

# WTO LAW

From a European Perspective

---

Edited by Birgitte Egelund Olsen, Michael Steinicke & Karsten Engsig Sørensen



Wolters Kluwer  
Law & Business

# **WTO Law**

From a European Perspective

Edited by

**Birgitte Egelund Olsen**

**Michael Steinicke**

**Karsten Engsig Sørensen**



**Wolters Kluwer**  
Law & Business

*Published by:*

Kluwer Law International  
PO Box 316  
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn  
The Netherlands  
Website: [www.kluwerlaw.com](http://www.kluwerlaw.com)

*Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:*

Aspen Publishers, Inc.  
7201 McKinney Circle  
Frederick, MD 21704  
United States of America  
Email: [customer.service@aspublishers.com](mailto:customer.service@aspublishers.com)

*Sold and distributed in all other countries by:*

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.  
Stratton Business Park  
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade  
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ  
United Kingdom  
Email: [kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com](mailto:kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com)

*Printed on acid-free paper.*

ISBN 978-90-411-3358-8

© 2012 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: [permissions@kluwerlaw.com](mailto:permissions@kluwerlaw.com)

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

## List of Contributors

### **Amin Alavi**

Associate professor Amin Alavi combines legal analysis and inputs from international relations theory to focus on the processes of legalisation and the impact of institutional factors and different legal instruments on the functioning of legal regimes. He has applied this approach on his research on *inter alia* WTO law and policy and EU external trade, with a focus on EU preferential trade agreements. He is the author of *Legalization of Development in the WTO* (2008) and several other articles such as 'Preferential Trade Agreements and the Law and Politics of GATT Article XXIV' (2010) and 'On the (Non-) Effectiveness of the World Trade Organization Special and Differential Treatments in the Dispute Settlement Process' (2007). He teaches courses on WTO law and international relations at Aarhus University. He has also been working as a consultant on WTO law and negotiations.

### **Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel**

Associate professor Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel holds a PhD from University of Copenhagen and is currently employed at University of Southern Denmark. His primary research areas are EU law and WTO Law, and he is author of the book 'WTO Adjudication', co-author of the book *WTO-Law – From a European Perspective*, co-author on a general book on EU law and author of a book on WTO dispute settlement. He has been responsible for setting up and teaching courses in 'WTO law' at University of Copenhagen (2003 and 2009) and University of Southern Denmark (2005–), international law (2003–) and EU law (2005–) at University of Southern Denmark. He has acted as panellist in the regional round of the Elsa WTO moot court competition from 2005 to 2008 and has been responsible for coaching the team from the University of Southern Denmark.

### **Hanne Kirk Deichmann**

Associate professor Hanne Kirk Deichmann is from the Department of Law, Aarhus University. She holds a PhD on Television Show Formats and does research on Intellectual Property Law. She has authored several contributions on this in national and international journals and books. She teaches courses in Copyright Law, Intellectual Property Rights and Market Law and is frequently used as external speaker on these subjects. She was appointed as High Court judge in a temporary position during the period 2010–2011. She is chairwoman of the Danish Public Lending Remuneration Board, member of the Danish Election Board (as an expert in names/brands) and she is member of the Danish Board of Appeal for Patents and Trademarks.

### **Pernille Wegener Jessen**

Associate professor Pernille Wegener Jessen is from the Department of Law, Aarhus University. Her primary research areas are EU law and trade law, specialising in competition law, especially State aid and subsidy law, and data protection law. She has authored several contributions on the subjects in national and international journals and books. Currently, she serves as supplemental member of the Danish Competition Council. Moreover, she is programme director for the MSc. in Business Administration and Commercial law at Aarhus University, a two-year full-time programme centering on law and economics.

### **Birgitte Egelund Olsen**

Professor Birgitte Egelund Olsen is from the Department of Law, Aarhus University and does research on general issues of EU law and WTO law, specialising in environmental law and the interaction between trade and environment. Her recent publications include the book *Liberalising Trade in the EU and the WTO: A Legal Comparison*, which she has co-edited. She was responsible for setting up the first regular ‘WTO law’ course at Aarhus University (2005–), and she currently directs the research project ‘WTO law and EU law: legal conflict and integration (2007-2011)’ funded by the Danish Council for Independent Research – Social Sciences. In addition, Prof. Egelund Olsen is the Director of the Executive Master in Environmental and Energy Law (MEEL) (a professional degree programme), and is member of the Danish Energy Board of Appeal.

