

MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE: PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

DAVID A. SCHLUETER

Contemporary Litigation Series

MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE: PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

DAVID A. SCHLUETER

THE MICHIE COMPANY
Law Publishers
CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA

**COPYRIGHT 1982
BY
THE MICHIE COMPANY**

**Library of Congress Card Number: 82-80389
ISBN 0-87215-417-3**

**The views of the author do not purport to reflect the views of the Department
of the Army or Department of Defense.**

MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE: PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

Contemporary Litigation Series

**Consulting Editors for the
CONTEMPORARY LITIGATION SERIES**

Professor Stephen R. Saltzburg
University of Virginia Law School

Professor Kenneth R. Redden
University of Virginia Law School

PREFACE

Although this book is primarily designed to serve as a guide for attorneys—civilian or military—whose practice includes military criminal justice, those studying the system or its components will find it a useful reference tool. Its contents and format are intended to lead the reader, in hornbook fashion, through the maze of procedural and substantive rules, military acronyms and related disciplinary practices unique to military criminal law. I have attempted in the textual discussions to condense and compile key cases, statutes, and regulations which should provide the reader with the basics. The footnotes and bibliography will in turn direct the reader to further resources; I have specifically included a section on researching military criminal law questions. An in-depth analysis of military justice is beyond the scope of this book and I have left that to the growing number of commentators of the system and their fine articles.

This book is not intended to serve as a substitute for careful examination of the pertinent case law, statutes, and regulations. Rather, it should complement those resources and assist the reader in understanding military criminal justice practices and procedures.

I owe much to the many friends, colleagues, and family members whose support meant a great deal as the book was taking shape. A number of them deserve special acknowledgment here. First, Professor Kenneth Redden of the University of Virginia Law School offered an endless stream of insightful suggestions on format and contents. His enthusiastic support of this project from the outset proved invaluable. Colonels David Minton and Rob Nutt provided endorsements of this endeavor in its early stages and kept it on track. Helena Daidone did a masterful job in typing the manuscript and Linda Furey and Peg Reichenberg spent long hours checking case citations. Finally, I cannot say enough for the love, patience, and encouragement offered by my wife, Linda, who amidst the demands of her own professional and personal work provided many helpful suggestions and invaluable assistance in preparation

PREFACE

of the manuscript. To all I say thank you; I have been truly blessed.

David A. Schlueter

*Springfield, Virginia
March 1982*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Preface</i>	v
<hr/>	
CHAPTER 1. THE MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM	1
PART I. INTRODUCTION	
§ 1-1. A Separate System?	2
§ 1-2. Using This Book	4
§ 1-2(A). A Foreword	4
§ 1-2(B). Frontal Analysis	4
§ 1-2(C). Discussion	5
§ 1-2(D). Annotated Bibliography	5
§ 1-2(E). Glossary	5
§ 1-2(F). Appendices	5
§ 1-3. Researching Military Criminal Law Issues	6
§ 1-3(A). The Uniform Code of Military Justice	6
§ 1-3(B). The Manual for Courts-Martial: MCM	6
§ 1-3(C). Service Supplements to the MCM	7
§ 1-3(D). Military Case Law	8
§ 1-3(D)(1). Court-Martial Reports	8
§ 1-3(D)(2). Military Justice Reporter	9
§ 1-3(D)(3). Citator	9
§ 1-3(E). Military Legal Periodicals	10
PART II. THE PRESENT SYSTEM: A PROLOGUE	
§ 1-4. An Overview	11
§ 1-5. The Commander's Options: Prosecutorial Discretion	17
§ 1-5(A). General	17
§ 1-5(B). Nonpunitive Measures	18
§ 1-5(C). Nonjudicial Punishment	19
§ 1-5(D). Court-Martial	19
§ 1-5(D)(1). Summary Court-Martial	19
§ 1-5(D)(2). Special Court-Martial	20
§ 1-5(D)(3). General Court-Martial	21

