

The WTO Dispute Settlement Procedures Second Edition

WTO Secretariat



CAMBRIDGE

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

The WTO Dispute Settlement Procedures

Second edition

A Collection of the Relevant Legal Texts



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© World Trade Organization, 2001. Material in this title may be reproduced, provided the source is acknowledged.

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

French edition and Spanish edition paperbacks of this title are both available directly from WTO Publications, World Trade Organization, Centre William Rappard, 154 rue de Lausanne, CH-1211 Geneva 21, Switzerland http://www.wto.org

ISBN 0 521 80448 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 01077 2 paperback

PREFACE

This volume contains a collection of the legal texts related to the settlement of disputes under the Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization (WTO). To facilitate their use, the texts have been grouped by subject matter, and cross-references and a subject index have been added by the WTO Secretariat. These additions do not form part of the legal texts and therefore should not be used as sources of interpretation.

A repertoire of the dispute settlement practice under the GATT 1947 can be found in the *Analytical Index: Guide to GATT Law and Practice*, Updated 6th edition published by the WTO Secretariat, ISBN 92-870-1143-5.

ABBREVIATIONS

In this publication the following abbreviations have been used:

A.B. Appellate Body

ADP Agreement on Implementation of Article VI

of GATT 1994

Aircraft Tokyo Round Agreement on Trade in Civil

Aircraft

BISD Basic Instruments and Selected Documents

(published by GATT)

CPs Contracting Parties

CTG Council for Trade in Goods
CTS Council for Trade in Services

Customs Valuation Agreement on Implementation of Article VII

of GATT 1994

Dairy International Dairy Agreement
DSB Dispute Settlement Body

DSU Dispute Settlement Understanding
GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services
GPA Agreement on Government Procurement
Montreal Decision Decision of 12 April 1989 on Dispute

Settlement (BISD 36S/61) adopted by the

CPs following the Mid-Term Review of the

Uruguay Round Negotiations

PGE Permanent Group of Experts
R of C Rules of Conduct for the DSU

SCM Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing

Measures

SPS Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and

Phytosanitary Measures

TBT Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade
Textile Agreement on Textiles and Clothing

TMB Textiles Monitoring Body

1966 Decision Decision on 5 April 1966 on Procedures

under (GATT) Article XXIII (BISD 14S/18)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

			Page
PRE	EFACE		iii
ABI	BREVIAT	TONS	v
I.	UNDERSTANDING ON RULES AND PROCEDURES GOVERNING THE SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES (DSU)		
	Art. 1:	Coverage and application	1
	Art. 2:	Administration	1
	Art. 3:	General Provisions	2
	Art. 4:	Consultations	4
	Art. 5:	Good Offices, Conciliation and Mediation	7
	Art. 6:	Establishment of Panels	7
	Art. 7:	Terms of Reference of Panels	8
	Art. 8:	Composition of Panels	8
	Art. 9:	Procedures for Multiple Complaints	10
	Art. 10:	Third Parties	11
	Art. 11:	Function of Panels	11
	Art. 12:	Panel Procedures	11
	Art. 13:	Right to Seek Information	13
	Art. 14:	Confidentiality	14
	Art. 15:	Interim Review Stage	14
	Art. 16:	Adoption of Panel Reports	15
	Art. 17:	Appellate Review, Standing Appellate Body	15
	Art. 18:	Communications with the Panel or Appellate Body	17
	Art. 19:	Panel and Appellate Body Recommendations	18
	Art. 20:	Time-frame for DSB Decisions	18
	Art. 21:	Surveillance of Implementation of Recommendations and Rulings	19
	Art 22.	Compensation and the Suspension of Concessions	20

