TERNATIONAL CORPORATE LAW AND FINANCIAL STREET

AND FINANCIAL

TERNATIONAL

INTERNATIONAL CORPORATE LAW AND FINANCIAL MARKET REGULATION

Convergence in Shareholder Law

MATHIAS M. SIEMS

CONVERGENCE IN SHAREHOLDER LAW

MATHIAS M. SIEMS



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521876759

© Mathias Siems 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87675-9 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONVERGENCE IN SHAREHOLDER LAW

On the one hand, it can be argued that the increasing economic and political interdependence of countries has led to the convergence of national legal systems. On the other hand, advocates of the counterhypothesis maintain that this development is both unrealistic and unnecessary.

Mathias Siems examines the company law of the UK, the USA, Germany, France, Japan and China to see how this issue affects share-holder law. The author subsequently analyses economic and political factors which may or may not lead to convergence, and assesses the extent of this development. Thus, Convergence in Shareholder Law not only provides a thorough comparative legal analysis but also shows how company law interconnects with political forces and economic development and helps in evaluating whether harmonisation and shareholder protection should be enhanced.

MATHIAS M. SIEMS is a Reader in Commercial Law at the University of Edinburgh and a Research Associate at the Centre for Business Research, University of Cambridge.

INTERNATIONAL CORPORATE LAW AND FINANCIAL MARKET REGULATION

Recent years have seen an upsurge of change and reform in corporate law and financial market regulation internationally as the corporate and institutional investor sector increasingly turns to the international financial markets. This follows large-scale institutional and regulatory reform after a series of international corporate governance and financial disclosure scandals exemplified by the collapse of Enron in the US. There is now a great demand for analysis in this area from the academic, practitioner, regulatory and policy sectors.

The International Corporate Law and Financial Market Regulation series will respond to that demand by creating a critical mass of titles which will address the need for information and high quality analysis in this fast developing area.

Series Editors

Professor Eilis Ferran, University of Cambridge Proessor Niamh Moloney, University of Nottingham Professor Howell Jackson, Harvard Law School

Editorial Board

Professor Marco Becht, Professor of Finance and Economics at Université Libre de Bruxelles and Executive Director of the European Corporate Governance Institute (ECGI).

Professor Brian Cheffins, S.J. Berwin Professor of Corporate Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge.

Professor Paul Davies, Cassel Professor of Commercial Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Professor Luca Enriques, Professor of Business Law in the Faculty of Law at the University of Bologna.

Professor Guido Ferrarini, Professor of Law at the University of Genoa and Honorary Professor, Faculty of Law, University College London.

Professor Jennifer Hill, Professor of Corporate Law at Sydney Law School.

Professor Klaus J. Hopt, Director of the Max Planck Institute of Comparative and International Private Law, Hamburg, Germany.

Professor Hideki Kanda, Professor of Law at the University of Tokyo.

Professor Colin Mayer, Peter Moores Professor of Management Studies at the Saïd Business School and Director of the Oxford Financial Research Centre.

James Palmer, Partner of Herbert Smith, London.

Professor Michel Tison, Professor at the Financial Law Institute of the University of Ghent.

Andrew Whittaker, General Counsel to the Board at the UK Financial Services Authority.

Professor Eddy Wymeersch, Chairman of the Committee of European Securities Regulators (CESR), Co-Chair of the CESR-European Central Bank Working Group on Clearing and Settlement, and part time Professor of Commercial Law, University of Ghent, Belgium.

此为试读,需要完整PDF请访问: www.ertongbook.com

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In the last fifteen years, the words 'globalization', 'internationalization' and 'Europeanization' have been seen and heard everywhere. The legal discussion has been no exception; on the one hand, it has sometimes been claimed that national legal systems are increasingly convergent. On the other hand, advocates of the counterhypothesis maintain that convergence of legal systems is neither realistic nor necessary. This book takes a look at how to approach this issue in relation to shareholder law. Although there are already some publications which deal with company law convergence, the reader is often left disappointed. With respect to similarities and differences between countries, the previous literature is dominated by broad statements about different corporate governance systems and anecdotal stories of convergence. A detailed legal analysis is, however, lacking. Similarly, with respect to convergence forces and hurdles, there has often been only a perfunctory analysis of particular topics, such as regulatory competition or shareholder ownership. But, again, a coherent and comprehensive account is missing. Thus, this book aims at filling that gap. Its structure is as follows. First, it compares the company laws of the United Kingdom, the USA, Germany, France, Japan and China. Secondly, it analyzes economic and political factors, which might (or might not) lead to convergence. Finally, it assesses this development.

