

A Bill of Rights
as provided in the Ten Original Amendments to
The Constitution of the United States
in force December 15, 1791.

THE FIRST AMENDMENT

FREEDOM OF ASSEMBLY AND PETITION

Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

Article IV

The right of the people to be secure in their persons, houses, papers, and effects, against unreasonable searches and seizures, shall not be violated, and no Warrants shall issue, but upon probable cause, supported by Oath or affirmation, and particularly describing the place to be searched, and the persons or things to be seized.

Article V

No person shall be held to answer for a capital, or otherwise infamous crime, unless on a presentment or indictment of a Grand Jury, except in cases arising in the land or naval forces, or in the Militia, when in actual service in time of War or public danger; nor shall any person be subject for the same offence to be twice put in jeopardy of life or limb; nor shall be compelled in any Criminal Case to be a witness against himself, nor be deprived of life, liberty,

of trial by jury shall be preserved, and no fact tried by a jury shall be otherwise re-examined in any Court of the United States, than according to the rules of the common law.

Article VIII

Excessive bail shall not be required, nor excessive fines imposed, nor cruel and unusual punishments inflicted.

Article IX

The enumeration in the Constitution, of certain rights, shall not be construed to deny or disparage others retained by the people.

Article X

The powers not delegated to the United States by the Constitution, nor prohibited by it to the States, are reserved to the States respectively, or to the people.



Regards
Harry J. Hawes

EDITED BY MARGARET M. RUSSELL

Published 2010 by Prometheus Books

Freedom of Assembly and Petition (The First Amendment): Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate. Copyright © 2010 by Margaret M. Russell. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, digital, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, or conveyed via the Internet or a Web site without prior written permission of the publisher, except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews.

Inquiries should be addressed to

Prometheus Books

59 John Glenn Drive

Amherst, New York 14228-2119

VOICE: 716-691-0133

FAX: 716-691-0137

WWW.PROMETHEUSBOOKS.COM

14 13 12 11 10 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Russell, Margaret M.

The First Amendment, freedom of assembly and petition : its constitutional history and the contemporary debate / edited by Margaret M. Russell.

p. cm. — (Bill of Rights series)

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-59102-777-5 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Assembly, Right of—United States. 2. Assembly, Right of—United States—History.
3. Petition, Right of—United States. 4. Petition, Right of—United States—History.

I. Russell, Margaret M.

KF4778.F743 2010

342.7308'54—dc22

2009039249

Printed in the United States of America

Portions of "Petitions" and "Women and Freedom of Expression before the Twentieth Century" originally appeared in *Rampant Women: Suffragists and the Right to Assembly* by Linda J. Lumsden. Copyright © 1997 by the University of Tennessee Press.

Used with permission.

TITLES AVAILABLE IN THE BILL OF RIGHTS SERIES

THE FIRST AMENDMENT

*The Establishment of Religion Clause: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Alan Brownstein

Freedom of the Press: Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

Edited by Garrett Epps

*The Free Exercise of Religion Clause: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Thomas C. Berg

Freedom of Speech: Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

Edited by Vikram David Amar

*Freedom of Assembly and Petition: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Margaret M. Russell

THE FOURTH AMENDMENT

Searches and Seizures

Edited by Cynthia Lee

BILL OF RIGHTS SERIES

Series Editor:

David B. Oppenheimer, *Clinical Professor of Law and Director of Professional Skills
University of California, Berkeley, School of Law*

Advisory Committee

Erwin Chemerinsky

*Dean and Professor of Law,
University of California, Irvine,
School of Law*

Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow

*Professor of Law; A. B. Chettle, Jr., Chair in
Dispute Resolution and Civil Procedure,
Georgetown University Law Center*

Jesse Choper

*Earl Warren Professor of Public Law,
University of California, Berkeley,
School of Law (Boalt Hall)*

Robert C. Post

*David Boies Professor of Law,
Yale Law School*

Sheila Rose Foster

*Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and
Albert A. Walsh Professor of Law,
Fordham Law School*

john powell

*Professor of Law, Gregory H. Williams Chair
in Civil Rights and Civil Liberties;
Executive Director, Kirwan Institute for the
Study of Race and Ethnicity,
Ohio State University,
Michael E. Moritz College of Law*

Cheryl Harris

*Professor of Law,
University of California, Los Angeles,
School of Law*

Deborah L. Rhode

*Ernest W. McFarland Professor of Law,
Stanford Law School*

Marjorie Heins

*Founder and Director,
Free Expression Policy Project (FEPP)*

Stephanie M. Wildman

*Professor of Law and Director for the Center
for Social Justice & Public Service,
Santa Clara University School of Law*