				Page
			ngthening the Multilateral System	24
	Art. 2		ecial Procedures Involving Least-Developed Country	25
	Art 3		bers bitration	
			n-Violation Complaints of the Type Described	20
			ragraph 1(b) of Article XXIII of GATT 1994	26
	Art. 2	27: Res	sponsibilities of the Secretariat	27
APP	ENDIC	CES		28
	1.	Agre	ements Covered by the Understanding	28
	2.		ial or Additional Rules and Procedures Contained e Covered Agreements	29
	3.	Work	ring Procedures	30
	4.	Expe	rt Review Groups	32
II.			SETTLEMENT RULES AND PROCEDURES IN T FERAL TRADE AGREEMENTS	
A.	The C	GATT	1994 and Other Covered Agreements	33
	1.	Gene	ral interpretative note to Annex 1A	33
	2.	The C	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994	33
	3.	WTC	Covered Agreements	35
		i.	Agreement on Agriculture	35
		ii.	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures	35
		iii.	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing	36
		iv.	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade	41
		v.	Agreement on Trade-Related Investment Measures	42
		vi.	Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of GATT 1994	43
		vii.	Agreement on Implementation of Article VII of GATT 1994	44
		viii.	Agreement on Preshipment Inspection	46
		ix.	Agreement of Rules of Origin	46

		Page			
	х.	Agreement on Import Licencing Procedures47			
	xi.	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures47			
	xii.	Agreement on Safeguards55			
В.	General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)55				
C.	Agreement	on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights57			
III.	DISPUTE SETTLEMENT DECISIONS OF THE CONTRACTING PARTIES TO THE GATT 1947 REFERRED TO IN THE DSU59				
A.	Decision of 12 April 1989 on Improvements to the GATT Dispute Settlement Rules and Procedures59				
В.	Decision of 5 April 1966 on Procedures Under Article XXIII60				
IV.	DISPUTE SETTLEMENT RULES AND PROCEDURES IN THE PLURILATERAL TRADE AGREEMENTS62				
A.	Provisions 1	Regarding the Agreement on Government Procurement62			
	1. Agre	eement on Government Procurement			
		fication Under Appendix 1 of the Dispute Settlement erstanding65			
B.	Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft65				
V.	RULES OF PROCEDURE FOR THE MEETINGS OF THE DISPUTE SETTLEMENT BODY67				
A.	Rules of Pro	ocedure for Meetings of the Dispute Settlement Body67			
B.	Rules of Procedure for Sessions of the Ministerial Conference and Meetings of the General Council				
VI.	RULES OF CONDUCT FOR THE UNDERSTANDING ON THE RULES AND PROCEDURES GOVERNING THE SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES				
VII.	WORKING	G PROCEDURES FOR APPELLATE REVIEW88			
VIII.	DSU PRAC	CTICES			
A.	Working pr	actices concerning dispute settlement procedures103			
В.	Article 4.11	DSU - Replies to request 104			

	Page
IX.	OTHER DECISIONS106
A.	Declaration on Dispute Settlement Pursuant to the Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the GATT 1994 or Part V of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
B.	Procedures for the Circulation and Derestriction of WTO Documents
C.	Procedures for Arbitration under Article 8.5 of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
D.	Decision on Certain Dispute Settlement Procedures for GATS117
INDE	X 119

I. UNDERSTANDING ON RULES AND PROCEDURES GOVERNING THE SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES (DSU)

Members hereby agree as follows:

Article 1

Coverage and Application

1. The rules and procedures of this Understanding shall apply to disputes brought pursuant to the consultation and dispute settlement provisions of the agreements listed in Appendix 1 to this Understanding (referred to in this Understanding as the "covered agreements"). The rules and procedures of this Understanding shall also apply to consultations and the settlement of disputes between Members concerning their rights and obligations under the provisions of the Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization (referred to in this Understanding as the "WTO Agreement") and of this Understanding taken in isolation or in combination with any other covered agreement.

See DSU Appendix 1 at p. 28; Notification Under Appendix 1 of DSU at p. 65.

