
The UN Committee against Torture

An Assessment

Chris Ingelse

Kluwer Law International

The UN Committee against Torture

An Assessment

by

Chris Ingelse



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-1650-8

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.
kluwerlaw@wkap.com

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2001 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the result of a research project conducted from 1994 to 1999 under the supervision of prof.dr. Th.C. van Boven, of Universiteit Maastricht, and prof.dr. C. Flinterman of Universiteit Utrecht. The results have been published before in Dutch in my dissertation: C. Ingelse, *De rol van het Comité in de ontwikkeling van het VN-Verdrag tegen Foltering*. Amsterdam: ThelaThesis, 1999. The dissertation was defended on 26 March 1999 in Maastricht. I am indebted to my supervisors, whose support and confidence have helped to bring the research project to a successful end. They encouraged me to have the dissertation published in English.

There was more encouragement, and – importantly – support for a request for funding of the translation from the following: Mr. J.H. Burgers, former chairman of the working group that drafted the Convention against Torture, prof.dr. B. Sørensen, former member of the Committee against Torture, prof.dr. M.T. Kamminga and dr. H. van der Wilt, both of Universiteit Maastricht, and prof.dr. B. de Witte of the European University Institute in Florence.

Financial support for the translation from the Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek (NWO, the Dutch Organisation for Scientific Research) is gratefully acknowledged. J. Turner, Dip.Trans., of Adept Translators Utrecht did an excellent job of translating.

The text of this book was completed on 16 November 2000. The research has been updated with relevant material of the Committee against Torture up to that date.

Chris Ingelse

Contact information:
Boels Zanders Advocaten
PO Box 1750
NL-6201 BT Maastricht
The Netherlands
E: ingelse@boelszanders.nl

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AFDI	Annuaire Français de Droit International
African Charter	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AI	Amnesty International
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
APT	Association pour la Prévention de la Torture
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW	Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
Cir.	Circuit
CRC	Committee on the Rights of the Child
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
Dig.	Digestae
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
Ecomm.HR	European Commission of Human Rights
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EGZ	Europäische Grundrechte Zeitschrift

FILJ	Florida International Law Journal
GA	United Nations General Assembly
GYIL	German Yearbook of International Law
HLR	Harvard Law Review
HRLJ	Human Rights Law Journal
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRQ	Human Rights Quarterly
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICJ Review	Review of the International Commission of Jurists
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICTFY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILO	International Labour Organization
IO	International Organization
IYHR	Israel Yearbook on Human Rights
NILR	Netherlands International Law Review
NJB	Nederlands Juristenblad
NJCM	Nederlands Juristen Comité voor de Mensenrechten
NJIL	Nordic Journal of International Law
NQHR	Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights
NYIL	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
PYIL	Polish Yearbook of International Law
RCADI	Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International
RIDP	Revue Internationale de Droit Pénal
SIM	Studie- en Informatiecentrum Mensenrechten
SR	Summary Record
UN	United Nations

UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
VJIL	Virginia Journal of International Law
Women's Committee	Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
Women's Convention	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
WWW	World-Wide Web
YJIL	Yale Journal of International Law

UN-DOCUMENTS

The origin of a UN document can be established by means of the UN document reference number:

A/..	General Assembly
A/49/44 (1994)	General Assembly 49th session, 1994, 44th item: Annual report of the Committee against Torture
CAT/..	Convention against Torture
CCPR/..	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
CEDAW/..	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CERD/..	International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination
CRC/..	Convention on the Rights of the Child
../C/..	Committee
CAT/C/..	Committee against Torture
A/C.3/..	General Assembly, Third Committee
../SR.	Summary record
CAT/C/SR.25	Committee against Torture, summary record of the 25th meeting
../D/..	Decision
CAT/C/18/D/27/ 1995 (1997)	Committee against Torture, 18th session, view on communication number 27, communication registered in 1995, view adopted in 1997.
../Add.	Addendum
../CONF.	Conference
../Corr.	Corrigendum
../Rev.	Revision
../L.	Limited distribution

../R.	Restricted distribution
../SP	States Parties
../WG.	Working group
../NGO	Document containing communications from non-governmental organisations
../PR.	Press release
../CORE/..	Core document
E/..	Economic and Social Council
E/C.12/..	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
E/CN.4/..	Commission on Human Rights
HRI/..	Human Rights Instruments
Res	Resolution
A/Res/..	General Assembly Resolution
S/..	Security Council
UN	United Nations
UNdoc	UN document

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	xiv
UN-documents	xvii

CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION

1 Introduction	1
2 Context	2
3 Reasons for this Study	4
4 Core Questions	6
5 Approach and Reading Guide	7
6 Basic Assumptions	9
6.1 Law Cannot Exist Without a Test	11
6.2 Law is the Result of a Targeted Process	13
6.3 A Normative Test for Law	14
6.4 Consequences for the Substance of Law	15
6.5 Consequences for the Sources of International Law	17
7 Final Considerations	18