Kevin R. Johnson

*Dean and Mabie-Apallas Professor of
Public Interest Law and Chicana/o Studies,
University of California, Davis,
School of Law (King Hall)*

Eric Ken Yamamoto

*Professor of Law,
University of Hawaii, William S. Richardson
School of Law*

**THE FIRST AMENDMENT
FREEDOM
OF ASSEMBLY
AND PETITION**

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	15
Series Editor's Preface <i>David B. Oppenheimer</i>	17
Editor's Introduction <i>Margaret M. Russell</i>	21
PART I. "THE RIGHT OF THE PEOPLE": ASSEMBLY AND PETITION AS A UNITARY CLAUSE	25
Freedom's Associations <i>Jason Mazzone</i>	26
A Right of Access to Court under the Petition Clause of the First Amendment: Defining the Right <i>Carol Rice Andrews</i>	32

10 CONTENTS

The Bill of Rights as a Constitution <i>Akbil Reed Amar</i>	36
----------------------------------------------------------------	----

PART II. “. . . TO PETITION THE GOVERNMENT FOR A REDRESS OF GRIEVANCES”	43
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------

CHAPTER 1. ORIGINS AND EARLY HISTORY

The Vestigial Constitution: The History and Significance of the Right to Petition <i>Gregory A. Mark</i>	47
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

“Petitions” from <i>Rampant Women: Suffragists and the Right to Assembly</i> <i>Linda J. Lumsden</i>	60
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

A Short History of the Right to Petition Government for the Redress of Grievances <i>Stephen A. Higginson</i>	66
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Initiative Petition Reforms and the First Amendment <i>Emily Calhoun</i>	69
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

John Quincy Adams, Slavery, and the Disappearance of the Right to Petition <i>David C. Frederick</i>	72
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

CHAPTER 2. SCOPE AND MEANING

The First Amendment Right to Petition Government for a Redress of Grievances: Cut from a Different Cloth <i>Julie M. Spanbauer</i>	85
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

A Right of Access to Court under the Petition Clause of the First Amendment: Defining the Right <i>Carol Rice Andrews</i>	94
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

“Shall Make No Law Abridging . . .”: An Analysis of the Neglected, but Nearly Absolute, Right of Petition	104
<i>Norman B. Smith</i>	

Sovereign Immunity and the Right to Petition: Toward a First Amendment Right to Pursue Judicial Claims against the Government	110
<i>James E. Pfander</i>	

Downsizing the Right to Petition	119
<i>Gary Lawson and Guy Seidman</i>	

CHAPTER 3. CONTEMPORARY DEBATE

“Libelous” Petitions for Redress of Grievances: Bad Historiography Makes Worse Law	129
<i>Eric Schnapper</i>	

The Return of Seditious Libel	134
<i>Ronald J. Krotoszynski Jr. and Clint A. Carpenter</i>	

Antitrust Immunity, the First Amendment and Settlements: Defining the Boundaries of the Right to Petition	142
<i>Raymond Ku</i>	

“Strategic Lawsuits Against Public Participation” (SLAPPs): An Introduction for Bench, Bar, and Bystanders	151
<i>George W. Pring and Penelope Canan</i>	

Petitioning and the Empowerment Theory of Practice	160
<i>Anita Hodgkiss</i>	

Immigrants and the Right to Petition	170
<i>Michael J. Wishnie</i>	

**PART III. “. . . THE RIGHT OF THE PEOPLE
PEACEABLY TO ASSEMBLE . . .” 185**

CHAPTER 1. ORIGINS AND EARLY HISTORY

The Intent of the Framers 189
M. Glenn Abernathy

Women and Freedom of Expression before the Twentieth Century 195
Linda J. Lumsden

Freedom's Associations 200
Jason Mazzone

The Neglected Right of Assembly 205
Tabatha Abu El-Haj

CHAPTER 2. ASSEMBLY AND ASSOCIATION

Hanging with the Wrong Crowd: Of Gangs, Terrorists,
and the Right of Association 207
David Cole

Freedom of Association: An Introductory Essay 217
Amy Gutmann

CHAPTER 3. CONTEMPORARY DEBATE

Hanging with the Wrong Crowd: Of Gangs, Terrorists,
and the Right of Association 225
David Cole

