

CLIMATE CHANGE LAW, POLICY AND PRACTICE SERIES

Distributional Choices in EU Climate Change Law and Policy

Towards a Principled Approach?

By Javier de Cendra de Larragán



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Distributional Choices in EU Climate Change Law and Policy

Towards a Principled Approach?

Javier de Cendra de Larragán



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3337-3

© 2011 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain

Distributional Choices in EU Climate Change Law and Policy

Climate Change Law, Policy and Practice Series

VOLUME 4

Editor

Professor Kurt Deketelaere

Professor of Law, University of Leuven, Belgium

Honorary Chief of Staff, Flemish Government

Honorary Professor of Law, University of Dundee, UK

Secretary-General, League of European Research Universities (LERU), Belgium

The aim of the Editor and Publishers is to publish works of excellent quality that focus on Climate Change.

Through this series the Editor and Publishers hope:

- to contribute to combating climate change, to protecting biodiversity, to reducing the impact of pollution on health and better use of natural resources;
- to provide information on cutting use of energy-improving energy efficiency, emissions and emissions trade, renewable energy, carbon capture and geological storage policy;
- to increase the access to information on climate change issues for students, academics, non-governmental organizations, government institutions, and business;
- to facilitate cooperation between academic and non-academic communities in the field of climate change throughout the world.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume

To Véronique, Marie and Amélie

List of Abbreviations

A/R	Afforestation/reforestation
AAU	Assigned Amount Unit
BAU	Business as Usual
BSA	Burden Sharing Agreement
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CBA	Cost Benefit Analysis
CBDR	Common but Differentiated Responsibilities
CCS	Carbon Capture and Storage
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CER	Certified Emission Reduction
CFC	Chlorofluorocarbon
CFI	Court of First Instance
CH ₄	Methane
CO ₂	Carbon Dioxide
CO ₂ -eq	Carbon Dioxide Equivalent
COP	Conference of the Parties
CSP	Country Strategy Papers
ECCP	European Climate Change Programme
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
EDF	European Development Fund
EEA	European Environmental Agency
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ETS	Emissions Trading Scheme
EU	European Union
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEEREF	EU Global Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Fund

List of Abbreviations

GEF	Global Environmental Fund
GHG	Greenhouse Gas
IET	International Emissions Trading
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
JI	Joint Implementation
JUSSCANZ	Japan, United States, Canada, Australia and New Zealand
LDC	Least Developed Country
LULUCF	Land Use, Land Use Change, and Forestry
MBI	Market Based Instruments
MOC	Meridional Overturning Circulation
MRV	Monitorable, Reportable and Verifiable
NAMA	National Appropriate Mitigation Action
NAP	National Allocation Plan
NIMBY	'Not in my backyard' Syndrome
ODA	Official Development Aid
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PAMs	Policies and Measures
PCT	Personal Carbon Trading
PCQ	Personal Carbon Quotas
PPM	Particles per Million
R & D	Research and Development
REDD	Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
REIO	Regional Economic Integration Organization
RES	Renewable Energy Sources
SCC	Social Cost of Carbon
SEA	Strategic Environmental Assessment
tCO ₂	Tones of Carbon Dioxide
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	xxi
------------------------------	------------

Chapter 1

General Introduction	1
1 Introduction	1
2 Distributional Choices in Climate Change Policy	2
2.1 A Provisional Definition of Distributional Choices in the Context of Climate Change Policy	2
2.2 Varieties of Distributional Choices in Climate Change Policy	3
3 The Relationship between Distributional Choices, Law and Legal Principles	5
4 Justification for Undertaking This Research	6
5 A Focus on EU Law	7
6 Main Research Questions	11
7 Methodology and Structure	11

Chapter 2

Climate Change, Climate Change Policy and Distributional Choices	15
1 Introduction	15
2 An Overview of the Climate Change Problem: Causes, Impacts and Responses	16
2.1 Definition of Climate Change	16
2.2 Causes of Climate Change	16
2.3 Impacts of Climate Change	17
2.3.1 Impacts of Climate Change on Sectors	17

