

MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE:  
PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

DAVID A. SCHLUETER

Contemporary Litigation Series

# **MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE: PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE**

**DAVID A. SCHLUETER**

THE MICHIE COMPANY  
*Law Publishers*  
CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA

**COPYRIGHT 1982  
BY  
THE MICHIE COMPANY**

**Library of Congress Card Number: 82-80389  
ISBN 0-87215-417-3**

**The views of the author do not purport to reflect the views of the Department  
of the Army or Department of Defense.**

# **MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE: PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE**

Contemporary Litigation Series

Consulting Editors for the  
**CONTEMPORARY LITIGATION SERIES**

**Professor Stephen R. Saltzburg**  
*University of Virginia Law School*

**Professor Kenneth R. Redden**  
*University of Virginia Law School*

## PREFACE

Although this book is primarily designed to serve as a guide for attorneys—civilian or military—whose practice includes military criminal justice, those studying the system or its components will find it a useful reference tool. Its contents and format are intended to lead the reader, in hornbook fashion, through the maze of procedural and substantive rules, military acronyms and related disciplinary practices unique to military criminal law. I have attempted in the textual discussions to condense and compile key cases, statutes, and regulations which should provide the reader with the basics. The footnotes and bibliography will in turn direct the reader to further resources; I have specifically included a section on researching military criminal law questions. An in-depth analysis of military justice is beyond the scope of this book and I have left that to the growing number of commentators of the system and their fine articles.

This book is not intended to serve as a substitute for careful examination of the pertinent case law, statutes, and regulations. Rather, it should complement those resources and assist the reader in understanding military criminal justice practices and procedures.

I owe much to the many friends, colleagues, and family members whose support meant a great deal as the book was taking shape. A number of them deserve special acknowledgment here. First, Professor Kenneth Redden of the University of Virginia Law School offered an endless stream of insightful suggestions on format and contents. His enthusiastic support of this project from the outset proved invaluable. Colonels David Minton and Rob Nutt provided endorsements of this endeavor in its early stages and kept it on track. Helena Daidone did a masterful job in typing the manuscript and Linda Furey and Peg Reichenberg spent long hours checking case citations. Finally, I cannot say enough for the love, patience, and encouragement offered by my wife, Linda, who amidst the demands of her own professional and personal work provided many helpful suggestions and invaluable assistance in preparation

## PREFACE

of the manuscript. To all I say thank you; I have been truly blessed.

*David A. Schlueter*

*Springfield, Virginia  
March 1982*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Preface</i> . . . . .	v
<hr style="width: 20%; margin: 0 auto;"/>	
CHAPTER 1. THE MILITARY CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM . . . . .	1
PART I. INTRODUCTION	
§ 1-1. A Separate System? . . . . .	2
§ 1-2. Using This Book . . . . .	4
§ 1-2(A). A Foreword . . . . .	4
§ 1-2(B). Frontal Analysis . . . . .	4
§ 1-2(C). Discussion . . . . .	5
§ 1-2(D). Annotated Bibliography . . . . .	5
§ 1-2(E). Glossary . . . . .	5
§ 1-2(F). Appendices . . . . .	5
§ 1-3. Researching Military Criminal Law Issues . . . . .	6
§ 1-3(A). The Uniform Code of Military Justice . . . . .	6
§ 1-3(B). The Manual for Courts-Martial: MCM . . . . .	6
§ 1-3(C). Service Supplements to the MCM . . . . .	7
§ 1-3(D). Military Case Law . . . . .	8
§ 1-3(D)(1). Court-Martial Reports . . . . .	8
§ 1-3(D)(2). Military Justice Reporter . . . . .	9
§ 1-3(D)(3). Citator . . . . .	9
§ 1-3(E). Military Legal Periodicals . . . . .	10
PART II. THE PRESENT SYSTEM: A PROLOGUE	
§ 1-4. An Overview . . . . .	11
§ 1-5. The Commander's Options: Prosecutorial Discretion . . . . .	17
§ 1-5(A). General . . . . .	17
§ 1-5(B). Nonpunitive Measures . . . . .	18
§ 1-5(C). Nonjudicial Punishment . . . . .	19
§ 1-5(D). Court-Martial . . . . .	19
§ 1-5(D)(1). Summary Court-Martial . . . . .	19
§ 1-5(D)(2). Special Court-Martial . . . . .	20
§ 1-5(D)(3). General Court-Martial . . . . .	21





## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 2-6(C). Crimes and Offenses Not Capital: Federal Crimes . . . . .	54
§ 2-7. Drug Offenses . . . . .	55
§ 2-8. Fraternalization . . . . .	56
Appendix References . . . . .	58
Annotated Bibliography . . . . .	58
CHAPTER 3. NONJUDICIAL PUNISHMENT . . . . .	60
§ 3-1. Introduction . . . . .	61
§ 3-2. Applicable Policies . . . . .	63
§ 3-3. Authority to Impose Punishment . . . . .	64
§ 3-3(A). Who May Impose? . . . . .	64
§ 3-3(B). Who May Be Punished? . . . . .	66
§ 3-3(C). "Minor" Offenses . . . . .	67
§ 3-4. The Right to Demand Trial . . . . .	69
§ 3-5. Procedural Rules for Imposing Nonjudicial Punishment . . . . .	70
§ 3-5(A). General . . . . .	70
§ 3-5(B). Army Procedures . . . . .	72
§ 3-5(B)(1). Preliminary Inquiry . . . . .	73
§ 3-5(B)(2). Notice . . . . .	74
§ 3-5(B)(3). Hearing . . . . .	75
§ 3-5(B)(4). Appeals . . . . .	76
§ 3-5(C). Air Force Procedures . . . . .	78
§ 3-5(C)(1). Preliminary Inquiry . . . . .	78
§ 3-5(C)(2). Notice . . . . .	79
§ 3-5(C)(3). Hearing . . . . .	80
§ 3-5(C)(4). Appeals . . . . .	81
§ 3-5(D). Navy and Marine Corps Procedures . . . . .	82
§ 3-5(D)(1). Preliminary Inquiry . . . . .	83
§ 3-5(D)(2). Notice . . . . .	83
§ 3-5(D)(3). Hearing . . . . .	85
§ 3-5(D)(4). Appeals . . . . .	86
§ 3-5(E). Coast Guard Procedures . . . . .	87
§ 3-5(E)(1). Preliminary Inquiry . . . . .	88
§ 3-5(E)(2). Notice . . . . .	89
§ 3-5(E)(3). Hearing . . . . .	89
§ 3-5(E)(4). Appeals . . . . .	91



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 4-5(A)(3). Effect of Recruiter Misconduct . . . . .	116
§ 4-5(A)(4). Constructive Enlistment . . . . .	117
§ 4-5(B). Induction: Involuntary Entry . . . . .	119
§ 4-5(C). Appointment of Officers . . . . .	121
§ 4-6. Jurisdiction Over Reservists and Members of National Guard . . . . .	121
§ 4-7. Jurisdiction Over Civilians . . . . .	124
§ 4-7(A). In Wartime . . . . .	124
§ 4-7(B). In Peacetime . . . . .	126
§ 4-8. Termination of Personal Jurisdiction . . . . .	126
§ 4-8(A). Continuing Jurisdiction . . . . .	126
§ 4-8(B). General Rule: Discharge Terminates Status . . . . .	128
§ 4-8(C). Exceptions to the General Rule . . . . .	128
§ 4-8(C)(1). Article 3(a) Offenses . . . . .	129
§ 4-8(C)(2). Fraudulent Discharge . . . . .	130
§ 4-8(C)(3). Deserters . . . . .	130
§ 4-8(C)(4). Persons in Custody . . . . .	131
§ 4-8(D). Retired Members . . . . .	131
§ 4-9. Pleading and Proving Personal Jurisdiction . . . . .	132

PART III. JURISDICTION OVER THE OFFENSE

§ 4-10. Introduction . . . . .	133
§ 4-11. The Service Connection Requirement . . . . .	134
§ 4-11(A). Applying the <i>Relford</i> Factors . . . . .	135
§ 4-11(A)(1). Situs of the Offense . . . . .	137
§ 4-11(A)(2). Abuse of Status . . . . .	138
§ 4-11(A)(3). Military Duties . . . . .	138
§ 4-11(A)(4). Threat to the Military . . . . .	139
§ 4-11(B). The Petty and Overseas Offenses Exceptions . . . . .	140
§ 4-11(C). Pleading and Proving Service Connection . . . . .	141
§ 4-12. Exclusive and Concurrent Jurisdiction . . . . .	142
§ 4-12(A). State and Federal Courts . . . . .	142
§ 4-12(B). Foreign Courts . . . . .	143



