

**SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY**  
**Law and Procedure in Federal Court**

**2011 EDITION**

**CAROLYN A. KUBITSCHKEK**  
**JON C. DUBIN**

**WEST®**

# SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY

---

Law and Procedure in Federal Court

**Carolyn A. Kubitschek**

Lansner Kubitschek Schaffer & Zuccardy  
New York, New York

**Jon C. Dubin**

Professor of Law  
Alfred C. Clapp Public Service Scholar and Associate  
Dean for Clinical Education, Rutgers School of  
Law—Newark

**2011 Edition**

**WEST®**

A Thomson Reuters business

*For Customer Assistance Call 1-800-328-4880*

Mat #41012210

© 2011 Thomson Reuters/West

For authorization to photocopy, please contact the **Copyright Clearance Center** at 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (978) 750-8400; fax (978) 646-8600 or **West's Copyright Services** at 610 Opperman Drive, Eagan, MN 55123, fax (651) 687-7551. Please outline the specific material involved, the number of copies you wish to distribute and the purpose or format of the use.

This publication was created to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered; however, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. The publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

ISBN 978-0-314-93824-4

## About the Authors

Carolyn A. Kubitschek is a partner in the law firm of Lansner Kubitschek Schaffer & Zuccardy in New York City, which concentrates on Social Security and federal practice. She is also an adjunct professor at Cardozo Law School. Ms. Kubitschek started one of the first Social Security disability projects in a federally-funded legal services program, and previously was on the faculty at Hofstra University School of Law. She has lectured and written extensively on the subject of Social Security disability law and practice. Ms. Kubitschek's writings have appeared in *Trial Magazine*, *The New York Law Journal*, *The Pittsburgh Law Review*, *The Arizona Law Review* and *Am Jur Trials*. She received her B.A. degree from Oberlin College and her law degree from the University of Chicago.

Jon C. Dubin is a Professor of Law, the Alfred C. Clapp Public Service Scholar, and Associate Dean for Clinical Education at Rutgers School of Law in Newark, New Jersey. Professor Dubin has run law school clinical projects handling Social Security and SSI disability cases at both Rutgers—Newark and St. Mary's Law School in San Antonio, Texas. He also supervised and handled disability cases as a staff attorney and director of litigation at the Harlem Neighborhood Office of the Legal Aid Society, Civil Division. Professor Dubin has written and lectured extensively on Social Security disability law and practice among other topics. His writings have appeared in the *Columbia Law Review*, *Minnesota Law Review*, *Hastings Law Journal*, and the *Administrative Law Review*, and have been cited by several federal courts including the United States Supreme Court and multiple Courts of Appeal. Professor Dubin served as co-counsel and principal author of the Petitioner's main brief in *Sims v. Apfel*, 530 U.S. 103 (2000). He received his A.B. degree from Dartmouth College and his J.D. from New York University School of Law.

**Publisher**

Jean E. Maess, J.D.

**Team Coordinator**

Glenn A. Guarino, J.D.

Lynn W. Kowalczyk

**Publication Editors**

Hilary A. Homer, J.D.

Natalie Macquire

**Editorial Support**

Kelly D. Cooper, J.D.

Kara A. Hiller, J.D.

Wendy S. Sigillo, J.D.

Frank Wozniak, J.D.

Elizabeth J. Yockel, J.D.

# **Summary of Contents**

- Chapter 1. In General
- Chapter 2. Establishing Disability Generally
- Chapter 3. The Sequential Evaluation of Disability
- Chapter 4. Evaluation of Pain and Other Symptoms
- Chapter 5. Evaluation of Particular Impairments
- Chapter 6. Administrative Proceedings
- Chapter 7. Availability of Judicial Review
- Chapter 8. Substantial Evidence Standard of Review
- Chapter 9. District Court Practice
- Chapter 10. Attorney's Fees
- Chapter 11. Appeals

**Table of Laws and Rules**

**Table of Cases**

**Index**

# **Table of Contents**

## **CHAPTER 1. IN GENERAL**

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

- § 1:1 Explosion of litigation in federal court

### **II. DECIDING WHEN TO FILE A CIVIL ACTION IN FEDERAL COURT**

- § 1:2 Generally
- § 1:3 Strategic factors—Likelihood of success
- § 1:4 —Determinative factors
- § 1:5 — —Type of claim
- § 1:6 — —Procedural posture
- § 1:7 — —Assessment of current record
- § 1:8 Substantial evidence
- § 1:9 Errors of law
- § 1:10 Strengthening the record
- § 1:11 Effects of not filing a civil action
- § 1:12 Amount at stake
- § 1:13 Deciding whether to defend

