# REGULATORY LAW AND POLICY: CASES AND MATERIALS

THIRD EDITION

Sidney A. Shapiro Joseph P. Tomain



### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Shapiro, Sidney A., 1947-

Regulatory law and policy : cases and materials / Sidney A. Shapiro, Joseph P. Tomain.--3rd ed.

p. cm. -

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-8205-5758-7

1. Administrative procedure--United States--Cases. 2. Delegated legislation--United States--Cases. 3. Administrative agencies--United States--Decidion making--Case studies. I. Tomain, Joseph P., 1948-II. Title.

KF5411.S53 2003

342.73'066--dc21

2003047742

ISBN#: 0820557587

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis, the knowledge burst logo, and Michie are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc, used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2003 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 10¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

Editorial Offices
744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
701 East Water Street, Charlottesville, VA 22902-7587 (804) 972-7600
www.lexis.com

Dedicated to
Justice Stephen Breyer
whose scholarship on administrative law
and government regulation inspired this book.

## PREFACE TO THE THIRD EDITION

Regulatory Law and Policy explores regulatory decision making, but unlike the traditional course in administrative law, it focuses on the substance of government regulation. The focus has two parts. You will study the justifications for regulation and the methods or "tools" that are used to implement the regulation. When you are finished, your understanding of the basic concepts that underlie regulatory law and policy should enable you to pursue specific areas of regulation more effectively.

Regulatory law and practice involves special lawyering skills, and those skills are addressed in this book. Like lawyers that practice in other disciplines, regulatory lawyers must be able to read and understand statutes and cases. These establish the authority of an agency to regulate and specify the limits of its authority. But those who are involved in a regulatory practice must also have an understanding of the policy and political aspects of administrative regulation. Moreover, this need does not differ when a lawyer's focus is a state or local agency instead of a federal one.

Although policy, politics, and law are three elements of administrative regulation, only the third element—the legal limits of regulation—is covered in most other law school courses. Our aim is to permit you to consider the missing elements—how policy and politics affect regulatory decisions—and how these elements are related to the legal authority of agencies. For this reason, although we do not neglect the study of the legal limits of regulation, we emphasize policy analysis and politics. Because of this emphasis, this course is a complement to other courses about regulation, such as environmental law, securities law, and labor law that you might take or have taken.

Our goal is to teach you "regulatory analysis," which functions similarly to case analysis, uncovers the principles and arguments behind the justifications for government intervention in markets, and reveals the strengths and weaknesses of the regulatory tools employed to correct market defects. Regulatory analysis is a way of understanding government regulation by identifying and analyzing patterns of regulatory activity that cut across industries and markets, just as case analysis cuts across various areas of private law. Regulatory analysis also helps explain the limits and benefits of regulatory tools. Finally, in the situation of deregulation and regulatory reform, regulatory analysis can explicate the limits of regulation itself.

The 3<sup>rd</sup> edition explores these themes relying on the prior edition but with updated material to reflect important developments, including the fate of the Telecommunications Act of 1996, the collapse of the airline industry, new farm subsidy legislation, the fate of the 1996 welfare reform legislation, and the 2001 No Child Left Behind Act, reforming federal educational support. We also track the significant new Supreme Court cases, especially involving takings law and commercial free speech.

Part I of the casebook explores these ideas by providing different perspectives on government regulation. Chapter 1 presents a short history of

government regulation and a case study to illustrate the entire regulatory process. Chapter 2 introduces the topics of market analysis and policy analysis by introducing you to the reasons and justifications for government regulation. Chapter 3 explores the politics of regulation, particularly as it relates to public participation before regulatory agencies. In summary, Part I examines the contextual background of the regulatory state.

Parts II and III are organized according to the various justifications for government regulation. In each chapter, we examine a specific justification for government regulation and one or more regulatory programs that were enacted in response to that justification. For each regulatory program, the materials address two policy issues: Is the justification for regulation defensible, and is the government utilizing the appropriate regulatory method or tool? The materials also raise legal and political issues, although the extent of this coverage varies depending on the regulatory program being studied.

We have considered the writing of this casebook as a conversation about the nature of government and its potential to improve or hinder the development of society. We hope that our efforts will not only educate you about the practice of regulatory law, but that it will also challenge you to contemplate the role of government in making this a better society.

Dean Joseph Tomain would like to thank his research assistants, Dan Dodd, Joshua Nolan, and Emily Shults for their invaluable help in the preparation of this edition.

