Space Regulations Library

Ricky J. Lee

Law and Regulation of Commercial Mining of Minerals in Outer Space



Law and Regulation of Commercial Mining of Minerals in Outer Space





Dr. Ricky J. Lee Sydney, Australia ricky.lee@activer.com.au

ISBN 978-94-007-2038-1 e-ISBN 978-94-007-2039-8 DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-2039-8 Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011944336

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2012

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

SPACE REGULATIONS LIBRARY

VOLUME 7

EDITORIAL BOARD

Managing Editor

PROF. RAM S. JAKHU, Institute of Air and Space Law, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

MEMBERS

M. DAVIS, Adelta Legal, Adelaide, Australia
S. LE GOUEFF, Le Goueff Law Office, Luxembourg
P. NESGOS, Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy, New York, U.S.A.
S. MOSTESHAR, Chambers of Sa'id Mosteshar, London, U.K. &
Mosteshar Mackenzie, California, U.S.A.
L. I. TENNEN, Law Offices of Sterns and Tennen, Phoenix, Arizona, U.S.A.

For further volumes: http://www.springer.com/series/6573

In a closed society Malthusianism has the appearance of self-evident truth, and herein lies the danger. It is not enough to argue against Malthusianism in the abstract - such debates are not settled in academic journals. Unless people can see broad vistas of unused resources in front of them, the belief in limited resources tends to follow as a matter of course. And if the idea is accepted that the world's resources are fixed, then each person is ultimately the enemy of every other person, and each race or nation is the enemy of every other race or nation. The extreme result is tyranny, war and even genocide. Only in a universe of unlimited resources can all men be brothers.

Robert Zubrin and Richard Wagner¹

 $^{^{\}rm I}$ Robert Zubrin and Richard Wagner, The Case for Mars: The Plan to Settle the Red Planet and Why We Must (1997), at 303.

Acknowledgements

The field of space law appealed to me originally as a convenient combination of my casual interest in space and my legal studies. Over the years, however, it grew from a peripheral interest to become a passion and from that passion grew a career path that has been both challenging and rewarding. I still recall that one Thursday afternoon in 1998 at the University of Adelaide when I was at lunchtime seminar on space law and its opportunities presented by Michael E. Davis, now a partner at the law firm of Adelta Legal in Adelaide, Australia. From that time, not content with having introduced me to this new and exciting field of law, Mr. Davis soon became my employer and continues to be an invaluable support, mentor and friend. Mere written words are never enough to express my gratitude to him for all that he has done for me, but I offer them here nonetheless as a very small token of my thanks.

In late 1999, after I was elected a member of the International Institute of Space Law, Mr. Davis introduced me to the late Associate Professor Alexis Goh of the University of Western Sydney as a useful contact in that endeavour. After I moved to Canberra from Adelaide in 2000, she encouraged me to undertake this monograph as a doctoral thesis at the University of Western Sydney and she herself became my extremely supportive supervisor. She had shown tremendous faith and high expectations in my abilities as a doctoral candidate and as a teaching academic, both of which I have tried over the years to meet as much as I can though in truth I know I probably can never meet. She was a generous and understanding boss, an encouraging but critical supervisor, a resourceful and supportive friend without whom this work (and my academic career) would never have become a reality. She is much missed.

My thanks go to Associate Professor Vernon Nase of the City University of Hong Kong, who kindly agreed to become my doctoral supervisor and has peppered me with critical yet invaluable comments and suggestions on this work and allowed for its completion. I am much indebted to him for the kindness and friendship that he has shown to me, both as my doctoral supervisor and generally in the field of space law.

The contribution of Professor David Flint AM of Murdoch University (Australia), Professor Paul B. Larsen of Georgetown University (the United States) and Professor Francis Lyall of the University of Aberdeen (the United Kingdom) in

viii Acknowledgements

examining this monograph, which was submitted as a doctoral thesis at Murdoch University, must be recognised.

In addition, the kindness and generosity of Prof. Ram Jakhu of the Institute of Air and Space Law at McGill University, Canada, in taking the time to review this monograph. Further, the understanding, encouragement and support (not to mention tolerance) of Norbert Schweizer and Michael Kobras, the partners of my employer, the Sydney commercial law firm of Schweizer Kobras, are also greatly appreciated.

