

ROUTLEDGE RESEARCH IN HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Social and Economic Rights in Theory and Practice

Critical Inquiries

Edited by
Helena Alviar García, Karl Klare and
Lucy A. Williams



Social and Economic Rights in Theory and Practice

Critical Inquiries

**Edited by Helena Alviar
García, Karl Klare and
Lucy A. Williams**

First published 2015
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2015 selection of editorial material, Helena Alviar García, Karl Klare, and Lucy A. Williams; individual chapters, the contributors

The right of Helena Alviar García, Karl Klare, and Lucy A. Williams to be identified as editors of this work has been asserted by them in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Social and economic rights in theory and practice / edited by Helena Alviar García, Karl Klare, Lucy A. Williams.

pages cm. – (Routledge research in human rights law)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-415-70564-6 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-315-86768-7 (ebk)

1. Social rights. 2. Human rights–Economic aspects. I. Alviar García, Helena, editor of compilation. II. Klare, Karl E., editor of compilation. III. Williams, Lucy A., editor of compilation.

K1700.S63 2014

323–dc23

2014011168

ISBN: 978-0-415-70564-6 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-86768-7 (ebk)

Typeset in Baskerville
by Cenveo Publisher Services

Social and Economic Rights in Theory and Practice

Since World War II, a growing number of jurisdictions in both the developing and industrialized worlds have adopted progressive constitutions that guarantee social and economic rights (SER) in addition to political and civil rights. Parallel developments have occurred at transnational level with the adoption of treaties that commit signatory states to respect and fulfil SER for their peoples.

This book is a product of the International Social and Economic Rights Project (iSERP), a global consortium of judges, lawyers, human rights advocates, and legal academics who critically examine the effectiveness of SER law in promoting real change in people's lives. The book addresses a range of practical, political, and legal questions under these headings, with acute sensitivity to the racial, cultural, and gender implications of SER and the path-breaking SER jurisprudence now emerging in the "Global South".

The book brings together internationally renowned experts in the field of social and economic rights to discuss a range of rights controversies from both theoretical and practical perspectives. Contributors of the book consider specific issues in the litigation and adjudication of SER cases from the differing standpoints of activists, lawyers, and adjudicators in order to identify and address the specific challenges facing the SER community.

This book will be of great use and interest to students and scholars of comparative constitutional law, human rights, public international law, development studies, and democratic political theory.

Helena Alviar García is Profesora Titular and Dean of the Faculty of Law at the Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia.

Karl Klare is the George J. & Kathleen Waters Matthews Distinguished University Professor at Northeastern University School of Law, Boston, USA.

Lucy A. Williams is Professor of Law at Northeastern University School of Law, Boston, USA. She is a co-director of the Project on Human Rights and the Global Economy at Northeastern University School of Law and is the convener of iSERP.

Routledge Research in Human Rights Law

Available titles in this series include:

The Right to Development in International Law

The Case of Pakistan

Khurshid Iqbal

Global Health and Human Rights

Legal and Philosophical Perspectives

John Harrington and Maria Stuttaford

The Right to Religious Freedom in International Law

Between group rights and individual rights

Anat Scolnicov

Emerging Areas of Human Rights in the 21st Century

The role of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights

Marco Odello and Sofia Cavandoli

The Human Right to Water and its Application in the Occupied Palestinian Territories

Amanda Cahill

International Human Rights Law and Domestic Violence

The effectiveness of international human rights law

Ronagh McQuigg

Human Rights in the Asia-Pacific Region

Towards Institution Building

Hitoshi Nasu and Ben Saul

Human Rights Monitoring Mechanisms of the Council of Europe

Gauthier de Beco

The Positive Obligations of the State under the European Convention of Human Rights

Dimitris Xenos

Vindicating Socio-Economic Rights

International Standards and Comparative Experiences

Paul O'Connell

The EU as a 'Global Player' in Human Rights?

