

OXFORD

THE FUTURE  
*of* BIOETHICS

International Dialogues

EDITED BY

Akira Akabayashi

# The Future of Bioethics

*International Dialogues*

EDITED BY

Akira Akabayashi



OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,  
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.  
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,  
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of  
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© The several contributors 2014

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 2014

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in  
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the  
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted  
by law, by licence, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics  
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the  
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the  
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013943974

ISBN 978-0-19-968267-6

Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and  
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials  
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

# The Future of Bioethics

# Preface

Evolving and cutting-edge medical technologies, such as developments in neuroscience and regenerative medicine, show exceptional promise in improving human health. However, they also engender unprecedented ethical, legal, and social problems that require both global and local responses.

Issues related to new technologies are further confounded by the effect of globalization on social change, made possible by astounding developments in information technology and transportation. These changes affect bioethics in two ways. They lead to issues around the movement of people and populations, in particular the migration of patients and care workers across continents, and those caused by enormous international medical research studies involving participants from many countries and cultures. Second, global issues call for global efforts and global solutions. Mobilization of humankind's ethical wisdom is required to address these in a manner that transcends cultural and national differences. Establishing culturally and ethically informed dialogue is the critical first step toward resolving these diverse problems.

This is the first book on bioethics that presents a genuine engagement between scholars and practitioners from East and West: the first book in the discipline of bioethics for the globalized world of the future. We address the emerging issues in bioethics. We aim to set the agenda for the future, focusing on new developments and their potential for change.

Most studies in bioethics advocating East–West dialogue have either attempted cross-cultural comparison or proposed Eastern philosophical paradigms as a counter to Western ideas. The tacit premise of previous writing on East–West dialogue is therefore a strain of relativism. From the Eastern perspective, Western views are treated as a cultural construct that should be referenced as models, but are not appropriate to be utilized in their existing form. To Westerners, Eastern interpretation represents ways of thinking that should be recognized but can never truly be understood in their complexity within Western cultures. For this reason, Asians place Western conceptions of bioethics on the critical chopping block, and approach them as something to be overcome. In contrast, although Westerners occasionally comment on current conditions in Asian countries, they rarely fully engage with bioethical discussions led by Asian researchers, and neither express agreement nor fully critique such views. In a globalized world, simply maintaining a respectful distance from other cultures is no longer sufficient.

The time has come for us to engage actively with different cultural perspectives, rather than hearing them and rather than listening attentively to them. The most prominent characteristic of this collection's development derives from the way in which the book has been developed. First, the contributors met to discuss and identify the issues at the cutting edge of bioethics. Then the leading researchers offered primary topic articles (PTAs). Next, researchers from various countries wrote commentaries to which the PTA authors replied. At each stage, the contributors communicated with each other to ensure genuine engagement while revising their contributions in light of ongoing

dialogue. The commentary authors included leading researchers as well as promising, relatively young researchers. Thus, the book aims not only at a cross-cultural dialogue, but a dialogue between researchers of different generations.

The book comprises two parts. Part I looks at bioethical issues that arise from new medical technologies such as regenerative medicine, enhancement, research ethics, and synthetic biology. Part II addresses challenging dilemmas that result from the globalization of social change, such as transplantation tourism, public health ethics, care in the aging society, and professionalism.

One can imagine, from a glance at the table of contents and contributing authors, what an important contribution this collection will be. Therefore a lengthy preface is unnecessary. I hope that the readers will enjoy this honest dialogue between researchers from both the East and West.

While these 21 chapters do not cover all topics that are likely to arise over the course of this century, they cover particularly challenging issues faced by current researchers. Dialogue must span both local and global levels. This, to me, is “the future of bioethics.”

July 2013

Akira Akabayashi

*University of Tokyo*

# Acknowledgements

I would first like to express my appreciation to the editorial advisory board members, Drs. Arthur Caplan, Alastair Campbell, Tony Hope, Tom Murray, and Julian Savulescu. Especially, this book could not have been published without the help of Tony and Julian, who provided valuable editing assistance and advice.

