Rethinking Corporate Governance

From Shareholder Value to Stakeholder Value

Editor

Roger Blanpain

Guest Editors

William Bromwich Olga Rymkevich Iacopo Senatori

Contributors

Carmen Agut García

Stephen Barber

Alice Belcher

Monray Marsellus Botha

William Bromwich

Raffaella Cascioli

Rosalind Chew

Chew Soon-Beng

Lance Compa

Mirella Damiani Michele Faioli

Luisa Ficari

Rebecca Givan

Inger Marie Hagen

József Hajdú

Laura Innocenti

Karl Koch

Attila Kun

Femke Laagland

Klaus Mehrens

Henning Meyer

Eric Ogilvie-Brown

John Opute

Massimo Pilati

Ekaterina Ribarova

Jacques Rojot Olga Rymkevich

lacona Constari

lacopo Senatori

Sumanjeet Singh Dagmara Skupień

Kees J. Vos

Ilse Zaal

Stefan Zagelmeyer Alezandr Zavgorodniy Hélio Zvlberstain



Rethinking Corporate Governance

From Shareholder Value to Stakeholder Value

Editor: Roger Blanpain

Guest Editors:

William Bromwich Olga Rymkevich Iacopo Senatori

Contributors

Carmen Agut García Stephen Barber Alice Belcher Monray Marsellus Botha William Bromwich Raffaella Cascioli Rosalind Chew Chew Soon-Beng Lance Compa Mirella Damiani Michele Faioli Luisa Ficari Rebecca Givan Inger Marie Hagen József Hajdú Laura Innocenti Karl Koch Attila Kun

Femke Laagland Klaus Mehrens Henning Meyer Eric Ogilvie-Brown John Opute Massimo Pilati Jacques Rojot Ekaterina Ribarova Olga Rymkevich Iacopo Senatori Sumanjeet Singh Dagmara Skupień Kees J. Vos Ilse Zaal Stefan Zagelmeyer Alezandr Zavgorodniy Hélio Zylberstajn



Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3450-9

© 2011 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

Rethinking Corporate Goverance

Notes on Contributors

- **Carmen Agut García**—Professor of Labour Law and Social Security, Faculty of Law and Economics, Jaume I University, Spain
- **Stephen Barber**—Senior Lecturer in Management, London South Bank University, UK
- Alice Belcher—Professor of Law, School of Law, University of Dundee, Scotland, UK
- Monray Marsellus Botha—Senior Lecturer, Department of Mercantile Law, University of Johannesburg, South Africa
- William Bromwich—Research fellow, Marco Biagi Faculty of Economics, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy
- Raffaella Cascioli—Researcher, ISTAT National Statistics Institute, Rome, Italy Rosalind Chew—Associate Professor, Division of Economics, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore
- Chew Soon-Beng—Professor, Division of Economics, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore
- Lance Compa—Senior Lecturer, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, USA
- Mirella Damiani—Department of Economics, Finance and Statistics, University of Perugia, Italy
- Michele Faioli—Faculty of Law, Tor Vergata University, Rome, Italy
- Luisa Ficari—Full Professor, Department of Law, Faculty of Economics, University of Tuscia, Viterbo, Italy
- **Rebecca Givan**—Assistant Professor, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, USA
- **Inger Marie Hagen**—Researcher, Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research, Oslo, Norway
- **József Hajdú**—Professor of Labour Law and Social Security, Faculty of Law, Department of Labour Law and Social Security, University of Szeged, Hungary.

