Legislation

DAVID R. MIERS ALAN C. PAGE



LEGISLATION

Ву

DAVID R. MIERS, LL.M., D. Jur.

Senior Lecturer in Law, University College, Cardiff

and

ALAN C. PAGE, LL.B., Ph.D.

Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Dundee

LONDON SWEET & MAXWELL 1982 Published in 1982 by
Sweet and Maxwell Limited of
11 New Fetter Lane, London.
Computerset by Promenade Graphics Limited, Cheltenham
and printed in Great Britain
by T. J. Press (Padstow) Ltd.,
Padstow. Cornwall

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Miers, David R. Legislation.

1. Legislation—Great Britain I. Title II. Page, Alan C.

328.41'07 JF441

ISBN 0-421-27110-8 ISBN 0-421-27120-5

All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the copyright holder and the publisher. application for which shall be made to the publisher.

© D. R. MIERS & A. C. PAGE 1982

To Maggie and Sheila

PREFACE

Legislation constitutes the single most important source of law in our society. Most central government activity is carried on within a statutory framework. The affairs of local authorities, nationalised industries, public corporations and private commerce are defined and directed by legislation. There is hardly any aspect of the education, welfare, health, employment, housing, income and public conduct of the citizen that is not regulated by statute. The preparation, enactment, interpretation and implementation of legislation are therefore matters of the first importance; not just for those whose behaviour is affected by the law, but also for those who are professionally involved in those matters. For governments, the preparation and enactment each year of a legislative programme implementing their manifesto promises and responding to the more routine requests of departments constitute vital features of their terms of office.

Yet in our experience the importance of legislation in our society is seldom fully appreciated by students; in particular they often seem insufficiently aware of, or unfamiliar with, its importance both as a source of law and as the foundation for the majority of substantive law courses studied. This is undoubtedly due in part to the overwhelming emphasis in traditional, and more seriously, in contemporary legal education, on reading and reconciling cases as the main lawyer-like skills to be acquired. Indeed, by virtue of the emphasis placed on case-handling and precedent, legal education seems to be in danger of perpetuating, consciously or unconsciously, that self-same bias in favour of the common law which earlier generations so roundly condemned when manifested by the judiciary in their approach to the interpretation of statutes.

A second reason lies in the generally fragmentary, and in some instances misleading, treatment of legislation in the available literature. Whereas the conception, formulation, enactment, interpretation and implementation of legislation are inter-related activities, they are nowhere dealt with as a whole, systematically and comprehensively. They are instead variously addressed, for different purposes and for different audiences, within political science and government, constitutional law, drafting, legal systems and legal method, jurisprudence and the sociology of law. This fragmentary treatment, in our view, seriously limits students' appreciation of the significance and importance of legislation.

viii Preface

In setting out to redress this imbalance we are conscious of the fact that our subject matter was such that everyone would have his or her own ideas about what the book should or should not contain. We were also aware of the enormous value of earlier disparate contributions to this field. These include C. K. Allen's Law in the Making, J. A. G. Griffith's early work culminating in his Parliamentary Scrutiny of Government Bills and S. A. Walkland's The Legislative Process in Great Britain. Where appropriate we have drawn on these contributions and acknowledge our own indebtedness to them. On the other hand, we have consciously sought to avoid the repetition of the more specialised material found in a Thornton, a Craics or a Maxwell as inappropriate for a work of this general nature. Beyond this our aim essentially has been to provide a systematic and comprehensive account of legislation applicable in the United Kingdom from its inception to its implementation. For reasons explained fully in Chapter 1 we conceive of legislation as a mainly government-inspired activity. Consequently we concentrate on public general Acts and their various non-Parliamentary equivalents, in particular, subordinate legislation and Community legislation.

The book originated in our teaching experience at University College, Cardiff, and was jointly conceived and developed. Because of Alan Page's departure for Dundee in 1979, responsibility for the initial draft of individual chapters was divided; Alan Page was responsible for Chapters 1, 3, 5, and 6, David Miers for Chapters 2, 4, 7 and 8.

