

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE

AN ANALYSIS OF CONSTITUTIONAL CASES AND CONCEPTS

By

CHARLES H. WHITEBREAD
Professor of Law, University of Virginia

Mineola, New York
THE FOUNDATION PRESS, INC.
1980

COPYRIGHT © 1980 By THE FOUNDATION PRESS, INC.

All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging In Publication Data

Whitebread, Charles H
Criminal procedure.

(University textbook series)

Includes index.

1. Criminal procedure—United States. I. Title. II. Series.

KF9619.W47 345.73'05 80-14619

ISBN 0-88277-006-3

University Textbook Series

July, 1980

Especially Designed for Collateral Reading

HARRY W. JONES

Directing Editor

Professor of Law, Columbia University

ADMIRALTY, Second Edition (1975)

Grant Gilmore, Professor of Law, Yale University.

Charles L. Black, Jr., Professor of Law, Yale University.

ADMIRALTY AND FEDERALISM (1970)

David W. Robertson, Professor of Law, University of Texas.

AGENCY (1975)

W. Edward Sell, Dean of the School of Law, University of Pittsburgh.

BUSINESS ORGANIZATION AND FINANCE (1980)

William A. Klein, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles.

CIVIL PROCEDURE, BASIC, Second Edition (1979)

Milton D. Green, Professor of Law Emeritus, University of California, Hastings College of the Law.

COMMERCIAL TRANSACTIONS, INTRODUCTION TO (1977)

Hon. Robert Braucher, Associate Justice, Supreme Judicial Court of Massachusetts.

Robert A. Riegert, Professor of Law, Cumberland School of Law.

CONFLICT OF LAWS, COMMENTARY ON THE, Second Edition (1980)

Russell J. Weintraub, Professor of Law, University of Texas.

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW, AMERICAN (A TREATISE ON) (1978) with 1979 Supplement

Laurence H. Tribe, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

CONTRACT LAW, THE CAPABILITY PROBLEM IN (1978)

Richard Danzig.

CORPORATIONS, Second Edition (1971)

Norman D. Lattin, Professor of Law, University of California, Hastings College of the Law.

CORPORATIONS IN PERSPECTIVE (1976)

Alfred F. Conard, Professor of Law, University of Michigan.

CRIMINAL LAW, Second Edition (1969)

Rollin M. Perkins, Professor of Law, University of California, Hastings College of the Law.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE (1980)

Charles H. Whitebread, II, Professor of Law, University of Virginia.

UNIVERSITY TEXTBOOKS SERIES—Continued

ESTATES IN LAND & FUTURE INTERESTS, PREFACE TO (1966)

Thomas F. Bergin, Professor of Law, University of Virginia.

Paul G. Haskell, Professor of Law, University of North Carolina.

EVIDENCE: COMMON SENSE AND COMMON LAW (1947)

John M. Maguire, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

EVIDENCE, STUDENTS' TEXT ON THE LAW OF (1935)

John Henry Wigmore.

JURISPRUDENCE: MEN AND IDEAS OF THE LAW (1953)

The late Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University.

LEGAL CAPITAL (1977)

Bayless Manning, Former Dean, Stanford Law School.

LEGAL RESEARCH ILLUSTRATED (1977)

J. Myron Jacobstein, Professor of Law, Law Librarian, Stanford University.

Roy M. Mersky, Professor of Law, Director of Research, University of Texas.

LEGAL RESEARCH, FUNDAMENTALS OF (1977), with 1980 Assignments Pamphlet

J. Myron Jacobstein, Professor of Law, Law Librarian, Stanford University.

Roy M. Mersky, Professor of Law, Director of Research, University of Texas.

PROCEDURE, THE STRUCTURE OF (1979)

Robert M. Cover, Professor of Law, Yale University.

Owen M. Fiss, Professor of Law, Yale University.

THE PROFESSION OF LAW (1971)

L. Ray Patterson, Dean of the School of Law, Emory University.

Elliott E. Cheatham, Professor of Law, Vanderbilt University.

PROPERTY, Second Edition (1975)

John E. Cribbet, Dean of the Law School, University of Illinois.

