



ALEXANDER GILLESPIE
**INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL
LAW, POLICY, AND ETHICS**
SECOND EDITION



OXFORD

International Environmental Law, Policy, and Ethics

Second Edition

ALEXANDER GILLESPIE



OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Alexander Gillespie 2014

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 1997

Second Edition published in 2014

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014938494

ISBN 978-0-19-871345-6

Printed and bound by

CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

In the relations of man with the animals, with the flowers, with the objects of creation, there is a great ethic, scarcely perceived as yet, which will at length break forth into the light and which will be the corollary and compliment to human ethics.

Victor Hugo (1802–1885)
En voyage, Alpes et Pyrénées, 1867

List of Abbreviations

ACCOBAMS	Agreement on the Conservation of Cetaceans in the Black Sea and Mediterranean
ASCOBANS	Agreement on the Conservation of Small Cetaceans of the Baltic, North East Atlantic, Irish and North Seas
CAFF	Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Flora and Fauna
CMS	Convention on Migratory Species
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organisation
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
IWC	International Whaling Commission
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OIE	World Organisation for Animal Health
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNPF	United Nations Population Fund
WSSD	World Summit on Sustainable Development
WWF	World Wildlife Fund

Table of Cases

UNITED STATES

TVA v Hill 437 US 153, 187 (1978).....	42
Ness v Albert 665 S.W.2d 1 (1983).....	76

Table of Legislation

UNITED STATES STATUTES

Bald Eagle Protection Act of 1940, 16 USC § 668-668d	83
Chimpanzee Health Improvement, Maintenance and Protection Act of 2000, Pub. L. 106-551.....	125
Endangered Species Act of 1973, 16 USC § 1531(b).....	42
National Parks Service Organic Act of 1916, 16 USC § 1	101
Wild and Free-Roaming Horses and Burros Act of 1971, 16 USC § 1331-40.....	83
Wilderness Act of 1964, 16 USC § 1131-6.....	18

UNITED KINGDOM STATUTES

Cruelties to Animals Act 1876, s 3(1).....	123
--	-----

NEW ZEALAND STATUTES

Conservation Act 1987.....	127
----------------------------	-----

Environment Act 1986.....	127
Resource Management Act 1991	127

EUROPEAN DIRECTIVES

Council Directive 83/129/EEC of 28 March 1983 concerning the importation into Member States of skins of certain seal pups and products derived therefrom.....	71
Council Directive 86/609/EEC on the protection of animals used for experimental purpose.....	124
Council Directive 89/370/EEC of 8 June 1989 amending Directive 83/129/EEC concerning the importation into Member States of skins of certain seal pups and products derived therefrom	71
Council Directive 92/43/EEC of 21 May 1992 on the conservation of natural habitats and of wild fauna and flora.....	121