In writing this work we have inevitably accumulated a great many debts. The greatest of these is owed to Bob Ferguson who, despite the pressure of other commitments, read drafts of all of the chapters and made a great many invaluable suggestions. We would also like to thank Dr. A. Mughan, Professor J. C. Wylie, Professor T. C. Daintith, T. St. J. N. Bates and Professor R. Lempert for reading and commenting on various drafts; Joyce Brunton, Christine Davies and Jennifer Dix for typing the final manuscript; and Susanna Marsh for preparing the index. Finally, our thanks go to our publishers for their assistance, encouragement and forbearance.

ACP DRM

TABLE OF CASES

A.G. v. Prince Augustus of Hanover [1957] A.C. 437	
Bailey v. Williamson (1873) L.R. 8 Q.B. 118	184 203
Bourne v. Norwich Crematorium Ltd. [1967] 2 All E.R. 576 Bowles v. Bank of England [1913] 1 Ch. 59 Bromley L.B.C. v. Greater London Council [1982] 1 All E.R. 129 Buchanan & Co. Ltd. v. Babco Forwarding and Shipping [1978] A.C. 141 189, 3 Buckoke v. G.L.C. [1971] Ch. 655 Bulmer (H.P.) Ltd. v. Bollinger [1974] 2 All E.R. 1226 Burmah Oil v. The Lord Advocate [1965] A.C. 75	193 16 179 208 178 208
Carter v. Bradbeer [1975] 1 W.L.R. 1204	, 16
Da Costa Case [1963] E.C.R. 31	189 177 193 192 195
Ealing L.B.C. v. Race Relations Board [1972] A.C. 342	188
Farrell v. Alexander [1977] A.C. 59	184 188 198
Gouriet v. Union of Post Office Workers [1978] A.C. 435	236 186
Hadmor Productions Ltd. v. Hamilton [1981] 2 All E.R. 724	189 192 184
[1975] A.C. 295	167

Institute of Patent Agents v. Lockwood [1894] A.C. 347	166 21
Jenkins v. Kingsgate [1981] 1 W.L.R. 972	179
Kapian [1978] R.T.R. 119	229
Letang v. Cooper [1965] 1 Q.B. 232	193
MacCarthys v. Smith [1980] 3 W.L.R. 929; [1979] 3 All E.R. 325	166
Magor and St. Mellons R.D.C. v. Newport Corporation [1952] A.C. 189	181,
Maunsell v. Olins [1975] A.C. 373	. 194 166
Norwhale, The [1975] 2 All E.R. 501 Number 20 Cannon Street Ltd. v. Singer & Friedlander Ltd. [1974] 2 All E.R. 577	
Ogden Industries Property Ltd. v. Lucas [1970] A.C. 113	195
Quazi v. Quazi [1979] 3 W.L.R. 833	, 192
Parsley v. Beard [1978] R.T.R. 263 Peake v. Automotive Products Ltd. [1977] 3 W.L.R. 853 Price v. Civil Service Commission [1977] 1 W.L.R. 1417 v. Davies [1979] R.T.R. 204	$\frac{243}{244}$
R. v. Bow Road Domestic Proceedings Court, ex p. Adedigba [1968] 2 Q.B. 572 — v. Chief Immigration Officer, ex p. Bibi [1976] 3 All E.R. 843 — v. Criminal Injuries Compensation Board, ex p. Lain [1967] 2 Q.B. 864 — v. Governor of Brixton Prison, ex p. Schtraks [1964] A.C. 556 — v. Governor of Pentonville Prison, ex p. Cheng [1973] A.C. 931 — v. Immigration Appeal Tribunals [1972] 1 W.L.R. 1390 — v. Kelt [1977] 3 All E.R. 1099	. 197 . 196 . 156
 v. Lemon [1979] A.C. 617 v. Local Commissioner for Administration, ex p. Bradford Metropolitan City Council [1972] 2 W.L.R. 1 v. Metropolitan Police Commissioner, ex p. Blackburn [1968] 2 Q.B. 118 v. Metropolitan Police Commissioner, ex p. Blackburn (No. 3) [1973] Q.B. 	236
241	. 155
Ramsay v. I.R.C. [1981] 2 W.L.R. 449 River Wear Commissioners v. Adamson (1877) 2 App.Cas. 743 Roberts v. British Railways Board [1975] 1 W.L.R. 396 Rookes v. Barnard [1964] A.C. 1129 Roquette Freres v. Council of the European Communities. 138/79	. 186 . 179 . 198
AVOQUETE A TELES OF COUNTER OF THE LAUTOPEAR COMMITTINITIES, 130/73	. 1307