TAXATION, FEDERAL INCOME, Second Edition (1979)

Marvin A. Chirelstein, Professor of Law, Yale University.

TORTS, Second Edition (1980)

Clarence Morris, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

C. Robert Morris, Professor of Law, University of Minnesota.

TRUSTS, PREFACE TO THE LAW OF (1975)

Paul G. Haskell, Professor of Law, Case Western Reserve University.

WILLS AND TRUSTS, THE PLANNING AND DRAFTING OF, Second Edition (1979)

Thomas L. Shaffer, Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame.

For my father
Dr. Joseph B. Whitebread

*

PREFACE

In the introduction which follows, I have discussed in some detail the organization and concept of this book. Here I wish to thank those who have been of assistance in its preparation.

First, I am indebted to the American Academy of Judicial Education and especially its Director, Douglas Lanford, for consenting to the reprinting of material from my book *Constitutional Criminal Procedure*. Further, I acknowledge the Academy's assistance and encouragement on that book, which gave me a firm basis from which to produce this new manuscript.

I am grateful to the University of Southern California Law Center and the University of Virginia Law Foundation for financial assistance, which was invaluable in the preparation of these materials. I especially appreciate the time-consuming, diligent efforts of the Library Staff at the University of Southern California in preparing the bibliographies that follow each chapter. To Albert O. Brecht, the Director, Alan S. Holoch, Assistant Director, and especially to Jill Murbank, of their staff, my sincere thanks.

I appreciate the willingness of my colleagues, Peter W. Low, at Virginia, and Stephen J. Morse, at Southern California, to read and discuss parts of the manuscript. Their comments were of great help.

I could not have completed this volume in an area where the law changes so rapidly without the tireless help in research and drafting of the following students. At the University of Virginia: David Sfara, Gary Sims, Kevin Buster, Jim Kenworthy, David Cooke, Tim Long, Steve Usdin, Jeff Conciatori and Kevin Breen. At the University of Southern California: Matt Walker and Paul Karssen.

In addition, the following students deserve my thanks for participating in the source and citation check: Mary Ellen Powers, Dan Hagen, Steven Poor, Charles Reach, Chris Jensen, Suzanne LaPierre, Tom Merrill and Rob Zeitinger.

Finally, I wish to express my thanks to Christopher Slobogin for his extraordinary help in overseeing the production of these materials. I am indebted to Chris for managing the logistics of the project as well as for his substantive contributions and editorial assistance. His responses to and criticism of earlier drafts of this manuscript played a central role in bringing the book to its current form.

CHARLES H. WHITEBREAD

June, 1980

*

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	vii
CHAPTER ONE. INTRODUCTION: THE STUDY OF CRIMINAL PRO- CEDURE	1

PART A

THE FOURTH AMENDMENT: SEARCH AND SEIZURE LAW

CHAPTER TWO. THE EXCLUSIONARY EVIDENCE RULE AND OTHER REMEDIES FOR CONSTITUTIONAL VIOLATIONS	14
CHAPTER THREE. THE LAW OF ARREST	56
CHAPTER FOUR. THE LAW OF SEARCH AND SEIZURE: AN AN- ALYTICAL FRAMEWORK	85
CHAPTER FIVE. THE SEARCH WARRANT REQUIREMENT	110
CHAPTER SIX. SEARCH INCIDENT TO A LAWFUL ARREST	133
CHAPTER SEVEN. THE "AUTOMOBILE EXCEPTION"	141
CHAPTER EIGHT. HOT PURSUIT, EVANESCENT EVIDENCE AND OTHER "EMERGENCY" SEARCHES	152
CHAPTER NINE. STOP AND FRISK	171
CHAPTER TEN. CONSENT SEARCHES	197
CHAPTER ELEVEN. PLAIN VIEW	211
CHAPTER TWELVE. BORDER SEARCHES	226
CHAPTER THIRTEEN. EAVESDROPPING	236