I would also like to thank Drs. Keiichiro Yamamoto, Hitoshi Arima, Satoshi Kodama, and Deborah Zion for their comments and insightful suggestions.

This book was supported in part by grants from the University of Tokyo Global Center of Excellence (GCOE) Program funded by the Japanese Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology, and the Uehiro Foundation on Ethics and Education.

# List of Abbreviations

AAHRPP	Association for the Accreditation of Human Research Participants Program
ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
AFM	French Muscular Dystrophy Association
AJOB	American Journal of Bioethics
AMA	Australian Medical Association
AMANET	African Malaria Network Trust
ARV	antiretroviral treatment
ASBH	American Society of Bioethics and Humanities
ASC	somatic or 'adult' stem cell
ASPD	antisocial personality disorder
BAC	Bioethics Advisory Committee (of the Singapore government)
CCTP	Conditional Cash Transfer Program
CEA	cost-effectiveness analysis
CER	comparative effectiveness research
CF	cystic fibrosis
CHRB	Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine
CML	chronic myelogenous leukemia
CMS	Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services
CNS	central nervous system
COI	conflict of interest
COPD	chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
CPMC	Coriell Personalized Medicine Collaborative
DALY	disability-adjusted life year
DBS	deep brain stimulation
DOI	Declaration of Istanbul
DTC	direct to consumer
ELSI	ethical, legal, and social issues
EOPJ	equal opportunity-based principle of justice
EPO	erythropoietin
ES	embryonic stem



xviii LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ESC	embryonic stem cell
ESRD	end-stage renal disease
EU	European Union
FDA	Food and Drug Administration
FERCAP	Forum for Ethical Review Committees in the Asian Western Pacific Region
fMRI	functional magnetic resonance imaging
GATS	Global Agreement on Trade in Services
GRID	gay-related immunodeficiency disease
HCT/Ps	human cells, tissues, and cellular and tissue-based products
hES	human embryonic stem
HMO	Health Maintenance Organization
HOTA	Human Organ Transplant Act 1987 (Singapore)
HSC	hematopoietic stem cell
ICER	incremental cost-effectiveness ratio
ICMS	International Cellular Medicine Society
ICOB	Informed Cohort Oversight Board
ICU	intensive care unit
IP	intellectual property
iPS	induced pluripotent stem
IRB	institutional review board
IRENSA	International Research Ethics Network for Southern Africa
JCAHO	Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations
JCI	Joint Commission International
JMA	Japan Medical Association
JME	Journal of Medical Ethics
JPMA	Japan Pharmaceutical Manufacturers Association
JSIM	Japanese Society of Internal Medicine
JST	Japan Society for Transplantation
LTC	long-term care
MHLW	Ministry of Health, Labor, and Welfare (Japan)
MOH	Ministry of Health (China)
MSC	mesenchymal stem cell
MT	moral technology
MTERA	Medical (Therapy, Research and Education) Act 1972 (Singapore)
NCB	Nuffield Council on Bioethics
NCC	Japanese National Cancer Center

NECTAR	Network of European CNS Transplantation and Restoration
NHI	national health insurance
NHS	National Health Service
NICE	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence
NOTA	National Organ Transplant Act 1984
NOTU	National Organ Transplant Unit
NSFC	National Natural Science Foundation of China
OHRP	Office for Human Research Protections
ONT	Spanish National Transplant Organization
OPO	Organ Procurement Organization
OPTN	Organ Procurement and Transplantation Network
PB	procreative beneficence
PD	Parkinson's disease
PGD	preimplantation genetic diagnosis
PhRMA	Pharmaceutical Manufacturer Association
pmp	per million population
QALY	quality-adjusted life year
RCT	randomized controlled trial
SARETI	South African Research Ethics Initiative
SCNT	somatic cell nuclear transfer
SCNT	somatic cell nuclear transfer
SDM	substitute decision maker
SIDCER	Strategic Initiative for Developing Capacity in Ethical Review
SSRI	selective serotonin reuptake inhibitor
STS	science, technology, and society study
TB	tuberculosis
TEC	Transplant Ethics Committee
TRREE	Training and Resources in Research Ethics Evaluation
TTS	The Transplantation Society
UK	United Kingdom
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNOS	United Network for Organ Sharing
US	United States
USADA	US Anti-Doping Agency
USPHT	United States Public Health Task Force
VE	virtue ethics