- Laura Innocenti—Research Assistant, LUISS University, Rome
- Karl Koch—Emeritus Professor, Faculty of Business, Computing and Information Management, London South Bank University, UK
- Attila Kun—Senior Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Department of Labour Law and Social Security, Károli Gáspár University, Budapest, Hungary
- **Femke Laagland**—PhD Candidate and Lecturer, University of Nijmegen, the Netherlands
- **Klaus Mehrens**—Senior Research Fellow, Global Policy Institute, London Metropolitan University, UK
- Henning Meyer—Global Policy Institute, London Metropolitan University, UK Eric Ogilvie-Brown—PhD Candidate, University of Dundee, and Law Lecturer, Aberdeen School of Business, Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, Scotland, UK
- John Opute—Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Business, Computing and Information Management, London South Bank University, UK
- Massimo Pilati—Full Professor, Marco Biagi Faculty of Economics, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy
- **Ekaterina Ribarova**—Research fellow, Institute for Social and Trade Union Research, Confederation of Independent Trade Unions, Sofia, Bulgaria
- **Jacques Rojot**—Full Professor and Director of Research in Management, University of Paris II, France
- Olga Rymkevich—Researcher, Marco Biagi Foundation, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy
- **Iacopo Senatori**—Researcher, Marco Biagi Foundation, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy
- Sumanjeet Singh—Assistant Professor, Department of Commerce, Ramjas College, University of Delhi, India
- Dagmara Skupień—Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Łódź, Poland
- **Kees J. Vos**—Research Fellow, Dutch Research Institute TNO Quality of Life, the Netherlands
- Ilse Zaal—PhD Candidate and Lecturer, University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands Stefan Zagelmeyer—Professor of Economics and Human Resource Management, International University of Applied Sciences Bad Honnef-Bonn, Germany
- Alezandr Zavgorodniy—Full Professor, Labour Law Department, School of Law, St. Petersburg State University, Russia
- Hélio Zylberstajn—Full Professor of Labor Economics, University of São Paulo, Brazil
- ERRATA CORRIGE: In the Bulletin of Comparative Labour Relations, Vol. 73 (2010) on Labour Productivity, Investment in Human Capital and Youth Employment: Comparative Developments and Global Responses, the List of Contributors (p.xvii) contained a misprint of the name of Prof. Rosalind Chew, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. The Editors take this opportunity to correct the error and extend their sincere apologies to Prof. Chew.

Editorial

This issue of the Bulletin contains a selection of papers from the Eighth International Conference in commemoration of Prof. Marco Biagi, on Rethinking Corporate Governance: from Shareholder Value to Stakeholder Value, held at the Marco Biagi Foundation in Modena, Italy, on 18–20 March 2010. With contributions from leading experts from all around the world in the fields of labor law, industrial relations, labor economics, labor statistics, human resources management, organization theory and other related subjects, the conference focused on the impact of the global economic crisis and its implications for the future of employment. Against the backdrop of a varieties of capitalism perspective as conceptualized by Hall and Soskice, a key issue under discussion was whether shareholder or stakeholder approaches to management yield the best results in terms of employment outcomes, with a particular focus on employee participation or involvement. As the world economic crisis, or the Great Recession as it is often called in the US. continues to take its toll on employment, pension funds, public services, and living standards, many observers argue that stakeholder-oriented economies, such as Germany, the Nordic countries and Japan, appear to have weathered the storm better than shareholder-oriented economies, such as the USA, the UK and Ireland, where "light-touch" regulation became something of an orthodoxy until the concept was discredited by recent events in the financial markets. These considerations were at the forefront of the discussion as leading scholars from five continents examined national case studies, regulatory models and future scenarios.

In the first chapter, in the section on collective bargaining, **Stefan Zagel-meyer** considers employer perspectives on collective bargaining coverage, the rate of which varies considerably from one country to another. Employers are said to benefit from the standardization of employment contracts, as negotiating costs are reduced. Firms that engage in collective bargaining tend to pay higher wages, and to provide greater job security, with high wages used as a means to

attract more highly motivated individuals. Promotion based on seniority, commonly negotiated under collective agreements, is seen as a way of improving morale within the firm, as management is perceived to be behaving fairly rather than arbitrarily, with an impact on morale and motivation.

Still on the topic of collective bargaining, **Carmen Agut García** considers the efficacy of collective bargaining procedures in Spain, casting light on some of the legal issues arising from the attempt to extend coverage in transnational collective bargaining, that is seen as a means to guarantee a floor of rights across national boundaries.

In another national case study, **John Opute** and **Karl Koch** report on developments in Nigeria, highlighting the key role that unions can play in the transition from a dictatorship to a functioning democracy. Even in cases in which union density is not particularly high, collective agreements can be negotiated that have an impact beyond the union membership. With major oil reserves and a population of over 150 million, the economic outlook of Nigeria is positive, and the country's political development is shown by the higher ranking assigned by the OECD in terms of freedom of association and collective bargaining, though the democratic process is still fragile. In a country with centralized collective wage bargaining, the union focus on nonmonetary issues in bargaining at company level is seen as a way to gain significant advantages for union members.

With reference to Singapore, **Rosalind Chew** and **Chew Soon-Beng** investigate the distinction between adversarial and strategic collective bargaining. The aim of strategic bargaining is to promote employment stability, with a long-term rather than a short-term focus. The authors provide insights into an economy where there has been hardly any industrial action since the 1960s, and where unions manage to extend many of the benefits of union membership to non-members, thanks to the tripartite structure of industrial relations in Singapore.