I started writing the German version of this monograph in June 2001 when I was just finishing my LLM in Edinburgh. Since then I have worked and lived in Paris, Berlin, Hamburg, Florence, Cambridge (Massachusetts), Riga, Cambridge (England), and again Edinburgh. I thank everyone who encouraged my research. Specifically for the English edition, I would like to thank Iain Fraser (Florence), Chris Goddard (Riga) and Kim Hughes (Cambridge University Press) for their help and support, as well as Eilís Ferran, Niamh Moloney and Howell Jackson as the editors of the series on International Corporate Law and Financial Market Regulation.

ABBREVIATIONS

AC UK Law Reports: Appeal Cases
AcP Archiv für die civilistische Praxis

AG Aktiengesellschaft

All ER

ALI-Principles American Law Institute (ALI), Principles

of Corporate Governance: Analysis and

Recommendations, 1994 All England Law Reports

ALR Australian Law Reports

Am. J. Comp. L. American Journal of Comparative Law

Amer. Econ. Rev. American Economic Review

Ariz. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Arizona Journal of International and

Comparative Law

BB Betriebs-Berater

BCLC Butterworths Company Law Cases
Bell J. Econ. Bell Journal of Economics and

Management Science

Berkeley Bus. L.J. Berkeley Business Law Journal

Berkeley J. Int'l L. Berkeley Journal of International Law

BGBl. German Federal Law Gazette

(Bundesgesetzblatt)

BGH German Supreme Court

(Bundesgerichtshof)

BGHZ Decisions of the German Supreme Court

(in private law matters)

BJIR British Journal of Industrial Relations

Bond L. Rev. Bond Law Review

Brook. J. Int'l L. Brooklyn Journal of International Law
BT-Drucks. Printed Matters of the German Bundestag

BU Int'l L.J. Boston University International Law

Journal

Bus. Hist. Business History
Bus. Law. Business Lawyer

BVerfG German Constitutional Court
(Bundesverfassungsgericht)

BVerfGE Decisions of the German Constitutional

Court

C. & SLJ Company and Securities Law Journal

Cal. App. California Appellate Reports
Cal. L. Rev. California Law Review
Cal. Rptr. California Reporter

CalGCL California General Corporation Law
CalPERS California Public Employees' Retirement

System

Cardozo J. Int'l & Comp. L. Cardozo Journal of International and

Comparative Law

Cardozo L. Rev. Cardozo Law Review
CEO Chief Executive Officer
CFO Chief Financial Officer
ch., chs., Ch., Chs. Chapter, Chapters

Ch., ChD UK Law Reports: Chancery Division
ChinArticles Chinese Guide to Articles of Association

of Companies Limited by Shares of

6 December 1997

ChinCA Chinese Companies Act

ChinCG-Code Code of Corporate Governance for Listed

Companies of the China Securities

Regulatory Commission (CSRC) (English

translation available at

www.csrc.gov.cn/en/homepage/

index_en.jsp)

ChinMandProv Chinese Mandatory Provisions in the

Articles of Association for Companies Listed Overseas of 27 August 1994 (English translation available at *China* Law and Practice, Vol. 9 (1995), No. 4,

p. 19)

ChinSA Chinese Securities Act

ECFR

CLJ Cambridge Law Journal

Colum. Bus. L. Rev. Columbia Business Law Review
Colum. J. Eur. L. Columbia Journal of European Law
Colum. J. Transnat'l L. Columbia Journal of Transnational Law

Colum. L. Rev. Columbia Law Review Comp. Law. Company Lawyer

Comp. L. L. & Pol'y J.

Conn. J. Int'l L.