Sidney A. Shapiro Joseph P. Tomain

Lawrence, Kansas Cincinnati, Ohio March 1, 2003

# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	v
PART I INTRODUCTION	
Chapter 1 THE REGULATORY PROCESS	3
A. REGULATORY PERSPECTIVES B. A HISTORY OF REGULATION C. EXPLAINING REGULATORY CYCLES D. THE AIR BAG CONTROVERSY E. A DYNAMIC RELATIONSHIP	3 4 26 29 36
Chapter 2 REGULATION AND PUBLIC POLICY	39
A. REGULATORY GOALS	40 65 67
Chapter 3 REGULATION AND POLITICS	73
A. DEMOCRATIC THEORY B. PUBLIC CHOICE C. THE PROBLEM OF COLLECTIVE ACTION D. RELATIONSHIP OF POLITICS AND POLICY	73 78 83 88
PART II ECONOMIC REGULATION	
Chapter 4 NATURAL MONOPOLY: PRICE CONTROLS AND ELECTRICITY REGULATION	101
A. THE RATIONALE FOR REGULATION  B. REGULATORY OPTIONS C. COST-OF-SERVICE RATEMAKING D. LEGAL BASES FOR REGULATION E. ELECTRICITY REGULATION F. RATE REFORM	101 105 107 115 139 156
Chapter 5 BOTTLENECKS I: ENTRY AND EXIT CONTROLS AND THE NATURAL GAS INDUSTRY	171
A. IMPOSING ENTRY CONTROLS B. EASING ENTRY CONTROLS	172

	Page
C. EXIT CONTROLS	193 213
Chapter 6 BOTTLENECKS II: ENTRY CONTROLS AND TELECOMMUNICATIONS	223 224
B. REGULATION OF LOCAL TELEPHONE MARKETS	231 248 288
Chapter 7 ECONOMIC RENTS: WEALTH DISTRIBUTION AND HOUSING RENTALS	291
A. REGULATORY JUSTIFICATIONS B. REGULATORY METHODS C. CASE STUDY: RENTAL HOUSING D. CONSTITUTIONALITY	291 293 304 315
Chapter 8 EXCESSIVE COMPETITION: AIRLINE REGULATION AND FARM PROGRAMS	335
A. AIRLINE REGULATION	335 353
PART III SOCIAL REGULATION	
Chapter 9 SPILLOVER COSTS: ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION	377
A. THE ECONOMICS OF SPILLOVER COSTS  B. WORKPLACE HEALTH: A CASE STUDY  C. THE COST-BENEFIT DEBATE  D. REGULATORY REFORM	378 392 400 415
Chapter 10 INADEQUATE INFORMATION: DRUG AND OCCUPATIONAL LICENSING	425
A. JUSTIFICATIONS FOR REGULATION	426
INFORMATION	432 434 445 459
Chapter 11 GOVERNMENT ALLOCATION: RADIO AND TELEVISION LICENSING AND ADOPTION	471
A RADIO AND TELEVISION LICENSING	472

SI	MIV	TARV	TARI	E OF	CON	PENTS

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS			
	Page		
B. ADOPTION	510		
Chapter 12 PUBLIC GOODS: SOCIAL WELFARE PROGRAMS			
AND SUBSIDIES	523		
A. SOCIAL WELFARE PROGRAMS	523		
B. TAX PREFERENCES AND SUBSIDIES	560		
Chapter 13 PUBLIC GOODS: EDUCATION ENTITLEMENTS	575		
A. PURPOSE AND STRUCTURE OF REGULATION	576		
B. SCHOOL REFORM	585		
C. EQUALITY IN SCHOOL SPENDING	620		
Table of Cases	TC-1		
Table of Statutes	TS-1		
Index	I-1		

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	v
Summary Table of Contents	vii
PART I	
INTRODUCTION	
Chapter 1 THE REGULATORY PROCESS	3
A. REGULATORY PERSPECTIVES	3
B. A HISTORY OF REGULATION	4
1. The Mercantilist Era	4
2. The Laissez-Faire Era	6
3. The Populist Era	7
4. The Progressive Era	9
5. The New Deal Era	13
6. The Great Society and Public Interest Eras	16
7. The Regulatory Reform Era	19
Notes and Questions	24
C. EXPLAINING REGULATORY CYCLES	26
1. Incompatible Traditions	26
2. Imperfection of Government	26
Notes and Questions	28
D. THE AIR BAG CONTROVERSY	29
Notes and Questions	33
E. A DYNAMIC RELATIONSHIP	36
Chapter 2 REGULATION AND PUBLIC POLICY	
	39
A. REGULATORY GOALS	40
1. Economic Goals	42
a. The Perfectly Competitive Market	42
(1) Demand	43
(2) Supply	44