Table of Instruments

<p>African Convention on Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources 2003</p> <p>Art 9(3) 121</p> <p>Art XII (1)(c) 73</p> <p>Annex III 121</p> <p>African Convention on the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources 1968. 73</p> <p>Art 2 11</p> <p>Agenda 21 (1992)</p> <p>s 4.4 38</p> <p>s 8.28 38</p> <p>s 8.31 38</p> <p>s 8.37 38</p> <p>s 11.14 53</p> <p>s 11.20 38</p> <p>s 11.21 38</p> <p>s 11.23 38</p> <p>s 12.22 38</p> <p>s 14.54 139</p> <p>s 14.55 139</p> <p>s 30.9 38</p> <p>s 31.1 124</p> <p>s 31.8 128</p> <p>s 31.9 124</p> <p>Ch 26 88</p> <p>Ch 5, para 5.50 65</p> <p>Ch 19, para 19.21(b) 124</p> <p>Agreement Between the Government of Canada and the Government of the United States on the Conservation of the Porcupine Caribou Herd 1987</p> <p>Preamble 88</p> <p>Agreement Concerning the Creation of a Marine Mammal Sanctuary in the Mediterranean</p> <p>Art 7 125</p> <p>Agreement on Conservation of Polar Bears 1973</p> <p>Art II 134</p> <p>Agreement on Humane Trapping Standards 121</p> <p>Agreement on Migratory Birds Between Australia and China 1986</p> <p>Art II(1) 88</p> <p>Agreement on Migratory Birds Between Australia and Japan 1974</p> <p>Art II(1)(d) 88</p>	<p>Agreement on Migratory Birds Between Australia and the Republic of Korea 2007</p> <p>Art 2(d) 88</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of African-Eurasian Migratory Waterbirds 1995. 88</p> <p>Preamble, para 4 39, 73</p> <p>Art II 135</p> <p>Art III 135</p> <p>Annex 3 121</p> <p>Action Plan 2.1.1 121</p> <p>points 4.1.5 121</p> <p>4.1.8 121</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Albatross and Petrels 121</p> <p>Art II.1 135</p> <p>Art III.2 88</p> <p>Art III.5 121–2</p> <p>Action Plan 1.4.2 121–2</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Cetaceans in the Black Sea and Mediterranean</p> <p>Art II.1 135</p> <p>Art II.2 125</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Gorillas and Their Habitat 2007</p> <p>Preamble 119</p> <p>para 3 86</p> <p>para 9 39</p> <p>Art II 134</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Polar Bears 1973 88</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Seals in the Wadden Sea 1990</p> <p>Preamble 21</p> <p>Art III 135</p> <p>Art VI.2 121, 125</p> <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Small Cetaceans of the Baltic, North East Atlantic, Irish and North Seas</p> <p>Preamble 135</p> <p>Art 2.1 135</p> <p>'Action Plan', Pt 2 125</p> <p>(2003) Resolution 4.8 125</p> <p>Agreement on the International Dolphin Conservation Program 1998</p> <p>Art 5(b) 120</p> <p>Annex VIII 3.d 120</p>
---	--

Agreement Relating to the Conservation and Management of Straddling Fish Stocks and Highly Migratory Fish Stocks 1995	
Art 2	134
Art 5(d)	139
Alpine Convention	75
Antarctic Protocol on Environmental Protection 1991	73
Apia Convention 1976	87
ASEAN Agreement on the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources	
Art 5	134
Bergen Ministerial Declaration on Sustainable Development 1990	
point 6(c)	43
Bern Convention <i>see</i> Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats	
Bilateral Agreement Between the United States and Russia for Polar Bears of the Chukchi Sea Population 2001	88
Biosafety Protocol	
Art 3(h)	131
Bonn Convention <i>see</i> Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species	
Charter for African Unity 1963	102
Charter of Economic Rights and Duties of States 1974	
Art 30	102
Convention for the Protection of Migratory Birds in Canada and the United States 1916	
Preamble	134
Art II(1)	88
Art II(3)	88
Art IV	134
Convention Between the United States, United Kingdom and Russia for the Preservation and Protection of Fur Seals 1911	
Art IV	88
Convention Concerning the Conservation of Migratory Birds and their Environment	73
Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage	39, 73, 75, 85, 139
Preamble	85
Article 2	74
Art 4	85, 102
Convention Designed to Ensure the Conservation of Various Species of Wild Animals in Africa 1900	120
Art 16	121
Annex VI	121
Convention for Co-operation in the Protection of the Marine and Coastal Environment of the West and Central African Regions	
Art 11	134
Convention for the Conservation of Antarctic Seals	121
Art 3.1	121
Annex, s 7	121
Convention for the Conservation of North Pacific Fur Seals 1976	121
Convention for the Preservation of Wild Animals, Birds and Fish in Africa 1900	
Schedule I	133
Convention for the Protection of Birds Useful to Agriculture 1902	37
Convention for the Protection of Natural Resources and the Environment of the South Pacific Region 1986	
Preamble	37, 86
Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment and Coastal Area of the South East Pacific 1981	
Preamble	86
Convention for the Protection, Management and Development of the Marine and Coastal Environment of the Eastern African Region	
Preamble	37
Convention for the Regulation of Whaling 1931	
Art 4	134
Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage 2003	85
Convention on Biological Diversity 1992	29, 53, 87, 103, 120
Preamble	73
para 1	128
para 3	135
Art 1	135
Art 4	135
Art 5	135
Art 8(j)	139
Art 11	39
(1998) Decision III/18	39
(2000) Decision V/3	39
V/5, para 5	20
V/15	39
(2002) Decision IV/10	39
6.21	132
(2004) Decision VII/9	39
(2008) Decision IX/6	39
IX/7	140–1
Principle 5	140