PART B

THE FIFTH AMENDMENT'S PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION

CHAPTER FOURTEEN. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION	256
CHAPTER FIFTEEN. CONFESSIONS	281

PART C

THE PRETRIAL PROCESS

CHAPTER SIXTEEN. THE PRELIMINARY HEARING	331
CHAPTER SEVENTEEN. BAIL	343
CHAPTER EIGHTEEN. PRETRIAL IDENTIFICATION	353
CHAPTER NINETEEN. THE GRAND JURY	375
CHAPTER TWENTY. THE PROSECUTORIAL DUTY TO DISCLOSE EXCULPATORY INFORMATION	396
CHAPTER TWENTY-ONE. GUILTY PLEAS AND PLEA BARGAIN- ING	407

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

PART D

CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH TRIAL

	Page
CHAPTER TWENTY-TWO. THE RIGHT TO JURY TRIAL	430
CHAPTER TWENTY-THREE. THE RIGHT TO SPEEDY TRIAL	474
CHAPTER TWENTY-FOUR. DOUBLE JEOPARDY	482

PART E

THE ROLE OF THE LAWYER UNDER THE SIXTH AMENDMENT

CHAPTER TWENTY-FIVE. THE RIGHT TO COUNSEL	514
CHAPTER TWENTY-SIX. EFFECTIVE ASSISTANCE OF COUNSEL	544

PART F

ENTRAPMENT

CHAPTER TWENTY-SEVEN. THE ENTRAPMENT DEFENSE	564
--	-----

PART G

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE FEDERAL AND STATE COURTS

CHAPTER TWENTY-EIGHT. THE CLOSING DOOR TO THE FED- ERAL COURTS	573
CHAPTER TWENTY-NINE. STATE COURT DEPARTURES FROM THE FEDERAL STANDARD	592
Appendix I	601
Appendix II	605
Table of Cases	607
Index	619

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	vii
CHAPTER ONE. INTRODUCTION: THE STUDY OF CRIMINAL PRO- CEDURE	1

PART A THE FOURTH AMENDMENT: SEARCH AND SEIZURE LAW

CHAPTER TWO. THE EXCLUSIONARY EVIDENCE RULE AND OTHER REMEDIES FOR CONSTITUTIONAL VIOLATIONS	14
Section	
2.01 Introduction	14
2.02 History of the Exclusionary Rule: From <i>Weeks</i> to <i>Ker</i>	15
2.03 Doctrines Restricting the Operation of the Ex- clusionary Rule	18
(a) The "Balancing" Test	18
(b) Police Action Based on a "Presumptively Val- id" Statute	23
(c) Harmless Error	25
(d) Waiver	29
2.04 An Extension of the Exclusionary Rule: The "Fruit of the Poisonous Tree" Doctrine	30
2.05 Remedies Beyond the Exclusionary Rule	37
(a) Civil Remedies	38
<i>Damages</i>	38
<i>Injunctive Relief</i>	46
(b) Criminal Remedies	48
(c) Non-judicial Remedies	51
2.06 Conclusion	53
CHAPTER THREE. THE LAW OF ARREST	56
Section	
3.01 Introduction	56
3.02 What Is an Arrest?	57
3.03 The Probable Cause Requirement	62
(a) Probable Cause Deriving From Outside Sources	62
(b) Probable Cause Derived From Direct Contact	66
3.04 The Arrest Warrant Requirement	70
3.05 Arrest Procedure	76
(a) The Method of Entry	76
(b) The Use of Deadly Force	80