Connecticut Journal of International Law

Cornell Int'l L.J.

Connecticut Journal of International Law

Cornell International Law Journal

Cornell L. Rev. Cornell Law Review

CSRC China Securities Regulatory Commission

DB Der Betrieb

DC Cir. United States Court of Appeals for the

District of Columbia

Del. Ch. Delaware Court of Chancery

Del. J. Corp. L. Delaware Journal of Corporate Law

Del. Supr. Delaware Supreme Court

DelGCL Delaware General Corporation Law

DStR Deutsches Steuerrecht

DSW Deutsche Schutzvereinigung für

Wertpapierbesitz e.V.

EBLR European Business Law Review
EBOR European Business Organization I

European Business Organization Law

Review

EC European Community; Treaty

establishing the European Community

European Company and Financial Law

Review

ECJ European Court of Justice ECR European Court Reports

EEC European Economic Community

ELJ European Law Journal
E.L. Rev. European Law Review
EU European Union

Europ. Econ. Rev. European Economic Review

European Journal of Law and Economics
EuZW Europäische Zeitschrift für Wirtschaftsrecht

EWS Europäisches Wirtschafts- und Steuerrecht

FASB Financial Accounting Standards Board

(USA)

Ford. Int. L.J. Fordham International Law Journal
Code de Commerce (France)

FrCG-Principles Principes de gouvernement d'entreprise

résultant de la consolidation des rapports

conjoints de l'AFEP et du MEDEF, 2003 Code monétaire et financier (France)

FrCMon Code monétaire et financier (France)
FrDécret Décret No. 67-236 sur les sociétés

commerciales (France)

FrRGAMF Règlement général de l'Autorité des

marchés financiers (AMF) (France)

FSA Financial Services Authority

Ga. L. Rev. Georgia Law Review

GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services

Geo. L.J. Georgetown Law Journal

GerAktG German Law on Joint-Stock Companies

(Aktiengesetz)

GerBGB German Civil Code (Bürgerliches

Gesetzbuch)

GerBörsG German Stock Exchange Act

(Börsengesetz)

GerBörsZulV German Stock Exchange Admission

Regulation

(Börsenzulassungsverordnung)

GerCGK German Corporate Governance Code

(Deutscher Corporate Governance Kodex) (English version available at

www.corporate-governance-

code.de/index-e.html)

GerFGG German Ex-Parte Jurisdiction Act (Gesetz

über die freiwillige Gerichtsbarkeit)

GerGmbHG German Law on Private Liability

Companies (Gesetz betreffend die

Gesellschaft mit beschränkter Haftung)

GerHGB German Commercial Code

(Handelsgesetzbuch)

GerStGB German Criminal Code

(Strafgesetzbuch)

GerUmwG German Transformation Act

(Umwandlungsgesetz)

GerWpHG German Securities Trading Act

(Wertpapierhandelsgesetz)

GerWpÜG German Takeover Act

(Wertpapiererwerbs- und

Übernahmegesetz)

GerZPO German Code of Civil Procedure

(Zivilprozessordnung)

Harv. Bus. Rev. Harvard Business Review

Harv. Int'l L.J. Harvard International Law Journal Harv. J. on Legis. Harvard Journal on Legislation

Harv. L. Rev. Harvard Law Review

IAS International Accounting Standard
IASB International Accounting Standards

Board

IBL International Business Lawyer

ICCLJ International and Comparative Corporate

Law Journal

ICCLR International Company and Commercial

Law Review

ICLQ International and Comparative Law

Quarterly

IFLR International Financial Law Review
IFRS International Financial Reporting

Standards

Int. L.The International LawyerIMFInternational Monetary FundInt. J. Bus.International Journal of BusinessInt'l Rev. L. & Econ.International Review of Law and