Principle 6	140	6.b	119–20
Principle 9	141	Art VIII	
Principle 10	141	3.	119–20
IX/11, para 2	39	Resolution	
(2009) Decision IX/1, para 1	20	3:16	119–20
(2010) Decision X/2	21, 39	4:21	119–20
X/2, Target 6	134	5:18	119–20
X/44	39	9:23	119–20
Decisions		10:20	119–20
I/8	139	10:21	119–20
II/9	139	Decision	
II/10	139	12:85	119–20
III/12	139	13:88	119–20
IV/4	139	14:58	119–20
IV/5	139	14:59	119–20
IV/6	139	Convention on Migratory Birds Between	
IV/7	139	the United States and Japan 1972	
IV/1	139	Art III(1)(e)	88
VI/5	139	Convention on Migratory Birds Between the	
VI/7	139	United States and USSR 1976	
IV/10	139	Art II(c)	88
IV/10	139	Convention on Nature Protection and	
VI/8	139	Wildlife Preservation in the Western	
VI/9	139	Hemisphere 1940	73, 86
VI/10	139	Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic	
VI/23	139	Marine Living Resources	12
VI/25	139	Convention on the Conservation of	
Convention on Birds Useful to Agriculture		European Wildlife and Natural	
1902		Habits 1979	73, 139
Art VII	124	Preamble	21, 73, 127, 133
Convention on Conservation of Nature		Art 2	133
in the South Pacific 1976	73	Art 3(1)	133
Preamble	73	Convention on the Conservation of	
Art 1	21	Migratory Species of Wild	
Art 2	73, 134	Animals	39, 73, 125, 139
Convention on Fishing and Conservation		Preamble	21, 86, 102, 127
of the Living Resources of the High		paras 1–3	134
Seas 1958		Art II	134
Preamble	134	Convention on the Conservation of Wildlife	
Art 1	134	in Africa 1900	
Convention on International Trade in		Preamble	11
Endangered Species of Fauna and		Convention on the Elimination of All	
Flora 1973	39, 71, 73	Kinds of Discrimination Against	
Preamble	21, 85, 102	Women 1979	
para 1	134	Art 10	64
Art II	134	Art 12	64
Art III		Art 14	64
2.c	119–20	Convention on the Protection and Promotion	
4.b	119–20	of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions	
5.c	119–20	2005	87
Art IV		Art 1	85
2.c	119–20	Art 2(6)	83, 85
5.b	119–20	Art 4	82

Convention on Wetlands of International Importance 1971	40	European Charter on Hunting and Biodiversity	
Preamble	21, 39, 86, 139	Principle 10	120
(1980) Resolution 1.6	40	European Convention for the Protection of Animals During International Transport	
(1984) Resolution 2.3	40	Preamble	120
(1996) Resolution 6.10	40	Art 2	120
(1999) Resolution 7.15	40	European Convention for the Protection of Pet Animals 1987	
(1999) Resolution 7.16	40	Preamble	116
(2002) Resolution 8.23	40	European Landscape Convention 2004	
(2002) Resolution 8.25	40	Art 1	75
(2002) Resolution 8.34	40	Global Strategy for the Survival of Great Apes and their Habitat 2005	
(2002) Resolution 8.40	40	Para 2.....	134
Convention Relative to the Preservation of Fauna and Flora in their Natural State (in Africa) 1933	73	Annex, para 10-12	119
Art 2	73	para 13.....	21
Convention Respecting Measures for the Preservation and Protection of the Fur Seals in the North Pacific Ocean 1911.....	134	Gothenburg Protocol to Abate Acidification, Eutrophication and Ground Level Ozone 1999	
Declaration and Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development 1995		Art 8	34
para 26(b)	104	Art 8(k)	34
Declaration for the Protection of Birds Useful to Agriculture 1875.....	121	Art 6(g)	34
Declaration of Fontainebleau 1986	128	Great Bustard Memorandum of Understanding	
Declaration of the Council of European Communities on the Program of Action of the European Community on the Environment 1973		point 10.....	21
Pt 1, Introduction	11	Inter-American Convention for the Protection and Conservation of Sea Turtles 1996	
Ch 9.....	34	Art IV(3)	88
Annex, Pt II.....	34	Art IV2h	120
Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment 1972.....	12, 85	Interim Convention on the Conservation of North Pacific Fur Seals 1957	121
Ch 1, para 7.....	11	Art V(2)(d).....	88
Recommendation 38	138	Art VII.....	88
Declaration of the World National Parks Congress 1983		Art IX (3)	121
Preamble	53	International Conference on Population and Development 1994, Action Plan, Principle 8	
Declaration on Future Generations 1997.....	105	para 7.2	65
Declaration on the Responsibilities of the Present Generations Towards Future Generations 2007.....	104	para 7.3	65
Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples 2007	87	para 7.6	65
Draft Program of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island States, 1994		para 7.9	65
Preamble, para 1.....	104	para 8.25	65
para 56.....	12	International Convention for the Conservation of Atlantic Tuna	
		Art 8	13
		International Convention for the High Seas Fisheries of the North Pacific Ocean	
		Preamble	13
		International Convention for the Protection of Birds 1950	
		Art 5	121