In the section on participation, **Jacques Rojot** examines employee share ownership plans as a form of employee involvement promoting motivation in the firm. The union response to such plans is often tepid, taking account of the multiple risks for employees, who in the event of bankruptcy are at risk of losing their jobs, their savings, and even their pensions. The author provides an overview of the advantages of employee share ownership, with particular reference to the French case.

Employee motivation is the main focus of the chapter by Massimo Pilati and Laura Innocenti, with long-term employees included among the most valuable corporate stakeholders due to their firm-specific human capital. Participation in decision-making and sharing in the results of corporate performance is seen as a way to attract, retain, and motivate such employees.

The chapter by **Luisa Ficari** examines workers' voice and participation in the restructuring of undertakings, with particular reference to the provisions in the EU Directive regulating employee involvement in the *Societas Europaea*. The author considers in particular the question of job continuity and redundancies in the case of the insolvency of an undertaking, and how this can be regulated by collective agreement. She also discusses collective agreements regulating the reduction in working hours in response to the economic crisis. Employee involvement,

information and consultation are therefore seen as playing an essential role in the definition of exit strategies in the event of insolvency.

Starting from an historical overview of the Statute for the European Company, that allows for a one-tier or a two-tier structure of employee participation, **Dagmara Skupień** discusses the Polish model of employee involvement. In the past two decades Poland has undergone a major transformation, with state-owned companies going through partial or total privatization, and this process has had an impact on participation. In the view of the author, employee involvement should be a requirement before company registration takes place, but the compromise reached at EU level does not include this provision.

Inger Marie Hagen examines the role of employee-elected directors on company boards in Norway, a country with a tradition of strong co-determination rights. She uses empirical data from company surveys to determine the perceived degree of influence of employee-elected directors, and identifies an interesting process by which such directors tend to have greater influence outside the board-room, as the CEO of the company seeks to establish his/her authority by submitting proposals to the board that have been subject to prior negotiation with the employee representatives. Key issues appear to be dealt with more effectively in direct, informal communication, rather than in the formal boardroom setting, where confrontation between the CEO and the employee representatives tends to be avoided. Employee representatives in Norway are said to reflect a labor-oriented rather than a stakeholder-oriented concept of corporate governance.

Still with reference to employee participation, Monray Marsellus Botha considers the South African case, drawing a distinction between three corporate governance models: authoritarian management, collective bargaining, and employee involvement. Unlike Germany, South Africa adopts a unitary board structure, and employees do not sit on company boards. Participation has developed slowly, with unions showing a reluctance to set up workplace forums due to a fear of erosion of collective bargaining. Some South African unions have also expressed opposition to Employee Share Ownership Plans, though they form part of the Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) strategy. In spite of enacting sophisticated legislation, South Africa still faces fundamental problems relating to decent work, housing, and clean water. Training programs and life-long training are seen as key to the transformation of the skills base of the South African workforce, that would enable employees not only to be more productive, but also to negotiate more effectively with management.

In the section on corporate social responsibility, the chapter by **Eric Ogilvie-Brown** casts light on the origins of limited liability, that was initially a privilege granted only to investors in large infrastructure projects, extended to manufacturing companies only at a later date. The author sees the granting of this privilege as a justification for extending benefits to society as a whole, as otherwise it would be a one-sided trade. He examines the case of the Ford Pinto in the 1970s to illustrate the dangers arising from a lack of corporate social responsibility, a case that resulted in lawsuits against the manufacturer in the US courts, in particular *Grimshaw v. Ford Motor Company*. The single-minded focus on "the bottom line" was

evidently a disastrous mistake by the Ford management. Whereas Milton Friedman treated limited liability as a right, the author argues that it is a privilege rather than a right, and that corporate social responsibility is the corollary of this privilege.

The link between labor law and corporate social responsibility is the focus of the chapter by **Attila Kun** and **József Hajdú**, who highlight the four dimensions of corporate social responsibility: economic, legal, ethical, and philanthropic. Legal compliance by itself appears to be insufficient for an evaluation of corporate performance. The authors identify a number of parallelisms between labor law and corporate social responsibility, representing respectively a "hard law" and a "soft law" approach to labor market regulation, and point to the need to avoid the use of corporate social responsibility as a means to reinterpret or evade labor law.

In the Bulgarian context, **Ekaterina Ribarova** examines a series of factors to explain why corporate social responsibility has so far had such a limited impact on the labor market and industrial relations. The author argues that it is perceived as an imported concept, and is mainly adopted in the subsidiaries of foreign-owned multinationals. Human resources policies that go beyond the basic provisions of the law and collective agreements are to be found only in a minority of firms in Bulgaria.

