

SOLOVE
ROTENBERG
SCHWARTZ

INFORMATION
PRIVACY LAW

*Second
Edition*

ASPEN
PUBLISHERS

INFORMATION PRIVACY LAW

Second Edition

Daniel J. Solove

Associate Professor of Law

George Washington University Law School

Marc Rotenberg

Executive Director

The Electronic Privacy Information Center

&

Adjunct Professor of Law,

Georgetown University Law Center

Paul M. Schwartz

Anita and Stuart Subotnick Professor of Law

Brooklyn Law School

ASPEN
PUBLISHERS

111 Eighth Avenue, New York, NY 10011
www.aspenpublishers.com

© 2006 Aspen Publishers, Inc.
a Wolters Kluwer business
www.aspenpublishers.com

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Aspen Publishers
Attn: Permissions Department
111 Eighth Avenue, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10011-5201

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 0-7355-5576-1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Solove, Daniel J., 1972–

Information privacy law / Daniel J. Solove, Marc Rotenberg, Paul M. Schwartz.—
2nd ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-7355-5576-1 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Privacy, Right of—United States. 2. Data protection—Law and legislation—
United States. 3. Confidential communications—United States. 4. Personality
(Law)—United States. I. Rotenberg, Marc. II. Schwartz, Paul M., 1959–
III. Title.

KF1262.S66 2005
342.7308'58—dc22

2005026950

INFORMATION PRIVACY LAW

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Erwin Chemerinsky

Alston & Bird Professor of Law
Duke University School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law
University of Chicago
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Stanford University

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia University

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
University of Michigan

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Hofstra University School of Law

Kent D. Syverud

Dean and Garner Anthony Professor
Vanderbilt University Law School

Elizabeth Warren

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law
Harvard University

EMERITUS EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Geoffrey C. Hazard, Jr.

Trustee Professor of Law
University of Pennsylvania
Distinguished Professor of Law
Hastings College of the Law, University of California

Bernard Wolfman

Fessenden Professor of Law
Harvard University

E. Allan Farnsworth

On January 31, 2005, Aspen Publishers lost a great author, colleague, and friend with the death of E. Allan Farnsworth, the Alfred McCormack Professor of Law at Columbia Law School and author of the seminal student treatise, *Contracts*, Fourth Edition, by Aspen Publishers.

About Aspen Publishers

Aspen Publishers, headquartered in New York City, is a leading information provider for attorneys, business professionals, and law students. Written by pre-eminent authorities, our products consist of analytical and practical information covering both U.S. and international topics. We publish in the full range of formats, including updated manuals, books, periodicals, CDs, and online products.

Our proprietary content is complemented by 2,500 legal databases, containing over 11 million documents, available through our Loislaw division. Aspen Publishers also offers a wide range of topical legal and business databases linked to Loislaw's primary material. Our mission is to provide accurate, timely, and authoritative content in easily accessible formats, supported by unmatched customer care.

To order any Aspen Publishers title, go to www.aspenpublishers.com or call 1-800-638-8437.

To reinstate your manual update service, call 1-800-638-8437.

For more information on Loislaw products, go to www.loislaw.com or call 1-800-364-2512.

For Customer Care issues, e-mail CustomerCare@aspenpublishers.com; call 1-800-234-1660; or fax 1-800-901-9075.

Aspen Publishers
a Wolters Kluwer business

To my parents and grandparents—DJS

To Anna, Chaz and Chloe, my parents, and GG—MSR

To Stefanie, Clara, and Leo—PMS

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<i>Contents</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxix</i>
1 INTRODUCTION	1
A. Information Privacy, Technology, and the Law	1
B. Information Privacy Law: Origins and Types	9
C. Philosophical Perspectives	39
2 PRIVACY AND THE MEDIA	75
A. Information Gathering	76
B. Disclosure of Truthful Information	102
C. Dissemination of False or Misleading Information	159
D. Appropriation of Name or Likeness	188
3 PRIVACY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT	207
A. The Fourth Amendment and Emerging Technology	207
B. Federal Electronic Surveillance Law	263
C. Intelligence, Terrorism, and National Security	300
D. Encryption	320
E. Government Computer Searches	323
4 HEALTH AND GENETIC PRIVACY	345
A. Medical Data and Privacy in the Information Age	346
B. Confidentiality of Medical Information	350
C. Constitutional Protection of Medical Information	394
D. Genetic Information	421

