

West Nutshell Series

SANFORD N. KATZ
DANIEL R. KATZ

Adoption Laws

in a
nutshell



WEST®

ADOPTION LAWS IN A NUTSHELL

By

SANFORD N. KATZ

Darald and Juliet Libby Professor of Law
Boston College Law School

DANIEL R. KATZ, Esq.

Member, Bars of Massachusetts, New York,
California and the District of Columbia

WEST®

A Thomson Reuters business

Thomson Reuters created this publication to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered. However, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. Thomson Reuters does not render legal or other professional advice, and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

Nutshell Series, In a Nutshell and the Nutshell Logo are trademarks registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

© 2012 Thomson Reuters

610 Opperman Drive
St. Paul, MN 55123
1-800-313-9378

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-0-314-19030-7

For
Joan

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The laws regulating the formation of family relationships like marriage, civil unions, domestic partnerships and adoption are found in state statutes and may differ considerably from jurisdiction to jurisdiction. There may be a variety of reasons for this phenomenon including the religious, political and ethnic make-up of the citizens of the jurisdiction. History plays an important role as well. American adoption laws, for example, do not trace their origins back to the English common law, like so many of American laws, but have a distinct American foundation. Because of the lack of homogeneity in the population of the United States, and because adoption is so reflective of a jurisdiction's social policy, the laws of adoption in the United States lack uniformity, and attempts to establish a uniform law of adoption have been unsuccessful. It is for that reason that one cannot accurately speak of American adoption law. Rather, one must refer to the American laws of adoption. This is why the title of this book is *Adoption Laws in a Nutshell*. This is also why we have included charts that present the law of each jurisdiction on the subject of the chart.

We caution the reader to check the current state of the law since the charts were developed

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

from 2009 to 2012 and some changes may have occurred since then. We also alert the reader to the fact that the laws regarding intercountry adoption may also change.

A number of Boston College Law School students assisted in the development of the charts and also did research on specific topics. We acknowledge with appreciation the work of Stephanie Giuliano Abhar, Tarek Audi, Michael Avery, Andrew Bender, Mark DeVincentis, Kevin Gallagher, Andrew Jones, Sam Lawrence, Julie Meeks, Michael Mohr, Feyisara Olotu, Ryan M. Rourke-Reed, Victoria Santoro, Peter Tipps, Paul Wagoner, Christine Weaver, Barrett Wilson-Murphy and Ben Winterhalter. Special thanks are due Meg Parsont for her excellent editing and Curtis Beyer for his valuable technical assistance in preparing the manuscript for publication.

The Bibliography consists of sources for the information in this book and suggestions for further reading in specific areas.

TABLE OF CASES

References are to Pages

Adams, Matter of, 189 Mich.App. 540, 473 N.W.2d 712 (Mich. App.1991), 136

Adams v. Monroe County Dept. of Social Services, 21 F.Supp.2d 235 (W.D.N.Y.1998), 116

Adoption of (see name of party)

A.H.W. v. G.H.B., 339 N.J.Super. 495, 772 A.2d 948 (N.J.Super.Ch.2000), 107

Alack v. Phelps, 230 So.2d 789 (Miss.1970), 231

Alley v. Bennett, 298 S.C. 218, 379 S.E.2d 294 (S.C.App.1989), 224

Ambrose v. Catholic Social Services, Inc., 736 So.2d 146 (Fla.App. 5 Dist.1999), 20

a Minor, In re Adoption of, 350 Mass. 302, 214 N.E.2d 281 (Mass.1966), 17

Appeal of (see name of party)

April v. Associated Catholic Charities of New Orleans, 629 So.2d 1295 (La.App. 4 Cir.1993), 24

Baby A, Matter of Adoption of, 128 Or.App. 450, 877 P.2d 107 (Or.App.1994), 109

Baby M, Matter of, 109 N.J. 396, 537 A.2d 1227 (N.J.1988), 92, 106

Bailey v. Mars, 138 Conn. 593, 87 A.2d 388 (Conn.1952), 215

Bank One Trust Co. N.A. v. Reynolds, 173 Ohio App.3d 1, 877 N.E.2d 342 (Ohio App. 2 Dist.2007), 235, 245, 253, 262, 273

