

MARTIN TRYBUS • LUCA RUBINI

# THE TREATY OF LISBON AND THE FUTURE OF EUROPEAN LAW AND POLICY



## The Treaty of Lisbon and the Future of European Law and Policy

Edited by

#### Martin Trybus

Professor of European Law and Vouc and Director, Institute of European Law, University of Birmingham, UK

#### Luca Rubini

Senior Lecturer in European Law and Deputy Director, Institute of European Law, University of Birmingham, UK\_

#### **Edward Elgar**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

#### © The Editors and Contributors Severally 2012

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by Edward Elgar Publishing Limited The Lypiatts 15 Lansdown Road Cheltenham Glos GL50 2JA UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc. William Pratt House 9 Dewey Court Northampton Massachusetts 01060 USA

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012930586



ISBN 978 0 85793 255 6

Typeset by Columns Design XML Ltd, Reading Printed and bound by MPG Books Group, UK

#### **Contributors**

Erkki Aalto is Defence Counsellor and National Armaments Director Representative at the Permanent Representation of Finland to the European Union and at the Mission of Finland to NATO in Brussels. He deals with issues concerning the European Defence Agency, NATO's armaments policy and the EU's internal market aspects of defence. Before his current posting, Erkki Aalto worked in the Mission of Finland to NATO and in the Ministry of Defence in Finland. He is preparing a doctoral thesis on national security exemptions in EU law at the University of Turku, Finland. He holds degrees from the University of Turku (BA, MA) and from the University of Aberdeen (LLM). He has published articles on defence policy.

Anthony Arnull, BA, PhD, Solicitor, is Barber Professor of Jurisprudence at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham, United Kingdom. His research has focused mainly on the law of the European Union, in particular the role and jurisdiction of the European Court of Justice. He is the author of, among other things, *The European Union and its Court of Justice* (Oxford University Press, 2nd edn, 2006) and a co-editor of several collections of essays, the most recent of which is *A Constitutional Order of States? Essays in EU Law in Honour of Alan Dashwood* (Hart Publishing, 2011). Professor Arnull is Consultant Editor of the *European Law Review*, having been its co-editor from 1996 to 2007. From 1989 to 1992, he worked at the European Court of Justice in Luxembourg as a référendaire in the chambers of Advocate General F.G. Jacobs.

Marie-Laure Basilien-Gainche is Associate Professor (tenure) in public European Law, at the Institute of European Studies of the University Sorbonne Nouvelle Paris III, France. She graduated from Sciences Po Paris and holds a doctorate in public law. Her research deals with crisis situations when norms, especially human rights protection laws, can be suspended. Marie-Laure Basilien-Gainche works in constitutional law and European law fields, in order to propose evaluations of the legitimacy of political systems and decisions of the EU and its Member States. Her attention is currently focused on the EU immigration and asylum policy. She is a member of the Institut des Amériques, of the scientific committee of

TERRA (Travaux, Études, Recherches sur les Réfugiés et l'Asile), of Migreurop and of Trans Europe Experts. She also contributes to the lettre Actualités Droits Libertés of the Centre de recherche et d'études sur les droits fondamentaux CREDOF – University Paris 10, and to Serge Slama's blog Combats pour les droits de l'homme.

Martin Borowski studied law in Germany. After the First German State Examination in 1991 he was fellow of the *Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes* for graduate work leading to a doctorate (1993–1995). Dr Borowski was awarded his doctorate (Dr Iur.) in 1997, and passed the Second German State Examination in the same year. He was awarded his *habilitation* and the title of *Privatdozent* in 2004 (both at the University of Kiel, Germany), with the *venia legendi* for the disciplines 'Public Law, European Law, Legal Philosophy, and Legal Theory'. He conducted research on constitutional review at Washington University, School of Law, St Louis, Missouri, with a Feodor-Lynen research grant awarded by the Alexander-von-Humboldt-Foundation (Germany) from 2005 to 2006. Dr Borowski is currently Reader at Birmingham Law School, United Kingdom.

