

DOUGLAS HODGSON

The Law of Intervening Causation

The Law of Intervening Causation

DOUGLAS HODGSON
The University of Western Australia

ASHGATE

© Douglas Hodgson 2008

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Douglas Hodgson has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

Published by
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Gower House
Croft Road
Aldershot
Hampshire GU11 3HR
England

Ashgate Publishing Company
Suite 420
101 Cherry Street
Burlington, VT 05401-4405
USA

Ashgate website: http://www.ashgate.com
--

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Hodgson, Douglas

The law of intervening causation

1. Liability (Law) 2. Causation

I. Title

346'.03

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hodgson, Douglas.

The law of intervening causation / by Douglas Hodgson.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7546-7366-8

1. Liability (Law). 2. Causation. I. Title.

K579.L5H63 2008

346.02--dc22

2007049172

ISBN 978 0 7546 7366 8



Mixed Sources

Product group from well-managed
forests and other controlled sources
www.fsc.org Cert no. SA-COC-1565
© 1996 Forest Stewardship Council

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall.

List of Cases

England and Scotland

A.C. Billings & Sons Ltd v Riden (1958)	196	213
Adams v The Lancashire and Yorkshire Railway Company (1869)	15; 44; 193; 197; 222	
	52–3, 56, 63, 214, 216, 245–6	
Aldham v United Dairies (London) Ltd [1940]	125	142
Algol Maritime Limited v Acori [1997]	163	179
Alphacell Ltd v Woodward [1972]	120	137
Arneil v Paterson [1931]		125
Attorney General v Hartwell (British Virgin Islands) [2004]	84	95
Banque Bruxelles Lambert S.A. v Eagle Star Insurance Co. Ltd [1995]	30; 122	38, 139
Barber v British Road Services (1964)		224
Barings plc (in liquidation) v Coopers & Lybrand (a firm) [2003]	111	
Bird v Holbrook (1828)	12; 60; 61	16, 70, 71
Blyth v The Birmingham Waterworks (1856)	117	134
Bower v Meggitt and Jones (1916)	155	
Brandon v Osborne Garrett & Co. Ltd [1924]	81; 173; 195	92–3, 191, 212
British Columbia Electric Railway Co. Ltd v Loach [1916]	4	7
Burrows v The March Gas and Coke Company (1870) (1872)	16	20–1
Butterfield v Forrester (1809)	222	245
Carmarthenshire County Council v Lewis [1955]	214	234
Carslogie Steamship Co. Ltd v Royal Norwegian Government [1952]	121; 132	138–7
Cavanagh v London Transport Executive (1956)	140	157
Church v Dugdale & Adams Ltd (1929)	139	
Clark v Chambers (1878)	17; 80; 185; 209	21–2, 23, 91–2, 202, 228
Clayards v Dethick (1848)	13; 44; 61; 195; 208	18, 52, 71, 213, 227–8
Cobb v Great Western Railway [1894]	91	103
Collins v The Middle Level Commissioners (1869)	90	103
Collinson v Manvers Main Collieries Ltd (1937)	128	145
Colvilles v Devine [1969]	44	
Corr v IBC Vehicles Ltd [2006]	141; 233	158n16
Coulter v Coltness Iron Co. [1938]	139	
Cox v Burbidge (1863)	124	141–2
Cutler v United Dairies (London), Ltd [1933]	62; 173; 175	191–2, 191N22, 193
Davies v Mann (1842)	223	246
Davis v St Mary's Demolition Co. [1954]	188	
Dixon v Bell (1816)	11; 90; 183	15–16, 102, 116, 200, 237
Dominion Natural Gas Co. Ltd v Collins and Perkins [1909]	2; 59; 61; 217	69, 237
Donoghue v Stevenson [1932]	213	
Donovan v Union Cartage Co. [1933]	184	
Doolan v Henry Hope & Sons Ltd (1918)	128	

