



■

UNDERSTANDING REMEDIES

SECOND EDITION

■

James M. Fischer



LexisNexis

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Fischer, James M.

Understanding remedies / James M. Fischer. --2nd ed.

p. cm.

ISBN 0-8205-6343-9 (softbound)

1. Remedies (Law)--United States. 2. Damages--United States. I. Title.

KF9010.F57 2006

347.7377--dc22

2006012707

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc, used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2006 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group.
All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 10¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

ISBN#: 0820563439

Editorial Offices

744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000

201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200

701 East Water Street, Charlottesville, VA 22902-7587 (434) 972-7600

www.lexis.com

UNDERSTANDING REMEDIES

Second Edition

JAMES M. FISCHER

*Professor of Law
Southwestern University School of Law*



LexisNexis®

DEDICATION

To Sue, Adam, Evan, Allison and Zachary with Love, Gratitude, and Affection; without Blame or Responsibility for errors and omissions.

PREFACE TO SECOND EDITION

The goal of this book is modest—a descriptive account of the law of remedies. Much modern scholarship is more ambitious seeking a normative account of the law of remedies, i.e., how much redress *should* the law allow to vindicate legal wrongs and restore individuals harmed by those wrongs to their rightful position.

Yet, to state that a work is descriptive is not to suggest that it is not difficult or complex. A descriptive account can illustrate the chance element of law; the fact that “law” is often either uncertain or unresolved. This open-endedness is particularly common with remedies. Much of the “law” here is stated in capacious language leaving much to individual interpretation. Remedies law tends to be situation sensitive; here, the usual feature is that the facts of the case control the result more than the remedies rule.

All this creates a large amount of uncertainty as to how remedies issues will be resolved. Law students (and lawyers) need to be comfortable with uncertainty. It is ever-present in the law, but “uncertainty” does not undermine the case for knowing the “law,” such as it is. Chance, after all, does favor the prepared mind.*

This book states the “law,” but also gives examples that illustrate that the “law” often bends, is bent, and courts often disagree as to how the issue before the court should be resolved. In other words, what is the law? This view of the “law” reflects, no doubt, the authors own biases. All authors simplify by collecting materials and omitting data based on their own view of what the end product should resemble. I have tried to be attentive to that bias. How successful I have been is, ultimately, for the reader to judge.

An early Rolling Stone’s song provides a compass that helps in learning, and ultimately understanding, the law of remedies:

You can’t always get what you want

You can’t always get what you want

And if you try sometime you find

You get what you need.**

Sometimes the law of remedies provides full redress, and perhaps even then some for harm sustained. Most often, however, other values conflict with

* Attributed to Louis Pasteur.

** Rolling Stones “You Can’t Always Get What You Want,” Let It Bleed Album (1969).

a full recovery (or restoration). Even here, however, the law does not leave the plaintiff unprotected. The law of remedies is a search (and a determination) as to what the law permits as rectification and reparation when legal wrongs have been committed.

Although this text is marketed primarily to law students, I have chosen to add extensive footnote references to authorities that support the propositions asserted, as well as references to other work that develop the materials further than can be accomplished in a single volume text that aspires to some degree of comprehensiveness. Any tour through the legal landscape is a sail through waters infested with legal icebergs. This book discusses the tips of those icebergs. As every sailor of the law, whether lawyer or judge, knows, much more lies beneath.

James M. Fischer
Professor of Law
Southwestern University School of Law
Los Angeles, California

CONVENTIONS USED IN THIS BOOK

Footnotes are consecutively numbered within each whole section. For example, all footnotes within Section 13 are consecutively numbered through that Section's subsections e.g., 13.1, 13.2, etc. Footnotes for each whole section begin with the number one.

The first time an authority is cited in a section, it is set forth in full; thereafter, *within that same whole section*, the authority is abbreviated, with only the page cite given. For example, a decision will be cited in full the first time it appears in Section 13, but only an abbreviated citation if the authority again is referenced in Section 13.1 or 13.2, etc. If that same authority is also cited in Section 14, it would again be fully set forth and abbreviated citations used for further references within Section 14's subsections.

Unless otherwise noted, all cross references are within the same whole section only. Thus, a reference in a footnote in Section 13, including subsections, to footnote 15 is to footnote 15 in Section 13, including subsections. A reference in a footnote in Section 21 including subsections, to text and notes 5–7 is to text and notes 5–7 in Section 21, including subsections, only.

