

ASPEN COURSEBOOK SERIES

OTIS AND FIONA OLMAN,
Plaintiffs,

vs.

Case No. _____

FULL MOON SPORTS, INC.,
& BRUCE BELCHER

AN ILLUSTRATED GUIDE TO

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Second Edition

Michael P. Allen • Michael Finch

Relations Commission on September 1, 2009, and the EEOC subsequently issued Plaintiffs a right-to-sue letter on March 1, 2010.

Parties

4. Otis Olman ("Olman") is former manager of the "Full Moon Outdoor Center," a retail sporting goods store located in Jacksonville, Florida, and owned by defendant, Full Moon Sports, Inc. ("Full Moon"). Olman was



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

ASPEN COURSEBOOK SERIES

AN ILLUSTRATED GUIDE TO CIVIL PROCEDURE

SECOND EDITION

MICHAEL P. ALLEN

STETSON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

MICHAEL FINCH

STETSON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

© 2011 Aspen Publishers. All Rights Reserved.
<http://lawschool.aspenpublishers.com>

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Aspen Publishers
Attn: Permissions Department
76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10011-5201

To contact Customer Care, e-mail customer.service@aspenpublishers.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Aspen Publishers
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-0-7355-0953-5

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Allen, Michael, 1967-
An illustrated guide to civil procedure / Michael P. Allen,
Michael Finch.--2nd ed. p. cm.
Includes index.
ISBN-13: 978-0-7355-0953-5 (pbk.: alk. paper)
ISBN-10: 0-7355-0953-0 (pbk.: alk. paper)
1. Civil procedure--United States. I. Finch, Michael, 1952- .
II. Title.
KF8840.A74 2011
347.73'5--dc22

2010052145

AN ILLUSTRATED GUIDE TO CIVIL PROCEDURE

SECOND EDITION

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Vicki Been

Elihu Root Professor of Law
New York University School of Law

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
University of California, Irvine, School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Hofstra University School of Law

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Professor of Law
University of California at Berkeley School of Law

Kent D. Syverud

Dean and Ethan A. H. Shepley University Professor
Washington University School of Law

Elizabeth Warren

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading provider of research information and workflow solutions in key specialty areas. The strengths of the individual brands of Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International and Loislaw are aligned within Wolters Kluwer Law & Business to provide comprehensive, in-depth solutions and expert-authored content for the legal, professional and education markets.

CCH was founded in 1913 and has served more than four generations of business professionals and their clients. The CCH products in the Wolters Kluwer Law & Business group are highly regarded electronic and print resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers is a leading information provider for attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, Aspen products offer analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International supplies the global business community with comprehensive English-language international legal information. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on the Kluwer Law International journals, loose-leaves, books and electronic products for authoritative information in many areas of international legal practice.

Loislaw is a premier provider of digitized legal content to small law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a unit of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York and Riverwoods, Illinois. Wolters Kluwer is a leading multinational publisher and information services company.

Dedication and Acknowledgments

Several people made this book possible, in both its first and second editions. The original visual layout of the GUIDE is due in large part to the efforts of Shannon Mullins, Sharon Gisclair, and Connie Evans of the Faculty Support Services at Stetson. That office was also instrumental in completing this second edition, particularly Louise Petren, Dianne Oeste and, once again, Shannon Mullins. We thank them, and everyone in that office, for their work on this project. We also are both grateful to Stetson University College of Law and Darby Dickerson for their support of this project.

We also want to acknowledge the artistic efforts of Tracey Sticco, Stetson College of Law Class of 2007. Tracey drew a number of cartoons that appear in the GUIDE and put up with our (numerous) requests for revisions. We deeply appreciate her efforts. Stetson student Sarah Lord also provided valuable research assistance on the second edition for which we are thankful.

We also thank the staff at Aspen Publishers. We especially appreciate Rick Mixter, for his inspired belief that legal texts can be practical and occasionally humorous, and Eric Holt, who brought our original vision to life. We are also grateful for Darren Kelly's editorial work on the second edition.