Dulieu v White & Sons [1901]	148
Dunham v Clare (1902) 20; 45; 127; 138	24–5, 53, 155–6
D'Urso v Sanson [1939]	179..... 196
Emeh v Kensington and Chelsea and Westminster Area Health Authority [1984] 43; 49; 75; 167; 238.....	57–8, 86n112, 184
Engelhart v Farrant & Co. [1897]	19..... 24
Environment Agency (Formerly National Rivers Authority) v Empress Car Co. (Abertillery) Ltd [1999] 6; 65; 89; 116; 118; 123	76, 101, 109, 134, 135–6, 140
Forbes v Mersyside Fire and Civil Defence Authority [2002]	94; 163..... 106, 180–1
Froom v Butcher [1976]	228
Glanville v Sutton [1928]	125
Glasgow Corporation v Muir [1943]	58
Glasgow Corporation v Taylor [1922]	183
Grant v Sun Shipping Co. Ltd [1948]	213..... 233
Groom v Selby [2001]	167
Halestrap v Gregory (1895)	209
Harrison v The Great Northern Railway Company (1864)	119..... 136
Harvey v Road Haulage Executive [1952]	224
Haynes v Harwood [1935] 5; 62; 82; 174; 184.....	8, 73, 93, 94, 97, 192
Herschtal v Stewart & Ardern Ltd [1940]	115; 213..... 131, 232–3
Hobbs v London and South Western Ry Co. (1875)	4
Hoey v Felton (1861) 14; 230	18–19, 254
Hogan v Bentinck West Hartley Collieries (Owners) Ltd [1949] 4; 5; 161; 207; 240.....	178–9, 225, 264
Holgate v Lancashire Mental Hospitals Board [1937]	215
Home Office v Dorset Yacht Co. Ltd [1970] 27; 63; 80; 83; 214; 231	34–5, 36, 74, 91, 94, 97, 99, 255
Hughes v Lord Advocate [1963]	25
Hughes v Macfie (1863) 61; 184; 222.....	71n24, 201–2, 245
Humber Oil Terminal Trustee Ltd v Owners of the Ship 'Sivand' [1998]	31; 50; 122..... 38
Hyett v Great Western Railway Company [1947]	46; 82..... 54, 93
Illidge v Goodwin (1831)	13..... 17–18
Imperial Chemical Industries Ltd v Shatwell [1965]	228
In Re Etherington and the Lancashire and Yorkshire Accident Insurance Company [1909] 7; 127.....	9, 143–4
Isitt v The Railway Passengers Assurance Company (1889)	126..... 143
Jebson v Ministry of Defence [2000]	228
Jones v Boyce (1816) 11; 44; 193.....	16, 20, 52, 211, 214
Jones v Jones [1985]	210
Kimball v Butler Bros (1910)	171
Kirkham v Chief Constable of the Greater Manchester Police [1990]	141..... 158–9
Knight v Home Office [1990]	141
Knightley v Johns [1982] 29; 83; 109; 113; 176; 232.....	36–7, 57, 94, 125, 129, 194, 256
Lamb v Camden London Borough Council [1981] 2; 28; 64; 93; 232; 23.....	4, 35, 57, 75, 106, 256
Lathall v Joyce & Son [1939]	125
Latham v Johnson & Nephew, Ltd [1913]	25; 182..... 33
Lynch v Knight (1861)	44..... 52
Lynch v Nurdin (1841) 12; 90; 183; 225	102, 200–1, 248
Malone v Cayzer Irvine & Co. (1908)	139..... 156

