§Law in context

Company Law and Capitalism Second Edition Tom Hadden

Company Law and Capitalism

SECOND EDITION

TOM HADDEN

Lecturer in Law in the Queen's University of Belfast

WEIDENFELD AND NICOLSON London © 1972 Tom Hadden 1977 Second Edition Reprinted October 1980

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Copyright owner.

Weidenfeld and Nicolson 91 Clapham High Street London SW4

ISBN 0 297 77334 8 Cased ISBN 0 297 77335 6 Paperback

Printed in Great Britain by Redwood Burn Limited Trowbridge & Esher

PREFACE

British company law is not unworkable. But it is tied to a conception of capitalism which has been discarded by all but the most ardent free-market economists. It has also ceased to reflect the realities of the commercial and industrial world.

The intention of this book is to explain and analyse the existing law as it is applied in practice to the three main types of business enterprise which operate as limited companies under the Companies Acts: small private businesses, larger unquoted or family companies and quoted companies. This restructuring on functional lines has in itself suggested a number of ways in which the law might be restated or reformed in order to provide a more realistic framework for the regulation of each class of enterprise. It has also highlighted the triviality of some of the topics traditionally dealt with at some length in company law texts. These have accordingly been excluded or drastically pruned. In dealing with changes in substantive law since the first edition of this book appeared in 1972 I have adopted the same approach. The main statutory reforms and developments in the case-law have been incorporated. But I have paid equal attention to developments in the practical operation of the law and to the likely impact of current proposals for industrial democracy and of current practice in governmental intervention on the future of the capitalist system in a mixed economy.

I have also tried to meet some of the criticisms with which the generally favourable response to the first edition was tempered. In the first chapter I have attempted to live better up to my title by including a good deal more material on the origins of capitalism and

by dealing more fully with the alternative theoretical explanations of free market and Marxist economists. In the second I have added some material on multi-nationals and the mixed economy to bring up to date the analysis of trends in modern capitalism. These two chapters now form Part I which is intended as a general non-legal introduction to the development and organization of the capitalist system.

As a result of this rearrangement I have been able to gather together in Part II all the chapters which deal with the basic rules of company law and practice, dealing in turn with small participatory companies, unquoted or family companies, quoted (listed) companies, and the administrative regulation of stock market dealings, of takeovers and mergers and of investment institutions. By abolishing the chapter on the concepts of company law and reallocating some of the material in it on a more functional basis I hope to meet the criticism that the material on certain topics was too scattered for teaching, or indeed any other, purposes. I have also attempted to remedy some of the errors and omissions which my more attentive readers have pointed out. In this Part the principal new material will be found in the section on inflation accounting in Chapter 3, in the discussion of oppression and its remedies, including the important new case of Wallersteiner v. Moir, in Chapter 5, and in the reorganized section on groups in Chapter 9. The main provisions of the Companies Act 1976 and the revised version of the City Code of April 1976 have been incorporated.

Finally I have attempted in Part III to analyse the practical choices facing the capitalist system. What is now Chapter 13 on Industrial Democracy has been completely rewritten, excising the material on individual and collective rights of employees and bringing in a much more detailed discussion of the experience of codetermination in Germany and of the proposals of the Bullock Committee in Britain. The final section on governmental intervention in Chapter 14 has been expanded to cover the provisions of the Industry Act 1975 and the operations of the National Enterprise Board.

I should like to thank a number of people who have read and commented on drafts of various sections of this new edition or otherwise assisted in its preparation: they are Phyllis Bateson (Queen's University), Ben Buchan (Weidenfeld and Nicolson), Rosemary Chesney (Queen's University), Mike Chesterman (University

X PREFACE

of Warwick), Paul Davies (University of Oxford), Ian Grigg-Spall (University of Kent), Geoffrey Hornsey (Queen's University), Rosemary Jack (who drew another drawing), Peter Lee (City Panel), Marie McAlister (Queen's University), David McLellan (University of Kent), Chris Moffat (Lloyd-Baker Institute), Carol Robinson (Queen's University), William Twining (University of Warwick), Jack Winkler (Cranfield Institute) and Malcolm Wood (Queen's University). I have not accepted all their criticisms, but I am grateful to them all, and particularly to Mike Chesterman, for trying so hard to straighten out my legal, theoretical and political deviations.

