

OXFORD COMMENTARIES ON
THE GATT/WTO AGREEMENTS

TRADE RELATED
ASPECTS OF
INTELLECTUAL
PROPERTY RIGHTS

A Commentary on the
TRIPS Agreement

CARLOS M. CORREA

Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights

A Commentary on the TRIPS Agreement

CARLOS M. CORREA

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© C. Correa, 2007

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Correa, Carlos.

Trade related aspects of intellectual property rights : a commentary on the TRIPS
agreement / Carlos Correa.

p. cm. — (Oxford commentaries on international law)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-19-927128-3 (hardback : alk. paper) 1. Agreement on Trade-Related
Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (1994) 2. Intellectual property (International
law) 3. Foreign trade regulation. I. Title.

K1401.A41994C68 2007

346.7304'8—dc22

2007008575

Typeset by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd., Chennai, India

Printed in Great Britain

on acid-free paper by

Antony Rowe Ltd., Chippenham, Wiltshire

ISBN 978-0-19-927128-3

1 3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

OXFORD COMMENTARIES ON INTERNATIONAL LAW

General Editors: *Professor Philip Alston*, Professor of International Law at New York University, and *Professor Vaughan Lowe*, Chichele Professor of Public International Law in the University of Oxford and Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.

Sub-Series:

OXFORD COMMENTARIES ON THE GATT/WTO AGREEMENTS

General Editor: *Professor Robert Howse*, Professor of International Law at the University of Michigan.

Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights

To Liliana, for her permanent support and tolerance of my intense travel and long working hours, and to my children Julia, Carlos, Laura, Juan, Elisa and Carolina.

Preface

The Agreement on Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights ('the TRIPS Agreement') sets out a number of obligations that the Members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) need to comply with when designing their intellectual property regimes. Unlike the other components of the system, the TRIPS Agreement does not aim at liberalizing trade, but at establishing rules for the appropriation of intellectual assets and the control over the production and trade of the products derived therefrom.

The TRIPS Agreement stipulates (except with regard to transitional periods and technical assistance) the same rules for developed and developing countries. Given the profound asymmetries existing amongst WTO members in their levels of development, particularly as regards their scientific and technological base, it is not surprising that this Agreement became one of the most controversial pieces of the multilateral trade system. An appropriate interpretation of its provisions is essential, therefore, to ensure a balance between the public interests and those of right holders.

This book provides elements for the interpretation and application of the TRIPS Agreement, having in view the implications of different provisions in various sectors of the economy. The analysis is based on the rules of interpretation codified in the Vienna Convention on the Law of the Treaties. It aims at clarifying the content and scope of the obligations created by the Agreement, as well as the room available to governments to adapt their legal regimes to different circumstances and policy objectives.

A basic notion underlying this book is that the TRIPS Agreement does not set forth a uniform law on intellectual property; rather it stipulates a set of minimum standards that may be differently implemented in Member countries, while it leaves many aspects to the discretion of national laws. As result, there are different legal options that may be chosen, within certain limits, in implementing the Agreement to develop national intellectual property systems that promote a competitive environment for innovation and the diffusion of new products and technologies.

The book provides commentaries on each of the provisions of the Agreement taking into account, where available, the rulings of WTO panels and the Appellate Body. Inevitably, the analysis builds on my previous work on the subject.¹ I am thankful to all who have contributed to the analysis of the Agreement from different

¹ See, eg 'Review of the TRIPS Agreement and transfer of technology to developing countries', in K Gallagher (editor), *Putting Development First. The Importance of Policy Space in the WTO and IFIs*, (2005: London and New York, ZED Books); 'The TRIPS Agreement from the perspective of developing countries', in P Macrory, A Appleton, and M Plummer (editors), *The World Trade Organization: Legal, Economic and Political Analysis*, (2005: New York, Springer); 'Managing the

positions and perspectives, and to the various organizations that have allowed me to be closely related to the inception and implementation of the TRIPS Agreement.

Carlos M. Correa
Buenos Aires
November, 2006

Provision of Knowledge: The Design of Intellectual Property Laws', in I Kaul, P Conceicao, K Le Gouven, and R Mendoza (editors), *Providing Global Public Goods—Managing Globalization*, (2003: New York, Oxford University Press); 'Pro-competitive measures under the TRIPS Agreement to promote technology diffusion in developing countries', in P Drahos and R Mayne (editors), *Global Intellectual Property Rights: Knowledge Access and Development*, (2002: New York, Palgrave and Oxfam GB); 'TRIPS and access to drugs: toward a solution for developing countries without manufacturing capacity?', Emory International Review, vol 17, No. 2, Summer, 2003; *Protection of data submitted for the registration of pharmaceuticals. Implementing the standards of the TRIPS Agreement*, (2002: Geneva, South Centre/WHO); 'Internationalization of the patent system and new technologies', Wisconsin International Law Journal, vol. 20. No. 3, 2002; 'Fair use in the digital era', International Review of Industrial Property and Copyright Law, vol. 33, No. 5/2002; Implementation of the WHO General Council Decision on paragraph 6 of the Doha declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, (2004: Geneva, WHO); 'Protection of geographical indications in the CARICOM countries' Caribbean Regional Negotiating Machinery, 2002, available at <www.crn.m.org/documents/studies/Geographical%20 Indications%20-%20Correa.pdf>; Implications of the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and public health, (2002: Geneva, WHO); Implementation of the WHO General Council Decision on paragraph 6 of the Doha declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, (2004: Geneva, WHO); author's contributions to UNCTAD-ICTSD, *Resource Book on TRIPS and Development* (2005: New York, Cambridge University Press); *Integrating public health concerns into patent legislation in developing countries*, (2000: south centre, Geneva); 'Intellectual property in the field of integrated circuits: implications for developing countries', World Competition, Vol.14, N1 2, December 1990.