### **III. SOURCES OF LAW**

- § 1:14 Introduction
- § 1:15 Statutory law
- § 1:16 Social Security regulations
- § 1:17 Social Security Rulings
- § 1:18 Hearings, Appeals, and Litigation Manual (“HALLEX”)
- § 1:19 Program Operations Manual System (POMS)
- § 1:20 Case law
- § 1:21 Unpublished decisions

### **IV. NONACQUIESCENCE**

- § 1:22 Generally
- § 1:23 Definition of nonacquiescence
- § 1:24 Legality of nonacquiescence

## SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY LAW AND PROCEDURE

- § 1:25 Effects of nonacquiescence
- § 1:26 History of nonacquiescence
- § 1:27 Relevance of nonacquiescence to advocates in federal court

## **CHAPTER 2. ESTABLISHING DISABILITY GENERALLY**

### **I. DEFINITION OF DISABILITY**

- § 2:1 Introduction
- § 2:2 Determining disability from evidence of daily functioning
- § 2:3 Refuting disability from evidence of daily functioning
- § 2:4 Sporadic or cyclical impairments
- § 2:5 Remediable impairments—Claimant's obligation to follow prescribed treatment
- § 2:6 Duration—Temporary impairments
- § 2:7 Trial work period

### **II. BURDEN OF PROOF**

- § 2:8 Overview
- § 2:9 Claimant's burden of proof
- § 2:10 Social Security Administration's burden of proof
- § 2:11 Claimant's last burden of proof
- § 2:12 Improper allocation of the burden of proof
- § 2:13 Failure to satisfy burden of proof
- § 2:14 Termination of benefits cases

### **III. ELIGIBILITY ISSUES OTHER THAN DISABILITY**

- § 2:15 Introduction
- § 2:16 Social Security Disability Insurance benefits
- § 2:17 Insured status
- § 2:18 Disabled widows and widowers
- § 2:19 Current disability standards for widows and widowers
- § 2:20 Disabled sons and daughters
- § 2:21 Supplemental Security Income (SSI)

### **IV. MEDICAL EVIDENCE**

- § 2:22 Overview
- § 2:23 What constitutes medical evidence



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 2:24	Medical records
§ 2:25	Medical reports and medical opinions
§ 2:26	Treating physicians
§ 2:27	Consulting physician
§ 2:28	Review physicians
§ 2:29	Medical advisors
§ 2:30	Weighing medical evidence
§ 2:31	First Circuit
§ 2:32	Second Circuit
§ 2:33	Third Circuit
§ 2:34	Fourth Circuit
§ 2:35	Fifth Circuit
§ 2:36	Sixth Circuit
§ 2:37	Seventh Circuit
§ 2:38	Eighth Circuit
§ 2:39	Ninth Circuit
§ 2:40	Tenth Circuit
§ 2:41	Eleventh Circuit
§ 2:42	District of Columbia Circuit
§ 2:43	Subsequent evidence
§ 2:44	Reports based upon contemporaneous evidence
§ 2:45	Retrospective diagnosis

## **V. RELATIONSHIP TO OTHER GOVERNMENT PROGRAMS**

§ 2:46	Unemployment compensation programs
§ 2:47	Generally

## **CHAPTER 3. THE SEQUENTIAL EVALUATION OF DISABILITY**

### **I. IN GENERAL**

§ 3:1	Generally
§ 3:2	Litigation on the sequential evaluation process

### **II. SUBSTANTIAL GAINFUL ACTIVITY**

§ 3:3	Generally
§ 3:4	Definitions
§ 3:5	Relationship to Congressional purpose
§ 3:6	Determining whether a claimant has engaged in substantial gainful activity

## SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY LAW AND PROCEDURE

- § 3:7 Amount of earnings
- § 3:8 Sporadic or transitory work
- § 3:9 Unsuccessful work attempts
- § 3:10 Part-time work
- § 3:11 Self-employment
- § 3:12 Special working conditions
- § 3:13 Sheltered workshops