5	<i>PRIVACY OF ASSOCIATIONS, ANONYMITY, AND IDENTIFICATION</i>	451
	A. Privacy of Group Associations	453
	B. Anonymity	470
	C. Identification	504
6	<i>PRIVACY AND GOVERNMENT RECORDS AND DATABASES</i>	523
	A. Public Access to Government Records	524
	B. Government Records of Personal Information	577
7	<i>PRIVACY, BUSINESS RECORDS, AND FINANCIAL INFORMATION</i>	623
	A. The Collection and Use of Personal Data	623
	B. Regulating Business Records and Databases	636
	C. Spam	693
	D. Identity Theft	696
	E. Financial Information	700
	F. Government Access to Financial and Business Records	718
	G. Privacy Policies: Private vs. Public Enforcement	739
8	<i>PRIVACY AND PLACE</i>	765
	A. Privacy at Home	765
	B. Privacy at School	778
	C. Privacy at Work	798
9	<i>INTERNATIONAL PRIVACY LAW</i>	869
	A. The OECD Privacy Guidelines	871
	B. The Protection of Privacy in Europe	873
	C. Privacy Protection in Other Countries	922
	D. International Transfers of Data	929
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	969
	<i>Table of Authorities</i>	979
	<i>Index</i>	1001

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xxv
----------------	-----

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxix
------------------------	------

1 INTRODUCTION	1
A. INFORMATION PRIVACY, TECHNOLOGY, AND THE LAW	1
• Sidis v. F-R Publishing Corp.	2
B. INFORMATION PRIVACY LAW: ORIGINS AND TYPES	9
1. Common Law	9
(a) The Warren and Brandeis Article	9
• Samuel D. Warren and Louis D. Brandeis, <i>The Right to Privacy</i>	12
(b) The Recognition of Warren and Brandeis's Privacy Torts	24
• William Prosser, <i>Privacy</i>	26
• Lake v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.	27
(c) Privacy Protection in Tort Law	30
(d) Privacy Protection in Evidence Law	31
(e) Privacy Protection via Property Rights	31
(f) Privacy Protection in Contract Law	32
(g) Privacy Protection in Criminal Law	32
2. Constitutional Law	33
3. Statutory Law	35
4. International Law	38

C. PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVES	39
1. The Philosophical Discourse About Privacy	39
(a) The Concept of Privacy and the Right to Privacy	39
(b) The Public and Private Spheres	39
2. The Definition and the Value of Privacy	40
• Alan Westin, <i>Privacy and Freedom</i>	41
• Julie E. Cohen, <i>Examined Lives: Informational Privacy and the Subject as Object</i>	46
• Daniel J. Solove, <i>Conceptualizing Privacy</i>	49
• Anita L. Allen, <i>Coercing Privacy</i>	52
• Paul M. Schwartz, <i>Privacy and Democracy in Cyberspace</i>	54
• Spiros Simitis, <i>Reviewing Privacy in an Information Society</i>	56
3. Critics of Privacy	59
• Amitai Etzioni, <i>The Limits of Privacy</i>	59
• Richard A. Posner, <i>The Right of Privacy</i>	62
• Fred H. Cate, <i>The Privacy Problem: A Broader View of Information Privacy and the Costs and Consequences of Protecting It</i>	65
4. The Feminist Perspective on Privacy	67
• State v. Rhodes	67
• Reva B. Siegel, <i>"The Rule of Love": Wife Beating as Prerogative and Privacy</i>	69
• Catharine A. MacKinnon, <i>Toward a Feminist Theory of the State</i>	71
• Anita L. Allen, <i>Uneasy Access: Privacy for Women in a Free Society</i>	72
2 PRIVACY AND THE MEDIA	75
A. INFORMATION GATHERING	76
1. Intrusion upon Seclusion	76
• Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652B: Intrusion upon Seclusion	76
• Nader v. General Motors Corp.	77
• Dietemann v. Time, Inc.	81
• Desnick v. American Broadcasting Co., Inc.	84
• Shulman v. Group W Productions, Inc.	90
2. Paparazzi	94
• Galella v. Onassis	94
• California Anti-Paparazzi Act	96
3. Video Voyeurism	100
• Video Voyeurism Prevention Act of 2004	101