List of Abbreviations

| | |
|----------|---|
| AB | Appellate Body |
| BIT | Bilateral Investment Treaty |
| CAFTA-DR | Dominican Republic–Central America Free Trade Agreement |
| DSU | Dispute Settlement Understanding |
| ECJ | European Court of Justice |
| EMRs | Exclusive marketing rights |
| FDI | foreign direct investment |
| FTAA | Free Trade Area of the Americas |
| FTAs | free trade agreements |
| GATT | General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade |
| IP | intellectual property |
| IPR/IPRs | intellectual property rights |
| ITC | International Trade Commission |
| LDCs | least-developed countries |
| MAI | Multilateral Agreement on Investment |
| MFN | most-favoured nation |
| NAFTA | North American Free Trade Agreement |
| OEM | original equipment manufacturer |
| R&D | research and development |
| TK | traditional knowledge |
| TOT | transfer of technology |
| TRIPS | Trade-related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights |
| UPOV | International Union for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants |
| VCLT | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties |
| WCT | WIPO Copyright Treaty |
| WIPO | World Intellectual Property Organization |
| WPPT | WIPO Performances and Phonograms Treaty |
| WTO | World Trade Organization |

Table of Cases

| | |
|---|---------------|
| Adams v Burke, 84 US 453 (17 Wall) (1873) | 85 |
| Alappat, <i>In re</i> , 33 F 3d 1526, Fed Cir 1994 | 279 |
| Alkylendiamine II, German Federal Court, 25 June 1976 | 345 |
| Aluminum Wheels: Jap-Auto Products v BBS Kraftfahrzeug Technik AG, Hanrei Jiho (Supreme Court, 1 July 1997) | 82 |
| Amgen v Chugai Pharmaceutical Co., 927 F.2d 1200, 18 USPQ2d 1016 (Fed. Cir.), cert. denied, 502 U.S. 856 (1991) | 295 |
| AT&T Corp v Excel Communications, Inc, 172 F3d 1352, Fed Cir 1999 | 279 |
| Atlantic Works v Brady, 107 US (Otto) 192, 1883 | 276 |
| Bayer Inc v The General Attorney of Canada, the Minister of Health, Apotex Inc and Novopharm Ltd, 19 May 1999 | 385 |
| British Horseracing Board Ltd v William Hill Organisation Ltd, Case C 203/02 [2004] ECR I-10415 | 126 |
| Campbell v Acuff-Rose (92ñ1292), 510 US 569 (1994) | 141 |
| Cuno Engineering Corp, 314 US 84, 51 USPQ 1, 1941 | 276 |
| Diamond v Bradley, U.S. Supreme Court, 450 U.S. 381, 1981 | 278 |
| Diamond v Diehr, U.S. Supreme Court, 450 U.S. 175 1981 | 278 |
| Dr. Karl Thomae Gesellschaft mit Beschränker Haftung c/Instituto Nacional de la propiedad Industrial s/denegatoria de patente of 13 February 2001, Argentine Supreme Court of Justice | 22 |
| Du Pont Powder Company v Masland, 244 US 100, 61 L Ed 1016, 37 S Ct 575 (1917) | 367 |
| Ebay Inc. et al v Merceexchange, LLC of 15 May 2006; 401 F 3d 1323 | 417, 423, 424 |
| EI du Pont de Nemours and Co v INPI, Third Jurisdiction No 2004/0053855-05 (Brazilian Court) | 492 |
| Eldred v Ashcroft, 537 US 186 | 134 |
| EMI Records v CBS Schallplatten GmbH, 1976 ECR, reproduced in (1976) 7 IIC 275 | 89 |
| Ets-Hokin v Skyy Spirits Inc, 225 F 3d 1068 (9th Cir 2000) | 121 |
| Feist Publication Inc v Rural Telephone Services, III S Ct 1282, 1991; 499 US 340, 1991 | 38, 122, 127 |
| Fixtures Marketing Ltd v Organismos Prognostikon Agonon Podosfairou AE (OPAP), Case C 444/02 [2004] ECR I-10549 | 126 |
| Fixtures Marketing Ltd v Oy Veikkauks Ab, Case C 46/02 [2004] ECR I-10365 | 126 |
| Fixtures Marketing Ltd v Svenska Spel Ab, Case C 338/02 [2004] ECR I-10497 | 126 |
| FTC v Borden Company, U.S. Supreme Court, 383 U.S. 637 (1966) | 202 |
| Golan v Ashcroft, No. CIV.A.01-B-1854, 2004 WL 615569 (D Colo 15 Mar 2004) | 510 |
| Great Atlantic & Pacific Tea Co v Supermarket Equipment Co, 340 US 147, 87 USPQ 303, 950 | 276 |
| HARVARD/Onco-mouse, T19/90 [1990] E.P.O.R. 501 | 289, 290 |
| IR v IXYS, Fed. Cir. 2004 (04-1014) | 424 |
| Junguersen v Ostby & Barton Co, 335 US 560, 80 USPQ 32 (1949) | 276 |
| Kodak SA v Jumbo-Markt AG, 4C.24/1999/rnd, 7 December 1999 | 79 |
| Lubrizol/Hybrid Plants, Case T320/87 [1990] EPOR 173 | 293 |
| Madey v Duke, 64 USPQ 2d 1737 (Fed Cir 2002) | 304 |
| Merck & Co v Primecrown Ltd, Joined Cases C-267/95 and C-268/95 [1996] ECR I-6285 | 82, 86 |