PART I – CONTEXT

CHAPTER 2 – THE EVOLUTION TOWARDS AN INTERNATIONAL BAN ON TORTURE

1 Introduction	21
2 A Historical Overview of Torture in Law and Practice: from a Legitimate Practice to an Absolute Ban	23
2.1 From Roman to Modern Times	24
2.2 Modern Times	28
3 Standards of Human Dignity in Interstate Relations	31

3.1 The Period until 1914: 'Sovereign' States and Democratisation	35
3.1.1 From Religious to Humanitarian Interferences and Interventions ..	35
3.1.2. Humanitarian Law of Armed Conflict	37
3.1.3 Slavery and the Slave Trade	38
3.2 Period 1914-1940: Institutionalisation of International Concern for the Treatment of Individuals	40
3.3 The Second World War as Crystallising Point	43
4 First Steps of the United Nations	43
5 Final Considerations	46

CHAPTER 3 – BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE

1 Introduction	48
2 The Ban on Torture in Human Rights Treaties	49
3 The Work of the United Nations on the Basis of the Charter	55
3.1 Procedures on the Basis of Resolution 1235	56
3.2 Procedures on the basis of Resolution 1503	57
4 Practice under Human Rights Treaties	58
4.1 Definitions of and Distinction between Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	58
4.2 Treatment of Prisoners	62
4.3 Corporal Punishment	63
4.4 The Death Penalty	64
4.5 Non-refoulement	64
4.6 Supporting Measures	65
5 The Background to the Convention against Torture	66
5.1 The Efforts of Amnesty International	67
5.2 The UN Declaration against Torture	68
6 The Drafting of the UN Convention against Torture	73
6.1 Preparation in the Commission's Working Group	74
6.2 Preparation and Adoption in the General Assembly	79
7 Final Considerations	83

PART II – THE ROLE OF THE COMMITTEE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SUPERVISORY PROCEDURES

CHAPTER 4 – THE COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE

1	Introduction	89
2	Explicit Powers	90
3	Implied Powers	91
4	Membership	93
5	The Independence and Impartiality of the Committee	96
5.1	Potential Sources of Manipulation	97
5.2	Guarantees of Institutional Impartiality and Independence	100
6	Organisation of the Work of the Committee	104
6.1	The Functions of the Committee Members	104
6.2	Sessions	105
6.3	Intersession Activities	107
6.4	The Provision of Information by the Committee	108
6.5	Meeting Order	109
6.6	The Secretariat	110
7	The Input of NGOs	112
8	Contacts with Other Supervisory Bodies	115
8.1	The Human Rights Committee	115
8.2	The Special Rapporteur against Torture	116
8.3	The European Committee on the Prevention of Torture	118
9	Funding	120
10	Final Considerations	122

CHAPTER 5 – THE REPORTING SYSTEM

1	Introduction	124
2	The Purpose of Reporting	126
3	The Submission of Reports	129
3.1	Initial Reports	129
3.2	Periodic Reports	132

3.3 Additional Reports	133
3.4 Ad Hoc Reports	135
4 Non-reporting States	137
5 Consideration of Reports	140
5.1 Information Sources of the Committee	141
5.2 'Constructive Dialogue' with the State Delegation	144
5.3 Conclusions and Recommendations	146
6 Authority to Issue General Comments	150
7 Final Considerations	153

CHAPTER 6 – THE INQUIRY INTO SYSTEMATIC TORTURE

1 Introduction	157
2 Course of the Procedure	158
3 The Inquiry Procedure in Practice	164
4 Similar Activities of Other Bodies	169
4.1 The Special Rapporteur on Torture	169
4.2 The European Committee on the Prevention of Torture	170
4.3 Inquiry by Other Treaty Bodies	172
5 Final Considerations	173

CHAPTER 7 – COMPLAINTS PROCEDURES

1 Introduction	176
2 The Individual Complaints Procedure	176
2.1 The Preliminary Phase of the Procedure	177
2.2 Consideration of Individual Complaints	178
2.2.1 The Consideration of the Admissibility Issues	180
2.2.2 Consideration of the Merits	188
2.3 The Number of Complaints	194
2.4 The Status of the Committee's Decisions	196
3 The State Complaints Procedure	197
4 Final Considerations	200

PART III – THE ROLE OF THE COMMITTEE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SUBSTANTIAL PROVISIONS

CHAPTER 8 – THE DEFINITION OF TORTURE

1	Introduction	205
2	The Convention Provision	205
2.1	Article 1	205
2.2	Lawful Sanctions	211
3	The Practice of the Committee	217
3.1	The Inclusion in National Law of a Definition of Torture	218
3.2	Elements of Torture	222
3.2.1	State Involvement	222
3.2.2	Severe Physical or Mental Suffering	225
3.3	Lawful Sanctions	231
3.4	Article 1 Paragraph 2	237
4	Final Considerations	238