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER THREE. THE LAW OF ARREST—Continued		
Section		Page
3.06	Disposition After Arrest	81
3.07	Conclusion	83
CHAPTER FOUR. THE LAW OF SEARCH AND SEIZURE: AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK		85
Section		
4.01	Introduction	85
4.02	When Is There a Fourth Amendment Right?	85
	(a) Governmental Conduct	85
	(b) Reasonable Expectation of Privacy	91
	<i>The Public Exposure Doctrine</i>	91
	<i>The Standing Issue</i>	96
4.03	Determining Whether a Search or Seizure Is Reasonable	102
	(a) The Warrant Requirement	102
	(b) Adequacy of the Warrant	108
	(c) Exceptions to the Warrant Requirement	108
4.04	Conclusion	109
CHAPTER FIVE. THE SEARCH WARRANT REQUIREMENT		110
Section		
5.01	Introduction	110
5.02	Who Determines Probable Cause?	111
5.03	What Constitutes Probable Cause?	112
	(a) General Requirements	113
	(b) Hearsay Information	114
	(c) The <i>Aquilar-Spinelli</i> Test	115
	(d) Challenging the Probable Cause Determination	117
5.04	The Content of the Warrant	119
	(a) The “Mere Evidence” Rule	119
	(b) The “Particularity” Requirement	120
5.05	Execution of the Warrant	123
	(a) Who May Execute the Warrant?	123
	(b) Time Limitations	123
	(c) Announcement of Presence	124
	(d) Handling Seized Evidence	124
5.06	Administrative Inspection Searches	125
	(a) The <i>Camara</i> and <i>See</i> Decisions	125
	(b) Permissible Warrantless Administrative Searches	127
	<i>The “Open Fields” Doctrine</i>	127
	<i>Highly Regulated Industries</i>	127
	<i>Other Activities Affected With a Public Interest</i>	130
	“Emergency” Searches	130
5.07	Conclusion	132

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER SIX. SEARCH INCIDENT TO A LAWFUL ARREST	133
Section	
6.01 Introduction	133
6.02 Relation of Search to Arrest	134
6.03 Geographic Scope of a Search Incident	135
6.04 The Contemporaneousness Requirement	138
6.05 Accomplices	139
6.06 Conclusion	140
 CHAPTER SEVEN. THE "AUTOMOBILE EXCEPTION"	 141
Section	
7.01 Introduction	141
7.02 The <i>Carroll</i> Formulation	142
7.03 The Rationale Behind the Exception	144
7.04 Measuring Exigency	147
7.05 The "Continuing Exigency" Rule	149
7.06 Conclusion	152
 CHAPTER EIGHT. HOT PURSUIT, EVANESCENT EVIDENCE AND OTHER "EMERGENCY" SEARCHES	 152
Section	
8.01 Introduction: The "Emergency" Concept	152
8.02 "Hot Pursuit"	156
(a) Exigent Circumstances	157
<i>Pursuit</i>	157
<i>"Hotness"</i>	159
(b) Scope of the Search	162
(c) Conclusion	164
8.03 Evanescent Evidence	165
8.04 Emergency Administrative Searches	170
 CHAPTER NINE. STOP AND FRISK	 171
Section	
9.01 Introduction	171
9.02 The Classical Formulation: <i>Terry v. Ohio</i> and Its Companion Cases	174
9.03 The Progeny of <i>Terry</i> : Elaborations and Trunca- tions of the Classical Formulation	178
9.04 Stop and Frisk in the Lower Courts	183
(a) The "Stop" Phase	184
(b) The "Frisk" Phase	186
<i>Factors That Trigger a Frisk</i>	186
<i>Scope of the Frisk</i>	189
<i>Airport Searches</i>	191
9.05 The American Law Institute Formulation	192
9.06 Conclusion	195

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER TEN. CONSENT SEARCHES	197
Section	
10.01 Introduction	197
10.02 Making a Valid Consent	197
(a) The Voluntariness Standard	197
(b) The Intelligence Standard	201
10.03 The Scope of a Consent Search	205
10.04 Who May Consent?	206
10.05 Conclusion	210
 CHAPTER ELEVEN. PLAIN VIEW	 211
Section	
11.01 Introduction	211
11.02 Prior Valid Intrusion	212
(a) With a Warrant	212
(b) Without a Warrant	213
<i>Search Incident</i>	214
<i>Hot Pursuit</i>	215
<i>Consent</i>	215
<i>Other Exceptions</i>	215
(c) Other Types of Valid Intrusions	216
11.03 Inadvertence	217
11.04 What Evidence Can Be Seized?	220
11.05 When Is an Object in "Plain View?"	222
11.06 Inventory Searches of Automobiles	224
11.07 Conclusion	225
 CHAPTER TWELVE. BORDER SEARCHES	 226
Section	
12.01 Introduction	226
12.02 Searches at the Border	227
12.03 Searches Near the Border	228
12.04 Stops Near the Border	231
12.05 Inspection of International Mail	234
12.06 Conclusion	235
 CHAPTER THIRTEEN. EAVESDROPPING	 236
Section	
13.01 Introduction	236
13.02 Historical Development	236
(a) The Trespass Doctrine	237
(b) Eavesdropping Under the Federal Communica- tions Act	 238
(c) Expansion of Fourth Amendment Protection	240
13.03 Eavesdropping Situations in Which the Fourth Amendment Does Not Apply	 242

