



The Theory of Taxation for Developing Countries

edited by
David Newbery
Nicholas Stern

A World Bank
Research Publication

The Theory of Taxation for Developing Countries

Edited by
David Newbery
Nicholas Stern

PUBLISHED FOR THE WORLD BANK

Oxford University Press

Oxford University Press

NEW YORK OXFORD LONDON GLASGOW
TORONTO MELBOURNE WELLINGTON HONG KONG
TOKYO KUALA LUMPUR SINGAPORE JAKARTA
DELHI BOMBAY CALCUTTA MADRAS KARACHI
NAIROBI DAR ES SALAAM CAPE TOWN

© 1987 The International Bank
for Reconstruction and Development / THE WORLD BANK
1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication
may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,
or transmitted in any form or by any means,
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording,
or otherwise, without the prior permission of
Oxford University Press.

Manufactured in the United States of America
First printing hardcover
and paperback editions
July 1987

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed
in this study are entirely those of the authors and should
not be attributed in any manner to the World Bank, to
its affiliated organizations, or to members of its Board of
Executive Directors or the countries they represent.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The Theory of taxation for developing countries.

Includes bibliographies and index.

1. Taxation—Developing countries. I. Newbery,
David M. G. II. Stern, N. H. (Nicholas Herbert)

HJ2351.7.T47 1987

336.2'009172'4

87-11106

ISBN 0-19-520498-0

ISBN 0-19-520541-3 (pbk.)

The Theory of Taxation
for Developing Countries

A WORLD BANK RESEARCH PUBLICATION

With contributions by

Ehtisham Ahmad	Choong Yong Ahn	Jane Armitage
Anthony Atkinson	Christopher Bliss	Avishay Braverman
Angus Deaton	Peter Diamond	Gary Fields
Mark Gersovitz	Francisco Gil Díaz	Jeffrey Hammer
Christopher Heady	Gordon Hughes	Michael Katz
Pradeep Mitra	Richard Musgrave	Richard Sabot
Raaj Kumar Sah	Joseph Stiglitz	Vito Tanzi
	Sweder van Wijnbergen	

Preface

ALL GOVERNMENTS NEED RESOURCES, but the problems of raising revenue are particularly severe in developing countries. These problems have been somewhat neglected in the past because work in public economics, both theoretical and applied, has concentrated on developed countries and taxation has not been a central concern in development economics. The past twenty-five years, however, have seen much progress in both fields, with a greater emphasis on construction of simple but clearly articulated models of the economies of developing countries that take into account the goals of, and constraints on, governments. It is now possible to investigate systematically such basic questions of public finance as which goods should be taxed, how tax systems should be reformed, and where additional resources should be sought. In this volume many of the economists whose work has been central to recent developments examine these issues, review progress in specific areas, and discuss directions for further work.

Parts 1 and 2 describe basic theories, facts, and experience; parts 3 through 6 deal with applications to particular countries and problems. Among the subjects covered are general tax theory, along with data requirements and the use of economic models in applications of the theory; the advantages and disadvantages of various taxes; the special characteristics of individual countries' tax systems and revenue sources; tax reform in general and practical experience in India, the Republic of Korea, and Mexico; the problems of taxing agriculture; and the pricing of publicly provided goods and services.

The book as a whole focuses, as the title implies, on taxation in developing countries, with a view to determining what can be achieved by applying the methods of public economics. No attempt has been made to impose a single, uniform view, but most of the authors share a concern with identifying the government's objectives and how they can best be achieved with the available resources, institutional arrangements, data, and tax instruments.

This book has several purposes. Because it uses modern methods and contains both new research and an assessment of the state of the art, it will be useful for economists and graduate students interested in development and taxation, and in particular for economists in governments, international organizations, and consultancies who wish to keep abreast of theoretical and empirical developments in contemporary research and adapt them for practical

use. The book may also help to persuade academic economists and research students that taxation is a stimulating and important area for research, and it provides useful analytical tools for solving a broad range of problems. Finally, the collection, with its case studies in economic theory and econometrics, should be valuable as a textbook for courses in both public economics and development economics.

