

Understanding



JUVENILE LAW

THIRD EDITION



Martin R. Gardner

UNDERSTANDING JUVENILE LAW

THIRD EDITION

Martin R. Gardner

*Steinhart Foundation Professor of Law
University of Nebraska, College of Law*



LexisNexis®

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gardner, Martin R.

Understanding juvenile law / Martin R. Gardner. -- 3rd ed.

p. cm. -- (Understanding series)

ISBN 978-1-4224-2955-6 (softbound)

1. Juvenile justice, Administration of--United States. 2. Children--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States. 3. Minors--United States. I. Title

KF9780.G37 2009

345.73'08--dc22

2008052907

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks and Michie is a trademark of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2009 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group.
All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 25¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

Editorial Offices
744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
www.lexisnexus.com

MATTHEW  BENDER

**UNDERSTANDING
JUVENILE LAW
THIRD EDITION**

LEXISNEXIS LAW SCHOOL ADVISORY BOARD

Lenni B. Benson

*Professor of Law &
Associate Dean for Professional Development
New York Law School*

Raj Bhala

*Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law*

Charles P. Craver

*Freda H. Alverson Professor of Law
The George Washington University Law School*

Richard D. Freer

*Robert Howell Hall Professor of Law
Emory University School of Law*

Craig Joyce

*Andrews Kurth Professor of Law &
Co-Director, Institute for Intellectual Property and Information Law
University of Houston Law Center*

Ellen S. Podgor

*Professor of Law &
Associate Dean of Faculty Development and Electronic Education
Stetson University College of Law*

Paul F. Rothstein

*Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center*

Robin Wellford Slocum

*Professor of Law & Director,
Legal Research and Writing Program
Chapman University School of Law*

David I. C. Thomson

*LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law*

Dedication

In memory of my goodly parents.

Martin R. Gardner

Acknowledgments

The author wishes to express appreciation for the generous support made available through the Ross McCollum Research Fund at the University of Nebraska College of Law; for the superb research and editorial assistance provided by Jeanette Ericson, Jolene Papa, and Krista Carlson; for the excellent secretarial service performed by Jann Howard, Gretchen Hammon, Marie Mathine, and Vida Eden; and, most of all, for the patience and encouragement of his wife, Anne.

Preface

This text examines the topic of juvenile law. The book addresses issues of children and the law in the context of common law doctrine, federal constitutional principles, and statutory enactments.

The book discusses these various bodies of law in relation to a fundamental issue permeating the entire field of juvenile law: the extent to which the law should protect young people rather than recognize them as autonomous persons. While the law traditionally adopted a protectionist posture, recent legal developments appear to recognize autonomy rights of adolescents in certain contexts. These developments are praised by some commentators who advocate wholesale rejection of the paternalistic model in favor of a system that treats adolescents as full-fledged persons under the law. This book does not advocate any particular resolution of the current debate about the nature of the rights of young people; rather, it suggests that sensitivity to the issues and arguments entailed in that debate is essential to any true understanding of the present state of juvenile law.

With these concerns in mind, the text begins with a general discussion of the nature of the rights of juveniles and the perception that young people constitute a unique class under the law. This theoretical introduction will serve as a background for subsequent discussion of juvenile law doctrine. The discussion separates aspects of juvenile law arising outside the juvenile justice system (defined in this text as the system of separate courts organized to deal with “delinquents” and “status offenders”)¹ from those arising within that system. This division is created as a useful means of organizing the doctrinal material, given the extensive body of rules that govern the juvenile justice system. Moreover, this organization permits the juvenile justice section to stand by itself as an independent text for students in courses that cover only that aspect of juvenile law.

Finally, for readers interested in single sources providing broader attention to juvenile law issues than provided in this text, two multi-volume sources may be useful starting points. Donald Kramer’s three-volume second edition to *Legal Rights of Children* offers a well organized treatment of a host of legal issues affecting young people. In addition, the various volumes of *Juvenile Justice Standards* from the Institute of Judicial Administration and the American Bar Association Joint Commission provide useful commentary on a variety of juvenile law issues. Finally, for a treatment of the juvenile justice system, the second edition of Samuel Davis’s *Rights of Juveniles* provides an excellent source.

¹ A separate section (Part Three) is devoted to the delinquency/status offense aspects of juvenile law under the label “juvenile justice system.” Sometimes this label is used more broadly to include abuse and neglect jurisdiction or any other matter handled in a separate juvenile court. The label “juvenile justice system” always includes, however, and is often limited to, that system of courts created to deal with delinquents and status offenders.

