

# the invisible houses



re-thinking and designing low-cost  
housing in developing countries

Gonzalo Lizarralde

ROUTLEDGE

# THE INVISIBLE HOUSES

Rethinking and Designing Low-Cost  
Housing in Developing Countries

*Gonzalo Lizarralde*

First published 2015  
by Routledge  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

and by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2015 Taylor & Francis

The right of Gonzalo Lizarralde to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Lizarralde, Gonzalo, 1974–

The invisible houses : rethinking and designing low-cost housing in developing countries / Gonzalo Lizarralde.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

1. Sustainable architecture – Developing countries. 2. Low-income housing – Developing countries. 3. Architects and community – Developing countries. 4. Urbanization – Developing countries.

I. Title.

NA7477.L59 2014

728'.1091724–dc23

2014017179

ISBN: 978-0-415-84082-8 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-0-415-84083-5 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-74960-0 (ebk)

Typeset in Bembo  
by HWA Text and Data Management, London



Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

# THE INVISIBLE HOUSES

There is an increased interest among architects, urban specialists and design professionals to contribute to solve “the housing problem” in developing countries. *The Invisible Houses* takes us on a journey through the slums and informal settlements of South Africa, India, Colombia, Honduras, El Salvador, Cuba, Haiti and many other countries of the Global South, revealing the challenges of, and opportunities for, improving the fate of millions of poor families. Stressing the limitations of current approaches to housing development, Gonzalo Lizarralde examines the short-, mid- and long-term consequences of housing intervention. The book covers—among others—the issues of planning, design, infrastructure and project management. It explains the different variables that need to be addressed and the causes of common failures and mistakes, while outlining successful strategies based on embracing a sustained engagement with the complexity of processes that are generally invisible.

**Gonzalo Lizarralde** is a professor at the School of Architecture, Université de Montréal. He has more than 15 years’ experience in the field of housing and project management in developing countries. He has authored more than 50 articles on the subjects of housing, post-disaster reconstruction and project management. He is a founding member of i-Rec, an international network for improving post-disaster reconstruction.

**A Sebastián, mi príncipe, e Ili, mi princesa**

## THE AUTHOR

A specialist in planning, management and evaluation of international architecture projects, Gonzalo Lizarralde is a professor at the School of Architecture at the Université de Montréal. He has fifteen years of experience in consulting for architecture and construction projects and has published numerous articles in the fields of low-cost housing and project management. Dr Lizarralde has taught at the University of Cape Town (South Africa), McGill University, Université de Montréal, Universidad del Valle and Universidad Javeriana (Colombia), and has given lectures in universities in Europe, the United States and Latin America. He has a post-doctorate from the Department of Construction Economics and Management at the University of Cape Town. Dr Lizarralde has been awarded research grants and/or scholarships from the South African NRF, the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC), the Fonds québécois de la recherche sur la société et la culture (FQRSC), the Canadian government and other funding agencies. Dr Lizarralde is director of the IF Research Group (grif) at the Université de Montréal, which studies the processes related to the planning and development of construction projects. He is also the leader of the Disaster Resilience and Sustainable Reconstruction Research Alliance, a scientific research program funded by the Quebec research funds (FQRSC). He is a founding member of i-Rec, an international network for improving post-disaster reconstruction. He is also the co-author of the book *Rebuilding After Disasters: From Emergency to Sustainability* (Routledge, 2009).

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many of the arguments presented in this book are the result of *collective research*. I am particularly grateful to:

- Colin Davidson, who provided important suggestions for the arguments in this book and revised a few chapters.
- Michel-Max Raynaud, Cassidy Johnson and Alexandre Apsan Frediani, who shared pertinent ideas about the importance of the Capability Approach in low-cost housing development.
- Lisa Bornstein, Isabelle Thomas, Kevin Gould, Christopher Bryant, Danielle Labbé, Arturo Valladares, Andrés Olivera, Jennifer Duyne Barenstein and all the members and students affiliated to the *Observatoire universitaire de la vulnérabilité, la résilience et la reconstruction durable* (*Œuvre durable* or The Disaster Resilience and Sustainable Reconstruction Research Alliance) for their contribution to the arguments related to vulnerability and resilience and for creating the Cuban resilience model case study.
- David Root and Mark Massyn and all the staff of the University of Cape Town for their contribution to the research projects conducted in South Africa.
- Mahmood Fayazi, Georgia Cardossi and Dhouha Bouraoui for creating pertinent case studies in Iran, Nairobi and Tunisia. All the students affiliated to the IF Research Group for their discussions, research results and pertinent ideas.
- The officers of *Compensar* for contributing valuable information about the *Cajas de compensación familiar* in Colombia.
- Venkatachalam Thiruppugazh and Graham Saunders for their inspiring ideas during the i-Rec (Information and Research for Reconstruction) conferences.
- Mario Bourgault and Juan Malo for their contribution to the study on project governance in developed and developing countries.
- The students of the Masters in Architecture—*Oriental mgpa* (Université de Montréal) and the professors and students involved in the workshops, conducted in Haiti in 2012 and 2013, for their inspiring ideas.

