by new material and so may be used as a case archive. Faculty designing syllabi thus have a larger number of edited cases from which to choose. (3) Finally, the site contains useful noncase material as well as links to other Court-related sites.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Through the years since publication of the first edition of *American Constitutional Law* in 1954, general readers, faculty, and students have contributed to its betterment. Their suggestions, reflected in both deletions and additions, indicate the measure of my indebtedness. I am especially grateful to those scholars who thoroughly reviewed the fifteenth edition and made recommendations for the sixteenth. These include Morris Jenkins, University of Toledo; Kati Mohammad-Zadeh, University of Minnesota; Ronald Nelson, University of South Alabama; and Kent Rissmiller, Worcester Polytechnic Institute. Other helpful suggestions came from Richard A. Glenn of Millersville University of Pennsylvania and Robert J. Bresler of Pennsylvania State University. Special thanks are due also to Stephen K. Medvic, chair of the Department of Government at Franklin & Marshall College and Jan A. Sams, academic coordinator for the department, as well as to my students, past and present, in Government 314 and 315

As always, deserving of much credit for their wisdom, guidance, and forbearance are the many people at Pearson Education who have supported this book. In particular, my thanks go to political science editors Eric Stano and Reid Hester, editorial assistant Elizabeth Alimena, production editor Kathy Sleys, project manager Hemalatha, and copy editor Jeyabalan Krishnaraj.

Much gratitude is owed also to family—my son Todd, my daughter Claire, my brother Mason, my grandson Jackson, and especially to Ellen, my wife and best friend for more than 40 years. Their love and devotion have been both sustaining and reassuring.

Finally, and sadly, I note the passing of Walter F. Murphy (1929-2010), who was a colleague of Professor Mason's for many years at Princeton. Walter's legacy as a teacher and mentor in the discipline is equaled only by his scholarly impact on the study of the Supreme Court.

Questions, suggestions, and comments about the book are welcomed via e-mail: grier.stephenson@fandm.edu.

D. G. S., Ir.

CONTENTS

PREFACE XVII

INTRODUCTION

A POLITICAL SUPREME COURT 1

Constitutional Interpretation and Political Choice 2

A Changing Judiciary 3

Appointment Politics, 1968-1984 6

Powell, Rehnquist, and Stevens 8

Appointment Politics, 1984-1992 10

Appointment Politics, 1992–2010 14

Key Terms 21

Queries 21

Selected Readings on Federal Judicial Appointments 21

Selected Readings on the Supreme Court 22

Selected Biographies 23

CHAPTER ONE

JURISDICTION AND ORGANIZATION OF THE FEDERAL COURTS 24

The Judicial Power 24

Supreme Court Decision Making 31

Source Materials 34

Reading a Supreme Court Decision 38

Key Terms 39

Queries 39

Selected Readings 39

CHAPTER TWO

THE CONSTITUTION, THE SUPREME COURT, AND JUDICIAL REVIEW 41

Granting and Limiting Power 41

The Doctrine of Judicial Review 43

Influences on Judicial Decision Making 47

viii Contents

Checks on Judicial Power 48
Finality of Supreme Court Decisions 50
Approaches to Constitutional Interpretation 52
Judicial Review—A Distinctively American
Contribution 54

Key Terms 55

Queries 55

Selected Readings 55

I. Establishing and Testing Judicial Review

Unstaged Debate of 1788: Robert Yates v.

Alexander Hamilton 57

Marbury v. Madison (1803) 60

Eakin v. Raub (1825) 64

Scott v. Sandford (1857) 67

II. External and Internal Checks on Judicial Power

Ex parte McCardle (1869) 70

Baker v. Carr (1962) 71

III. Finality of Supreme Court Decisions

City of Boerne v. Flores (1997) 71

Unstaged Debate: Andrew Jackson, Abraham Lincoln, and Arkansas v.

The Supreme Court 75

IV. Approaches to Constitutional Interpretation

Unstaged Debate of 1986: Judge Bork v. Professor Tribe 77

CHAPTER THREE

CONGRESS AND THE PRESIDENT 80

Separation of Powers 80

Congress and Lawmaking 82

The President and Executive Power 85

Foreign Policy and National Security 88

Key Terms 92

Queries 92

Selected Readings 93

I. Delegation and Lawmaking

Mistretta v. United States (1989) 94

Immigration and Naturalization Service v.