Table of Contents

Part One	INTRODUCTION	1
Chapter 1	MINORITY AS A LEGAL STATUS	3
§ 1.01	OVERVIEW	3
§ 1.02	DISTINGUISHING MINORS FROM ADULTS	3
[A]	Chronological Age Rules	3
[1]	Common Law	3
[2]	Modern Statutes: Different Ages for Different Contexts	4
[B]	Individualized Standards for Assessing Maturity	5
[1]	Manifestations of the Individualized Standard	5
[a]	The “Mature Minor” and Medical Treatment	5
[b]	Waivers of Juvenile Court Jurisdiction	6
[2]	Social Science and the Process of Maturation: The Nature of Adolescence	6
Chapter 2	THE RIGHTS OF JUVENILES	9
§ 2.01	OVERVIEW	9
§ 2.02	THE PROTECTIONIST THEORY	10
[A]	Theoretical Premises	10
[B]	Overview of Private Law	11
[C]	The State as <i>Parens Patriae</i>	12
§ 2.03	THE PERSONHOOD THEORY	12
[A]	Overview	12
[B]	Personhood Rights and Current Law	13
§ 2.04	ACCOMMODATION OF PROTECTIONIST AND PERSONHOOD THEORIES	14
Part Two	OUTSIDE THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM	15
Chapter 3	THE CHILD AND THE FAMILY	17
§ 3.01	GENERAL BACKGROUND	17
§ 3.02	SUPPORT AND MAINTENANCE	18
[A]	“Necessary” Support	19
[1]	Setting The Amount Of Financial Support	19
[2]	Education	20
[3]	Medical Care	22
[a]	Parental Objections On Religious Grounds	22

Table of Contents

[b]	Objections On Grounds Of Parental Autonomy	23
[c]	Handicapped Newborns	24
[d]	Consent by the Juvenile: The “Mature Minor” Exception	25
[4]	Unborn Children	26
[B]	Duration of Support	27
[1]	Emancipation	27
[2]	Disobedience to Parents	28
[3]	Death of Parent or Child	29
[C]	Theoretical Implications	29
§ 3.03	PARENTAL NEGLECT	29
[A]	Parental Tort Liability	30
[B]	State Intervention	31
[1]	Criminal Actions	31
[2]	<i>Parens Patriae</i> Limitations on Parental Authority	32
[3]	Termination of Parental Rights	34
[4]	Foster Care	35
§ 3.04	ADOPTION	38
§ 3.05	INHERITANCE	39
§ 3.06	CHILD CUSTODY	41
[A]	Disputes Between Natural Parents	41
[1]	The Tender Years Presumption	42
[2]	The Primary Caretaker Presumption	43
[3]	Race, Religion, and Sexual Orientation of Parents	44
[4]	The Child’s Preference	45
[5]	Joint Custody	46
[6]	Visitation Rights	46
[B]	Disputes Between Parents and Non-Parents	48
[C]	Jurisdictional Issues	49
[D]	Theoretical Implications	51
Chapter 4	CHILD ABUSE	53
§ 4.01	OVERVIEW	53
§ 4.02	CHILD ABUSE LEGISLATION	54
[A]	Defining Child Abuse	54
[1]	Constitutional Attacks	57
[2]	Policy Implications	58
[B]	Duty to Report	59
[1]	Persons Obligated to Report	60
[2]	Civil Liability for Failure to Report or Investigate	61
[3]	Policy Implications	62
§ 4.03	THE JUDICIAL PROCESS	63

Table of Contents

[A]	Expert Testimony	64
[1]	Battered Child Syndrome	64
[2]	Other “Syndrome” Evidence	65
[a]	Munchausen Syndrome by Proxy	67
[b]	Battering Parent Syndrome	69
[3]	Policy Implications	70
[B]	Children’s Testimony	70
[1]	Competency to Testify	70
[2]	The Traumatic Effects of Testifying	72
[a]	Face to Face Confrontation?	72
[b]	Hearsay Exceptions	74
[3]	Policy Implications	80
[C]	Other Evidentiary Issues	82
[1]	Testimonial Privileges	82
[2]	Admissibility of Prior Acts of Abuse	82
§ 4.04	CRIMINAL OR CIVIL ALTERNATIVES?	83

