

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

PRIVATE LAW IN EUROPE CONTEXT SERIES

# Constitutional Values and European Contract Law

*Edited by  
Stefan Grundmann*



**Wolters Kluwer**

Law & Business

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

**Constitutional Values and  
European Contract Law**

**Stefan Grundmann**



**Wolters Kluwer**

Law & Business

AUSTIN

BOSTON

CHICAGO

NEW YORK

THE NETHERLANDS

*Published by:*

Kluwer Law International  
P.O. Box 316  
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn  
The Netherlands  
Website: [www.kluwerlaw.com](http://www.kluwerlaw.com)

*Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:*

Aspen Publishers, Inc.  
7201 McKinney Circle  
Frederick, MD 21704  
United States of America  
Email: [customer.care@aspenpubl.com](mailto:customer.care@aspenpubl.com)

*Sold and distributed in all other countries by:*

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.  
Stratton Business Park  
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade  
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ  
United Kingdom  
Email: [kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com](mailto:kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com)

ISBN 978-90-411-2765-5

© 2008 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without written permission of the publishers.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, United States of America. Email: [permissions@kluwerlaw.com](mailto:permissions@kluwerlaw.com).

# **Constitutional Values and European Contract Law**

# Private Law in European Context Series

---

VOLUME 13

---

*Series Editors:*  
Martijn Hesselink  
Ugo Mattei  
Horatia Muir Watt

---

## **For the Society of European Contract Law (SECOLA)**

*Massimo Bianca Hugh Collins Fernando Gomez Stefan Grundmann Jacobien Rutgers  
(President)*

Contract law is probably the most dynamic area of European Private Law and also the fundamental private law discipline in all national legal systems. SECOLA was founded to assist the study of European contract law and to enhance its quality. SECOLA organizes an open, truly international and interdisciplinary discussion platform. The focus of the Society is upon newly enacted European Community legal measures, on core concepts in the field of European contract law, and on proposals for further legislation. The Society organizes one or two international conferences each year, arranges for the publication of scholarly discussions in the field including books to be published in this series, and assists with other network activities. In addition, SECOLA has created a journal dedicated to the same aims (see <[www.secola.org](http://www.secola.org)> and <[www.degruyter.de/rs/280\\_7944\\_DEU\\_h.htm](http://www.degruyter.de/rs/280_7944_DEU_h.htm)>).

*A list of previous titles in the series may be found at the end of this volume.*

## Authors Page

Dr Olha O. Cherednychenko,  
LLM

PhD, Senior Lecturer in European Private Law, VU University Amsterdam, The Netherlands, De Boelelaan 1105, NL-1081 HV Amsterdam, The Netherlands, Email: o.cherednychenko@rechten.vu.nl

Dr Dott. Aurelia Colombi  
Ciacchi, LLM

PhD, Lecturer in Comparative Law and Senior Researcher in European Private Law, Zentrum für europäische Rechtspolitik an der Universität Bremen, Germany, Universitätsallee, GW 1, D-28359 Bremen, Germany, Email: Aurelia.Ciacchi@gmx.de

Prof. Dr Giovanni  
Comandé, LLM

Professor of Private Comparative Law, Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari e di Perfezionamento S Anna, Italy, Piazza Martiri della Libertà, 33, I-56127 Pisa, Italy, Email: gico@sss.it

Prof. Dr Fernando Gomez

Professor of Law and Economics, Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona, Spain, Ramon Trias Fargas, 25-27, E-08005 Barcelona, Spain, Email: fernando.gomez@upf.edu

Prof. Dr Dr Stefan Grundmann,  
LLM

Professor of Private and Business Law, Humboldt Universität, Berlin, Germany, Unter den Linden 6, D-10099 Berlin, Email: stefan.grundmann@rewi.hu-berlin.de