Francesco Costamagna, MA, PhD, is Research Fellow in European Union Law at the University of Turin, Italy. He has been post-doctoral fellow in International Law at the same university. His research works mainly focus on the relationship between, on one side, economic and social rights, and, on the other, international economic norms, as well as EU internal market rules. He is the author of a book (in Italian) on *Social and Health Services, Competition and Freedom to Provide Services in the EU Legal Order*. He has also published articles and other works on these issues. He holds a PhD in International Economic Law at the 'L. Bocconi' University of Milan (Italy). His PhD thesis was on 'International Protection of Public Infrastructure Investments and State Sovereignty'. He has been a visiting scholar at the Centre for Energy, Petroleum and Mineral Law and Policy (University of Dundee, Scotland).

Adam Cygan, LLB, LLM, PhD is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of Leicester, United Kingdom. He has written several monographs considering the participation of national parliaments in EU affairs as well as numerous journal articles and chapters in edited volumes. He has provided expert evidence to the EU Affairs Select Committee in the House of Lords on the role of national parliaments in the EU and participates in a training programme for parliamentarians and civil servants which promotes best practice in subsidiarity monitoring.

**Bleddyn Davies** studied law at the University of Liverpool, completing his PhD in the field of criminal justice and constitutional safeguards in 2010.

His research interests include European constitutional law, European criminal law, public law and public international law. Since July 2011, Bleddyn has been a Lecturer in Public and European Union Law at Liverpool John Moores University, United Kingdom.

Elaine Fahey, PhD, has been a Lecturer in Law at the School of Social Sciences and Law at the Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland since 2006. She is a Visiting Max Weber Fellow at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy (2010–2011) at the Global Governance Programme, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies. Her research interests are Global Governance Law and EU–US Relations, EU Institutional Law, Internal Market Law and the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice. She has written two monographs on EU Law in Ireland. She was previously a Max Weber Post-doctoral Fellow at the European University Institute (2009–2010). She is a former Judicial Research Assistant, Judges' Library, Four Courts, Dublin, a Judicial Extern at the Los Angeles Federal District Court, USA and a stagiaire at the Court of Justice of the European Union, Luxembourg. She has practised at the Irish Bar and is Chairperson of the Irish Society for European Law.

Flora Goudappel, PhD, is Associate Professor of European Union law at Erasmus School of Law, in Rotterdam, The Netherlands. Her specializations are EU citizenship, Justice and Home Affairs, as well as federalism. She has previously worked at both Erasmus School of Law and the University of Utrecht, as well as at the Ministry of Justice of the Netherlands. She has been a visiting professor in a.o. Baltimore, Bordeaux, Istanbul, Curação and Beijing.

Barbara Guastaferro is Emile Noel Fellow at the Jean Monnet Center of the New York University School of Law for the academic year 2011/2012. She holds a PhD in European and Public Law from the University of Padua, Italy. She is currently Adjunct Professor in History, Institutions and Politics of the EU at the University of Naples L'Orientale, and Teaching Assistant in Public Law at the University of Naples Federico II. In 2009 she was visiting fellow at the European Court of Justice and in 2004 she was intern at the legal office of the Permanent Representation of Italy to the EU in Brussels, where she followed the works of the Intergovernmental Conference adopting the Treaty establishing a Constitution for Europe. She is author of several publications in the field of European Politics and European Law.

Ester Herlin-Karnell is Assistant Professor in EU Law at the Free University of Amsterdam in the Netherlands. She holds a DPhil in Law from Oxford University as well as an LLM from King's College London and a

Contributors xi

Jur. Kand. (LLM) from Stockholm University, Sweden. She has previously worked as a legal secretary and judge's assistant in a Swedish District Court. Her research interests lie within EU (constitutional) law and European criminal law. She is currently completing a monograph on the constitutional dimension of European Criminal Law (forthcoming Hart, 2012).