February 1977

Derrybroughas Portadown Co. Armagh

TABLE OF CASES

Aaron's Reefs Lta. v. 1 wiss [1690] A.C. 273	310-11
Allen v. Hyatt (1914) 30 T.L.R. 444	256
In re Allied Produce Co. Ltd. [1967] 1 W.L.R. 1469	358
Ammonia Soda Co. v. Chamberlain [1918] 1 Ch. 266	132
Ashbury Railway Carriage and Iron Co. v. Riche (1875)	
L.R. 7 H.L. 653	113
Automatic Self-Cleansing Filter Syndicate Co. Ltd. v.	
Cunninghame [1906] 2 Ch. 34	156
Bamford v. Bamford [1970] Ch. 212	273
Bank voor Handel en Sheepvart v. Slatford [1953] 1 Q.B. 248	II2
In re Jon Beauforte (London) Ltd. [1953] Ch. 131	114
Bell Houses Ltd. v. City Wall Properties Ltd. [1966]	
2 Q.B. 656	115, 148
In re Bellador Silk Ltd. [1965] 1 All E.R. 667	267
Re Black Bolt and Nut Association's Agreement (1960)	
L.R. 2 R.P. 50; (1961) L.R. 3 R.P. 43	492
Blue Chip Stamps v. Manor Drug Stores (1975) 421 U.S. 723	351
Brace v. Calder [1895] 2 Q.B. 253	99
Henry Brown & Sons v. Smith [1964] 2 Lloyds List 476	144
In re Bugle Press Ltd. [1961] 1 Ch. 270	372-3
Bushell v. Faith [1970] A.C. 1099	106, 246
In re Carlton Holdings Ltd. [1971] 1 W.L.R. 918	372
Charterbridge Corporation Ltd. v. Lloyds Bank Ltd.	
[1970] Ch. 62	395
Clemens v. Clemens Bros Ltd. [1976] 2 All E.R. 179	269 , 290
In re City Equitable Fire Insurance Co. [1925] 1 Ch. 407	238

xii TABLE OF CASES

Consten and Grundig v. EEC Commission (1966) C.M.L.R.	418 495
Conway v. Petronius Clothing Co. Ltd. (1977)	
The Times 28 April	464
	235 , 253, 259
Cox v. Hickman (1860) 8 H.L.C. 268	98 , 167, 169
Cunliffe-Owen v. Teather & Greenwood [1967] 1 W.L.R.	1421 343
In re Cutts [1956] 1 W.L.R. 728	190-1
D.H.N. Food Distributors Ltd. v. Tower Hamlets L.B.C. [1	976]
1 W.L.R. 852	394
Dafen Tinplate Co. v. Llanelly Steel Co. [1907] 2 Ch. 124	260
In re Davis & Collett Ltd. [1935] 1 Ch. 693	157
De Beers Consolidated Mines Ltd. v. Howe [1906] A.C. 45.	
Derry v. Peek (1889) 14 App. Cas. 337	311
Diamond v. Oreamuno (1969) 24 N.Y. 2d. 494	351
Dimbula Valley (Ceylon) Tea Co. Ltd. v. Laurie [1961]	33*
1 Ch. 353	700
	132
In re Duomatic Ltd. [1969] 2 Ch. 365	242, 258–9
Edwards v. Halliwell [1950] 2 All E.R. 1064	272
Eisenberg v. Central Zone Property Corp. (1957) 335 U.S. 8	384 278
Elder v. Elder & Watson Ltd. [1952] S.C. 49	263
Ernst & Ernst v. Hochfelder (1976) 96 S.Ct. 1375	351
Europemballage Corp. and Continental Can Co. v. EEC	33
Commission (1973) C.M.L.R. 199	495
001111111111111111111111111111111111111	493
In re F G Films Ltd. [1953] 1 W.L.R. 483	146
In re F L E Holdings Ltd. [1967] 1 W.L.R. 1397	200
Featherstonhaugh v. Fenwick (1810) 17 Ves. Jun. 298	101
In re Five Minute Car Wash Service Ltd. [1966] 1 W.L.R.	
	, 271 ,272–80
Freeman & Lockyer v. Buckhurst Park Properties (Mangal)	
Ltd. [1964] 2 Q.B. 480	119-20, 166
In re Galvanized Tank Manufacturers' Association's	
Agreement (1965) L.R. 5 R.P. 315	492
In re Thomas Gerrard & Son Ltd. [1968] Ch. 455	139
Gething v. Kilner [1972] 1 W.L.R. 337	370
In re Glamorganshire Banking Co. (1884) 28 Ch. D. 620	281
0 1 1	