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Appendix References	23
Annotated Bibliography	23
CHAPTER 2. MILITARY CRIMES	29
§ 2-1. Introduction	30
§ 2-2. Absence Offenses	31
§ 2-2(A). General	31
§ 2-2(B). Desertion	31
§ 2-2(C). Absence Without Leave	33
§ 2-2(C)(1). Failing to Go to Place of Duty	33
§ 2-2(C)(2). Leaving a Place of Duty	34
§ 2-2(C)(3). Absence Without Leave	35
§ 2-2(D). Missing Movement	37
§ 2-2(E). Defenses to Absence Without Leave	38
§ 2-2(E)(1). Impossibility	38
§ 2-2(E)(2). Duress	39
§ 2-2(E)(3). Mistake of Fact	39
§ 2-2(E)(4). Civilian Detention	39
§ 2-2(E)(5). Statute of Limitations	40
§ 2-3. Disrespect Offenses	42
§ 2-3(A). Disrespect Toward Officers	42
§ 2-3(B). Insubordination Toward Petty, Warrant or Noncommissioned Officers	43
§ 2-3(C). Defenses to Disrespect Offenses	44
§ 2-4. Disobedience Offenses	45
§ 2-4(A). General	45
§ 2-4(B). Disobedience of a Superior's Orders	46
§ 2-4(C). Violation of General Orders or Regulations	48
§ 2-4(D). Disobedience of Other Orders	49
§ 2-4(E). Dereliction of Duty	50
§ 2-5. Article 133: Conduct Unbecoming an Officer and a Gentleman	50
§ 2-6. Article 134: The General Article	51
§ 2-6(A). Disorders and Neglects to the Prejudice of Good Order and Discipline	53
§ 2-6(B). Conduct Bringing Discredit Upon the Armed Forces	53

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 2-6(C). Crimes and Offenses Not Capital:	
Federal Crimes	54
§ 2-7. Drug Offenses	55
§ 2-8. Fraternization	56
Appendix References	58
Annotated Bibliography	58
 CHAPTER 3. NONJUDICIAL PUNISHMENT	60
§ 3-1. Introduction	61
§ 3-2. Applicable Policies	63
§ 3-3. Authority to Impose Punishment	64
§ 3-3(A). Who May Impose?	64
§ 3-3(B). Who May Be Punished?	66
§ 3-3(C). "Minor" Offenses	67
§ 3-4. The Right to Demand Trial	69
§ 3-5. Procedural Rules for Imposing Nonjudicial Punishment	70
§ 3-5(A). General	70
§ 3-5(B). Army Procedures	72
§ 3-5(B)(1). Preliminary Inquiry	73
§ 3-5(B)(2). Notice	74
§ 3-5(B)(3). Hearing	75
§ 3-5(B)(4). Appeals	76
§ 3-5(C). Air Force Procedures	78
§ 3-5(C)(1). Preliminary Inquiry	78
§ 3-5(C)(2). Notice	79
§ 3-5(C)(3). Hearing	80
§ 3-5(C)(4). Appeals	81
§ 3-5(D). Navy and Marine Corps Procedures	82
§ 3-5(D)(1). Preliminary Inquiry	83
§ 3-5(D)(2). Notice	83
§ 3-5(D)(3). Hearing	85
§ 3-5(D)(4). Appeals	86
§ 3-5(E). Coast Guard Procedures	87
§ 3-5(E)(1). Preliminary Inquiry	88
§ 3-5(E)(2). Notice	89
§ 3-5(E)(3). Hearing	89
§ 3-5(E)(4). Appeals	91

