



Cognition

THE
THINKING
ANIMAL

DANIEL B. WILLINGHAM

www.prenhall.com/willingham
COMPANION WEBSITE™



Cognition

The Thinking Animal

Daniel B. Willingham

University of Virginia



Upper Saddle River, New Jersey 07458

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Willingham, Daniel B.

Cognition : the thinking animal / Daniel B. Willingham.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-13-028699-0

1. Cognitive psychology. I. Title.

BF201.W56 2001

153—dc21

00-047882

VP/Editorial Director: *Laura Pearson*

Acquisitions Editor: *Jayne Heffler*

Editorial Assistant: *April Klemm*

AVP/Director of Production and Manufacturing: *Barbara Kittle*

Director of Marketing: *Beth Gillet Mejia*

Marketing Manager: *Sharon Cosgrove*

Managing Editor: *Mary Rottino*

Project Manager: *Alison Gnerre*

Production Assistant: *Elizabeth Best*

Prepress and Manufacturing Manager: *Nick Sklitsis*

Prepress and Manufacturing Buyer: *Tricia Kenny*

Interior Design: *Bruce Hobart (Pine Tree Composition)*

Line Art Manager: *Guy Ruggiero*

Art Director: *Jayne Conte*

Cover Design: *Bruce Kenselaar*

Electronic Illustrations: *Mirella Signoretto*

Director, Image Resource Center: *Melinda Reo*

Photo Research Supervisor: *Beth Boyd*

Image Permission Supervisor: *Kay Delloso*

Photo Researcher: *Karen Pugliano*

Cover Art: *Auguste Rodin/Explorer, Paris/Superstock, Inc.*

Acknowledgments for copyrighted material may be found beginning on p. 590, which constitutes an extension of this copyright page.

This book was set in 10/12 Trump Mediaeval by Pub-Set
and was printed by R. R. Donnelley/Harrisonburg.
The cover was printed by Phoenix.

Prentice
Hall

© 2001 by Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Upper Saddle River, New Jersey 07458

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form
or by any means, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

ISBN 0-13-028699-0

Prentice-Hall International (UK) Limited, *London*

Prentice-Hall of Australia Pty. Limited, *Sydney*

Prentice-Hall Canada Inc., *Toronto*

Prentice-Hall Hispanoamericana, S.A., *Mexico*

Prentice-Hall of India Private Limited, *New Delhi*

Prentice-Hall of Japan, Inc., *Tokyo*

Pearson Education Asia Pte. Ltd., *Singapore*

Editora Prentice-Hall do Brasil, Ltda., *Rio de Janeiro*

*This book is dedicated
to my parents*

Cognition

PREFACE

A long-standing goal of human enquiry is to understand ourselves. How can we characterize the human species? Here are some of the better-known proposals:

Man is by nature a political animal—Aristotle

Man is a noble animal—Sir Thomas Browne

Man is a tool-using animal—Thomas Carlyle

Man is a reasoning animal—Seneca

Man is a social animal—Benedict Spinoza

Man is a rational animal who always loses his temper when he is called upon to act in accordance with the dictates of reason—Oscar Wilde.

I would propose that all of these proposals are, in a sense, correct, but they are all rooted in another characteristic. We are able to act politically, to use tools effectively, to understand nobility, etc., because of our ability to *think*. The heart of the matter is that we are thinking animals, and it is thinking that affords these other abilities or, at least, affords our having these abilities in the manner that we do. The book you are reading is a study of cognition—of how humans think.

This book is intended for students taking their first course in cognitive psychology. No background knowledge in psychology or statistics is presupposed. As is typical of other books designed for such a course, the book is organized around the major subject areas of cognitive psychology, and most of the book can be covered over the course of a semester. Again, as is typical of cognitive psychology textbooks, the coverage begins at what may be loosely thought of as lower-level processes, and proceeds toward higher-level processes.

There are three things I would like you to know about this book: what I have done regarding its readability, what I have done regarding pedagogy, and how I have handled the inclusion of material from cognitive neuroscience.

➤ READABILITY

I have friends throughout the country who teach introductory cognitive psychology at their college or university. None of them ever says something like, “My students are crowding office hours, calling me at home, and filling my email in-box demanding to know more, more, more cognitive psychology! They love it like a mouse loves cheese!” The comments of my friends usually run

more along the lines of, "They hate the subject matter, hate the course, hate the book, hate me."