	Page
(3) Equilibrium	44
(4) Costs	45
(5) Marginal Revenue	46
(6) Industry Price and Firm Price	47
(7) Price Elasticity of Demand	49
b. The Benefits of Efficient Markets	49
c. Market Defects	50
(1) Competitive Conditions	51
(2) Restricted Entry or Exit	53
(3) External Costs	53
(4) Inadequate and Inaccurate Information	54
(5) Public Goods	55
Notes and Questions	56
2. Noneconomic Goals	58
a. Prohibit Objectionable Exchanges	58
b. Eliminate Price as the Basis of Exchange	59
c. Remedy Distribution of Wealth	59
d. Subject Exchanges to Collective Values	60
Notes and Questions	60
3. Economic Versus Noneconomic Justifications	62
a. Positive and Normative Economics	63
b. Economic and Noneconomic Tradeoffs	63
Notes and Questions	64
B. REGULATORY METHODS	65
1. Price Controls	65
2. Entry and Exit Controls	65
3. Standard Setting	66
4. Allocation	66
5. Taxes and Other Economic Incentives	66
C. REGULATORY ANALYSIS	67
Notes and Questions	69
Chapter 3 REGULATION AND POLITICS	<b>7</b> 3
A. DEMOCRATIC THEORY	73

	Page
1. Pluralist Defense	74
2. Republican Thesis	74
Sunstein, The Partial Constitution	75
3. Deliberative Democracy	76
Gutman & Thompson, Democracy and Disagreement	76
Notes and Questions	78
B. PUBLIC CHOICE	78
Levine, Revisionism Revised: Airline Deregulation and the Public	
Interest	79
Notes and Questions	82
C. THE PROBLEM OF COLLECTIVE ACTION	83
Wilson, The Politics of Regulation	84
Notes and Questions	87
D. RELATIONSHIP OF POLITICS AND POLICY	88
1. Influence of Policy	88
2. Influence of Politics	90
3. Impact of Legal Procedures	92
Notes and Questions	94
PART II ECONOMIC REGULATION	
Chapter 4 NATURAL MONOPOLY: PRICE CONTROLS AND ELECTRICITY REGULATION	101
A. THE RATIONALE FOR REGULATION	101
1. Natural Monopoly	101
2. Impact on Consumers	101
Notes and Questions	104
B. REGULATORY OPTIONS	104
1. Regulatory Compact	105
2. Regulatory Markets	106
C. COST-OF-SERVICE RATEMAKING	107
1. Ratemaking Goals	108
a. Production Motivation or Capital Attraction	108
b. Efficiency Incentive	108
c. Demand Control or Consumer Rationing	108

	Page
d. Income Distribution	108
2. The Rate Formula	109
a. Operating Expenses	109
b. Rate Base	110
c. Rate of Return	111
d. Revenue Requirement	112
3. Rate Formula Consequences	114
Notes and Questions	115
D. LEGAL BASES FOR REGULATION	115
1. Substantive Due Process	116
2. Takings Clause	118
a. Rate Base	118
b. Rate of Return	120
3. The <i>Hope</i> Case	120
Federal Power Commission v. Hope Natural Gas	121
Notes and Questions	124
a. <i>Hope</i> Debated	126
Jersey Central Power & Light Co. v. FERC	128
Notes and Questions	133
b. Hope Redux	136
Duquense Light Co. v. Barasch	136
Notes and Questions	138
E. ELECTRICITY REGULATION	139
Tomain, The Past and Future of Electricity Regulation	140
Tomain, The Persistence of Natural Monopoly	143
New York v. FERC	146
Notes and Questions	149
1. Market Standardization	150
2. Energy Trading	151
Tomain, The Past and Future of Electricity Regulation	152
F RATE REFORM	156

	1
	1. Marginal Cist Pricing
	Notes and Questions
	2. Price Level Regulation
	Pierce, Price Level Regulation Based on Inflation is not an Attractive Alternative to Profit Level Regulation
	Hillman & Braeutigam, The Potential Benefits and Problems of Price Level Regulation: A More Hopeful Perspective
	Notes and Questions
	3. Market Based Rates
	Public Service Commission of Indiana
	Notes and Questions
Chapter AND TH	5 BOTTLENECKS I: ENTRY AND EXIT CONTROLS E NATURAL GAS INDUSTRY
A. IMPOS	SING ENTRY CONTROLS
	1. The Natural Gas Inductry
	2. Early Regulation
	3. Traditional Federal Regulation
	Federal Power Commission v. Transcontinental Gas
	Co
	Notes and Questions
	4. The Beginning of Regulatory Failure
	5. Regulatory Failure
	G ENTRY CONTROLS
	stribution Cos. v. FERC
	Questions
o. Lair (	CONTROLS
	1. Imposing Exit Controls
	California v. Southland Royalty Co
	United Gas Pipe Line Co. v. McCombs
	Notes and Questions
	2. Easing Exit Controls
	Commission
	Consolidated Edison Co. of New York v. FERC