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 3-6. Punishments	92
§ 3-6(A). General	92
§ 3-6(B). Reduction in Grade	92
§ 3-6(C). Deprivation of Liberty	93
§ 3-6(C)(1). Correctional Custody	93
§ 3-6(C)(2). Extra Duties	93
§ 3-6(C)(3). Restriction	94
§ 3-6(C)(4). Arrest in Quarters	94
§ 3-6(C)(5). Confinement on Bread and Water	94
§ 3-6(D). Deprivation of Pay	95
§ 3-6(E). Censure	95
§ 3-6(F). Combination of Punishments	96
§ 3-6(G). Effective Dates of Punishments	96
§ 3-7. Effect of Errors in Imposition	97
§ 3-8. Consequences of Nonjudicial Punishment	98
§ 3-8(A). Filing Requirements: Military Career .	98
§ 3-8(B). Use at Court-Martial or Administrative Proceedings	99
Appendix References	102
Annotated Bibliography	102
CHAPTER 4. JURISDICTION	104
PART I. INTRODUCTION	
§ 4-1. General	105
§ 4-2. The Nature of Court-Martial Jurisdiction	106
§ 4-2(A). A Creature of Statute	107
§ 4-2(B). Requisites of Jurisdiction	107
§ 4-3. Jurisdictional Limits of Courts-Martial	108
§ 4-3(A). General Court-Martial	108
§ 4-3(B). Special Court-Martial	109
§ 4-3(C). Summary Court-Martial	109
PART II. PERSONAL JURISDICTION	
§ 4-4. General	110
§ 4-5. Inception of Jurisdiction: A Change of Status . . .	111
§ 4-5(A). Enlistment: Voluntary Entry	111
§ 4-5(A)(1). Valid Enlistments	113
§ 4-5(A)(2). Void Enlistments: Minors; Involuntary; Incompetent	114

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
§ 4-5(A)(3). Effect of Recruiter Misconduct	116
§ 4-5(A)(4). Constructive Enlistment	117
§ 4-5(B). Induction: Involuntary Entry	119
§ 4-5(C). Appointment of Officers	121
§ 4-6. Jurisdiction Over Reservists and Members of National Guard	121
§ 4-7. Jurisdiction Over Civilians	124
§ 4-7(A). In Wartime	124
§ 4-7(B). In Peacetime	126
§ 4-8. Termination of Personal Jurisdiction	126
§ 4-8(A). Continuing Jurisdiction	126
§ 4-8(B). General Rule: Discharge Terminates Status	128
§ 4-8(C). Exceptions to the General Rule	128
§ 4-8(C)(1). Article 3(a) Offenses	129
§ 4-8(C)(2). Fraudulent Discharge	130
§ 4-8(C)(3). Deserters	130
§ 4-8(C)(4). Persons in Custody	131
§ 4-8(D). Retired Members	131
§ 4-9. Pleading and Proving Personal Jurisdiction	132

PART III. JURISDICTION OVER THE OFFENSE

§ 4-10. Introduction	133
§ 4-11. The Service Connection Requirement	134
§ 4-11(A). Applying the <i>Relford</i> Factors	135
§ 4-11(A)(1). Situs of the Offense	137
§ 4-11(A)(2). Abuse of Status	138
§ 4-11(A)(3). Military Duties	138
§ 4-11(A)(4). Threat to the Military	139
§ 4-11(B). The Petty and Overseas Offenses Exceptions	140
§ 4-11(C). Pleading and Proving Service Connection	141
§ 4-12. Exclusive and Concurrent Jurisdiction	142
§ 4-12(A). State and Federal Courts	142
§ 4-12(B). Foreign Courts	143