Benson v. Nicholas, 254 Pa. 55, 98 A. 775 (Pa.1916), 223

B.L.V.B. & E.L.V.B., In re Adoption of, 160 Vt. 368, 628 A.2d 1271 (Vt.1993), 114

Board of Educ. of Montgomery County v. Browning, 333 Md. 281, 635 A.2d 373 (Md.1994), 218

TABLE OF CASES

- Bower v. Landa, 78 Nev. 246, 371 P.2d 657 (Nev.1962), 220
Burr v. Board of County Com'rs of Stark County, 23 Ohio St.3d 69, 491 N.E.2d 1101 (Ohio 1986), 13, 30
- Caban v. Mohammed, 441 U.S. 380, 99 S.Ct. 1760, 60 L.Ed.2d 297 (1979), 58
Calista Corp. v. Mann, 564 P.2d 53 (Alaska 1977), 213
C.H.H. v. R.H., 696 So.2d 1076 (Ala.Civ.App.1996), 213
Cole v. Arkansas Dept. of Human Services., 2010 WL 6451863 (Ark.Cir.2010), 130
Collier v. Krane, 763 F.Supp. 473 (D.Colo.1991), 18
Corbin J., In re Adoption of, 278 Neb. 1057, 775 N.W.2d 404 (Neb.2009), 45
Crawford v. Cooper/T. Smith Stevedoring Co., Inc., 14 F.Supp.2d 202 (D.R.I.1998), 223
Crilly v. Morris, 70 S.D. 584, 19 N.W.2d 836 (S.D.1945), 224
Crossman, Matter of Estate of, 145 Mich.App. 154, 377 N.W.2d 850 (Mich.App.1985), 218
Crozier v. Cohen, 299 F.Supp. 563 (W.D.Okla.1969), 222
Culliton v. Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, 435 Mass. 285, 756 N.E.2d 1133 (Mass.2001), 103
Custody of H.S.H.-K., In re, 193 Wis.2d 649, 533 N.W.2d 419 (Wis.1995), 146
- D'Accardi v. Chater, 96 F.3d 97 (4th Cir.1996), 221
Davis v. Moore, 772 A.2d 204 (D.C.2001), 215
Delamotte v. Stout, 207 Tenn. 406, 340 S.W.2d 894 (Tenn.1960), 224
Doe, In re Adoption of, 130 Ohio App.3d 288, 719 N.E.2d 1071 (Ohio App. 9 Dist.1998), 115, 141
Doe, In re Adoption of, 2008 WL 5006172 (Fla.Cir.Ct.2008), 132
Donnelly's Estates, In re, 81 Wash.2d 430, 502 P.2d 1163 (Wash. 1972), 234, 244
Dresser v. Cradle of Hope Adoption Center, Inc., 358 F.Supp.2d 620 (E.D.Mich.2005), 26
- Edwards' Estate, Matter of, 106 Ill.App.3d 635, 62 Ill.Dec. 407, 435 N.E.2d 1379 (Ill.App. 2 Dist.1982), 217
Engstrom v. State, 461 N.W.2d 309 (Iowa 1990), 22
E.O.G., In re Adoption of, 1993 WL 840527 (Pa.Com.Pl.1993), 143

TABLE OF CASES

Estate of (see name of party)