Governments Stock & Other Securities Investment Co. Ltd.	
v. Christopher [1956] 1 All E.R. 490	301
Greenhalgh v. Arderne Cinemas Ltd. [1951] 1 Ch. 286	261
In re Grierson, Oldham & Adams Ltd. [1967] 1 W.L.R. 385 In re The Grosvenor and West-end Railway Terminus Hotel Co.	
(1897) 76 L.T. 337	352
Guthrie v. Harkness (1905) 199 U.S. 1149	282
In re H R Harmer Ltd. [1959] 1 W.L.R. 62	266
Harrison v. Tennant (1856) 21 Beav. 482	102
Hedley Byrne & Co. v. Heller & Partners [1964] A.C. 465	251 , 312
In re Hellenic & General Trust Ltd. [1976] 1 W.L.R. 123	394
Hely-Hutchinson v. Brayhead Ltd. [1968] 1 Q.B. 549	243
Hogg v. Cramphorn Ltd. [1967] Ch. 254 245-6	, 274, 280
In re Holders Investment Trust Ltd. [1971] 1 W.L.R. 583	262
In re Eric Holmes (Property) Ltd. [1965] Ch. 1052	200
Holroyd v. Marshall (1862) 10 H.L.C. 191	172
Houldsworth v. City of Glasgow Bank (1880) 5 App. Cas. 31	7 311
Hughes v. Trapnell [1963] 1 Q.B. 737	339
Hutton v. West Cork Railway Co. (1883) 23 Ch. D. 654	317-8
ICI and Commercial Solvents Corp. v. EEC Commission (1974)	
C.M.L.R. 309	495
Independent Automatic Sales Ltd. v. Knowles & Foster	
[1962] I W.L.R. 974	173-4
Industrial Development Consultants Ltd. v. Cooley [1972]	
1 W.L.R. 443	253 , 254
IRC v. Crossman [1937] A.C. 26	69
IRC v. Phillips [1951] 1 Ch. 225	189
Introductions Ltd. v. National Provincial Bank Ltd. [1970]	
Ch. 199	5–16 , 148
T W C ACTUAL TALE A THIER	
In re Jermyn Street Turkish Baths Ltd. [1970] 1 W.L.R.	C -CO -
	-6 , 268–9
Jones v. Lipman [1962] 1 W.L.R. 832	146
Kendel - Wood (1971) I D 6 Evols 242	×6.
Kendal v. Wood (1871) L.R. 6 Exch. 243	164 138
In re Kingston Cotton Mill Co. (No. 2) [1896] 2 Ch. 279	_
Knapp v. Bankers Securities Corp. (1956) 230 F. 2d. 717	270
Re Kodak (1970) C.M.L.R. D19	495