Manchester Corporation v Markland [1936]	117
Mangan v Atherton (1866)	185
Marriott v Maltby Main Colliery Co. (1920)	139
Marshall v Caledonian Railway (1899)	63
Martin v Stanborough (1924)	188
McAuley v London Transport Executive [1958]	115
McDowall v Great Western Railway Company [1903]	13; 186
McFarlane v Tayside Health Board [1999]	167
McKew v Holland & Hannen & Cubitts (Scotland) Ltd [1970]	2; 26; 48; 77; 109; 204
	33–4, 56, 63, 88, 125, 185n80, 221, 222–3
Meah v McCreamer [1985]	65; 232
	75–6, 256–7
Meah v McCreamer (No. 2) [1986]	65; 233
Muirhead v Industrial Tank Specialities Ltd [1986]	113
Newton v Edgerley [1959]	82; 186
	93n14, 203–4
Nichols v Marsland (1876)	119
Northwestern Utilities Ltd v London Guarantee and Accident Co. Ltd [1936]	91
Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v Morts Dock & Engineering Co. Ltd (The Wagon Mound (No. 1)) [1961]	8; 26; 229
	10, 33, 253
Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v The Miller Steamship Co. Pty Ltd (The Wagon Mound (No. 2)) [1967]	25; 28; 42; 239
	36
Owners of Steamship Singleton Abbey v Owners of Steamship Paludina [1927]	62; 131
	148–9, 153
Perry v Kendricks Transport Co. Ltd [1970]	63
Philco Radio and Television Corporation Ltd v J. Spurling Ltd [1949]	2; 4; 60; 91; 108; 219
	4, 70n17, 103–4, 124–5, 238–9
Pidgeon v Doncaster Health Authority [2002]	168
	185n80
Pigney v Pointer's Transport Services Ltd [1957]	140; 147; 231
	157–8, 162, 165n46, 255
Polemis & Furness, Withy & Co. Ltd, Re [1921]	7; 26; 233
	10, 33, 78
Prendergast v Sam & Dee Ltd [1989]	164
Quinn v Burch Bros (Builders) Ltd [1966]	24
	31
Rahman v Arearose Ltd [2001]	161
	177
Reeves v Commissioner of Police of the Metropolis [2000]	6; 43; 66; 94; 109; 141; 151;
	215; 226
	51, 77, 106, 110, 115, 125, 159–60, 163, 234, 249
Rickards v Lothian [1913]	25; 60; 61
	32–3, 70, 71–2
Roberts v Bettany [2001]	2; 50
	58–9
Robinson v The Post Office [1974]	163
	180
Robson v North Eastern Railway Co. (1874–75)	196
	213
Rocca v Stanley Jones & Co. (1914)	161
	177–8
Rose v North Eastern Railway (1876)	198
	214–15
Roswell v Prior (1701)	9
	13–14
Rothwell v Caverswall Stone Co. Ltd [1944]	161
	178
Rouse v Squires [1973]	93; 106; 110; 224
	105–6, 122–3, 126, 247
Rushton v Turner Bros Asbestos Co. Ltd [1959]	63
	74
Sabri-Tabrizi v Lothian Health Board [1998]	168
	185n80
Sayers v Harlow Urban District Council [1958]	47; 181; 193; 199; 208; 227; 231
	55–6, 198, 216, 251, 255
Scaramanga & Co. v Stamp (1880)	171
	189
Scott v Shepherd (1773)	9; 25; 43; 60; 61; 80; 193
	13–14, 32, 52, 70, 71, 91, 210
Scott's Trustees v Moss (1889)	81
	92
Selvanayagam v University of West Indies (1983)	166
	182–3