Urfan Khaliq is a Reader at Cardiff Law School, Cardiff University. His research interests are in the fields of Public International Law, International Human Rights Law and EU Law and he has published widely in these fields.

Rafael Leal-Arcas is a Senior Research Fellow at the World Trade Institute and a Senior Lecturer in International Economic Law and European Union Law, Queen Mary University of London (Centre for Commercial Law Studies), United Kingdom. He is the author of more than 70 scholarly publications on international trade law, WTO law, international investment law, international environmental law, and EU law. Among his publications are the books, International Trade and Investment Law: Multilateral, Regional and Bilateral Governance (Edward Elgar, 2010) and Theory and Practice of EC External Trade Law and Policy (Cameron May, 2008).

Michael Mirschberger, Ass. Jur., is Research Fellow at the German Research Institute for Public Administration Speyer. Previously he has been Scientific Assistant at the German University of Administrative Sciences Speyer and Scientific Assistant at the Ludwig-Maximilian University in Munich. His main research interests are German and European Administrative Law as well as European and Comparative Constitutional Law. Michael Mirschberger is currently reading for a PhD at the German University of Administrative Sciences Speyer.

Julian Nowag, LLM European Legal Studies (Dunelm), MSt in Law (Oxon), Ref. iur., Dipl. iur., is a DPhil candidate from St Anne's College at the Law Faculty of the University of Oxford, United Kingdom. His main research areas are in EU Competition and Internal Market Law. He has published in the field of European Competition Law and other areas. Julian Nowag has worked on projects for the European Commission, the European Parliament and advised the Colombian Competition Authority.

Laura Puccio holds a Bachelors degree in International Economics and Management from Bocconi University in Milan, Italy and a Masters degree in International Affairs from the Institut d'Etudes Politiques of Paris (Sciences Po Paris), France. She is currently a PhD candidate in Law at the European University Institute in Florence. Her research interests are in International and European Economic Law.

Helena Raulus has been Lecturer in European Union Law at the Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, The Netherlands, since the beginning of 2008. She obtained her PhD, on 'Private International Law in the European Union: From Conventions to Regulations', in 2005 from the University of Aberdeen. After her PhD, Helena Raulus worked at the University of Helsinki as a post-doctoral researcher and project coordinator for Europeanized Criminal Justice programme. Her current research interests are in the European Union fundamental rights protection and the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice.

Lisa Rodgers is a Senior Lecturer at Birmingham City University, United Kingdom. Her main research interests are European and International Employment Law and Policy. She has written a range of articles on aspects of Employment Law and Policy, most recently in the *Industrial Law Journal*, and is currently completing a PhD in Employment Law at the University of Leicester.

Luca Rubini, Laurea in giurisprudenza, MA, PhD, is Senior Lecturer and Deputy-Director of the Institute of European Law at Birmingham Law School. His research currently focuses on the governance of public subsidies and on the various linkages between trade, energy and climate change. His publications include The Definition of Subsidy and State Aid -WTO Law and EC Law in Comparative Perspective (Oxford University Press, 2009), and he has recently edited Microsoft on Trial: Legal and Economic Analysis of a Transatlantic Antitrust Case (Edward Elgar, 2010) and Challenges of Development: Asian Perspectives (Vita e Pensiero, 2010; co-edited with Francesco Bestagno). He served as référendaire to Francis Jacobs, Advocate General at the European Court of Justice and has held visiting positions at King's College London, the Institute of International Economic Law (Georgetown University), the World Trade Institute (University of Berne) and Bocconi University Milan. He is fellow of the Centre of European Law, King's College London, and visiting professor at ASERI (Catholic University, Milan). He is admitted to the Bar in Italy and to the Law Society of England and Wales as solicitor (non-practising).