CHAPTER 9 – PREVENTION OF TORTURE AND OTHER CRUEL, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT

1	Introduction	241
2	The Convention Provisions	241
2.1	General Measures against Torture: Article 2 Paragraph 1	241
2.2	Article 2 Paragraph 2	245
2.3	Article 2 Paragraph 3	245
2.4	Specific Measures against Torture: Articles 10 and 11	246
2.5	General Measures against Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment: Article 16	247
3	The Practice of the Committee	249
3.1	General Measures against Torture: Article 2 Paragraph 1	249
3.1.1	Due Process and Conditions of Detention	252
3.1.2	The Judicial Organisation	257
3.1.3	Direct Effect	259
3.1.4	Gradual Implementation?	261
3.1.5	The Individual Right to be Protected from Torture	262
3.2	Article 2 Paragraph 2	263
3.3	Article 2 Paragraph 3	266

3.4 Specific Measures Against Torture: Articles 10 and 11	271
3.5 General Measures against Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment: Article 16	273
3.5.1 Conditions of Detention	275
3.5.2 Punishments	277
3.5.3 The Death Penalty	279
3.5.4 Other Matters of Interest	285
4 Final Considerations	287

CHAPTER 10 – NON-REFOULEMENT WHEN AT RISK OF BEING SUBJECTED TO TORTURE

1 Introduction	290
2 The Convention Provision	290
3 The Practice of the Committee	293
3.1 Article 3 in the Individual Complaints Procedure	293
3.1.1 Minimum Substantiation	294
3.1.2 Evidence	296
3.1.3 Establishing a Danger of Torture	298
3.1.4 General Comment on Article 3: A Summary of the Committee's Practice	306
3.1.5 The Human Rights Committee on <i>Non-refoulement</i>	308
3.2 Article 3 in the Reporting Procedure	312
4 Final Considerations	315

CHAPTER 11 – CRIMINAL ENFORCEMENT

1 Introduction	318
2 The Convention Provisions	319
2.1 Criminalisation	319
2.2 Establishing Criminal Jurisdiction: Article 5	320
2.2.1 Scope of Universal Jurisdiction	321
2.3 Exercise of Criminal Jurisdiction: Articles 6 and 7	327
2.3.1 Pre-trial Detention of the Suspect and Preliminary Inquiry	327
2.3.2 Prosecution and <i>Aut Dedere Aut Judicare</i>	328
2.3.3 Obligation to Prosecute	329
2.3.4 Immunity of High-ranking Officials	330
2.4 Other Points of Criticism	332

2.5 Extradition and International Judicial Assistance: Articles 8 and 9	334
2.6 Investigation: Articles 12 and 13	335
3 The Practice of the Committee	337
3.1 Criminalisation: Article 4	337
3.1.1 Torture as Separate Offence	337
3.1.2 Appropriateness of Penalties	341
3.2 Establishment and Exercise of Criminal Jurisdiction: Articles 5, 6 and 7	342
3.2.1 Prosecution and Trial	342
3.2.2 Universal Jurisdiction	350
3.3 Extradition and International Judicial Assistance: Articles 8 and 9	352
3.4 Investigation: Articles 12 and 13	354
4 Final Considerations	357

CHAPTER 12 – VICTIMS OF TORTURE

1 Introduction	361
2 The Convention Provisions	361
2.1 The Right of Complaint and Protection of the Complainant: Article 13	361
2.2 Redress: Article 14	362
2.3 Torture Provides no Evidence: Article 15	365
3 The Practice of the Committee	366
3.1 The Right of Complaint and the Protection of the Complainant: Article 13	366
3.2 Redress: Article 14	370
3.2.1 The Human Rights Committee on Redress	377
3.3 Torture Provides no Evidence: Article 15	379
4 Final Considerations	383

CHAPTER 13 – CONCLUSION

1 Introduction	386
2 Basic Assumptions	386
3 Findings	390
3.1 The Convention against Torture	390

3.2 The Role of the Committee in the Development of Monitoring Procedures	391
3.2.1 The Committee against Torture (Articles 17 and 18)	391
3.2.2 The Reporting System (Article 19)	392
3.2.3 The Inquiry Procedure (Article 20)	393
3.2.4 Complaints Procedures (Articles 21 and 22)	395
3.3 The Role of the Committee in the Development of the Substantive Treaty Obligations	397
3.3.1 Definition of Torture (Article 1)	397
3.3.2 Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Articles 2, 10, 11 and 16)	398
3.3.3 <i>Non-refoulement</i> with respect to the Danger of Torture (Article 3)	399
3.3.4 Criminal Enforcement (Articles 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 12)	400
3.3.5 Victims of Torture (Articles 13, 14 and 15)	402
4 Final Considerations	403
4.1 The Contribution of the Committee against Torture	403
4.2 What Remains for the Committee?	405
 Annex – Convention against Torture	 409
Literature	424
Sources of Case Law	439
Index	449