### III. SEVERITY

- § 3:14 Severity
- § 3:15 History of the severity regulation
- § 3:16 Combinations of impairments
- § 3:17 Examples of non-severe impairments

### IV. LISTINGS OF IMPAIRMENTS AND MEDICAL EQUIVALENCE

- § 3:18 Overview
- § 3:19 Definitions of the Listings
- § 3:20 Application of the Listings
- § 3:21 Advantages of meeting the Listings
- § 3:22 Specific obligations of ALJs with respect to the Listings
- § 3:23 Interpretation of the Listings
- § 3:24 Judicial review of Listings determinations
- § 3:25 Failure to meet the Listings
- § 3:26 Medical equivalence
- § 3:27 Definition of medical equivalence
- § 3:28 Evaluating medical equivalence
- § 3:29 Factors to consider in determining equivalence
- § 3:30 Specific forms of equivalence
- § 3:31 Multiple impairments
- § 3:32 Obligations of the ALJ with respect to equivalence
- § 3:33 Failure to equal the Listings

### V. PAST RELEVANT WORK AND OTHER WORK

#### A. IN GENERAL

- § 3:34 Generally
- § 3:35 Definition of past relevant work
- § 3:36 —Remoteness in time
- § 3:37 —Substantial gainful activity

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 3:38 —Job characteristics
- § 3:39 Determining ability to return to past relevant work
- § 3:40 Arduous physical labor
- § 3:41 Other work in the national economy
- § 3:42 —Factors which must be considered
- § 3:43 ALJ obligations in determining whether the claimant can perform another job

### B. RESIDUAL FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY

- § 3:44 Generally
- § 3:45 Definitions
- § 3:46 Categories of residual functional capacity
- § 3:47 Evaluating residual functional capacity
- § 3:48 Evidence as to residual functional capacity
- § 3:49 Residual functional capacity—No work
- § 3:50 —Less than full range of sedentary work
- § 3:51 Sporadic work
- § 3:52 Sedentary work
- § 3:53 Light work
- § 3:54 Medium work
- § 3:55 Heavy work
- § 3:56 Non-exertional impairments
- § 3:57 Particular types of significant non-exertional impairments
- § 3:58 Particular types of insignificant non-exertional impairments
- § 3:59 Inability to travel
- § 3:60 Use of residual functional capacity determination

### C. VOCATIONAL FACTORS: AGE, EDUCATION AND JOB SKILLS

- § 3:61 Generally
- § 3:62 Age
- § 3:63 Establishing age
- § 3:64 Establishing adaptability based upon age
- § 3:65 Education
- § 3:66 Categories of educational attainment
- § 3:67 Measuring educational level
- § 3:68 Judicial interpretation of the education regulations
- § 3:69 Recent education
- § 3:70 Job skills
- § 3:71 Definition of skilled and semiskilled work

## SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY LAW AND PROCEDURE

- § 3:72 Distinction between skills and aptitudes
- § 3:73 Transferability
- § 3:74 Proving transferability and lack of transferability
- § 3:75 Particular skills which are transferable
- § 3:76 Particular qualities which are not transferable skills
- § 3:77 Use of vocational data

### D. MEDICAL-VOCATIONAL GUIDELINES (THE "GRIDS")

- § 3:78 Introduction
- § 3:79 Explanation of Grids
- § 3:80 When the Grids apply
- § 3:81 Judicial powers when Grids apply
- § 3:82 Inapplicability of Grids
- § 3:83 —Impairments that do not match Grid categories
- § 3:84 —Inability to do full range of sedentary or light work
- § 3:85 —Non-exertional impairments/limitations
- § 3:86 —Pain
- § 3:87 —Borderline age
- § 3:88 What criteria apply when Grids do not apply

### E. VOCATIONAL EVIDENCE

- § 3:89 Overview
- § 3:90 When vocational evidence is not necessary—Claimant cannot engage in substantial gainful activity
- § 3:91 —Grids apply
- § 3:92 When vocational evidence is necessary
- § 3:93 Documentary evidence
- § 3:94 When a vocational expert must testify
- § 3:95 Purpose of vocational expert testimony
- § 3:96 Content of vocational expert's testimony
- § 3:97 —Job characteristics
- § 3:98 —Transferability of skills
- § 3:99 Who may question a vocational expert
- § 3:100 Form of vocational expert testimony
- § 3:101 Form of questions to vocational experts
- § 3:102 Weighing vocational expert testimony favorable to claimant
- § 3:103 Weight of vocational expert testimony unfavorable to claimant
- § 3:104 Conflict between DOT and vocational testimony

