

JOHN LOCKE

Edited by
Peter Anstey

CRITICAL ASSESSMENTS OF
LEADING PHILOSOPHERS, SERIES II

JOHN LOCKE

Critical Assessments of Leading
Philosophers, Series II

Edited by
Peter Anstey

Volume I
Moral and Political Philosophy

First published 2006
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN, UK

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
270 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

Editorial material and selection © 2006 Peter Anstey; individual
owners retain copyright in their own material

Typeset in 10/12pt Times by Graphicaft Limited, Hong Kong
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
TJI Digital, Padstow, Cornwall

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or
reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic,
mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter
invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any
information storage or retrieval system, without permission in
writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN10: 0-415-35054-9 (Set)
ISBN10: 0-415-35055-7 (Volume I)

ISBN13: 978-0-415-35054-9 (Set)
ISBN13: 978-0-415-35055-6 (Volume I)

Publisher's Note

References within each chapter are as they appear in the original complete work

Critical Assessments of Leading Philosophers

Other titles in the series:

Ludwig Wittgenstein

Edited by Stuart Shanker

René Descartes

Edited by Georges J. D. Moyal

George Berkeley

Edited by Walter E. Creery

Martin Heidegger

Edited by Christopher Macann

Immanuel Kant

Edited by Ruth Chadwick

John Dewey

Edited by Jim Tiles

G. W. Leibniz

Edited by Roger Woolhouse

David Hume

Edited by Stanley Tveyman

Socrates

Edited by William J. Prior

Plato

Edited with a new introduction by Nicholas D. Smith

Nietzsche

Edited with a new introduction by Daniel W. Conway

Bertrand Russell

Edited with a new introduction by Andrew Irvine

Aristotle

Edited with a new introduction by Lloyd P. Gerson

Deleuze and Guattari

Edited with a new introduction by Gary Genosko

Spinoza

Edited with a new introduction by Genevieve Lloyd

Ludwig Wittgenstein

Second Series

Edited with a new introduction by Stuart Shanker and David Kilfoyle

Kierkegaard

Edited with a new introduction by Daniel W. Conway

Derrida

Edited with a new introduction by Len Lawlor and Zeynep Direk

Karl Popper

Edited by Anthony O'Hear

Emmanuel Levinas

Edited with a new introduction by Claire Katz

Edmund Husserl

Edited with a new introduction by Rudolf Bernet, Donn Welton, and Gina Zavota

Gottlob Frege

Edited with a new introduction by Michael Beaney and Erich H. Reck

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A project of this magnitude cannot be undertaken in isolation and I have benefited from the advice of a number of people. David Armitage, Mark Goldie, Duncan Ivison, Christopher Lawrence, J. R. Milton, Kiyoshi Shimokawa, Ralph Schumacher, Udo Thiel and Jean-Michel Vienne all contributed in different ways to facilitate the process of selecting chapters and articles from the recent secondary literature on John Locke. Not all of them will agree with the final contents list, but their comments along the way have forced me to think very carefully about the items that appear in these volumes. James G. Buickerood, Daniel Carey, J. R. Milton, Paul Schuurman and Kiyoshi Shimokawa also provided helpful comments on the Introductions.

Many of the authors of chapters and articles included in this edition have kindly supplied minor corrections and updated references to their original papers and these have been added. Thanks too must go to Kiyoshi Shimokawa and Philippe Hamou for undertaking the time-consuming task of translating their contributions into English and to Myriam Dennehy who translated Jean-Michel Vienne's chapter. Jonathan Walmsley kindly undertook to revise his paper on the development of Locke's mechanism at short notice and Miles MacLeod was an industrious and efficient research assistant in the early stages of the project. I would also like to express my appreciation to the editorial staff at Routledge for their very professional assistance throughout the project, and especially to Simon Alexander. Finally, thanks must go to my wife Julia for her patience and support throughout.