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
PART IV. CONVENING AND COMPOSITION OF COURTS-MARTIAL	
§ 4-13. General	145
§ 4-14. Authority to Convene a Court-Martial	146
§ 4-14(A). The Convening Authority	147
§ 4-14(A)(1). Statutory Authorization	147
§ 4-14(A)(2). Disqualifications	147
§ 4-14(A)(3). Delegation of Authority	148
§ 4-14(B). Convening Orders	149
§ 4-15. Properly Composed Court-Martial	149
§ 4-15(A). Military Judge	150
§ 4-15(B). Counsel	151
§ 4-15(C). Court Members	151
Appendix References	153
Annotated Bibliography	153
CHAPTER 5. PRETRIAL PROCEDURES	155
PART I. GENERAL	
§ 5-1. Introduction	157
§ 5-2. Commander's Investigation	158
§ 5-2(A). Searches and Seizures	159
§ 5-2(A)(1). Probable Cause Searches	160
§ 5-2(A)(2). Other Reasonable Searches	161
§ 5-2(A)(3). Inspections and Inventories	162
§ 5-2(B). Interrogation of Suspects	163
§ 5-2(C). Eyewitness Identification	165
§ 5-3. Pretrial Restraint	166
§ 5-3(A). Apprehension, Arrest and Restriction	166
§ 5-3(B). Pretrial Confinement	167
§ 5-3(C). Illegal Pretrial Restraint	169
PART II. PREFERRAL AND FORWARDING OF CHARGES	
§ 5-4. Preferring Charges	170
§ 5-4(A). The Charge Sheet	171
§ 5-4(B). General Rules of Pleading	172
§ 5-4(B)(1). Pleading Jurisdiction	173
§ 5-4(B)(2). Amendments to Pleadings	174
§ 5-4(B)(3). Additional charges	175

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 5-4(C). Defective Pleadings	175
§ 5-4(C)(1). Misjoinder	176
§ 5-4(C)(2). Duplicity	176
§ 5-4(C)(3). Multiplicity	177
§ 5-5. Forwarding of Charges	179
§ 5-5(A). Immediate Commander	179
§ 5-5(B). Summary Court-Martial Convening Authority	180
§ 5-5(C). Special Court-Martial Convening Authority	181
§ 5-5(D). General Court-Martial Convening Authority	181
§ 5-6. Command Influence	182
 PART III. THE ARTICLE 32 INVESTIGATION AND THE PRETRIAL ADVICE	
§ 5-7. General	183
§ 5-8. The Article 32 Investigation	184
§ 5-8(A). The Parties to the Investigation	185
§ 5-8(A)(1). The Investigating Officer	185
§ 5-8(A)(2). Counsel	186
§ 5-8(B). The Accused's Rights	186
§ 5-8(C). Article 32 Investigation Procedure	188
§ 5-8(D). Investigating Officer's Report	189
§ 5-8(E). Defects in the Investigation	190
§ 5-9. The Staff Judge Advocate's Pretrial Advice	191
§ 5-9(A). Contents of the Pretrial Advice	191
§ 5-9(B). Defective Pretrial Advice	192
 PART IV. CONVENING OF A COURT-MARTIAL AND THE REFERRAL PROCESS	
§ 5-10. General	193
§ 5-11. Convening the Court-Martial	194
§ 5-11(A). The Convening Authority	194
§ 5-11(B). The Convening Order	195
§ 5-11(C). The Participants	196
§ 5-11(C)(1). Military Judge	196
§ 5-11(C)(2). Trial and Defense Counsel	197

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 5-11(C)(3). Members of the Court	199
§ 5-11(C)(4). Changes in Composition	201
§ 5-12. Referral of Charges to a Court-Martial	202
§ 5-13. Withdrawal of Charges	202
§ 5-14. Service of Charges Upon the Accused	204
 PART V. PLEA BARGAINING, CONFESSITIONAL STIPULATIONS AND DISCHARGE IN LIEU OF COURT-MARTIAL	
§ 5-15. General	204
§ 5-16. Pretrial Agreements	204
§ 5-16(A). Form and Content	206
§ 5-16(B). Valid Conditions	206
§ 5-16(C). Invalid Conditions	207
§ 5-17. Confessional Stipulation	208
§ 5-18. Discharge in Lieu of Court-Martial	209
 PART VI. DEFENSE DISCOVERY AND REQUESTS FOR WITNESSES	
§ 5-19. General	210
§ 5-20. Defense Discovery	210
§ 5-20(A). The Charge Sheet	210
§ 5-20(B). ABA Standards Requiring Disclosure of Evidence	211
§ 5-20(C). The <i>Brady</i> Request	212
§ 5-20(D). Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure .	212
§ 5-20(E). The Article 32 Investigation	213
§ 5-20(F). The Military Rules of Evidence Notice Requirements	213
§ 5-20(G). The Jencks Act	214
§ 5-20(H). Motions for Discovery	214
§ 5-21. Defense Requests for Witnesses	215
§ 5-21(A). General	215
§ 5-21(B). Procedures	216
Appendix References	218
Annotated Bibliography	218
 CHAPTER 6. ARTICLE 39(a) PRETRIAL SESSION	
§ 6-1. General	224
§ 6-2. Inquiries by the Military Judge	225
§ 6-2(A). Accused's Rights to Counsel	226