- Oswaldo Lopez and Adriana Lopez for their contribution to collecting information in Yumbo, Colombia.
- Alfonso Solano and all the participants of the *Taller Internacional de Vivienda* in Rio de Janeiro for their contribution to the case study of Favela Santa Marta.
- The residents of informal settlements and officers of several public and private organizations that were interviewed during the development of the research projects that led to this book.
- Marjorie Ewing, Robert Lecker and Amy Oliver for revising sections of the book and providing editorial comments.

I acknowledge the contribution of the *institutions* that funded the research initiatives that permitted creating the case studies presented in this publication, notably:

- The Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council—Canada, for funding the research work that permitted building the case studies in Colombia, El Salvador and Honduras.
- *The Fonds de recherche société et culture*—Québec.
- The Canadian Government, the Université de Montréal (*Direction des relations internationales*), the Université d'État d'Haïti, the Fondation Connaissances et Liberté (Fokal) and the architecture firm AEdifica for their contributions to creating the case of housing and reconstruction in Haiti.



# CREDITS

Excerpts from *Invisible Cities* by Italo Calvino: Published by Vintage. Copyright © 1972 by Guilio Einaudi Editore, s.p.a. Torino. English translation by William Weaver copyright © 1974 and renewed 1978 by Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing Company. Reprinted by permission of Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing Company. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission of The Random House Group Limited.

Figure 4.1 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, Colin Davidson, and Cassidy Johnson, eds. *Rebuilding after Disasters: From Emergency to Sustainability*. London: Taylor & Francis, 2009. Figure 1.3. Page 8.

Figure 4.3 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, Colin Davidson, and Cassidy Johnson, eds. *Rebuilding after Disasters: From Emergency to Sustainability*. London: Taylor & Francis, 2009. Figure 1.3. Page 8.

Figure 4.5 Lizarralde, Gonzalo. “Stakeholder Participation and Incremental Housing in Subsidized Housing Projects in Colombia and South Africa.” *Habitat International* 35, no. 2 (2010): 175–87. Figure 2. Page 180.

Figure 5.3 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, and David Root. “Ready-Made Shacks: Learning from the Informal Sector to Meet Housing Needs in South Africa.” Paper presented at the CIB World Building Congress Construction for Development, Cape Town, South Africa, 2007. Figure 2.

Figure 5.4 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, and David Root. “Ready-Made Shacks: Learning from the Informal Sector to Meet Housing Needs in South Africa.” Paper presented at the CIB World Building Congress Construction for Development, Cape Town, South Africa, 2007. Figure 4.

Figure 5.5 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, Colin Davidson, and Cassidy Johnson, eds. *Rebuilding after Disasters: From Emergency to Sustainability*. London: Taylor & Francis, 2009. Figure 1.6. Page 16.

Figure 5.7 Lizarralde, Gonzalo, Colin Davidson, and Cassidy Johnson, eds. *Rebuilding after Disasters: From Emergency to Sustainability*. London: Taylor & Francis, 2009. Figure 2.5. Page 42.

Figure 6.2 Lizarralde, Gonzalo. "Stakeholder Participation and Incremental Housing in Subsidized Housing Projects in Colombia and South Africa." *Habitat International* 35, no. 2 (2010): 175–87. Figure 9. Page 184.

Figure 6.5 Lizarralde, Gonzalo. "Sustainable Low Cost Housing in Developing Countries: The Role of Stakeholders." In *Contemporary Issues of Construction in Developing Countries*, edited by George Ofori, 282–306. London: Taylor & Francis, 2012. Figure 10.4. Page 280.