Chadha (1983) 97

Clinton v. City of New York (1998) 99

II. Congressional Investigations

Watkins v. United States (1957) 103

Barenblatt v. United States (1959) 106

III. Presidential Privilege and Immunity

United States v. Nixon (1974) 107

Nixon v. Fitzgerald (1982) 110

Clinton v. Jones (1997) 113

IV. Appointment and Removal

Myers v. United States (1926) 116

Humphrey's Executor v. United States (1935) 118

Morrison v. Olson (1988) 120

V. Foreign Policy and National Security

Ex parte Milligan (1866) 123

Missouri v. Holland (1920) 123

United States v. Curtiss-Wright Export Corp. (1936) 124

Korematsu v. United States (1944) 126

Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer (1952) 126

United States v. United States District Court (1972) 130

War Powers Resolution (1973) 131

Boumediene v. Bush (2008) 132

CHAPTER FOUR

FEDERALISM 133

Sources of Contention 134

Nature of National Authority 135

Concepts of Federalism 138

The Return of Dual Federalism 142

Key Terms 145

Queries 146

Selected Readings 146

I. Defining the Nature of the Union

Chisholm v. Georgia (1793) 147

McCulloch v. Maryland (1819) 149

Cohens v. Virginia (1821) 154

Collector v. Day (1871) 159

II. National Supremacy v. Dual Federalism in the Modern Era

U.S. Term Limits, Inc. v. Thornton (1995) 160

United States v. Morrison (2000) 164

Gonzales v. Raich (2005) 169

CHAPTER FIVE

THE ELECTORAL PROCESS 175

Voting 176

Representation 178

Party Politics and Campaigns 183

Key Terms 185

Queries 185

Selected Readings 185

I. Voting

Bush v. Gore (2000) 186

II. Representation

Baker v. Carr (1962) 190

Reynolds v. Sims (1964) 193

Vieth v. Jubelirer (2004) 197

Miller v. Johnson (1995) 201

III. Party Politics and Campaigns

California Democratic Party v. Jones (2000) 205

McConnell v. Federal Election Commission (2003) 209

Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission (2010) 215

CHAPTER SIX

THE COMMERCE CLAUSE 220

Views of the Framers 221

The Marshall Doctrine 222

The Doctrine of the Taney Court 224

States and the Commerce Clause Today 225

The National Commerce Power: Competing Visions 228

Constitutional Crisis 230

The Commerce Power Reborn 235

A Return to Limitations 237

Key Terms 238

Queries 238

Selected Readings 239

I. Defining the Commerce Power

Gibbons v. Ogden (1824) 240 Cooley v. Board of Wardens (1851) 244

II. States and the Commerce Power

Southern Pacific Co. v. Arizona (1945) 246

Philadelphia v. New Jersey (1978) 249

Granbolm v. Heald (2005) 251

III. Competing Visions of Congress' Commerce Power

United States v. E. C. Knight Co. (1895) 256

Champion v. Ames (1903) 258

Hammer v. Dagenhart (1918) 260

Stafford v. Wallace (1922) 262

IV. The New Deal in Court

Carter v. Carter Coal Co. (1936) 264

National Labor Relations Board v. Jones & Laughlin Steel

Corporation (1937) 267

V. Contemporary Views of the Commerce Power

Wickard v. Filburn (1942) 269

Heart of Atlanta Motel v. United States; Katzenbach v.

McClung (1964) 271

United States v. Lopez (1995) 272

United States v. Morrison (2000) 276

Gonzales v. Raich (2005) 276

CHAPTER SEVEN

NATIONAL TAXING AND SPENDING POWER 277

Direct and Indirect Taxes 278

Regulation Through Taxation 279

Regulation Through Spending 281

Key Terms 282

Queries 283

Selected Readings 283

I. Direct and Indirect Taxes

Hylton v. United States (1796) 284

Pollock v. Farmers' Loan & Trust Company (1895) 285

II. Regulation Through Taxation

McCray v. United States (1904) 288

Bailey v. Drexel Furniture Co. (1922) 289

III. Regulation Through Spending

United States v. Butler (1936) 291

South Dakota v. Dole (1987) 294

Rumsfeld v. Forum for Academic and Institutional Rights, Inc. (2006) 296

CHAPTER EIGHT

PROPERTY RIGHTS AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF DUE PROCESS 300

