

A COMPARATIVE HISTORY OF IDEAS

Hajime Nakamura

A COMPARATIVE
HISTORY OF IDEAS

by

Hajime Nakamura



KPI

LONDON, NEW YORK, SYDNEY and HENLEY

First published in Tokyo, 1975
This revised edition published in 1986 by KPI Limited
14 Leicester Square, London WC2H 7PH, England

Distributed by
Routledge & Kegan Paul plc
14 Leicester Square, London WC2H 7PH, England

Routledge & Kegan Paul Inc
29 West 35th Street, New York NY 10001, USA

Routledge & Kegan Paul
c/o Methuen Law Book Company
44 Waterloo Road
North Ryde, NSW 2113
Australia

Routledge & Kegan Paul plc
Broadway House, Newtown Road,
Henley-on-Thames, Oxon RG9 1EN, England

Printed in Great Britain by
Unwin Brothers Ltd.
The Gresham Press, Old Woking, Surrey

© Hajime Nakamura, 1975, 1986

No part of this book may be reproduced in any
form without permission from the publisher,
except for the quotation of brief passages in criticism

ISBN 0-7103-0122-77

*A COMPARATIVE
HISTORY OF IDEAS*

Preface to the Second Edition

We are living in the age when things should be viewed and discussed on a global scale. No event is isolated from other events.

We are in need of a kind of global history of ideas in which the developments of ideas should be viewed in the global scope, and yet we are afraid that no work to the effect has been brought about. Of course, there have been published a number of authoritative works, such as *History of Philosophy Eastern and Western* or *History of World Religions* and so on. But in these works separate courses of development of ideas in various cultural areas were set forth in different chapters by different scholars from different angles, and the final outcomes seem too disparate, providing us with no conformity in the purpose and the style.

I thought that in order to keep conformity, developments of ideas in various cultural areas should be viewed by a single author and then the details should be corrected by other scholars specialising in various aspects of human intellect or in different traditions.

To this end I have toiled presumptuously to write a comparative history of ideas covering various traditions in global scope. In launching this project I tried to avoid elaborate theorising and allow the data to speak for themselves, as a glance at the following pages will show. Some theoretical considerations are, of course, unavoidable, but whatever theories emerge in this work do not wander far from the problems that emerge from the data of intellectual history.

I have attempted to describe and assess certain key problems in the history of ideas, both East and West. The material has been patiently collected; it was there, and it seemed a pity not to put it into some kind of order and present it to a public that might, after all, find something of value hidden within these pages.

This work does not necessarily cover all important religions and philosophical systems. It covers only those features or problems of thought which are common to East and West through the end of the nineteenth century. Synchronical considerations are chiefly presented in the main text, while diachronical similarities between thinkers of different ages are mentioned mostly in the footnotes.

This work was originally based upon a series of four public lectures delivered at Harvard University in 1963. For my lectures there I should also like to thank especially: Professor Robert H. L. Slater, former Director of the Center for the Study of World Religions, Harvard University; Professor Daniel H. H. Ingalls of Harvard; Mr. J. Masson, a student at Harvard. The suggestions and arrangements by Professor Charles W. Morris and Professor Delton L. Scudder of the University of Florida were helpful to me in my studies.

Since then I engaged in revising and developing the theme. In summer, 1969, I joined the Fifth East-West Philosophers' Conference held at the East-West Center, University of Hawaii, and remained in Honolulu after the close of the Conference to complete the manuscript. I am most grateful to Dr. Minoru Shinoda, Professor of History, University of Hawaii, and formerly Director of the Institute of Cultural Learning, East-West Center, who kindly assisted me in my work during my stay then. Without his kind arrangements this book would not have been brought to existence. Mr. Clifford Miyashiro kindly went over the manuscript up to the end of the second chapter, spending a great deal of his time to check various points and to improve the style.

I came again to Honolulu in summer, 1971, at the invitation of the East-West Center under the thoughtful arrangements by Dr. Everett Kleinjans, Chancellor of the Center, and Professor Eliot Deutsch, Editor of *Philosophy East and West* to revise the manuscript in its finalised form. Also, I am much indebted to Professor Winfield E. Nagley of the University of Hawaii for his kind friendship for many years.

The merit of completion of the manuscript should be ascribed especially to Professor Gerald Larson of the University of California at Santa Barbara, who kindly consented to come to the Center solely for the purpose of revising the manuscript. He and I worked together every day from 8 o'clock a.m. to noon, and worked in the afternoon also. I learnt quite a lot from conversation with him. Without his kind collaboration this book would not have been brought to this state of completion.