Figure 10.10 Work by students Stéphanie Boudreau-Chartier and Esther Gélinas.

Figure 10.12 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Tadeuz Jalocha).

Figure 10.13 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Cristobal Palma).

Figure 10.14 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Takuto Sando).

Figure 10.15 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Cristian Martinez).

Figure 10.16 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Cristian Martinez).

Figure 10.17 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Cristian Martinez).

Figure 10.18 Designed by *ELEMENTAL* (Photo: Cristian Martinez).

All other images were produced by Gonzalo Lizarralde.

# CONTENTS

|   |      |
|---|------|
| <i>Figures</i>  | ix   |
| <i>The Author</i>   | xiv  |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>  | xv   |
| <i>Credits</i>  | xvii |
| <br>  |      |
| 1 Learning From the Poor: Most of What Architects, Urban Specialists, Policy Makers and Design Professionals Need to Know About Housing Can Be Learned from the Informal Sector | 1    |
| 2 Invisible Millions: The Multiple (and Contradictory) Faces of Poverty and Informality   | 34   |
| 3 Invisible Markets: On Why to Buy a \$60,000 House in a Slum, and Other Distortions in Housing Markets   | 56   |
| 4 Invisible Land: About Houses Built on Distant, Wasted and Fragmented Land   | 79   |
| 5 Invisible Informal Processes: About the Way Land is Occupied and Houses are Produced, Purchased, Installed and Enlarged   | 96   |
| 6 Invisible Infrastructure: Housing is Not Actually About Delivering Houses, But About Developing Infrastructure, Collective Services and Economic Activities. But, Where?      | 114  |
| 7 Visibly Vulnerable, Invisibly Resilient: On Why Disasters Are Not Strictly “Natural” and Reconstruction Projects Sometimes Represent a Different Type of Disaster             | 128  |

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| 8  | Invisible Freedoms: On an Ethical Position Towards Housing in Developing Countries  | 147 |
| 9  | Invisible Power: On Who Does What, When and How—a New Framework for Understanding Low-Cost Housing in Developing Countries  | 167 |
| 10 | Rethinking and Designing Low-Cost Housing in Developing Countries: It is Not About Simplifying the Problem, but Rather Committing to Collective Sustained Effort and Embracing Complexity | 180 |
|    | <i>Bibliography</i>   | 213 |
|    | <i>Index</i>  | 222 |

# FIGURES

|      |   |    |
|------|---|----|
| 1.1  | Mr Sanchez spends most of his free time in this solarium  | 3  |
| 1.2  | Informal settlements are characterized by increased vulnerabilities   | 4  |
| 1.3  | Informal settlements are in constant transformation   | 5  |
| 1.4  | Slums are not places of misery and despair  | 7  |
| 1.5  | Formality and informality sometimes merge   | 9  |
| 1.6  | Informal settlements and informal labour are often found on the same site   | 10 |
| 1.7  | Direct provision of public housing has proven to be largely disappointing   | 13 |
| 1.8  | Sites-and-services has been largely abandoned as a strategy for housing development   | 15 |
| 1.9  | Slum upgrading accelerates housing completion and facilitates the creation of home-based income-generating activities   | 16 |
| 1.10 | Slum upgrading typically includes public investment in infrastructure and land regularization   | 17 |
| 1.11 | Traditional lifestyle in villages and small towns   | 18 |
| 1.12 | “We are making your dreams come true”   | 22 |
| 1.13 | The town of Choluteca, Honduras   | 23 |
| 1.14 | The processes of housing development have become invisible to the majority of non-poor  | 26 |
| 1.15 | Complexity must be embraced in order to deal with the multiple variables, time scales and levels of intervention that must be considered in housing development | 28 |
| 2.1  | Mr Murielo’s equipment to cast round columns allowed him to obtain profitable contracts   | 35 |
| 2.2  | The criminalization of informal settlements has led to increased segregation, exclusion and persecution   | 37 |
| 2.3  | Open-air market in Port-au-Prince, Haiti  | 39 |
| 2.4  | Polluted water sources are a threat to both the environment and public health in Cité Lajoie in Port-au-Prince  | 39 |