Why? I don't know, but it has been the guiding force in my writing this book. *My goal is to have a class full of students who have done the assigned reading, and who are excited by cognitive psychology.* The way to do that, I think, is to communicate what makes cognitive psychology interesting. To be honest, I've never cared much for the way that other textbooks have sought to keep students interested. The usual strategy is to include lots of "real world" examples and lots of demonstrations, usually found in little boxes that appear every few pages. This strategy seems to confirm the reader's growing suspicion that they are bored by sending the implicit message, "Yes, yes, I know this stuff is boring, but hang in there, and every few pages I'll toss in one of those boxes with a demonstration or real-world application to keep you going."

I've done three things in this book to try to arouse the reader's interest in the material:

1. I have tried to be careful about making the questions that motivate cognitive psychologists explicit. I think the questions we ask are of interest to a lot of people, but we don't always do the best job of explaining the questions in any detail. We plunge right into the answers, and the answers seem arcane and removed from anything anyone would care about. Each chapter in this book is organized around two or three straightforward questions that are easy to appreciate, and the importance of which are explained in detail.
2. To the extent possible, I have used a narrative structure. By that I mean that there are causal links within and across chapter sections, so that it makes it more clear *why* you are reading something. Nothing is more boring than a list of unconnected facts.
3. I have tried to write in a non-stilted, not-especially-academic style.

Despite the light tone, this book is not light in content. As you can see by flipping through any given chapter, I cover the major topics in each sub-area of the field. (An easy way to check the coverage is by examining the "key terms" section at the end of each chapter.) Included in the coverage of almost all of these topics are significant details from landmark experiments, including the methodology, graphs of results, and so on. Again, a lighter tone should not be interpreted as indicating lighter coverage.

➤ PEDAGOGY

Readability is fine, but the goal of a textbook is, after all, that students learn the material. Different students like and use different pedagogical features, so I've included a few different ones to help them learn.

- Brief **previews** of each section pose the broad questions and provide the broad answers contained in the section.

- **Key terms** are identified by bold-face type, and are defined immediately thereafter. They are also collected in a glossary.
- Each section closes with a series of questions. The **Stand-on-one-foot summary questions** simply ask the student to summarize what they have learned in the section they have just read. I call them stand-on-one-foot-summaries after the talmudic story of the heretic who went to great sages, asking each to summarize all of the Torah in the time that he could stand on one foot. (He finally found a willing sage in Hillel who quoted from Leviticus, "What is hateful to you, do not to others.") Thus, the idea is simply to get the reader to pause for a moment and make sure they understood the major points by summarizing what they have just read.
- The end of each section also includes questions that require considerably more thought; the student will need to apply what he or she has just learned to new situations, or to go beyond the material in some way. I call these **Questions that require two feet**. Answers to all questions are provided at the close of each chapter.
- There is a companion web site <http://www.prenhall.com/willingham> to accompany the text, authored by Robert Bramucci of the California State University, Fullerton. The web site includes an online study guide for students (lots of self-test questions in different formats), a recap and summary of each chapter, links to relevant sites on the internet, and more.

Another feature of this book that I think students and professors will find useful is the Appendix. This book assumes no background knowledge on the part of the student, but an appreciation of the work in cognitive psychology often requires knowledge of statistical or methodological concepts. The Appendix contains background information and explanations of several concepts (e.g., statistical significance) that may be familiar to a student who has taken other psychology courses, but that a beginning student may not know. In order to maintain the flow of the book, these explanations are collected in the Appendix.

► THE BRAIN

There is no doubt that the influence of neuroscience on cognitive psychology is substantial, and it is increasing. This trend poses a problem for the writers of textbooks, and the teachers of cognitive psychology courses. Cognitive neuroscience can easily fill a semester-long course, and indeed, there are stand-alone texts on the subject. Further, discussion of this work presupposes some background in neuroscience. How, then, to fairly represent the impact of cognitive neuroscience on cognitive psychology without making the course twice as long, and without setting another prerequisite for the students?

I have tried to represent the state of the field, including key findings from cognitive neuroscience, and at the same time to give the instructor some flexibility. The chapters of this book make reference to key neuroscientific studies where appropriate; there are certain findings that have had such an impact on

cognitive psychology that they simply must be part of any course. I have tried to describe these findings in a way that assumes no background on the part of the student.

For the instructor who prefers a greater emphasis on cognitive neuroscience, I have included additional materials. The "Brain Interlude" that follows Chapter 1 introduces the student to the rationale behind cognitive neuroscientific studies, the methods they use, and a brief introduction to brain anatomy. Throughout the rest of the book, key studies from cognitive neuroscience are discussed in boxes set off from the main text. These experiments were selected with an eye towards exposing students to a variety of methods and some of the key issues in cognitive neuroscience. Those instructors who place less emphasis on cognitive neuroscientific approaches can, of course, instruct students to simply skip over this material.