International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling 1946	
Preamble	13, 47
para 1	13
para 2	102
Art V(2)	47
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1976	
Art 27	85
International Plan of Action for Reducing Incidental Catch of Seabirds in Long-line Fisheries	122
International Tropical Timber Agreement 1983	
Art 2	12
Johannesburg Declaration on Sustainable Development 2002	
para 3	104
para 4	104
Joint Convention on the Safety of Spent Fuel Management and on the Safety of Radioactive Waste Management 1997	
Art 1	97
Art 11(vi),(vii)	97
Kinshasa Declaration on Great Apes 2005	
Preamble	119
Kyoto Protocol to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change	23
Madrid Protocol <i>see</i> Protocol on Environmental Protection to the Antarctica Treaty	
Memorandum of Understanding on the Slender Billed Curlew	
Preamble	135
s 1	135
Memorandum of Understanding Concerning Conservation Measures for the Aquatic Warbler	
Point 1	135
Memorandum of Understanding on Marine Turtles of the Atlantic Coast of Africa	135
Memorandum of Understanding on the Conservation and Management of Marine Turtles and their Habitats of the Indian Ocean and South-East Asia	135
Memorandum of Understanding on the Siberian Crane	
Preamble	135
Memorandum of Understanding on West African Elephants	
para 3	135
Mercury Convention	105
Mexico City Declaration on Cultural Policies 1982	82
Migratory Bird Convention <i>see</i> Convention for the Protection of Migratory Birds in Canada and the United States 1916	
Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer	
Art 9	33-34
Nairobi Declaration 1982	103
Nordic Convention 1974	
Art 4	102
Pact of Arab States	102
Peace of Westphalia 1648	85
Protocol Concerning Protected Areas and Wild Fauna and Flora in the Eastern African Region	
Art 2	134
Art 12	134
Protocol on Environmental Protection to the Antarctic Treaty	
Annex II	124
Art 3	73, 124, 139
Art 3(2)(b)(vi)	21
Art 3(2)(b)(v)	134
Art 3(5),(6)	120
Art 5	134
Art 5(9)	124
'Amended Version of Annex II to the Environmental Protocol'(2009)	
Measure 16	124
Protocol on Further Reductions of Sulphur Emissions 1994	
Art 6(f)	34
Protocol on Volatile Organic Compounds	
Art 2(7)(d)	34
Protocol to the 1972 Convention on the Prevention of Marine Pollution by Dumping of Wastes and Other Matter	104
Protocol to the 1979 Convention on Long Range Transboundary Air Pollution on the Reduction of Sulphur Emissions	
Preamble	34
Ramsar Convention <i>see</i> Convention on Wetlands of International Importance	
Rio Declaration on Environment and Development	103
Preamble	138
Principle 1	12
Principle 7	138
Seoul Declaration on Environmental Ethics 1997	55-6