Sharp v Powell (1872)	117
Shawinigan v Vokins [1961]	110
Slipper v British Broadcasting Corporation [1991]	83; 216; 233 94, 236–7, 257
Stansbie v Troman [1948]	38; 63; 92 73–4, 104, 114
Steele v Robert George & Co., (1937), Ltd [1942]	45; 165 181
Taylor v Rover Co. Ltd (1966)	219 239
Tennent v Earl of Glasgow (1864)	116
The Calliope [1970]	132 149
The City of Lincoln (1889)	18; 44; 81; 130; 231 22, 53, 92, 147–8, 149, 151, 153, 255
The Fritz Thyssen [1968]	131
The Guildford [1956]	131
The Metagama (1927)	2; 45; 132; 178 53, 149–51, 196
The Oropesa [1943]	4; 46; 134; 230; 235; 241 7, 54–5, 151–2, 153, 259
The Sisters (1876)	209
Vaughan v Menlove (1837)	57 66
Vicars v Wilcocks (1806)	10 14–15
Videan v British Transport Commission [1963]	176 194
Ward v Cannock Chase District Council [1985]	30; 64 37–8, 75
Ward v T.E. Hopkins & Son Ltd [1959]	83; 174; 175 94, 192, 193–4
Ward v Weeks (1830)	11; 61; 215 15, 71, 235
Webb v Barclays Bank plc and Portsmouth Hospitals NHS Trust [2001]	162 179n52
Weld-Blundell v Stephens [1920]	4; 59; 61; 209; 216 69, 73, 228, 235
Wieland v Cyril Lord Carpets, Ltd [1969]	48; 93; 202 57, 105, 220–1
Wilkinson v Kinneil Cannel and Coking Coal Co. (1897)	81
Williams v Eady (1893)	185 202–3
Wilson v Coulson [2002]	211
Withers v London, Brighton & South Coast Railway Company [1916]	139 156–7
Woods v Duncan [1946]	AC 401 140
Wright v Lodge [1993]	49; 110; 225 57, 127–7
Yachuk v Oliver Blais Co. Ltd [1949]	92; 188; 219; 225 104–5, 205–6, 238, 248

Canada

Abbott v Kasza [1975]	117; 199
Anderson v Northern Railway Company (1875)	171
Bishop v Sharrow (1975)	187
Blais v Yachuk [1946]	86 97
Block v Martin (1951)	159; 202 220
Bohlen v Perdue and City of Edmonton [1976]	227
Boss v Robert Simpson (Eastern) Ltd (1968)	202
Bradford v Kanellos (1973)	33; 99; 109 40, 112, 125
Brain v Mador (1985)	166
Canphoto Ltd v Aetna Roofing (1965) Ltd [1971]	68 78–9
Cotic v Gray (1981)	147; 229 165, 165n48, 253
C.P.R. v Calgary [1971]	119
Crotin v National Post [2003]	100
Dallaire v Paul-Emile Martel Inc. [1989]	111; 191; 225 127–8, 207–8
Davidson v Connaught Laboratories (1980)	160 177
Doughty v Township of Dungannon [1938]	109 125