B. DISCLOSURE OF TRUTHFUL INFORMATION	102
1. Public Disclosure of Private Facts	103
(a) Introduction	103
• Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652D: Publicity Given to Private Life	103
(b) Private Matters	104
• Gill v. Hearst Publishing Co.	104
• Daily Times Democrat v. Graham	108
(c) Publicity	114
• Miller v. Motorola, Inc.	114
(d) The Newsworthiness Test	117
• Sipple v. Chronicle Publishing Co.	117
• Shulman v. Group W Productions, Inc.	129
(e) First Amendment Limitations	131
• Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn	134
• The Florida Star v. B.J.F.	137
2. Disclosure of Illegally Obtained Information	152
• Bartnicki v. Vopper	152
C. DISSEMINATION OF FALSE OR MISLEADING INFORMATION	159
1. Defamation	159
(a) Introduction	159
(b) Defamation and the Internet	161
• Zeran v. America Online, Inc.	163
• Blumenthal v. Drudge	166
(c) First Amendment Limitations	170
• New York Times Co. v. Sullivan	170
• Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.	173
2. False Light	181
(a) Introduction	181
• Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652E: Publicity Placing Person in False Light	181
(b) First Amendment Limitations	183
• Time, Inc. v. Hill	183
3. Infliction of Emotional Distress	185
• Hustler Magazine v. Falwell	186
D. APPROPRIATION OF NAME OR LIKENESS	188
1. Introduction	188
• Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652C: Appropriation of Name or Likeness	188

2. Name or Likeness	191
• Carson v. Here's Johnny Portable Toilets, Inc.	191
3. Connection to Matters of Public Interest	197
• Finger v. Omni Publications International, Ltd.	199
4. First Amendment Limitations	203
• Zacchini v. Scripps-Howard Broadcasting Co.	203
3 PRIVACY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT	207
A. THE FOURTH AMENDMENT AND EMERGING TECHNOLOGY	207
1. Introduction	207
(a) Privacy and Security	207
(b) The Fourth and Fifth Amendments	208
(c) The Applicability of the Fourth Amendment	210
(d) Reasonable Searches and Seizures	210
(e) The "Special Needs" Doctrine	211
(f) Administrative Searches	211
(g) Checkpoints	212
(h) <i>Terry</i> Stops	212
(i) The Enforcement of the Fourth Amendment	213
2. Wiretapping, Bugging, and Beyond	214
• Olmstead v. United States	215
• Lopez v. United States	221
• Katz v. United States	223
• United States v. White	229
3. The Reasonable Expectation of Privacy Test and Emerging Technology	232
(a) Applying the Reasonable Expectation of Privacy Test	232
• Smith v. Maryland	232
• United States v. Place	238
• Illinois v. Caballes	238
• California v. Greenwood	243
• Plain View, Open Fields, and Curtilage	245
• Florida v. Riley	245
(b) Sensory Enhancement Technology	252
• Dow Chemical Co. v. United States	252
• <i>Kyllo</i> v. United States	256
B. FEDERAL ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE LAW	263
1. Section 605 of the Federal Communications Act of 1934	263

2. Title III of the Omnibus Crime Control Act of 1968	264
3. The Electronic Communications Privacy Act (ECPA) of 1986	265
(a) Statutory Structure	265
• Types of Communications	266
• The Wiretap Act	267
• The Stored Communications Act	269
• The Pen Register Act	271
• Electronic Surveillance Law and the Fourth Amendment	272
• The Installation of Electronic Surveillance Devices	272
• Electronic Surveillance Orders	274
• State Electronic Surveillance Law	275
(b) Video Surveillance	276
(c) E-mail	277
• Steve Jackson Games, Inc. v. United States Secret Service	277
(d) Unauthorized Access to Password-Protected Web Sites	282
(e) Content vs. Envelope Information	283
4. The Communications Assistance for Law Enforcement Act	285
5. The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act	288
• Global Relief Foundation, Inc. v. O'Neil	291
• United States v. Isa	293
6. The USA PATRIOT Act	294
C. INTELLIGENCE, TERRORISM, AND NATIONAL SECURITY	300
1. Is National Security Different?	300
2. FISA and the "Wall"	303
• In re Sealed Case	304
• Peter Swire, <i>The System of Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Law</i>	307
• The 9/11 Commission Report (2004)	309
3. The Attorney General's FBI Guidelines	314
4. The Homeland Security Act	317
5. The Intelligence Reform and Terrorism Prevention Act	317
• Ronald D. Lee & Paul M. Schwartz, <i>Beyond the "War on Terrorism": Towards the New Intelligence Network</i>	318
D. ENCRYPTION	320