	Page
Notes and Questions	207
Order No. 490-A	208
Mobil Oil Exploration & Production v. FERC	209
Mobil Oil Exploration & Production v. United Distribution	
Co.	211
Notes and Questions	213
D. ALLOCATION CONTROLS	213
Consolidated Edison Co. v. FERC	214
Notes and Questions	220
Chapter 6 BOTTLENECKS II: ENTRY CONTROLS AND TELECOMMUNICATIONS	223
	20.4
A. HISTORY OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS REGULATION	224
1. Telephony	225
a. The First 100 Years	225
b. The Post-1982 Decree Era	227
c. The Post-1996 Act Era	228
2. Radio and Television Broadcasting	228
3. Internet	231
4. Cable Television	231
B. REGULATION OF LOCAL TELEPHONE MARKETS	231
$AT\&T\ v.\ Iowa\ Utilities\ Board\ \dots\dots\dots\dots\dots\dots\dots\dots$	232
Verizon Communication, Inc. v. FCC	239
Notes and Questions	247
C. REGULATION OF CABLE TELEVISION	248
1. Regulatory History	248
2. Rate Regulation	251
a. Regulatory Justification	251
Omega Satellite Prods. Co. v. City of Indianapolis	252
Notes and Questions	252
b. Regulatory Reform	254
P.L. 104-104, Telecommunications Competition and Regulation Act of 1995	258
Notes and Questions	259
2. Entry Controls	259
a Cross-Ownership Rules	260

b. Must-Carry and Duplication Rules
In the Matter of: Amendment of Subpart L, Part 91 to Adopt Rules and Regulations to Govern the Grant of Authorizations in the Business Radio Service for Microwave Stations
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. v. FCC (Turner Broadcasting II)
Notes and Questions
3. First Amendment Limitations
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. v. FCC (Turner Broadcasting I)
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. v. FCC (Turner Broadcasting II)
Fox Television Stations, Inc. v. FCC
Notes and Questions
D. THE FUTURE OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS
AND HOUSING RENTALS
B. REGULATORY METHODS
1. Historically-Based Price Controls
a. Price Controls During World War II and the Korean War
b. Exemptions
c. Rationing
M. Kraus & Brothers v. United States
Notes and Questions
2. Windfall Profits Taxes
Conte, Or Tax Excess Profits
Notes and Questions
C. CASE STUDY: RENTAL HOUSING
Epstein, Rent Control and the Theory of Efficient Regulation
Keating, Commentary on "Rent Control and the Theory of Efficient Regulation"
Mandel, Does Rent Control Hurt Tenants?: A Reply to Epstein
Radin, Residential Rent Control
Olsen, Is Rent Control Good Social Policy?

	Page
Notes and Questions	312
D. CONSTITUTIONALITY	315
Block v. Hirsh	315
Notes and Questions	315
Pennell v. City of San Jose	316
Notes and Questions	319
Seawall Associates v. City of New York	322
Yee v. City of Escondido, California	327
Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional Planning	
Agency	329
Notes and Questions	332
Chapter 8 EXCESSIVE COMPETITION: AIRLINE	
REGULATION AND FARM PROGRAMS	335
A. AIRLINE REGULATION	335
1. Regulation	335
a. Regulation and Subsidies	336
b. Regulation and Excessive Competition	336
2. Deregulation	338
Notes and Questions	339
3. After Deregulation	340
a. Lower Prices	340
b. Instability and Consolidation	341
c. Hub and Spoke System	342
d. Fare Discrimination	343
e. Short Trips and Remote Areas	344
Notes and Questions	344
4. Regulatory Reform	346
a. Expansion	347
Victor, Hub Cap	347
b. Auctions and Lotteries	348
c. Congestion Pricing	349
Morrison & Winston, Enhancing the Performance of the	
Deregulated Air Transportation System	349
d. Regulation of Slots and Gates	350
e. Regulation of Service	351

TIBLE OF CONTENTS	Alz
	Page
Notes and Questions	351
B. FARM PROGRAMS	353
1. The History of Regulation	353
a. New Deal Programs	353
b. Post-War Programs	354
c. The 1996 Agricultural Improvement and Reform Act (FAIR ACT)	355
d. The Farm Security and Rural Investment Act of 2002	356
2. The Justification for Regulation	356
Notes and Questions	358
3. Regulatory Reform	359
United States Department of Agriculture, Food and Agricultural Policy: Taking Stock for the New Century	359
Notes and Questions	364
4. Politics and Regulation	365
Notes and Questions	366
5. Regulatory Tools	367
Federal Agricultural Improvement and Reform Act of 1996	368
Farm Security and Rural Investment Act of 2002	370
Notes and Questions	373
PART III SOCIAL REGULATION	
Chapter 9 SPILLOVER COSTS: ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION	377
A. THE ECONOMICS OF SPILLOVER COSTS	378
1. Coase's Theorem	380
2. Tort Rules — Calabresi and Melamed	381
a. Common Law Options	382
b. Transaction Costs	382
c. Distributional Consequences	385
Notes and Questions	206