

The background of the book cover is a composite image. On the left, a prehistoric man with long dark hair and a beard, wearing a fur cloak, is shown from the side, holding a spear. He is looking towards the right. The right side of the image is a deep space scene with a dark blue and black background, filled with numerous stars and a prominent, bright, glowing nebula or galaxy structure. The author's name is printed in the top right corner.

Michael Woolfson

The Formation of The Solar System

Theories Old and New

Imperial College Press



The Formation of The Solar System

Theories Old and New

Michael Woolfson
University of York, UK



Imperial College Press

Published by

Imperial College Press
57 Shelton Street
Covent Garden
London WC2H 9HE

Distributed by

World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd.

5 Toh Tuck Link, Singapore 596224

USA office: 27 Warren Street, Suite 401-402, Hackensack, NJ 07601

UK office: 57 Shelton Street, Covent Garden, London WC2H 9HE

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

First published 2007

Reprinted 2008

THE FORMATION OF THE SOLAR SYSTEM

Theories Old and New

Copyright © 2007 by Imperial College Press

All rights reserved. This book, or parts thereof, may not be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system now known or to be invented, without written permission from the Publisher.

For photocopying of material in this volume, please pay a copying fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. In this case permission to photocopy is not required from the publisher.

ISBN-13 978-1-86094-824-4

ISBN-10 1-86094-824-3

The Formation of
The Solar System
Theories Old and New

Introduction

Most scientists think that the work they do is very important. Well, they would wouldn't they? It is a human trait, an aspect of vanity, to consider that what one does is more significant than it really is. You might think that scientists would be objective and self-critical and, to be fair, many of them are, but mostly they are prone to all the weaknesses of humanity at large. Nevertheless, if you were to ask a group of scientists which they thought was the most important, the most fundamental, of all scientific problems, the majority would probably reply that it is to understand the origin of the Universe. But, I hear you say, surely that it is a solved problem and in one sense it is. The big-bang theory starts with an event that occurs at an instant when there is no matter, no space and no time. A colossal release of energy at that 'beginning of everything' spreads out creating matter, space and time. There is some supporting evidence for this model. When we look at distant galaxies we find that they are receding from us at a speed proportional to their distance. If all motions were reversed then in 15 billion (thousand million) years they would all converge at the point where the big bang began — which can be regarded as anywhere since everywhere diverged from the same point at the beginning of time. Before 15 billion years ago there was no time — nothing existed of any kind.

I hope that you understand all that because I certainly do not. It is not that I do not *believe* in the big-bang theory — it is just that I do not really *understand* it. The mathematical model of the big-bang is plain enough and many physicists and astronomers, including myself, can deal with that but I doubt that there are many people

on this Earth that really *understand* it. My own test of whether or not I understand something is whether or not I can explain it to others. Sometimes in my teaching career, when I have been preparing a new course, I have suddenly realised that I could not provide a clear explanation for something — the reason being that the topic I *assumed* I understood I did not really understand at all. Fortunately, in the teaching context, by reading and a bit of thought I have been able to deal with my own shortcomings. Nevertheless, I can promise you that I shall not be writing a book on the origin of the Universe.

So, if we now exclude the origin of the Universe and take it as an observational fact that we have matter, space and time, what would most scientists think of as the next most important problem? That surely must be to explain the origin of life. By what process can inanimate matter be transformed even into the most primitive life forms? Is it actually a spontaneous process? We are straying close to religious issues here so I shall go no further in that direction. But, once life exists, even in a primitive form, we do have a theory that *can* readily be understood, Darwin's theory of evolution, which leads us to the higher forms of life, including ourselves. Random genetic mutations occasionally create an individual that has advantages over others in its environment. The principle of 'survival of the fittest' ensures that its newly modified genes flourish and eventually become dominant and by small changes over long periods of time a new species can evolve. There is also some evidence for the occasional rather more rapid creation of new species. Something that Darwin's ideas do not deal with directly is the existence of consciousness, the knowledge of one's own identity and relationship to the outside world. That too is one of the difficult problems of science, although there are those who attempt to explain it in terms of computer technology by asserting that human beings resemble rather complex computers.

The topic of this book is not as important as those mentioned above and in many ways it is much more mundane. The Solar System is a collection of objects — the Sun, planets, satellites etc. — made of ordinary matter — iron, silicates, ices and gases, the properties of which we well understand. The Universe is full of such material so all we have to do is to find a way of transforming it from one state to

another. Having said that, although it is not an important problem in a fundamental sense, it is nevertheless quite an interesting one because it turns out to be very difficult. For more than two hundred years scientists have been struggling to find ways of just producing the Sun, planets and satellites, let alone all the other bodies of the Solar System. Part of the problem has been that scientists have tended to concentrate on parts of the system rather than looking at it as a whole. It is as though one was trying to understand the structure and workings of a car by studying just the wheels, the transmission system or the seats. It is only by looking at the whole car that one can understand the relationships of one part to another, how it works and how it was made. The same is true for the Solar System. It is not a collection of disconnected objects bearing little relationship to one another. It is a *system* and it will only be understood by examining it as a system.