Economics

IOSCO International Organization of Securities

Commissions

Japanese Corporation Act (kaisha hô),

Law No. 86/2005

Japanese Commercial Code (Shôhô), Law JapCC No. 48/1899 Japanese law for special exceptions to the **JapCCExcA** Commercial Code concerning audit, etc. of joint stock companies (Kabushiki gaisha no kans tô ni kansuru shôhô no tokurei ni kansuru hôritsu), Law No. 22/1974 Tokyo Stock Exchange, Principles of JapCG-Principles Corporate Governance for Listed Companies 2004. JapSEA Japanese Securities and Exchange Act (Shôken torihikohô), Law No. 25/1948 IBLJournal of Business Law J. Corp. L. Journal of Corporation Law Journal of Comparative Law ICL Journal of Corporate Law Studies ICLS **ICMS** Journal of Common Market Studies ICP Juris Classeur Périodique J. Econ. Manage. Strategy Journal of Economics and Management Strategy J. Empirical Legal Stud. Journal of Empirical Legal Studies I. Finance Journal of Finance Iournal of Financial Economics I. Finan. Econ. IIS Journal of Japanese Studies Journal of Law and Economics J. L. & Econ. J. L. Econ. & Org. Journal of Law, Economics and Organization J. Legal Stud. Journal of Legal Studies

J. Polit. Economy Journal of Political Economy IZ Juristenzeitung

Law & Pol'y Int'l Bus. Law & Soc. Inquiry Loy. LA Int'l & Comp. L.J.

LQR LSE MBCA Melbourne U. L. Rev. Law and Policy in International Business Law and Social Inquiry Loyola of Los Angeles International and

Comparative Law Journal Law Quarterly Review London Stock Exchange

Model Business Corporation Act (USA)

Melbourne University Law Review

Rahels Z.

Mich. L. Rev. Michigan Law Review

Minn. J. Global Trade
Minnesota Journal of Global Trade
Maastricht Journal of European and

Maastricht Journal of European and
Comparative Law

MLR Modern Law Review

NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement

NC J. Int'l & Com. Reg. North Carolina Journal of International

NJW Law and Commercial Regulation
NJW Neue Juristische Wochenschrift

No(s). Number(s)

Nw. J. Int'l L. & Bus. Northwestern Journal of International Law

and Business

Nw. U. L. Rev.Northwestern University Law ReviewNYBCLNew York Business Corporation LawNY Int'l L. Rev.New York International Law ReviewNYL Sch. J. Int'l &New York Law School Journal of

Comp. L. International and Comparative Law

NYSE New York Stock Exchange

NYSE Manual Listed Company Manual of the New York

Stock Exchange

NYU L. Rev. New York University Law Review
NZG Neue Zeitschrift für Gesellschaftsrecht

OECD Organization for Economic Co-operation

and Development

OECD-Principles OECD Principles of Corporate

Governance (available at www.oecd.org/dataoecd/32/18/

31557724.pdf)

OJLS Oxford Journal of Legal Studies
Penn St Int'l L. Rev. Penn State International Law Review
QJ Econ. Quarterly Journal of Economics

Rabels Zeitschrift für ausländisches und

internationales Privatrecht

Rev. int. dr. comp. Revue internationale du droit comparé
Rev. Int. Polit. Economy Review of International Political Economy

Rev.soc. Revue des sociétés

RG Supreme Court of the German Reich

(Reichsgericht)

RGZ	Decisions of the Supreme Court of the German Reich
RIW	Recht der internationalen Wirtschaft
s. (ss.)	section(s), sentence(s)
S. Cal. L. Rev.	Southern California Law Review
Sarbanes-Oxley Act 2002	Sarbanes-Oxley Act (Public Company
	Accounting Reform and Investor
	Protection Act) (USA) of 30 July 2002
SE	Societas Europaea (European Company)
SE-Reg	Council Regulation (EC) No. 2157/2001
	of 8 October 2001 on the Statute for a
SEC	European Company (SE)
SEC	Securities Exchange Commission (USA); Regulations and Rules of the SEC based
	on Securities Exchange Act of 1934; 17
	CFR Parts 200–301
SI	Statutory Instrument
St John's J. Legal Comment.	Saint John's Journal of Legal Commentary
St Louis U. L.J.	Saint Louis University Law Journal
Stan. L. Rev.	Stanford Law Review
Transnat'l L. & Contemp.	Transnational Law and Contemporary
Probs.	Problems
Transnat'l Law.	Transnational Lawyer
Tul. L. Rev.	Tulane Law Review
U. Chi. L. Rev.	University of Chicago Law Review
U. Cin. L. Rev.	University of Cincinnati Law Review
UC Davis L. Rev.	UC Davis Law Review
UCLA Pac. Basin L.J.	UCLA Pacific Basin Law Journal
U. Pa. J. Int'l Econ. L.	University of Pennsylvania Journal of
	International Economic Law
U. Pa. L. Rev.	University of Pennsylvania Law Review
U. Pitt. L. Rev.	University of Pittsburgh Law Review
UK-CA	Companies Act 2006 (United Kingdom)
UK-City Code	City Code on Takeovers and Mergers of

