

EVIDENCE
IN
TRIALS AT COMMON LAW

by
JOHN HENRY WIGMORE

In Ten Volumes

VOLUME 4

Revised by
JAMES H. CHADBURN
Fessenden Professor of Law, Harvard University



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

COPYRIGHT © 1904, 1905, 1907, 1915, 1923, 1932, 1933, 1934,
1935, 1940, BY JOHN H. WIGMORE

COPYRIGHT © 1947, 1949, 1951, 1953, 1955, BY LAWRENCE J. KNAPP AND
FRED D. FAGG, JR., AS TRUSTEES UNDER THE WILL OF EMMA H. V. WIGMORE

COPYRIGHT © 1957, 1959, BY LAWRENCE J. KNAPP AS TRUSTEE UNDER
THE WILL OF EMMA H. V. WIGMORE

COPYRIGHT © 1972 BY JAMES H. CHADBOURN

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. NO PART OF THIS BOOK MAY BE REPRODUCED
IN ANY FORM OR BY ANY ELECTRONIC OR MECHANICAL MEANS IN-
CLUDING INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEMS WITHOUT
PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE PUBLISHER, EXCEPT BY A REVIEWER
WHO MAY QUOTE BRIEF PASSAGES IN A REVIEW.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOG CARD NO. 61-10756

ISBN 0-7355-6568-6

Fourth Printing

Published by Aspen Publishers
76 Ninth Avenue, New York, NY 10011
Formerly published by Little, Brown and Company

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

WIGMORE ON EVIDENCE

Volume Division

Sections		Volume
1-21	—	I (rev.)
24-218	—	IA (rev.)
219-686	—	II (rev.)
687-863	—	III (rev.)
874-1046	—	IIIA (rev.)
1048-1357	—	IV (rev.)
1360-1684	—	V (rev.)
1690-1913	—	VI (rev.)
1917-2169	—	VII (rev.)
2175-2396	—	VIII (rev.)
2400-2597	—	IX (rev.)
Indexes	—	X

EVIDENCE
IN
TRIALS AT COMMON LAW
VOLUME 4



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Cite as 4 Wigmore, Evidence §—— (Chadbourn rev. 1972)

Preface

The objectives which were my goals in revising Volume 3 of Wigmore's treatise are likewise my guidelines in the revision of the present Volume. The preface to Volume 3* may therefore suffice (or, as pleaders say, be "incorporated by reference") at this point.

I acknowledge, with gratitude, the skillful assistance I have received from Miss Ellen Kemp, Secretarial Staff, Harvard Law School, and from Mr. Thomas Hay, Senior Supervisor, Harvard Law School Library.

Harvard Law School
June 1, 1972

JAMES H. CHADBURN

* 3 Wigmore, Evidence, p. v. (Chadbourn rev. 1970).

Summary of Contents

VOLUME 4

37. Admissions (§§1048-1087)	1
38. Testimonial Rehabilitation (Supporting the Credit of an Impeached Witness) (§§1100-1144)	231
39. Autoptic Proference (Real Evidence) (§§1150-1169)	321
40. Rules of Auxiliary Probative Policy (§§1171-1175)	395
41. Production of Documentary Originals (§§1177-1282)	403
42. Rules of Testimonial Preference (§§1285-1321)	693
43. Provisional Testimonial Preferences (§§1325-1339)	762
44. Conclusive (or Absolute) Preferences (§§1344-1356a)	788

Table of Contents

VOLUME 4

Preface

Summary of Contents

BOOK I. ADMISSIBILITY (*continued*)

Part I. Relevancy (continued)

Title II. Testimonial Evidence (*continued*)

SUBTITLE II. TESTIMONIAL IMPEACHMENT (*continued*)