xiv TABLE OF CASES

Lagunas Nitrate Co. v. Lagunas Syndicate [1899] 2 Ch. 392 Lee v. Neuchatel Asphalte Co. (1889) 41 Ch. D. 1 In re William C Leitch Bros. Ltd. [1932] 2 Ch. 71 Lindgren v. L & P Estates Ltd. [1968] Ch. 572 In re Lundie Bros. Ltd. [1965] 1 W.L.R. 1051 158, Lyle & Scott Ltd. v. Scotts Trustees [1959] A.C. 763	237 , 314 131 , 132 204 236 , 395 160 , 266–7 369
Macaura v. Northern Assurance Co. [1925] A.C. 619 McEntire & Maconchy v. Crossley Bros. Ltd. [1895] A.C. 4 Mann v. Goldstein [1968] 1 W.L.R. 1091 Maxwell v. Department of Trade and Industry [1974] Q.B. 53 Morgan v. Tate & Lyle [1955] A.C. 21 Mutual Life and Citizens' Assurance Co. Ltd. v. Evatt [1971] A.C. 793	197
In re Net Book Agreement (1962) L.R. 3 R.P. 246 In re New York Taxicab Co. Ltd. [1913] 1 Ch. 1 Northern Counties Securities Ltd. v. Jackson & Steeple Ltd. [1974] 1 W.L.R. 1133	493 18 3-4 247
In re Othery Construction Ltd. [1966] 1 W.L.R. 69 Otter Tail Power Co. v. US (1973) 410 U.S. 366	196 490
In re Panama, New Zealand and Australian Royal Mail Co. (1870) L.R. 5 Ch. App. 318 Parke v. Daily News Ltd. [1962] Ch. 927 In re Patrick & Lyon Ltd. [1933] Ch. 786 Pavlides v. Jensen [1956] Ch. 565 Percival v. Wright [1902] 2 Ch. 421 236, 252, 253 In re Pergamon Press Ltd. [1971] Ch. 388 Phipps v. Boardman [1967] 2 A.C. 46 Polsky v. S & A Services Ltd. [1951] 1 All E.R. 185 & 1068	356-7 234
R. v. Arthur (1967) The Times 14 March R. v. de Berenger (1814) 3 M. & S. 67 R. v. Grunwald [1963] 1 Q.B. 935 R. v. Gurney (1868) 11 Cox C.C. 414 R. v. ICR Haulage Ltd. [1944] 1 K.B. 551 R. v. Lord Kylsant [1932] 1 K.B. 442 R. v. McDonnell [1966] 1 Q.B. 233	344 309, 370 308 111 307–8

R. v. Mackinnon [1959] 1 Q.B. 150	308
R. v. Salter [1968] 2 Q.B. 793	189
R. v. Schildkamp [1971] A.C. 1	204
In re Rampgill Mill Ltd. [1967] Ch. 1138	199
Regal (Hastings) Ltd. v. Gulliver [1942] 1 All E.R. 378	235, 254
Rights and Issues Investment Trust Ltd. v. Stylo Shoes Ltd.	
[1965] Ch. 250	247
In re W & M Roith Ltd. [1967] 1 W.L.R. 432	244-5
Royal British Bank v. Turquand (1856) 6 E. & B. 327	119, 165
Salaman v. Warner (1891) 65 L.T. 132	345
Salmon v. Hamborough Co. (1671) 1 Ch. Cas. 204	12, 20
Salomon v. Salomon & Co. [1897] A.C. 22	143, 200, 202
Schein v. Chasen (1975) 313 So. 2d 739	351
Scott v. Brown, Doering & McNab [1892] 2 Q.B. 724	345
Scottish Co-operative Wholesale Society Ltd. v. Meyer	
[1959] A.C. 324	263-4 , 396
SEC v. Texas Gulf Sulphur Co. (1968) 401 F. 2d 833	350
Seddon v. North Eastern Salt Co. [1905] 1 Ch. 326	314
Selangor United Rubber Estates Ltd. v. Cradock (No. 3)	
[1968] 1 W.L.R. 1555	374
John Shaw & Sons (Salford) Ltd. v. Shaw	106-7 , 275-6
[1935] 2 K.B. 113	
Sidebottom v. Kershaw, Leese & Co. [1920] 1 Ch. 154	260
Smith v. Anderson (1880) 15 Ch. D. 247	411
Re Smith & Fawcett [1942] Ch. 304	154-5, 290
A P Smith Mfg. Co. v. Barlow (1953) 346 U.S. 861	319
Howard Smith Ltd. v. Ampol Petroleum Ltd. (1974) A.C.	821 246, 290
In re South of England Natural Gas and Petroleum Co. Ltd.	
[1911] 1 Ch. 573	249-50
In re Standard Manufacturing Co. [1891] 1 Ch. 627	174
Stekel v. Ellice [1973] 1 W.L.R. 191	99, 161
Stoneleigh Finance Ltd. v. Phillips [1965] 2 Q.B. 537	178
Strong v. Repide (1909) 213 U.S. 419	256
Sykes v. Beadon (1879) 11 Ch. D. 170	411
20,000 01 2000001 (10/9) 11 011 21 1/0	7**
Taylor v. Wright (1945) 69 Cal. App. 2d 371	256
Thomas v. Kelly (1888) 13 App. Cas. 506	174
Trevor v. Whitworth (1887) 12 App. Cas. 409	129, 130
Tunstall v. Steigman [1962] 2 Q.B. 593	
2 WISHER V. DIETERIAN [1902] 2 Q.D. 593	III, 144