Sagnata Investments Ltd. v. Norwich Corporation [1971] 2 Q.B. 614	203
Seaford Estates v. Asher [1949] 2 K.B. 481	182
Shearer v. Bercain Ltd. [1980] 3 All E.R. 295	177
Sheridan v. Webster [1980] R.T.R. 349	229
Simmonds v. Newell [1953] 1 W.L.R. 826	155
	244
Stock v. Frank Jones (Tipton) Ltd. [1978] 1 W.L.R. 231	187
Surjit Kaur v. The Lord Advocate [1981] S.L.T. 322	189
Sussex Peerage Claim (1844) 11 Cl. & Fin. 85	
University of Reading v. MacCormack [1976] I.R.C.R. 491	244
Variola v. Italian Finance Administrative, 34/73 [1973] E.C.R. 981	21
Vestey v. I.R.C. [1980] A.C. 114895, 178,	179

TABLE OF STATUTES

1539	Statute of Proclamations (31	1920	Emergency Powers Act (10
	Hen. 8, c. 26) 143		& 11 Geo. 5, c. 55) 145
1689	Bill of Rights (1 W. & M.		Government of Ireland Act
	Sess. 2, c. 2)—		(10 & 11 Geo. 5, c. 67)7
	Art. 1 16	1932	Import Duties Act (22 & 23
	Art. 2 16		Geo. 5, c. 8)
	Art. 4 16	1936	Public Order Act (1 Edw. 8
1714	Riot Act (1 Geo. 1, c. 5) 43		& 1 Geo. 6, c. 6)—
1824	Vagrancy Act (5 Geo. 4, c.		s. 5A(1) 228
	83)—		(5) 230
	s. 4 77		Private Legislation Proce-
1832	Cholera Prevention Act (2 &		dure (Scotland) Act (26
	3 Wm. 4, c. 10) 143		
1850	Lord Brougham's Act (13		Geo. 5 & 1 Edw. 8, c.
	Vict. c. 21)—	2.00000	52)10, 11
	s. 2 88	1944	National Fire Service (Reg-
1868	Promissory Oaths Act (31 &		ulations) Indemnity Act
1000	32 Vict. c. 72)—		(7 & 8 Geo. 6, c. 35) 157
	s. 4	1945	Supplies and Services (Tran-
1870	Extradition Act (33 & 34		sitional Powers) Act (9
1070			& 10 Geo. 6, c. 10) 17
	Vict. c. 52)—		Statutory Order (Special
1876	s. 3(1)		Procedure) Act (9 & 10
1010	Customs Consolidation Act		Geo. 6, c. 18)10, 11
	(39 & 40 Vict. c. 36)—	1946	Statutory Instruments Act
1000	s. 42 193	1010	(9 & 10 Geo. 6, c. 36) 41,
1889	Interpretation Act (52 & 53		142, 151, 158, 163
1000	Vict. c. 63) 190		s. 1(1) 142
1893	Rules Publication Act (56 &		(2) 142
	57 Vict. c. 66)151, 155		s. 2 154
	s. 1		s. 4(1)155, 156, 157, 164
	s. 3 154		(2)
	(2) 154		s. 5
1899	Private Legislation Proce-		
	dure (Scotland) Act (62		s. 6
	& 63 Vict. c. 47) 11, 14, 30		s. 7(1) 158
1908	Punishment of Incest Act (8	1947	Supplies and Services (Ex-
	Edw. 7, c. 45) 216		tended Purposes) Act
1911	Parliament Act (1 & 2 Geo.		(10 & 11 Geo. 6,
	5, c. 13)127, 128		c. 55) 17
	s. 1(1) 127	1948	Laying of Documents Before
	s. 2127, 128		Parliament (Interpreta-
	Official Secrets Act (1 & 2		tion) Act (11 & 12 Geo.
	Geo. 5, c. 28)—		6, c. 59) 156
	s. 8 230	1949	Consolidation of Enactments
1914	Government of Ireland Act		(Procedure) Act (12, 13
	(4 & 5 Geo 5, c. 90) 128		& 14 Geo. 6, c. 33) 40,
	Welsh Church Act (4 & 5		41, 43, 44, 46
	Geo. 5, c. 91) 128		s. 2 41
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		MARCHARAGE ANTONOMICS ANTONOMICS AND ANTONOMICS AND