Catalin Stefan Rusu studied law at 'Babes-Bolyai' University, Cluj Napoca, Romania, at the International Faculty of Comparative Law, Strasbourg, France and at Utrecht University, The Netherlands. He obtained his PhD degree in 2009 after publishing his research findings in the field of European Merger Control. He carried out academic research and was engaged in teaching activities at the Molengraaff Institute for Private Law, Utrecht University, between 2005 and 2010. Currently, he is an Assistant Professor of European Law at Radboud University, Nijmegen, The Netherlands,

Contributors xiii

where he lectures on European Competition Law and EU Internal Market Law. His main area of research revolves around the economic concentration phenomenon in the Internal Market.

Melanie Smith, LLB, LLM, PhD, is a Lecturer at Cardiff Law School, Cardiff University in Wales, United Kingdom. Her main research interests are in EU Constitutional and Administrative Law, in particular the study of institutions as seen through the lens of legitimacy. She is the author of Centralised Enforcement, Legitimacy and Good Governance in the EU (Routledge, 2009) and has published a number of articles on the topic of enforcement of EU obligations.

Martin Trybus, LLM, PhD, Rechtsassessor, is Professor of European Law and Policy and Director of the Institute of European Law at Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham, United Kingdom. His research aims to make a contribution to the understanding and development of the Law of the European Union, especially its economic and constitutional aspects, to establish 'European Union Defence and Security Law' as a separate legal subject, and to contribute to the understanding and development of European Union Public Procurement Law. Martin Trybus is the author of European Union Law and Defence Integration (Hart, 2005) and the co-editor, with Nigel White, of European Security Law (Oxford University Press, 2007) and, with Roberto Caranta, of The Law of Green and Social Procurement in Europe (Djøf, 2010). He has been involved in major studies for the European Defence Agency and the European Commission on the European armaments market, and for the OECD on procurement regulation. He is currently a member of the Procurement Review Board of the European Space Agency in Paris.

Johan van de Gronden is Professor of European law at the Law Faculty of the Radboud University Nijmegen, The Netherlands. He received his PhD in 1998. His research interests concern European Internal Market Law, Competition Law, Services of General (Economic) Interest and the impact of EU law on health care. From 1998 until September 2007 he worked at the Europa Institute of the University Utrecht (in the last years as a senior lecturer). In 2007 he was appointed as a professor of European law in Nijmegen. He is also a member of the Committee of Consumer Affairs and of the Committee of International Social and Economic Affairs of the Dutch Social and Economic Council. Furthermore, he is a founding editor of the TMC Asser series Legal Issues of Services of General Interest.

Ton van den Brink is Associate Professor in European Union Law at the Europa Institute of Utrecht University in the Netherlands and is responsible for the daily management of the Europa Institute. He has coordinated

various national and EU-funded research and training projects. His research focuses on topics of European constitutional law and national dimensions of the European integration process. He is a member of the Ius Commune research school (senior researcher Constitutional Processes: Interaction between the National and the European Dimension). Ton is involved in several courses in the EU law Masters programme of Utrecht University as well as at Utrecht University College.

Bart van Vooren is Assistant Professor of EU Law and European Integration at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. He specialized in international law at NYU School of Law, and subsequently received his doctoral degree from the European University Institute which focused on EU External Relations Law. During his doctoral studies he served as board member and editor-in-chief of the European Journal of Legal Studies. He is currently associate fellow at the Leuven University Centre for Global Governance Studies (GGS), and faculty liaison with the Centre for the Law of EU External Relations (CLEER).

Wolfgang Weiß studied Law and Economics at the University of Bayreuth. He completed his Dr. juris (1995) and his second thesis in law (Habilitation) in 2000. He was Reader, later Professor in International Law at Oxford Brookes University, United Kingdom (2006) and later Professor of Public Law, European Law and Public International Law at University of Erlangen-Nuremberg, Germany (2006–2008). Since 2008 he has held a Chair in Public Law, European Law and Public International Law at the German University of Administrative Sciences in Speyer and became an Ordinary Member to the German Research Institute for Public Administration in Speyer. He is still affiliated with Oxford Brookes University as a part-time Professor in International Law.