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 5-4(C). Defective Pleadings . . . . .	175
§ 5-4(C)(1). Misjoinder . . . . .	176
§ 5-4(C)(2). Duplicity . . . . .	176
§ 5-4(C)(3). Multiplicity . . . . .	177
§ 5-5. Forwarding of Charges . . . . .	179
§ 5-5(A). Immediate Commander . . . . .	179
§ 5-5(B). Summary Court-Martial Convening Authority . . . . .	180
§ 5-5(C). Special Court-Martial Convening Authority . . . . .	181
§ 5-5(D). General Court-Martial Convening Authority . . . . .	181
§ 5-6. Command Influence . . . . .	182

PART III. THE ARTICLE 32 INVESTIGATION AND  
THE PRETRIAL ADVICE

§ 5-7. General . . . . .	183
§ 5-8. The Article 32 Investigation . . . . .	184
§ 5-8(A). The Parties to the Investigation . . . . .	185
§ 5-8(A)(1). The Investigating Officer . . . . .	185
§ 5-8(A)(2). Counsel . . . . .	186
§ 5-8(B). The Accused's Rights . . . . .	186
§ 5-8(C). Article 32 Investigation Procedure . . . . .	188
§ 5-8(D). Investigating Officer's Report . . . . .	189
§ 5-8(E). Defects in the Investigation . . . . .	190
§ 5-9. The Staff Judge Advocate's Pretrial Advice . . . . .	191
§ 5-9(A). Contents of the Pretrial Advice . . . . .	191
§ 5-9(B). Defective Pretrial Advice . . . . .	192

PART IV. CONVENING OF A COURT-MARTIAL AND  
THE REFERRAL PROCESS

§ 5-10. General . . . . .	193
§ 5-11. Convening the Court-Martial . . . . .	194
§ 5-11(A). The Convening Authority . . . . .	194
§ 5-11(B). The Convening Order . . . . .	195
§ 5-11(C). The Participants . . . . .	196
§ 5-11(C)(1). Military Judge . . . . .	196
§ 5-11(C)(2). Trial and Defense Counsel . . . . .	197

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 5-11(C)(3). Members of the Court . . .	199
§ 5-11(C)(4). Changes in Composition . . .	201
§ 5-12. Referral of Charges to a Court-Martial . . . . .	202
§ 5-13. Withdrawal of Charges . . . . .	202
§ 5-14. Service of Charges Upon the Accused . . . . .	204
PART V. PLEA BARGAINING, CONFSSIONAL STIPULATIONS AND DISCHARGE IN LIEU OF COURT-MARTIAL	
§ 5-15. General . . . . .	204
§ 5-16. Pretrial Agreements . . . . .	204
§ 5-16(A). Form and Content . . . . .	206
§ 5-16(B). Valid Conditions . . . . .	206
§ 5-16(C). Invalid Conditions . . . . .	207
§ 5-17. Confessional Stipulation . . . . .	208
§ 5-18. Discharge in Lieu of Court-Martial . . . . .	209
PART VI. DEFENSE DISCOVERY AND REQUESTS FOR WITNESSES	
§ 5-19. General . . . . .	210
§ 5-20. Defense Discovery . . . . .	210
§ 5-20(A). The Charge Sheet . . . . .	210
§ 5-20(B). ABA Standards Requiring Disclosure of Evidence . . . . .	211
§ 5-20(C). The <i>Brady</i> Request . . . . .	212
§ 5-20(D). Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure . . . . .	212
§ 5-20(E). The Article 32 Investigation . . . . .	213
§ 5-20(F). The Military Rules of Evidence Notice Requirements . . . . .	213
§ 5-20(G). The Jencks Act . . . . .	214
§ 5-20(H). Motions for Discovery . . . . .	214
§ 5-21. Defense Requests for Witnesses . . . . .	215
§ 5-21(A). General . . . . .	215
§ 5-21(B). Procedures . . . . .	216
Appendix References . . . . .	218
Annotated Bibliography . . . . .	218
CHAPTER 6. ARTICLE 39(a) PRETRIAL SESSION . . . . .	
§ 6-1. General . . . . .	224
§ 6-2. Inquiries by the Military Judge . . . . .	225
§ 6-2(A). Accused's Rights to Counsel . . . . .	226

