ACADEMIC PRESS SERIES IN COGNITION AND PERCEPTION

Signal Detection Theory and ROC Analysis

James P. Egan
Washington State University



COPYRIGHT © 1975, BY ACADEMIC PRESS, INC.
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.
NO PART OF THIS PUBLICATION MAY BE REPRODUCED OR
TRANSMITTED IN ANY FORM OR BY ANY MEANS, ELECTRONIC
OR MECHANICAL, INCLUDING PHOTOCOPY, RECORDING, OR ANY
INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEM, WITHOUT
PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE PUBLISHER.

ACADEMIC PRESS, INC. 111 Fifth Avenue, New York, New York 10003

United Kingdom Edition published by ACADEMIC PRESS, INC. (LONDON) LTD. 24/28 Oval Road, London NW1

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Egan, James P

Signal detection theory and ROC analysis.

(Academic Press in series in cognition and perception)

Includes bibliographies and index.

Signal detection (Psychology) 2. Decisionmaking. Title. I. [DNLM: 1. Psychometrics. Psychophysics. 3. Sensation. BF237 E28s1 BF237.E33 152.8'2'0182 74-30817 ISBN 0-12-232850-7

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Signal Detection Theory and ROC Analysis

ACADEMIC PRESS SERIES IN COGNITION AND PERCEPTION

SERIES EDITORS:
Edward C. Carterette
Morton P. Friedman
Department of Psychology
University of California, Los Angeles
Los Angeles, California

Stephen K. Reed: Psychological Processes in Pattern Recognition

Earl B. Hunt: Artificial Intelligence

James P. Egan: Signal Detection Theory and ROC Analysis

IN PREPARATION

Myron L. Braunstein: Depth Perception Through Motion

To Wilson P. Tanner, Jr.

Preface

This book is intended primarily for the graduate student in experimental psychology who wants to learn about signal detection theory. The student should be aware that signal detection theory has been applied to many diverse fields within experimental psychology. The present treatment does not discuss these applications, nor does it present the results of experiments. My intent is to provide a background with which the student can more profitably read the ever increasing literature on signal detection theory.

The book, Signal Detection Theory and Psychophysics by D. M. Green and J. A. Swets (1966, 1974) is a milestone in the history of psychophysics, but many students find some of the important parts rather difficult. I have tried to present the basic material which will help the student of psychology to understand those parts. In addition, I have attempted to cover certain functions and processes, such as the Poisson random process, that are not treated in their book.

The level of mathematical difficulty of this book is intended to be that for a student with one semester of integral calculus and one year of "psychological statistics." However, even after taking a course on integral calculus many students of experimental psychology do not appreciate the importance of such matters as the orthogonal properties of certain trigonometric functions, the transformation of probability density functions, and

other concepts and techniques which are useful, sometimes even necessary, for the understanding of signal detection theory and psychophysics. Although I include little that is new in this treatment, I believe that I have selected certain portions of knowledge in such a fashion as to be particularly useful in the study of signal detection theory. The student has much else to learn and needs all the help available.

This book deals with the decision theory of categorization, including ROC analysis. The properties of ROCs, which are based upon many of the important probability laws used in psychology, are given special emphasis in this part. A succeeding book, Signal Detection Theory and Ideal Observers, begins with a discussion of the concept of ideal observers. Then, the minimum essentials of signal analysis are presented. Next, the properties of ensembles of randomly determined waveforms are discussed. (The concept of an ensemble is fundamental in the application of signal detection theory to psychoacoustics, because the best measures of detection, discrimination, and recognition are based upon a series of discrete observation intervals.) Finally, in the second book, a simplified model of Gaussian noise is developed, and this model is used in an analysis of how well an ideal observer can detect, or recognize, signals that are added to this noise.

With time, the treatments of signal detection theory have improved by an emphasis upon the distinction between the relative roles of decision theory and the statistical theory of noise. The present book was written for the purpose of teaching, and therefore I have used various examples, derivations, etc., that were developed by others; I have rewritten this material for the experimental psychologist whenever I felt that such material would be helpful. Acknowledgment of indebtedness to other works is usually given in the text. The bibliography at the end of each chapter lists these works along with others that were helpful to me. These references may help the student as well.

Worked examples were selected in order to illustrate various points, and some of these examples purposely leave out a few steps so that the student may consider them as exercises with each answer provided. There are several appendices, and it is hoped that these additions will be useful to the instructor as well as to the student.