### **Michael Steinicke**

Professor Michael Steinicke is Head of Department and professor of EU law at the Department of Law at the School of Business and Social Sciences, University of Aarhus. His primary research interest is international trade law, with a focus on free movement and competition issues regarding the relation between the state and the market (including public procurement law). He is co-author of the book

*Liberalising Trade in the EU and the WTO: A Legal Comparison* which will appear on Cambridge University Press in 2012, and other books on related issues in English and Danish and a number of articles as well. He has also been involved in a number of research projects on different trade and competition-related issues.

**Karsten Engsig Sørensen**

Professor Karsten Engsig Sørensen is professor at the Department of Law, Aarhus University. His primary research areas have been EU law, focusing on the internal market, WTO law, company law, competition law and EU tax law. He is the co-editor on the book *Liberalising Trade in the EU and the WTO: A Legal Comparison* which will appear on Cambridge University Press in 2012. He has authored several other books and articles and serves as co-editor of the SSRN Working Paper Series in Nordic and European Company Law. He is also programme director for the MSc. in EU Business and Law at Aarhus University, a two-year full-time programme focusing on EU law and economics.

## List of Abbreviations

ACP States	African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States
ACTA	Anti-Counterfeiting Trade Agreement
ADA	Anti-dumping Agreement
ASCM	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
ASG	Agreement on Safeguards
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
CAP	Common Agriculture Policy
CARICOM	Caribbean Community and Common Market
CCC	Customs Cooperation Council
CJ	Court of Justice of the European Union
CPC	Central Product Classification
CPVO	Community Plant Variety Office
CPVR	Community Plant Variety Right
CTE	Committee on Trade and Environment
CU	Custom Union
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body
DSU	Dispute Settlement Understanding
EBA	Everything-but-Arms
EC	European Community
ECB	European Central Bank
ECSC	European Coal and Steel Community
EEA	European Economic Area
EEC	European Economic Community
EFTA	European Free Trade Area
EPA	Economic Partnership Agreement
EPC	European Patent Convention
EPO	European Patent Office

## *List of Abbreviations*

EU	European Union
EURATOM	European Atomic Energy Community
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FTA	Free trade Area
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GI	Geographical Indications
GPA	Government Procurement Agreement
GSP	Generalized System of Preferences
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IGO	Inter-governmental Organisation
ILC	International Law Commission
ILD Rules	International Long Distance Rules
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LDCs	Least-Developed Countries
MAI	Multilateral Agreement on Investment
MEA	Multilateral Environmental Agreement
MFN	Most-Favoured-Nation
MIGA	Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAMA	Non-Agricultural Market Access
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OMA	Orderly Marketing Agreement
PACT	Plurilateral Agreement on Competition and Trade
PDO	Protected Designation of Origin
PPM	Processes and Production Method
RBP	Restrictive Business Practices
RTA	Regional Trade Agreement
S&DT	Special and Differential Treatments
SCM Agreement	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
SPS Agreement	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures
TBR	Trade Barrier Regulation
TBT Agreement	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPRM	Trade Policy Review Mechanism
TRIMs	Agreement on Trade-Related Investment Measures
TRIPS	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights



*List of Abbreviations*

UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UPOV	Union for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants
VER	Voluntary Export Restraint
WCO	World Customs Organization
WCT	WIPO Copyright Treaty
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization
WPPT	WIPO Performances and Phonograms Treaty
WTO	World Trade Organization

## Preface

This book on WTO law from a European perspective provides an analysis of the core legal concepts and some of the basic themes characterising the two most prominent and successful efforts in the regulation of international trade to date. The main focus is the regulation of trade in the WTO, but these efforts to regulate trade are compared with the parallel efforts of the EU. This comparison makes it easier for readers who are more familiar with EU law to understand the special features of WTO law, and to understand how WTO law and EU law interacts.

WTO and EU legislation and jurisprudence up to 1 August 2011 were taken into consideration. We would be grateful for any corrections that readers might suggest.

Our special thanks are addressed to Steven Harris and Tinna Meyer, who, with a lot of patience, took care of language corrections and coordination of the contributions from the writers. We thank Marina Bitsch Møller for making the table of cases.