The rules and procedures of this Understanding shall apply subject to such special or additional rules and procedures on dispute settlement contained in the covered agreements as are identified in Appendix 2 to this Understanding. To the extent that there is a difference between the rules and procedures of this Understanding and the special or additional rules and procedures set forth in Appendix 2, the special or additional rules and procedures in Appendix 2 shall prevail. In disputes involving rules and procedures under more than one covered agreement, if there is a conflict between special or additional rules and procedures of such agreements under review, and where the parties to the dispute cannot agree on rules and procedures within 20 days of the establishment of the panel, the Chairman of the Dispute Settlement Body provided for in paragraph 1 of Article 2 (referred to in this Understanding as the "DSB"), in consultation with the parties to the dispute, shall determine the rules and procedures to be followed within 10 days after a request by either Member. The Chairman shall be guided by the principle that special or additional rules and procedures should be used where possible, and the rules and procedures set out in this Understanding should be used to the extent necessary to avoid conflict.

See DSU Appendix 2 at p. 29.

Article 2

Administration

1. The Dispute Settlement Body is hereby established to administer these rules and procedures and, except as otherwise provided in a covered agreement, the

consultation and dispute settlement provisions of the covered agreements. Accordingly, the DSB shall have the authority to establish panels, adopt panel and Appellate Body reports, maintain surveillance of implementation of rulings and recommendations, and authorize suspension of concessions and other obligations under the covered agreements. With respect to disputes arising under a covered agreement which is a Plurilateral Trade Agreement, the term "Member" as used herein shall refer only to those Members that are parties to the relevant Plurilateral Trade Agreement. Where the DSB administers the dispute settlement provisions of a Plurilateral Trade Agreement, only those Members that are parties to that Agreement may participate in decisions or actions taken by the DSB with respect to that dispute.

See Notification Under Appendix 1 of DSU at p. 65, DSU 6.1, 16.4, 17.14, 21.6, 22.6 at pp. 7, 15, 17, 20, 23; GPA XXII:3 at p. 63.

- 2. The DSB shall inform the relevant WTO Councils and Committees of any developments in disputes related to provisions of the respective covered agreements.
- 3. The DSB shall meet as often as necessary to carry out its functions within the time-frames provided in this Understanding.
- 4. Where the rules and procedures of this Understanding provide for the DSB to take a decision, it shall do so by consensus.¹

See Rules of Procedure (DSB) at p. 67 and Rules of Procedure VII (General Council) at p. 82.

Article 3

General Provisions

- 1. Members affirm their adherence to the principles for the management of disputes heretofore applied under Articles XXII and XXIII of GATT 1947, and the rules and procedures as further elaborated and modified herein.
- 2. The dispute settlement system of the WTO is a central element in providing security and predictability to the multilateral trading system. The Members recognize that it serves to preserve the rights and obligations of Members under the covered agreements, and to clarify the existing provisions of those agreements in accordance with customary rules of interpretation of public international law. Recommendations and rulings of the DSB cannot add to or diminish the rights and obligations provided in the covered agreements.

2

¹ The DSB shall be deemed to have decided by consensus on a matter submitted for its consideration, if no Member, present at the meeting of the DSB when the decision is taken, formally objects to the proposed decision.

See DSU 19.2 at p. 18.

- 3. The prompt settlement of situations in which a Member considers that any benefits accruing to it directly or indirectly under the covered agreements are being impaired by measures taken by another Member is essential to the effective functioning of the WTO and the maintenance of a proper balance between the rights and obligations of Members.
- 4. Recommendations or rulings made by the DSB shall be aimed at achieving a satisfactory settlement of the matter in accordance with the rights and obligations under this Understanding and under the covered agreements.
- 5. All solutions to matters formally raised under the consultation and dispute settlement provisions of the covered agreements, including arbitration awards, shall be consistent with those agreements and shall not nullify or impair benefits accruing to any Member under those agreements, nor impede the attainment of any objective of those agreements.
- 6. Mutually agreed solutions to matters formally raised under the consultation and dispute settlement provisions of the covered agreements shall be notified to the DSB and the relevant Councils and Committees, where any Member may raise any point relating thereto.