A serious attempt was made to use frequent section numbers in such a way that it would be easy for an instructor to assign certain topics and to omit others. The following sections are marked with an asterisk: 3.6.4, 3.11, 3.11.1, 3.18, 3.18.1, 3.18.2, 4.8, 4.8.1, 4.8.2, 4.8.3, 5.6.4, 5.6.5, 6.2.3, 6.2.6, 7.5.2, 7.5.3, 7.5.4, 7.11, 7.17.3, and 7.17.8. These sections may be omitted without loss of the general theme.

All figures and tables were prepared anew, but, of course, some of them

Preface xvii

have appeared in similar form in other treatments of signal detection theory. However, to the best of my knowledge, the chi-square ROCs in Chapter 5, the ROCs based upon geometric distributions in Chapter 6, and certain functions that stem from the Poisson random process in Chapter 7, are novel to the literature on ROC analysis.

Acknowledgments

There are many who have assisted me in the preparation of this book. First of all, as a general matter, the author is happy to acknowledge the help that he has received from his students, the ones with whom he worked at the blackboard by the hour in order to learn of these matters for himself as well as to teach them whatever he could. Then, there are those who read early versions of this section, or that, and they encouraged me to continue the effort. Dr. Frank R. Clarke, Dr. Kent Gummerman, Dr. Dennis McFadden, and Mr. E. G. Pasanen read portions of the manuscript. Also, Mr. William Rankin prevented me from making many errors in the use of the English language. As a student, he showed me many sentences and paragraphs that were too obscure for publication. I thank all these people.

I must express my appreciation to Dr. T. G. Birdsall. During my frequent visits from Bloomington to Ann Arbor from 1956 to 1966, Dr. Birdsall patiently explained to me some of the intricacies of ROC analysis, and he also supported the view that a much idealized model of Gaussian noise is helpful to the beginning student in the understanding of the detection process.

My greatest debt belongs to Dr. David S. Emmerich and to Dr. Neal Viemeister. I have been very fortunate to have these two scholars as my severest critics. Over a period of many years, they have taught me a very great deal. As critics of this book, each of them independently read the complete manuscript with great care, and they pointed out not only my

misuse of commas, but my misuse of certain concepts in mathematics. More than that, both made constructive suggestions which have enriched my treatment of ROC analysis. I am grateful to both of them.

I am pleased that my book was accepted for publication in the series: Academic Press Series in Cognition and Perception, edited by Drs. E. C. Carterette and M. Friedman. Professor Carterette's encouragement and constructive suggestions have been very helpful to me.

Professor Wilson P. Tanner, Jr., was the primary force in the introduction of signal detection theory to psychophysics. It is a pleasure to dedicate this little book to Spike Tanner.

Finally, my thanks to my wife Katherine. She has constantly encouraged me, and she has tolerated me in my difficult ways. Above all, she has left me alone when I wanted to work.

There would be many more errors in this book than there are if I had not had the help of all the individuals mentioned above. Of course, I am responsible for all errors that remain, whether they be in my use of arithmetic, grammar, or logic.

Signal Detection Theory and ROC Analysis

Contents

Pre	eface		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	xv
Ac	knov	vledgi	nents	xix
nt	rodu	ction		1
1	De	cisior	Theory of Categorization	6
	1.1	The F	Fundamental Detection Problem	6
	1.2	Some	Descriptive Terms and Their Probabilities	7
			The Four Event-Response Conjunctions	7
			Prior Probabilities	7
		1.2.3	Hit Rate and False-Alarm Rate	8
		1.2.4	The Event-Response Probabilities	8
	1.3		t-Evidence Probabilities, Likelihood Ratio, and Posterior Proba-	
		bilitie		10
		1.3.1	Event-Evidence Probabilities	10
		1.3.2	Likelihood Ratio	11
		1.3.3	Posterior Probabilities	12
		1.3.4	The Logarithm of Likelihood Ratio	13
		1.3.5	Examples	14
	1.4	Decis	ion Theory of Categorization	15
			Decision Goal: Maximize Expected Value	16