The publisher would like to thank the following for permission to reprint their material:

Imprint Academic for permission to reprint W. Randall Ward 'Divine will, natural law and the voluntarism/intellectualism debate in Locke', first published in *History of Political Thought*, 16 (2), 1995, pp. 208–218. Copyright © Imprint Academic, Exeter, UK.

Imprint Academic for permission to reprint Francis Oakley 'Locke, natural law and God—again', first published in *History of Political Thought*, 18 (4), 1997, pp. 624–651. Copyright © Imprint Academic, Exeter, UK.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Tuckness, Alex. The Coherence of a Mind: John Locke and the Law of Nature. *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 37:1 (1999), 73–90. © *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, Inc. Reprinted with permission of The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Chappell, Vere. Locke on the Intellectual Basis of Sin. *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 32:2 (1994), 197–207. © *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, Inc. Reprinted with permission of The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Taylor & Francis for permission to reprint Michael Losonsky 'John Locke on passion, will and belief', *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 4 (2), 1996, pp. 267–283. www.tandf.co.uk/journals

Taylor & Francis for permission to reprint Tito Magri 'Locke, suspension of desire, and the remote good', *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 8 (1), 2000, pp. 55–70. www.tandf.co.uk/journals

Blackwell Publishing for permission to reprint David Wootton 'John Locke and Richard Ashcraft's *Revolutionary Politics*', *Political Studies*, 40 (1), 1992, pp. 79–98.

Blackwell Publishing for permission to reprint Richard Ashcraft 'Simple objections and complex reality: theorizing political radicalism in seventeenth-century England', *Political Studies*, 40 (1), 1992, pp. 99–115.

The University of Nagoya Press for permission to reprint Kiyoshi Shimokawa 'Locke's concept of property', in *John Locke no Jiyushugi Seijitetsugaku*, Nagoya: University of Nagoya Press, 2000, pp. 69–105.

Cambridge University Press and James Tully for permission to reprint James Tully 'Rediscovering America: the *Two Treatises* and aboriginal rights', in *An Approach to Political Philosophy: Locke in Contexts*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993, pp. 137–176. © Cambridge University Press, reproduced with permission of the author and publisher.

University of Calgary Press for permission to reprint John Douglas Bishop 'Locke's theory of original appropriation and the right of settlement in Iroquois territory', *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, 27 (3), 1997, pp. 311–337.

Sage Publications, Inc. for permission to reprint David Armitage 'John Locke, Carolina, and the *Two Treatises of Government*', *Political Theory*, 32 (5), 2004, pp. 602–626.

Sage Publications, Inc. for permission to reprint Julian H. Franklin 'Allegiance and jurisdiction in Locke's doctrine of tacit consent', *Political Theory*, 24 (3), 1996, pp. 407–422.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Cambridge University Press and Brian Calvert for permission to reprint Brian Calvert 'Locke on punishment and the death penalty', *Philosophy*, 68, 1993, pp. 211–229. © Royal Institute of Philosophy, published by Cambridge University Press, reprinted with permission.

Cambridge University Press and A. John Simmons for permission to reprint A. John Simmons 'Locke on the death penalty', *Philosophy*, 69, 1994, pp. 471–477. © Royal Institute of Philosophy, published by Cambridge University Press, reprinted with permission.

Cambridge University Press and Jeremy Waldron for permission to reprint Jeremy Waldron 'Locke, toleration, and the rationality of persecution', in *Liberal Rights: Collected Papers 1981–1991*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993, pp. 88–114 and pp. 433–437. © Cambridge University Press, reproduced with permission of the author and the publisher.

Imprint Academic for permission to reprint Selina Chen 'Locke's political arguments for toleration', *History of Political Thought*, 19 (2), 1998, pp. 167–185. Copyright © Imprint Academic, Exeter, UK.

Barbara Arneil for permission to reprint Barbara Arneil 'Women as wives, servants and slaves: rethinking the public/private divide', *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, 34 (1), 2001, pp. 29–54. © The Canadian Political Science Association.