We should also mention the students we have had the pleasure to teach over the years. Some of these students actually used the GUIDE (or its precursors) and provided valuable comments on it. Others helped shape our own understanding of civil procedure. To them we offer thanks for letting us say the very special phrase "I am a teacher." And we thank our colleagues at other law schools who have used the GUIDE. We appreciate their support and their guidance.

Finally, permit us a few more personal thanks. Professor Allen thanks, and dedicates the GUIDE to, his wife Debbie and his two sons, Ben and Noah. They stood (or crawled) by him throughout this effort in doing the first edition. They have equally been here for the second one. It would not have been possible to complete this project without their love and support.

Professor Finch thanks his wife, Lora, an exceptional wife and mother; his daughters Chloe (please go to med school, we have enough lawyers in the family) and Lily; and his parents and brother.

We hope you learn from and enjoy our work.

Michael Allen & Michael Finch

December, 2010
Gulfport, Florida

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Chapter One: Origins of the Lawsuit	5
A. <i>The Clients Tell Their Story.....</i>	5
1. The Olmans' Employment History	5
2. New Management at Full Moon	6
3. Bad News	8
4. The Olmans Respond.....	10
5. Otis Is Fired	10
6. The Olmans Take Legal Action.....	11
B. Lane's First Steps	12
<i>A Note Concerning Remedies</i>	13
<i>A Note Concerning Lawyers' Ethical Responsibilities.....</i>	16
C. Preparing to File Suit.....	19
1. Investigating the Facts	19
2. Determining the Applicable Law	20
a. Sources and Types of Law	20
b. Federal Law Applicable to the Olmans' Dispute	22
(1) The Olmans' Claims for Discriminatory Treatment.....	22
<i>Tactical Tip: List the Elements of Each Potential Claim</i>	23
<i>Task 1.1</i>	24
(2) Otis's Claim for Retaliation.....	24
<i>Task 1.2</i>	24

(3) Federal Law Remedies.....	25
c. State Law Applicable to the Olmans' Claims	26
(1) Statutory Claims for Age Discrimination and Retaliation	26
(2) State Common Law Claims	27
<i>Question 1.1</i>	29
<i>Task 1.3</i>	30
D. Final Considerations before Proceeding with the Suit	31
<i>A Concluding Note Concerning Sources of Procedural Law</i>	33
Chapter Two: Selecting the Locale for Litigation	35
A. Personal Jurisdiction.....	35
1. Whose Law Governs Personal Jurisdiction?	36
2. Common Bases for Exercising Personal Jurisdiction	37
<i>Question 2.1</i>	38
<i>Question 2.2</i>	40
3. Constitutional Limitations on Personal Jurisdiction	40
<i>Question 2.3</i>	42
B. Service of Process	42
1. The Mechanics of Service.....	43
2. Waiving Formal Service of Process.....	45
<i>Question 2.4</i>	46
3. The Constitutionality of Service Methods	46
Chapter Three: Deciding Whether to Sue in Federal or State Court	47
A. Courts and Judicial Power in the United States.....	47
1. The Allocation of Judicial Power	47

2. Reasons for Invoking the Federal Courts' Judicial Power.....	48
B. Federal Jurisdiction and Claims Arising under Federal Law	50
1. Arising under Jurisdiction.....	50
<i>Question 3.1</i>	51
2. Supplemental Jurisdiction.....	52
<i>Question 3.2</i>	53
C. Diversity of Citizenship Jurisdiction	54
<i>Question 3.3</i>	56
D. Removal Jurisdiction.....	56
<i>Question 3.4</i>	58
Chapter Four: Venue: A Final Decision about the Forum	59
A. Forum Selection and Venue	59
<i>Question 4.1</i>	61
<i>Question 4.2</i>	62
B. Challenging the Plaintiff's Choice of Venue.....	62
Chapter Five: Choosing the Law That Governs a Suit	65
A. Choice of Law in Litigation	65
B. State Common Law in Federal Court.....	66
C. Choosing Which State's Law to Apply	67
D. The Potential Impact of State Law on "Procedural" Issues.....	69
<i>Question 5.1</i>	71
Chapter Six: Commencing the Lawsuit	73
A. The Complaint.....	73