Chapter 37

TOPIC VI. ADMISSIONS

1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

§1048. Probative status of admissions	2
§1049. Admissions, distinguished from the hearsay exception for statements of fact against interest; death not necessary	8
§1050. Admissions, distinguished from confessions; admissions under duress; admissions required by law; admissions in personal injury cases	11
§1051. Admissions, distinguished from testimonial self-contradictions; prior warning not necessary	12
§1052. Express and implied admissions	14
§1053. Admissions, as not subject to rules for testimonial qualifications; personal knowledge; infancy; opinion rule	16
§1054. Admissions, excluded as evidence of certain facts: (1) Contents of documents; (2) Execution of attested documents; (3) Reports required by law; (4) Party-opponent's privilege	21
§1055. Admissions, as insufficient for proof of certain facts: (1) Marriage; (2) Divorce; (3) Criminal cases	22
§1056. Weight of admissions	23
§1057. Admissions as distinguished from estoppels, warranties, contracts, and arbitrations	23

CONTENTS

§1057a. — Admissions made to a third person; or after suit begun; or not communicated to the other party	25
§1058. Quasi admissions, as distinguished from solemn or judicial admissions	26
§1059. — Quasi admissions not conclusive: Explanations; corroboration by prior consistent claims; putting in the whole of the statement	27

2. IMPLIED ADMISSIONS

§1060. Admissions implied from conduct; sundry instances	32
§1060a. — Flight, resistance, fraud, bribery, fabrication of evidence, precautions against injury, insurance against liability, failure to prosecute, failure to produce evidence	33
§1061. Offer to pay or settle a claim; general principle	33
§1062. — State of the law in various jurisdictions	48

3. EXPRESS ADMISSIONS

§1062a. Classification	63
<i>a. Admissions of the Now Opponent in Other Litigation</i>	
§1063. (1) Attorney's admissions, in general	63
§1064. (2) Common law pleadings in the same cause, as judicial admissions	67
§1065. (3) Bills and answers in chancery in other causes	71
§1066. (4) Common law pleadings in other causes	74
§1067. (5) Superseded or amended pleadings	88
<i>b. Statements of Another Person Adopted by the Now Opponent</i>	
§1069. In general	100
§1070. Admissions by reference to a third person	100
§1071. Third persons statement assented to by party's silence; general principal	102
§1072. — Specific rules; statements made during a trial, under arrest; notice to quit; omission to schedule a claim, etc.	109
§1073. Third person's document: Writing sent to the party or found in his possession; unanswered letter; account rendered; "proofs of loss" in insurance	129
§1074. — Books of a corporation or partnership	140
§1075. — Depositions in another trial, used or referred to	148
<i>c. Statements of Another Person Having Identity of Interest with the Now Opponent</i>	
§1076. Admissions of other parties to the litigation; nominal and real parties; representative parties (executor, guardian, etc.); stockholders; coparties; confessions of a codefendant	152
§1077. Privies in obligation; joint promisor; principal and surety, etc.	158
§1078. — Agent; partner; attorney; deputy sheriff; interpreter; husband and wife	162
§1079. — Coconspirators; joint tort-feasors; seditious society	180
§1080. Privies in title; general principle; history of the principle	190
§1080a. — The Morgan theory of vicarious admissions	195
§1081. — Decedent; insured; colegatee, coheir, coexecutor; cotenant; bankrupt	201
§1082. Grantor, vendor, assignor, indorser; (1) Admissions before transfer; (a) realty; admissions against documentary title; transfers in fraud of creditors	210
§1083. — (b) Personalty; New York rule	215
§1084. — (c) Negotiable instruments	218
§1085. — (2) Admissions after transfer; realty and personalty, in general	219
§1086. — Transfers in fraud creditors	221

CONTENTS

§1087. — Other principles affecting grantor's declarations as to property, discriminated	229
--	-----

Chapter 38

SUBTITLE III. TESTIMONIAL REHABILITATION

INTRODUCTORY

§1100. Distinction between (1) admissibility of evidence to rehabilitate or support a witness, and (2) stage of the examination at which such evidence can be offered	232
§1101. Arrangement of topics	233