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER THIRTEEN. EAVESDROPPING—Continued

Section		Page
13.04	Federal Eavesdropping Law: Title III	244
	(a) The Definition of Surveillance	245
	(b) Prohibited Activities	245
	(c) Exceptions	246
	(d) Application for an Eavesdrop Order	247
	(e) The Wiretap Order	248
	(f) Procedures for Performing a Communication Interception	249
	(g) Post-Interception Procedures	250
	(h) Suppression of Eavesdrop Evidence	251
	(i) Civil Remedies	253
13.05	Conclusion	253

PART B

THE FIFTH AMENDMENT'S PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION

CHAPTER FOURTEEN. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIVILEGE AGAINST

SELF-INCRIMINATION		256
Section		
14.01	Introduction	256
14.02	Who May Assert the Claim?	256
14.03	When May the Right Be Asserted?	257
14.04	What is Incriminating Evidence?	259
	(a) The <i>Hoffman</i> Rule	259
	(b) Bars to Fifth Amendment Claims	261
	<i>Immunity</i>	261
	<i>Statute of Limitations</i>	263
14.05	The Compulsion Requirement and Waiver of the Fifth Amendment Right	264
	(a) Statutory Compulsion	265
	<i>The "Required Records" Test</i>	265
	<i>The Albertson Test</i>	265
	<i>The Garner Case</i>	270
	(b) Compulsion in an Investigative Setting	271
	(c) Indirect Compulsion Through "Chilling " Asser- tion of the Right	273
	(d) When Compelled Testimony May Be Ad- missible	274
	<i>Rogers and Brown</i>	275
	<i>The Continuing Waiver Theory</i>	276
	<i>The Couch Case</i>	276
14.06	The "Testimonial Evidence" Requirement	276
14.07	Conclusion	280

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER FIFTEEN. CONFESSIONS	281
Section	
15.01 Introduction	281
15.02 The Due Process "Voluntariness" Test	282
(a) Police Conduct	283
(b) Characteristics of the Accused	285
(c) The Timing of the Confession	287
(d) Summary	288
15.03 <i>Massiah</i> and <i>Escobedo</i> : The Right to Counsel View	289
15.04 <i>Miranda</i> and Fifth Amendment Analysis	292
15.05 Clarifying <i>Miranda</i>	295
(a) The Custody Requirement	295
(b) "Interrogation"	298
(c) The Warnings	299
(d) Waiver	300
<i>The Voluntariness Requirement</i>	300
<i>The Effect of Asking for an Attorney</i>	302
<i>Waiver by Juveniles</i>	303
(e) Termination of and Breaks in the Interrogation	304
(f) The Presence of Counsel	306
(g) Further Defining the Scope of <i>Miranda</i>	308
<i>Types of Statements Rendered Inadmissible by</i> <i>Miranda</i>	308
<i>Which Offenses Trigger Miranda?</i>	308
<i>Statements to Private Persons</i>	310
15.06 The Confession as Evidence	311
(a) Assessing the Voluntariness and Credibility of a Confession	311
<i>Who Makes the Voluntariness Decision?</i>	311
<i>Burden of Proof</i>	313
<i>Corroborating Evidence</i>	313
<i>Challenging the Confession at Trial</i>	313
<i>Failing to Object to the Admission of</i> <i>Confessions</i>	315
(b) Standing and Co-defendant Confessions	315
(c) The Use of Confessions for Impeachment Purposes	317
(d) Derivative Evidence	320
(e) Harmless Error	322
15.07 The Impact of <i>Miranda</i> on Other Standards	323
(a) The McNabb-Mallory Rule	323
(b) <i>Massiah</i> and <i>Escobedo</i> After <i>Miranda</i>	325
(c) The Reaction of Congress to <i>Miranda</i>	326
15.08 Conclusion	327