Jan Wetzel

Regulating Corporate Human Rights Violations

Humanizing Business

Surya Deva

The UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

The Law, Process and Practice

Marco Odello and Francesco Seatzu

State Security Regimes and the Right to Freedom of Religion and Belief

Changes in Europe Since 2001

Karen Murphy

The European Court of Human Rights in the Post-Cold War Era

Universality in Transition

James A. Sweeney

The United Nations Human Rights Council

A Critique and Early Assessment

Rosa Freedman

Children and International Human Rights Law

The Right of the Child to be Heard

Aisling Parkes

Litigating Transnational Human Rights Obligations

Alternative Judgements

Mark Gibney and Wouter Vandenhole

Reproductive Freedom, Torture and International Human Rights

Challenging the Masculinisation of Torture

Ronli Noa Sifris

Applying an International Human Rights Framework to State Budget Allocations

Rights and Resources

Rory O'Connell, Aoife Nolan, Colin Harvey, Mira Dutschke and Eoin Rooney

Human Rights Law in Europe

The Influence, Overlaps and Contradictions of the EU and the ECHR

Kanstantsin Dzehtsiarou, Tobias Lock, Theodore Konstadinides and Noreen O'Meara

Nomadic Peoples and Human Rights

Jérémie Gilbert

Children's Lives in an Era of Children's Rights

The Progress of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in Africa

Afua Twum-Danso Imoh and Nicola Ansell

Social and Economic Rights in Theory and Practice

Critical Inquiries

Helena Alviar Garcia, Karl Klare and Lucy A. Williams

Forthcoming titles in this series include:

Jurisdiction, Immunity and Transnational Human Rights Litigation

Xiaodong Yang

Business and Human Rights in South East Asia

A Global Imperative for States and Corporations

Mahdev Mohan and Cynthia Morel

China's Human Rights Lawyers

Advocacy and Resistance

Eva Pils

Extraterritoriality and International Human Rights Law

The Spatial Reach of African Human Rights Treaties

Takele Soboka Bulto

Human Rights Law and Personal Identity

Jill Marshall

In Pursuit of Human Rights

NGOs, Pedagogy and Praxis in Grassroots Africa

Joanne Coysh

Indigenous Peoples, Title to Territory and Resources

The Transformative Role of Free Prior & Informed Consent

Cathal M. Doyle

The Law and Practice of the European Social Committee

Francesco Seatzu and Amaya Ubeda de Torres

Reconciling Cultural Diversity and International Human Rights Obligations

The Compatibility Approach in the Practice of International Human Rights Institutions

Michael K. Addo

The Right to Equality in European Human Rights Law

The Quest for Substance in the Jurisprudence of the European Courts

Charilaos Nikolaidis

This book is dedicated to the claimants, activists, and advocates whose courage, persistence, and imagination make possible the emergence of social and economic rights jurisprudence in our time.

Contributors

Helena Alviar García is Profesora Titular and Dean of the Faculty of Law at Universidad de los Andes in Bogotá, Colombia.

Natalia Angel-Cabo is Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Law at Universidad de los Andes in Bogotá, Colombia.

Lilian Chenwi is Associate Professor in the School of Law at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.

Dennis M. Davis is Judge of the High Court of South Africa, Western Cape Division and Honorary Professor of Law, University of Cape Town.

Sukti Dhital is a human rights lawyer and Co-founder Director of Nazdeek, a legal capacity-building organization committed to bringing access to justice closer to marginalized communities in India.

Jackie Dugard is co-founder and former Executive Director, Socio-Economic Rights Institute of South Africa, Johannesburg, where she is currently a Senior Researcher. She is also a Visiting Associate Professor at the Law School, University of the Witwatersrand in Johannesburg.

Octavio Luiz Motta Ferraz is a Brazilian born scholar based in the UK. He was an Assistant and then an Associate Professor of Law at University of Warwick, UK, from 2006–2014 and is now a Reader in Transnational Law at King's College, London.

Roberto Gargarella is a Professor at Universidad de Buenos Aires and Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Argentina.

Karl Klare is George J. & Kathleen Waters Matthews Distinguished University Professor, Northeastern University School of Law, Boston, USA.

Sandra Liebenberg holds the H.F. Oppenheimer Chair in Human Rights Law in the Faculty of Law, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa.

Domingo Lovera Parmo is Assistant Professor and Researcher, Universidad Diego Portales, Santiago, Chile.

Tshepo Madlingozi is Senior Lecturer, University of Pretoria, South Africa.

Frank I. Michelman is Robert Walmsley University Professor, Emeritus, Harvard University.

Colm O’Cinneide is a Reader in Law in the Faculty of Laws, University College London, London, UK. He is currently general rapporteur of the European Committee of Social Rights.