Speaking in the First Person Plural: Expressive Associations
and the First Amendment 234
Daniel A. Farber

CONTENTS 13

Association and Assimilation	241
<i>Deborah L. Rhode</i>	

The Expressive Interest of Associations	250
<i>Erwin Chemerinsky and Catherine Fisk</i>	

The Neglected Right of Assembly	255
<i>Tabatha Abu El-Haj</i>	

APPENDIXES

Constitution of the United States of America	261
----------------------------------------------	-----

The Amendments to the Constitution	277
------------------------------------	-----

TITLES AVAILABLE IN THE BILL OF RIGHTS SERIES

THE FIRST AMENDMENT

*The Establishment of Religion Clause: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Alan Brownstein

Freedom of the Press: Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

Edited by Garrett Epps

*The Free Exercise of Religion Clause: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Thomas C. Berg

Freedom of Speech: Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

Edited by Vikram David Amar



*Freedom of Assembly and Petition: Its Constitutional History
and the Contemporary Debate*

Edited by Margaret M. Russell

THE FOURTH AMENDMENT

Searches and Seizures

Edited by Cynthia Lee

BILL OF RIGHTS SERIES

Series Editor:

David B. Oppenheimer, *Clinical Professor of Law and Director of Professional Skills
University of California, Berkeley, School of Law*

Advisory Committee

Erwin Chemerinsky

*Dean and Professor of Law,
University of California, Irvine,
School of Law*

Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow

*Professor of Law; A. B. Chettle, Jr., Chair in
Dispute Resolution and Civil Procedure,
Georgetown University Law Center*

Jesse Choper

*Earl Warren Professor of Public Law,
University of California, Berkeley,
School of Law (Boalt Hall)*

Robert C. Post

*David Boies Professor of Law,
Yale Law School*

Sheila Rose Foster

*Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and
Albert A. Walsh Professor of Law,
Fordham Law School*

john powell

*Professor of Law, Gregory H. Williams Chair
in Civil Rights and Civil Liberties;
Executive Director, Kirwan Institute for the
Study of Race and Ethnicity,
Ohio State University,
Michael E. Moritz College of Law*

Cheryl Harris

*Professor of Law,
University of California, Los Angeles,
School of Law*

Deborah L. Rhode

*Ernest W. McFarland Professor of Law,
Stanford Law School*

Marjorie Heins

*Founder and Director,
Free Expression Policy Project (FEPP)*

Stephanie M. Wildman

*Professor of Law and Director for the Center
for Social Justice & Public Service,
Santa Clara University School of Law*

Kevin R. Johnson

*Dean and Mabie-Apallas Professor of
Public Interest Law and Chicana/o Studies,
University of California, Davis,
School of Law (King Hall)*

Eric Ken Yamamoto

*Professor of Law,
University of Hawaii, William S. Richardson
School of Law*

**THE FIRST AMENDMENT
FREEDOM
OF ASSEMBLY
AND PETITION**

THE FIRST AMENDMENT
FREEDOM
OF ASSEMBLY
AND PETITION

Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate

EDITED BY MARGARET M. RUSSELL



Prometheus Books

59 John Glenn Drive
Amherst, New York 14228-2119

Published 2010 by Prometheus Books

Freedom of Assembly and Petition (The First Amendment): Its Constitutional History and the Contemporary Debate. Copyright © 2010 by Margaret M. Russell. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, digital, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, or conveyed via the Internet or a Web site without prior written permission of the publisher, except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews.

Inquiries should be addressed to

Prometheus Books

59 John Glenn Drive

Amherst, New York 14228-2119

VOICE: 716-691-0133

FAX: 716-691-0137

WWW.PROMETHEUSBOOKS.COM

14 13 12 11 10 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Russell, Margaret M.

The First Amendment, freedom of assembly and petition : its constitutional history and the contemporary debate / edited by Margaret M. Russell.

p. cm. — (Bill of Rights series)

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-59102-777-5 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Assembly, Right of—United States. 2. Assembly, Right of—United States—History.
 3. Petition, Right of—United States. 4. Petition, Right of—United States—History.
- I. Russell, Margaret M.

KF4778.F743 2010

342.7308'54—dc22

2009039249

Printed in the United States of America

Portions of "Petitions" and "Women and Freedom of Expression before the Twentieth Century" originally appeared in *Rampant Women: Suffragists and the Right to Assembly* by Linda J. Lumsden. Copyright © 1997 by the University of Tennessee Press.

Used with permission.

To my parents and my children