- Ferenc v. World Child, Inc., 977 F.Supp. 56 (D.D.C.1997), 19
Fields v. Fields, 137 Wash. 592, 243 P. 369 (Wash.1926), 225
Finstuen v. Crutcher, 496 F.3d 1139 (10th Cir.2007), 127
Ford, In re Estate of, 8 Cal.Rptr.3d 541, 82 P.3d 747 (Cal.2004),
214
Foster v. Bass, 575 So.2d 967 (Miss.1990), 27
Fox, Matter of, 567 P.2d 985 (Okla.1977), 233
- Gibbs v. Ernst, 538 Pa. 193, 647 A.2d 882 (Pa.1994), 31
Gill v. Office of Personnel Management, 699 F.Supp.2d 374
(D.Mass.2010), 125
Go Intern., Inc. v. Lewis, 601 S.W.2d 495 (Tex.Civ.App.-El Paso
1980), 236
Goodridge v. Department of Public Health, 440 Mass. 309, 798
N.E.2d 941 (Mass.2003), 123
Goodson v. Castellanos, 214 S.W.3d 741 (Tex.App.-Austin 2007),
145
Goshkarian, Appeal of, 110 Conn. 463, 148 A. 379 (Conn.1930),
215
- Hanks v. Hanks, 281 Ala. 92, 199 So.2d 169 (Ala.1967), 213
Hansen v. McClellan, 2006 WL 3524059 (Mich.App.2006), 136
Harshaw v. Bethany Christian Services, 714 F.Supp.2d 771
(W.D.Mich.2010), 36
Hart, In re, 806 A.2d 1179 (Del.Fam.Ct.2001), 132
Hebert v. Stephenson, 574 So.2d 835 (Ala.Civ.App.1990), 213
Hedges v. Dixon County, 150 U.S. 182, 14 S.Ct. 71, 37 L.Ed. 1044
(1893), 216
Heien v. Crabtree, 369 S.W.2d 28 (Tex.1963), 224
Herrick's Estate, In re, 124 Minn. 85, 144 N.W. 455 (Minn.1913),
249
Hobbs v. Van Stavern, 249 S.W.3d 1 (Tex.App.-Hous. (1 Dist.)
2006), 144
Holt v. Burlington Northern R. Co., 685 S.W.2d 851 (Mo.App.
W.D.1984), 219
- Idaho Dept. of Health & Welfare v. Doe, 150 Idaho 195, 245 P.3d
506 (Idaho App.2010), 217

TABLE OF CASES

- Infant Girl W., In re, 845 N.E.2d 229 (Ind.App.2006), 134
- In Interest of Angel Lace M., 184 Wis.2d 492, 516 N.W.2d 678 (Wis.1994), 115, 146
- In re (see name of party)**
- I.N.S. v. Pangilinan, 486 U.S. 875, 108 S.Ct. 2210, 100 L.Ed.2d 882 (1988), 215
- Israel v. Allen, 195 Colo. 263, 577 P.2d 762 (Colo.1978), 148
- Jackson v. State, 287 Mont. 473, 956 P.2d 35 (Mont.1998), 28
- Jacob, In re, In re Dana, 86 N.Y.2d 651, 636 N.Y.S.2d 716, 660 N.E.2d 397 (N.Y.1995), 114, 140
- Jason C., In re, 129 N.H. 762, 533 A.2d 32 (N.H.1987), 139
- Jenkins, Matter of Estate of, 904 P.2d 1316 (Colo.1995), 214
- J.F. v. D.B., 116 Ohio St.3d 363, 879 N.E.2d 740 (Ohio 2007), 108
- J.F. v. D.B., 897 A.2d 1261 (Pa.Super.2006), 110
- J.F. v. D.B., 165 Ohio App.3d 791, 848 N.E.2d 873 (Ohio App. 9 Dist.2006), 108
- J.N.H. v. N.T.H., 705 So.2d 448 (Ala.Civ.App.1997), 213
- Johnson v. Calvert, 19 Cal.Rptr.2d 494, 851 P.2d 776 (Cal.1993), 94, 98
- Johnson v. Johnson, 617 N.W.2d 97 (N.D.2000), 222
- Juman v. Louise Wise Services, 211 A.D.2d 446, 620 N.Y.S.2d 371 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.1995), 29
- Kerrigan v. Commissioner of Public Health, 289 Conn. 135, 957 A.2d 407 (Conn.2008), 131
- K.M. and D.M., Petition of, 274 Ill.App.3d 189, 210 Ill.Dec. 693, 653 N.E.2d 888 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.1995), 114, 133
- K.S.P., In re Adoption of, 804 N.E.2d 1253 (Ind.App.2004), 114, 134
- Lankford v. Wright, 347 N.C. 115, 489 S.E.2d 604 (N.C.1997), 222
- Lassiter v. Department of Social Services of Durham County, N. C., 452 U.S. 18, 101 S.Ct. 2153, 68 L.Ed.2d 640 (1981), 74
- Lehr v. Robertson, 463 U.S. 248, 103 S.Ct. 2985, 77 L.Ed.2d 614 (1983), 57
- Leroy v. Maine Children's Home, 2002 WL 31360598 (Me.Super.2002), 24
- Litowitz v. Litowitz, 146 Wash.2d 514, 48 P.3d 261 (Wash.2002), 92