A. REHABILITATION AFTER IMPEACHMENT OF MORAL CHARACTER

§1104. (A) Proving good character in support; in general, inadmissible until impeached	233
§1105. — (1) After evidence of general character	235
§1106. — (2) After evidence of particular instances of misconduct, by cross-examination or record of conviction	236
§1107. — (3) After evidence of bias, interest, or corruption	240
§1108. — (4) After evidence of self-contradiction	240
§1109. — (5) After contradiction by other witnesses	242
§1110. — Other principles distinguished	244
§1111. (B) Discrediting the impeaching witness; cross-examining to rumors of misconduct	245
§1112. (C) Explaining away the bad reputation: (1) Reputation due to malice, etc.; (2) Witness' veraciousness unimpaired; (3) Witness reformed	248

B. REHABILITATION AFTER IMPEACHMENT BY PARTICULAR ACTS OF MISCONDUCT

§1116. Denial of the fact; showing innocence of a crime admitted on cross-examination or proved by record of conviction	249
§1117. — Explaining away the fact; reformed good character in support	250

C. REHABILITATION AFTER IMPEACHMENT BY BIAS, INTEREST, SELF-CONTRADICTION, ADMISSIONS

§1119. Denial of the fact; explaining away the fact; putting in the whole of a conversation, etc.; good character in support	253
--	-----

D. REHABILITATION BY PRIOR CONSISTENT STATEMENTS

I. WITNESSES IN GENERAL

§1122. General theory	254
§1123. History	254
§1124. Offered (1) in chief, before any impeachment	255
§1125. Offered (2) after impeachment of moral character	258
§1126. Offered (3) after impeachment by inconsistent statements	258

CONTENTS

§1127. Offered (4) after impeachment by contradiction	267
§1128. Offered (5) after impeachment by bias, interest, or corruption; statements of an accomplice	268
§1129. Offered (6) after impeachment as to recent contrivance	270
§1130. — Statements identifying an accused, on a former occasion	277
§1130a. — Statements serving to fix a time or place	293
§1131. Offered (7) after cross-examination or impeachment of any sort	293
§1132. Consistent statements are not themselves testimony; impeached witness himself may prove them	294
§1133. Statements of claim by a party, to rebut his admissions	296

2. SPECIAL CLASSES OF WITNESSES

§1134. Complaint of rape; history	297
§1135. — (A) First theory: Explanation of an inconsistency; fact of complaint is admissible	298
§1136. — Consequences of this theory; details not admitted; complainant must be a witness	306
§1137. — (B) Second theory: Rehabilitation by consistent statement	311
§1138. — Consequences of this theory; details are admissible; complainant must be a witness, and impeached	311
§1139. — (C) Third theory: Spontaneous or <i>res gestae</i> declarations, as exception to hearsay rule	313
§1140. Summary	314
§1141. Complaint in travail by an illegitimate's mother	314
§1142. Owner's complaint after robbery or larceny	317
§1143. Statements by possessor of stolen goods	319
§1144. Accused's consistent exculpatory statements	319

Chapter 39. Autoptic Proference (Real Evidence)

1. GENERAL PRINCIPLE

§1150. Definition of the process	321
§1151. General principle: Autoptic proference always proper, unless specific reasons of policy apply	324
§1152. Sundry instances of production and inspection in court	326

2. INDEPENDENT PRINCIPLES INCIDENTALLY AFFECTING AUTOPTIC PREFERENCE

§1154. Irrelevant facts are not to be proved (color, resemblance, appearance, etc., to show race, paternity, age, etc.; changed conditions of premises, etc.)	328
§1154a. Experiments in court	333
§1155. Privilege, as a ground for prohibition (self-incrimination, plaintiff suing for corporal injury)	336
§1156. Sundry independent principles sometimes involved (handwriting, hearsay, photographs, etc.)	336

3. LIMITATIONS GERMANE TO THE PROCESS ITSELF OF AUTOPTIC PREFERENCE

§1157. Unfair prejudice to an accused person (exhibition of weapons, clothes, wounds, etc.)	336
§1158. Unfair prejudice to a civil defendant, in personal injury cases	350