Duce v Rourke (1951) 67; 86; 100; 233.....	78, 97, 113, 257
Edwards v Smith [1941] 187	
Engel v Kam-Ppelle Holdings Ltd [1993] 166	
Fetherston v Neilson and King Edward Hotel [1944] 108.....	124
Fleming v Atkinson [1959] 125	
Fujiwara v Osawa [1938] 106.....	122
Funk v Clapp (1986) 146	164
Geall v Dominion Creosoting Co. (1917) 186	
Gray v Gill [1993] 166	
H. (M.) v Bederman [1995] 100	
Harris v Toronto Transit Commission [1967] 188; 227	205, 250
Hayes Estate and Hayes v Green and Green (1983) 147	
Hewson v Red Deer (1977) 33; 68.....	41, 79
H.L. v Canada (Attorney General) (2005) 69; 237	80
Hobbs v Robertson (2004) 165	
Hoffer v School Division of Assiniboine South [1973] 188	
Holian v United Grain Growers (1980) 33; 68; 100; 189	41, 79, 113, 206
Ingram v Lowe (1975) 187	
Ippolito v Janiak (1981) 166	182
Ives v Clare Brothers Ltd [1971] 213	
Jane Doe v Board of Police Commissioners for Metro Toronto [1998] 100	
Jones v Shafer [1948] 31; 67.....	39, 78
Katzman v Yaeck (1982) 160	
Kirk v Trerise (1979) 125	
Kolesar v Jeffries (1976) 159	176
Lamberty v Saskatchewan Power Corp. (1966) 32; 114.....	40, 130–1
Lawson v Wellesley Hospital [1978] 215	
Lepine v University Hospital (1964) 145	
Martin v McNamara Construction Co. Ltd [1955] 32; 100	39, 112–13
Menow v Honsberger and Jordan House Ltd [1974] 106	122
Mercer v Gray [1941] 158.....	175
Michaluk v Rolling River School [2001] 214	
Mitchell v Rahman [2002] 2; 3; 159	
Oke v Weide Transport Ltd (1963) 32	39–40
Ostash v Sonnenberg (1968) 214	233
Papp v Leclerc (1977) 159	
Patten v Silberschein [1936] 67; 233	77–8, 257
Price v Milawski (1977) 160.....	176
Priestley v Gilbert [1972] 205.....	223
Q v Minto Management Ltd (1985) 69.....	79
Rehak v McLennan [1992] 159.....	176
Roberge v Bolduc [1991] 56; 168.....	65–6, 185
Robson v Ashworth (1985) 147	164–5
Ryan v Hickson (1975) 188	
Schlink v Blackburn [1993] 100	
Seymour v Winnipeg Electric Railway (1910) 172	190
Smith v Inglis (1978) 32; 108	124
Stadel v Albertson [1954] 145	
Swami v Lo (No. 3) (1979) 34; 147.....	41–2, 164
The Queen in right of British Columbia v Zastowny (2006) 69; 236; 237.....	80–1

Thompson v Toorenburgh (1975) 114; 160	130, 177
Toronto Hydro-Electric Commission v Toronto Railway Co. (1919) 67.....	77
Town of Prescott v Connell (1893) 18; 85; 178.....	96, 196
Turner v Koren (1932) 7	
Urbanski v Patel (1978) 68; 179	79
Villemure v L'Hopital Notre-Dame (1972) 146.....	164
Walker v DeLuxe Cab Ltd [1944] 67.....	78
Watson v Grant (1970) 159	175–6
Whelan v Parsons & Sons [2005] 187	
Wickberg v Patterson (1997) 227	
Williams v New Brunswick (1985) 34; 69; 100; 214	41, 79–80, 113, 233–4
Winnipeg Electric Railway Co. v Canadian Northern Railway Co. and Bartlett (1920) 99; 192.....	112
Wright Estate v Davidson (1992) 148	
Wright v McCrea [1965] 33	41

Australia

Adelaide Chemical and Fertilizer Company Limited v Carlyle (1940) 53; 128; 165.....	62, 146, 182
Alford v Magee (1952) 223	
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v GSF Australia Pty Ltd (2004–2005) 236	260n11
AMP General Insurance Ltd v RTA (2001) 144.....	161n29
Anderson v Corporation of the City of Enfield; Turco (Aust.) Pty Ltd (Third Party) (1983) 38; 220.....	45–6, 239
Aquilina v N.S.W. Insurance Ministerial Corporation (1994) 157	174
Australian Eagle Insurance Company Ltd v Federation Insurance Ltd (1976) 206; 207	224–5
Australian Shipbuilding Industries (WA) Pty Ltd v Packer (1993) 113	
Beavis v Apthorpe (1962) 36; 156	
Bennett v Minister of Community Welfare (1992) 77; 99; 114; 168	88, 111–12, 130, 185–6
Bohdal v Streets [1984] 87	
Boyd v SGIC [1978] 165	182
Cameron v Nottingham Insurance Co. Ltd [1958] 210	
Canterbury Bankstown Rugby League Football Club Ltd v Rogers (1993) 124.....	140–1
Caterson v Commissioner for Railways (1973) 54; 73; 86; 198.....	62–3, 84, 97–8, 215
CES v Superclinics (Aust.) Pty Ltd (1995) 75; 166; 238.....	86, 183
Chapman v Hearse (1961) 4; 25; 36; 95; 106; 175; 224.....	44–5, 48, 107–8, 122, 123, 192, 247
Chappell v Hart (1998) 124	
Charlton v Public Trustee for the Northern Territory (1967) 107; 228	
Chomentowski v Red Garter Restaurant Pty Ltd (1970) 37; 74; 96.....	45, 85, 108, 109
Club Italia (Geelong) Inc. v Ritchie (2001) 74; 97	85n107, 109
Commonwealth Trading Bank of Australia v Sydney Wide Stores Pty Ltd (1981) 74	
Commonwealth v McLean (1997) 210	
Curmi v McLennan [1994] 73; 96; 187	84n102, 109, 204
De Alba v Freehold Investment Co. (1895) 194	
Evenden v Manning Shire Council (1929) 171; 173	191
Expokin Pty Ltd v Graham [2000] 203.....	221