Table of Contents

2.3.2	Impacts across Regions	18
2.3.3	Estimated Benefits and Costs of Impacts from Climate Change and Their Distribution	19
2.4	Responses to Climate Change	20
2.4.1	Adaptation	20
2.4.2	Mitigation	21
2.4.3	Relationship between Mitigation, Adaptation and Sustainable Development	23
2.4.4	Interim Conclusions	24
3	The Policy-Relevant Characteristics of Climate Change Policy	25
3.1	Climate Change and Uncertainty	25
3.2	The Problem of Irreversibility	25
3.3	Climate Change Is a Long-Term Problem	26
3.4	Climate Protection Is a Global Public Good	26
3.5	Climate Change Is Mainly Caused by the Use of Fossil Fuels	28
3.6	Climate Change Is Closely Linked to Considerations of Equity	29
3.6.1	Varieties of Justice	29
3.6.2	Criteria of Justice	29
3.7	Main Barriers for the Adoption of Effective Mitigation Policies	30
3.8	Interim Conclusions	32
4	The Institutions Involved in Designing and Implementing Climate Change Policy	33
5	Setting the Goals of Climate Change Policy	34
5.1	Fixing the Goals	34
5.2	Rationales for the Adoption of Specific Goals	36
5.2.1	Science-Based Considerations	36
5.2.2	Economic Considerations	37
5.2.3	Political Considerations	38
5.2.4	Ethical Considerations	39
5.2.5	Interim Observations	41
6	Burden Sharing in Climate Change (Mitigation) Policy	41
6.1	Criteria for Burden Sharing Proposed in the Literature	41
6.2	Lessons Stemming from an Analysis of Specific Proposals for Burden Sharing Put Forward in the Literature	45
6.3	Extension of the Problem of Burden Sharing in Mitigation Policy	46
7	Instruments of Climate Change (Mitigation) Policy	47
7.1	Choice of Instruments	47
7.2	The Need for Instrument Mixes	48
7.3	Evaluating Interactions between Instruments	49

7.4	Distributional Impacts of Instruments	50
7.5	Links between Policy Areas	51
7.6	Interim Conclusions	51
8	Conclusions and a Definition of Distributional Choices in Climate Change Policy	52
 Chapter 3		
Law, Legal Principles and Distributional Choices		55
1	Introduction	55
2	Some Methodological Clarifications Regarding the Concept of Law Underlying This Book	56
2.1	Concepts of Law	56
2.2	Law as Order	59
2.3	Law as the Command of the Sovereign	59
2.4	Law as a Just Proportion in the Distribution of Benefits and Burdens	60
2.5	The Concept of Law Guiding the Research	63
3	Law as Justice	64
3.1	Law as a Rational Ordinance	64
3.1.1	Rationality and the Policymaker	66
3.1.1.1	<i>Constitutionalist v. Legalism</i>	70
3.1.1.2	Conclusion	71
3.1.2	The Principle of Proportionality as a Tool to Assess Teleological Rationality	71
3.1.2.1	The First Dimension of the Principle of Proportionality: The Test Of Appropriateness	73
3.1.2.2	The Second Dimension of the Test of Proportionality: Test of Necessity	73
3.1.2.3	<i>The Third Dimension of the Test of Proportionality: Proportionality Stricto Sensu</i>	74
3.2	Law as a Rational Ordinance for the Common Good	74
3.2.1	The Rise and Demise of the Common Good	74
3.2.2	The Environment, Climate Change and the Common Good	77
3.2.3	Limits to the Scope of the Common Good?	77
3.2.3.1	The Common Good and Cosmopolitan Justice	78
3.2.3.2	Intergenerational Justice	80
3.2.3.3	Relevance of Theories of Intergenerational Justice for Law	80
3.2.4	Proportionality in the Distribution of Burdens and Benefits by Law	82
3.3	Law as a Rational Ordinance for the Common Good Issued by the Legislator	85
3.4	The Role of the Judiciary	86

Table of Contents

4	Notion and Functions of Legal Principles	87
4.1	The Notion of Legal Principle	88
4.2	Functions of legal Principles	93
4.2.1	Legal Principles Guiding the Policymaker	93
4.2.2	Legal Principles Guiding the Courts	95
5	The Analytical Framework Based on Legal Principles to Describe, Analyse and Prescribe Distributional Choices and Its Application to EU Climate Change Law	96
6	Conclusions	99

Chapter 4

Legal Principles of EU Law Relevant for Describing, Assessing and Testing Distributional Choices in Climate Change Law and Policy

		101
1	Introduction	101
2	The Analysis of Legal Principles in EU Law	102
2.1	Introduction	102
2.2	The Particular Importance of Legal Principles in EU Law	103
2.3	Types of Legal Principles in EU Law	103
2.4	Legal Principles in the Hierarchy of EU Rules	105
2.5	Roles of Legal Principles in EU Law	105
2.5.1	Roles of Constitutional Principles	106
2.5.2	In the Law-Making Process	108
2.5.3	In Adjudication	110
2.5.3.1	Gap-Filling Function	110
2.5.3.2	Legal Principles as Aid for Interpretation.	111
2.5.3.3	Legal Principles as Grounds for Interpretation and Review	111
2.5.4	Levels at Which Principles May be Relied upon by Applicants	113
3	Law as a Search for a Proportion between Ends and Means	114
3.1	The Test of Appropriateness	114
3.1.1	The Test of Intensity	114
3.1.2	The Test of Quality	115
3.1.2.1	The Principle of Sustainable Development	116
3.1.2.1.1	The Concept and Dimensions of Sustainable Development	116
3.1.2.1.2	The Legal Significance of Sustainable Development in EC Law	119
3.1.2.2	The Principle of Integration	124
3.1.2.2.1	Integration and Climate Change	124
3.1.2.2.2	The Principle of Integration in EC Law	126