In her analysis of labor regulation in shareholder and stakeholder economies, Mirella Damiani considers institutional responses in a varieties of capitalism perspectives. Different levels of regulation between economies can be compared by means of indices comparing employment laws, collective relations laws, and social security. The chapter considers the argument that the higher level of labor regulation in civil law countries can have negative effects, such as higher unemployment, and lower labor force participation. A further argument that is investigated is that the lower level of shareholder protection in the civil law countries leads to underdeveloped capital markets, as in the case of Germany, where total stock market capitalization amounts to 50% of GDP, compared to three times GDP in the US and the UK. The thorny question of executive pay is also given some consideration, along with recent changes in legal protection in the employment field: for example, the author presents statistical findings that the reduction of legal protection for employees in Italy has coincided with a significant decline in productivity. On the other hand, significant productivity gains have been recorded in German companies in recent years, with Germany outperforming the UK. The conclusion of the chapter is that institutional comparative advantage still plays a strategic role, though on specific issues various interpretations have a claim to validity.

In the final section, on corporate governance and regulatory models, the theoretical framework is dealt with by **Hélio Zylberstajn**, who compares the neoclassical approach, in particular shareholder or stockholder theory, with the corporate social responsibility approach, in other words, stakeholder theory. He also provides insights into innovative round-table negotiations in various sectors in Brazil, and concludes that there are three sources of workers' rights: labor and employment law, the provisions of collective bargaining, and extended stakeholder bargaining.

In their overview of the social dimension of transatlantic economic relations, **Michele Faioli et al.** examine not just forms of collaboration across the Atlantic, but also forms of competition between the distinct systems, and point out that the subsidiaries of European companies operating in the United States tend to adopt the local employment regulation provisions, resulting in lower levels of protection for their employees. They also cite the case of a US firm importing union-busting tactics such as captive audience meetings in a subsidiary in the UK. In a globalized system, policy decisions on one side of the Atlantic can have significant repercussions on the other side. Impact assessment procedures should be adopted to highlight regulatory conflicts in a timely manner.

Based on labor statistics data, **Raffaella Cascioli** considers investment in vocational training in times of economic crisis, and highlights the decline in investment in this sector that took place in Italy with the onset of the economic downturn. Arguably, investment in human capital is the key to emerging from the crisis in better shape in an increasingly competitive environment.

In connection with employee representation on company boards in the European Union, **Femke Laagland and Ilse Zaal** report on the impact of the Cross-Border Merger Directive in the Netherlands. Until the adoption of the Directive, the Netherlands had one of the strongest systems of employee board-level representation in Europe. However, as a result of the compromise between the various European systems of employee representation (or absence thereof), Dutch employees risk losing their employee participation rights in the event of cross-border mergers.

In his discussion of shareholder versus stakeholder capitalism, **Kees J. Vos** refers to a prescient warning in the *Financial Times* in 1998 that "EMU's one-size-fits all monetary policy will be such a straightjacket that flexibility will be needed." The implication was that continental stakeholder capitalism would inevitably give way to US-style shareholder values, and the author partially supports this claim, also considering the impact of cross-border mergers and acquisitions. However, in his view, the economic crisis has led to a partial restoration of the original balance between shareholder/stakeholder values. While recognizing that shareholder capitalism continues to hold sway, he expresses the hope that tax-payers will not be expected to pay for the next market bubble.

In her report on the management of the National Health Service in Scotland, Alice Belcher considers top-down and bottom-up approaches to governance. Clearly in this case there are no shareholder interests to consider, but the author underlines the five principles laid down in the White Paper on European Governance: openness, participation, accountability, effectiveness, and coherence. In the current economic climate one more principle might be added: sustainability.

Sumanjeet Singh considers the balance of shareholder and stakeholder interests in corporate governance in an Indian perspective. He also provides an overview of the numerous cases of large-scale corporate fraud that have occurred in recent years, particularly in the US, the UK, Italy, Australia and India. Whereas shareholder-value perspectives give priority to profitability, stakeholder-value perspectives underline the importance of responsibility. Albeit in the presence of shifting battle lines, shareholder primacy prevails in the present climate.

Finally, **Olga Rymkevich and Alezandr Zavgorodniy** provide a short report on the employment of executive staff under Russian labor law, underlining the fact that this is a relationship that does not fall entirely within the purview of labor law. As one of the BRIC countries with a growing presence in the global economy, Russia is clearly of strategic interest and is destined to attract further attention in the field of comparative labor relations.