Chapter 5 PRIVATE LAW ISSUES OUTSIDE THE FAMILY 85

§ 5.01	OVERVIEW	85
§ 5.02	LITIGATION ISSUES	85
[A]	Parties	85
[B]	Statutes of Limitations	86
§ 5.03	CONTRACTS	87
[A]	The Common Law Infancy Doctrine	88
[1]	The Necessaries Exception	88
[2]	Avoidance and Restitution	90
[3]	Misrepresentation of Age	91
[4]	Ratification	92
[a]	Failure to Make a Timely Disaffirmance	92
[b]	Express Ratification	93
[c]	Conduct	93
[5]	Emancipation and Contract Capacity	93
[6]	Non-Necessary Medical Expenses	94
[B]	Statutory Innovations	94
[C]	Policy Implications	96
§ 5.04	TORTS	97
[A]	Intentional Torts	98
[1]	Punitive Damages	98
[2]	Parental Liability Statutes	99
[B]	Negligence	100
[C]	Policy Implications	101

Table of Contents

§ 5.05	PROPERTY	101
§ 5.06	MAKING A WILL	102
§ 5.07	EMPLOYMENT	103
[A]	State Legislation	103
[B]	Federal Legislation	106
[C]	Policy Implications	108
Chapter 6	CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	111
§ 6.01	OVERVIEW	111
§ 6.02	THE EARLY CASES: <i>MEYER</i> AND <i>PIERCE</i>	112
§ 6.03	THE FIRST AMENDMENT	113
[A]	The Religion Clauses	113
[1]	The Establishment Clause and the Public Schools	113
[a]	School Prayer	114
[b]	Accommodating Student Religious Belief	116
[2]	The Free Exercise Clause	116
[B]	Free Speech	120
[1]	In School	120
[2]	Outside School	126
§ 6.04	THE FOURTH AMENDMENT	129
§ 6.05	THE EIGHTH AMENDMENT	137
[A]	In School: Corporal Punishment	137
[B]	Outside School: Capital Punishment	138
§ 6.06	THE FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT	142
[A]	Due Process	142
[1]	Substantive Rights	142
[a]	Reproductive Freedom	142
[b]	Education	147
[c]	Corporal Punishment	148
[d]	Marriage	148
[e]	Curfews	149
[2]	Procedural Rights	149
[a]	School Discipline	149
[b]	Mental Health Commitments	151
[B]	Equal Protection	154
[1]	Childhood as a Suspect Class?	154
[2]	Illegitimacy	154
§ 6.07	SUMMARY	158

Table of Contents

Part Three	THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM	161
Chapter 7	THE JUVENILE COURT MOVEMENT	163
§ 7.01	OVERVIEW	163
§ 7.02	THE EMERGENCE OF JUVENILE COURTS	163
[A]	The Common Law	163
[B]	Statutory Reform	165
§ 7.03	SUPREME COURT OVERSIGHT	169
[A]	The Pre- <i>Gault</i> Era	169
[B]	In re <i>Gault</i>	171
[C]	<i>Gault</i> 's Progeny	175
[D]	Summary	178
Chapter 8	JURISDICTION	181
§ 8.01	OVERVIEW	181
§ 8.02	AGE	182
[A]	Maximum Age	182
[1]	Generally	182
[2]	Gender Distinctions	182
[3]	Age at the Time of Offense or at the Commencement of Proceedings?	183
[B]	Minimum Age	185
§ 8.03	DELINQUENCY	186
[A]	Exclusive Jurisdiction	187
[B]	Concurrent Jurisdiction	187
[C]	Waivers of Jurisdiction	188
[1]	Judicial Waivers	188
[2]	Legislative Waivers	189
[a]	Statutes Excluding Gang Activity	190
[b]	Policy Considerations	191
§ 8.04	STATUS OFFENSES	192
[A]	Noncriminal Misconduct	192
[B]	Undesirable Status Conditions	193
[C]	Constitutional Issues	193
[1]	Equal Protection Challenges	193
[a]	Discrimination Against Juveniles	193
[b]	Discrimination Against Females	194
[2]	Void for Vagueness	194
[D]	Policy Implications	196