The Doctrine of Vested Rights 301

Expansion of the Contract Clause 302

Twilight of the Contract Clause 304

Origins of Due Process 305

Judicial Restraint and the Fourteenth Amendment 306

Judicial Activism and the Fourteenth Amendment 308

Search for a Role: Footnote Four 311

Takings, Land Use, and the Fifth Amendment 313

"New Property" and Due Process of Law 314

Key Terms 317

Queries 317

Selected Readings 317

I. Vested Rights and the Ex Post Facto Clause *Calder* v. *Bull* (1798) 319

II. The Contract Clause

Dartmouth College v. Woodward (1819) 321

Charles River Bridge v. Warren Bridge (1837) 324

Home Building & Loan Association v. Blaisdell (1934) 326

III. Property Rights and the Fourteenth Amendment

Slaughterhouse Cases (1873) 329

Munn v. Illinois (1877) 334

Unstaged Debate of 1893: Justice Brewer v. Professor Thayer 337

Lochner v. New York (1905) 340

Nebbia v. New York (1934) 343

West Coast Hotel Co. v. Parrish (1937) 345

Ferguson v. Skrupa (1963) 347

IV. Fifth Amendment Takings and Land Use

Kelo v. City of New London (2005) 348

V. "New Property"

Saenz v. Roe (1999) 351

CHAPTER NINE

THE BILL OF RIGHTS 355

Paths of Due Process of Law 355

Creation of the Bill of Rights 356

Applying the Bill of Rights to the States 358

The New Judicial Federalism: A New Double Standard 362

The Second Amendment 363

xii Contents

Key Terms 364

Queries 364

Selected Readings 365

I. Drive for a Bill of Rights

Jefferson-Madison Correspondence, 1787-1789 366

II. The Bill of Rights and the States

Palko v. Connecticut (1937) 368

Adamson v. California (1947) 370

Duncan v. Louisiana (1968) 372

III. The Second Amendment

District of Columbia v. Heller (2008) 374

McDonald v. City of Chicago (2010) 378

CHAPTER TEN

CRIMINAL JUSTICE 382

Searches and Seizures 383

Right to Counsel 391

Self-Incrimination 393

Punishment 396

Key Terms 399

Queries 399

Selected Readings 400

I. Searches and Seizures

A. Whose Rights? 401

Minnesota v. Carter (1998) 401

B. The Exclusionary Rule

Mapp v. Obio (1961) 403

United States v. Leon (1984) 404

C. Search Incident to Arrest

Chimel v. California (1969) 408

D. Automobile Searches

California v. Acevedo (1991) 410

E. Electronic Surveillance

Olmstead v. United States (1928) 413

Katz v. United States (1967) 415

United States v. United States District Court (1972) 418

Kyllo v. United States (2001) 418

F. Arrests, Detentions, and Frisks

Atwater v. City of Lago Vista (2001) 422

Terry v. Obio (1968) 426

G. Administrative Searches

Board of Education of Pottawatomie County v. Earls (2002) 428

II. Right to Counsel

Powell v. Alabama (1932) 432

Gideon v. Wainwright (1963) 434

III. Self-Incrimination

Miranda v. Arizona (1966) 436

Dickerson v. United States (2000) 439

IV. Capital Punishment

Gregg v. Georgia (1976) 444 Roper v. Simmons (2005) 447

CHAPTER ELEVEN

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION 452

Tests of Freedom 453

Internal Security 454

Public Forum 457

Protest and Symbolic Speech 458

Freedom of Association 461

Print and Electronic Media 463

Postscript 467

Key Terms 468

Queries 468

Selected Readings 468

I. Internal Security

Schenck v. United States (1919) 470

Gitlow v. New York (1925) 471

Whitney v. California (1927) 473

Dennis v. United States (1951) 475

Brandenburg v. Obio (1969) 478

II. Public Forum

Clark v. Community for Creative Non-Violence (1984) 480

Good News Club v. Milford Central School (2001) 482

III. Protest and Symbolic Speech

United States v. O'Brien (1968) 485

Texas v. Johnson (1989) 487

Virginia v. Black (2003) 490

IV. Freedom of Association

Boy Scouts of America and Monmouth Council v. Dale (2000) 494