Many of the chapters in this book are necessarily technical because they contain the formal expressions and theoretical arguments that are quantified in the empirical analysis. In almost all cases, however, the discussions are not mathematically difficult. The main requirements of the reader are familiarity with partial differentiation and with the standard results of microeconomic theory as set forth in any standard textbook in which the properties of direct and indirect utility functions are derived. Although we have attempted to use consistent notation throughout the book, practical limitations and the wide range of subjects covered have made complete uniformity impossible. The discussion of "Notation and Terminology," below, provides a brief description of symbols and conventions, and we have also explained the notation as it appears in each chapter.

The immediate origins of this book were in a workshop held in the Development Research Department of the World Bank in June 1982, at which some of the leading exponents of public finance were invited to offer their views on ways of analyzing proposed tax reforms in developing countries. There were two reasons for interest in this topic: the Division of Public Economics, recently established within the Development Research Department, was then in the process of formulating its research program, and there was a sense within the development community that the rapid advances in the theory of public finance that had been made in the 1970s could fruitfully be applied to developing countries. Following the workshop the Research Committee of the World Bank decided to support the production of this book. A number of authors were commissioned to write chapters on specific topics, and the two editors undertook to provide an appropriate framework. The first draft of the manuscript was discussed at a conference held at the World Bank in June 1984 and was revised over the next twelve months. The editors are grateful for the authors' cooperation and patience during this process.

One of the goals of the project was to survey existing research and put it in a more accessible form. In addition, the book extends and adapts theory so that it can contribute more directly to the problems that face policymakers in developing countries. Much of the work of this kind reported here draws on research that was already under way at the time of the original workshop, some of it funded under other World Bank research projects. The study on India (chapter 11) was supported by the British Economic and Social Research Council and the Overseas Development Administration. This empirical work, and the project as a whole, raised many interesting additional questions, which form a considerable research agenda. The ideas presented here, however, in

themselves provide both useful insights and a framework for constructive applied work.

We are grateful to the authors for their contributions, their involvement in revising their own chapters, and their detailed comments on other parts of the work. We also owe thanks to many individuals and institutions, most of all to the Development Research Department of the World Bank.

During the course of the work Newbery was at the World Bank, at Churchill College, Cambridge University, and at the Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs, Princeton University. He is currently a reader in economics at Cambridge University. Stern was at the University of Warwick, spent part of the summer of 1983 as a visiting scholar in the Fiscal Affairs Department of the International Monetary Fund, and visited the World Bank on other occasions. Since January 1986 he has been at the London School of Economics. Our associates at these and other institutions have been unfailingly helpful. In particular, we thank Bela Balassa, Esra Bennathan, Nancy Birdsall, Roger Bowden, John Duloy, Gregory Ingram, Nizar Jethar, Anne Krueger, Deepak Lal, Ricardo Martin, Graham Pyatt, Marcello Selowsky, Zmarak Shalizi, Lyn Squire, Mateen Thobani, and Arvind Virmani, all of the World Bank, and Ved Gandhi, Peter Heller, and Alan Tait of the International Monetary Fund for their comments on various chapters and for other help. Robin Boadway of Queen's University, David Bradford of Princeton University, Lawrence Lau of Stanford University, and Jesus Seade of Warwick University provided helpful advice. In addition to contributing to the volume and providing valuable comments on a number of chapters, Pradeep Mitra took responsibility for the World Bank administration of the project after Newbery returned to Cambridge in September 1983. We are greatly indebted to him. We are also particularly grateful to Geoffrey Frewer, who read the text in detail, standardized the notation, and prepared the preliminary index. Special thanks are due to James Mirrlees for guidance and encouragement throughout. We also thank Marcia Brubeck for her great care, skill, patience, and judgment in carrying through a most difficult copyediting task on a lengthy and technical volume by disparate contributors with individual preferences and idiosyncrasies. Finally, we are grateful for the kindness and support of the secretaries who have been involved in this work: Susan Buonocore, Vivian Couchoud, and Mary Ann Heraud at the World Bank, Connie Dent at Princeton University, and Jenny Johnson and Liz Thompson at Warwick University.