See Working Procedures for Appellate Review 30(2), at p. 100.

Before bringing a case, a Member shall exercise its judgement as to whether action under these procedures would be fruitful. The aim of the dispute settlement mechanism is to secure a positive solution to a dispute. A solution mutually acceptable to the parties to a dispute and consistent with the covered agreements is clearly to be preferred. In the absence of a mutually agreed solution, the first objective of the dispute settlement mechanism is usually to secure the withdrawal of the measures concerned if these are found to be inconsistent with the provisions of any of the covered agreements. The provision of compensation should be resorted to only if the immediate withdrawal of the measure is impracticable and as a temporary measure pending the withdrawal of the measure which is inconsistent with a covered agreement. The last resort which this Understanding provides to the Member invoking the dispute settlement procedures is the possibility of suspending the application of concessions or other obligations under the covered agreements on a discriminatory basis vis-à-vis the other Member, subject to authorization by the DSB of such measures.

See DSU 22 at p. 20.

8. In cases where there is an infringement of the obligations assumed under a covered agreement, the action is considered prima facie to constitute a case of nullification or impairment. This means that there is normally a presumption that a breach of the rules has an adverse impact on other Members parties to that

covered agreement, and in such cases, it shall be up to the Member against whom the complaint has been brought to rebut the charge.

- 9. The provisions of this Understanding are without prejudice to the rights of Members to seek authoritative interpretation of provisions of a covered agreement through decision-making under the WTO Agreement or a covered agreement which is a Plurilateral Trade Agreement.
- 10. It is understood that requests for conciliation and the use of the dispute settlement procedures should not be intended or considered as contentious acts and that, if a dispute arises, all Members will engage in these procedures in good faith in an effort to resolve the dispute. It is also understood that complaints and counter-complaints in regard to distinct matters should not be linked.
- 11. This Understanding shall be applied only with respect to new requests for consultations under the consultation provisions of the covered agreements made on or after the date of entry into force of the WTO Agreement. With respect to disputes for which the request for consultations was made under GATT 1947 or under any other predecessor agreement to the covered agreements before the date of entry into force of the WTO Agreement, the relevant dispute settlement rules and procedures in effect immediately prior to the date of entry into force of the WTO Agreement shall continue to apply.²
- 12. Notwithstanding paragraph 11, if a complaint based on any of the covered agreements is brought by a developing country Member against a developed country Member, the complaining party shall have the right to invoke, as an alternative to the provisions contained in Articles 4, 5, 6 and 12 of this Understanding, the corresponding provisions of the Decision of 5 April 1966 (BISD 14S/18), except that where the Panel considers that the time-frame provided for in paragraph 7 of that Decision is insufficient to provide its report and with the agreement of the complaining party, that time-frame may be extended. To the extent that there is a difference between the rules and procedures of Articles 4, 5, 6 and 12 and the corresponding rules and procedures of the Decision, the latter shall prevail.

See 1966 Decision at p. 60.

Article 4

Consultations

1. Members affirm their resolve to strengthen and improve the effectiveness of the consultation procedures employed by Members.

4

This paragraph shall also be applied to disputes on which panel reports have not been adopted or fully implemented.

- 2. Each Member undertakes to accord sympathetic consideration to and afford adequate opportunity for consultation regarding any representations made by another Member concerning measures affecting the operation of any covered agreement taken within the territory of the former.³
- 3. If a request for consultations is made pursuant to a covered agreement, the Member to which the request is made shall, unless otherwise mutually agreed, reply to the request within 10 days after the date of its receipt and shall enter into consultations in good faith within a period of no more than 30 days after the date of receipt of the request, with a view to reaching a mutually satisfactory solution. If the Member does not respond within 10 days after the date of receipt of the request, or does not enter into consultations within a period of no more than 30 days, or a period otherwise mutually agreed, after the date of receipt of the request, then the Member that requested the holding of consultations may proceed directly to request the establishment of a panel.
- 4. All such requests for consultations shall be notified to the DSB and the relevant Councils and Committees by the Member which requests consultations. Any request for consultations shall be submitted in writing and shall give the reasons for the request, including identification of the measures at issue and an indication of the legal basis for the complaint.

