

STUDIES IN LOGIC  
AND  
THE FOUNDATIONS OF MATHEMATICS

VOLUME 143

S. ABRAMSKY / S. ARTEMOV / R.A. SHORE / A.S. TROELSTRA  
EDITORS

---

*Classical Recursion  
Theory  
Volume II*

P.G. ODIFREDDI

---

ELSEVIER

AMSTERDAM • LAUSANNE • NEW YORK • OXFORD • SHANNON • SINGAPORE • TOKYO

# CLASSICAL RECURSION THEORY VOLUME II

---

P.G. ODIFREDDI  
*University of Turin*  
*Turin, Italy*



1999

---

ELSEVIER  
AMSTERDAM • LAUSANNE • NEW YORK • OXFORD • SHANNON • SINGAPORE • TOKYO

ELSEVIER SCIENCE B.V.  
Sara Burgerhartstraat 25  
P.O. Box 211, 1000 AE Amsterdam, The Netherlands

© 1999 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.

This work is protected under copyright by Elsevier Science, and the following terms and conditions apply to its use:

#### Photocopying

Single photocopies of single chapters may be made for personal use as allowed by national copyright laws. Permission of the Publisher and payment of a fee is required for all other photocopying, including multiple or systematic copying, copying for advertising or promotional purposes, resale, and all forms of document delivery. Special rates are available for educational institutions that wish to make photocopies for non-profit educational classroom use.

Permissions may be sought directly from Elsevier Science Rights & Permissions Department, PO Box 800, Oxford OX5 1DX, UK; phone: (+44) 1865 843830, fax: (+44) 1865 853333, e-mail: [permissions@elsevier.co.uk](mailto:permissions@elsevier.co.uk). You may also contact Rights & Permissions directly through Elsevier's home page (<http://www.elsevier.nl>), selecting first 'Customer Support', then 'General Information', then 'Permissions Query Form'.

In the USA, users may clear permissions and make payments through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA; phone: (978) 7508400, fax: (978) 7504744, and in the UK through the Copyright Licensing Agency Rapid Clearance Service (CLARCS), 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP, UK; phone: (+44) 171 631 5555; fax: (+44) 171 631 5500. Other countries may have a local reprographic rights agency for payments.

#### Derivative Works

Tables of contents may be reproduced for internal circulation, but permission of Elsevier Science is required for external resale or distribution of such material.

Permission of the Publisher is required for all other derivative works, including compilations and translations.

#### Electronic Storage or Usage

Permission of the Publisher is required to store or use electronically any material contained in this work, including any chapter or part of a chapter.

Except as outlined above, no part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the Publisher.

Address permissions requests to: Elsevier Science Rights & Permissions Department, at the mail, fax and e-mail addresses noted above.

#### Notice

No responsibility is assumed by the Publisher for any injury and/or damage to persons or property as a matter of products liability, negligence or otherwise, or from any use or operation of any methods, products, instructions or ideas contained in the material herein. Because of rapid advances in the medical sciences, in particular, independent verification of diagnoses and drug dosages should be made.

First edition 1999

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data  
A catalog record from the Library of Congress has been applied for.

ISBN 0 444 50205 X

⊗ The paper used in this publication meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (Permanence of Paper).

Printed in The Netherlands.

CLASSICAL RECURSION THEORY  
VOLUME II

**To my parents,  
on their 50th anniversary.**

# Preface to Volume II

If it is bad luck to title a book “Volume I”, as Gian-Carlo Rota says in *Indiscreet Thoughts*, it is not good luck to promise a Volume II in the introduction, either. For the ten years after the appearance of *Classical Recursion Theory* in 1989, I was torn between the easy choice of publishing a new edition of the first volume with an amended introduction, and the much harder choice of completing the second volume. Now that an apparently diverging sequence of successive drafts has finally come to a limit, I can release both a new edition of the first volume and a second volume.

In this last moment dedicated to thanksgivings, my first thoughts go to Laura. She entered my shattered life in 1986, putting its pieces back together and providing an inexhaustible flow of joy, happiness and understanding. She whipped me back into line, whenever I strayed from what she rightly considered the correct path. As I already wrote on her copy of Volume I, this book is also hers.

As the previous one, much of my last decade has been enlightened by visits to different parts of the world, made possible by a number of friends. First and foremost, Anil Nerode and Richard Shore, thanks to whom Ithaca became my second home for three years and thirteen summers. Then John Crossley in Melbourne in 1988, Dongping Yang in Beijing in 1992 and 1995, Gerald Sacks in Boston in 1995, 1996 and 1998, Antonin Kučera in Prague and Cristian Calude in Auckland in 1996, and Ding Deheng in Nanjing in 1998. Last but not least, Andrea Sorbi, whose selfless work as coordinator of a Human Capital and Mobility Project provided the funds for a number of European trips.