The story that I tell goes back a long way — perhaps almost to the beginning of sentient mankind. Starting from the observations that a few points of light wandered around against the background of the stars, a picture emerged of a collection of bodies, connected to the Earth, Moon and Sun, that formed a separate family. Gradually the picture improved until, about three hundred years ago, we not only knew how all the bodies moved relative to each other but also understood the nature of the forces that made them move as they do.

Large telescopes, operating over a range of wavelengths from X-rays to radio waves, together with spacecraft, have given us detailed knowledge of virtually all the members of the solar-system family even to the extent of knowing something about the materials of which they consist. In addition, from Earth-bound observations we have even been able to detect planets around other stars — many of them — so we know that the Solar System is not a unique example of its kind. New knowledge has provided guidance for theoreticians attempting to explain the origin of the Solar System — but it also gives new constraints that their theories need to satisfy.

I began my study in this area, generally known as cosmogony, in 1962, intrigued by the fact that, while there had been many theories put forward, not one had survived close scientific scrutiny. While

some of them were superficially attractive they all failed because they contravened some important scientific principle; it is a basic requirement of any theory that *every* aspect of it must be consistent with the science that we know. If a theory explains many things in the Solar System but is in conflict with scientific principles then it is wrong. You can no more have a nearly plausible theory than you can have a nearly pregnant woman. Armed with the knowledge that, since the Solar System exists, there must be some viable theory for its origin I started on what turned out to be a long hard road. There were many dead ends and new beginnings. Ideas arose, seemed promising, failed critical tests and then were abandoned. However, one early basic idea that was the core of what came to be called the Capture Theory survived and evolved. What it evolved into is very different from the starting form but the essential idea is still there. Gradually a picture emerged that seemed to make sense — a good sign — and instead of problems piling up as had been the original experience, it was solutions to problems that seemed to proliferate.

I have already confessed to my lack of deep understanding of the big-bang theory but I *do* understand the nature of planets and related bodies and hence I am prepared to write about the formation of the Solar System. However, in writing a book an author has to consider first the readership for whom it is intended and that was a problem with which I wrestled for some time. A complete deep scientific treatment of all aspects of the various theories would be unintelligible to most non-specialist readers and would just be a reproduction of what is already available in the scientific literature. An alternative approach, in which only verbal descriptions were given throughout, would be more readable but would lack credibility — many theories sound plausible enough when described in hand-waving fashion but wilt under close scientific scrutiny. So, to maximize the readership while maintaining scientific integrity, I have decided on a middle course. Fortunately the level of science needed to deal with most aspects of cosmogony can be understood by anyone with a fairly basic scientific background. The approach that has been adopted is to introduce equations here and there to provide scientific substance together with narrative to explain what they mean. In addition, for

those who wish to delve more deeply into the subject, reference will be given to a small selection of books and papers in scientific journals — but I stress, these are *not* essential reading! Hopefully, this text alone will provide an account in a form that should both be understood by the non-expert reader and also be of interest to those with wider knowledge of astronomy or general science.

Prologue: The Dreamer

Gng lay on his back with his head cushioned on a bale of ferns. He was well away from the fire, on the windward side, so that the sky he saw was clear of the sparks that flew high into the air. His stomach was distended with aurochs meat, the product of the successful hunt that he and the other men of the tribe had carried out that day. The women too had done well, with a rich harvest of berries and roots that accompanied the meat in their gargantuan meal. These were the good days. He shivered with apprehension as he thought of the bad days that would soon come. Even with his bearskin cloak and leg covering he would feel the bitter cold. There would be many days when cold and hunger filled his mind to the exclusion of all else. These were times when the wild beasts were as desperate as the members of the tribe and last year two of the children had been taken.

He studied the pattern of lights in the sky that he had come to know so well. His imagination created pictures like those seen in a fire, but the pictures in the sky never changed. There is the snake, there the bear, the waterfall seemed particularly brilliant tonight and the hunter's spear is as clear as ever. Actually there were some occasional changes. Many moons ago he had seen a bright light suddenly appear in the sky. The Moon had been eaten by the night so he could see that this light could make shadows. The brightness had lasted for two moons or so, gradually fading until it could no more be seen. Perhaps there was a great forest in the sky and a fire had raged in it and gradually died away. Such things were part of his experience. There were other changes that were less exciting but that were always

happening. As each night passed so the sky lights twisted round, like a leaf on the end of a filament of a spider's web but always in one direction. They all twisted together so the patterns did not change. But, over the course of time, he had seen three lights that slowly moved amongst the others. What were the lights that kept their rigid patterns and what were those that travelled amongst them? Were those travellers like the old rogue males expelled from the herd by a new young dominant bull? No, that did not seem to fit.