TABLE OF CASES

- Lofton v. Secretary of Dept. of Children and Family Services, 358 F.3d 804 (11th Cir.2004), 126
- Lucas, In re Estate of, 2005 WL 674682 (D.C.Super.2005), 216
- Luke, In re Adoption of, 263 Neb. 365, 640 N.W.2d 374 (Neb. 2002), 115, 138
- Lyman v. Sullivan, 147 Conn. 134, 157 A.2d 759 (Conn.1960), 215
- M.A., In re Adoption of, 930 A.2d 1088 (Me.2007), 135
- Mallette v. Children's Friend and Service, 661 A.2d 67 (R.I.1995), 32
- Marriage of (see name of party)**
- Marriott's Estate, In re, 515 P.2d 571 (Okla.1973), 232
- Massachusetts v. United States Dept. of Health and Human Services, 682 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2012), 125
- Massachusetts v. United States Dept. of Health and Human Services, 698 F.Supp.2d 234 (D.Mass.2010), 125
- Matter of (see name of party)**
- Matthews on Behalf of Matthews v. Secretary of Health and Human Services, 810 F.Supp. 587 (D.Del.1992), 215
- Maui Land & Pineapple Co. v. Makeelani, 69 Haw. 565, 751 P.2d 1020 (Hawai'i 1988), 217
- Maxwell, In re, 4 N.Y.2d 429, 176 N.Y.S.2d 281, 151 N.E.2d 848 (N.Y.1958), 119
- McClure v. Noble, 602 So.2d 377 (Ala.1992), 246
- M.C.D., In re Adoption of, 42 P.3d 873 (Okla.Civ.App. Div. 3 2001), 142
- McKinney v. State, 134 Wash.2d 388, 950 P.2d 461 (Wash.1998), 36
- Meracle v. Children's Service Soc. of Wisconsin, 149 Wis.2d 19, 437 N.W.2d 532 (Wis.1989), 14, 38
- MEW and MLB, In re Marriage of, 4 Pa. D. & C.3d 51, 27 Fiduc.Rep. 416 (Pa.Com.Pl.1977), 147
- M.H. v. Caritas Family Services, 488 N.W.2d 282 (Minn.1992), 15, 27
- Michael J. v. Los Angeles County Dept. of Adoptions, 201 Cal. App.3d 859, 247 Cal.Rptr. 504 (Cal.App. 2 Dist.1988), 13
- Milwaukee County v. M.E. White Co., 296 U.S. 268, 56 S.Ct. 229, 80 L.Ed. 220 (1935), 128
- M.J.S., In re Adoption of, 44 S.W.3d 41 (Tenn.Ct.App.2000), 144