Even more than for the first volume, I owe a great debt to the colleagues who have read parts of the manuscript and have provided corrections and suggestions: Klaus Ambos-Spies, Francesco Bergadano, Cristian Calude, Barry Cooper, Ugo de’ Liguoro, Lavinia Egidi, Dick Epstein, Matt Giorgi, Lane Hemachandra, Carl Jockusch, Martin Kummer, Antonin Kučera, Steffen Lempp, Bob Lubarsky, Wolfgang Merkle, Franco Montagna, Michael Morley, Dan Osherson, Alan Selman, Mark Simpson, Ted Slaman, Bob Soare, Andrea Sorbi, Frank Stephan, Helmut Veith and Yue Yang.

Whatever vision informs the book has been inspired by a handful of people, whose thoughts have provided and sustained inspiration through the years: Barry Cooper, Juris Hartmanis, Carl Jockusch, Georg Kreisel, Anil Nerode, Richard Platek and Gerald Sacks. Their acquaintance has been an undeserved honor, their teaching a much appreciated gift.

However, the book would never have been completed without the massive help of the Magnificent Four whose expectations have set my standards: Rod Downey, Bill Gasarch, André Nies and Richard Shore. As friends, they have provided a constant stimulus and encouragement, much needed in the face of hurdles and doubts. As colleagues, they have dedicated an enormous amount of time and energy to help me with explanations and proofs. If this volume does not displease them, I will be delighted.

As Beaumarchais once noticed, books are for authors as babies are for mothers: conceived in pleasure, carried with fatigue and given birth in pain. No words could better describe an enterprise that literally took away half of my life, nor better introduce the subject of dedication. Because, if I look back at my forty-eight years, in them I see only my parents more constant than this book. As a first child, I shared most of their life together: perhaps not as close and near as they would have liked, perhaps closer and nearer than they might have guessed. The deadline of their fiftieth anniversary on September 17th, 1999 has provided a major drive towards the completion of the book: another item to add to a long list of valuable parental offerings, which neither spoken nor printed words are able to match.

Ithaca - Torino  
1989 - 1999

# Contents

<b>Preface</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
What is in the Book . . . . .	1
How to Use the Book . . . . .	3
Notation and Conventions . . . . .	5
<b>VII THEORIES OF RECURSIVE FUNCTIONS</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>VII.1 Measures of Complexity</b> . . . . .	10
Static complexity measures ★ . . . . .	11
Shortening proofs by adding axioms ★ . . . . .	17
Definition of a dynamic complexity measure . . . . .	19
First properties of dynamic complexity measures . . . . .	23
<b>VII.2 Speed of Computations</b> . . . . .	26
Upper and lower bounds of the complexities of a function . . . . .	26
The Compression Theorem ★ . . . . .	32
Functions with best complexity . . . . .	34
The Speed-Up Theorem . . . . .	38
<b>VII.3 Complexity Classes</b> . . . . .	47
Hierarchies for the recursive functions: successor levels ★ . . . . .	50
Hierarchies for the recursive functions: limit levels . . . . .	55
Hierarchies for the recursive functions: exhaustiveness ★ . . . . .	59
Names for complexity classes ★ . . . . .	61
<b>VII.4 Time and Space Measures</b> . . . . .	67
One-tape Turing machines . . . . .	67
Other Turing machine models ★ . . . . .	70
Linear Speed-Up . . . . .	76
Hierarchy theorems . . . . .	80
Space versus time . . . . .	84
Nondeterministic Turing machines . . . . .	86



Alternating Turing machines ★	95
VII.5 Inductive Inference	96
Historical background ★	98
Identification by next value	101
Identification by consistent explanation	104
Identification by reliable explanation	111
Identification by explanation	116
Identification by explanation with finite errors	126
Behaviorally correct (consistent) identification	131
Behaviorally correct identification with finite errors	138
The world of inference classes ★	141
Degrees of inferability ★	141
VIII HIERARCHIES OF RECURSIVE FUNCTIONS	145
VIII.1 Small Time and Space Bounds ★	147
Real time	147
Constant space	150
Logarithmic space	160
VIII.2 Deterministic Polynomial Time	163
Polynomial time computable functions	163
Closure properties	164
Alternative characterizations	170
Rate of growth	177
Feasibly computable functions ★	178
The class P	181
Logarithmic space again and beyond ★	184
A look inside P ★	187
Polynomial time degrees ★	188
VIII.3 Nondeterministic Polynomial Time ★	197
The class NP	198
Deterministic polynomial time again ★	198
NP sets as analogues of r.e. sets: successes	199
NP sets as analogues of r.e. sets: failures ★	208
Relativizations	213
Polynomial time degrees again ★	222
VIII.4 The Polynomial Time Hierarchy ★	223
Truth in Bounded Quantifier Arithmetic	224
Types of bounded quantifiers ★	225
The Polynomial Time Hierarchy	226
Second-Order Logic on finite domains ★	227
The levels of the Polynomial Time Hierarchy	228
Relativizations	231