My thanks also go to Mark Sonter, director of Asteroid Enterprises Pty Ltd, who provided me with some of his expert insights into the physical and technical aspects of mining asteroids.

It goes without saying, though worth saying nonetheless, that without the continuing support encouragement and love of my family, I can achieve nothing in my life. I am very grateful, even though I may not appear to show it from time to time.

Of course, all faults and shortcomings in this monograph are exclusively my own and I count on the support of my friends and the vindictiveness of my enemies to show me any errors of my work.

Sydney, Australia

Ricky J. Lee

List of Abbreviations

AAS American Astronomical Society

ACP African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States
AIAA American Institute of Aeronautics and Astronautics

AN Ascending node

ARABSAT Arab Corporation for Space Communications

AU Astronomical Unit

COPUOS Committee on Peaceful Uses of Outer Space

COSPAR Committee on Space Research

DN Descending node

ECAS Eight Colour Asteroid Survey
ECSL European Centre for Space Law
EEC European Economic Community
ENPV Expected Net Present Value
ESA European Space Agency

EUMETSAT European Organisation for the Exploitation of Meteorological

Satellites

EUTELSAT European Telecommunication Satellite Organisation

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GEO Geostationary Earth Orbit
HEEO Highly Elliptical Earth Orbit
IAU International Astronomical Union
IBA International Bar Association

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ICC International Chamber of Commerce
IISL International Institute of Space Law
ILC International Law Commission
IMF International Monetary Fund

INMARSAT International Mobile Satellite Organisation

INTELSAT International Telecommunication Satellite Organisation

ISA International Seabed Authority
ISRO Indian Space Research Organisation

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

xvi List of Abbreviations

ITU International Telecommunication Union

LEO Low Earth Orbit

NASA National Aeronautics and Space Administration

NEAR Near Earth Asteroid Rendezvous NIEO New International Economic Order

NPV Net Present Value

OPEC Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries

RLV Reusable Launch Vehicle
ROI Return on Investment
SSI Space Studies Institute
SSPS Space Solar Power Satellite

UN United Nations

UNCLOS III Third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNESCO United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

UNIDROIT International Institute for the Unification of Private Law

USA United States of America

USACERL United States Army Construction Engineering Research

Laboratory

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organisation

WTO World Trade Organisation

List of Figures

Fig. 1.1	Outline of the contents and their correlation with the	
	hypothesis	3
Fig. 1.2	Segments of a commercial space mining venture	11
Fig. 2.1	Change in velocity needed for soft landing on selected objects .	25
Fig. 2.2	The stock resource base and its subdivisions	30
Fig. 2.3	Diminishing returns and marginal physical product curves	34
Fig. 2.4	The perfect market response to resource scarcity	37
Fig. 2.5	The onset of economic exhaustion of mineral resources	39
Fig. 2.6	Example: expected life of bauxite reserves	43
Fig. 2.7	Different types of hydrogen fuel cells	46
Fig. 2.8	Government-industry roles in the transition to a	
	hydrogen economy	47
Fig. 2.9	Relative cost of producing 1 ounce of platinum 2005–2030	49
Fig. 2.10	The three groups of Near Earth Asteroids	61
Fig. 2.11	Gravitational perturbations on long period comets	
	by Jupiter	65
Fig. 2.12	Gravitational perturbations on short period comets	
	by Jupiter	66
Fig. 2.13	Orbital geometry of short period comets	68
Fig. 2.14	Orbital properties of an asteroid	69
Fig. 2.15	Trajectory plan for a 2009 mining mission to asteroid 1991JW.	76
Fig. 2.16	Image of 113 Amalthea taken by Voyager 1	78
Fig. 2.17	Example trajectory for a multiple flyby mission	79
Fig. 3.1	Timeline of international space law instruments	100
Fig. 3.2	State responsibility under Article VI: summary of analysis	132
Fig. 6.1	Competing interests to be balanced in the creation	
	of the new international regulatory framework	275
Fig. 6.2	Summary of proposed compromises in the new legal	
	framework	294
Fig. 6.3	Structure of the proposed international space	
	development authority	297
Fig. 6.4	Balancing some of the opposing interests between	
	the industrialised states and the developing states	305