Notation and Terminology

WE HAVE ATTEMPTED to impose a consistent system of notation throughout the book, occasionally overriding the preferences of individual authors to do so. The main peculiarity is that q is invariably a price (not a quantity) and is the price facing consumers, as distinguished from p , the producer price. In addition, x is individual consumption or net demand and never expenditure, y is individual production, m is money income, and t is almost always a tax rate (but briefly appears as time in chapter 5). The Greek character τ is often an ad valorem tax rate. Capital letters are used for aggregate quantities (but P is the world price); R is government revenue. The shadow price of government revenue or the marginal social cost of raising revenue is always λ or λ_i . Other conventions are that ϵ , ϵ_i , and ϵ_{ij} are usually demand price elasticities (but ϵ is also the elasticity of the social marginal utility of income or the coefficient of inequality aversion) and that η , η_i , and η_{ij} are price elasticities of supply. Subscripts usually refer to goods but sometimes indicate derivatives, whereas superscripts refer to households or sectors. Vectors are usually not distinguished from scalars except that, for special emphasis, the former, where they are denoted by letters of the Latin alphabet, appear in boldface type. Other systematic usage may be detected, but the limited number of distinctive characters available precludes complete consistency. Variables are defined in each chapter.

A tonne is a metric ton.

Abbreviations

AIDS	Almost Ideal Demand System
APC	Average propensity to consume out of income
ARI	Accounting rate of interest
CBA	Cost-benefit analysis
CES	Constant elasticity of substitution
CGE	Computable general equilibrium
CIF	Cost, insurance, and freight
CPI	Consumer price index
CRI	Consumption rate of interest
CV	Coefficient of variation
DRC	Domestic resource cost
DUPS	Directly unproductive profit seeking
EP	Effective protection
EPR	Effective protection rate
EV	Equivalent variation
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FF	Fertilizer fund
FOB	Free on board
FPF	Federal Participation Fund
GDP	Gross domestic product
GMF	Grain Management Fund
GNP	Gross national product
HYV	High-yield variety
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LES	Linear expenditure system
LIFO	Last in, first out
LPG	Liquefied petroleum gas
MANVAT	Value-added tax on manufacturing
MC	Marginal cost
MPC	Marginal propensity to consume out of income
MPL	Marginal product of labor
NSSO	National Sample Survey Organisation (India)
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
R and D	Research and development

SCBA	Social cost-benefit analysis
SD	Standard deviation
SWF	Social welfare function
TV	Traditional variety
VAT	Value-added tax
WPI	Wholesale price index

Contents

Preface	xi
Notation and Terminology	xiv
Abbreviations	xv
1. Introduction <i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i>	3
The Scope of the Analysis	7
Some Omissions	12
Conclusions	14
PART 1. THEORY	19
2. The Theory of Optimal Commodity and Income Taxation: An Introduction <i>Nicholas Stern</i>	22
The Scope of Modern Theories	23
The Standard Assumptions	26
Optimal Taxation	27
The Social Welfare Function	46
Applications to General Arguments	49
Tax Reform	52
Conclusions	54
Appendix: Lump-Sum Grants and Indirect Taxes	55
Notes	59
3. Aspects of the General Theory of Tax Reform <i>Nicholas Stern</i>	60
Production in the Standard Models of Optimal Taxation	61
Incidence of Indirect Taxes	66
Some Partial-Equilibrium Issues	70
The General Theory of Reform and Shadow Prices	74
Trade, Optimal Taxation, and Reform	82
A Review of the General Principles	83
Conclusions	89
Appendix: Normalization and the Choice of Untaxed Goods	90
4. Econometric Issues for Tax Design in Developing Countries <i>Angus Deaton</i>	92
A Simple Model of Taxes and Tax Reforms	93
The Specification of Preferences and Technology	96
Data and Estimation	107
Conclusions	112