- Prof. Dr Johannes Hager Professor of Private and Media Law, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany, Professor-Huber-Platz 2, D-80539 München, Germany, Email: claudia.burger@jura.uni-muenchen.de
- Prof. Dr Arthur Hartkamp Professor of European Private Law, Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen, The Netherlands, Postbus 9049, NL-6500 KK Nijmegen, The Netherlands, Email: a.hartkamp@jur.ru.nl
- Prof. Dr Martijn W. Hesselink Professor of European Private Law, Centre for the Study of European Contract Law, Universiteit van Amsterdam, The Netherlands, PO Box 1030, NL-1000 BA Amsterdam, The Netherlands, Email: M.W.Hesselink@uva.nl
- Prof. Dr Stefan Leible Professor of Private Law, Private International Law and Comparative Law, Universität Bayreuth, Germany, Universitätsstrasse 30, D-95440 Bayreuth, Germany, Email: stefan.leible@uni-bayreuth.de
- Dr Benedita MacCrorie Lecturer of Constitutional Law, Escola de Direito da Universidade do Minho—Campus de Gualtar – Gualtar, P-4710-228 Braga, Portugal, Email: beneditamaccrorie@hotmail.com
- Prof. Maria Rosaria Marella Professor of Private Law and European Private Law, Università degli Studi di Perugia, Italy, Dipartimento per gli Studi Giuridici ‘Alessandro Giuliani’, Via Alessandro Pascoli n. 33, 06123 Perugia, Italy, Email: mrmarella@libero.it
- Prof. Dr Nuno Manuel Pinto Oliveira Professor of Private Law, Escola de Direito da Universidade do Minho—Campus de Gualtar – Gualtar, P-4710-228 Braga, Portugal, Email: npo@direito.uminho.pt
- Prof. Giuseppe Vettori Professor of Civil Law, Facoltà di Giurisprudenza, Università di Firenze, Italy, P.za S. Marco, 5, I-50121 Firenze, Italy, Email: studio.vettori@tin.it

# Summary of Contents

<b>Part 1</b>	
<b>Constitutional Values and European Contract Law: An Overview</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>§ 1</b>	
<b>Constitutional Values and European Contract Law: An Overview</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>(Stefan Grundmann)</i>	
<b>Part 2</b>	
<b>The Start: National Constitutions and Private Law</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>§ 2</b>	
<b>Fundamental Rights in National (Namely German) Contract Law</b>	<b>21</b>
<i>(Johannes Hager)</i>	
<b>§ 3</b>	
<b>Subordinating Contract Law to Fundamental Rights: Towards a Major Breakthrough or towards Walking in Circles?</b>	<b>35</b>
<i>(Olha O. Cherednychenko)</i>	
<b>Part 3</b>	
<b>The First Dimension on the EC Level: Fundamental Freedoms</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>§ 4</b>	
<b>Fundamental Freedoms and European Contract Law</b>	<b>63</b>
<i>(Stefan Leible)</i>	

**Part 4**

<b>The Second Dimension on the EC Level: Fundamental Rights, Namely Equality and Human Dignity</b>	<b>85</b>
--	-----------

**§ 5**

<b>Fundamental Rights, Fundamental Freedoms and Contract Law</b> <i>(Arthur S. Hartkamp)</i>	<b>87</b>
---	-----------

**§ 6**

<b>Anti-discrimination Rules in European Contract Law</b> <i>(Nuno Manuel Pinto Oliveira &amp; Benedita MacCrorie)</i>	<b>111</b>
---	------------

**§ 7**

<b>Human Dignity in a Different Light: European Contract Law, Social Dignity and the Retreat of the Welfare State</b> <i>(Maria Rosaria Marella)</i>	<b>123</b>
---	------------

**§ 8**

<b>Social Rights, Human Dignity and European Contract Law</b> <i>(Aurelia Colombi Ciacchi)</i>	<b>149</b>
---	------------

**§ 9**

<b>Co-determining European Private Law(s) and Constitutionalization Process(es)</b> <i>(Giovanni Comandé)</i>	<b>161</b>
--	------------

**Part 5**

<b>The Third Dimension on the EC Level: Constitutional Structural Principles</b>	<b>203</b>
--	------------

**§ 10**

<b>The Institutional Perspective: The European Economic and Social Constitution and the Role of Contract Law</b> <i>(Giuseppe Vettori)</i>	<b>205</b>
---	------------