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		<i>Page</i>
§ 6-2(B).	Challenge of the Military Judge	227
§ 6-2(C).	Request for Trial by Military Judge Alone	227
§ 6-2(D).	Request for Enlisted Members on the Court	228
§ 6-3.	Arraignment	230
§ 6-4.	Motions	231
§ 6-4(A).	Notice, Waiver, and Burden of Proof .	231
§ 6-4(B).	Motions to Dismiss	232
§ 6-4(B)(1).	Lack of Jurisdiction	232
§ 6-4(B)(2).	Statute of Limitations	233
§ 6-4(B)(3).	Speedy Trial	233
§ 6-4(B)(4).	Lack of Mental Responsibility	237
§ 6-4(B)(5).	Former Jeopardy	238
§ 6-4(B)(6).	Failure to Allege an Offense	239
§ 6-4(B)(7).	Former Punishment	239
§ 6-4(B)(8).	Grant of Immunity	240
§ 6-4(B)(9).	Constructive Condonation of Desertion	241
§ 6-4(B)(10).	Multiplicity	241
§ 6-4(C).	Motions to Suppress	241
§ 6-4(C)(1).	Pretrial Statements of the Accused	243
§ 6-4(C)(2).	Illegal Searches and Seizures	244
§ 6-4(C)(3).	Eyewitness Identifica- tion	244
§ 6-4(D).	Motions to Grant Appropriate Relief .	245
§ 6-4(D)(1).	Accused Incompetent to Stand Trial	245
§ 6-4(D)(2).	Pretrial Confinement	246
§ 6-4(D)(3).	Change of Venue	246
§ 6-4(D)(4).	Defective Pretrial Investigation or Pretrial Advice	247
§ 6-4(D)(5).	Defective Pleadings	247
§ 6-4(D)(6).	Severance	248

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
§ 6-4(D)(7). Request for Individual Military Counsel	248
§ 6-4(D)(8). Request for Witnesses	249
§ 6-4(D)(9). Discovery	249
§ 6-4(E). Motions in Limine	250
§ 6-4(F). Rulings on Motions	251
§ 6-4(G). Reconsideration of Rulings	251
§ 6-4(H). Appeal of Rulings: Extraordinary Writs	252
§ 6-5. Pleas	253
§ 6-5(A). Not Guilty Pleas	254
§ 6-5(B). Guilty Pleas	254
§ 6-5(B)(1). Effect of Guilty Plea	255
§ 6-5(B)(2). The <i>Care</i> Provendity Inquiry	256
§ 6-5(B)(3). The <i>Green-King</i> Pretrial Agreement Inquiry	258
§ 6-5(B)(4). Improvident Guilty Pleas	260
§ 6-5(B)(5). Entry of Findings	263
§ 6-5(C). Irregular Pleas	263
Appendix References	265
Annotated Bibliography	265
 CHAPTER 7. TRIAL PROCEDURES	 269
PART I. INTRODUCTION	
§ 7-1. General	271
§ 7-2. The Participants	271
§ 7-2(A). The Accused	272
§ 7-2(B). Defense Counsel	272
§ 7-2(C). Trial Counsel	273
§ 7-2(D). Military Judge	274
§ 7-2(E). Court Members	274
§ 7-2(F). Court Reporter	275
§ 7-2(G). Interpreter	276
§ 7-3. Courts-Martial and the Media	276
§ 7-4. Motions at Trial	277
§ 7-4(A). Continuances	277
§ 7-4(B). Mistrial	278