viii Contents

		1.4.2 Examples	19
		1.4.3 Decision Variable, Equivalent Decision Rule, and Proper Decision	
		Axis	19
		1.4.4 Hit Rate and False-Alarm Rate of Expected-Value Observer	20
		1.4.5 Examples	20
		1.4.6 Decision Goal: Maximize Percentage Correct	20
		1.4.7 Example	23
		1.4.8 Decision Goal: Maximize the Hit Rate for a Fixed False-Alarm Rate	23
		1.4.9 Likelihood-Ratio Observer	24
		1.4.10 The Minimax Observer	24
	1.5	Detectability, Degree of Overlap, and the Criterion	25
	1.6	Multidimensional Observations	26
		Comment	26
	1.8	Summary of Some Terms and Concepts	27
	Bibl	iography	28
2	Red	eiver Operating Characteristics	29
	2.1	Summary of Chapter 1	29
	2.2	Receiver Operating Characteristics	30
	2.3	Hit Rate and False-Alarm Rate: Discrete Distributions	32
		2.3.1 Comment	32
	2.4	Hit Rate and False-Alarm Rate: Continuous Distributions	33
	2.5	Likelihood Ratio and Slope of ROC	33
		2.5.1 Likelihood Ratio and Discrete Distributions	34
		2.5.2 Likelihood Ratio and Continuous Distributions	34
		2.5.3 Comment	36
		2.5.4 Max-P(C) Observer Reconsidered	36
	2.6	Proper and Improper ROCs	37
		2.6.1 Example: Discrete Distributions	38
		2.6.2 Example: Continuous Distributions	40
		2.6.3 Bounds of Proper ROCs Based upon one Point	40
	2.7	Ordered Families of ROCs	41
		2.7.1 Monotone Likelihood-Ratio Family of ROCs	42
		2.7.2 Unordered Family of ROCs	43
	2.8	Isocriterion Contours	43
		2.8.1 Max-P(C) Observer	44
		2.8.2 Neyman-Pearson Observer	44
	2.9	Two-Interval, Forced Choice and Area under ROC	44
		2.9.1 Probability of a Correct Decision	46
		2.9.2 $P(C)_{21}$ and A	46
	2.10	Transformation of the Decision Axis	48
	2.11	Psychometric Functions	48
		2.11.1 Psychometric Functions Based Directly upon Performance	49
		2.11.2 Psychometric Functions and Area under ROC	50
		2.11.3 Psychometric Functions Based upon a Probability Law	51
		Summary of Salient Features of ROCs	51
	2.13	Summary of Method for Calculation of Cutoff on the Decision Axis	52
	Bibl	iography	53

Contents

3

No	ormal-Normal ROCs	57
3.1	Introduction	57
	3.1.1 General Importance of the Gaussian Probability Distribution	57
	3.1.2 Gaussian Distributions in SDT	58
3.2		59
3.3		60
3.4		61
	3.4.1 Examples: Calculation of d' and β Corresponding to a Point in	01
	ROC-space	61
	3.4.2 Example: Effect of Criterion on $P(Y \mid sn)$ and $P(C)$	62
	3.4.3 Example: Calculations Based upon the Cutoff	62 63
3.5	3.4.4 Table of Values for d' of One	
3.6	,	63
3.0	Linear Transformation of the Decision Axis, Likelihood Ratio, and the Cutoff	64
	3.6.1 Example	65
	3.6.2 Example: Calculation of β from Equation (3.18)	66
	3.6.3 Example: Calculations Based upon a Payoff Matrix	66
	*3.6.4 Example: Likelihood-Ratio Cutoff Greater than One	67
3.7		68
3.8		69
3.9		69
	0 Relation between Log $L(y)$ and y	69
	1 Log $L(y)$ Transformation of the Decision Axis	70
0.1	*3.11.1 Distribution of Ln $L(y)$	71
	3.11.2 Consequence of N-N Distributions of Ln $L(y)$	73
3.15	2 Performance with a Variable Cutoff	74
	3 Isocriterion Contours	75
0,12	3.13.1 Example: The Max-P(C) Observer	75
	3.13.2 Example: The Neyman-Pearson Observer	76
	3.13.3 Comment	76
3.14	4 Derivatives of the Single-Interval Paradigm	76
	3.14.1 Two-Interval, Forced-Choice Task	76
	3.14.2 Multiple-Observation Task	77
	3.14.3 Comment	78
3.13	5 Transformation of N-N Distributions	78
	3.15.1 Linear Transformation of X to Y	79
	3.15.2 Sum of Normally Distributed Variables	79
3.16	6 Relation among Measures of Performance	79
	3.16.1 The Max-P(C) Observer and d'	80
	3.16.2 The Neyman-Pearson Observer and d'	81
	3.16.3 The Area A, and d'	81
3.17	7 Signal Detection Theory and Statistical Tests of Hypotheses	81
*3.18	8 Optimal Performance with Two Signal Events	82
	*3.18.1 Max-P(C) Observer with Two Signal Events	83
	*3.18.2 Neyman-Pearson Observer with Two Signal Events	84
3.19	9 Unequal-Variance, N-N ROCs	86
	0 Summary	87
Bib	liography	89