PREFACE TO FIRST EDITION

Remedies are fundamental; yet, remedies are frequently overlooked. We often discuss remedies without realizing that it is a remedy about which we are talking. Consider, for example, the exclusionary rule, which is a staple of constitutional criminal procedure jurisprudence. The exclusionary rule is, at root, a remedy designed to vindicate the values courts have identified in the text of constitutional provisions. It rectifies the harm inflicted by excluding evidence acquired by the state in violation of constitutional and statutory guarantees. It is remedial in its field of operation as much as an injunction or damages award in the cases in which they apply.

Should it make a difference whether a legal issue is classified and analyzed as a remedy or as a substantive right or procedural device? There is the argument that the difference is simply one of category classification, no different from tort versus contract, substance versus procedure, or civil versus criminal. Yet, the very persistence of these category classifications tells us that there is more going on here than mere categorization or arrangement. Separate identification of a legal issue in the remedies category helps us focus on the essential nature of that legal issue and its role in the larger legal framework. By looking at an “issue” as a “remedies issue” we gain a better understanding of the capabilities of remedies, as well as their limits.

The approach taken in these materials is neither doctrinal nor theoretical; rather, the focus is educative. The objective is to identify the basic legal principles, rules, and standards that constitute the law of remedies as applied by courts in the United States. Of necessity, the focus is on general principles and general rules of application. This approach permits readers to begin the analysis of a problem by deciding which facts are relevant. General principles and general rules also enable the reader to discover the more precise rules that determine the particular case. Most importantly, however, general principles and general rules enable the reader to both gain a sense of the ambit of remedies and establish a base from which the relationship between the general and the particular may be investigated to determine whether the specific application of a remedial principle or rule is consistent and coherent with the larger body of substantive and remedies law.

Stating rules and principles is easy; it is their application that is difficult. Neither the most complex nor the most basic “How to” book can avoid that gap between knowledge and application. Yet, if knowledge of rules and principles is not a sufficient condition to the proper application of law, it is necessary condition. Even the most gifted athlete will be frustrated if his performance is crippled because he violates the rules of the game. The knowledge of law, particularly its component rules, principles, guidelines, and standards enables the good lawyer to practice her profession with skill

and confidence. Knowing what a client's remedies are has an obvious connection to the work litigation lawyers do, but remedies are not solely the concern of trial lawyers. Transaction lawyers must know what consequences are likely to result if the transaction fails, or the deal the transaction spawns, is breached. Remedies are not the sum of a lawyer's work, but they are an important constituent part of what good lawyers do and think about when representing their clients.

I have attempted to provide in these materials a comprehensive, and I hope, readable overview of the law of remedies. I have selected those rules and principles that I believe are of general application, noting whenever possible significant splits and disagreements regarding the accepted canons of law. In this regard Newton's law works here as elsewhere: for every stated principle of law, there is an equal, and opposite, statement of the principle elsewhere. I have tried to bring many of these disagreements to the surface by presenting the views evenly. When I believe that a particular view is wrong, I have not, however, hesitated to say so, but always as my opinion, not disguised as a restatement of the law. I cite all, in my opinion, useful sources, oblivious (actually indifferent) to the critique that some sources are beneath academic usage.*

If courts use it, this text cites it.

I hope readers will find the work useful and interesting. I certainly encourage readers of this work to contact me at Southwestern University School of Law if they have comments or observations regarding the book.

James M. Fischer
Professor of Law

* See Patrick McFadden, *Fundamental Principles of American Law*, 85 Cal. L. Rev. 1749, 1750 n.9 (1997) (observing, I hope tongue in cheek: "Woe to the scholar who cites American Jurisprudence")

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

Chapter 1 UNDERSTANDING REMEDIES

§ 1	BASIC REMEDIAL GOALS	1
§ 2	TYPES OF REMEDIES	3
§ 2.1	Legal versus Equitable Remedy	4
§ 2.2	Specific versus Substitutional Remedies	4
§ 2.3	Damages	5
§ 2.4	Injunctions	5
§ 2.5	Restitution	6
§ 2.6	Declaratory Relief	6
§ 2.7	Punitive Damages	7
§ 2.8	Nominal Damages	8
§ 2.9	Presumed Damages	9
§ 3	RIGHTS AND REMEDIES	10
§ 3.1	Relationship Between Rights and Remedies	10
§ 3.2	Common Law Remedies	13
§ 3.3	Statutory Remedies	13
	§ 3.3.1 Express Remedies	13
	§ 3.3.2 Implied Remedies	14
§ 4	PUBLIC POLICY	18
§ 5	RESERVED	

Chapter 2 GENERAL PRINCIPLES CONCERNING COMPENSATORY DAMAGES

§ 6	THE PURPOSE OF COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	25
§ 6.1	Expectancy Interest	27
§ 6.2	Reliance Interest	29
§ 6.3	Restitutionary Interest	32
§ 6.4	General Damages versus Special or Consequential Damages	33
§ 6.5	Economic versus Non-Economic Damages	36