<b>VIII.5 Polynomial Space ★</b>	235
Linear space ★	235
The class PSPACE	237
Polynomial time again ★	240
The Polynomial Time Hierarchy again	242
Relativizations	244
A look inside PSPACE ★	248
<b>VIII.6 Exponential Time and Space</b>	249
Exponential time	250
Beyond exponential time ★	255
Exponential space	259
Superexponential bounds ★	261
<b>VIII.7 Elementary Functions</b>	264
Elementary functions	264
Closure properties	265
Alternative characterizations	269
Computation time and space	272
Rate of growth	275
Hierarchies	278
The diagonal function ★	279
Relativizations	284
<b>VIII.8 Primitive Recursive Functions</b>	286
Primitive recursive functions	286
Closure properties	287
Alternative characterizations	295
Computation time and space	297
Rate of growth	298
Hierarchies	301
The diagonal function ★	308
<b>VIII.9 <math>\epsilon_0</math>-Recursive Functions</b>	314
Multiple recursive functions ★	315
Ordinal recursion	316
$\epsilon_0$ -recursive functions	318
Closure properties	319
Alternative characterizations	322
Functions provably total in Peano Arithmetic ★	324
Rate of growth	326
Hierarchies	338
The diagonal function ★	342
A natural stopping point ★	355

<b>IX RECURSIVELY ENUMERABLE SETS</b>	<b>357</b>
IX.1 <b>Global Properties of Recursive Sets</b>	358
Characterizations of the lattice of recursive sets	358
The complexity of the theory of recursive sets	361
Homogeneity	361
Automorphisms	362
Absolute definability	363
Ultrafilters and models of fragments of Arithmetic $\star$	364
IX.2 <b>Local Properties of R.E. Sets</b>	368
Splitting theorems	368
Hyperhypersimple sets	374
R-maximal sets	376
Maximal sets	379
Sets without maximal supersets	385
The world of simple sets $\star$	393
IX.3 <b>Global Properties of R.E. Sets</b>	401
The complexity of the theory of r.e. sets $\star$	401
Absolute definability	403
Homogeneity	411
Automorphisms	414
Orbits $\star$	422
Definable and invariant classes of r.e. degrees $\star$	423
IX.4 <b>Complexity of R.E. Sets</b>	424
Nonspeedable sets	424
Effectively speedable sets	431
Existence theorems	435
Complexity sequences $\star$	438
IX.5 <b>Inductive Inference of R.E. Sets <math>\star</math></b>	447
Identification by explanation of sets	447
Identification by explanation of partial functions	452
<b>X RECURSIVELY ENUMERABLE DEGREES</b>	<b>455</b>
X.1 <b>The Finite Injury Priority Method</b>	456
Motivation	456
Embeddability results	459
Sacks agreement method	464
A tactical variation $\star$	467
X.2 <b>Effective Baire Category <math>\star</math></b>	467
Categorical formulation of finite injury arguments	468
The permitting method	470
Degrees r.e. in smaller degrees $\star$	471

<b>X.3 The Infinite Injury Priority Method</b>	473
Thick subsets	473
The Injury Lemma	474
The Hat Trick	476
The Window Lemma	478
The Gate Opening Lemma ★	480
The Thickness Lemma	482
Formal systems and r.e. sets ★	485
<b>X.4 The Priority Method</b>	487
Historical remarks ★	487
The Tree Method	488
Admissibility ★	496
Bounded Arithmetic ★	501
Avoiding the priority method	505
A review of solutions to Post's Problem ★	509
<b>X.5 Many-One Degrees</b>	511
Incomparable degrees	511
Upward density	513
Greatest lower bounds	514
Least upper bounds	518
Connections between structure and degrees ★	519
Minimal degrees	526
Initial segments	530
Global properties	534
<b>X.6 Turing Degrees</b>	538
Incomparable degrees	539
Density	541
Greatest lower bounds	543
Least upper bounds	551
Lattice embeddings ★	559
Definability from parameters	565
The complexity of the theory of r.e. degrees	572
Absolute definability ★	578
Homogeneity ★	579
Automorphisms ★	580
<b>X.7 Comparison of Degree Theories ★</b>	582
One-one degrees	582
Bounded truth-table degrees	585
Truth-table degrees	593
Elementary inequivalences	601
<b>X.8 Structure Inside Degrees ★</b>	603
Inside many-one degrees	603