### Preface: The European Union and the Rule of Law

#### Gisela Stuart

Wittgenstein thought that the 'aim of philosophy is to show the fly the way out of the fly-bottle'. The Lisbon Treaty and its precursor, the Constitutional Treaty, was to make the European Union more effective, accountable and transparent, as well as bringing it closer to the people. After years teaching EU law, attending Council of Ministers' meetings and having been one of the 13 people who drafted the Constitutional Treaty – I, just like Wittgenstein's fly – am still in need of help. Trying to understand the entirety and complexity of the workings, rules and institutions of what we call Europe makes getting out of the fly-bottle look like child's play. What's gone wrong?

For a start don't call it Europe. It is the European Union, or the Union for short. Europe is a geographic entity which stretches from Ireland in the west to the Urals in the east. It is a historic entity which certainly includes the capital city of the Eastern Roman Empire, known today as Istanbul. The Union on the other hand is a post-World War II construct of currently 27 nation states.

With the Lisbon Treaty the Union is said to have given up its ambition for wider and deeper integration and accepted that it is made up of sovereign Member States; it has no intentions of moving towards a federal structure. Lisbon has given greater powers to the European Parliament, transferred whole swathes of areas from unanimity to qualified majority, done away with the Pillar structure which protected competences, and created new institutions like the Diplomatic Service and a Foreign Representative. One is left to wonder just what else they could they have done had they intended to 'widen and deepen'.

The Union's individual components can claim democratic legitimacy, the Union itself cannot. The members of the European Parliament are elected in the Member States. They campaign on national party tickets. Once elected, their political groups in the European Parliament bear little resemblance to the national party they came from. Whether left or right, what

matters much more is whether their party is in government back home or not. Believe me, as a Labour minister in the Blair administration. I constantly had to face the British Labour MEPs voting against us. The Council of Ministers is composed of democratically elected ministers of the Member States, but they change so frequently that the collective memory of the institution remains with Brussels bureaucrats. Until the permanent representations in Brussels become answerable to national parliaments, the deals and trade-offs will forever remain secret and unaccountable. The Commissioners are appointed by democratic Member States, but once they take up office they vow their allegiance to the institution they serve. The European Court of Justice does much more than applying and interpreting the law. Part of its institutional remit is to 'further European integration'. Its interpretations and judicial developments cannot be corrected by further primary legislation as is the case in nation states. Democratic checks and balances are missing in the Union. No wonder that after Lisbon the Union is even more remote from the people than it was before.

Aristotle tells us in his *Metaphysics* that 'the whole is greater than the sum of its parts'. In the case of the Union it's something else. To some this is a great achievement; a supranational organisation which we have not seen before. To others it is a 21st-century form of an empire that becomes consumed by perpetuating self interest in the constant struggle for survival. It is probably a bit of both, but for me democracy is a space within which political discourse can take place, and at regular intervals those who govern can – at will – be removed by those who are governed. If the European Union wants to survive it has to anchor itself in the democratic institutions of the nation state, not try to replace them.

Gisela Stuart, Member of Parliament for Edgbaston Member of the former Convention on the Future of Europe

#### **Abbreviations**

CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy

CSDP Common Security and Defence Policy

C.M.L.R. Common Market Law Reports

CT Constitutional Treaty

EC European Communities

E.C.R. European Court Reports

ECJ European Court of Justice

EU European Union

OJ Official Journal of the European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