X Contents

4	Power-Law ROCs		
	4.1		91
		4.1.1 The Negative Exponential Family	91
	4.0	4.1.2 The Rayleigh Family	92
	4.2	But I will be a second of the	93
		4.2.1 Some Properties of the Negative Exponential	93
	4.0	4.2.2 Likelihood Ratio and the Negative Exponential	94
	4.3		94
		4.3.1 Slope of the Power-Law ROC	96
	4.4		97
		4.4.1 Two Equations for the Slope of the Power-Law ROC	97
		4.4.2 The Cutoff for the Likelihood-Ratio Observer	97
		4.4.3 Given a Point in ROC Space, Determine k	98
		4.4.4 Ratio Property of Power-Law ROC	98
	4.5	and the second matter	99
	4.6		99
	4.7		100
	*4.8	Tropaction Exponential	101
		*4.8.1 Negative Exponential and Chi-Square Distributions	101
		*4.8.2 Negative Exponential and Rayleigh Distributions	102
	41.101	*4.8.3 Example: Neyman-Pearson Observer	103
	4.9	3	105
		4.9.1 Example: Neyman-Pearson Observer and Monotone Likelihood-	•
		Ratio Family	105
	4.10) Isocriterion Contours	106
		4.10.1 The Max-P(C) Observer	107
		4.10.2 Example for Max-P(C) Observer	108
		4.10.3 The Neyman-Pearson Observer	108
	4.11	Area Under the Power-Law ROC	108
	4.12	2 Multiple-Observation Task	110
	4.13	B Power-Law and N-N ROCs	110
	Bib	liography	112
5	Ch	i-Square ROCs	114
	•		117
	5.1	The Chi-Square Distribution	115
	5.2	The Detection Task and Likelihood Ratio	116
	5.3	Nonstandardized Chi-Square Distributions	118
	5.4	Likelihood Ratio for the Random Variable I	119
	5.5	Summary	120
	5.6	Chi-Square ROCs	121
		5.6.1 Chi-Square ROCs with v Constant	121
		5.6.2 Chi-Square ROCs with v Variable	122
		5.6.3 Chi-Square ROCs with v _{sn} Variable	124
		*5.6.4 General Equation for Likelihood Ratio for I	127
		*5.6.5 Example: Calculation of Chi-Square ROCs	128
		5.6.6 Max-P(C) for Chi-Square Distributions	129
	5.7	Multiple-Observation Task with Negative Exponentials	130

Contents xi

	5.8 General Case of Multiple Observations 5.9 Example: Comparison of Performance in Various Tasks	132 133
	5.9.1 Performance Based upon Negative Exponentials	133
	5.9.2 Performance Based upon N-N Distributions	135
	5.10 Measure of Detectability for Chi-Square Distributions	136
	5.11 Summary	137
	Bibliography	139
ı	ROCs and the Bernoulli-Trials Process	140
	6.1 ROCs and Bernoulli Distributions	141
	6.2 ROCs and Binomial Distributions	142
	6.2.1 Likelihood Ratio and Cutoff for Binomial Distributions	143
	6.2.2 Binomial ROCs	144
	*6.2.3 Examples: Normal Approximation to the Binomial	145
	6.2.4 Example: Two Coins in a Hat 6.2.5 Example: 2IFC	146
	*6.2.6 Decisions Based upon Decisions	147 149
	6.3 ROCs and Geometric Distributions	150
	6.3.1 Likelihood Ratio and Cutoff for Geometric Distributions	151
	6.3.2 Truncation of Geometric Distributions	152
	6.3.3 ROCs and Geometric Distributions	153
	6.3.4 On a Relation between the Binomial Observer and the Geometric	
	Observer	155
	6.3.5 Example	156
	6.4 ROCs and Negative Binomial Distributions	156
	6.4.1 Likelihood Ratio and Cutoff for Negative Binomial Distributions	157
	6.4.2 ROCs and Negative Binomial Distributions	157
	6.4.3 On a Relation between the Binomial Observer and the Pascal	
	Observer	158
	6.5 Summary	159
	Bibliography	161
	ROCs and the Poisson Random Process	162
	7.1 The Poisson Random Process and the Poisson Distribution	163
	7.2 The Poisson Random Process and Interevent Intervals	165
	7.3 Likelihood Ratio for Poisson Distributions	166
	7.4 Poisson ROCs	169
	7.5 Critical Number for the Poisson Observer	171
	7.5.1 Critical Number as λ_s approaches zero	172
	*7.5.2 Critical Number and $(\lambda_n \lambda_{sn})^{1/2}$	174
	*7.5.3 Continuity of the Psychometric Function for the Max-P(C) Observer	175
	*7.5.4 Closing the Discrete Poisson ROC	176
	7.6 Psychometric Functions for the Poisson Observer with a Max-P(C)	
	Objective	177
	7.7 Psychometric Functions for the Poisson Observer with the Neyman-	180
	Pearson Objective	179