Fishlock v Plummer [1950]	207
Forbes v Olympic General Products (Qld) Pty Ltd (1989)	220
Forrester v Torrensford Sand and Gravel Pty Ltd (1928)	36
Gardiner v Henderson & Lahey [1988]	114
GIO v Aboushadi (1999)	207
Goodsell v Murphy (2002)	212
Haber v Walker [1963]	7; 72; 122; 143; 240; 241
Havenaar v Havenaar [1982]	42; 210
Hird v Gibson [1974]	38; 210
Hirst v Nominal Defendant [2004]	97; [2005] 56; 97; 226
Hogan v Gill (1992)	218
Holden Pty Ltd v Walsh [2000]	144
Jacques v Matthews [1961]	107; 228
Joslyn v Berryman (2003)	223
Kavanagh v Akhtar (1998)	56; 75
Kenny & Good Pty Ltd v MGICA (1992) Ltd (1999)	122
Kessey v Golledge [1999]	55; 203
Krakowski v Trenorth (1996)	212
Lawrie v Meggitt (1974)	156
Lindeman Ltd v Colvin (1946)	154
Lisle v Brice [2002]	144
Liston v Liston (1981)	156
Lothian v Rickards (1911)	35; 95
Mahony v J Kruschich (Demolitions) Pty Ltd (1985)	4; 38; 54; 112; 156
Malleys Ltd v Rogers (1955)	44; 194
March v E. & M. H. Stramare Pty Ltd (1990–91)	73; 98; 108; 223; 227
	63, 84, 110–11, 124, 250
Martin v Isbard (1946)	156
McHale v Watson (1966)	191
Medlin v The State Government Insurance Commission (1994–95)	54; 76
Melchior v Cattnach [2000]	168
Migge v Wormald Bros Industries Ltd [1972]	154
Moore v A.G.C. (Insurances) Ltd [1968]	156
Mount Isa Mines v Bates (1972)	37; 96; 114; 226
Muller v Lalic [2000]	218
Munce v Vinidex [1974]	166
Neall v Watson (1960)	126
Nicolson v Tucker (1984)	205
NSW Insurance Ministerial Corporation v Myers (1995)	144; 210
O'Brien v Thorpe (1987)	113; 169
Parkdale Custom Built Furniture Pty Ltd v Puxu Pty Ltd (1982)	212
Parramatta City Council v Lutz (1988)	96
Parry v Yates & Griffin (1963)	195
Pitt Son & Badgery Ltd v Proulefcio SA (1984)	74; 96
Pyne v Wilkenfeld (1981)	49; 55; 202
Re Armstrong and State Rivers and Water Supply Commission [1952]	119
Reg Glass v Rivers (1968)	74; 95
Richters v Motor Tyre Service Proprietary Ltd [1972]	144
Rigg v State of New South Wales (1993)	142
Rolfe v Katanga Lucerne Mill Pty Ltd [2005]	221