1949	Parliament Act (12, 13 & 14 Geo. 6, c. 103)41, 127, 128	1967 1968	Abortion Act (c. 87)
1951	Price Control and Other Orders (Indemnity) Act		Act (c, 9)
1956	(14 & 15 Geo. 6, c. 59) 157 Restrictive Trade Practices		s. 1
	Act (4 & 5 Eliz. 2, c. 68) 63		s. 98
1958	Import Duties Act (6 & 7 Eliz. 2, c. 6)—		32) 148 Theatres Act (c. 54) 73, 131
	s. 13(4) 157		Gaming Act (c. 65) 228
1959	Obscene Publications Act (7 & 8 Eliz. 2, c. 66) 73		s. 2(1)
1960	Betting, Gaming and Lotter-		Race Relations Act (c. 71) 182
	ies Act (8 & 9 Eliz. 2, c.		Town and Country Planning
	60)227, 228		Act (c. 72)—
1961	Restriction of Offensive		s. 37(3) 99
	Weapons Act (9 & 10		s. 38
action to the contract of	Eliz. 2, c. 22) 198		Trade Descriptions Act (c.
1962	Town and Country Planning		29)— s. 24
	Act (10 & 11 Eliz. 2, c.	1000	
	38)—	1969	Children and Young Persons
	s. 149(1)		Act (c. 54)— s. 1(1)
1964	(3)		s. 1(1)
1965	Law Commissions Act (c.	1970	
1 3.03	22) 51	1970	Chronically Sick and Dis- abled Persons Act (c.
	s. 3(1)42, 51		44) 45
	Finance Act (c. 25)—		Town and Country Planning
	Sched. 6, para. 24(4) 103		Regulations (London)
	Statutory Orders (Special		Indemnity Act (c. 57) 157
	Procedure) Act (c.	1971	Rolls Royce Purchase Act (c.
	43) 10	1371	9)
	Trade Disputes Act		Misuse of Drugs Act (c.
	(c. 48) 198		38)—
	Murder (Abolition of the		s. 28 229
	Death Penalty) Act (c.		Pensions (Increase) Act (c.
	71)		56)—
	74) 100		s. 8(2)(a) 240
	Southern Rhodesia Act (c.		Industrial Relations Act (c. 72)89, 238
	76) 157		Immigration Act (c. 77) 142
1007	War Damage Act (c. 18)3, 198		s. 2(6)
1967	Misrepresentation Act (c. 7) 230	1972	Road Traffic Act (c. 20) 142, 230
	Parliamentary Commission-	1312	Northern Ireland (Tempor-
	er Act (c. 13)—		ary Provisions) Act (c.
	Sched. 1		22) 114
	s. 10 43		Legal Advice and Assistance
	Sched. 3, Pt. III 43		Act (c. 50)—
	Royal Assent Act (c. 23) 130		s. 11(2) 157
	Sexual Offences Act (c. 60) 131		Town and Country Planning
	Companies Act (c. 81)—		Act (c. 52)—
	s. 67 147		s. 287 147