In re Victoria Steamboats Ltd. [1897] 1 Ch. 158

183

Wallersteiner v. Moir (No. 2) [1975] Q.B. 373	279, 280
In re Westbourne Galleries Ltd. [1970] 1 W.L.R. 1378;	
reversed (1971) Ch. 799; reaffirmed (1973)	
A.C. 360	158-9 , 267-8
White v. Bristol Aeroplane Co. [1953] Ch. 65	261
In re W. R. Willcocks & Co. Ltd. [1974] 1 Ch. 163	159
In re Yenidje Tobacco Co. Ltd. [1916] 2 Ch. 426	145, 157
In re Yeovil Glove Co. Ltd. [1965] Ch. 148	201

TABLE OF STATUTES

Aircraft and Shipbuildin	ng Industr	ies Act 1977	505
Bankruptcy Act 1914			
S.I	187-8	ss.42-3	190
S. I 4	188	s.44	190
s.15	189	s.45	190
s.16	185	s.54	190
s.19	189	s.154	192
S.20		s.155	192
s.33	189	s.158	192
s.38 175,	192, 194		
Bankruptcy Act 1924, s.	33		193
Bills of Sale Act 1854			173
Bills of Sale Act 1878		_	173, 177
Bills of Sale (Amendmen	nt) Act 18	82	173, 174, 177
Coal Industry Nationali	zation Ac	t 1946	502-3
Companies Act 1862			20, 22, 173
Companies Act 1929, s.	356		338
Companies Act 1948			
s.1 103, 110, 123,	149, 165	s.23	107, 108
S.2	104, 110		390, 397
S.5	107	s.28	122
s.8	104	s.31	166
S.10	108, 261	s.38	301
S.II	104	s.39	301
S.I2	208	s.40	303
ss.17-19	104, 105	S.4.I	303
S.20	105	s.43	312
		S.44	306
		s.45	300

xviii TABLE OF STATUTES

s.47	302	s.200		208
s.48	302		197, 212, 26	
	5	551400	-5/,,	389
ss.49-53	302	s.209	370.	371, 389
s.52	208	S.210	160, 228, 26	2-70, 400
s.54 129, 130, 370, 393-4,			,,	70, 400
s-55	301	S.212		165
s.56	129	s.222	157	195, 262
s.61	107	s.223	-31:	196
ss.66–8 108, 129, 169,		s.225		262
ss.69-71	169	s.236		198, 358
s.72 108,		s.270		198, 358
s.94	199	s.283		195, 358
	208	ss.284-91		195
s.109	116	ss.292-30	0	195, 198
	208	s.306		185
s.124	208	ss.311-5		195
s.130	116	s.319		198, 199
s.131 116,	324	s.320		199
s.132 116,	324	s.322		201
s.136	324	s.328		203, 204
s.140	324	s.332		166, 204
		s.334		198, 358
s.149	250	s.353		121, 198
s.150	1-2	s.434		102
s.153		S.44I		282
s.154 390,		s.448 2	243, 249, 252,	258, 315
ss.156–8	117			
	212	s.455		109, 300
s.160	138			
	38–9	Table A,	Part I:	
s.164 283,		art.76		323
s.165 283, 354,		art.80		117, 156
s.167	355	art.81	117,	321, 461
s.172	354	art.84		248
ss.176-7	117			
s.183	326	arts.89-	-92	326
s.184 106, 324,		art.95		326
s.187	192	arts.10		321, 461
s.190	241	art.116		130