CONTENTS

§1159. Indecency, or other impropriety; liquor sampled by jurors	354
§1160. Incapacity of the jury to appreciate by observation (experiments in court; insane person's conduct)	357
§1161. Physical or mechanical inconvenience of production; patent infringements	360
§1162. Production impracticable; view by jury; (1) General principle	362
§1163. — (2) View allowable upon any issue, civil or criminal; statutes	362
§1164. — (3) View allowable in trial court's discretion	373
§1165. — (4) View by part of jury	377
§1166. — (5) Unauthorized view	379
§1167. — Other principles to be distinguished (juror's private knowledge; official showers; testimony taken in accused's presence; fence and road viewers)	380
§1168. Nontransmissibility of evidence on appeal; jury's view as "evidence"	381
§1169. View by the judge	391

Chapter 40. Rules of Auxiliary Probative Policy

INTRODUCTION: GENERAL SURVEY OF AUXILIARY RULES

§1171. Nature of the rules	395
§1172. Summary of the auxiliary rules	396
§1173. "Best evidence" principle; history of the phrase	398
§1174. — Scope of the phrase	400
§1175. Primary and secondary evidence	401

Chapter 41. Production of Documentary Originals

INTRODUCTORY

§1177. History of the rule	406
§1178. Analysis of topics	415

a. In Proving a Writing

§1179. Reason of the rule	415
§1180. — Spurious reasons	417
§1181. Rule not applicable to ordinary unscribed chattels	419
§1182. Rule as applicable to inscribed chattels	421
§1183. Traditional rule applicable to all kinds of writings; new rule also applicable to photographs, sound recordings, and the like	423

b. Production Must be Made

§1185. What constitutes production; witness testifying to a document not before him	425
§1186. Production of original always allowable	427
§1187. Dispensing with authentication does not dispense with production	430
§1188. Dispensing with production does not dispense with authentication	430
§1189. Order of proof as between execution, loss, and contents	431
§1190. Production made; may a copy also be offered?	434
§1191. Production may be excused, when contents are not in dispute	434

c. Unless It Is Not Feasible

§1192. General principle; unavailability of the original; proof to the judge	435
§1193. (1) Loss or destruction; history	438
§1194. — General tests for sufficiency of proof of loss; trial court's discretion	439

CONTENTS

§1195. — Specific tests and rulings	444
§1196. — Kinds of evidence admissible in proving loss (circumstantial, hearsay, admissions, affidavits, etc.)	451
§1197. — Discriminations between loss and other situations	454
§1198. — Intentional destruction by proponent himself	455
§1199. (2) Detention by opponent; in general	460
§1200. — (a) Opponent's possession; what constitutes possession	462
§1201. — — Mode of proving possession; documents sent by mail	463
§1202. — (b) Notice to produce; general principle	465
§1203. — — Rule of notice not applicable; documents lost, or sent by mail	466
§1204. — — Rule of notice satisfied; (1) Document present in court	468
§1205. — — Rule of notice satisfied; (2) Implied notice proceedings; new trial; trover, forgery, etc.	470
§1206. — — Rule of notice satisfied; (3) Notice of notice	474
§1207. — — Exceptions to the rule of notice; opponent's fraudulent suppression; recorded deed; waiver; document incriminating; document out of the jurisdiction	476
§1208. — — Procedure of notice; person, time and tenor	479
§1209. — (c) Failure to produce; what constitutes nonproduction	483
§1210. — — Consequences of nonproduction for the opponent; (exclusion of evidence; default; inferences)	484
§1211. (3) Detention by third person; history	485
§1212. — (a) Person within the jurisdiction	486
§1213. — (b) Person without the jurisdiction	489
§1214. (4) Physical impossibility of removal	496
§1215. (5) Irremovable judicial records; general principle (records, pleadings, depositions, wills, etc.; statutory rules)	496
§1216. — Exception for nuli tiel record and perjury	500
§1217. — Discriminations (dockets, certified copies, etc.)	501
§1218. (6) Irremovable official documents; general principle	501
§1219. — Specific instances, at common law	504
§1219a. — Secret ballots	506
§1220. Specific instances, under statutes	507
§1221. — Exceptions at common law	507
§1222. — Discriminations	508
§1223. (7) Private books of public importance	508
§1224. (8) Recorded conveyances	511
§1225. — Statutes and decisions	515
§1226. — Sundry consequences of the principle of not producing recorded deeds	532
§1227. — Other principles discriminated	534
§1228. (9) Appointments to office	534
§1229. (10) Illegible documents	534
§1230. (11) Voluminous documents	535
§1231. (12) Any document provable by copy in trial court's discretion	546