the Panel on Takeovers and Mergers
(United Kingdom)

UK-Combined Code
Combined Code on Corporate
Governance (United Kingdom)

UK-FSMA Financial Services and Markets Act 2000

(United Kingdom)

UK-Listing Rules UK Listing Rules

UK-Table A Table A of the Companies (Table A to F)

Regulations 1985 (United Kingdom)

US-GAAP Generally Accepted Accounting Principles

(USA)

US-SA Securities Act of 1933 (USA), ch. 38, 48

Stat. 7, codified at 15 USC secs. 77a-77m

US-SEA Securities Exchange Act of 1934 (USA),

ch. 404, 48 Stat. 881, codified at 15 USC

secs. 78a-78kk

US-UCC Uniform Commercial Code (USA)

Va. J. Int'l L. Virginia Journal of International Law

Va. L. Rev. Virginia Law Review Vill. L. Rev. Villanova Law Review

Wash. ULQ Washington University Law Quarterly

WLR Weekly Law Reports
WM Wertpapier-Mitteilungen
WTO World Trade Organization

Yale J. Int'l L. Yale Journal of International Law

Yale J. on Reg. Yale Journal on Regulation

Yale L.J. Yale Law Journal

ZEUP Zeitschrift für Europäisches Privatrecht ZfRV Zeitschrift für Rechtsvergleichung

ZGR Zeitschrift für Unternehmens- und

Gesellschaftsrecht

ZHR Zeitschrift für das gesamte Handels- und

Wirtschaftsrecht

ZJapanR Zeitschrift für Japanisches Recht ZRP Zeitschrift für Rechtspolitik

ZVglRWiss Zeitschrift für vergleichende

Rechtswissenschaft

TABLE OF CASES

European Union

Centros Ltd v. Erhervsog Selskabsstyrelsen, C-212/97 [1999] ECR I-1459 298, 300, 302

Commission v. Belgium, C-503/99 [2002] ECR I-4809 185

Commission v. French Republic, C-483/99 [2002] ECR I-4781 185

Commission v. Portugal, C-367/98 [2002] ECR I-4731 185

Hughes de Lasteyrie du Saillant v. Ministère de l'Économie, des Finances et de l'Industrie, C-9/02 [2004] ECR I-2409 301

Kamer van Koophandel en Fabrieken voor Amsterdam v. Inspire Art Ltd, C-167/01 [2003] ECR I-10155 302, 303, 384

SEVIC Systems AG, C-411/03 [2005] ECR I-10805 269, 301

The Queen v. Daily Mail and General Trust plc, C-81/87 [1988] ECR I-5483 302

Überseering BV v. Nordic Construction Company Baumanagement GmbH (NCC), C-275/17 [2002] ECR I-9919 301, 302

Waltraud Tomberger v. Gebrüder von der Wettern GmbH, C-234/94 [1996] ECR I-3133 132

United Kingdom

Adams v. Cape Industries plc [1990] Ch 433 (Court of Appeal)

Alexander v. Automatic Telephone Co. [1990] 2 Ch 56 (Court of Appeal) 176

Brady v. Brady [1988] BCLC 20 (Court of Appeal) 178, 179

Bushell v. Faith [1970] AC 1099 (House of Lords) 114

Carruth v. Imperial Chemical Industries Ltd [1937] AC 707 (House of Lords) 199

City Equitable Fire Insurance Co., Re [1925] 1 Ch 407 (Court of Appeal) 192

Creasey v. Breachwood Motors Ltd [1993] BCLC 480 (Queen's Bench) 70

DHN Food Distributors Ltd v. Tower Hamlets LBC [1976] 1 WLR 852 (Court of Appeal) 70