I hope that I have written a textbook that will make students enthusiastic about this field, and will make them want to know more than they can find in this book. Hillel's answer to the impatient heretic is not always quoted in full; after providing the summary of the Torah, Hillel added, "Now go and study," acknowledging that a one-sentence summary was bound to be lacking, and that the heretic should learn more. I have not succeeded in summarizing cognitive psychology in a sentence, but I can add the entreaty; I hope that this book will serve as a starting point from which students will want to learn still more about the field.

I would greatly appreciate feedback and suggestions regarding this text. It is easiest to reach me via electronic mail: willingham@virginia.edu

► ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Discovering what you do not know and the extent to which you must lean on others when writing a textbook is a humbling experience. This humility comes into sharp focus when writing acknowledgments. I have had to resist the urge to catalogue the many persons who were of assistance ("Mad love and a big shout-out to that guy who gave me a dime for the Xerox machine in the library!") and will try limit my thanks to those people whose contributions were quite direct.

I am very grateful to the team of people at Prentice Hall who transformed the messy sheets I sent them into the book you hold: Mary Rottino was ever vigilant as managing editor in all matters; Alison Gnerre beautifully combined the calm actions and faint air of desperation characteristic of an effective production editor; Jayne Conte and Bruce Kenselaar are responsible for the beautiful cover; and Guy Ruggiero and Mirella Signoretto remade my scribbles into the clear line art you see here. My thanks, too, to Sharon Cosgrove, marketing manager, and Ronald Fox, marketing assistant, for their work to ensure people know about the book, and to Tricia Kenny as prepress and manufacturing buyer. April Dawn Klemm was an excellent jack-of-all-trades as editorial assistant. I also thank Andy Snyder for his help in preparing the index. Eric Stano was my first editor and had much to do with shaping the book to its current form. I'm

especially grateful to Jayme Heffler, who had the difficult task of stepping into the editorial process in mid-stream, a job she consistently performed with great skill, common sense, and good humor. I'm very grateful to all for their hard work.

I also offer sincere thanks to my colleagues who reviewed earlier versions of chapters: Thomas R. Alley, Clemson University; Terri Bonebright, De Pauw University; Linda S. Buyer, Governor's State University; Stephen Christman, University of Toledo; Jane Marie Clipman, Lafayette College; Peter Derks, The College of William and Mary; Bob Ferguson, Buena Vista University; Diana Heise, Millsaps College; Richard L. Marsh, University of Georgia; Danielle McNamara, Old Dominion University; Kristy A. Nielson, Marquette University; and Marilyn L. Turner, Wichita State University. Their thoughtful, careful reviews led to substantial changes in the format and the details of the book. I have reviewed textbooks for publishers and can attest to the fact that no one does it for the honorarium; it is a service to the field, and I greatly appreciate it.

I have had the remarkable good fortune to learn from and work with some great cognitive psychologists, all of whom are also gentle, warm-hearted people. My thanks to my graduate school advisors—Bill Estes, Steve Kosslyn, and Mary Jo Nissen—who were so generous with their time and wisdom. John Gabrieli has also been an enduring influence as a colleague and friend. I'm also grateful to my cognitive colleagues at the University of Virginia—Michael Kubovy, Denny Proffitt, Tim Salthouse, and Bobbie Spellman—for their helpfulness with particular questions, for their encouragement in all matters, and for making it fun to come to work.

Finally, my special thanks to my parents, who have been patient and supportive guides throughout my life. I dedicate this book to them, for the advices.

Daniel B. Willingham
University of Virginia

CONTENTS

Preface xv

1

The Approach of Cognitive Psychology 1

Why Make Assumptions? 3

How Did Philosophers and Early Psychologists Study the Mind? 6

Philosophical Underpinnings 6

The Beginnings of Modern Psychology 13

The Response: Behaviorism 15

Behaviorism's Success 17

How Do Cognitive Psychologists Study the Mind? 21

What Behaviorism Couldn't Do 21

Failures of Behaviorism to Account for Human Behavior 23

The Computer Metaphor and Information Processing 26

The Behaviorist Response 28

Abstract Constructs in Other Fields 29

So What, Finally, Is the Cognitive Perspective? 32

Interlude: The Brain 36

Where Is the Damage? 38

Where Is the Activation? 41

The Behavioral Side of the Equation 44

Lesion Studies 45

Imaging Studies 45

Problems and Limitations 46

Cognitive Neuropsychology 48

The Five-Minute Brain Anatomy Lesson 49

2

Visual Perception 54

What Makes Visual Perception Hard? 56

► Box 2.1. Is Face Perception Special? 60

How Are These Ambiguities Resolved? 62*Shape* 63*Brightness Perception* 65*Distance and Size* 69*Top-Down Influences in Vision* 75*An Alternative Point of View: The Ecological Approach
to Visual Perception* 78**What Is Visual Perception For? 83***Identifying Objects* 84*Older Theories* 85*Navigation* 92