d. Of the Writing Itself

§1232. What is the "original" writing? General principle	547
§1233. (1) Duplicates and counterparts: (a) Either may be used without producing the other; (b) all must be accounted for before using copies	548
§1234. — Duplicate notices, blotter-press, printing press, and photographic copies as originals	550
§1235. (2) Copy acted on or dealt with, as an original for certain purposes (bailments, admissions, bankbooks, accounts, etc.)	560

CONTENTS

§1236. (3) Copy made an original by the substantive law applicable; (a) telegraphic dispatches	561
§1237. — (b) Printed matter	564
§1238. — (c) Wills and letters of administration	564
§1239. — (d) Government land grants, land certificates, and land patents; mining rights; title registration; recorded private deeds	565
§1240. — (c) Tax lists, ballots, notarial acts, and sundry documents	572
§1241. (4) Records, accounts, etc., as exclusive memorials under the parol evidence rule	573

c. Whenever the Purpose Is to Establish Its Terms

§1242. General principle; facts about a document, other than its terms, provable without production	574
§1243. Application of the principle: (1) Oral utterances accompanying a document read or delivered; (2) Document as the subject of knowledge or belief	575
§1244. — (3) Identity of document; (4) Summary statement of tenor of multifarious documents; (5) Absence of entries	577
§1245. — (6) Fact of payment of a written claim; receipts	581
§1246. — (7) Fact of ownership; (8) Fact of tenancy	583
§1247. — (9) Fact of transfer of realty, or (10) of personality	585
§1248. — (11) Execution of a document; (12) Sending or publication of a demand, notice, etc.	586
§1249. — (13) Sundry dealings with documents — conversion, loss, forgery, larceny, agency, partnership, corporation, service of writ, etc.	588
§1250. — (14) Miscellaneous instances	591

B. EXCEPTIONS TO THE RULE

§1252. (1) "Collateral" facts; history	593
§1253. — Principle	595
§1254. — Specific instances	596
§1255. (2) Party's admission of contents; principle	599
§1256. — Forms of rule in various jurisdictions	601
§1257. — Related rules (deed recitals; oral disclaimer of title; New York rule)	604
§1258. (3) Witness' admission of contents, on voir dire	609
§1259. (4) Witness' admission of contents, on cross-examination; rule in <i>The Queen's Case</i> ; principle	610
§1260. — Policy of the rule	611
§1261. — Details of the rule	626
§1262. — Rule as applied to prior statements in depositions	627
§1263. — Jurisdictions recognizing the rule in <i>The Queen's Case</i>	629

C. RULES ABOUT SECONDARY EVIDENCE OF CONTENTS (COPIES, DEGREES OF EVIDENCE, ETC.)

§1264. In general	636
-------------------	-----

1. RULES PREFERRING ONE KIND OF TESTIMONY TO ANOTHER (DEGREES OF EVIDENCE, ETC.)

§1265. General principle	637
§1266. Nature of copy testimony, as distinguished from recollection testimony	637
§1267. Is a written copy the exclusive form of testimony? Proof of a lost record, deed, will, etc., by recollection	641

CONTENTS

§1268. Is a written copy conditionally preferred to recollection? Admissibility of recollection before showing copy unavailable; (a) deeds, etc.	645
§1269. — (b) Copy preferred for proving public records	652
§1270. — (c) Copy of record of conviction, as preferred to the convict's testimony on cross-examination	655
§1271. — (d) Copy of foreign statutory law, as preferred to recollection testimony	664
§1272. Preference as between recollection witnesses	674
§1273. Preference as between different kinds of written copies; certified and sworn copies	674
§1274. Discriminations against a copy of a copy; in general	678
§1275. — Specific rules of preference as to copy of copy	679