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART C

*THE PRETRIAL PROCESS

	Page
CHAPTER SIXTEEN. THE PRELIMINARY HEARING	331
Section	
16.01 Introduction	331
16.02 The Preliminary Hearing as a Means of Determining Probable Cause to Detain	333
(a) The Limits of <i>Gerstein</i>	334
(b) Procedural Protections During a <i>Gerstein</i> Hearing	335
16.03 The Bail Decision	336
16.04 The Preliminary Hearing as a Means of Determining Probable Cause to Prosecute or Bind Over the Defendant to the Grand Jury	337
16.05 The Preliminary Hearing as a Discovery Device ..	338
16.06 Conclusion	341
CHAPTER SEVENTEEN. BAIL	343
Section	
17.01 Introduction	343
17.02 Bail in Capital Cases	344
17.03 Operation of the Right to Bail	345
17.04 Types of Bail Systems	346
(a) The Money Bail System	346
(b) The Reform Movement	347
17.05 Preventive Detention	349
17.06 Conclusion	351
CHAPTER EIGHTEEN. PRETRIAL IDENTIFICATION	353
Section	
18.01 Introduction	353
18.02 Substantive Bases for Attack of Pretrial Identification	353
(a) Right to Counsel	353
<i>Timing of Procedure</i>	354
<i>Type of Procedure</i>	355
(b) The Due Process Standard	356
<i>Suggestiveness</i>	356
<i>Necessity</i>	357
<i>Reliability</i>	358
18.03 The Exclusionary Rule and the "Independent Source Test"	360
18.04 Procedure for Determining Admissibility	361
18.05 Lineups	363
(a) Compelling a Suspect to Participate	363
(b) Defense's Request for a Lineup	364
(c) The Role of Counsel	365
(d) Suggestiveness of Lineups	367

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER EIGHTEEN. PRETRIAL IDENTIFICATION—

Continued

Section	Page
18.06 Showups and Confrontations	368
(a) The Right to Counsel	368
(b) The Right to Due Process	369
(c) Accidental or Spontaneous Confrontations	370
18.07 Photograph Identification	371
(a) Right to Counsel	371
(b) Right to Due Process	372
<i>Number of Photographs</i>	372
<i>Composition of Display</i>	372
<i>Other Factors</i>	373
18.08 Conclusion	373
 CHAPTER NINETEEN. THE GRAND JURY	 375
Section	
19.01 Introduction	375
19.02 Types of Grand Juries	377
(a) The Charging Function of the Grand Jury	377
(b) The Investigatory Function of the Grand Jury	378
(c) The Supervisory Function of the Grand Jury	379
19.03 The Powers of Grand Juries	380
(a) Compelling Witness Attendance	380
(b) Subpoenas Duces Tecum	381
(c) Immunity Grants	382
19.04 The Role of the Court	382
19.05 Secrecy of Grand Jury Proceedings	383
19.06 Rights and Rules Applicable During the Grand Jury Process	384
(a) The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	385
(b) The Right to Counsel	387
(c) The Right to Appear and Confront Witnesses	389
(d) Applicability of the Rules of Evidence	389
19.07 Constitutional Requirements of Grand Jury Com- position	391
19.08 Conclusion	394
 X CHAPTER TWENTY. THE PROSECUTORIAL DUTY TO DISCLOSE EXCULPATORY INFORMATION	 396
Section	
20.01 Introduction	396
20.02 The Necessity of a Request and the Materiality Requirement	398
20.03 Timing of the Disclosure	400
20.04 Who Decides What Evidence is Disclosed?	403
20.05 What Constitutes Suppression?	404
20.06 Conclusion	405