**§ 11**

<b>European Contract Law and Economic Welfare: A View from Law and Economics</b> <i>(Fernando Gomez)</i>	<b>215</b>
---	------------

**§ 12**

<b>European Contract Law: A Matter of Consumer Protection, Citizenship, or Justice?</b> <i>(Martijn W. Hesselink)</i>	<b>241</b>
--	------------

# Table of Contents

## **Part 1**

<b>Constitutional Values and European Contract Law: An Overview</b>	<b>1</b>
---	----------

<b>§ 1</b>	
<b>Constitutional Values and European Contract Law: An Overview</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>(Stefan Grundmann)</i>	

I	Introduction	4
II	National Constitutions and Private Law	5
III	EC Fundamental Freedoms and Private Law	8
IV	Enlarging the Perspective: EC Constitutional Freedoms, Rights and Structural Principles and Private Law	10
	1 Three Dimensions	10
	2 Fundamental Rights	11
	3 Constitutional Structural Principles	14
V	Future Perspectives: Finding A Coherent System for All Three Dimensions across the Different Areas of Private Law	16
	1 National Laws Differ	16
	2 The Three Dimensions Differ	17
	3 Areas of Private Law May Differ	17

**Part 2****The Start: National Constitutions  
and Private Law****19****§ 2****Fundamental Rights in National (Namely German)****Contract Law****21***(Johannes Hager)*

I	Introduction	22
II	The Effects of Fundamental Rights	22
1	The Core Approaches	22
2	Article 1(3) German Constitution and Laws	23
3	Application to Contracts	25
4	The Federal Constitutional Court as a 'Super-Appellate' Court	28
III	The Effect of Fundamental Rights on Acts of Private Parties, in Particular on Contract Law	28
1	No Exception for Private Autonomy	28
2	Application to Testamentary Contracts	28
3	Application to Family Law	29
4	Application to Life Assurance	30
IV	The European Dimension	33
1	The General Approach of the European Court of Human Rights	33
2	The Role of Freedom of Contract in This Approach	34
V	Summary	34

**§ 3****Subordinating Contract Law to Fundamental Rights:****Towards a Major Breakthrough or towards****Walking in Circles?****35***(Olha O. Cherednychenko)*

I	Introduction	36
II	Towards the Subordination of Contract Law to Fundamental Rights in German Law	37
III	The Complexity of Subordinating Contract Law to Fundamental Rights	41
IV	Is There a Need for the Subordination of Contract Law to Fundamental Rights?	45
V	Should Contract Law in Europe Be Harmonized through the Horizontal Effect of Fundamental Rights?	48

VI	A Plea for a Complementary Relationship between Fundamental Rights and Contract Law	49
VII	The Need for Further Differentiation between Kinds of the Horizontal Effect of Fundamental Rights in Contract Law	54
1	Direct Horizontal Effect	55
2	Strong Indirect Horizontal Effect	56
3	Weak Indirect Horizontal Effect	57
VIII	Concluding Remarks	59

### Part 3

#### **The First Dimension on the EC Level: Fundamental Freedoms**

61

### § 4

#### **Fundamental Freedoms and European Contract Law** (*Stefan Leible*)

63

I	Introduction	63
II	The Function of the Fundamental Freedoms in the Internal Market	64
III	Fundamental Freedoms and Private Law	65
1	Party Autonomy as a Starting Point	65
2	Fundamental Freedoms and Member States' Regulatory Systems	66
3	Default Rules or Mandatory Law?	68
4	May National Law Escape Control Where the Conflict Rules Violate a Fundamental Freedom?	69
5	Discriminating Rules of Private Law	71
6	Neutral Rules at the Core of Private Law (Law of Obligations, Liability, Property Law)	71
IV	Horizontal Effect of the Fundamental Freedoms	72
1	Direct Horizontal Effect	73
a)	Case Law of the ECJ	73
b)	Personal View	76
c)	Exception for Collective Action?	78
2	Indirect Effect	80
a)	Restrictions Caused by Rules	80
b)	Restrictions Not Caused by Rules	82
V	Six Propositions	84