5. Dynamic Issues	<i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i>	114
The Arrow-Debreu Model and Some Problems	115	
Investment Policy	119	
Tax Policy in Growth Models	124	
The Dynamics of Government Revenue Requirements	132	
Costs, Innovation, and Market Structure	137	
Conclusions	139	
Notes	140	
6. Taxation, Cost-Benefit Analysis, and Effective Protection	<i>Christopher Bliss</i>	141
Positive and Normative Economics	142	
The Explanation of Tariffs	144	
Effective Protection	147	
Taxation Theory	152	
Optimal Taxation and Cost-Benefit Analysis with Tariffs	154	
Further Implications for Cost-Benefit Analysis	157	
The Developing Country	158	
Appendix: Mathematical Details	159	
Notes	161	
PART 2. STRUCTURAL ISSUES AND TAXATION		163
7. Taxation and Development	<i>David Newbery</i>	165
The Special Characteristics of Developing Countries	167	
Consequences of the Special Features of		
Developing Economies for Tax Design	175	
Planning, the Public Sector, and the Problem of Coordination	192	
The Relationship between Tax Structure and the		
Level of Development	193	
Differences in Objectives and Political Constraints	195	
Administrative Capacity and the Problem of Tax Evasion	200	
Conclusions	202	
Notes	204	
8. Quantitative Characteristics of the Tax Systems of Developing Countries	<i>Vito Tanzi</i>	205
The Level of Taxation	218	
The Structure of Taxation	222	
Other Aspects	236	
Appendix: Supplementary Tables	239	
Notes	241	
9. Tax Reform in Developing Countries	<i>Richard Musgrave</i>	242
Tax Reform and Development Policy	243	
The Pattern of Distribution	246	
Income versus Consumption Base	250	
Personal Income Tax	251	
Company Taxation	256	
Product Taxes	259	
Taxes on Property and Land	261	
Conclusions	262	
Note	263	

10. Public Policy and the Labor Market in Developing Countries	<i>Gary Fields</i>	264
The Analytical Framework and Its Empirical Foundations		265
Public Policy in Models with Wage Dualism		269
Conclusions		276
Notes		277
PART 3. CASE STUDIES IN TAX REFORM		279
11. Alternative Sources of Government Revenue: Illustrations from India, 1979–80	<i>Ehtisham Ahmad and Nicholas Stern</i>	281
The Composition of Indirect Taxes: Theory		283
The Taxation of Inputs		298
Federal and State Taxes		299
A Comparison of Alternative Sources of Revenue		304
Commodity Taxes		310
The Personal Income Tax and Comparisons with Indirect Taxes		312
Nonmarginal Reforms		315
Extensions of the Model: The Supply Side		322
Conclusions		329
Notes		332
12. Some Lessons from Mexico's Tax Reform	<i>Francisco Gil Díaz</i>	333
The Tax Environment of a Small Open Economy		334
The Major Items of the Tax Reform		335
Some Broad Results of the Tax Reform		348
The Incidence of the Mexican Tax System on Family Income		349
Conclusions		354
Appendix: Estimates of the Incidence of the Inflationary Tax		356
Notes		359
PART 4. THE THEORY OF AGRICULTURAL TAXATION		361
13. Agricultural Taxation: The Main Issues	<i>David Newbery</i>	366
The Applicability of the Standard Model		366
Tax Incidence in Agriculture		371
Tax Incidence in the Urban Sector with Nontraded Food Crops		373
The Debate on Agricultural Taxation and the Terms of Trade		376
Instruments for Agricultural Taxation		379
Directions for Future Research		384
Conclusions		385
Notes		385
14. The Theory of Tax Design for Developing Countries	<i>Anthony Atkinson</i>	387
A Simple Example of a Peasant Economy		389
The Equity-Efficiency Tradeoff in Our Simple Model		392
Direct and Indirect Taxation in the Peasant Economy		397
Optimal Taxation		399
Extensions of the Analysis		404