In conclusion, an impressive number of scholars, including not just established academics with an international reputation, but also researchers in the early stages of their career, representing a range of disciplines and many different national backgrounds, bring to bear theoretical arguments and empirical data with a view to gaining insight into major developments in labor markets and the economy as a whole. The spirit of open-minded enquiry in an international and comparative perspective with an emphasis on the practical dimension that characterized the research work of Marco Biagi lives on in this collection of papers.

William Bromwich Olga Rymkevich Iacopo Senatori

Summary of Contents

Notes on Contributors	XIX
Editorial	xxi
Part I Collective Bargaining	1
Chapter 1 The Employer's Perspective on Collective Bargaining Coverage: An Analytical Framework Stefan Zagelmeyer	3
Chapter 2 The Efficacy of Transnational Collective Bargaining: The Spanish Case Carmen Agut García	29
Chapter 3 The Emergence of Collective Bargaining Structures in a Transformation Economy: The Example of Nigeria John Opute and Karl Koch	39
Chapter 4 From Adversarial to Strategic Collective Bargaining: The Case of a Small Open Economy Rosalind Chew and Chew Soon-Beng	59

Part II Participation	69
Chapter 5 Employee Share Ownership and Workers' Participation: A Tool for Cooperation? Jacques Rojot	71
Chapter 6 Employee Participation: A Lever of Corporate Governance to Increase the Effectiveness of Human Resource Practices Massimo Pilati and Laura Innocenti	79
Chapter 7 Workers' Voice and Involvement in the Restructuring of Undertakings Luisa Ficari	91
Chapter 8 The Statute for a European Company and the Polish Model of Employee Involvement Dagmara Skupień	105
Chapter 9 Employee-Elected Directors on Company Boards: Stakeholder Representatives or the Voice of Labor? Inger Marie Hagen	121
Chapter 10 Employee Participation and Governance: A South African Perspective Monray Marsellus Botha	141
Part III Corporate Social Responsibility	163
Chapter 11 Corporate Social Responsibility: An Integral Element Rather than a Bolt-On Option Eric Ogilvie-Brown	165

Chapter 12 Conceptualization of Corporate Social Responsibility in the Context of Labor Law Attila Kun and József Hajdú	175
Chapter 13 Corporate Social Responsibility, the Labor Market and Industrial Relations in Bulgaria Ekaterina Ribarova	195
Chapter 14 Labor Regulation in Shareholder and Stakeholder Economies Mirella Damiani	211
Part IV Corporate Governance and Regulatory Models	235
Chapter 15 Labor Economics, Corporate Governance, and Corporate Social Responsibility: Interfaces and Boundaries Hélio Zylberstajn	237
Chapter 16 A Social Dimension for Transatlantic Economic Relations Michele Faioli, Lance Compa, Henning Meyer, Stephen Barber, Rebecca Givan and Klaus Mehrens	255
Chapter 17 Investment in Human Capital in Times of Economic Crisis Raffaella Cascioli	271
Chapter 18 Employee Board-Level Representation in the European Union: The Cross-Border Merger Directive and Its Impact in the Netherlands Femke Laagland and Ilse Zaal	283
Chapter 19 Shareholder versus Stakeholder Capitalism	299

Summary of Contents

Chapter 20 Top-Down Meets Bottom-Up Meets Mutuality: Governance in the NHS in Scotland Alice Belcher	311
Chapter 21 Balancing the Interests of Shareholders and Stakeholders through Corporate Governance Sumanjeet Singh	327
Chapter 22 The Employment of Executive Staff under Russian Labor Law Alezandr V. Zavgorodniy and Olga P. Rymkevich	353

Table of Contents

Notes on Contributors		XiX	
Editorial			
	Part I Collective Bargaining		
The An A	apter 1 e Employer's Perspective on Collective Bargaining Covera Analytical Framework fan Zagelmeyer	ge: 3	
I.	Introduction	3	
II.	Collective Bargaining: Core Concepts	4	
III.	Employer Demand for Collective Bargaining: Internal Fa	ctors 7	
	A. Dimensions of the Employment Relationship	7	
	1. Exchange and Authority	7	
	2. Power and Opportunism	10	
	3. Cooperation and Conflict	11	
	B. Personnel Management	13	
	1. Compensation	13	
	2. Motivation	14	
	3. Work Organization and Working Time	15	
	4. Employment Levels and Structure	17	
	C. Company Characteristics	17	
IV.	Employer Demand for Collective Bargaining: External Fa		
	A. Markets	19	
	B. Institutions	22	
	C. External Organizations	23	