See GATT 1994 XXII:1 at p. 33, XXIII:1 at p. 33; SCM 4.2, 4.3 at p. 47, 7 at p. 49; GATS XXII at p. 56; TRIPS 64 at p. 57; GPA XXII:1, 2 at p. 63; Aircraft 8.5, 8.6 at p. 65; as well as provisions on consultations contained in other WTO covered agreements referred to in 4.11 footnote p. 6 and Working Practices at p. 103.

- 5. In the course of consultations in accordance with the provisions of a covered agreement, before resorting to further action under this Understanding, Members should attempt to obtain satisfactory adjustment of the matter.
- 6. Consultations shall be confidential, and without prejudice to the rights of any Member in any further proceedings.
- 7. If the consultations fail to settle a dispute within 60 days after the date of receipt of the request for consultations, the complaining party may request the establishment of a panel. The complaining party may request a panel during the 60-day period if the consulting parties jointly consider that consultations have failed to settle the dispute.

See DSU 12.10 for developing countries at p. 13; 24.2 for least-developed countries at p. 25.

³ Where the provisions of any other covered agreement concerning measures taken by regional or local governments or authorities within the territory of a Member contain provisions different from the provisions of this paragraph, the provisions of such other covered agreement shall prevail.

8. In cases of urgency, including those which concern perishable goods, Members shall enter into consultations within a period of no more than 10 days after the date of receipt of the request. If the consultations have failed to settle the dispute within a period of 20 days after the date of receipt of the request, the complaining party may request the establishment of a panel.

See DSU 12.10 at p. 13.

9. In cases of urgency, including those which concern perishable goods, the parties to the dispute, panels and the Appellate Body shall make every effort to accelerate the proceedings to the greatest extent possible.

See Working Procedures for Appellate Review Rule 26(3), at p. 99; DSU 12.8 at p. 12.

- 10. During consultations Members should give special attention to the particular problems and interests of developing country Members.
- 11. Whenever a Member other than the consulting Members considers that it has a substantial trade interest in consultations being held pursuant to paragraph 1 of Article XXII of GATT 1994, paragraph 1 of Article XXII of GATS, or the corresponding provisions in other covered agreements, such Member may notify the consulting Members and the DSB, within 10 days after the date of the circulation of the request for consultations under said Article, of its desire to be joined in the consultations. Such Member shall be joined in the consultations, provided that the Member to which the request for consultations was addressed agrees that the claim of substantial interest is well-founded. In that event they shall so inform the DSB. If the request to be joined in the consultations is not accepted, the applicant Member shall be free to request consultations under paragraph 1 of Article XXII or paragraph 1 of Article XXIII of GATT 1994, paragraph 1 of Article XXIII or paragraph 1 of Article XXIII of GATS, or the corresponding provisions in other covered agreements.

For the provisions see footnote 4 at p. 6.

6

The corresponding consultation provisions in the covered agreements are listed hereunder: Agreement on Agriculture, Article 19; Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures, paragraph 1 of Article 11; Agreement on Textiles and Clothing, paragraph 4 of Article 8; Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade, paragraph 1 of Article 14; Agreement on Trade-Related Investment Measures, Article 8; Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of GATT 1994, paragraph 2 of Article 17; Agreement on Implementation of Article VII of GATT 1994, paragraph 2 of Article 19; Agreement on Preshipment Inspection, Article 7; Agreement on Rules of Origin, Article 7; Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures, Article 6; Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures, Article 30; Agreement on Safeguards, Article 14; Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights, Article 64.1; and any corresponding consultation provisions in Plurilateral Trade Agreements as determined by the competent bodies of each Agreement and as notified to the DSB.