**Part 4****The Second Dimension on the EC Level: Fundamental Rights, Namely Equality and Human Dignity 85****§ 5****Fundamental Rights, Fundamental Freedoms and Contract Law 87***(Arthur S. Hartkamp)*

I	Introduction	88
II	Horizontal Effect of Provisions in the EC Treaty and in the ECHR	89
1	The EC Treaty: Discrimination and Fundamental Freedoms	89
a)	Discrimination	89
b)	Fundamental Freedoms: Free Movement of Goods	90
c)	Application to Quasi-public Undertakings	91
d)	Borderline Cases	92
e)	Free Movement of Workers, Freedom of Establishment and to Provide Services	93
f)	The 'Exceptions' or Grounds of Justification	95
2	Fundamental Rights: The ECHR	97
a)	The ECHR and Its Role in Contract Law	97
b)	The ECHR and Horizontal Effect	98
c)	The ECHR and a Mitigated Form of Horizontal Effect	99
3	The EC Treaty and the ECHR Compared	102
a)	No Uniform Approach: The EC Treaty and the ECHR	102
b)	No Ground for Horizontal Application of Fundamental Rights	103
c)	In Favour of a Unitary Approach of All Freedoms	104
III	Interpretation of Contracts in the Light of the EC Treaty and in the ECHR	106
1	The Core Question to Be Asked	106
2	The EC Treaty	106
3	Regulations: Directives	108
4	The ECHR	108
IV	Conclusions	110

**§ 6****Anti-discrimination Rules in European Contract Law 111***(Nuno Manuel Pinto Oliveira & Benedita MacCrorie)*

I	Introduction: The Principle of Equality in European Contract Law	111
II	An Assessment of Directives 2000/43 and 2004/113 from the Perspective of the Constitutional Principle of Autonomy	112

1	Collision between the Constitutional Principles of Autonomy, Freedom of Contract and Equality	112
2	The Constitutional Protection of Autonomy, as Freedom of Contract in Portugal and Germany	113
3	The Harmonization of Autonomy, Freedom of Contract, and Equality: The Distinction between the Public and the Private Spheres of the Individual	115
III	An Assessment of Directives 2000/43 and 2004/113 from the Perspective of the Constitutional Principle of Equality	117
1	Hierarchy between Different Grounds of Discrimination: Alterable or Unalterable Characteristics?	117
2	A Critique of the External and Internal Justifications for the 'Hierarchisation of Equality'	119
IV	Conclusion	121
§ 7		
	<b>Human Dignity in a Different Light: European Contract Law, Social Dignity and the Retreat of the Welfare State</b>	<b>123</b>
	<i>(Maria Rosaria Marella)</i>	
I	Introduction	124
II	Uses and Misuse of Human Dignity in Western Law	126
III	A Modest Proposal	130
IV	Social Dignity in the European Constitutional Tradition	131
V	Social Dignity as a Legal Concept	135
VI	Social Dignity, Welfare State Expectations and Privatization	139
1	Housing	140
2	Health Insurance	142
3	Long Term Care Insurance (LTCI)	143
4	Services of General Interest	144
5	Access to Credit	145
VII	Conclusion	146
§ 8		
	<b>Social Rights, Human Dignity and European Contract Law</b>	<b>149</b>
	<i>(Aurelia Colombi Ciacchi)</i>	
I	Social Rights in the Classifications of Fundamental Rights	150
II	Beyond the Dichotomy of Social Rights vs. Liberty Rights: The Social Dimension of Fundamental Rights Horizontality in Contract Law	152
III	Human Dignity, Good Faith and Good Morals: More Similarities than Differences	156
IV	Constitutionalization of Contract Law and Democratization of Legal Ethics	157