Table of Contents

Chapter 9	THE PRE-ADJUDICATION PROCESS	197
§ 9.01	OVERVIEW	197
§ 9.02	POLICE INVESTIGATION	197
[A]	Searches and Seizures	197
[1]	Taking Into Custody	198
[a]	Caselaw	198
[b]	Statutes	203
[2]	Searches and Seizures of Evidence	204
[3]	Consensual Searches and Seizures	205
[a]	Consent While in Custody	207
[b]	Third Party Consent	207
[4]	Policy Implications	208
[B]	Interrogations	211
[1]	Fourteenth Amendment Due Process	211
[2]	Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel	213
[3]	Fifth Amendment Privilege Against Self-Incrimination: <i>Miranda</i>	213
[a]	<i>Fare v. Michael C.</i>	215
[b]	State Law Protections	217
[c]	Policy Implications	218
[C]	Lineups	219
§ 9.03	INTAKE AND DIVERSION	220
§ 9.04	DETENTION AND BAIL	221
[A]	Preventive Detention	222
[1]	<i>Schall v. Martin</i>	223
[2]	Policy Implications	224
[B]	Bail	225
§ 9.05	JUDICIAL WAIVER OF JURISDICTION	226
[A]	Criteria For Waiver	226
[1]	Vagueness of the Criteria	227
[2]	Applying the Criteria	228
[B]	Procedures	229
Chapter 10	ADJUDICATION	231
§ 10.01	OVERVIEW	231
§ 10.02	DELINQUENCY	231
[A]	Procedural Aspects	231
[1]	Notice	232
[2]	Discovery	234
[3]	Counsel	234
[4]	Evidentiary Issues	236

Table of Contents

[a]	Rules of Evidence	236
[b]	Standard of Proof	236
[c]	Self-Incrimination, Confrontation, and Cross Examination	237
[5]	Jury Determinations	238
[6]	Speedy Trials	239
[7]	Public Trials	239
[a]	Rights of Juveniles	239
[b]	Rights of the Press	241
[8]	Policy Implications	242
[B]	Affirmative Defenses	243
[1]	Competency to be Adjudicated	244
[2]	The Insanity Defense	245
[3]	The Infancy Defense	246
[4]	Battered Children and Self-Defense	247
[5]	Gang Activity and the Duress Defense	249
[6]	Policy Implications	250
§ 10.03	STATUS OFFENSES	250
[A]	Procedural Aspects	250
[1]	Constitutional Protections	251
[2]	Notice	253
[3]	Discovery	253
[4]	Counsel	254
[5]	Evidentiary Issues	254
[a]	Rules of Evidence	254
[b]	Standard of Proof	256
[c]	Self-Incrimination	256
[6]	Jury Determinations, Open Proceedings	257
[7]	Policy Implications	257
[B]	Affirmative Defenses	257
Chapter 11	DISPOSITIONS	259
§ 11.01	OVERVIEW	259
§ 11.02	HEARING PROCEDURES	259
[A]	Right to a Hearing	260
[B]	Right to Counsel	260
[C]	Rules of Evidence	261
§ 11.03	DELINQUENCY CASES	261
[A]	The Traditional Theory: Promoting the Child's Interests	262
[1]	Appellate Review of Judicial Discretion	262
[2]	The Least Drastic Alternative	264
[B]	The New Theory: Social Protection and Punishment	266

Table of Contents

[1]	Distinguishing Punishment and Rehabilitation	267
[2]	Punitive Juvenile Justice Legislation	267
[3]	Legal Consequences of Punitive Dispositions	268
[C]	Dispositional Alternatives	270
[1]	Probation	270
[a]	Conditions of Probation	271
[b]	Probation Revocation	272
[c]	Rehabilitation or Punishment?	273
[2]	Restitution	274
[a]	Procedural Requirements	276
[b]	Rehabilitation or Punishment?	276
[3]	Community Service	277
[4]	Community-Based Institutionalization	278
[a]	Foster Care	279
[b]	The Problem of Runaways	280
[5]	Secure Confinement	281
[a]	The Right to Rehabilitation	282
[b]	Cruel and Unusual Punishment	284
[i]	General Conditions of Confinement	285
[ii]	Disciplinary Regimens	286
[D]	Boot Camps	288
[E]	“Blended Sentencing”	288
[F]	Policy Implications	289
§ 11.04	STATUS OFFENDERS	290
[A]	Non-Incarcerative Dispositions	291
[B]	Secure Confinement	291
[1]	Initial Disposition	291
[2]	Secure Confinement as a Secondary Disposition	293
[3]	Segregating Status Offenders and Delinquents	295
[C]	The Right to Rehabilitation	296
[D]	Unconstitutional Punishment	297
[1]	Punishment Violative of Due Process	298
[2]	Cruel and Unusual Punishment	299
[a]	Punishment in “Nonpunitive” Dispositional Systems	299
[b]	Punishment of Status	300
§ 11.05	APPEALS	301
Chapter 12	THE FUTURE OF THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM	303
§ 12.01	OVERVIEW	303
§ 12.02	DELINQUENCY	303

Table of Contents

§ 12.03 STATUS OFFENSES 305

TABLE OF CASES TC-1

INDEX I-1