	Page
§ 7	VALUE 38
§ 7.1	Determining Economic Value 39
§ 7.2	Diminution in Value 42
§ 7.3	Cost of Repair versus Diminution in Value . . . 43
§ 7.4	Burden of Proof 44
§ 7.5	Betterment 45
§ 7.5.1	Determining Betterment 46
§ 7.5.2	Allocating Betterment 46
§ 7.6	Value as a Function of Time 48
§ 7.6.1	General Rule 49
§ 7.6.2	Fluctuating Value 50
§ 7.6.3	Foreign Currency Obligations 53
§ 7.7	Value as a Function of Place 56
§ 7.7.1	Place in Chain of Distribution 56
§ 7.7.2	Place in Terms of Physical Location 57
§ 8	MEASURING COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 58
§ 8.1	Certainty 58
§ 8.2	Excessiveness 62
§ 8.3	Lost Profits 65
§ 8.4	New Business Rule 67
§ 8.5	Lost Volume Sellers 68
§ 8.6	Real or Hypothetical Losses 70
§ 8.7	Harsh or Mild Measures 71
§ 8.8	Jury Discretion and Judicial Review 74
§ 9	FUTURE LOSSES 75
§ 9.1	Future Damage 77
§ 9.2	Future Damages 78
§ 9.3	Discounting to Present Value 79
§ 10	LOSS CAUSATION 85
§ 10.1	General Principles 85
§ 10.2	Contracts 86
§ 10.2.1	Cause-in-Fact 86
§ 10.2.2	Policy Considerations 88
§ 10.3	Tort Causation 91

	Page
§ 10.4 Future Losses	94
§ 10.5 Lost Chance	95
§ 10.6 Occurrence Causation versus Loss Causation	98
§ 10.7 Apportionment of Damages	99
§ 11 ECONOMIC LOSS RULE	101
§ 11.1 Purpose and Scope of Rule	101
§ 11.2 Property Damage	104
§ 11.3 Pollution Caused Economic Losses	108
§ 11.4 Modern Applications	109
§ 12 NON-ECONOMIC DAMAGES	111
§ 12.1 General Principles	111
§ 12.2 Measuring Non-Economic Loss	117
§ 12.2.1 Excessiveness	120
§ 12.2.2 Discretion of the Decision Maker	123
§ 12.2.3 Quality of Evidence	126
§ 12.2.4 Pre-Impact Fear of Death	127
§ 12.3 Infliction of Emotional Distress	129
§ 13 DUTY TO MITIGATE DAMAGES	131
§ 13.1 General Principles	131
§ 13.2 Reasonable Efforts	133
§ 13.2.1 Bodily Injury Claims	135
§ 13.2.2 Employment Claims	136
§ 13.2.3 The “Fragile” Plaintiff	140
§ 13.3 Equal Opportunity to Avoid Losses Rule	141
§ 13.4 Disposal or Repair of Damaged Property	142
§ 13.5 Continued Dealing With Defendant	142
§ 13.6 Intentional Wrongs	143
§ 13.7 Compensation For Mitigation Efforts	143
§ 13.8 Special Applications of the Mitigation Principle	144
§ 13.8.1 Leases	144
§ 13.8.2 Lost Volume Seller Profits	145
§ 14 OFFSETTING BENEFITS	145
§ 14.1 Special Benefits Rule in Tort	146

		Page
	§ 14.2 Special Benefits Rule in Contract	148
	§ 14.3 Taxes	149
§ 15	COLLATERAL SOURCE RULE	150
	§ 15.1 Nature of the Rule	150
	§ 15.1.1 Rule of Substance	152
	§ 15.1.2 Rule of Evidence	152
	§ 15.1.3 Tort or Contract	154
	§ 15.2 Collateral Source or No Damage	156
	§ 15.3 Gratuitous Benefits	157
	§ 15.4 Independent Source	158
	§ 15.4.1 United States as Defendant	158
	§ 15.4.2 Claims Against Employers	160
	§ 15.5 Permissible Inquiries into Collateral Sources	161
	§ 15.6 Payments by Joint Tortfeasors	163
	§ 15.7 Collateral Source Rule and Tort Reform Legislation	164
§ 16	PREJUDGMENT INTEREST	165
	§ 16.1 Ascertainability: Liquidated versus Unliquidated Claims	168
	§ 16.2 Interest Rate	171
	§ 16.2.1 Determination of Rate	171
	§ 16.2.2 Simple or Compound	174
	§ 16.3 Accrual Date	175
§ 17	TAX CONSEQUENCES OF AWARDS AND SETTLEMENTS	177
	§ 17.1 Personal Injury Awards	179
	§ 17.2 Non-Personal Injury Awards	182
	§ 17.3 Effect of Settlement Allocation	184
	§ 17.4 Consideration of Taxability of Damages in Arriving at Damages Awards	185
	§ 17.5 Enhanced Taxation As Additional Damages	187
§§ 18-19	RESERVED	