|      |  |    |
|------|--|----|
| 2.5  | In an attempt to control the expansion of Favela Santa Marta and protect green areas, authorities recently built a protective wall   | 40 |
| 2.6  | The informal sector largely comprises women who run their own micro-business   | 43 |
| 2.7  | Protection against crime is one of the most common priorities of informal entrepreneurs  | 46 |
| 2.8  | Whereas some informal businesses are mobile, others become sedentary or semi-sedentary by using permanent or temporary structures installed in public spaces                           | 49 |
| 2.9  | Very often, the combination and proximity of domestic and income-generation activities constitute simultaneously a traditional form of housing in city centres in developing countries | 51 |
| 2.10 | Different informal activities have different needs inside and outside the house  | 52 |
| 3.1  | A house for sale in Cité Lajoie, Port-au-Prince  | 57 |
| 3.2  | Interior of a house for sale in Favela Santa Marta, Rio de Janeiro   | 57 |
| 3.3  | The urban housing market in developing countries   | 61 |
| 3.4  | Urban upgrading typically increases the value of residential properties  | 62 |
| 3.5  | Deterioration and subdivisions in historic buildings, such as this one in central Bhuj, India, can contribute to the filtering down of properties in the market                        | 63 |
| 3.6  | Urban interventions in numerous historic districts (including Barrio Candelaria in Bogotá, Colombia, pictured) swiftly increase property values favouring gentrification               | 63 |
| 3.7  | The housing gap in low-cost residential markets  | 65 |
| 3.8  | An upfront subsidy by the South African government permits to purchase a house like this one, located in Freedom Park, Western Cape  | 72 |
| 4.1  | View of the units built in Nueva Choluteca   | 80 |
| 4.2  | Vernacular housing typologies and higher densities in old Choluteca create graceful urban spaces   | 81 |
| 4.3  | An abandoned house in Nueva Choluteca  | 82 |
| 4.4  | Low-cost housing projects in South Africa have favoured detached units built in relatively large plots   | 85 |
| 4.5  | Layout of a semi-detached unit in Netreg   | 88 |
| 4.6  | Urban layout in Netreg   | 88 |
| 4.7  | The idea of a “house” is closely related to a freestanding unit—even among urban children (certainly talented artists) raised in this township in Gugulethu, South Africa              | 90 |
| 4.8  | The urban layout in Freedom Park deliberately creates an enclosed community, aiming to avoid social conflicts with neighbouring communities  | 93 |
| 5.1  | Cité Lajoie, Haiti, has grown in the past ten years as housing deficits in Port-au-Prince have increased   | 97 |
| 5.2  | Most housing constructions in Cité Lajoie start with a temporary structure built with wood sticks, fabric and plastics, materials that get quickly replaced by corrugated iron sheets  | 97 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 5.3  | Managers of the informal enterprises in Khayelitsha Shacks and Township Shacks  | 100 |
| 5.4  | This exhibition of prefab shacks in Lansdowne, a main road in Khayelitsha, becomes a sales point for informal construction companies                                      | 101 |
| 5.5  | The core product of Township Shacks   | 101 |
| 5.6  | Transportation means used by Khayelitsha Shacks   | 102 |
| 5.7  | A common pattern of land occupation permitted women to conduct domestic activities while overseeing open and public areas in Mfuleni                                      | 105 |
| 5.8  | Murder incidents per capita (1:10,000) in various townships in the Cape Flats   | 107 |
| 5.9  | Transformations to housing units in Choluteca followed a common pattern   | 109 |
| 5.10 | Frequent transformations to housing units in Choluteca aimed at integrating productive activities or building additional rooms for extended families                      | 110 |
| 6.1  | Urban designers in Juan Pablo II proposed a central park in the middle of the settlement, sport facilities, reduced roads for cars and efficient pathways for pedestrians | 119 |
| 6.2  | Extensions built by homeowners in the backyards of the core-units appeared very quickly in Juan Pablo II  | 121 |
| 6.3  | After occupation, residents of Juan Pablo II personalized the unit façades and created playground areas in open spaces  | 122 |
| 6.4  | Upgrading of the units often included plastering interior walls and laying ceramic tiles on the floors  | 122 |
| 6.5  | Decision-makers prescribed the designs and specifications of the additions to the core-units  | 123 |
| 6.6  | In the infrastructure of Favela Santa Marta, cantilevered sidewalks create a network of safe pathways that facilitate access to the upper units on the mountain.          | 124 |
| 6.7  | Defying all expectations, a soccer field was constructed on the steep mountain, providing an important recreational facility for residents of Favela Santa Marta          | 125 |
| 7.1  | Housing construction in flood-prone areas, such as this one in Yumbo, Colombia, put people at risk and exacerbate the effects of disasters                                | 131 |
| 7.2  | Where is the missing column? Weak structures such as this one in an informal settlement in Cali, Colombia, contribute to create physical vulnerabilities                  | 131 |
| 7.3  | Community Architect Offices contribute to create a resilient built environment in Cuba, providing guidance and support to households in the community                     | 135 |
| 7.4  | Hundreds of tents and temporary units were quickly installed in the Champ de Mars and other public spaces of Port-au-Prince after the 2010 earthquake                     | 137 |
| 7.5  | Rudimentary temporary units built in Armenia, Colombia, after the 1999 earthquake   | 138 |