E. GOVERNMENT COMPUTER SEARCHES	323
1. The Scope of Warrants to Search Computers	323
2. ISP Records	326
• United States v. Hambrick	326
• McVeigh v. Cohen	329
• United States v. Kennedy	333
3. Carnivore	338
4. Key Logging Devices	339
• United States v. Scarfo	339
4 HEALTH AND GENETIC PRIVACY	345
A. MEDICAL DATA AND PRIVACY IN THE INFORMATION AGE	346
• Paul M. Schwartz, <i>Privacy and the Economics of Health Care Information</i>	346
• Lawrence O. Gostin, <i>Health Information Privacy</i>	347
• Simson Garfinkel, "Nobody Knows the MIB"	348
B. CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL INFORMATION	350
1. Professional Ethics and Evidentiary Privileges	350
(a) Ethical Rules	350
• Oath and Law of Hippocrates	350
• Current Opinions of the Judicial Council of the American Medical Association Canon 5.05	350
(b) Evidentiary Privileges	350
• Jaffee v. Redmond	352
2. Tort Liability for Disclosure of Patient Information	356
• McCormick v. England	356
• Hammonds v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co.	358
3. Tort Liability for Failure to Disclose Patient Information	363
• Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California	363
• McIntosh v. Milano	369
4. Statutory Reporting Requirements	375
5. State Law Privacy Protections for Medical Information	377
6. Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act	379
• Entities Subject to the Regulations	380
• Type of Information and Records Covered	381
• Privacy Protections	382

• Exceptions	384
• Compliance and Enforcement	385
• Effect on Existing Law	385
• Northwestern Memorial Hospital v. Ashcroft	390
C. CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTION OF MEDICAL INFORMATION	394
1. The Constitutional Right to Information Privacy	394
• Substantive Due Process and the Constitutional Right to Privacy	394
• Whalen v. Roe	396
• 42 U.S.C. § 1983 and “Constitutional Torts”	404
• Carter v. Broadlawns Medical Center	405
• Doe v. Borough of Barrington	406
• Doe v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority	409
2. The Fourth Amendment	415
• Anonymous Fireman v. City of Willoughby	415
• Ferguson v. City of Charleston	418
D. GENETIC INFORMATION	421
1. Background: Genetic Privacy	421
2. Property Rights in Body Parts and DNA	422
• Moore v. Regents of the University of California	422
3. Genetic Testing and Discrimination	436
• Richard A. Epstein, <i>The Legal Regulation of Genetic Discrimination: Old Responses to New Technology</i>	436
• Paul M. Schwartz, <i>Privacy and the Economics of Health Care Information</i>	437
4. DNA Databases and Identification	441
• United States v. Kincade	442
5 PRIVACY OF ASSOCIATIONS, ANONYMITY, AND IDENTIFICATION	451
A. PRIVACY OF GROUP ASSOCIATIONS	453
1. Compelled Disclosure of Group Membership Lists	453
• National Association for the Advancement of Colored People v. State of Alabama	453
2. Interrogation About Group Associations	456
• Barenblatt v. United States	456
3. Surveillance of Group Activities	461
• Laird v. Tatum	461

• Philadelphia Yearly Meeting of the Religious Society of Friends v. Tate	467
B. ANONYMITY	470
1. Anonymous Speech	470
• Talley v. State of California	470
• McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission	472
• Watchtower Bible & Tract Society v. Village of Stratton	477
2. Anonymity in Cyberspace	480
• ACLU v. Miller	481
• Columbia Insurance Co. v. Seescandy.com	485
• Doe v. 2TheMart.com, Inc.	486
3. Anonymous Reading and Receiving of Ideas	490
• Tattered Cover, Inc. v. City of Thornton	490
4. Anonymity and Copyright	498
• Recording Industry Association of America, Inc. v. Verizon Internet Services, Inc.	498
C. IDENTIFICATION	504
1. Identification Devices and Techniques	504
2. Identification and the Constitution	506
• Hiibel v. Sixth Judicial District Court	508
3. Social Security Numbers	513
• Greidinger v. Davis	515
4. National Identification Systems	519
• Richard Sobel, <i>The Degradation of Political Identity Under a National Identification System</i>	519
6 PRIVACY AND GOVERNMENT RECORDS AND DATABASES	523
A. PUBLIC ACCESS TO GOVERNMENT RECORDS	524
1. Public Records and Court Records	524
• Daniel J. Solove, <i>Access and Aggregation: Public Records, Privacy, and the Constitution</i>	525
2. The Freedom of Information Act	526
• United States Department of Justice v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press	530
• National Archives and Records Administration v. Favish	536
3. Constitutional Requirements of Public Access	542
• Los Angeles Police Department v. United Reporting Publishing Corp.	544