#### Table of legislation

Agreement between UK and	Article 17 190, 224
Ecuador for the Promotion	Article 19(1) 190
and Protection of Investments,	Article 19(2) 190
UK Treaty Series No. 18	Article 21 193
(1996), Cm. 3076 <b>280</b>	Article 24 193
Agreement between UK and	Article 34 193, 391, 392
Moldova for the Promotion	Article 35 391, 395
and Protection of Investments,	Article 36 9, 391, 392, 413, 414,
UK Treaty Series No. 8 (1999),	433, 434, 435
Cm. 4260 <b>280</b>	Article 41 109
Agreement between UK and	Article 47(2) 190, 224, 229
Philippines for the Promotion	Article 47(3) 190, 224
and Protection of Investments,	Article 48 190, 224
UK Treaty Series No. 7	Article 48(2) 229
(1981) <b>281</b>	Article 49 190, 224
Charter of Fundamental Rights of	Article 50 190
the European Union,	Article 51 181, 183, 186, 187,
the European Chion,	101,100,100,100,
OJ [2010] C 83/389	228, 351
-	
OJ [2010] C 83/389	228, 351
OJ [2010] C 83/389 Preamble <b>49, 110, 207, 208, 209,</b>	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218,
OJ [2010] C 83/389 Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232 Article 2 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220,
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228,
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221,
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227  Article 9 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221, 222
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227  Article 9 190  Article 10(1) 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221, 222 Article 52(5) 210, 211, 212, 218,
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227  Article 9 190  Article 10(1) 190  Article 11 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221, 222 Article 52(5) 210, 211, 212, 218, 393, 433
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227  Article 9 190  Article 10(1) 190  Article 11 190  Article 12(1) 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221, 222 Article 52(5) 210, 211, 212, 218, 393, 433 Article 52(7) 49, 209, 223, 224,
OJ [2010] C 83/389  Preamble 49, 110, 207, 208, 209, 210, 213, 214, 223, 224, 226, 232  Article 2 190  Article 3 217  Article 4 190  Article 5(1) 190  Article 5(2) 190  Article 6 190  Article 7 190, 224, 227  Article 9 190  Article 10(1) 190  Article 11 190	228, 351 Article 51(1) 42, 50, 212, 218, 220, 450 Article 52 6, 190, 207, 221, 222, 223, 224, 228, 235 Article 52(1) 228, 453 Article 52(2) 221, 222, 395, 427 Article 52(3) 214, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 231, 235 Article 52(4) 214, 217, 218, 221, 222 Article 52(5) 210, 211, 212, 218, 393, 433

Community Framework for State Aid in the Form of Public Service Compensation. OJ [2005] C297/4 417 Convention based on Article K3 of the Treaty on European Union on the establishment of a European Police Office. OJ[1995] C 316 326 Convention on simplified extradition procedure between the Member States of the European Union, OJ[1995] C 78 332 Convention relating to extradition between the Member States of the European Union, OJ[1996] C 313 332 Council Joint Action 2004/551/ CFSP, on the establishment of the European Defence Agency 314 Article 4(3) 314 Article 8(2) 314 Article 9(2) 314 Article 9(3) 314 Decision 2000/596/EC of the Council, establishing a European Refugee Fund Decision 2004/573/EC of the Council, on the organisation of joint flights for removals from the territory of two or more Member States, of third-country nationals who are subjects of individual removal orders 374 Decision 2004/752, establishing the European Union Civil Service

Tribunal OJ [2004] L333/7

Council, establishing the

Decision 2007/435/EC of the

European Fund for the Integration of third-country nationals for the period 2007 to 2013 as part of the General programme Solidarity and Management of Migration Flows 366 ision 2009/809/EU of the

Decision 2009/809/EU of the Council, Article 2 28

Decision 2009/879/EU of the European Council, Electing the President of the European Council, OJ L 315/48 247

Decision 2009/880/EU of the
European Council, taken with
the Agreement of the President
of the Commission of
1 December 2009 appointing
the High Representative of the
Union for Foreign Affairs and
Security, OJ L 315/49 247

Decision 2009/881/EU of the European Council, Article 1 28

Decision 2009/937/EU of the Council, Annex, Article 2(5) 28

Decision 2010/125, appointing the members of the panel provided for in Article 255 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
OJ [2010] L50/20 37

Decision 2010/306, appointing a judge to the Court of Justice, OJ [2010] L137/3 38