Blackwell Publishing for permission to reprint Patrick Kelly "'All things richly to enjoy": economics and politics in Locke's *Two Treatises of Government*', *Political Studies*, 36, 1988, pp. 273–293.

University of Calgary Press for permission to reprint Naomi Zack 'Lockean money, indigenism and globalism', *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, supp. vol. 25, 1999, pp. 31–53.

Disclaimer

The publishers have made every effort to contact authors/copyright holders of works reprinted in *John Locke: Critical Assessments of Leading Philosophers*. This has not been possible in every case, however, and we would welcome correspondence from those individuals/companies whom we have been unable to trace.

Chronological table of reprinted articles and chapters

<i>Date</i>	<i>Author</i>	<i>Title</i>	<i>Source</i>	<i>Vol.</i>	<i>Chap.</i>
1985	James G. Buickerood	The natural history of the understanding: Locke and the rise of facultative logic in the eighteenth century	<i>History and Philosophy of Logic</i> 6(2): 157–190.	II	30
1988	Patrick Kelly	'All things richly to enjoy': economics and politics in Locke's <i>Two Treatises of Government</i>	<i>Political Studies</i> 36: 273–293.	I	19
1990	Predrag Cicovacki	Locke on mathematical knowledge	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 28(4): 511–524.	II	33
1990	Nicholas Wolterstorff	The assurance of faith	<i>Faith and Philosophy</i> 7(4): 396–417.	IV	63
1991	David Owen	Locke on real essence	<i>History of Philosophy Quarterly</i> 8(2): 105–118.	III	47
1991	Mark Goldie	The theory of religious intolerance in Restoration England	Ole Peter Grell, Jonathan I. Israel and Nicholas Tyacke (eds.) <i>From Persecution to Toleration: the Glorious Revolution and Religion in England</i> , Oxford: Clarendon Press, pp. 331–368.	IV	59
1992	David Wootton	John Locke and Richard Ashcraft's <i>Revolutionary Politics</i>	<i>Political Studies</i> 40(1): 79–98.	I	7
1992	Richard Ashcraft	Simple objections and complex reality: theorizing political radicalism in seventeenth-century England	<i>Political Studies</i> 40(1): 99–115.	I	8
1992	Martha B. Bolton	The epistemological status of ideas: Locke compared to Arnauld	<i>History of Philosophy Quarterly</i> 9(4): 409–424.	II	22
1992	Jean-Michel Vienne	Locke et l'intentionnalité: le problème de Molyneux	<i>Archives de Philosophie</i> 55: 661–684.	II	27
1992	Menno Lievers	The Molyneux Problem	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 30(3): 399–416.	II	28

Chronological Table continued

Date	Author	Title	Source	Vol.	Chap.
1992	Lisa Downing	Are corpuscles unobservable in principle for Locke?	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 30(1): 33–52.	II	35
1992	Mark Goldie	John Locke's circle and James II	<i>The Historical Journal</i> 35(3): 557–586.	IV	56
1993	James Tully	Rediscovering America: the <i>Two Treatises</i> and aboriginal rights	<i>An Approach to Political Philosophy: Locke in Contexts</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 137–176.	I	10
1993	Brian Calvert	Locke on punishment and the death penalty	<i>Philosophy</i> 68: 211–229.	I	14
1993	Jeremy Waldron	Locke, toleration, and the rationality of persecution	<i>Liberal Rights: Collected Papers 1981–1991</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 88–114 and pp. 433–437.	I	16
1993	Hilary Kornblith	Locke and natural kinds	<i>Inductive Inference and its Natural Ground</i> , Cambridge MA: MIT Press, pp. 13–34.	III	48
1993	Nabil I. Matar	John Locke and the Jews	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i> 44(1): 45–62.	IV	60
1994	Vere Chappell	Locke on the intellectual basis of sin	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 32(2): 197–207.	I	4
1994	A. John Simmons	Locke on the death penalty	<i>Philosophy</i> 69: 471–477.	I	15
1994	J. R. Milton	Locke at Oxford	<i>Locke's Philosophy: Content and Context</i> , Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 29–47.	IV	55
1994	J. J. MacIntosh	Locke and Boyle on miracles and God's existence	<i>Robert Boyle Reconsidered</i> , ed. M. Hunter, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 193–214.	IV	62
1995	W. Randall Ward	Divine will, natural law and the voluntarism/intellectualism debate in Locke	<i>History of Political Thought</i> 16(2): 208–218.	I	1
1995	David B. Paxman	'Adam in a strange country': Locke's language theory and travel literature	<i>Modern Philology</i> 92(4): 460–481.	IV	68
1996	Michael Losonsky	John Locke on passion, will and belief	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 4(2): 267–283.	I	5

CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

1996	Julian H. Franklin	Allegiance and jurisdiction in Locke's doctrine of tacit consent	<i>Political Theory</i> 24(3): 407–422.	I	13
1996	David Owens	A Lockean theory of memory experience	<i>Philosophy and Phenomenological Research</i> 56(2): 319–332.	II	26
1996	José Luis Bermúdez	Locke, metaphysical dualism and property dualism	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 4(2): 223–245.	III	46
1996	Daniel Carey	Locke, travel literature, and the natural history of man	<i>The Seventeenth Century</i> 11(2): 259–280.	IV	67
1997	Francis Oakley	Locke, natural law and God – again	<i>History of Political Thought</i> 18(4): 624–651.	I	2
1997	John Douglas Bishop	Locke's theory of original appropriation and the right of settlement in Iroquois territory	<i>Canadian Journal of Philosophy</i> 27(3): 311–337.	I	11
1997	Samuel C. Rickless	Locke on primary and secondary qualities	<i>Pacific Philosophical Quarterly</i> 78(3): 297–319.	III	43
1997	J. R. Milton	John Locke's medical notebooks	<i>The Locke Newsletter</i> 28: 135–156.	IV	65
1998	Selina Chen	Locke's political arguments for toleration	<i>History of Political Thought</i> 19(2): 167–185.	I	17
1998	George S. Pappas	Epistemology in the empiricists	<i>History of Philosophy Quarterly</i> 15(3): 285–302.	II	21
1998	Matthew Stuart	Locke on superaddition and mechanism	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 6(3): 351–379.	III	40
1998	P. Kyle Stanford	Reference and natural kind terms: the real essence of Locke's view	<i>Pacific Philosophical Quarterly</i> 79(1): 78–97.	III	49
1998	Lisa Downing	The status of mechanism in Locke's <i>Essay</i>	<i>The Philosophical Review</i> 107(3): 381–414.	III	52
1998	G. E. Aylmer	Locke no Leveller	<i>Soldiers, Writers and Statesmen of the English Revolution</i> , eds I. Gentles, J. Morrill and B. Worden, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 304–322.	IV	57
1999	Alex Tuckness	The coherence of a mind: John Locke and the law of nature	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 37(1): 73–90.	I	3
1999	Naomi Zack	Lockean money, indigenism and globalism	<i>Canadian Journal of Philosophy</i> Supp. 25: 31–53.	I	20