Seville Strategy		United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change 1992	
Objective 1.1	39	Preamble, para 17	35
Seville + 5 Recommendations, Recommendation No. 6	39	Art 1	138-9
Statement of Principles for a Global Consensus on the Management, Conservation and Sustainable Development of all Types of Forests	87	Art 2	138-9
Preamble	139	Art 3	20
Art 3	139	Art 3(1)	103-4
Principle 8(f)	53	Art 3(3)	35
Principle 12(a)	38	United Nations Millennium Declaration	
Principle 16(e)	38	para 21	1, 104
Statute for the Council of Europe 1949 (Treaty of London)	102	para 23	1
Statute of the International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources 1948	70	Universal Declaration of the Rights of Animals 1977	116
Stockholm Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment 1972		Vienna Declaration from the World Conference on Human Rights 1993	
Principle 1	102	Art 20	85
Principle 2	19	Art 28	85
Principle 4	19	Art 32	85
Recommendation 29	20	World Charter for Nature 1982	
United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea		Preamble	20, 103, 138
Article 61(2), (4)	134	General Principle 1	138
Art 118	134	General Principle 2	135
Art 119	134	General Principle 4	11-12
United Nations Declaration on the Right to Development 1986		Annex	128
Art 4, para 13	12	2.2	72-3
United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples	87	World Conservation Strategy 1980	
		Preface to Chapter 18	127-8
		para 4	11
		para 5	11
		Ch 18, para 1	127-8
		World Heritage Convention <i>see</i> Convention Concerning the Protection of World Cultural and Natural Heritage	
		World Summit on Sustainable Development 'Plan of Implementation'	87
		para 44(e)	139

INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW,
POLICY, AND ETHICS

This book is dedicated to the memory
of Patricia Birnie (1926–2013)
: *exemplar*

Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Table of Instruments</i>	<i>xvii</i>

I. INTRODUCTION

II. ANTHROPOCENTRICISM

1. Introduction	4
2. The anthropocentric worldview	4
3. Reflection in law and policy	10
4. Conclusion	13

III. SELF INTEREST

1. Introduction	14
2. Protecting the environment due to self interest	14
3. Recognition in law and policy	19
4. Limits of the approach of self interest	21
5. Conclusion	24

IV. ECONOMICS

1. Introduction	25
2. The idea	25
3. The economics of conservation	28
4. The economics of pollution	33
5. Recognition of the argument	37
6. Difficulties with the argument	40
A. Irreconcilable worldviews	40
B. No economic value and/or lack of ecological knowledge	44
C. Higher economic values	45
D. Market problems	48
E. Political problems	49
7. Conclusion	50

V. RELIGION

1. Introduction	51
2. The influence of religion	51

3. Reflection in international environmental law	52
4. Religion as a catalyst for environmental concern	53
5. The Christian stewardship ethic	56
6. Difficulties with the stewardship ethic	59
7. Conclusion	66

VI. AESTHETICS

1. Introduction	68
2. The argument of aesthetic value	69
3. Recognition in law and policy	72
4. Difficulties with aesthetics	76
5. Conclusion	80

VII. CULTURE

1. Introduction	82
2. The values of culture as a catalyst for environmental protection	82
3. Reflection in law and policy	85
4. Difficulties with cultural-based arguments	88
5. Conclusion	94

VIII. FUTURE GENERATIONS

1. Introduction	95
2. Environmental damage and future generations	95
3. The moral consideration of other generations	98
4. Adoption of the argument in law and policy	101
5. Problems when considering future generations	105
6. Conclusion	109

IX. ANIMALS AND OTHER LIVING ENTITIES

1. Introduction	111
2. Moral consideration for animals	111
3. Animals in international law and policy	115
A. Near equal to humanity	116
B. Utilization, no pain, and the welfare approach	119
C. Lethal scientific experiments using animals	122
4. Inherent value in all individual living entities	126
5. Inherent value in international law and policy	127
6. Conclusion	128

X. SPECIES AND ECOSYSTEMS

1. Introduction	130
2. Extinction and endangered species	131
3. Endangered species in law and policy	133
4. Ecosystems	136
5. Ecosystems in international law	138
6. Difficulties of thinking holistically	140
7. Conclusion	143

XI. CONCLUSION

<i>Bibliography</i>	151
<i>Index</i>	191