Ebrahimi v. Westbourne Galleries Ltd [1972] 2 All ER 492 (Chancery Division) 202

Edwards v. Halliwell [1950] 2 All ER 1064 (Court of Appeal) 22

Foss v. Harbottle (1843) 2 Hare 461 (House of Lords) 213

Isle of Wight Ry v. Tahourdin (1883) 25 ChD 320 (Court of Appeal) 152

Normandy v. Ind, Coope & Co. [1908] 1 Ch 84 (Chancery Division) 99

Re a Company (No. 00709 of 1992) [1999] 1 WLR 1092 (O'Neill v. Phillips) (House of Lords) 35, 207

Salomon v. Salomon & Co. [1897] AC 22 (House of Lords) 70

Smith & Fawcett Ltd, Re [1942] Ch 304 (Court of Appeal) 72, 192

Wall v. London & Northern Assets Corporation Ltd [1898] 2 Ch 469 (Court of Appeal) 110

Wallersteiner v. Moir (No. 2) [1975] 1 All ER 849 (Court of Appeal) 214

Weller (Sam) & Sons Ltd, Re [1990] BCLC 80 (Chancery Division) 74

West Mercia Safetywear Ltd v. Dodd [1988] BCLC 250 (Court of Appeal) 179

Yukong Line Ltd v. Rendsburg Investment Corporation [1998] 1 WLR 294 (Queen's Bench) 70

United States

A. P. Smith Mfg Co. v. Barlow, 98 A 2d 581 (New Jersey 1953) 179

Allied Chemical & Dye Corp. v. Steel & Tube Co. of America, 14 Del. Ch. 1, 120 A 486 (1923) 202

Aronson v. Lewis, 473 A 2d 805 (Del. 1984) 213

Auerbach v. Bennett, 47 NY 2d 619; 393 NW 2d 994; 419 NYS 2d 920 (1979) (NY Court of Appeals) 213

Baatz v. Arrow Bar, 426 NW 2d 298 (South Dakota 1990) 70

Business Roundtable v. SEC, 905 F 2d 406 (DC Cir. 1990) 114

Dodge v. Ford Motor Co., 170 NW 668 (Michigan 1919) 179

Edgar v. MITE, 487 US 624 (1982) (US Supreme Court) 184

Eshleman v. Keenan, 22 Del. Ch. 82; 194 A 40 (1937); aff'd 23 Del. Ch. 234; 2 A 2d 904 (1938) 72

Fleigler v. Lawrence, 361 A 2d 218 (Del. 1976) 200

Foster v. Florida, 537 US 990 (US Supreme Court 2002) 386

Gimbal v. Signal Companies, 316 A 2d 599 (Del. Ch.); aff'd in part 316 A 2d 619 (Del. 1974) 166

Harris v. Carter, 582 A 2d 222 (Del. Ch. 1990) 206

Hartford Accident & Indemnity Co. v. W. S. Dickey Clay Mfg Co., 26 Del. Ch. 16; 21 A 2d 178 (1941), aff'd 26 Del. Ch. 411; 24 A 2d 315 (1942) 202

Havlicek v. Coast-to-Coast Analytical Services Inc., 46 Cal. Rptr 2d 696; 39 Cal. App. 4th 1844 (1995) 320

Hoschett v. TSI International Software Ltd, 683 A 2d 43 (Del. Ch. 1996) 62

Inhabitants of Waldoborough v. Knox and Lincoln R. R., 24 A 942 (Maine 1892) 169

Kahn v. Lynch Communication Systems Inc., 638 A 2d 1110 (Del. 1994); 669 A 2d 79 (Del. 1995) 170

Kinney Shoe Corp. v. Polan, 939 F 2d 209 (4th Cir. 1991) 70

Lawrence v. Texas, 123 S Ct 2472 (US Supreme Court 2003) 386