TABLE OF STATUTES XIX

ss.191-3	242, 243	art.125	281
s.195	117	Table A, P	art II:
s.197	242	art.3	122, 154
s.199	242, 323	Table B	104
		Schedule 4	302
Companies Act	(Northern Ireland	d) 1960, s.201	268
Companies Act			
S.2	241	ss.25-6	208, 241, 242, 258,
			323, 347
ss.4-5	392	ss.27-9	117, 208, 242, 258,
			304, 347
ss.6-8	208, 323, 392		0 1.017
		s.30	241
		s.31	304
s.13	139, 212	s.32	354
		ss.33-4	304
S.14	138-9, 212	s.35	358
		s.37	284, 358
s.16	208, 323	s.40	283
		s.43	149
5.17	208, 392	s.50	358
s.18	208, 392	s.109	283, 355
s.19	208, 320	S.120	102
S.20	208, 320	Schedule 2	128, 382
Companies Act 1	976		
ss.4-6	152, 208	s.16	139
s.8	391	s.18	393
S.12	117, 208	ss.24-5	304
s.13	139	s.26	304
s.15	139, 212	s.27	304
Companies Claus	ses Consolidation	Act 1845	20
Companies (Win			194
Consumer Credit		X=-	180-1
Cotton Industry			497
County Courts A			185
Counter-Inflation			496
	010		13*

XX TABLE OF STATUTES

Deeds of Arrangement Act 1914		185
Development of Inventions Acts 1	948-54	497
Directors' Liability Act 1890		312
Employment Protection Act 1975		199, 445, 465
European Communities Act 1972,	, s.9	114, 148, 166
Fair Trading Act 1973		489
Finance Act 1960		219
Finance Act 1965		292
Finance Act 1971		292
Finance Act 1972		215, 217
Finance Act 1975		134, 292
Finance (No. 2) Act 1975		134
Finance Act 1976	9	215, 323, 506
Friendly Societies Act 1974		418
Friendly and Industrial and Provi	dent Societies Act 10	
,	,	1
Health and Safety Act 1974		476
Income and Corporation Taxes A	ct 1070	
s.233 170		219
	ss.485-8	393, 506
Industrial Common Ownership A	2 0	419
Industrial Expansion Act 1968		497
Industrial and Provident Societies	Act 1965	417
Industrial Relations Act 1971		.28, 464, 476
Industry Act 1972	•	498
Industry Act 1975	498	-501, 506-7
Insolvency Act 1976	96, 188, 189, 192, 1	
Insurance Companies Act 1974	5, 5, 5,	406
Joint Stock Companies Act 1844		19
Joint Stock Companies Act 1856		21
	1 (01	
Leeman's Act: Banking Companie	s' (Shares) Act 1867	343
Limited Partnership Act 1907		167, 224
Mercantile Law (Amendment) Ac	t 1865	98, 167
Misrepresentation Act 1967	. 1003	250, 312
Provonterent a ave a gol		-00,000

Monopolies and Res	trictive Pract	ices (Inquiry ar	
Act 1948	A		488
Monopolies and Mer	gers Act 196	5	489
Partnership Act 1890)		
S.I	98	ss.29-30	101
s.5	00, 148, 164	s.35	102, 157
ss.20-4	100, 101	s.40	154
ss.26-7	154		
Policy Holders Protection	ction Act		406
Prevention of Fraud	(Investments) Act 1958 306,	308, 338-40, 411
S.I	338	s.13	306, 308
S.2	338	S.14	339, 340
s.3	338	s.15	340
s.5	339	s.16	340
Protection of Deposit	ors Act 1963		405
S.2I			307, 308, 339
			0 770 7000
Registration of Busin	ess Names A	ct 1916	96-7, 100, 207
Resale Prices Act 19	76		493
Restrictive Trade Pra		976	491-2
		~.v#1	
Shipbuilding Industr			497
Stock Exchange (Cor	npletion of E	Bargains) Act 19	76 343
Theft Act 1968			
s.18	241	s.19	241, 306
Trade Union and La	bour Relatio	ns Act 1974	476
			_
City Code on Take-o	vers and Me	rgers 1976	
Introduction	366, 378	General Princ	iple 10 379
		General Princ	
General Principle 1	377	Rule 16	380
General Principle 3	378, 386	Rule 17	347
General Principle 4	367, 378,	Rule 21	384
	385	Rule 23	383
General Principle 6	379	Rule 27	383
General Principle 8	366, 379	Rule 30	348
General Principle 9	366, 379		379, 382, 384, 385
1 3	0 1010	5	313,3-33-753-3