V	Constitutionalization Malpractice and Constitutionalization Good Practice	158
 <b>§ 9</b>		
	<b>Co-determining European Private Law(s) and Constitutionalization Process(es)</b>	<b>161</b>
	<i>(Giovanni Comandé)</i>	
I	Casting Doubts and Introducing Some Thesis	162
1	Framing the Terminology and the Subject Matter	162
2	Unfolding the Thesis	167
II	The Complex Interplay between Constitutional Values, Economic Rights and Private Law	169
1	A Plural Notion of European Contract Law	170
2	And Its Manifold Outcomes	172
III	The Peculiar Dimension of European Private Law and its 'Constitutional Embeddedness' with EC Economic Freedoms	173
1	Fundamental Rights Discourse in European Private Law	173
2	The Manifold Spirit of European Private Law(s)	176
3	The Market's Invisible Hand Shakes the Visible Hand of Constitutional Values in Private Law	177
4	The Dialogue between Constitutional Values and EC Fundamental Freedoms in a Social Oriented European Law	179
IV	Uncertain Distinctions among Constitutional Values, Case Law Trends and Legitimacy in National and Supranational Constitutionalization Discourse	182
1	Input from Some European Constitutions and the Missing Distinction in the EU Constitutional Treaty	183
2	National Case Law on the Relevance of Fundamental Rights in Contract Law: Some Lessons for the EU	186
a)	From the Application of General Constitutional Principles	188
b)	And Economic Rights	191
V	From National to National: Sharing Rules to Share Values	193
1	The Sustainability and Desirability of Common Frame(s) of Constitutional Reference in European Private Law	196
2	A Tentative Conclusion: Towards a European Civic Citizenship	199

**Part 5****The Third Dimension on the  
EC Level: Constitutional  
Structural Principles****203****§ 10****The Institutional Perspective: The European Economic  
and Social Constitution and the Role of Contract Law**  
*(Giuseppe Vettori)***205**

I	Introduction	206
II	The Cases	206
1	Personal Dignity	206
2	The Relevance of Disparity of Power	207
3	Competition and Social Rights	208
4	Trusts and Movement of Goods	209
III	The Constitutional Relevance of Private Autonomy	210
IV	Principles, Rights and Rules: The Role of Contract Law	211
V	The Hedgehog and the Fox	213

**§ 11****European Contract Law and Economic Welfare:  
A View from Law and Economics**  
*(Fernando Gomez)***215**

I	Introduction	216
II	Market Versus Contract: Contract and Cooperation in Economic Exchange	217
1	Biological Kin Selection	220
2	Selfish Cooperation	220
3	Altruism (or Fairness)	221
4	Reciprocity in Contractual Relationships	222
5	External Enforcement Mechanisms (Notably Contract Law)	226
III	Economic Welfare and Contract Law: Efficiency and Distribution	228
IV	The Proper Scope of European Contract Law	236
V	Conclusions	240

**§ 12****European Contract Law: A Matter of Consumer Protection,  
Citizenship, or Justice?**  
*(Martijn W. Hesselink)***241**

I	Introduction	242
II	Consumer Protection	242

1	The Community Policy of Consumer Protection	242
2	Contract Law as Consumer Protection	243
a)	Protective Rules	243
b)	Categorical Protection	243
c)	A Uniform Concept	244
d)	A Corollary to the Internal Market	244
e)	A Limited Set of Interests	246
3	An Expanding Scope for a Limited Perspective	247
III	Citizenship	249
1	European Union Citizenship	249
2	Contract Law as a Matter of Citizenship	250
3	A Broader Perspective, but a Narrower Basis	251
IV	Justice	252
1	A European Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	252
2	Contract Law as a Matter of Justice	254
a)	The Need for a Common European Concept of Justice	254
b)	Theories of Justice in Contract Law	256
(1)	<i>The Mirage of Social Justice (Hayek)</i>	256
(2)	<i>Welfare Maximization (Kaplow &amp; Shavell)</i>	257
(3)	<i>Commutative Justice (Canaris)</i>	257
(4)	<i>Contract as Promise (Fried)</i>	258
(5)	<i>Two Principles of Justice (Rawls)</i>	258
(6)	<i>Capabilities (Sen, Nussbaum)</i>	259
3	The Need for a Genuine Area of Civil Justice	260
V	A Matter of Consumer Protection, Citizenship or Justice?	260
1	The European Commission's U-turn	260
2	Roaming for Rights, or: Citizenship as Consumer Protection	262
3	Back to Justice	264