Inside truth-table degrees . . . . .	605
Inside weak truth-table degrees . . . . .	611
Inside Turing degrees . . . . .	612
X.9 <b>Index Sets</b> ★ . . . . .	618
Complexity of index sets . . . . .	619
Specific index sets . . . . .	620
Applications of index sets to degrees . . . . .	632
Global structure . . . . .	634
<b>XI LIMIT SETS</b> . . . . .	<b>641</b>
XI.1 <b>Jump Classes</b> . . . . .	641
Domination properties . . . . .	641
Jump classes . . . . .	646
Hops . . . . .	650
Jump inversion below $0'$ . . . . .	656
Generalized jump classes ★ . . . . .	660
XI.2 <b>1-Generic Degrees</b> . . . . .	662
Full approximation arguments . . . . .	664
Permitting below r.e. degrees ★ . . . . .	667
Permitting below $\text{GL}_2$ degrees ★ . . . . .	669
Permitting below 1-generic degrees below $0'$ ★ . . . . .	671
XI.3 <b>Structure Theory</b> . . . . .	676
The Diamond Theorem . . . . .	676
Incomparable degrees . . . . .	679
The Capping Theorem . . . . .	683
The Cupping Theorem . . . . .	687
The Complementation Theorem . . . . .	689
Exact pairs and ideals . . . . .	690
XI.4 <b>Minimal Degrees</b> . . . . .	695
Methodology ★ . . . . .	695
Minimal degrees below $0'$ . . . . .	698
Full approximation arguments ★ . . . . .	702
Permitting below r.e. degrees ★ . . . . .	705
The initial segments of the degrees below $0'$ ★ . . . . .	708
XI.5 <b>Global Properties</b> . . . . .	708
Definability from parameters . . . . .	708
The complexity of the theory of degrees below $0'$ . . . . .	714
Absolute definability ★ . . . . .	718
Homogeneity ★ . . . . .	719
Automorphisms ★ . . . . .	720
Subclasses of degrees below $0'$ ★ . . . . .	722
Definability of $0'$ in the degrees ★ . . . . .	726

<b>XI.6 Many-One Degrees <math>\star</math></b>	<b>729</b>
Partial many-one reducibility	729
The mini-jump operator	732
$\Delta_2^0$ many-one degrees	734
<b>XII ARITHMETICAL SETS</b>	<b>737</b>
<b>XII.1 Forcing in Arithmetic</b>	<b>737</b>
Definition of forcing	738
Generic sets	741
Genericity without forcing $\star$	744
An alternative approach to forcing $\star$	747
History of the notion of forcing $\star$	747
Product forcing $\star$	748
Local forcing on trees	751
<b>XII.2 Applications of Forcing</b>	<b>753</b>
Turing degrees	753
Arithmetical reducibilities $\star$	755
Arithmetical definability $\star$	758
Implicit arithmetical definability $\star$	760
$\omega$ -Hops	765
<b>XII.3 Turing Degrees of Arithmetical Sets</b>	<b>769</b>
Local and global properties	769
Cones of minimal covers	773
Definability of the Turing degrees of arithmetical sets	776
<b>XIII ARITHMETICAL DEGREES</b>	<b>781</b>
<b>XIII.1 The Theory of Arithmetical Degrees</b>	<b>781</b>
The finite extension method	782
The tree method	784
Arithmetical jump	787
Global properties	787
Arithmetical degrees below $0'_a$	791
<b>XIII.2 An Analogue of R.E. Sets</b>	<b>794</b>
Basic properties	794
Representation of infinite hops	796
The complexity of $\omega$ -r.e.a. sets	797
<b>XIII.3 An Analogue of Post's Problem</b>	<b>798</b>
A first approximation to the construction	800
The real construction	804
The basic module of the construction	806
The ingredients of the construction	809
An analogue of the Friedberg-Muchnik Theorem	809