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 3:105 Where agency has sustained burden of proving existence of other jobs
- § 3:106 Evaluating testimony of vocational expert
- § 3:107 Claimants' vocational experts
- § 3:108 Weighing conflicting testimony

## CHAPTER 4. EVALUATION OF PAIN AND OTHER SYMPTOMS

- § 4:1 Generally
- § 4:2 The pain regulation
- § 4:3 The laws of the circuits regarding pain
- § 4:4 Eighth Circuit
- § 4:5 Fourth Circuit
- § 4:6 Ninth Circuit
- § 4:7 Tenth Circuit
- § 4:8 Eleventh Circuit
- § 4:9 Sixth Circuit
- § 4:10 Seventh Circuit
- § 4:11 Fifth Circuit
- § 4:12 Second Circuit
- § 4:13 First Circuit
- § 4:14 Third Circuit
- § 4:15 District of Columbia Circuit
- § 4:16 History of law of pain
- § 4:17 Implementing the law of pain: Medically determinable impairment
- § 4:18 Evidence of pain—Medication
- § 4:19 —Treatment other than medication
- § 4:20 —Daily activities
- § 4:21 Pain which is supported by medical evidence
- § 4:22 "Excess" pain
- § 4:23 Evidence of pain—Work history
- § 4:24 —Physiological factors
- § 4:25 ALJ duties in pain cases

## CHAPTER 5. EVALUATION OF PARTICULAR IMPAIRMENTS

### I. CARDIOVASCULAR IMPAIRMENTS

- § 5:1 Introduction
- § 5:2 Categories of heart disease, in general

## SOCIAL SECURITY DISABILITY LAW AND PROCEDURE

- § 5:3 Functional and therapeutic classifications of heart disease
- § 5:4 Categories of heart disease—Ischemia
- § 5:5 Pain of ischemia
- § 5:6 Effect of ischemic heart disease and its treatment on ability to function
- § 5:7 Categories of heart disease—Congestive heart failure (chronic heart failure)
- § 5:8 Other types of heart disease
- § 5:9 Measuring ischemia—Cardiac catheterization
- § 5:10 —Electrocardiograms
- § 5:11 Measuring chronic heart failure
- § 5:12 Treadmill test
- § 5:13 Limitations of treadmill test
- § 5:14 Categories of impairments—Arrhythmias
- § 5:15 Measuring disability based on aneurysm
- § 5:16 Hypertension
- § 5:17 Stress
- § 5:18 Side effects of medication

## II. MENTAL ILLNESS

### A. IN GENERAL

- § 5:19 Introduction
- § 5:20 Basic mental demands of work
- § 5:21 History of the law of mental illness impairments
- § 5:22 Mental illness listings
- § 5:23 Various types of mental illness—Organic mental disorders
  - § 5:24 —Psychotic disorders
  - § 5:25 —Affective disorders
  - § 5:26 —Mental retardation
  - § 5:27 —Anxiety-related disorders
  - § 5:28 —Somatoform disorders
  - § 5:29 —Personality disorders
- § 5:30 Functional criteria of mental disability
- § 5:31 Cyclical illness
- § 5:32 Claimants who do not meet the Listings
- § 5:33 Stress
- § 5:34 Side effects of medication
- § 5:35 Sources of evidence
- § 5:36 Particular evidence
- § 5:37 ALJs' obligations

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 5:38 Evaluation of mental illness claims
- § 5:39 Onset of disability

### B. MENTAL RETARDATION AND DEMENTIA

- § 5:40 Generally
- § 5:41 Causes of mental retardation
- § 5:42 Measuring mental retardation; IQ tests
- § 5:43 Duration of mental retardation
- § 5:44 Effect of low IQ on ability to function
- § 5:45 Severity
- § 5:46 Listings of impairments
- § 5:47 "Significant work related limitations"
- § 5:48 Other specific impairments establishing disability for claimants with IQs between 60 and 70
- § 5:49 Medical equivalence
- § 5:50 Final steps of sequential evaluation
- § 5:51 Organic mental disorders; dementia