<u>Document: Complaint and Demand for Jury Trial</u>	76
B. Lane's Goals in Drafting the Complaint	83
<i>Tactical Tip: Relying on Form Books or "Model" Complaints</i>	84
1. Preparing for the Defendants' Anticipated Responses	85
<i>Tactical Tip: Alleging the Elements of a Cause of Action</i>	86
2. Preserving the Opportunity to Fully Litigate the Case, with a Minimum of Procedural Cost	86
3. Preserving a Client's Legal Rights	88
4. Pinning Down the Defendants	88
5. Telling a Good Story to the Court, the Defendants, and (Perhaps) the Public	88
6. Complying with a Lawyer's Ethical Obligations	89
<i>Question 6.1</i>	91
C. Specificity in Pleading	92
D. Filing and Serving the Complaint	92
Chapter Seven: The Opening Defense	95
A. Full Moon Responds to the Complaint	95
1. Pre-Answer Motions	98
a. Power Motions	100
<i>Question 7.1</i>	101
b. Pleading Motions	101
<i>Question 7.2</i>	102
<u>Document: Defendant Full Moon Sports, Inc.'s Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim</u>	105
<u>Document: Defendant Full Moon Sports, Inc.'s Memorandum in Support of Its Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim</u>	105

c. Other Possible Motions.....	108
<i>Question 7.3</i>	109
2. Full Moon’s Answer	109
<i>Question 7.4</i>	110
<i>Question 7.5</i>	112
<u><i>Document: Answer and Counterclaim of Defendant Full Moon Sports, Inc.</i></u>	113
B. Belcher’s Belated Response to the Suit.....	118
<i>Question 7.6</i>	118
Chapter Eight: Prelude to Discovery	121
A. Lane Responds to the Defendants	121
<i>Question 8.1</i>	123
<i>Question 8.2</i>	124
B. The Pleadings Are Closed . . . Or Are They?	124
<i>Question 8.3</i>	125
C. Case Management	126
<i>A Note Concerning Appeals</i>	128
<u><i>Document: Case Management and Scheduling Order</i></u>	130
Chapter Nine: Gathering Evidence and Refining Strategy— The Discovery Process	131
A. Preparing for the Discovery Process	131
<i>Tactical Tip: Party Autonomy in Discovery</i>	132
<i>Task 9.1</i>	133
B. The Parties Make Their Required Disclosures	133
<i>Tactical Tip: Read the Rules</i>	134

<i>Question 9.1</i>	136
<i>Document: Required Disclosure Statement of Plaintiffs Otis and Fiona Olman</i>	137
<i>Question 9.2</i>	140
C. Discovery Devices: Uses and Disputes	140
1. General Considerations	140
a. Relevance and Privilege	140
<i>A Note Concerning Common Privileges</i>	142
b. Tools of Discovery	144
<i>A Guide to Gathering Information under the Rules</i>	144
<i>A Note Concerning Electronic Discovery</i>	148
2. Initial Paper Discovery	149
a. Lane Begins the Discovery Process	149
<i>Task 9.2</i>	150
<i>Document: Plaintiffs' First Request for Production of Documents</i>	152
<i>Tactical Tip: Subpoenaing Non-Parties</i>	154
<i>Task 9.3</i>	156
<i>Document: Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories to Defendant</i>	157
b. Full Moon Responds	159
<i>Document: Defendant's Responses and Objections to Plaintiffs' First Request for Production of Documents</i>	161
<i>Document: Defendant's Answers and Objections to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories</i>	164
c. Lane Reacts	167
<i>Tactical Tip: Courts and Discovery Disputes</i>	169