Chronological Table continued

Date	Author	Title	Source	Vol.	Chap.
1999	David Soles	<i>Is Locke an imagist?</i>	<i>The Locke Newsletter</i> 30: 17–66.	II	23
1999	David Owen	Locke on reasoning	<i>Hume's Reason</i> , Oxford: Oxford University Press, chapter 3, pp. 30–61.	II	29
1999	Stephen Buckle	British sceptical realism: a fresh look at the British tradition	<i>European Journal of Philosophy</i> 7(1): 1–29.	II	34
2000	Tito Magri	Locke, suspension of desire, and the remote good	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 8(1): 55–70.	I	6
2000	Kiyoshi Shimokawa	Locke's concept of property (trans.)	<i>John Locke no Jiyushugi Seijitetsugaku</i> , Nagoya: University of Nagoya Press, pp. 69–105.	I	9
2000	Jonathan Walmsley	The development of Lockean abstraction	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 8(3): 395–418.	II	25
2000	E. J. Lowe	Locke, Martin and substance	<i>The Philosophical Quarterly</i> 50(201): 499–514.	III	38
2000	Rae Langton	Locke's relations and God's good pleasure	<i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society</i> 100, Part 1: 75–91.	III	41
2000	Raymond Martin	Locke's psychology of personal identity	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 38(1): 41–61.	III	53
2000	Philip Milton	John Locke and The Rye House Plot	<i>The Historical Journal</i> 43(3): 647–668.	IV	58
2001	Barbara Arneil	Women as wives, servants and slaves: rethinking the public/private divide	<i>Canadian Journal of Political Science</i> 34(1): 29–54.	I	18
2001	Paul Schuurman	Locke's logic of ideas in context: content and structure	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 9(3): 439–465.	II	31
2001	Jonathan Barnes	Locke and the syllogism	<i>Whose Aristotle? Whose Aristotelianism?</i> Ed. R. W. Sharples, Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 105–132.	II	32
2001	Sally Ferguson	Lockian teleosemantics	<i>Locke Studies</i> 1: 105–122.	II	36
2001	Edwin McCann	Locke's theory of substance under attack!	<i>Philosophical Studies</i> 106(1–2): 87–105.	III	39

CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

2001	J. R. Milton	Locke, medicine and the mechanical philosophy	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 9(2): 221–243.	III	50
2001	John W. Yolton	Locke's man	<i>Journal of the History of Ideas</i> 62(4): 665–683.	III	54
2001	Joseph Carrig	Liberal impediments to liberal education: the assent to John Locke	<i>The Review of Politics</i> 63(1): 41–76.	IV	69
2001	Paul Schuurman	Locke's way of ideas as context for his theory of education in <i>Of the Conduct of the Understanding</i>	<i>History of European Ideas</i> 27(1): 45–59.	IV	70
2002	Robert A. Wilson	Locke's primary qualities	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 40(2): 201–228.	III	42
2002	Peter R. Anstey	Locke, Bacon and natural history	<i>Early Science and Medicine</i> 7(1): 65–92.	IV	66
2003	Hannah Dawson	Locke on private language	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 11(4): 609–638.	II	37
2003	Jonathan Walmsley	The development of Locke's mechanism in the drafts of the <i>Essay</i>	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 11(3): 417–449.	III	51
2004	David Armitage	John Locke, Carolina, and the <i>Two Treatises of Government</i>	<i>Political Theory</i> 32(5): 602–626 (corrected).	I	12
2004	Raffaella De Rosa	Locke's <i>Essay</i> , Book I: the question-begging status of the anti-nativist arguments	<i>Philosophy and Phenomenological Research</i> 59(1): 37–64.	II	24
2004	James Hill	Locke's account of cohesion and its philosophical significance	<i>British Journal for the History of Philosophy</i> 12(4): 611–630.	III	44
2004	Philippe Hamou	L'opinion de Locke sur la 'matière pensante'	<i>Methodos</i> 4	III	45
2004	S.-J. Savonius	Locke in French: the <i>Du gouvernement civil</i> of 1692 and its readers	<i>The Historical Journal</i> 47(1): 47–79.	IV	61
2004	Richard Yeo	John Locke's 'New Method' of commonplacing: managing memory and information	<i>Eighteenth-Century Thought</i> 2: 1–38.	IV	64