Birgitte Egelund Olsen  
Michael Steinicke  
Karsten Engsig Sørensen  
November 2011

## Summary of Contents

<b>List of Contributors</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations</b>	<b>xxvii</b>
<b>Preface</b>	<b>xxxi</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Birgitte Egelund Olsen</i>	
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>The WTO Institutions</b>	<b>19</b>
<i>Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel</i>	
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>Dispute Settlement</b>	<b>37</b>
<i>Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel</i>	
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
<b>Interpretation, Sources of Law and Precedent</b>	<b>65</b>
<i>Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel</i>	
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>The WTO and the EU</b>	<b>79</b>
<i>Birgitte Egelund Olsen, Michael Steinicke &amp; Karsten Engsig Sørensen</i>	

<b>Chapter 6</b> <b>Trade in Goods</b> <i>Karsten Engsig Sørensen</i>	<b>113</b>
<b>Chapter 7</b> <b>Trade and the Environment</b> <i>Birgitte Egelund Olsen</i>	<b>181</b>
<b>Chapter 8</b> <b>Agriculture</b> <i>Amin Alavi</i>	<b>227</b>
<b>Chapter 9</b> <b>Safeguards</b> <i>Karsten Engsig Sørensen</i>	<b>243</b>
<b>Chapter 10</b> <b>Anti-dumping</b> <i>Pernille Wegener Jessen</i>	<b>261</b>
<b>Chapter 11</b> <b>Subsidies</b> <i>Pernille Wegener Jessen</i>	<b>295</b>
<b>Chapter 12</b> <b>Trade in Services</b> <i>Michael Steinicke</i>	<b>321</b>
<b>Chapter 13</b> <b>Trade and Intellectual Property Rights</b> <i>Hanne Kirk Deichmann</i>	<b>353</b>
<b>Chapter 14</b> <b>Regulation of Investment</b> <i>Michael Steinicke</i>	<b>393</b>
<b>Chapter 15</b> <b>Regional Trade Agreements</b> <i>Amin Alavi</i>	<b>407</b>
<b>Chapter 16</b> <b>Development</b> <i>Amin Alavi</i>	<b>423</b>

<b>Chapter 17</b>	
<b>Government Procurement</b>	<b>439</b>
<i>Michael Steinicke</i>	
<b>Chapter 18</b>	
<b>Competition Policy</b>	<b>463</b>
<i>Michael Steinicke</i>	
<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>479</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>497</b>

# Table of Contents

<b>List of Contributors</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations</b>	<b>xxvii</b>
<b>Preface</b>	<b>xxxix</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Birgitte Egelund Olsen</i>	
1. Main Issues	1
2. The Role of the WTO in International Trade Regulation	2
3. WTO Law from a European Perspective	3
4. GATT versus WTO	4
4.1. The International Trade Organization	5
4.2. The Origins and Evolution of the GATT	6
4.2.1. The GATT 'Birth Defects'	7
4.2.2. The GATT Rounds	8
4.3. The Creation of the WTO	9
4.3.1. Does the WTO Overcome the GATT 'Birth Defects'?	11
4.3.2. The WTO of Today	12
5. The Formation of the EU	14
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>The WTO Institutions</b>	<b>19</b>
<i>Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel</i>	
1. Main Issues	19
2. Institutional Issues	20

## Table of Contents

2.1.	The Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organisation	20
2.2.	The Preamble: WTO Objectives	20
2.3.	The WTO Agreements and Treaty Structure	21
2.4.	The Scope and Functions of the WTO	23
2.5.	The Institutional Structure of the World Trade Organization	24
2.6.	EU Institutional Issues	26
3.	WTO Decision-Making	29
3.1.	The General Rule: Consensus	29
3.2.	Interpretations	29
3.3.	Waivers	30
3.4.	Amendments	30
3.5.	EU Decision-Making	32
4.	Membership	33
4.1.	Original WTO Membership	33
4.2.	Accession	33
4.3.	Withdrawal	34
4.4.	EU Membership	34
5.	Trade Policy Review Mechanism	35

## Chapter 3

### Dispute Settlement

37

*Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel*

1.	Main Issues	37
2.	Origins of the WTO Dispute Settlement System	38
3.	The Dispute Settlement Understanding	39
3.1.	Coverage of WTO Dispute Settlement Procedures	39
3.2.	Dispute Settlement Institutions	40
3.3.	Dispute Settlement: Adjudicating Bodies	40
3.4.	Principles for Dispute Settlement	43
3.5.	Obligation to Have Recourse to the DSU	44
4.	The Dispute Settlement Procedure	45
4.1.	Overview: The Course of WTO Dispute Settlement	45
4.2.	Consultations	46
4.3.	Basis for Bringing a Complaint	47
4.4.	Access to WTO Dispute Settlement: Legal Standing	49
4.5.	The Panel Procedure	50
4.6.	Appellate Review	53
4.7.	Panel and Appellate Body Recommendations	54
5.	EU Dispute Settlement	55
6.	Implementation and Enforcement of DSB rulings	56
6.1.	Flowchart	57
6.2.	Implementation of DSB Rulings	58