TABLE OF CASES

- M.M., In re, 156 Ill.2d 53, 189 Ill.Dec. 1, 619 N.E.2d 702 (Ill.1993), 235
- M.M.D. & B.H.M., In re, 662 A.2d 837 (D.C.1995), 114, 132
- M.M.G.C., In re Adoption of, 785 N.E.2d 267 (Ind.App.2003), 114, 134
- Mohr v. Commonwealth, 421 Mass. 147, 653 N.E.2d 1104 (Mass. 1995), 26
- Monahan v. Monahan, 14 Ill.2d 449, 153 N.E.2d 1 (Ill.1958), 217
- Moore v. Department of Human Resources, 220 Ga.App. 471, 469 S.E.2d 511 (Ga.App.1996), 20
- Moschetta v. Moschetta, 30 Cal.Rptr.2d 893 (Cal.App. 4 Dist. 1994), 98
- Northfield Ins. Co. v. St. Paul Surplus Lines Ins. Co., a Div. of St. Paul Companies, Inc., 545 N.W.2d 57 (Minn.App.1996), 219
- Oleski v. Hynes, 2008 WL 2930518 (Conn.Super.2008), 99
- Petition of (see name of party)**
- Petitions of Goldman, 331 Mass. 647, 121 N.E.2d 843 (Mass. 1954), 119
- Pierce v. Pierce, 198 Mont. 255, 645 P.2d 1353 (Mont.1982), 220
- Poncho v. Bowdoin, 138 N.M. 857, 126 P.3d 1221 (N.M.App. 2005), 221
- Prewitt's Estate, In re, 17 Ariz.App. 396, 498 P.2d 470 (Ariz.App. Div. 2 1972), 214
- Prince v. Prince, 194 Ala. 455, 69 So. 906 (Ala.1915), 213
- Quilloin v. Walcott, 434 U.S. 246, 98 S.Ct. 549, 54 L.Ed.2d 511 (1978), 57
- Ramsey County v. Yee Lee, 770 N.W.2d 572 (Minn.App.2009), 219
- R.B.F. & R.C.F., In re Adoption of, 569 Pa. 269, 803 A.2d 1195 (Pa.2002), 114, 142
- Richard P. v. Vista Del Mar Child Care Service, 106 Cal.App.3d 860, 165 Cal.Rptr. 370 (Cal.App. 2 Dist.1980), 17
- Ritchie, Appeal of, 155 Neb. 824, 53 N.W.2d 753 (Neb.1952), 220
- Robbins, Matter of Estate of, 241 Kan. 620, 738 P.2d 458 (Kan.1987), 218

TABLE OF CASES

- Roberto d.B., In re, 399 Md. 267, 923 A.2d 115 (Md.2007), 103
- Rodriguez v. Morris, 519 N.Y.S.2d 451 (N.Y.Sur.1987), 221
- Roe v. Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Springfield, Ill., 225 Ill.App.3d 519, 167 Ill.Dec. 713, 588 N.E.2d 354 (Ill.App. 5 Dist.1992), 14, 21
- R.R. v. M.H., 426 Mass. 501, 689 N.E.2d 790 (Mass.1998), 103
- Samek v. Sanders, 788 So.2d 872 (Ala.2000), 213
- Santosky v. Kramer, 455 U.S. 745, 102 S.Ct. 1388, 71 L.Ed.2d 599 (1982), 69
- Schultz' Estate, In re, 220 Or. 350, 348 P.2d 22 (Or.1959), 223
- Seader, In re Estate of, 76 P.3d 1236 (Wyo.2003), 225
- Sharon S. v. Superior Court, 2 Cal.Rptr.3d 699, 73 P.3d 554 (Cal.2003), 130
- Smith v. Organization of Foster Families For Equality and Reform, 431 U.S. 816, 97 S.Ct. 2094, 53 L.Ed.2d 14 (1977), 74
- Soos v. Superior Court in and for County of Maricopa, 182 Ariz. 470, 897 P.2d 1356 (Ariz.App. Div. 1 1994), 98
- Stanley v. Illinois, 405 U.S. 645, 92 S.Ct. 1208, 31 L.Ed.2d 551 (1972), 54, 55
- Taeger v. Catholic Family and Community Services, 196 Ariz. 285, 995 P.2d 721 (Ariz.App. Div. 1 1999), 17
- Tammy, Adoption of, 416 Mass. 205, 619 N.E.2d 315 (Mass. 1993), 114, 126, 136
- Tellis v. Saucier, 133 Ga.App. 779, 213 S.E.2d 39 (Ga.App.1975), 216
- Tereault v. Palmer, 413 N.W.2d 283 (Minn.App.1987), 219
- Thompson, In re Estate of, 760 N.W.2d 208 (Iowa App.2008), 217
- Tilliski's Estate, In re, 323 Ill.App. 490, 56 N.E.2d 481 (Ill.App. 4 Dist.1944), 235
- Travelers Ins. Co. v. Young, 580 F.Supp. 421 (E.D.Mich.1984), 218
- Troxel v. Granville, 530 U.S. 57, 120 S.Ct. 2054, 147 L.Ed.2d 49 (2000), 126
- Two Children by H.N.R., Matter of Adoption of, 285 N.J.Super. 1, 666 A.2d 535 (N.J.Super.A.D.1995), 114, 139
- Wheeling Dollar Sav. & Trust Co. v. Singer, 162 W.Va. 502, 250 S.E.2d 369 (W.Va.1978), 211, 225
- Whitchurch v. Perry, 137 Vt. 464, 408 A.2d 627 (Vt.1979), 225