2. RULES AS TO QUALIFICATIONS OF WITNESS TO COPY

§1277. In general	686
§1278. Witness to copy must have personal knowledge of original	687
§1279. — Exception for copy of official records; cross-reading not necessary	689
§1280. — Sundry distinction (press copies; witness not the copyist; double testimony; impression or belief; spoliation)	690

3. RULES DEPENDING ON THE HEARSAY RULE AND ITS EXCEPTION

§1281. Witness must be called, unless by exception to the hearsay rule for certified copies, etc.	691
---	-----

4. SUNDRY PRINCIPLES

§1282. Completeness of copy; abstracts	692
--	-----

Chapter 42. Rules of Testimonial Preference

§1285. Nature and kinds of testimonial preference	694
---	-----

I. PROVISIONAL (OR CONDITIONAL) TESTIMONIAL PREFERENCES

§1286. General nature and policy of these rules	694
---	-----

A. PREFERENCE FOR AN ATTESTING WITNESS

§1287. History	696
§1288. Reason and policy of the rule	697
§1289. Tenor of the rule.	699

A. *Where the Execution of Any Document*

§1290. Kinds of documents covered by the rule; at common law, all documents were included; statutory modifications	700
§1291. Documents incidentally or "collaterally" in issue	705

B. *Purports to Have Been Attested*

§1292. Who is the attesting witness	707
-------------------------------------	-----

C. *A Party Desiring to Prove Its Execution*

§1293. Rule applies only in proving execution, not in using the document for other purposes	709
---	-----

CONTENTS

D. Against an Opponent Entitled in the State of the Issues to Dispute Execution

§1294. Execution not disputable (1) because of estoppel or other rule of substantive law	710
§1295. Execution not disputable (2) because of the rule of pleading	710
§1296. Execution not disputable (3) because of judicial admission	711
§1297. Execution not disputable (4) because of opponent's claim under the same instrument	712
§1298. — Execution disputable, and rule applicable, where the opponent merely produces the instrument, without claiming under it	713

E. Must, Before Using Other Evidence

§1299. Attester preferred to any third person, including the maker of the document	715
§1300. Attester preferred to opponent's extrajudicial admissions	716
§1301. Attester preferred to opponent's testimony on the stand	719

F. Either Produce the Attester as a Witness

§1302. Attester need not testify favorably; witness denying or not recollecting; attester's favorable testimony not conclusive	720
§1303. — Discriminations (refreshing recollection; implied attestation clause; impeaching one's own witness, or one's own attestation; Illinois rule admitting only attesting witnesses in probate)	726
§1304. Number of attesters required to be called	727
§1305. — Rule satisfied when one competent witness testifies by deposition or affidavit	734
§1306. — When all witnesses unavailable in person, one attestation only need be authenticated	735

G. Or Show His Testimony To Be Unavailable

§1308. General principle of unavailability	737
§1309. All the attesters must be shown unavailable	737
§1310. Statutory enumerations of causes of unavailability	738
§1311. Causes of unavailability; (1) death; (2) ancient document	741
§1312. — (3) Absence from the jurisdiction	743
§1313. — (4) Absence in unknown parts	747
§1314. — (5) Witness' name unknown, through loss or illegibility of document	748
§1315. — Illness or infirmity; (7) failure of memory; (8) imprisonment	749
§1316. — (9) Incompetency, through interest, infamy, insanity, blindness, etc.	750
§1317. — Refusal to testify, privileged or unprivileged	751
§1318. — (11) Document proved by registry copy	752
§1319. — Summary	753

H. And Also Authenticate His Attestation, Unless It Is Not Feasible

§1320. If the witness is unavailable, must his signature be proved, or does it suffice to prove the maker's?	753
§1321. Proof of signature dispensed with, where not obtainable	760

Chapter 43. Provisional Testimonial Preferences

B. PREFERRED REPORTS OF PRIOR TESTIMONY

§1325. Introductory	762
§1326. (a) Magistrate's report of accused's statement; general principle	762