972	European Communities Act		1976	Rent (Agriculture) Act (c.	
	(c. 68)	119		80)	106
	s. 2(1)21	1, 22	1977	Rent (Agriculture) (Amend-	
	(2)147, 148, 159,	170		ment) Act (c. 17)	106
	(4) 22, 24,			Redundancy Rebates Act (c.	
	s. 3	21		22)	116
	Sched. 2, para. 1(1) 148,			Rent Act (c. 42)	92
	Local Government Act (c.			Criminal Law Act (c. 45)	49
	70)—			Housing (Homeless Persons)	
	s. 239	9		Act (c. 48)—	
	s. 240	10		s. 3(1)	92
973	Guardianship Act (c. 29)—			(2)	92
	Sched. 2, Pt. II	100		s. 12	
	Statute Law (Repeals) Act	100		Pensioners' Payment Act (c.	177
	(c. 39)—			51)	110
		43	1978	Interpretation Act (c. 30)	
	s. 1(1) Sched. 1, Pt. V	43	1970		
		10		Theft Act (c, 31)	49
	Local Government (Scot- land) Act (c. 65)—			Protection of Children Act (c. 37)—	
	s. 82	9		s. I(b)	229
974	Northern Ireland Act			Consumer Safety Act (c. 38)	241
	(c. 28)	47		Scotland Act (c. 51)	119
	Sched. 1, para. 1	164		Wales Act (c. 52)	119
	Health and Safety at Work		1979	Social Security Act (c. 18)	7
	etc. Act (c. 37)—			Charging Orders Act (c. 53)	7
	s. 2	92	1980	Petroleum Revenue Tax Act	
	Consumer Credit Act (c.			(c. 1)	16
	39)—			Bees Act (c. 12)	7
	s. 4	176		National Health Service (In-	
	Sched. 2	103		valid Direction) Act (c.	
	Control of Pollution Act (c.	100		15)	3
	40)	025		Education Act (c. 20)	99
		200		Competition Act (c. 21)—	
	Trade Union and Labour	00		s. 1	91
	Relations Act (c. 52)	89		Companies Act (c. 22)	7
	s. 1(2)	89			,
	Prevention of Terrorism			Licensed Premises (Exclu- sion of Certain Persons)	
	(Temporary Provisions)				920
	Act (c. 55)	55		Act (c. 32)	230
975	Remuneration, Charges and			Licensing (Amendment) Act	100
	Grants Act (c. 57)—			(c. 40)	132
	s. 1	147		Deer Act (c. 49)	132
	Sex Discrimination Act (c.			Criminal Justice (Scotland)	
	65)243,	244		Act (c. 62)	49
	s. 74	229		Local Government Planning	
	(2)(b)	229		and Land Act (c. 65)	7
976	Lotteries and Amusements			Highways Act (c. 66)	45
	Act (c. 32)	230	1981	European Assembly Elec-	
	Finance Act (c. 40)	72	1501	tions Act (c. 8)	7
	Drought Act (c. 44)	55		Matrimonial Homes and	,
		.,,,,		Property Act (c. 24)	139
	Race Relations Act (c. 74)—	220			104
	s. 65			The Transport Act 1962	
	(2)(b)			(Amendment) Act (c.	
	\$ 711	778		32)	1.37

TABLE OF STATUTES

981	Zoo Licensing Act (c. 37) 132	1981	Contempt of Court Act (c.
	Indecent Displays (Control)		49) 49
	Act (c. 42)		Transport Act (c, 56) 83
	222, 223		Employment and Training
	s. 1		Act (c. 57) 238 s. 1 218
	(3)(b) 222		Sched. 1 218
	(6)		Companies Act (c. 62)—
	Disabled Persons Act (c.		s. 39 177
	43)		Wildlife and Countryside Act (c. 69)—
	Act (c. 45) 132		s. 37 103
	Criminal Attempts Act (c.	1982	Local Government (Miscel-
	47) 49		laneous Provisions) Act 222
	Australia	E	UROPEAN ECONOMIC COMMUNITY
1901	Acts Interpretation Act—	1957	E.E.C. Treaty of Rome 167,
	s. 15AA(1) 199		168, 208
1981	Statute Law Revision Act 199		Art. 100 169
			Art. 119 22
	New Zealand		Art. 148 168
1007			Art. 149 168
	Acts Interpretation Act—		Art. 18921, 168, 171
	(s, 5(i)) 199		Art. 191 168

CONTENTS

		page
Ta	face ble of Cases ble of Statutes	vii xi xv
Ĭ.	Preliminary Questions What is legislation? Who legislates? Restrictions on the legislature	1 1 11 18
2.	Institutional Arrangements for the Preparation of Legislation The preparation and implementation of the legislative programme The condition of the statute book Law reform	25 25 36 48
3.	The Pre-Parliamentary Stages The role of government The role of outside groups The preparation of proposals The role of Parliament Conclusion	53 54 56 59 72 77
4.	The Preparation of a Bill Expectations and responsibilities The drafting process Scrutiny of drafting	78 78 83 104
5.	The Parliamentary Stages "The demands of the government" "The rights of the minority" Public Bill procedure Conclusion	107 107 111 113 136
6.	Legislation without Legislatures Subordinate or delegated legislation Community legislation	140 141 167