Chapter 3 GENERAL PRINCIPLES CONCERNING EQUITABLE REMEDIES

§ 20	THE HISTORICAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN LAW AND EQUITY	189
§ 20.1	Judicial Power	192
§ 20.2	Right of Jury Trial	195
§ 20.3	Merger of Law and Equity	198
	§ 20.3.1 Procedural or Substantive	198
	§ 20.3.2 Remedial Defenses	198
§ 20.4	Law and Equity	199
§ 21	ADEQUACY OF THE REMEDY AT LAW/ IRREPARABLE INJURY	201
§ 21.1	Justification for the Requirement	201
§ 21.2	The Content of the Requirement	207
	§ 21.2.1 Frustration of Relief Sought	208
	§ 21.2.2 Economic Harm	208
	§ 21.2.3 Problems in Measuring the Legal Remedy	210
	§ 21.2.4 Nature of the Injury	211
	§ 21.2.5 Loss of Chance or Advantage	212
	§ 21.2.6 Insolvency	213
	§ 21.2.7 Multiple Lawsuits	214
	§ 21.2.8 Uniqueness	214
§ 22	EQUITY ACTS IN PERSONAM	216
§ 23	EQUITABLE DISCRETION	219
§ 24	BURDEN ON THE COURT/SUPERVISION	224
§ 25	NATURE OF RIGHTS PROTECTED	226
§ 26	STATUTORY EQUITABLE REMEDIES	230
	§ 26.1 Statute Expanding Equitable Remedies	231
	§ 26.2 Statute Restricting Equitable Remedies	233
§ 27	INJUNCTION OF CRIMINAL ACTIVITY	236
§ 28	INJUNCTIONS AND PRIOR RESTRAINTS	238
§ 29	RESERVED	

Chapter 4 INJUNCTIONS

§ 30	RIPENESS, MOOTNESS, AND STANDING	244
§ 30.1	Ripeness	245
§ 30.2	Mootness	249
	§ 30.2.1 Voluntary Cessation	250
	§ 30.2.2 Capable of Repetition	252
	§ 30.2.3 Continuing Effects	254
§ 30.3	Standing	255
§ 31	TEMPORARY INJUNCTIVE RELIEF	257
§ 31.1	Forms of Relief	257
§ 31.2	Traditional Tests for Issuance of Temporary Injunctive Relief	260
	§ 31.2.1 Likelihood of Success on the Merits	260
	§ 31.2.2 Irreparable Injury	262
	§ 31.2.3 Balancing of Hardships or Equities	264
	§ 31.2.4 Public Policy or Public Interest	265
§ 31.3	Modern Variations of the Traditional Test	267
§ 31.4	Maintenance of the Status Quo	271
§ 31.5	Freeze Orders	273
§ 31.6	Notice and Hearing Requirements	274
§ 31.7	Bond Requirement	279
§ 32	APPELLATE REVIEW OF ORDERS GRANTING OR DENYING TEMPORARY RELIEF	286
§ 33	PERMANENT INJUNCTIONS	292
§ 33.1	Scope of Injunctive Relief	292
§ 33.2	Entitlement to Permanent Injunctive Relief	299
§ 33.3	Length of Permanent Injunctive Relief	303
§ 34	SPECIFICITY OF INJUNCTIVE RELIEF	304
§ 35	PERSONS BOUND BY INJUNCTIVE RELIEF	310
§ 35.1	In Active Concert or Participation With	310
§ 35.2	Personal Jurisdiction Over Non Party	314
§ 35.3	Agents and Employees	315
§ 35.4	Duty to Participate	318

	Page
§ 36 MODIFICATION OF INJUNCTIONS	318
§ 36.1 Preliminary Injunctions	319
§ 36.2 Permanent Injunctions	320
§ 36.3 Consent Decrees and Structural Injunctions . . .	324
§ 36.4 Effect of Appeal on Power of Trial Court to Super- vise or Modify Injunction	327
§§ 37-39 RESERVED	