3.1.2.2.3	The Relation between Integration and Other Relevant Legal Principles in the Context of Distributional Choices in Climate Change Law and Policy	130
3.1.2.3	The Precautionary Principle	132
3.1.2.3.1	The Precautionary Principle, Climate Change and Future Generations	132
3.1.2.3.2	The Precautionary Principle and Future Generations	133
3.1.2.3.3	The Precautionary Principle, Intergenerational Equity and the UNFCCC	133
3.1.2.3.4	The Precautionary Principle in EC Law	134
3.1.2.4	The Principle of Prevention	140
3.1.2.4.1	Prevention and Climate Change	140
3.1.2.4.2	Prevention in EC Law	140
3.1.2.5	The Polluter Pays Principle	142
3.1.2.5.1	The Polluter Pays Principle and Distributional Choices in Climate Change Policy	142
3.1.2.5.2	The Polluter Pays Principle in EU Law	144
3.1.2.5.3	The Polluter Pays Principle and State Aid	145
3.1.2.5.4	The Polluter Pays Principle as a Criterion to Distribute Costs between Polluters	145
3.1.2.6	The Principle of Rectification at Source	148
3.1.3	The Test of Probability	151
3.1.3.1	The Principle of Legal Certainty	152
3.1.3.2	The Principle of Legitimate Expectations.	153
3.2	The Test of Necessity	155
3.2.1	The Principle of Conferral (or Attribution)	155
3.2.2	The Principle of Subsidiarity	155
3.2.2.1	The Protocol on the Principles of Subsidiarity and Proportionality	156
3.2.2.2	The Practice of the Commission	157
3.2.2.3	Subsidiarity in the Legal Literature	158
3.2.2.4	Subsidiarity in Law and Economics Literature	161

Table of Contents

3.2.3	Efficiency, Cost-Effectiveness and Climate Change Policy	162
3.2.3.1	In Relation to Climate Change Law and Policy	162
3.2.3.2	Efficiency, Cost-Effectiveness and Equity in EC law. The Increasing Use of Integrated Impact Assessments	164
4	Law as a Search for a Proportion in the Distribution of Benefits and Burdens	166
4.1	The Principle of Proportionality in the Distribution between States	166
4.1.1	The Principle of Intergenerational Equity	166
4.1.1.1	The Principle of Intergenerational Equity in International Law	166
4.1.1.2	The Principle of Intergenerational Equity in EU Law	166
4.1.1.3	The Principle of Intergenerational Equity in the Academic Literature	168
4.1.1.4	Avenues to Effectively Implement the Doctrine of Intergenerational Equity in Domestic Law	171
4.1.2	The Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities	173
4.1.2.1	Common but Differentiated Responsibilities in International Law	173
4.1.2.2	The Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and the Principle of Solidarity	178
4.1.2.3	Common but Differentiated Responsibilities in EU Law	181
4.1.3	The Principle of Solidarity	185
4.1.4	The Principle of Loyal Cooperation	187
4.2	Proportionality in the Distribution of Burdens between Firms and Individuals	188
4.2.1	The Principle of Proportionality in the Distribution of the Burdens	188
4.2.1.1	Solidarity among EU Citizens	188
4.2.1.2	Proportionality in the EU Law-Making Process	189
4.2.1.3	Proportionality in the Case Law of the EU Courts	192
4.2.1.3.1	The Principle of Proportionality in Case Law	192
4.2.1.3.2	Proportionality, Fundamental Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	197

4.2.1.3.3	Proportionality in Burden Sharing in the Case Law of the ECJ	200
4.2.2	The Principle of Equal Treatment	201
4.2.2.1	The Principle of Equality and European Courts	201
4.2.2.2	The Test of Equality	202
4.2.2.3	The Intensity of Review	206
4.2.2.3.1	The Right of the EU to Legislate Step-by-Step	206
4.2.2.3.2	The Discretion of EU Institutions	207
5	Law as a Search for a Proportion in the Participation of Affected Parties	208
5.1	Within the EU	208
5.1.1	Public Participation	208
5.1.1.1	Public Participation and Distributional Choices	208
5.1.1.2	Public Participation in EU Law	209
5.1.2	Access to Justice in EU Courts to Challenge Violation of Procedural Environmental Rights	211
5.1.3	Principles of Environmental Justice in EU Law	212
5.1.3.1	Introduction	212
5.1.3.2	Environmental Justice in the EU	213
5.2	Procedural Justice beyond the EU	215
6	Conclusions	217