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>Chronological table of reprinted articles and chapters</i>	xix
 General introduction	 1
 VOLUME I	
 Introduction	 9
 PART 1	
Natural law theory	19
 1 Divine will, natural law and the voluntarism/intellectualism debate in Locke	 21
W. RANDALL WARD	
 2 Locke, natural law and God – again	 32
FRANCIS OAKLEY	
 3 The coherence of a mind: John Locke and the law of nature	 61
ALEX TUCKNESS	
 PART 2	
Will and motivation	81
 4 Locke on the intellectual basis of sin	 83
VERE CHAPPELL	

CONTENTS

5	John Locke on passion, will and belief MICHAEL LOSONSKY	94
6	Locke, suspension of desire, and the remote good TITO MAGRI	109
PART 3		
	The political significance of the 'Second Treatise'	127
7	John Locke and Richard Ashcraft's <i>Revolutionary Politics</i> DAVID WOOTTON	129
8	Simple objections and complex reality: theorizing political radicalism in seventeenth-century England RICHARD ASHCRAFT	153
PART 4		
	Property	175
9	Locke's concept of property (trans.) KIYOSHI SHIMOKAWA	177
PART 5		
	Colonialism	217
10	Rediscovering America: the <i>Two Treatises</i> and aboriginal rights JAMES TULLY	219
11	Locke's theory of original appropriation and the right of settlement in Iroquois territory JOHN DOUGLAS BISHOP	254
12	John Locke, Carolina, and the <i>Two Treatises of Government</i> DAVID ARMITAGE	278
PART 6		
	Consent	303
13	Allegiance and jurisdiction in Locke's doctrine of tacit consent JULIAN H. FRANKLIN	305

CONTENTS

PART 7	
Capital punishment	321
14 Locke on punishment and the death penalty	323
BRIAN CALVERT	
15 Locke on the death penalty	341
A. JOHN SIMMONS	
PART 8	
Toleration	347
16 Locke, toleration, and the rationality of persecution	349
JEREMY WALDRON	
17 Locke's political arguments for toleration	371
SELINA CHEN	
PART 9	
Women	391
18 Women as wives, servants and slaves: rethinking the public/private divide	393
BARBARA ARNEIL	
PART 10	
Money	419
19 'All things richly to enjoy': economics and politics in Locke's <i>Two Treatises of Government</i>	421
PATRICK KELLY	
20 Lockean money, indigenism and globalism	445
NAOMI ZACK	

CONTENTS

VOLUME II

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
Introduction	1
PART 11	
Empiricism	7
21 Epistemology in the empiricists	9
GEORGE S. PAPPAS	
PART 12	
Ideas and knowledge	27
22 The epistemological status of ideas: Locke compared to Arnauld	29
MARTHA B. BOLTON	
23 Is Locke an imagist?	47
DAVID SOLES	
24 Locke's <i>Essay</i>, Book I: the question-begging status of the anti-nativist arguments	82
RAFFAELLA DE ROSA	
25 The development of Lockean abstraction	111
JONATHAN WALMSLEY	
26 A Lockean theory of memory experience	136
DAVID OWENS	
27 Locke et l'intentionnalité: le problème de Molyneux	150
JEAN-MICHEL VIENNE	
28 The Molyneux problem	174
MENNO LIEVERS	

CONTENTS

PART 13	
Reasoning and logic	193
29 Locke on reasoning	195
DAVID OWEN	
30 The natural history of the understanding: Locke and the rise of facultative logic in the eighteenth century	229
JAMES G. BUICKEROOD	
31 Locke's logic of ideas in context: content and structure	269
PAUL SCHUURMAN	
32 Locke and the syllogism	297
JONATHAN BARNES	
33 Locke on mathematical knowledge	327
PREDRAG CICOVACKI	
PART 14	
Scepticism	341
34 British sceptical realism: a fresh look at the British tradition	343
STEPHEN BUCKLE	
35 Are corpuscles unobservable in principle for Locke?	375
LISA DOWNING	
PART 15	
Language	397
36 Lockian teleosemantics	399
SALLY FERGUSON	
37 Locke on private language	412
HANNAH DAWSON	