XX LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

WADA	World Anti-Doping Agency
WHO	World Health Organization
WMA	World Medical Association

# List of Contributors

AKIRA AKABAYASHI University of Tokyo, Japan  
YOHEI AKAIDA University of Tokyo, Japan  
HITOSHI ARIMA Yokohama City University, Japan  
ATSUSHI ASAI Kumamoto University, Japan  
MARK P. AULISIO Case Western Reserve University, USA  
JING BAI National Center for Women and Children's Health, China CDC, China  
TOM L. BEAUCHAMP Georgetown University, USA  
CARL BECKER Kyoto University, Japan  
ARIC BENDORF Centre for Values, Ethics and the Law in Medicine, Australia  
EDWARD J. BERGMAN University of Pennsylvania, USA  
NANCY BERLINGER Hastings Center, USA  
MICHAEL C. BRANNIGAN College of Saint Rose, USA  
DANIEL CALLAHAN Hastings Center, USA  
ALASTAIR V. CAMPBELL National University of Singapore, Singapore  
ARTHUR L. CAPLAN New York University, USA  
BENJAMIN CAPPS National University of Singapore, Singapore  
LEONARDO D. DE CASTRO National University of Singapore, Singapore  
JACQUELINE J. L. CHIN National Singapore University, Singapore  
NORMAN DANIELS Harvard University, USA  
ANGUS DAWSON University of Birmingham, UK  
NICOLE M. DEMING Case Western Reserve University, USA  
THOMAS DOUGLAS University of Oxford, UK  
MICHAEL DUNN University of Oxford, UK  
H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT Jr., Rice University, USA  
RUIPING FAN City University of Hong Kong, China  
AUTUMN FIESTER University of Pennsylvania, USA  
MICHAEL K. GUSMANO Hastings Center, USA  
YOSHINORI HAYASHI Ritsumeikan University, Japan  
ANITA HO University of British Columbia, Canada  
SORAJ HONGLADAROM Chulalongkorn University, Thailand  
TONY HOPE University of Oxford, UK  
TOMOHIDE IBUKI National Center of Neurology and Psychiatry, Japan

- YASUTAKA ICHINOKAWA University of Tokyo, Japan  
TAKASHI IKEDA Meiji University, Japan  
AKIRA INOUE Ritsumeikan University, Japan  
KOHJI ISHIHARA University of Tokyo, Japan  
TAICHI ISOBE University of Tokyo, Japan  
BRUCE JENNINGS Center for Humans and Nature, USA  
AMAR JESANI Centre for Studies in Ethics and Rights, Mumbai, India  
D. GARETH JONES University of Otago, New Zealand  
YASUHIRO KADOOKA Kumamoto University, Japan  
GREGORY KAEBNICK Hastings Center, USA  
KATSUNORI KAI Waseda University, Japan  
OSAMU KANAMORI University of Tokyo, Japan  
IAN KERRIDGE The Centre for Values, Ethics and the Law in Medicine, Australia  
TAKANOBU KINJO University of the Ryukyus, Japan  
SATOSHI KODAMA Kyoto University, Japan  
ILHAK LEE Yonsei University, Korea  
DONNA L. LUEBKE MetroHealth System, USA  
TAMRA LYSAGHT National University of Singapore, Singapore  
SHUNZO MAJIMA Hokkaido University, Japan  
KAREN J. MASCHKE Hastings Center, USA  
MICHELLE L. MCGOWAN Case Western Reserve University, USA  
CATHERINE MILLS University of Sydney, Australia  
NOZOMI MIZUSHIMA University of Tokyo, Japan  
FARHAT MOZAM Center of Biomedical Ethics and Culture, SIUT, Pakistan  
JONATHAN D. MORENO University of Pennsylvania, USA  
MASAHIRO MORIOKA Osaka Prefecture University, Japan  
THOMAS MURRAY Hastings Center, USA  
TAKAHIRO NAKAJIMA University of Tokyo, Japan  
EISUKE NAKAZAWA University of Tokyo, Japan  
MASATOSHI NARA Keio University, Japan  
YUKIHIRO NOBUHARA The University of Tokyo, Japan  
JUSTIN OAKLEY Monash University, Australia  
KANTARO OHASHI Kobe College, Japan  
TAKETOSHI OKITA Osaka University, Japan  
TARO OKUDA Nanzan University, Japan  
KOJI OTA University of Tokyo, Japan