15. Optimal Taxation and Shadow Pricing in a Developing Economy	<i>Christopher Heady and Pradeep Mitra</i>	407
The Structure of the Model	409	
Analytical Results	411	
Numerical Results	413	
Conclusions	423	
16. The Taxation and Pricing of Agricultural and Industrial Goods in Developing Economies	<i>Raaj Kumar Sah and Joseph Stiglitz</i>	426
Outline of the Chapter	430	
The Basic Model	431	
A Simple Analysis of Agricultural and Industrial Pricing	432	
The Structure of Prices in the Agricultural Sector	438	
The Structure of Prices in the Industrial Sector	444	
Migration and Unemployment	448	
Further Extensions	449	
Tax Analysis for Developing versus Developed Economies	452	
Caveats and Misgivings	453	
Conclusions	457	
Notes	458	
PART 5. EMPIRICAL STUDIES OF AGRICULTURAL TAXATION		463
17. Multimarket Analysis of Agricultural Pricing Policies in Korea	<i>Avishay Braverman, Jeffrey Hammer, and Choong Yong Ahn</i>	467
The Korean Problem	469	
The Model	471	
Results	478	
Conclusions	486	
Appendix	487	
Notes	487	
18. Identifying Desirable Directions of Agricultural Price Reform in Korea	<i>David Newbery</i>	489
Summary of Lessons Learned	490	
A Brief Description of the Korean Problem	491	
Policy Analysis	498	
The Marginal Social Cost of Rural Price Interventions	503	
The Marginal Social Costs of Urban Price Interventions	505	
The Calculation of Social Weights	506	
Quantifying the Social Cost of Raising Revenue	508	
Sensitivity of the Results to Other Parameters	511	
Conclusions	512	
Appendix 18-1. Calculating the Tax Rates on Cereals	513	
Appendix 18-2. Calculating the Demand Elasticities	514	
Appendix 18-3. Data Used in Calculations	518	
Notes	520	

19. Short-Run Macroeconomic Effects of Agricultural Pricing Policies	<i>Sweder van Wijnbergen</i>	521
Relative Food Prices and Export Competitiveness		522
Model Description		525
Simulating an Agricultural Price Reform		526
Conclusions		529
PART 6. TAXATION AND PRICING IN OTHER SECTORS		531
20. The Incidence of Fuel Taxes: A Comparative Study of Three Countries	<i>Gordon Hughes</i>	533
Analytical Method and Data Requirements		535
The Impact of Fuel Taxes on Prices		540
Expenditure Transfers and the Distribution of Real Income		546
Conclusions		555
Notes		558
21. Pricing Publicly Supplied Goods and Services	<i>Michael Katz</i>	560
A Model		562
Price and Rationing Changes		564
Price and Quality Changes		573
Menus of Options for Consumers		583
The Presence of Other Taxes and Subsidies		585
Conclusions		587
Notes		588
22. Efficiency and Equity Implications of Subsidies to Secondary Education in Kenya	<i>Jane Armitage and Richard Sabot</i>	589
The Dual Secondary System in Kenya		591
Methods and Data		595
Private and Social Rates of Return to Government and Harambee Schools and Some Adjustments		598
Access to Government Schools and Family Background		607
Conclusions		609
Notes		611
23. The Effects of Domestic Taxes on Foreign Private Investment	<i>Mark Gersovitz</i>	615
The Large Host		616
No Taxation of Foreign Capital		616
Foreign Tax Rules and Developing Country Taxation of Foreign Firms under Separate Accounting		618
The Formula Apportionment Alternative		624
Country Risk		627
Attracting Foreign Investment: Tax Holidays		632
Conclusions		633
Notes		634

PART 7. FINDINGS AND IMPLICATIONS	637
24. Optimal Tax Theory and Development Policy: Directions for Future Research <i>Peter Diamond</i>	638
First- and Second-Best Analyses	638
Policy Recommendations	641
Optimal Tax Theory	643
25. Conclusions <i>David Newbery and Nicholas Stern</i>	648
Contributions	649
Problems and Omissions	651
Further Work	654
Final Remarks	658
Bibliography	659
Affiliations of Contributors	679
Index	681