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 6-2(B). Challenge of the Military Judge . . . .	227
§ 6-2(C). Request for Trial by Military Judge Alone . . . . .	227
§ 6-2(D). Request for Enlisted Members on the Court . . . . .	228
§ 6-3. Arraignment . . . . .	230
§ 6-4. Motions . . . . .	231
§ 6-4(A). Notice, Waiver, and Burden of Proof .	231
§ 6-4(B). Motions to Dismiss . . . . .	232
§ 6-4(B)(1). Lack of Jurisdiction . . . .	232
§ 6-4(B)(2). Statute of Limitations . .	233
§ 6-4(B)(3). Speedy Trial . . . . .	233
§ 6-4(B)(4). Lack of Mental Responsibility . . . . .	237
§ 6-4(B)(5). Former Jeopardy . . . . .	238
§ 6-4(B)(6). Failure to Allege an Offense . . . . .	239
§ 6-4(B)(7). Former Punishment . . . .	239
§ 6-4(B)(8). Grant of Immunity . . . .	240
§ 6-4(B)(9). Constructive Condonation of Desertion . . . . .	241
§ 6-4(B)(10). Multiplicity . . . . .	241
§ 6-4(C). Motions to Suppress . . . . .	241
§ 6-4(C)(1). Pretrial Statements of the Accused . . . . .	243
§ 6-4(C)(2). Illegal Searches and Seizures . . . . .	244
§ 6-4(C)(3). Eyewitness Identifica- tion . . . . .	244
§ 6-4(D). Motions to Grant Appropriate Relief .	245
§ 6-4(D)(1). Accused Incompetent to Stand Trial . . . . .	245
§ 6-4(D)(2). Pretrial Confinement . . .	246
§ 6-4(D)(3). Change of Venue . . . . .	246
§ 6-4(D)(4). Defective Pretrial Investigation or Pretrial Advice . . . . .	247
§ 6-4(D)(5). Defective Pleadings . . . .	247
§ 6-4(D)(6). Severance . . . . .	248



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
§ 6-4(D)(7). Request for Individual Military Counsel . . . . .	248
§ 6-4(D)(8). Request for Witnesses . . . . .	249
§ 6-4(D)(9). Discovery . . . . .	249
§ 6-4(E). Motions in Limine . . . . .	250
§ 6-4(F). Rulings on Motions . . . . .	251
§ 6-4(G). Reconsideration of Rulings . . . . .	251
§ 6-4(H). Appeal of Rulings: Extraordinary Writs . . . . .	252
§ 6-5. Pleas . . . . .	253
§ 6-5(A). Not Guilty Pleas . . . . .	254
§ 6-5(B). Guilty Pleas . . . . .	254
§ 6-5(B)(1). Effect of Guilty Plea . . . . .	255
§ 6-5(B)(2). The <i>Care</i> Providency Inquiry . . . . .	256
§ 6-5(B)(3). The <i>Green-King</i> Pretrial Agreement Inquiry . . . . .	258
§ 6-5(B)(4). Improvident Guilty Pleas . . . . .	260
§ 6-5(B)(5). Entry of Findings . . . . .	263
§ 6-5(C). Irregular Pleas . . . . .	263
Appendix References . . . . .	265
Annotated Bibliography . . . . .	265

CHAPTER 7. TRIAL PROCEDURES . . . . . 269

PART I. INTRODUCTION

§ 7-1. General . . . . .	271
§ 7-2. The Participants . . . . .	271
§ 7-2(A). The Accused . . . . .	272
§ 7-2(B). Defense Counsel . . . . .	272
§ 7-2(C). Trial Counsel . . . . .	273
§ 7-2(D). Military Judge . . . . .	274
§ 7-2(E). Court Members . . . . .	274
§ 7-2(F). Court Reporter . . . . .	275
§ 7-2(G). Interpreter . . . . .	276
§ 7-3. Courts-Martial and the Media . . . . .	276
§ 7-4. Motions at Trial . . . . .	277
§ 7-4(A). Continuances . . . . .	277
§ 7-4(B). Mistrial . . . . .	278