After Professor Larson left for California, Mr. Ronald Burr of the East-West Center came to Tokyo for the purpose of completing the work and editing the manuscript. During his stay in Tokyo in August of 1971 through December he kindly devoted most of his time to editing. I am greatly thankful for his enthusiasm in collaboration.

For publication of this work in its final form I was especially honoured and encouraged by Professor Charles Morris who kindly read the whole work through. I am very grateful to him for a long chain of friendship extending for many years, almost a quarter of a century.

I feel greatly honoured by the kind help of all these gentlemen.

Although I know full well that this work has many passages which

need much revision and further enlargement, I decided to bring it to the public as a stepping stone for further studies.

The original work was published in Tokyo, now it is being published by KPI, in a new and revised form, and I feel myself greatly honoured in the hope that this work might be read widely.

For this new edition I am very grateful to Mr. Peter Hopkins, and Dr. Mark Nathanson, of KPI. I am also greatly indebted to Mr. Trevor Leggett of the BBC, who knows Japanese and Sanskrit very well and whose works are cordially welcomed in both Japan and India, for his kind help on many points. Herewith I express my sincere gratitude to them.

HAJIME NAKAMURA

Professor Emeritus, University of Tokyo
Founder-Director, The Eastern Institute, Tokyo

EDITOR'S PREFACE

PROFESSOR Nakamura's book represents an effort to discuss the history of ideas primarily from the perspective of Asian thought, though perhaps sometimes with an Indian emphasis. As a result, it presents problems in intellectual history from quite a different perspective than most European and American historians of ideas, who view the history of philosophy using European thought as a norm or criterion. This is part of the genius of the work; but it must not be overly stressed because it is based on the *differences* in traditions. For it becomes clear as one works through Professor Nakamura's book that the old East-West dichotomy in many respects is simply inadequate. Certain common intellectual problems have surfaced wherever man has appeared; and methods must be found for getting beyond the East-West preoccupation if significant intellectual progress is to be made with respect to understanding the history of ideas. At the same time, however—and this is the paradox of Professor Nakamura's book—it becomes clear in the end that many of the problems of what is called "modern thought" (by Western philosophers) did not manifest themselves in India, China, and Japan before the period of "Westernization" except in scattered and tentative ways. In place of the Western scientific orientation, however, very human ethical considerations were often emphasized.

The reader will find Professor Nakamura's work to be a source book in at least two important ways. In the first place, he stands in a tradition of scholars who have held the chair of philosophy at Tokyo University, and who are of astonishingly high caliber in the amount and quality of the scholarship they have produced. Going back only two generations from Professor Nakamura is Junjiro Takakusa who, among other things, oversaw the publication in his own lifetime of the Taisho edition of the Buddhist Tripitaka. Succeeding him was Professor Nakamura's famous teacher Dr. Hakuju Ui, who, in addition to an immensely helpful Buddhist dictionary and other important works, published what stands as *the* authoritative work on Chinese Zen, his three-volume *Zenshū Shi Kenkyū*. In that work, Professor Ui offered long quotations and commentaries from works that would be very difficult for the average (and sometimes not so average) reader to find. In a somewhat similar way, the reader will

find Professor Nakamura's scholarship to be authoritative and documented in the extreme, and that in place of hiding his sources behind paraphrases he often offers quotations from the widest range of texts and commentators imaginable so that the reader may constantly appreciate the original touch of great figures in the ongoing history of ideas.

This work also serves as a source book in that scholars of the history of ideas (especially those in comparative philosophy and comparative religion) will find it to be especially rich in ideas. Many of the comparisons mentioned by Professor Nakamura have been elaborated on under this cover. In some instances, however, eager to explore other areas, he has moved on, leaving behind a challenge for succeeding authors to do further research on what has been brought to light. Many times Professor Nakamura has suggested specific points that deserve further scrutiny. If he had elaborated all of the comparative points of interest himself, this book would have been larger by at least another volume.

As to the editing of the work, it was done, so to speak, in two "shifts." Dr. Gerald Larson began work on the task early in the summer of 1971 in Honolulu. After readying for publication Chapter I and a large portion of Chapter II (parts I and II) his previous commitments necessitated his return to "the mainland." At that time Professor Nakamura was preparing to return to Tokyo for resumption of his duties as chairman of the department of Indian and Buddhist philosophy at the University of Tokyo. So it became necessary to engage a second editor to complete the work. It was then decided that Ronald Burr would go to Tokyo in August of 1971 for this purpose. Beginning with Part III of Chapter II, he completed preparation of the manuscript in Tokyo in March, 1972. Then it was sent to Santa Barbara, California, where Dr. Larson gave the entire manuscript a final reading.