He never spoke to the others about what he saw and what he thought. They knew that he was a little different — the name they had given him meant 'dream' or 'dreamer'. But he was a brave hunter and a respected member of the tribe so the difference was tolerated. Once, in a moment of rare tenderness, he had tried to explain to Nid, his woman, about what he saw in the sky. He could not find the words to express his thoughts and she comprehended nothing. She roughly pulled away from him, looked at him with a puzzled and troubled expression and then returned to suckling their latest infant. That was instinct — that she understood.

Gng did not know that he was a very important man. He had observed the night sky and tried to make sense of what he saw in terms of what he knew. He was the first astronomer.

Contents

| | |
|------------------------------|------------|
| Introduction | xv |
| Prologue: The Dreamer | xxi |

General Background

| | |
|--|----------|
| Chapter 1. Theories Come and Theories Go | 3 |
| 1.1 What is Science? | 3 |
| 1.2 The Problem of Cosmogony | 5 |
| 1.3 New Theories for Old | 7 |
| Chapter 2. Measuring Atoms and the Universe | 9 |
| 2.1 Measuring Things in Everyday Life | 9 |
| 2.2 Science and Everyday Life | 11 |
| 2.3 Small Things Beyond Our Ken | 11 |
| 2.4 Measuring Things in the Solar System | 13 |
| 2.5 Large Things Beyond Our Ken | 15 |

Enlightenment

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter 3. Greek Offerings | 19 |
| 3.1 Even Before the Ancient Greeks | 19 |
| 3.2 Plato and Aristotle | 20 |
| 3.3 Aristarchus — A Man Ahead of his Time | 21 |

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 3.4 | Eratosthenes — The Man who Measured the Earth | 22 |
| 3.5 | Ptolemy and the Geocentric Solar System | 24 |

Chapter 4. The Shoulders of Giants **27**

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 4.1 | The Refugees | 27 |
| 4.2 | Nicolaus Copernicus and a Heliocentric Solar System | 28 |
| 4.3 | Tycho Brahe — the Man with a Golden Nose | 30 |
| 4.4 | Johannes Kepler — A Mathematical Genius | 32 |
| 4.5 | Galileo Galilei — Observation versus Faith | 34 |
| 4.6 | Isaac Newton — and All was Light | 37 |

The Solar System: Features and Problems

Chapter 5. A Voyage of Discovery to the Solar System **43**

| | | |
|-----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 5.1 | Travelling Towards the Solar System | 43 |
| 5.2 | Approaching the Solar System | 43 |
| 5.3 | Most of the Planets have Satellites | 47 |
| 5.4 | Other Small Bodies | 50 |

Chapter 6. The Problem to be Solved **53**

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 6.1 | Knowledge and Time | 53 |
| 6.2 | Very Basic Requirements for a Solution | 54 |

Chapter 7. The French Connection **57**

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 7.1 | Some Early Theoretical and Observational Developments | 57 |
| 7.2 | Laplace and his Spinning Cloud | 59 |
| 7.3 | The Problem with a Spinning Cloud | 61 |

Chapter 8. American Catherine-Wheels **63**

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 8.1 | Spirals in the Sky | 63 |
| 8.2 | Making a Catherine Wheel | 64 |
| 8.3 | Objections to the Chamberlin–Moulton Theory | 66 |