- Ji-YONG PARK Yonsei University, Korea
- MICHAEL PARKER University of Oxford, UK
- INGMAR PERSSON University of Gothenburg, Sweden and University of Oxford, UK
- RACHEL PHETTEPLACE Case Western Reserve University, USA
- RENZONG QIU Chinese Academy of Social Sciences & Peking Union Medical College, China
- MALA RAMANATHAN Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology, India
- JAMES SABIN Harvard University, USA
- OSAMU SAKURA The University of Tokyo, Japan
- RYOJI SATO Monash University, Australia, Japan
- TOMOKO SATO University of Tokyo, Japan
- JULIAN SAVULESCU University of Oxford, UK
- SUSUMU SHIMAZONO Sophia University, Japan
- YOSUKE SHIMAZONO Osaka University, Japan
- DOUGLAS SIPP RIKEN Center for Developmental Biology, Japan
- ROBERT SPARROW Monash University, Australia
- PETER A. SY University of the Philippines, Philippines
- KYOKO TAKASHIMA University of Tokyo, Japan
- DANIEL FU-CHANG TSAI National Taiwan University, Taiwan
- WILHELM VOSSENKUHL Ludwig Maximilians-University, Germany
- CAMERON R. WALDMAN Hastings Center, USA
- ZHAOCHEN WANG Peking Union Medical College, China
- MIRIAM WEISS Case Western Reserve University, USA
- KEIICHIRO YAMAMOTO University of Tokyo, Japan
- STUART J. YOUNGNER Case Western Reserve University, USA
- XIAOMEI ZHAI Chinese Academy of Medical Sciences / Peking Union Medical College, China

# Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xxi

## Part I. Progress of Biomedical Technologies and Ethics

### Section A: Regenerative Medicine

1.1 Primary Topic Article: The Ethics of Regenerative Medicine: Broadening the Scope beyond the Moral Status of Embryos <i>Tamra Lysaght and Alastair V. Campbell</i>	5
1.2 Commentary: Stem Cell Clinical Research: The Biology Determines the Ethics <i>Douglas Sipp</i>	27
1.3 Commentary: Regenerative Medicine and Science Literacy <i>Eisuke Nakazawa</i>	31
1.4 Commentary: Regenerative Medicine, Politics, and the High Price of Moral Constraint <i>Aric Bendorf and Ian Kerridge</i>	35
1.5 Response to Commentaries <i>Tamra Lysaght and Alastair V. Campbell</i>	40
2.1 Primary Topic Article: Neural Repair as a Case Study in Neuroethics <i>D. Gareth Jones</i>	46
2.2 Commentary: Some Issues in Neuroethics <i>Jing Bai and Renzong Qiu</i>	65
2.3 Commentary: Public Participation as a Potential Counter Strategy against Unethical Optimism <i>Taichi Isobe, Nozomi Mizushima, and Osamu Sakura</i>	69
2.4 Commentary: Three Problems with Treatments for Parkinson's Disease <i>Yukihiro Nobuhara</i>	75
2.5 Response to Commentaries: The Optimism of Misguided Ventures in Repairing the Brain <i>D. Gareth Jones</i>	80

### Section B: Enhancement

3.1 Primary Topic Article: Autonomy and the Ethics of Biological Behaviour Modification <i>Julian Savulescu, Thomas Douglas, and Ingmar Persson</i>	91
--	----