List of Tables

Table 2.1	Selected technological development enabling mining	
	in space	26
Table 2.2	Resource base and life expectancy estimates for certain	
	mineral resources in the earth's crust	28
Table 2.3	Estimated reserves and depletion dates	42
Table 2.4	Cumulative reserves and production in selected	
	minerals	44
Table 2.5	Bell superclasses of asteroid taxonomy and likely	
	mineralogy	55
Table 2.6	Mineral resources found on asteroids and their	
	uses in space	57
Table 2.7	The Arjunas with low eccentricities	67
Table 2.8	Energy requirements for various missions	73
Table 2.9	Potential benefits for mining of Near Earth Asteroids	83
Table 2.10	Outline of platinum mining project milestones	84
Table 2.11	Summary of mission risks and effects of the passage	
	of time	93
Table 3.1	Principles Declaration	119
Table 3.2	Broadcasting Principles	120
Table 3.3	Remote Sensing Principles	122
Table 3.4	Nuclear Power Sources Principles	123
Table 3.5	Cooperation declaration	124
Table 6.1	Specific competing interests and concerns	276
Table 6.2	Comparative taxation on a model copper mine	
	in selected states	279
Table 6.3	Summary of admission procedures for major	
	organisations	302

Glossary

A measure of a celestial body's intrinsic brightness, measured in the standard V photometric band
Asteroid with perihelion 1.017 AU $< q \le 1.3$ AU
The point on an orbit that is most distant from the Sun
Asteroid with perihelion $q < 1.017$ AU and semi major axis $a > 1.0$ AU
Asteroid with Earth-like orbits with low inclination, low eccentricity and orbital periods close to one Earth year
Unit of length equal to the mean distance between the
Earth and the Sun, estimated in 2009 at 149,597,870,700 m
Asteroid with semi major axis $a < 1.0$ AU and aphelion $Q > 0.983$ AU
Compound of a metal with carbon monoxide (CO)
Where two objects are at the aphelion or perihelion at the same time
Minimum distance between closest points on the orbit of the Earth and the orbit of an asteroid or comet, usually given in astronomical units (AU). Potentially hazardous objects to the Earth have an Earth MOID of less than 0.05 AU
Measure of the circularity of the orbit where the more eccentric an orbit, the more oval shaped the orbit is
The orbital plane on which the Earth orbits the Sun
Minimum speed an object without propulsion needs to have to move away infinitely from the gravity of an object
Elliptical orbit that is tangential to two coplanar orbits that is most energy efficient transfer trajectory
The velocity $(\Delta \vec{v})$ of an object relative to Earth or another celestial object when it is outside that body's gravity well

xxii Glossary

Impulse Change in velocity $(\Delta \vec{v})$ that is given to an object in a short period of time relative to the total duration of the trajectory The angle between the orbital plane of a particular object Inclination (i) and the ecliptic Solid hydrocarbons found in crude oil Kerogen Where one object is at perihelion and the other is at Opposition aphelion The point on an orbit which is closest to the Sun Perihelion (q)Planetesimal One of a class of bodies that are theorised to have formed the planets after condensing from diffuse matter early in the history of the solar system Generation of chemicals or free metals by heat **Pyrolysis** decomposition The fragmented rocky debris blanketing the surface of the Regolith Moon, some asteroids and other small objects in the Solar System The longest diameter of an elliptical orbit. Semi-major Axis(A)Period of a body relative to the Earth Synodic Period The trajectory for an object travelling from one body to Transfer Orbit another Trojan An object which is trapped in a stable orbit 60° ahead of or behind the object as it orbits the Sun

Gases that can be released from comet cores by heating, producing gases such as water, carbon dioxide (CO₂), carbon monoxide (CO), methane (CH₄), ammonia

(NH₃) and hydrogen cyanide (HCN)