| | |
|--|---------------|
| Chapter 9. British Big Tides | 68 |
| 9.1 The Jeans Tidal Theory | 68 |
| 9.2 Jeffreys' Objections | 71 |
| 9.3 Russell's Objection | 73 |
| 9.4 Spitzer's Objection | 74 |
| 9.5 A Modern Objection | 75 |
| Chapter 10. Russian Cloud Capture — With British Help | 76 |
| 10.1 The Schmidt Model | 76 |
| 10.2 Lyttleton's Modification of the Accretion Theory | 77 |
| Chapter 11. German Vortices — With a Little French Help | 79 |
| 11.1 First Ideas about Vortices | 79 |
| 11.2 The von Weizsäcker Vortex Theory | 80 |
| 11.3 Objections to the Vortex Idea | 80 |
| Chapter 12. McCrea's Floccules | 82 |
| 12.1 Producing Stars and Planets Together | 82 |
| 12.2 Objections to the Floccule Theory | 85 |
| Chapter 13. What Earlier Theories Indicate | 87 |
| 13.1 Angular Momentum Difficulties | 87 |
| 13.2 Planet Formation | 88 |
| 13.3 Indications of Requirements for a Successful Theory | 89 |
| New Knowledge | |
| Chapter 14. Disks Around New Stars | 93 |
| 14.1 How Hot and How Luminous? | 93 |
| 14.2 What is a <i>New</i> Star? | 96 |
| 14.3 Detecting Disks | 97 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter 15. Planets Around Other Stars | 99 |
| 15.1 Stars in Orbit | 99 |
| 15.2 Finding the Speed of a Star | 100 |
| 15.3 Finding Out About the Planet | 103 |
| 15.4 Characteristics of Exoplanets | 106 |
| Chapter 16. Disks Around Older Stars | 108 |
| 16.1 The Sun has a Disk | 108 |
| 16.2 Disks Around Other Older Stars | 110 |
| Chapter 17. What a Theory Should Explain Now | 113 |
| 17.1 The Beginning of the 21 st Century | 113 |
| 17.2 The Sun and its Properties | 114 |
| 17.3 Planet Formation | 115 |
| 17.4 Satellite Formation | 115 |
| 17.5 Asteroids and Comets | 116 |
| 17.6 Concluding Remarks | 116 |
| The Return of the Nebula | |
| Chapter 18. The New Solar Nebula Theory: The Angular Momentum Problem | 119 |
| 18.1 A Message from Meteorites | 119 |
| 18.2 Mechanical Slowing Down of the Sun's Spin | 121 |
| 18.3 Magnetism Gives a Helping Hand | 122 |
| 18.4 A Modification of the Hoyle Mechanism | 125 |
| 18.5 Slowing the Sun's Spin | 126 |
| Chapter 19. Making Planets Top-Down | 129 |
| 19.1 A Massive Disk | 129 |
| 19.2 Some Problems of Top-Down Processes | 130 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Chapter 20. A Bottom-Up Alternative | 132 |
| 20.1 A Summary of the Bottom-Up Approach | 132 |
| 20.2 Forming a Dusty Carpet | 133 |
| 20.3 The Formation of Planetesimals | 135 |
| 20.4 Making Terrestrial Planets and Cores for Giant Planets | 136 |
| 20.5 Major Planets — The Final Stage | 139 |
| Chapter 21. Making Planets Faster | 141 |
| 21.1 Conditions in the Disk | 141 |
| 21.2 Runaway Growth | 144 |
| Chapter 22. Wandering Planets | 146 |
| 22.1 The Need for Planets to Wander | 146 |
| 22.2 Interactions Between Planets | 147 |
| 22.3 Effects Due to the Mass of the Nebula Disk | 148 |
| 22.4 The Role of Spiral Waves | 150 |
| 22.5 Saving the Planet | 151 |
| 22.6 A Problem with Type-I Migration | 152 |
| Chapter 23. Back to Top-Down | 154 |
| 23.1 Perceived Problems with the SNT | 154 |
| Making Stars | |
| Chapter 24. This is the Stuff that Stars are Made of | 159 |
| 24.1 The Question | 159 |
| 24.2 The Galaxy | 160 |
| 24.3 The Ingredients | 162 |

| | |
|---|----------------|
| Chapter 25. Making Dense Cool Clouds | 164 |
| 25.1 The ISM, Clouds and Temperature | 164 |
| 25.2 Atoms, Ions, Molecules and Electrons | 165 |
| 25.3 Further Cooling Processes | 166 |
| 25.4 Making a Dense Cool Cloud | 168 |
| Chapter 26. A Star is Born | 170 |
| 26.1 Collapse of Stout Party | 170 |
| 26.2 Turbulent Times | 172 |
| 26.3 The Big Squeeze | 173 |
| 26.4 Some Observations about Star Formation | 174 |
| 26.5 A Star-Forming Model | 175 |
| Capture | |
| Chapter 27. Close to the Maddening Crowd | 181 |
| 27.1 Neighbours | 181 |
| 27.2 Another Big Squeeze | 182 |
| Chapter 28. Close Encounters of the Stellar Kind | 185 |
| 28.1 Jeans Revisited — The Capture Theory | 185 |
| 28.2 New Knowledge — New Ideas | 187 |
| 28.3 A Method for Realistic Simulations | 188 |
| 28.4 Capture-Theory Simulations | 189 |
| 28.5 Doing Without Protostars | 192 |
| Chapter 29. Ever Decreasing Circles | 195 |
| 29.1 The Starting Orbits of Planets | 195 |
| 29.2 A Resisting Medium | 195 |
| 29.3 Resistance Due to Viscous Drag | 197 |
| 29.4 Resistance Due to the Effects of Mass | 198 |
| 29.5 The Evolution of Planetary Orbits | 199 |
| 29.6 Slowing Down and Speeding Up | 202 |