Bruce Porter is Director of the Social Rights Advocacy Centre, Ontario, Canada.

Jayshree Satpute is a human rights lawyer and Co-founder of Nazdeek, a legal capacity-building organization committed to bringing access to justice closer to marginalized communities in India.

Kate Tissington is Senior Research and Advocacy Officer, Socio-Economic Rights Institute of South Africa (SERI), Johannesburg, South Africa.

Namita Wahi is a Fellow at the Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi, and an S.J.D. Candidate at Harvard Law School.

Lucy A. Williams is Professor of Law, Northeastern University School of Law (NUSL), Boston, USA. She is a co-director of NUSL’s Project on Human Rights and the Global Economy and convenor of the International Social and Economic Rights Project (iSERP).

Katharine G. Young is Associate Professor, Boston College Law School, USA.

Acknowledgments

This book grew out of the work of the International Social and Economic Rights Project (iSERP), a project of the Program on Human Rights and the Global Economy (PHRGE) of Northeastern University School of Law, Boston. iSERP is an international network of lawyers, human rights advocates, legal academics, and judges that studies the emerging global jurisprudence of social and economic rights.

The editors and contributors are grateful to our iSERP colleagues for insight, encouragement, and critical commentary. For financial and logistic support, we thank PHRGE, Northeastern University's George J. and Kathleen Waters Matthews Distinguished University Professor endowment, and the four institutions that graciously hosted our annual meetings: Northeastern University (Boston, USA); Universidad de los Andes (Bogotá, Colombia); the University of Pretoria (Pretoria, South Africa); and University College London (London, UK).

We are deeply grateful to the Rockefeller Foundation for generous support that enabled us to workshop the draft chapters collaboratively at the Foundation's Bellagio Center. Special thanks are owed to Rockefeller Foundation officers and staff, particularly Mr Rob Garris and Ms Nadia Gilardoni.

Expert editorial assistance was provided by Laura Gamba Fadul and Juan Camilo Gomez Fajardo.

Contents

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	xiv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvi

PART 1	
Perspectives	1

1 Critical perspectives on social and economic rights, democracy and separation of powers	3
KARL KLARE	

2 Rights-compromised or rights-savvy? The use of rights-based strategies to advance socio-economic struggles by Abahlali baseMjondolo, the South African shack-dwellers' movement	23
JACKIE DUGARD, TSHEPO MADLINGOZI AND KATE TISSINGTON	

3 Resource questions in social and economic rights enforcement: a preliminary view	43
LUCY A. WILLIAMS	

PART 2	
Global social and economic rights practice: limitations and openings	65

2A: Latin America	67
--------------------------	----

4 Distribution of resources led by courts: a few words of caution	67
HELENA ALVIAR GARCÍA	

5	Latin American social constitutionalism: courts and popular participation	85
	NATALIA ANGEL-CABO AND DOMINGO LOVERA PARMO	
6	Deliberative democracy, dialogic justice and the promise of social and economic rights	105
	ROBERTO GARGARELLA	
7	Between activism and deference: social rights adjudication in the Brazilian Supreme Federal Tribunal	121
	OCTAVIO LUIZ MOTTA FERRAZ	
2B: India		138
8	The tension between property rights and social and economic rights: a case study of India	138
	NAMITA WAHI	
9	Claiming the right to safe motherhood through litigation: the Indian story	158
	SUKTI DHITAL AND JAYSHREE SATPUTE	
2C: South Africa		178
10	Democratizing the socio-economic rights-enforcement process	178
	LILIAN CHENWI	
11	The scope of the judicial role in the enforcement of social and economic rights: limits and possibilities viewed from the South African experience	197
	DENNIS M. DAVIS	
2D: Canada		215
12	Inclusive interpretations: social and economic rights and the Canadian charter	215
	BRUCE PORTER	

PART 3	
Looking forward	235
13 Adjudicating social and economic rights: can democratic experimentalism help?	237
SANDRA LIEBENBERG AND KATHARINE G. YOUNG	
14 The constitutionalization of social and economic rights	258
COLM O'CINNEIDE	
15 Constitutionally binding social and economic rights as a compelling idea: reciprocating perturbations in liberal and democratic constitutional visions	277
FRANK I. MICHELMAN	
<i>Bibliography</i>	295
<i>Index</i>	323

Part 1

Perspectives