Rumsfeld v. Forum for Academic and Institutional

Rights, Inc. (2006) 498

V. Print and Electronic Media

New York Times Co. v. Sullivan (1964) 498

New York Times Co. v. United States (1971) 500

Ashcroft v. Free Speech Coalition (2002) 504

CHAPTER TWELVE

RELIGIOUS LIBERTY 508

Competing Visions 508

The Establishment Clause 510

The Free Exercise Clause 515

Values in Tension 518

Key Terms 519

Queries 519

Selected Readings 520

xiv Contents

I. Religion in Public Schools and Other Official Settings Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe (2000) 521 McCreary County v. A.C.L.U. of Kentucky (2005) 524

II. State Aid to Religious Schools

Lemon v. Kurtzman (1971) 528

Agostini v. Felton (1997) 532

Zelman v. Simmons-Harris (2002) 536

III. Free Exercise of Religion

The Flag-Salute Cases 541

Minersville School District v. Gobitis (1940) 542

Justice Frankfurter to Justice Stone, May 27, 1940: A Qualified

Plea for Judicial Self-Restraint 545

West Virginia State Board of Education v.

Barnette (1943) 547

Sherbert v. Verner (1963) 549

Employment Division v. Smith (1990) 550

City of Boerne v. Flores (1997) 553

CHAPTER THIRTEEN

PRIVACY 554

Dimensions of Privacy 554

Private Law and Public Law Beginnings 555

Invigorating a Right of Privacy 557

Abortion 558

A Developing Concept 561

Key Terms 564

Queries 564

Selected Readings 564

I. Invigorating a Right of Privacy

Griswold v. Connecticut (1965) 565

II. Abortion

Roe v. Wade (1973) 568

Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v.

Casey (1992) 571

Gonzales v. Carbart (2007) 576

III. Right to Die

Washington v. Glucksberg (1997) 581

IV. Sexual Orientation

Lawrence v. Texas (2003) 584

CHAPTER FOURTEEN

EQUAL PROTECTION OF THE LAWS 590

Identifying Forbidden Discrimination 591 Racial Discrimination 592 State Action 597 Gender Discrimination 598 Fundamental Rights Analysis 599 Congressional Protection of Civil Rights 600

Affirmative Action 602

Key Terms 605

Queries 605

Selected Readings 606

I. Identifying Forbidden Discrimination

Korematsu v. United States (1944) 607

Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center (1985) 607

Romer v. Evans (1996) 610

II. Racial Discrimination

Plessy v. Ferguson (1896) 613

Brown v. Board of Education (First Case) (1954) 616

Bolling v. Sharpe (1954) 617

Brown v. Board of Education (Second Case) (1955) 618

Milliken v. Bradley (1974) 619

III. State Action

Civil Rights Cases (United States v. Stanley), (1883) 621

Moose Lodge v. Irvis (1972) 624

IV. Gender Discrimination

Frontiero v. Richardson (1973) 626

Craig v. Boren (1976) 628

Mississippi University for Women v. Hogan (1982) 629

V. Fundamental Rights Analysis

Shapiro v. Thompson (1969) 632

San Antonio Independent School District v.

Rodriguez (1973) 634

VI. Affirmative Action

Grutter v. Bollinger (2003) 637

Gratz v. Bollinger (2003) 642

Parents Involved in Community Schools v. Seattle School District No. 1 (2007) 646

CHAPTER FIFTEEN

SECURITY AND FREEDOM IN WARTIME 652

The Fragility of Civil Liberties 652

The USA Patriot Act 653

Antiterrorist Policies in Court 655

"Inter Arma Silent Leges" 657

Key Terms 658

Queries 658

Selected Readings 659

Ex parte Milligan (1866) 660

Ex parte *Quirin* (1942) 662

Korematsu v. United States (1944) 664

New York Times Company v. United States (1971) 667

United States v. United States District

Court (1972) 667

Boumediene v. Bush (2008) 669

xvi Contents

APPENDIX 675

The Constitution of the United States of America 675 Justices of the Supreme Court 686 Presidents and Justices 689

GLOSSARY 693

EPILOGUE 706

INDEX OF CASES 713

INDEX OF SUBJECTS AND NAMES 722