|       |   |     |
|-------|---|-----|
| 7.6   | Temporary housing solutions were built by the local NGO FUNDASAL in rural areas of El Salvador after the 2001 earthquakes   | 139 |
| 7.7   | FUNDASAL built thousands of temporary and permanent units in the region of La Paz, El Salvador  | 139 |
| 7.8   | Part of the problem or part of the solution? Concrete blocks produced by informal companies in Delmas lie in a temporary camp after the 2010 earthquake in Haiti                              | 143 |
| 8.1   | Coffee growers proposed different types of individual projects to the CGOs  | 149 |
| 8.2   | Beneficiaries of the CGOs program worked through self-help or hired formal and informal construction companies  | 150 |
| 8.3   | Prefabricated houses were presented in the housing exhibition organized by the CGOs   | 151 |
| 8.4   | Beneficiaries of the CGOs program enjoyed the freedom to choose the type of project they wanted, and needed, to build   | 153 |
| 8.5   | Owner-driven approaches have been successfully implemented in Gujarat, India, in the last decade  | 153 |
| 9.1   | A framework for rethinking and designing low-cost housing in developing countries, based on an approach to social justice   | 177 |
| 10.1  | Backyard dwellings in South Africa are often seen as part of the “housing problem”  | 182 |
| 10.2  | A slum in the “ <i>cerros orientales</i> ” in Bogotá  | 183 |
| 10.3  | Informal housing units get dangerously close to railways, highways and rivers in many cities, including Hanoi, which sometimes requires the relocation of families                            | 184 |
| 10.4  | Innovative ideas are required for technical solutions to complement the products and services of the informal sector  | 185 |
| 10.5  | Squatters in public spaces are common in most cities in the Global South, including Shanghai  | 186 |
| 10.6  | Landlords and unit owners can find it difficult to keep up with maintenance and to upgrade multi-family buildings   | 187 |
| 10.7  | Market-driven development aimed at preserving the historical value of collective housing structures, such as <i>inquilinos</i> in Barrio Las Cruces in Bogotá, tends to displace poor tenants | 188 |
| 10.8  | Special attention must be paid to guaranteeing that improvements to collective forms of housing, such as <i>mesones</i> in El Salvador, continue to benefit original residents                | 189 |
| 10.9  | Rapid urbanization is challenging the sustainability of human settlements in developing countries   | 190 |
| 10.10 | Innovative ways of consolidating and improving existing housing are required in developing countries  | 193 |
| 10.11 | Whereas steady housing stock upgrades allow households to climb the housing ladder, an abrupt increase in property values might result in housing solutions “trickling up” in the market      | 195 |
| 10.12 | Quinta Monroy, Iquique, Chile   | 196 |
| 10.13 | Quinta Monroy, Iquique, Chile   | 197 |



|       |   |     |
|-------|---|-----|
| 10.14 | Quinta Monroy, Iquique, Chile   | 197 |
| 10.15 | Villa Verde, Constitución, Chile  | 198 |
| 10.16 | Villa Verde, Constitución, Chile  | 198 |
| 10.17 | Villa Verde, Constitución, Chile  | 199 |
| 10.18 | Villa Verde, Constitución, Chile  | 199 |
| 10.19 | Urban newcomers bring rural forms of space appropriation and occupation with them   | 203 |
| 10.20 | Careful observation and understanding of human settlements allows us to see the aesthetic value of informal constructions such as this one in Barrio Las Cruces in Bogotá, Colombia | 204 |
| 10.21 | Sketches of informal constructions and appropriation of open space in Haïti and Hanoi   | 205 |