Volatiles

List of Reports, Series and Journal Titles

Source Full title

A. F. L. Rev. Air Force Law Review

A.S.I.L.S. Int'l. L. J. Association of Student International Law Societies

International Law Journal

A.T.S. Australian Treaty Series

Abs. Lunar & Planetary Abstracts of the Lunar and Planetary Science

Conference

Acta Astron. Acta Astronautica (Journal of the International

Academy of Astronautics)

Acta Juridica (Law Journal of the University of Cape

Town)

Ad Astra (Journal of the National Space Society)

Adel. L. Rev. Adelaide Law Review
Adv. Space Res. Advanced Space Research

Air & Sp. L. Air & Space Law Akron L. Rev. Akron Law Review

Am. J. Int'l. L. American Journal of International Law

Am. J. Int'l. L. Supp.

Am. Soc. Int'l. L. Proc.

American Journal of International Law Supplement

Proceedings of the American Society of International

Law

Am. U. J. Int'l. L. & American University Journal of International Law and

Pol'y. Policy

Am. U. L. Rev. American University Law Review Ann. Air & Sp. L. Annals of Air and Space Law

Ann. Assoc. Am. Geog.
Ann. Rev. Astron. &
Annual Review of Astronomy and Astrophysics

Astrop.

Sci. Conf.

Ann. Rev. Energy
App. Geog.

Annual Review of Energy
Applied Geography

Astron. & Astrophysics Astronomy and Astrophysics

Astron. Gesell. Abs. Ser. Astronomische Gesellschaft Abstract Series (Astronomical Society Abstract Series)

Astron. J. Astronomical Journal Astrophysics J. Astrophysics Journal

Aust. Int'l. L. J. Australian International Law Journal Aust. J. Astron. Australian Journal of Astronomy

Aust. Y. B. Int'l. L. Australian Yearbook of International Law

Az. J. Int'l. & Comp. L. Arizona Journal of International and Comparative Law

B. C. Envt'l. Aff. L. Rev.
B. C. Int'l. & Comp. L.
Rev.
Boston College Environmental Affairs Law Review
Boston College International and Comparative Law
Review

B. U. Int'l. L. J. Boston University International Law Journal

Baylor L. Rev. Baylor Law Review

Berkeley Tech. L. J.
Brit. Y. B. Int'l. L.
Brooklyn J. Int'l. L.
Brooklyn J. Int'l. L.
Brooklyn J. Int'l. L.

Brooklyn L. Rev. Brooklyn Law Review Buff. L. Rev. Buffalo Law Review

Bull. Am. Astron. Soc. Bulletin of the American Astronomical Society

C.F.R. Code of Federal Regulations

Cable News Network
Cal. L. Rev.

Cable News Network
California Law Review

Cal. W. Int'l. L. J. California Western International Law Journal

Cam. L. J. Cambridge Law Journal

Can. Y. B. Int'l. L. Canadian Yearbook of International Law

Cardozo L. Rev. Cardozo Law Review

Case W. Res. J. Int'l. L. Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law

Chi. J. Int'l. L. Chinese Journal of International Law

Colo. J. Int'l. Envt'l. L. & Colorado Journal of International Environmental Law

Pol'y. and Policy

Colum. J. Envt'l. L.
Colum. J. Transnat'l. L.
Colum. J. World Bus.

Columbia Journal of Environmental Law
Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Columbia Journal of World Business

Colum. L. Rev. Columbia Law Review Com. L. J. Commercial Law Journal

Conn. J. Int'l. L. Connecticut Journal of International Law

Cornell Int'l. L. J. Cornell International Law Journal

Cornell L. Rev. Cornell Law Review
Cosmic Research Cosmic Research

Crosslink Crosslink
De Economist
Def. Sci. Defence Science

Harv. J. on Legis.

L. Rev.

Hastings Int'l. & Comp.