### C. SUBSTANCE ABUSE

- § 5:52 Generally
- § 5:53 Retroactive effect of the statute
- § 5:54 Evaluating disability in claimants with drug and alcohol problems
- § 5:55 Burden of proving materiality

## III. MUSCULOSKELETAL IMPAIRMENTS

- § 5:56 Overview
- § 5:57 Amputation or paralysis
- § 5:58 Osteoarthritis
- § 5:59 Medical evidence
- § 5:60 Listings of impairments—§ 1.02 and 1.03
- § 5:61 —§ 1.04
- § 5:62 Pain

## IV. RESPIRATORY IMPAIRMENTS

- § 5:63 Generally
- § 5:64 Pulmonary function testing
- § 5:65 Listings—Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
- § 5:66 —Asthma
- § 5:67 Bases for disability when claimants do not meet Listings
- § 5:68 Non-exertional limitations caused by respiratory disease

- § 5:69 Remediability of impairments

## **V. IMMUNE SYSTEM DISORDERS**

- § 5:70 Introduction
- § 5:71 Fibromyalgia, generally
- § 5:72 Medical evidence of fibromyalgia
- § 5:73 Credibility issues
- § 5:74 Chronic Fatigue Syndrome overview
- § 5:75 Evaluating Chronic Fatigue Syndrome

## **CHAPTER 6. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDINGS**

### **I. THE OBLIGATIONS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE AND ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS**

- § 6:1 Introduction
- § 6:2 Right to hearing
- § 6:3 Impartial finders of fact
- § 6:4 Confrontation
- § 6:5 Cross-examination
- § 6:6 Notice
- § 6:7 Counsel
- § 6:8 Obligation to conduct full and fair inquiry
- § 6:9 ALJ's obligation to obtain medical evidence
- § 6:10 Evidence as to impairments which claimant does not allege
- § 6:11 Calling a medical expert
- § 6:12 Ordering consultative examination
- § 6:13 Post-hearing reports
- § 6:14 Opportunity to testify fully
- § 6:15 Residual functional capacity
- § 6:16 Past relevant work
- § 6:17 Assist pro se claimants in conducting hearing
- § 6:18 Testimony of lay witnesses
- § 6:19 ALJ's obligations in reaching and writing decision
- § 6:20 Explanation of ALJ's assessment of evidence
- § 6:21 Evidence regarding Listings
- § 6:22 Impairments in combination
- § 6:23 Evidence regarding residual functional capacity
- § 6:24 Substitution of own opinion for that of physician



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- § 6:25 Evidence regarding claimant's past work
- § 6:26 Evidence regarding other jobs
- § 6:27 Vocational evidence
- § 6:28 Credibility findings
- § 6:29 Specific factors affecting credibility—Medical evidence
- § 6:30 —Demeanor
- § 6:31 —Work history
- § 6:32 —Other factors
- § 6:33 Testimony of lay witnesses—Weighing testimony

## III. APPEALS COUNCIL REVIEW

- § 6:34 Introduction
- § 6:35 Who may request Appeals Council review
- § 6:36 Time limits for requesting review
- § 6:37 Dispositional options available to the Appeals Council
- § 6:38 Dispositional options when Appeals Council grants review
- § 6:39 Obligations of Appeals Council upon review
- § 6:40 Review powers of Appeals Council
- § 6:41 Limits on Appeals Council review powers
- § 6:42 Appeals Council reversal of favorable ALJ credibility findings
- § 6:43 Judicial review of Appeals Council decisions reversing favorable ALJ decisions
- § 6:44 Special obligations after federal court remand

## IV. REOPENING CASES

- § 6:45 Generally
- § 6:46 Who may reopen
- § 6:47 Reopening procedure
- § 6:48 Judicial review of reopening
- § 6:49 Reopening because of constitutional violations
- § 6:50 No constitutional violation found
- § 6:51 Implicit reopening by agency
- § 6:52 No implicit reopening
- § 6:53 Statutorily mandated reopening

## CHAPTER 7. AVAILABILITY OF JUDICIAL REVIEW

### I. JURISDICTION

- § 7:1 Overview