- **Box 2.2. Functional Imaging Evidence Bearing on the Representation
of Space in the Temporal Lobe** 96

3**Attention 100****In What Way Is Attention Limited? 103***Parallel Performance* 104*Changes in Task Performance* 106*Consistent Attention Requirements* 109*Summary of Difficulties* 113*Allocation of Attention* 114*Reduction in Attention Demands with Practice: Automaticity* 115**What Is the Fate of Sensory Stimuli That Are Not Selected
to Receive Attention? 121***Early Filter Theories* 123*Late Filter Theories* 124*Movable Filter* 127*What Is Selected?* 128

- **Box 3.1. Neural Evidence for Selection of Objects by Attention** 131

How Does Selection Operate? 132**Why Does Selection Fail? 135***Stimuli That Capture Attention* 136*Feature Singletons* 137*Ironic Process of Mental Control* 138*Maintaining Attention: Vigilance* 140

- **Box 3.2. Vigilance and Laterality** 141

4**Sensory Memory and Primary Memory 145****What Is Sensory Memory? 147***Early Span of Apprehension Studies* 148*Sperling's Partial Report Procedure* 149

- Further Work* 154
 - What Is Iconic Memory For?* 157
 - Echoic Memory* 159
- **Box 4.1. Tracking Auditory Sensory Memory** 160
- What Are the Characteristics of Primary Memory?** 164
 - Impetus to Study Primary Memory* 164
 - How Forgetting Occurs* 166
 - Representation* 170
 - Capacity* 172
- How Does Primary Memory Work?** 176
 - Models of Primary Memory* 177
 - Working Memory* 178
- **Box 4.2. The Neural Basis of Working Memory** 179
- **Box 4.3. The Loss of the Phonological Store** 182
 - Primary Memory Contributions to Secondary Memory Tasks* 185
 - Working Memory as a Workspace* 187

5

Memory Encoding 192

- What Determines What We Encode in Memory?** 194
 - Factor 1: Emotion Engendered by the Material* 194
- **Box 5.1. Emotional Processing and Recall of Emotional Information** 197
 - Factor 2: Repetition of the Material* 200
 - Factor 3: Depth, or Thinking About the Meaning of the Material* 202
 - Factor 4: Effort to Learn the Material* 205
 - Interim Summary* 206
 - Depth and Elaboration* 207
 - Problems with the Levels of Processing Theory* 209
 - Match Between Encoding and Retrieval: Transfer Appropriate Processing* 209
- **Box 5.2. What Is Remembered, What Is Forgotten?** 212
 - Match Between Encoding and Retrieval: Physical Environment* 213
 - Conclusion* 215
- Why Do We Encode Things as We Do?** 216
 - Prior Knowledge Reduces What You Have to Remember* 218
 - Prior Knowledge Guides Your Interpretation of Details* 219
 - Prior Knowledge Makes Unusual Things Stand Out* 222
- What Happens After We Encode Something?** 225
 - Retrograde and Anterograde Amnesia* 225
 - Proving That There Is a Temporal Gradient* 227
- **Box 5.3. Direct Evidence of Changes in Memory Across Time** 230
 - Consolidation* 231
 - What Does Consolidation Mean for Memory?* 233

6

Memory Retrieval 235**How Come Sometimes We Can Retrieve a Memory
and Other Times We Can't Retrieve the Same Memory? 236**

- Measures of Memory* 237
- Sensitivity of Memory Measures* 240
- Differences in Cues* 243
- Encoding and Retrieval Redux* 245
- Retrieval Cues and Memory Test Sensitivity* 247

➤ **Box 6.1. The Frontal Lobe and Memory Retrieval 252**

- Retrieval and Prior Knowledge* 253

➤ **Box 6.2. Functional Imaging Studies of the Frontal Lobe and Memory 256**

- Mnemonics: A Framework for Retrieval* 257

Why Do We Forget? 259

- Decay Theory* 259
- Interference Theory* 261
- The Permanence of Memory* 265
- Forgetting Caused by Repression* 271