Denver Journal of International Law and Policy Denver J. Int'l. L. & Pol'y. Detroit Coll. L. J. Int'l. L. Detroit College of Law Journal of International Law & Prac. and Practice Dick. J. Int'l. L. Dickenson Journal of International Law Die Friedenswarte Die Friedenswarte E.R. **English Reports** Earth Planets & Sp. Earth Planets and Space Earth, Moon & Planets Earth, Moon and Planets Ec. & Fin. Rev. Economics and Finance Review **Ecology Law Quarterly** Ecology L. Q. Econ. J. **Economics Journal** Emory Int'l. L. Rev. Emory International Law Review Emory J. Int'l. Disp. Emory Journal of International Dispute Resolution Resol. Energy Explor. & **Energy Exploration and Exploitation** Exploit. **Energy Policy Energy Policy** Envt'l. & Res. Ec. Environmental and Resource Economics Envt'l. L. **Environmental Law** Eur. J. Int'l. L. European Journal of International Law Fl. Coastal L. Rev. Florida Coastal Law Review Fl. Int'l. L. J. Florida International Law Journal Fordham Environmental Law Report Fordham Envt'l. L. Rep. Fordham L. Rev. Fordham Law Review Foreign Aff. Foreign Affairs Foreign Policy Foreign Policy Foreign Service J. Foreign Service Journal Ga. J. Int'l. & Comp. L. Georgia Journal of International and Comparative Geo. Wash. J. Int'l. L. & George Washington Journal of International Law and Ec. **Economics** Geoadria Geoadria Geochim. & Cosmochim. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta (Journal of the Acta Geochemical and Meteoritical Societies) Georgetown Int'l. Envt'l. Georgetown International Environmental Law Review L. Rev. Georgetown L. J. Georgetown Law Journal Hague Y. B. Int'l. L. Hague Yearbook of International Law Harv. Int'l. L. J. Harvard International Law Journal Harv. J. Law & Tech. Harvard Journal of Law and Technology

Harvard Journal on Legislation

Hastings International and Comparative Law Review

Hastings L. J. Hastings Law Journal
Herts. L. J. Hertfordshire Law Journal
Hist. & Tech. History and Technology
Houston J. Int'l. L. Houston Journal of International Law

Howard L. J. Howard Law Journal
Human Rights Q. Human Rights Quarterly
Hyperfine Interactions Hyperfine Interactions

I.C.J. Rep. Reports of the International Court of Justice

I.L.M. International Legal Materials
I.L.R. International Law Reports

Icarus Icarus

Ind. J. Global Legal Stud.
Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies
Indian J. Int'l. L.
Info. Econ. & Pol'y.
Indiana Journal of International Law
Information Economics and Policy

Int'l. & Comp. L. Q. International and Comparative Law Quarterly

Int'l. Bus. Lawyer International Business Lawyer Int'l. Geol. Rev. International Geology Review

Int'l. J. International Journal

Int'l. J. Estuarine & International Journal of Estuarine and Coastal Law

Int'l. J. Marine & International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law

Int'l. Lawyer International Lawyer

Int'l. Leg. Persp. International Legal Perspectives
Int'l. Org. International Organisations

Int'l. R. & S. Ab. International rechtliche und staatrechtliche

Abhandlungen

Int'l. Trade L. J. International Trade Law Journal Iran-U.S.C.T.R. Iran-U.S. Claims Tribunal Reports

Isr. L. Rev. Israel Law Review
J. Afr. L. Journal of African Law

J. Air L. & Com.

J. Astron. & Space Sci.

J. Brit. Interplanetary

Journal of Air Law and Commerce

Journal of Astronomy and Space Science

Journal of the British Interplanetary Society

Soc.

Coastal L.

Coastal L.

J. Contemp. Leg. Issues
J. Energy Nat. Res. L.
J. Envt'l. L. & Lit.
Journal of Contemporary Legal Issues
Journal of Energy and Natural Resources Law
Journal of Environmental Law and Litigation

J. Geophys. Res. Journal of Geophysical Research
J. Guid. Con. & Dyn. Journal of Guidance, Control and Dynamics

J. Hist. Int'l. L.

Journal of Guidance, Control and Dynamics

J. Hist. Int'l. L.

Journal of History of International Law

Journal of International Law and Business

J. Japan & Int'l. Econ. Journal of Japanese and International Economics