Of the people without whom this editing task could not have been accomplished, the highest inspiration came from Professor Nakamura himself. Simply by working with him many a colleague has been prompted to persevere in the mentor's fashion (see for instance Professor Inada's foreword to his new translation of Nāgārjuna's *Mūlamadhyamaka-kārikās*, Hokuseido, 1970). Professor Nakamura unconsciously gets the best from those who come into contact with him. He is jolly, kind and willing to give complete concentration at a moment's notice to the problems that arise in each of the myriad projects in which he is constantly involved.

As to the people without whom the editing in Tokyo could not have taken place (at least as smoothly and happily as it did) thanks must go first to Dr. Dorothy Roberts at the East-West Center in Honolulu, who got us all together when it was learned that the editing must be completed in Japan. Secondly, without the friendship, companionship, and myriad assistances of Yoshihiro Matsunami, who manages the affairs of

Professor Nakamura's Eastern Institute in Tokyo, the task would have been much more lengthy and difficult as well as much less enjoyable. Mrs. Miriam Gould of the East-West Center offered many suggestions on proof reading the finished copy. Finally, the Tokyo editing could not have been done without the day-to-day typing and doctoring of Mrs. Nancy Burr, whose uncanny feel for good idiomatic English has made it possible to present a book which is, hopefully, as easy to read as it is important.

RONALD BURR

CONTENTS

CONTENTS

PREFACE TO SECOND EDITION	v
EDITOR'S PREFACE by Ronald Burr	ix
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	3
1. The Aim of the Work	3
2. Some References to Comparative Attempts in the Classical Period	7
<i>Chapter I. MYTHS, GODS, AND SACRIFICE:</i>	
THOUGHT IN EARLY AGRICULTURAL COMMUNITIES	
I. Social Background	11
1. Introductory Remarks	11
2. Sedentary Life	12
3. Establishment of a Hierarchical Order	15
4. The Compilation of the Holy Scriptures of Each Tradition	22
II. Gods and Man	26
1. The Gods in Ancient Mythology	26
2. Principles and Efficacy of Rituals	35
3. Man's Destiny	39
a. After-life	39
b. Ancestor Worship	41
4. Cosmic Law	43
III. The Search for the Absolute	47
1. Introductory Comments	47
2. The Tendency towards Mono-theism	49
3. Cosmogony	50
a. Introductory Remarks	50

b. Creation from the Primordial Man	51
c. Creation from the Non-existent	53
d. Creation from "What is neither existent nor nonexistent."	53
e. Creation from Primeval Water and the Cosmic Egg	56
f. Speculation about the Word	60
g. Time as the Fundamental Principle	63
h. Food as the Fundamental Principle	64
i. Reflections on the Structure of the Universe	65
IV. Conclusion	69

*Chapter II. THE TWILIGHT OF THE GODS:
THE RISE OF PHILOSOPHY AND THE
DEVELOPMENT OF HETERODOXIES*

I. Introductory Remarks	73
II. The Rise of Philosophy	76
A. The Early Critical Attitude	76
1. Yearning for the Beyond	76
2. Re-evaluation of the Gods and the Sacrifice	80
3. Brief Summary	83
B. Elements Regarded as the Fundamental Principle	85
1. Water	85
2. Ether or Space	86
3. Wind or Breath	87
4. Fire	89
5. Numbers	89
6. Summary	90
C. The Concept of the Absolute	91
1. The Absolute and the Self	91
2. The Identification of the Self with the Absolute	98
3. The Manifestation of the World from Being as Such	103
4. The Source of Beings	113
5. The Structures of Human Existence	114
6. The Absolute Subject	115
7. The Deified Self	123
D. Problems of Practice	125
1. Retribution and Deliverance as Hereditary	125
2. Individual Responsibility	126
a. Transmigration and Retribution	126
b. The Final Goal	135
c. The Basis of Ethics	138

III. The Development of Heterodoxies	142
A. Materialism	142
1. Materialism (—Elements—)	142
2. Materialism (—Atomists—)	145
B. The Pursuit of Pleasure	152
C. Determinism	157
D. Skepticism	162
1. Suspension of Judgment	162
2. Sophistic Dialectic	165
3. Relativism	167
E. Asceticism	172
1. Self-mortification	172
2. The Seeking of Dishonor	180
F. Concluding Words	183
IV. Concluding Comments	185