Chapter 5 GENERAL PRINCIPLES GOVERNING RESTITUTION

§ 40 RESTITUTION	329
§ 41 RESTITUTION FOR WRONGDOING	332
§ 41.1 Tortious Conduct	335
§ 41.2 Breach of Contract	338
§ 41.3 Other Examples of Restitution in Contractual Settings	342
§ 42 RESTITUTION FOR UNJUST ENRICHMENT	343
§ 43 NATURE OF UNJUST ENRICHMENT	344
§ 43.1 The Volunteer Principle	345
§ 43.2 Bypassing the Person Benefitted	348
§ 43.3 Mistaken Payment	349
§ 43.4 Expectation of Payment or Compensation	350
§ 43.5 Irreparable Injury	351
§ 43.6 Plus-Minus Rule	352
§ 43.7 Benefits versus Harms	352
§ 44 QUASI CONTRACT AND UNJUST ENRICHMENT . . .	353
§ 44.1 Nature of Quasi Contract	353
§ 44.2 Critical Elements of Quasi Contract	356
§ 44.3 Connected Relationships	359
§ 44.4 Recovery by Party in Breach of Contract	360
§ 45 VALUATION OF THE BENEFIT	361
§ 46 APPORTIONMENT OF BENEFIT	365
§ 46.1 Feasibility	366
§ 46.2 Defendant's Culpability	369
§ 46.3 Extent of Apportionment	371

	Page
§ 47 RESTITUTIONARY DAMAGES	371
§§ 48-49 RESERVED	
 Chapter 6 RESTITUTIONARY ACTIONS	
§ 50 INTRODUCTION	376
§ 51 DISGORGEMENT ORDERS	376
§ 52 INDEMNITY	381
§ 53 SUBROGATION	386
§ 53.1 Derivative Claim	387
§ 53.2 “Superior Equities” Principle	388
§ 53.3 Priorities	389
§ 53.3.1 Make Whole Requirement	390
§ 53.3.2 Settlement or Compromise	391
§ 53.4 Loss of Subrogation Rights	393
§ 53.5 Duties to Fund Creators	394
§ 54 CONSTRUCTIVE TRUST	396
§ 54.1 Trust By Analogy or Metaphor	396
§ 54.2 Elements of Constructive Trust	399
§ 54.3 Application of Irreparable Injury Requirement	401
§ 54.4 Reasons for Seeking a Constructive Trust	402
§ 54.5 Scope of Constructive Trust	403
§ 54.5.1 Purchase of Life Insurance	404
§ 54.5.2 Failure to Maintain Life Insurance	406
§ 54.6 Priority	408
§ 54.7 Time Interest Attaches	410
§ 54.8 Fraudulent Conveyance versus Constructive Trust	412
§ 55 EQUITABLE ACCOUNTING	414
§ 56 EQUITABLE LIEN	416
§ 57 REPLEVIN	418
§ 57.1 Nature of the Action	418
§ 57.2 Identification of Property (Accession and Confusion)	420
§ 58 EJECTMENT	424

Page

§ 59	TRACING PRINCIPLES FOR CONSTRUCTIVE TRUSTS, EQUITABLE LIENS AND EQUITABLE ACCOUNTING	426
§ 59.1	Equitable Principles	426
§ 59.2	Nature of Tracing	427
§ 59.3	Limitations on Tracing	429
	§ 59.3.1 Strict Rule in Bankruptcy	430
	§ 59.3.2 Lowest Intermediate Balance Rule	431
	§ 59.3.3 Tracing and Equal Treatment	434
 Chapter 7 REMEDY DEFENSES		
§ 60	COMPARED WITH LIABILITY DEFENSES	438
§ 61	LACHES AND STATUTES OF LIMITATION	440
§ 61.1	Laches	440
§ 61.2	Statutes of Limitation	447
	§ 61.2.1 Accrual	448
	§ 61.2.2 Discovery of Injury or Harm	449
	§ 61.2.3 Continuing Injury or Violation	453
§ 61.3	Tolling	456
§ 61.4	Merger of Law and Equity	460
§ 62	UNCLEAN HANDS AND “IN PARI DELICTO”	461
§ 62.1	Unclean Hands	461
§ 62.2	“In Pari Delicto”	467
§ 62.3	Merger of Law and Equity	470
§ 63	DURESS AND UNCONSCIONABILITY	472
§ 63.1	Duress	472
§ 63.2	Unconscionability	476
	§ 63.2.1 Procedural	478
	§ 63.2.2 Substantive	479
§ 64	ESTOPPEL, WAIVER, AND ELECTION	479
§ 64.1	Equitable Estoppel	480
§ 64.2	Waiver	483
§ 64.3	Election	484
§ 65	FRAUD AND ILLEGALITY	486
§ 65.1	Fraud	486