6.3.	Review of Implementation	59
6.4.	Enforcement: Compensation and/or Suspension	60
7.	Implementation of Court Decisions and Enforcement in the EU	63

## Chapter 4

### **Interpretation, Sources of Law and Precedent** **65**

*Bugge Thorbjørn Daniel*

1.	Main Issues	65
2.	Interpretation	66
2.1.	The General Rule of Interpretation	67
2.2.	Interpretation in the EU	69
3.	Sources of WTO law	70
3.1.	Sources of Public International Law: The ICJ Statute	70
3.2.	WTO and International Law	71
3.3.	Limited Jurisdiction of Panels/Appellate Body	72
3.4.	Sources of EU Law	74
4.	Jurisprudence/Precedent	75
4.1.	GATT and WTO Dispute Settlement Reports	75
4.2.	The Limiting Provisions	77
4.3.	Jurisprudence and Precedent in EU Law	78

## Chapter 5

### **The WTO and the EU** **79**

*Birgitte Egelund Olsen, Michael Steinicke & Karsten Engsig Sørensen*

1.	Main Issues	79
2.	The Status of the EU in the WTO	81
2.1.	The EU as a Member of the WTO	81
2.1.1.	The Evolution of the EU's Membership	81
2.1.2.	The Reservation for Regional Trade Agreements	82
2.2.	The Competence to Enter into External Trade Agreements	83
2.2.1.	Competence in the Area of the Common Commercial Policy (Article 207)	84
2.2.1.1.	Opinion 1/94	84
2.2.1.2.	Amendments to the Treaty	86
2.2.2.	Implied Powers	86
2.2.3.	Exclusive and Shared Competence	88
2.3.	Procedure for Entering into International Agreements	89
3.	Trade Retaliation	90
4.	The Effects of WTO Law in the EU	92
4.1.	On Monism and Dualism	92
4.2.	Legal Effect of the WTO Agreements	94
4.2.1.	The WTO Agreements Are Part of the EU Legal Order	94



## Table of Contents

4.2.2.	The WTO Agreements Are Binding	95
4.2.3.	Interpretation of WTO Law	95
4.3.	WTO Law and Direct Effect	96
4.3.1.	Judicial Recognition of the Direct Effect of International Agreements	97
4.3.2.	Direct Effect and the GATT	98
4.3.3.	Recognition of Direct Effect at a Political Level	99
4.3.4.	Direct Effect and the WTO	100
4.3.5.	Direct Effect and Other Effects of the WTO Dispute Settlement Process	101
4.3.6.	Concluding Remarks on Direct Effect	103
4.4.	Judicial Review of EU Legislation	104
4.5.	Indirect Effects of WTO Law	106
4.6.	The Principle of Consistent Interpretation	107
5.	The Effect of WTO Law in the EU Member States	108

## Chapter 6

### Trade in Goods

113

*Karsten Engsig Sørensen*

1.	Main Issues	113
2.	Trade Restrictions within the Scope of the GATT	116
2.1.	Overview of Different Types of Restrictions and Exceptions	116
2.2.	Who Is Bound by the WTO Agreements on Trade in Goods?	118
2.3.	Goods Covered by GATT	119
3.	Tariffs on Imported Goods	121
3.1.	Negotiating Lower Tariffs and the MFN Principle	121
3.2.	Ensuring Compliance with Tariff Bindings	122
3.2.1.	Internal Taxes and Other Charges	123
3.2.2.	Valuation of Goods	125
3.2.3.	Tariff Classification	128
3.2.4.	Origin of Goods	130
3.3.	Removing Customs Duties in the EU	132
4.	Non-tariff Import Restrictions	133
4.1.	Prohibiting Quantitative Import Restrictions	133
4.1.1.	Quotas and Other Quantitative Restrictions	133
4.1.2.	Distinguishing Import Restrictions and Internal Trade Rules	136
4.1.3.	Exceptions to Article XI	139
4.2.	Regulating Import Procedures	140
4.3.	Prohibiting Quantitative Restrictions and Other Import Restrictions in the EU	142