Chapter III. EARLY UNIVERSAL RELIGIONS

I. Introductory Remarks	191
II. The Ideal Image of the Founders	194
A. Their Lives	194
1. Birth and Youthful Days	194
2. Spiritual Activities	199
B. Faith	206
1. Significance of Faith	206
2. Worship of the Founder	210
C. Concluding Words	215
III. Fundamental Attitudes	217
A. Attitude toward Thinkers and Their Systems	217
1. Cognizance of Variation	217
2. Partial Veracity of Thoughts	218
3. Tolerance	221
B. Attitude toward Philosophy in General	225
1. Silence on Metaphysical Problems	225
2. Rigorous Examination	229
3. Universal Norms	232
IV. Human Existence	237
A. Analysis	237
1. Suffering	237
2. Ignorance—The Cause of Suffering	239
3. Impermanence of Phenomena	242

4. The Theory of Non-Ego	245
5. The Individual—Kinetic Existence and Transmigration ...	250
B. The Aim of Human Existence and the Path toward the Aim	256
1. The Aim	256
2. Possibility for Progress	264
a. Karma and Craving	264
b. The True Self	269
3. General Principles of Ethics	273
a. The Value and Equality of Man	273
b. Compassion and Service to Others	276
c. The Concepts of Evil and Conscience	281
d. The Mean and the Character of Effort	286
4. Ethics in the Order	292
a. Establishing of the Order	292
b. Moderate Asceticism	295
1) Away from the World into the Order	295
2) Disciplines	298
c. Mission Work	301
5. Ethics for Laymen	303
6. Further Practice	309
a. The Use of Philosophy as a Path	309
b. Meditation	311
V. The Ideal of the Universal State	317
A. States and Kings	317
B. Attempts at a Universal State Based on a Universal Religion	323
1. Universal States	323
2. The Ideal of the Management of the Centralized State	332
3. Religious and Cultural Policy for the Populace	339
VI. Concluding Remarks	344
 <i>Chapter IV. FEATURES OF MEDIEVAL THOUGHT</i>	
I. General Thoughts on Developments in the Middle Ages	351
A. Introduction	351
B. Supremacy of Religion	356
1. Otherworldliness	356
2. The Establishment of Religious Authority	361
3. Approach to Common People	366
II. Two Types of Religion	370
A. Introductory Words	370

B.	The Themes of Compassion and Love	373
1.	Compassion-Love Doctrine	373
2.	The Role of Saints and Bodhisattvas	379
3.	Vicarious Suffering	382
4.	Sin and Grace	384
a.	Faith and Deliverance in the Pure Land or Paradise ...	384
b.	Sense of Sin and Need for Divine Grace	390
C.	Mystical Schools	399
1.	Methodology	399
2.	Interpretation of Experience	409
3.	Practical Consequences of Mysticism	416
4.	Ecumenical Thinking	420
III.	Theology and its Counterparts	423
A.	Reasoning and Philosophy	423
B.	Frequently Discussed Problems	432
1.	The Nature of the Absolute	432
a.	Threefold Characterizations	432
b.	Interrelational Existence	436
c.	The Absolute as Phenomena	443
2.	The Absolute and the Individual	449
a.	The Relationship between the Absolute and the Individual	449
b.	Immortality of the Self	452
3.	Problems of More Formal Reasoning	455
a.	Proofs of God's Existence	455
b.	Motion	459
c.	Categories	460
d.	Controversy over Universals	462
IV.	Conclusion	469

Chapter V. COMMON FEATURES OF MODERN THOUGHT

I.	Introductory Remarks	475
II.	Modern Philosophical Attitudes	479
A.	Nature and Natural Law	479
B.	Mathematics, Logic, and the Movement toward Scientific Methods	486
C.	Revival of Skepticism	490
1.	Rational Doubt and Consciousness of the Ego	490
2.	Movement toward Reliance on Experience	497
D.	Discovery of Antiquity in a Modern Light	503
E.	Liberty	506

F. Post-modern Movement toward Dialectics	509
III. Modern Religious Attitudes	511
A. Protest against Medieval Ways of Thinking	511
1. Introductory Words	511
2. Denunciation of Religious Formalism and Stress on Inner Devotion	512
3. Denial of Charismatic Authority	517
4. Rejection of Religious Differences	520
5. A Return to This-Worldliness	526
6. Rise in Popularity of Worldly Activity and Vocational Ethics	530
B. Changes in the Evaluation of Man	536
1. Man Conceived as Supreme—Stress on Human Love	536
2. Service to People	541
3. Heightened Movement toward Equality of Man and Anti-discrimination	545
4. Increased Lay Tendency of Religion	550
5. Accelerated Approach to the Masses	555
6. A Return to Ethical Norms—A Result of Man's Increased Value	557
IV. Conclusion of the Discussions on Modern Thought	561
GENERAL CONCLUSIONS	565
INDEX	568

N.B. Bibliographical details of a work cited in this manuscript are mentioned when it is cited for the first time.