7

Memory Storage 279**What Is in the Storehouse? 280**

- The Classical View* 282
- Typicality Effects* 284
- Category Hierarchy* 287
- Prototypes* 290
- Exemplar Models* 292
- Problems with Similarity Models* 295

➤ **Box 7.1. Functional Imaging Evidence on the Difference Between Rule
Application and Similarity Judgments in Categorization 296**

- Summary* 299

How Is Memory Organized? 300

- Addressing System* 300
- Content-Addressable Storage* 301
- Hierarchical Theory* 303
- Spreading Activation Theories* 305
- Spreading Activation Models: An Example* 307
- Evidence of Activation* 309
- Criticisms of Spreading Activation* 311
- Distributed Representation (Parallel Distributed Processing)* 311

➤ **Box 7.2. How Are Concepts Organized in the Brain? 314**

- Criticisms of Parallel Distributed Processing Models* 316

What Else Is in Memory? 317*What Are Separate Memory Systems?* 318*Procedural and Declarative Memory* 318**► Box 7.3. Functional Imaging Evidence of Procedural/Declarative Memory 322***Support from Studies with Control Participants* 325*Criticism of the Multiple-System Approach* 329*Coda* 331**8****Visual Imagery 333****What Purpose Does Visual Imagery Serve? 335***Imagery in Early Psychology* 336*Imagery Reenters Psychology* 336*Imagery and Perception* 343**► Box 8.1. The Overlap of Imagery and Perceptual Processes 344****Are Visual Images Supported by a Separate Representation System? 349***The Role of Introspection: Imagery as an Epiphenomenon* 350*The Metaphor Is Misleading* 351*Demand Characteristics and Tacit Knowledge* 351*Propositional Versus Analog Representation* 352*Imagery Theorists Fight Back* 355**► Box 8.2. The Visual Angle of the Mind's Eye and Available Cortex 360****How Does Visual Imagery Work? 364***Image Generation* 364*Image Inspection* 370*Image Transformation* 374**► Box 8.3. Direct Evidence for Smooth Rotation 378****9****Decision Making and Deductive Reasoning 382****Do People Consistently Make Optimal Decisions? 384***Normative or Rational Models* 384*Demonstrations of Human Irrationality* 387**What Shortcuts Do People Use to Make Decisions? 393***Representativeness* 393*Availability* 394*Anchoring and Adjustment* 396*Information That We Ignore* 397**► Box 9.1. Decision Making and Emotion: The Somatic Marker Hypothesis 402**

Summary 403
Alternative Concepts of Optimality 404

Do People Reason Logically? 409

Formal Logic 410

➤ **Box 9.2. Are Inductive and Deductive Reasoning Supported by Different Brain Structures? 412**

Human Success and Failure in Reasoning: Conditional Statements 416

Human Success and Failure in Reasoning: Syllogisms 421

General Models of Reasoning 424

Rational Analysis Models 431

➤ **Box 9.3. Mental Models, Spatial Reasoning, and Brain Imaging 432**

Summary 434

10 Problem Solving 436

How Do You Solve a Problem if You Have Had No Experience With Similar Problems? 438

Problem Spaces 438

What Do You Do When You Have Knowledge That Seems to Apply to a Problem but No Experience with the Specific Problem? 448

How Background Knowledge Helps 448

➤ **Box 10.1. Using Background Knowledge: The Role of the Frontal Lobe 450**

Thinking About the Relationships Between Objects in a Problem: Analogy 452

Thinking About the Attributes of Individual Objects in a Problem: Functional Fixedness 457

What Makes People Good at Solving Problems? 470

How Do Experts Differ From Novices? 470

How Do You Get to Be an Expert? 473

What Makes Nonexperts Good at Solving Problems? 476

➤ **Box 10.2. Functional Imaging of Problem Solving and Working Memory 478**

11 Language 485

What Is Language, and What Makes Language Processing Difficult? 487

What Is Language? 488

Grammar 493

How Are Ambiguities Resolved? 499

Words 502

►	Box 11.1. Functional Imaging of Single Word Processing	506
	<i>Sentences</i>	509
	<i>Texts</i>	516
►	Box 11.2. Functional Activation of Syntactic Processing	512
	How Are Language and Thought Related?	524
	<i>Ape Language</i>	525
	<i>Language and Thought</i>	529
	Appendix	537
	Answers to Questions	540
	Glossary	556
	References	568
	Credits	590
	Author Index	594
	Subject Index	601