Contents

7. Interpretation	176
Interpretation and application	176
The significance of judicial interpretation	178
The constitutional theory of judicial interpretation	180
The characteristic forms of argument in interpretation	183
Reform of judicial interpretation	196
The Impact of Legislation	
The impact and the efficacy of legislation	212
Principal variables influencing the impact of legislation	220
Appendix: The Interpretation of Legislation Bill 1981	245
Index of Books and Articles	247
Index	257

CHAPTER ONE

PRELIMINARY QUESTIONS

This book is primarily about the making, interpretation and impact of legislation applicable in the United Kingdom. In this introductory chapter we examine four preliminary questions. First, what is legislation, how may it be defined and what forms does it assume; secondly, who makes it; thirdly, why is it necessary; and finally, what legal, as opposed to political or conventional, restrictions, if any, are there on those making it?

WHAT IS LEGISLATION?

DEFINITION AND FORMS

The expression "legislation" is commonly used in at least two senses. First, the expression is used to convey something of the nature of the activity involved: its use denotes the enactment of rules of law or the process of deliberate law-making or law changing. As we shall see not all legislation lays down rules, but this normally constitutes its dominant and explicit purpose. In this respect legislation differs from, for example, adjudication, the primary function of which is the settlement of disputes in accordance with pre-existing rules. To the extent that judges do make law, for example where there is no appropriate rule available, they do so only interstitially within the context of the discharge of their primary function.

The second and more obvious sense in which the expression "legislation" is used is to denote the results or products of the legislative process under discussion; in this sense it may be coterminous with Acts of Parliament in the case of the United Kingdom; Regulations, Directives and Decisions in the case of the European Economic Community and so on. Once again we may distinguish these results or decisions from other decisions including judicial decisions. There are several points of contrast here. To the extent that legislation serves as a mechanism for the settlement of disputes or the resolution of conflicts it frequently embodies compromises and trade-offs between the conflicting interests. Judicial decisions, on the other hand, normally favour one party. In

legislative acts the words used are themselves the formulation of the rule; legislative rules are "rules in fixed verbal form." In judicial decisions, on the other hand, the words used by the judge in stating the basis for his decision are treated as only one possible formulation or approximation of the rule, and the rule itself may be recast or reformulated for the purpose of subsequent decisions. However, we regard the most important contrast between legislative and judicial decisions as being the prospective and general qualities of legislative decisions. Legislative decisions normally look to the future and to abstractly defined categories of persons and events. By contrast judicial decisions are retrospective and specific. They are directed in the first place to the past relations and conduct of the parties and to the determination of the dispute between them.

As used in these two senses the expression presupposes a fairly high degree of political and legal differentiation. At a minimum it implies first, as we have suggested, a distinction between general rules which are intended to govern human conduct in an indeterminate number of future instances and individual rules or commands which are intended to apply in a specific instance or a limited number of instances only. Secondly, it implies the existence of some person or agency, the legislature, which is equipped and authorised to promulgate such general rules.² Let us examine each of these implications more fully.

Generality is frequently treated as being the hallmark of legislation. Under the EEC Treaty a distinction must be drawn between legislative acts whose validity can be impugned only in severely limited circumstances, and administrative or executive acts whose validity can be challenged more freely. In distinguishing these two categories of acts the European Court has stressed the general and abstract character of legislative acts. "... a regulation, being essentially of a legislative nature, is applicable not to a limited number of persons, defined or identifiable, but to categories of persons viewed abstractly and in their entirety ... a measure which is applicable to objectively determined situations and which involves immediate legal consequences in all Member States for categories of persons viewed in a general and abstract manner cannot be considered as constituting a decision." Some writers have gone so far as to insist that legislation must be general and not particular in

Twinning and Miers, How To Do Things With Rules (2nd ed., 1982), pp. 143–144.
 Akzin, "Legislation: Nature and Functions", in International Encyclopaedia of Social Sciences (Sills ed., 1968), Vol. 9, p. 221.

³ Cases 16, 17, 19–22/62, Confédération nationale des producteurs de fruits et légumes v. Council [1962] E.C.R. 471, 478–479.