TABLE OF CASES

- Williams v. Dorrell, 714 So.2d 574 (Fla.App. 3 Dist.1998), 216
- Wolford v. Children's Home Society of West Virginia, 17
F.Supp.2d 577 (S.D.W.Va.1998), 37
- Woodward, Appeal of, 81 Conn. 152, 70 A. 453 (Conn.1908), 215
- W. R. Fairchild Const. Co. v. Owens, 224 So.2d 571 (Miss.1969),
231
- Ybarra v. Texas Dept. of Human Services, 869 S.W.2d 574
(Tex.App.-Corpus Christi 1993), 236
- York v. Nunley, 80 Ohio App.3d 697, 610 N.E.2d 576 (Ohio App.
8 Dist.1992), 222

OUTLINE

	Page
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	V
TABLE OF CASES	XI
INTRODUCTION.....	1
Part One. Establishing the Adoptive Relationship	7
I. Voluntary System.....	7
A. Independent or Private Placements	7
B. Agency Adoptions.....	10
1. Wrongful Adoption	13
2. Annulling or Abrogating the Adoption	15
a. Duty to Disclose Information	17
C. Expenses and Benefits of Adoption	38
D. Consent of Birth Parents and Child	40
1. Mother's Consent	40
a. Adoption Consent Statutes	40
2. Standby Adoption	52
3. Waiver of Consent	52
4. Child's Consent	53
5. Father's Consent	53
a. Putative Father Registry	59
II. Involuntary System	69
A. Placement After Dependency Adjudication	69

OUTLINE

	Page
II. Involuntary System—Continued	69
B. Subsidized Adoption	75
1. State Subsidized Adoption Statutes	77
C. New Assisted Reproductive Technology and Adoption	80
1. Embryo Adoption	82
a. Embryo Adoption Statutes	83
2. Surrogacy	92
a. State Surrogacy Statutes	97
D. Second Parent Adoption	113
E. Standards for Placement	115
1. Religion	118
2. Race	120
3. Sexual Orientation	123
a. State Laws Regarding Gay Adoption	128
 Part Two. Maintaining the Adoptive Relationship	 147
I. Post Adoption Decree Contacts	149
II. Open Adoption	151
III. Post-Adoption Agreements	152
A. Post-Adoption Contact Statutes	153
IV. Access to Adoption Records	176
A. Access to Identifying Information	179
B. Access to Non-Identifying Information	203
V. Equitable Adoption	209
A. Equitable Adoption Statutes	212
VI. Inheritance and Adoption	226
A. Question One: Does an Adopted Child Inherit From His/Her Biological Relatives?	227

OUTLINE

	Page
VI. Inheritance and Adoption—Continued	226
1. States Answering This Question	
No	227
2. States Answering This Question	
Yes	235
B. Question Two: Do Biological Relatives Inherit From Adoptee?	236
C. Question Three: Does Adoptee Inherit From Adoptive Relatives?	246
D. Question Four: Do Adoptive Relatives Inherit From Adoptee?	254
E. Question Five: Stepparent Exception—Is There an Exception to the Traditional Laws of Inheritance if a Child Is Adopted by a Stepparent? If So, What Is the Exception?	262
 Part Three. Federal Legislation Affecting State Adoptions	 275
I. Indian Child Welfare Act (ICWA) of 1978 ..	275
II. Federal Adoption Assistance and Child Welfare Act of 1980 (FAACWA)	276
III. Multiethnic Placement Act of 1994	277
IV. Adoption and Safe Families Act of 1997	278
V. Foster Care Independence Act	279
VI. Safe and Timely Interstate Placement of Foster Children	280
 Part Four. Intercountry Adoption	 281
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 287
INDEX	293