3.2	Commentary: (Im)Moral Technology? Thought Experiments and the Future of ‘Mind Control’ <i>Robert Sparrow</i>	113
3.3	Commentary: Some Remarks on Moral Bioenhancement <i>Masahiro Morioka</i>	120
3.4	Commentary: Moral Technology and the Concept of ‘the Self’ <i>Tomohide Ibuki and Satoshi Kodama</i>	126
3.5	Response to Commentaries <i>Julian Savulescu, Thomas Douglas, and Ingmar Persson</i>	131
4.1	Primary Topic Article: Ethics, Eugenics, and Politics <i>Robert Sparrow</i>	139
4.2	Commentary: Eugenics in Society: A Sociological and Historical Consideration <i>Yasutaka Ichinokawa</i>	154
4.3	Commentary: Are ‘Brave’ Parents Practicing Eugenics, Enhancement, or Something Else? <i>Michelle L. McGowan</i>	159
4.4	Commentary: Therapy, Enhancement, and Eugenics <i>D. Gareth Jones</i>	163
4.5	Commentary: The Nature of the Moral Obligation to Select the Best Children <i>Julian Savulescu</i>	170
4.6	Response to Commentaries: The Real Force of ‘Procreative Beneficence’ <i>Robert Sparrow</i>	183
5.1	Primary Topic Article: The Misguided Quest for <i>the</i> Ethics of Enhancement <i>Thomas Murray</i>	193
5.2	Commentary: Thomas Murray’s Enhancement of a Bioethics of Enhancement <i>Carl Becker</i>	205
5.3	Commentary: Arguments for and against Enhancement in Sports <i>Renzong Qiu</i>	211
5.4	Commentary: What We Can—and Cannot—Learn about the Ethics of Enhancement by Thinking about Sport <i>Robert Sparrow</i>	218
5.5	Response to Commentaries: Laments, Limits, and Liberalism <i>Thomas Murray and Cameron R. Waldman</i>	224

***Section C: Emerging Problems in Research Ethics***

6.1	Primary Topic Article: Redefining Property in Human Body Parts: An Ethical Enquiry <i>Benjamin Capps</i>	235
-----	---	-----



6.2	Commentary: But Which Body: Body of Labor, or Body of Anatomy? <i>Kantaro Ohashi</i>	264
6.3	Commentary: The Non-Ownership Thesis: A German Perspective <i>Wilhelm Vossenkuhl</i>	268
6.4	Commentary: Legal Status of the Human Body and Tissues <i>Katsunori Kai</i>	275
6.5	Response to Commentaries: Does ‘Dignity in Property’ Tell Us Anything about Dignity and Bioethics? <i>Benjamin Capps</i>	278
7.1	Primary Topic Article: Genetic Research to Facilitate Personalized Medicine: Ethical and Policy Challenges <i>Karen J. Maschke</i>	284
7.2	Commentary: Genetic Information: Direct to Consumers or Gatekeeping? <i>Soraj Hongladarom</i>	292
7.3	Commentary: The Ethical and Social Aspects of Genetic Information and Personalized Medical Genomics <i>Koji Ota</i>	295
7.4	Commentary: Gatekeeping Access to Genetic Information: A Response to “Genetic Research to Facilitate Personalized Medicine: Ethical and Policy Challenges” <i>Douglas Sipp</i>	298
7.5	Response to Commentaries <i>Karen J. Maschke</i>	301
8.1	Primary Topic Article: Ethics in Emerging Forms of Global Health Research Collaboration <i>Michael Parker</i>	304
8.2	Commentary: Reconciliation between Universality and Diversity <i>Zhaochen Wang</i>	318
8.3	Commentary: Research Ethics Governance in Korea: How and Why Does a Nation Adopt an Ethical Perspective into Research Oversight? <i>Ilhak Lee</i>	323
8.4	Response to Commentaries: Some Reflections <i>Michael Parker</i>	329
 <b>Section D: Synthetic Biology and Chimera</b>		
9.1	Primary Topic Article: The Ethical Issues of Synthetic Biology <i>Gregory Kaebnick</i>	335
9.2	Commentary: Synthetic Biology, Intellectual Property, and Buddhism <i>Soraj Hongladarom</i>	345