<i>Question 9.3</i>	170
d. The Discovery Dispute Is Resolved.....	171
<i>Question 9.4</i>	172
3. Depositions	174
a. Lane Prepares for Depositions	174
<i>A Note Concerning Corporate Testimony</i>	177
b. A Discovery Controversy	178
c. Preparing Witnesses	180
d. Taking a Deposition	180
<i>Tactical Tip: Taking Effective Depositions</i>	181
<i>Document: Excerpts from Shockley Deposition</i>	183
<i>Question 9.5</i>	187
4. The Second Wave of Paper Discovery: Admissions	188
D. Expert Discovery	189
<i>Question 9.6</i>	190
Chapter Ten: Joinder & Amendment	193
A. Structuring a Lawsuit	193
1. Otis's Claims against Full Moon and Belcher	193
<i>Question 10.1</i>	195
<i>Question 10.2</i>	196
2. Fiona's Claims against Full Moon.....	196
<i>Question 10.3</i>	197
3. Full Moon's Counterclaim against Otis.....	198
<i>Question 10.4</i>	198

<i>Question 10.5</i>	199
B. Lane Considers Whether to Amend the Complaint.....	199
1. Joining a New Defendant.....	200
<i>Question 10.6</i>	201
2. Joining an Additional Plaintiff.....	202
<i>Question 10.7</i>	202
3. Amending the Pleadings: The Importance of Timing.....	204
a. The Potential Impact of Rules 15 and 16	204
b. Beating the Statute of Limitations and Rule 15(c)	205
<i>Question 10.8</i>	206
C. Some Concluding Joinder Issues: What Might Have Been.....	206
1. Impleader	206
2. Necessary and Indispensable Parties	208
<i>Question 10.9</i>	209
3. Intervention.....	209
<i>Question 10.10</i>	210
Chapter Eleven: Summary Judgment	211
A. Tweedy Moves for Summary Judgment.....	211
1. The Standard for Summary Judgment	211
<i>Question 11.1</i>	213
2. Full Moon's Grounds for Summary Judgment	213
a. Proving the Affirmative Defense of Waiver	213
<i>Question 11.2</i>	214

b. Challenging Otis’s Claims That Full Moon Acted with Ageist Motive	214
<i>A Note to Students</i>	215
c. Challenging Otis’s Claim That Full Moon Terminated Otis in Retaliation	216
<i>Question 11.3</i>	217
3. Preparing and Supporting the Summary Judgment Motion	217
<u>Document:</u> <i>Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment</i>	218
<u>Document:</u> <i>Memorandum in Support of Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment</i>	221
<u>Document:</u> <i>Affidavit of Chloé Michaela</i>	226
<i>Question 11.4</i>	228
B. The Olmans’ Response to Summary Judgment	228
1. Responding to the Liability Release	229
2. Responding to Full Moon’s Contention That It Acted with Legitimate, Non- Discriminatory Motive in Replacing Otis	230
3. Raising Doubt about Full Moon’s Motive in Terminating Otis	230
<u>Document:</u> <i>Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment</i>	231
<i>Question 11.5</i>	235
C. Judge Goodenough’s Ruling	236
<u>Document:</u> <i>Order and Memorandum</i>	237
<i>Question 11.6</i>	240
Chapter Twelve: Trial	241
A. Preparing for Trial	241
<i>Tactical Tip: The Importance of Preparation</i>	244

B. The Trial	244
1. Structure of a Trial and the Role of Procedure	244
<i>The Structure of a Civil Jury Trial</i>	245
2. Selecting a Jury and the Beginning of Trial.....	246
<i>Task 12.1</i>	248
3. Otis's Case-in-Chief	249
<i>Question 12.1</i>	252
<i>A Note Concerning the Jury</i>	253
4. Full Moon's Case-in-Chief	254
<i>Question 12.2</i>	255
5. The Jury Deliberates and Reaches Its Verdict	256
<u><i>Document: Verdict Form</i></u>	258
C. Post-Trial Matters Before Judge Goodenough	260
<u><i>Document: Judgment on Jury Verdict</i></u>	261
<i>Question 12.3</i>	262
<i>Question 12.4</i>	264
Chapter Thirteen: Final Resolution	265
A. Considering Appeal.....	265
1. The Olmans' Perspective	265
2. Full Moon's Perspective	266
<u><i>Document: Notice of Appeal</i></u>	269
B. Settlement Negotiations Continue.....	270
<u><i>Document: Joint Stipulation to Dismiss with Prejudice</i></u>	272