Sarkis v Summitt Broadway Pty Ltd [2006] 144	162n29
Scout Association of Queensland v Central Regional Health Authority (1997) 152; 157	174
Skea v NRMA Insurance Ltd [2005] 38; 203	
South Australian Stevedoring Company Limited v Holbertson [1939] 154	171–2
State Government Insurance Commission v Oakley [1990] 55; 203; 206	64, 222, 224
State Rail Authority of New South Wales v Wiegold (1991) 65; 74; 210; 237	85–6, 229–30
Taco Co. of Australia Inc. v Taco Bell Pty Ltd (1982) 212	
Telstra Corporation Ltd v Smith (1998) 144	
The Commissioner of Railways (Western Australia) v Stewart (1936) 120	137
The Duke Group v Pilmer (1999) 213	
Thompson v Bankstown Corporation (1953) 183	
Thorpe Nominees v Henderson & Lahey [1988] 87	
Travel Compensation Fund v Tambree (2005) 99; 169	186–7
Vieira v Water Board [1988] 157	174n23
Walker-Flynn v Princeton Motors Pty Ltd (1960) 165	182
Watts v Turpin (1999) 91	
Woolfe v Tasmania (Department of Health and Human Services) [2001] 129	145–6
Wyong Shire Council v Shirt (1980) 42	
Yates v Jones (1990) 75; 211; 237	86, 230–1, 261–2
Zavitsanos v Chippendale [1970] 143	

USA

Aetna Insurance Co. v Boon (1877) 21; 84	26, 95
Albala v City of New York (1981) 167	183n73
American Mutual Liability Insurance Co. v Buckley & Co. Inc. (1941) 6; 190	207
Anderson v Baltimore & Ohio Railroad Company (1937) 52; 226	60–1, 249–50
Arsnow v Red Top Cab Co. (1930) 149	
Baione v Heavey (1932) 70	81
Brower v N.Y. Central Railway (1918) 70; 85	81, 95
Burrell Township v Uncapher (1887) 105	121–2
Chicago, Milwaukee, St Paul & Pacific Railroad Company v Goldhammer (1935) 51	60
Daniels v New York Railroad (1903) 149	166
Dominics v Monongahela Connecting R.R. Co. (1937) 35	42–3
Exxon v Sofec Inc. (1995) 112; 135	128, 152–3
Fehrs v McKeesport (1935) 190	207
Ferroggiaro v Bowline (1957) 34	42
Jacobson v Suderman and Young Inc. ('The Mariner') (1927) 117	135
Johnson v Kosmos Portland Cement Co. (1933) 118	136
Kline v Moyer (1937) 106	122
Koelsch v Philadelphia Co. (1893) 16	21
Lane v Atlantic Works (1872) 34	42
Liberty National Life Insurance v Weldon (1958) 70	
Lillie v Thompson (1947) 71; 102	82–3, 115–16
Liming v Illinois Central Railway (1890) 172; 177	195
Louisiana Mutual Insurance Co. v Tweed (1869) 22; 118	26–7, 135
Lowden v Shoffner Mercantile Co. (1940) 52; 178	61, 195
McKenna v Baessler (1892) 53	
McLaughlin v Sullivan (1983) 150	

Memphis and Charleston Railroad Company v Reeves (1870) 120	137–8
Milwaukee and St Paul Railway Company v Kellogg (1877) 9; 21; 84	13, 25–6, 95
Molton v City of Cleveland (1988) 150	
New York Central Railway Company v Brown (1933) 51	59–60, 96
New York Eskimo Pie Corporation v Rataj (1934) 85; 189	206–7
O'Neill v City of Port Jervis (1930) 123	140
Railroad Co. v Stout (1873) 188	204–5
Sandri v Byram (1929) 194	211
Scheffer v Washington City Railroad Co. (1882) 149	166
Shuster v City of New York (1958) 71	81
Smith v Cohen (1935) 70	81
St Louis-San Francisco Railway Company v Mills (1924) 71; 85	81–2, 96
Sudderth v White (1981) 150	
Thompson v Fox (1937) 153	170
Troietto v G.H. Hammond Co. (1940) 108	124
Wagner v International Railroad Company (1921) 172; 175	190, 193
Watters v T.S.R. Inc. (1990) 150	