<b>XIII.4 An Analogue of the Jump Classes</b> . . . . .	<b>811</b>
The main result . . . . .	811
Jump classes . . . . .	815
Jump inversion . . . . .	816
<b>XIII.5 Comparison with the R.E. Degrees</b> . . . . .	<b>817</b>
Minimal pairs . . . . .	817
The Diamond Theorem . . . . .	824
<b>XIV ENUMERATION DEGREES</b>	<b>827</b>
<b>XIV.1 Enumeration Degrees</b> . . . . .	<b>827</b>
Total degrees . . . . .	829
<b>XIV.2 The Theory of Enumeration Degrees</b> . . . . .	<b>833</b>
Minimal pairs . . . . .	834
Minimal covers . . . . .	836
Global properties . . . . .	842
<b>XIV.3 Enumeration Degrees below <math>0'_e</math></b> . . . . .	<b>847</b>
Density . . . . .	849
Greatest lower bounds . . . . .	851
Least upper bounds . . . . .	853
Lattice embeddings . . . . .	853
Global properties . . . . .	856
<b>XIV.4 A Model of the Lambda Calculus <math>\star</math></b> . . . . .	<b>857</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>863</b>
<b>Notation Index</b>	<b>923</b>
<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>929</b>

# Introduction to Volume II

We obviously keep in Volume II the same notation and conventions used in Volume I. For the reader's convenience, we reproduce here the parts of the Introduction to Volume I which are relevant to Volume II.

## What is in the Book

Recall that **Classical Recursion Theory is the study of real numbers or, equivalently, functions over the natural numbers**. The basic methods of analysis of the real numbers used in Volumes I and II are:

**Hierarchies.** A hierarchy is a stratification of a class of reals built from below, starting from a subclass that is taken as primitive (either because well understood, or because already previously analyzed), and obtained by iteration of an operation of class construction.

**Degrees.** Degrees are equivalence classes of reals under given equivalence relations, that identify reals with similar properties. Once a class of reals has been studied and understood, degrees are usually defined by identifying reals that look the same from that class point of view.

As might be imagined the two methods are complementary: first a class is analyzed in terms of intrinsic properties, for example by appropriately stratifying it in hierarchies, and then the whole structure of real numbers is studied modulo that analysis with the appropriate notion of degrees induced by the given class.

The previous complementarity is exploited throughout Volume II. In Chapter VIII we provide a study of **polynomial time computable functions** and of the induced notion of **polynomial time degrees** (similar notions of degrees could be introduced for most complexity classes studied in Chapter VIII). In Chapters IX, X and XIV we provide a study of the **recursively enumerable sets** and of the induced notion of **enumeration degrees**, while in Chapters



XII and XIII we provide a study of the **arithmetical sets** and of the induced notion of **arithmetical degrees**.

We now outline the skeleton of Volume II in more detail, referring to the introductions of the various chapters for more details. Chapters VII and VIII resume the analysis of the fundamental objects in Recursion Theory, the recursive sets and functions, and provide a microscopic picture of them. We start in Chapter VII with an abstract study of the complexity of computation of recursive functions. Then in Chapter VIII we attempt to build from below the world of recursive sets and functions that was previously introduced in just one go. A number of subclasses of interest from a computational point of view are introduced and discussed, among them: the **polynomial time (or space) computable functions** which provide an upper bound for the class of feasibly computable functions (as opposed to the abstractly computable ones); the **elementary functions**, which are the smallest known class of functions closed under time (deterministic or not) and space computations; the **primitive recursive functions**, which are those computable by the 'for' instruction of programming languages like PASCAL, i.e. with a preassigned number of iterations (as opposed to the recursive functions, computable by the 'while' instruction, which permits an unlimited number of iterations); the  **$\epsilon_0$ -recursive functions**, which are those provably total in Peano Arithmetic.

Chapters IX and X return to the treatment of recursively enumerable sets. A good deal of information on their structure was already gathered in Chapter III, but here a systematic study of the structures of both the lattice of **recursively enumerable sets** and of the partial ordering of **recursively enumerable degrees** is undertaken. Special tools for their treatment are introduced, most prominent among them being the **priority method**, a constructive variation of the Baire Category method.

Chapter XI deals with **limit sets**, also known as  $\Delta_2^0$  sets, which are limits of recursive functions. They are a natural formalization of the notion of sets for which membership can be determined by effective trials and errors, unlike recursive sets (for which membership can be effectively determined), and recursively enumerable sets (for which membership can be determined with at most one mistake, by first guessing that an element is not in the set, and then changing opinion if it shows up during the generation of the set).

Chapter XII deals with **arithmetical sets**, which are definable in the language of First-Order Arithmetic. As a special tool for their treatment we introduce the method of **arithmetical forcing**, which can be combined with the Baire Category and the priority methods. Chapter XIII studies the structure of the continuum w.r.t. the notion of relative arithmetical definability provided by the **arithmetical degrees**, along the lines of Chapter V. Similarly, Chapter XIV studies the structure of the continuum w.r.t. a notion of relative recursive enumerability provided by the **enumeration degrees**.