Decision 2010/320/EU of the Council, addressed to Greece with a view to reinforcing and deepening fiscal surveillance and giving notice to Greece to take measures for the deficit reduction judged necessary to remedy the situation of excessive deficit,
OJL 145/6 83

Decision 2010/405/EU of the Council, authorising enhanced cooperation in the area of the law applicable to divorce and legal separation,

OJ [2010] L 189/12 150

Decision 2010/411/EU of the
Council, on the signing on
behalf of the Union of the
Agreement between the
European Union and the
United States of America on
the processing and transfer of
Financial Messaging data from
the European Union to the
United States for the purposes
of the Terrorist Finance
Tracking program (SWIFT)
OJ [2010] L 195 1 143

Decision 2010/427/EU of the Council, Establishing the Organisation and Functioning of the European External

Action Service 256, 257, 302

Article 1(2) 258

Article 1(4) 258

Article 2 255

Article 3(1) 258

Article 5 258

Article 6 257

Article 9(2) **257** 

Article 9(4) 257, 259

Decision 573/2007/EC of the Commission, implementing Decision 573/2007/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the adoption of the strategic guidelines 2008 to 2013 367

Decision 573/2007/EC of the European Parliament and the Council, establishing the European Refugee Fund for the period 2008 to 2013 as part of the General programme 'Solidarity and Management of Migration flows' and repealing Council Directive 2004/904/EC 365

Decision 574/2007/EC of the
European Parliament and the
Council, establishing the
External Borders Fund for the
period 2007 to 2013 as part of
the General programme
'Solidarity and Management
of Migration Flows' 366

Decision 575/2007/EC of the
European Parliament and the
Council, establishing the
European Return Fund for the
period 2008 to 2013 as part of
the General programme
'Solidarity and Management
of Migration Flows' 366

Decision 69/494/EEC of the Council, on the progressive standardization of agreements concerning commercial relations between Member States and third countries and on the negotiation of Community agreements 268, 279

Decision ECB/2010/5 of the European Central Bank, establishing a securities markets programme, OJ [2010] L 124/8 82,86

- Decision N541/2004 and N542/ 2004 – C (2005) 1329 fin of the Commission, on the Introduction of a Risk Equalisation System in the Dutch Health Insurance 421
- Decision 2009/371/JHA of the Council establishing the European Police Office (Europol) OJ [2009] L 121/37 (Europol Decision) 326, 333, 336, 337
- Decision 2011/199/EU of the
  European Council, amending
  Article 136 of the Treaty on the
  Functioning of the European
  Union with regard to a stability
  mechanism for Member States
  whose currency is the Euro,
  OJ [2011] L 91/1 84
- Decision 8675/2/98 of the Council, European Union Code of Conduct on Arms Export, DG E-PESC IV 307
- Directive 2000/78/EC of the Council, establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation, OJ [2000] L303/ 16–22 191
- Directive 2001/40/EC of the Council, on the mutual recognition of decisions on the expulsion of third country nationals 373
- Directive 2003/9/EC of the Council, laying down minimum standards for the reception of asylum seekers 358
- Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, establishing a

- scheme for greenhouse gas emission allowance trading within the Community and amending Council Directive 96/61/ECOJL 275 **288**
- Directive 2003/110/EC of the Council, on assistance in cases of transit for the purposes of removal by air 374
- Directive 2004/38/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, OJ [2004] L158/77 423
- Directive 2004/83/EC of the Council, on minimum standards for the qualification and status of third country nationals or stateless persons as refugees or as persons who otherwise need international protection and the content of the protection granted 370
- Directive 2005/85/EC of the Council, on minimum standards on procedures in Member States for granting and withdrawing refugee status 371
- Directive 2006/123/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, on services in the internal market, OJ [2006] L376/36 417
- OJ [2006] L376/36 417 Directive 2008/104/EC, Agency
- Workers Directive, OJ [2008] L327/9 442
- Directive 2008/115/EC of the European Parliament and of