New Zealand

Burnett v Wairoa Co-operative Meat Company Ltd [1921] 128	145
Grant v Cooper, McDougall and Robertson Ltd (1940) 220	240
John Mill and Co. Ltd v Public Trustee [1945] 101	114
McCarthy v Wellington City [1966] 4; 25; 39; 77; 101; 189; 219	32, 47–8, 114, 206
McFarland v Stewart (1900) 144	162
Murdoch v British Israel World Federation (New Zealand) Inc. [1942] 145	162
Pallister v Waikato Hospital Board [1975] 4; 102; 145; 215	115, 163, 234
Reid v Friendly Societies' Hall Company (1880–81) 39; 101	47, 113–14
Smith v Auckland Hospital Board [1965] 202	
Taupo B.C. v Birnie [1978] 87	98

Ireland

Breslin v Corcoran [2003] 78; 88	89, 99
Byrne v Wilson (1862) 14; 105	19, 121
Conley v Strain [1988] 162	
Cooke v Midland Great Western Railway of Ireland [1909] 187	204
Crowley v A.I.B. and O'Flynn, Green, Buchan and Partners [1988] 115	131
Cunningham v MacGrath Bros [1964] 87; 209	98–9, 228
Dockery v O'Brien [1975] 78	89
Hogg v Keane [1956] 57; 194	66
Kingston v Kingston (1965) 57; 195	212
Martin v Moore [1946] 128	145
McKenna v Stephens and Hall [1923] 106	122
Sullivan v Creed [1904] 60; 103; 186	70n17, 116, 203, 237

Other Jurisdictions

Moini v The Government of Papua New Guinea [1977] 40; 78..... 48

Sarl Les transports heandais v SA Les grands travaux du Forez (1977) (France) 40; 78
.....48–9, 89

Acknowledgements

I wish to express my gratitude to my research assistant, Julia Ker, for her useful insights and diligent efforts in accumulating and collating materials and information in support of this undertaking. I am also indebted to Dianne Hollis for her tireless and conscientious efforts in typing, correcting and formatting successive drafts of the manuscript. I would also like to thank Professor William Ford, Dean of the School of Law of The University of Western Australia, for his help in providing financial assistance and teaching relief which facilitated a timelier completion of this monograph. Finally, I would like to acknowledge the assistance of Carol Hicks, Law Library Reference Librarian, in chasing down some rather obscure and venerable case citation references.

Douglas Hodgson
The University of Western Australia
2008

Contents

List of Cases

vii

Acknowledgements

xvii

PART I Introduction

1	Introduction	3
2	Early Judicial Development of Intervening Causation Law	13

PART II The Legal Tests

3	Reasonable Foreseeability	31
4	Unreasonableness/Abnormality	51
5	Voluntary and Deliberate Human Action	69
6	Probability	91
7	Scope of Risk	101

PART III Operative Contexts

8	Intervening Negligent Acts and Omissions	121
9	Extraordinary Natural Phenomena, Coincidences and Animals	133
10	Maritime Incidents	147
11	The Suicide Cases	155
12	Professional Malpractice	169
13	Rescue of Persons and Property	189
14	Children	199
15	Escaping from Danger and Inconvenience	209
16	Negligence Causing Susceptibility to Later Harm	219
17	Miscellaneous Operative Contexts	227

PART IV Conclusion

18	The Influence of Contributory Negligence and Apportionment Legislation on Intervening Causation Issues	245
19	The Inter-relationship Between Remoteness of Damage and <i>Novus Actus Interveniens</i>	253
20	Conclusion	259
	<i>Index</i>	267

PART I

Introduction