Article 5

Good Offices, Conciliation and Mediation

- 1. Good offices, conciliation and mediation are procedures that are undertaken voluntarily if the parties to the dispute so agree.
- 2. Proceedings involving good offices, conciliation and mediation, and in particular positions taken by the parties to the dispute during these proceedings, shall be confidential, and without prejudice to the rights of either party in any further proceedings under these procedures.
- 3. Good offices, conciliation or mediation may be requested at any time by any party to a dispute. They may begin at any time and be terminated at any time. Once procedures for good offices, conciliation or mediation are terminated, a complaining party may then proceed with a request for the establishment of a panel.
- 4. When good offices, conciliation or mediation are entered into within 60 days after the date of receipt of a request for consultations, the complaining party must allow a period of 60 days after the date of receipt of the request for consultations before requesting the establishment of a panel. The complaining party may request the establishment of a panel during the 60-day period if the parties to the dispute jointly consider that the good offices, conciliation or mediation process has failed to settle the dispute.
- 5. If the parties to a dispute agree, procedures for good offices, conciliation or mediation may continue while the panel process proceeds.
- 6. The Director-General may, acting in an *ex officio* capacity, offer good offices, conciliation or mediation with the view to assisting Members to settle a dispute.

Article 6

Establishment of Panels

1. If the complaining party so requests, a panel shall be established at the latest at the DSB meeting following that at which the request first appears as an item on the DSB's agenda, unless at that meeting the DSB decides by consensus not to establish a panel.⁵

See SCM 4.4, 7.4 at pp. 47, 50; GPA XXII:3 at p. 63.

⁵ If the complaining party so requests, a meeting of the DSB shall be convened for this purpose within 15 days of the request, provided that at least 10 days' advance notice of the meeting is given.

2. The request for the establishment of a panel shall be made in writing. It shall indicate whether consultations were held, identify the specific measures at issue and provide a brief summary of the legal basis of the complaint sufficient to present the problem clearly. In case the applicant requests the establishment of a panel with other than standard terms of reference, the written request shall include the proposed text of special terms of reference.

See ADP 17.5 at p. 43.

Article 7

Terms of Reference of Panels

1. Panels shall have the following terms of reference unless the parties to the dispute agree otherwise within 20 days from the establishment of the panel:

To examine, in the light of the relevant provisions in (name of the covered agreement(s) cited by the parties to the dispute), the matter referred to the DSB by (name of party) in document ... and to make such findings as will assist the DSB in making the recommendations or in giving the rulings provided for in that/those agreement(s).

- 2. Panels shall address the relevant provisions in any covered agreement or agreements cited by the parties to the dispute.
- 3. In establishing a panel, the DSB may authorize its Chairman to draw up the terms of reference of the panel in consultation with the parties to the dispute, subject to the provisions of paragraph 1. The terms of reference thus drawn up shall be circulated to all Members. If other than standard terms of reference are agreed upon, any Member may raise any point relating thereto in the DSB.

See DSU Appdx 4.1 at p. 32; GPA XXII:4 at p. 63.

Article 8

Composition of Panels

1. Panels shall be composed of well-qualified governmental and/or non-governmental individuals, including persons who have served on or presented a case to a panel, served as a representative of a Member or of a contracting party to GATT 1947 or as a representative to the Council or Committee of any covered agreement or its predecessor agreement, or in the Secretariat, taught or published on international trade law or policy, or served as a senior trade policy official of a Member.

See also GATS, Annex on Financial Services Art. 4 at p. 57; GATS, Decision on Certain Dispute Settlement Procedures Art. 3 and 4 at p.118; GPA XXII:5 at p. 64.