Chapter 5

The EU Approach to International Burden Sharing: An Analysis from the Perspective of Legal Principles		221
1	Introduction	221
2	The EU Position in the International Climate Negotiations Pursuant to the Kyoto Protocol	222
2.1	The EU Approach to Mitigation	222
2.2	The EU Position towards Financing Adaptation in Third Countries	224
2.3	Interim Observations	225
3	The EU Position in the International Negotiations for a Post-2012 Climate Change Regime	226
3.1	The International Negotiation Process on Burden Sharing	226
3.2	The Position of the EU in the International Negotiations	228
3.2.1	The Position of the EU Regarding the Long-Term Target	228
3.2.2	The Position of the EU Regarding Burden Sharing in the International Negotiations	230
3.2.2.1	Burden Sharing in Mitigation among Developed Countries	230

Table of Contents

3.2.2.2	Burden Sharing among Developing Countries	234
3.2.2.3	The EU Position towards Other Elements Related to Burden Sharing in Mitigation	235
3.2.2.3.1	The CDM and Sectoral Agreements	236
3.2.2.3.2	Land Use, Land Use Change and Forestry	237
3.2.2.3.3	Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation and Conservation	238
3.2.2.3.4	Biofuels	240
3.2.2.4	The EU Position towards Adaptation	243
3.2.2.5	The EU Position towards Financing Climate Change Policies in Developing Countries	244
3.3	Interim Conclusions	246
3.4	Copenhagen and Beyond	247
4	An Exploration of the EU Position on Burden Sharing from the Perspective of the Meta-principle of Proportionality	250
4.1	A Proportion between Means and Ends	251
4.1.1	Appropriateness	251
4.1.1.1	The Intensity	251
4.1.1.2	The Quality	252
4.1.1.2.1	Sustainable Development	252
4.1.1.2.2	Integration	257
4.1.1.2.3	The Polluter Pays Principle	267
4.1.1.2.4	The Principle of Rectification at Source	268
4.1.1.3	The Probability of Achieving the End	269
4.1.1.3.1	The Test of Probability and Long-Term Targets	269
4.1.1.3.2	The Test of Probability and the EU Post-2012 Strategy	270
4.1.2	The Necessity of the EU Approach to Burden Sharing	273
4.1.2.1	The Test of Necessity	273
4.1.2.2	The Principles of Attribution and Subsidiarity	273
4.1.2.2.1	Attribution and the EU Position at the International Level	273
4.1.2.2.2	Subsidiarity and the Long-Term Target	274
4.1.2.2.3	Subsidiarity and the Position of the EU in Burden Sharing	276
4.2	A Proportion in the Distribution	281
4.2.1	The Principle of Intergenerational Equity and EU Climate Change Mitigation Law	281

4.2.2	The Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and the Position of the EU in the International Climate Change Negotiations Law	284
5	Conclusions	291

Chapter 6

Effort Sharing between Member States in EU Climate Change Law and Policy: An Analysis from the Perspective of Legal Principles **295**

1	Introduction	295
2	The First Burden-Sharing Agreement	296
3	The Transition from the First EU BSA to the Commission's Proposal on a New EU BSA	298
4	The Second Burden-Sharing Agreement	301
5	A Comparison between the First and Second BSA	301
6	Analysis from the Perspective of the Meta-principle of Proportionality	303
6.1	A Proportion between Means and Ends	303
6.1.1	The Ends	303
6.1.2	The Means	304
6.1.3	The Test of Appropriateness	304
6.1.3.1	The Intensity	305
6.1.3.2	The Quality	309
6.1.3.2.1	The Principle of Integration	309
6.1.3.2.2	The Polluter Pays Principle	314
6.1.3.2.3	The Principle of Rectification at Source	315
6.1.3.3	The Probability of Achieving the Ends	315
6.1.4	The Test of Necessity	316
6.2	A Proportion in the Distribution of the Burden	318
6.2.1	The Principles of Solidarity and CBDR	318
6.2.2	The Polluter Pays Principle	323
6.2.3	The Principle of Loyal Cooperation	324
6.2.3.1	Introduction	324
6.2.3.2	Responsibility of the EC under International Law and under Article 4 of the Kyoto Protocol	326
6.2.3.2.1	The Position of the EC under the Kyoto Protocol	326
6.2.3.2.2	The Compliance Regime of the Kyoto Protocol and Consequences for the EC	329
6.2.3.3	The Role of Article 10 EC in Ensuring EC Compliance with Its Kyoto Target	332