| | |
|--|---------|
| Merck KGaA v Integra Lifesciences Ltd, et al Supreme Court (03-1237) 331 F.3d 860 of 13 June 2005 | .417 |
| Parfums Christian Dior SA and Tuk Consultancy BV, Joined Cases C-300/98 and C-392/98 [2000] ECR I-11307 | .23, 38 |
| Parfums Givency, Inc v Drug Emporium, Inc, 38 F.3d 477 | .440 |
| Pharmon v Hoechst, Case 19/84 [1985] ECR 2281 | .82 |
| Phil Collins, OJ EC N C312/3, 18 November 1993 | .259 |
| PLANT GENETIC SYSTEMS/Glutamine synthetase inhibitors, T356/93 [1995] EPOR 357 | .288 |
| Portugal v Council, Case C-149/96 [1999] ECR I-8395 | .23 |
| Roche Products Inc v Bolar Pharmaceutical Co, 733 F.2d 858, Fed Cir, cert denied 469 US 856, 1984 | .305 |
| Ruckelshaus v Monsanto Co, 467 US 986, 104 S Ct 2862, 26 June 1984 | .385 |
| Sega v Accolade, CA 9, No 92-15655, 20.10.92 | .125 |
| State Street Bank v Signature Financial Group, 149 F.3d 1368, Fed Cir 1998 | .279 |
| Tele-Direct (Publ'ns) Inc v American Bus Infor Inc (1997) [1998] 2 F.C. 22 (Fed. Ct. App.) | .122 |
| Thai Cigarette Case, BISD 37th Supp 200 | .106 |
| Theberge v Galeries d'Art du Petit Champlain Inc [2002] 2 SCR 336 | .135 |
| Unilever NV c/Instituto Nacional de la propiedad Industrial s/denegatoria de patente of 24 October 2000, Argentine Supreme Court of Justice | .22 |
| Unilever NV v Instituto Nacional de Propiedad Industrial s/denegatoria de patente, reproduced in El Derecho, 2 August 2001 | .27 |
| University of London Press v University Tutorial Press Ltd, 1916, 2 Ch 601, 86 LJCh 107, 115 LT 301, 13 Digest (Repl) 55, 53 | .122 |

TABLE OF PANEL AND APPELLATE BODY REPORTS

| | |
|--|---|
| Argentina—Certain Measures on the Protection of Patents and Test Data, WT/DS196, 30 May 2000 | .86 |
| Argentina—Certain measures on the protection of patents and test data: Request for Consultations by the United States WT/DS196/1 IP/D/22, 6 June 2000 | .514 |
| Argentina—Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals and Test Data Protection for Agricultural Chemicals, WT/DS171, 6 May 1999 | .86 |
| Argentina—Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear, WT/DS121/AB/R (2000) | .18, 93 |
| Brazil—Measures Affecting Patent Protection, Request for the Establishment of a Panel by the United States, WT/DS199/3, 9 January 2001 | .286 |
| Brazil—Measures Affecting Patent Protection, Notification of Mutually Agreed Solution, WT/DS199/4, G/L/454, IP/D/23/Add.1, 19 July 2001 | .286 |
| European Communities—Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Products, WT/DS153/1, 2 December 1998 | .26 |
| Canada—Certain Measures Concerning Periodicals, AB-1997-2, WT/DS31/AB/R, | .57, 110 |
| Canada—Patent Protection of Pharmaceutical Products WT/DS114/R, 17 March 2000 | .4, 6, 18, 26, 29, 30, 48, 50, 51, 55, 61, 71, 93, 101, 102, 194, 263, 273, 282, 283, 309, 310, 311, 412, 483, 485, 486 |
| Canada—Term of patent protection WTO/DS170/AB/R, 5 May 2000 | .61, 344, 483, 507 |
| EC—Measures affecting the approval and marketing of biotech products WT/DS291/R, WT/DS292/R, WT/DS293/R | .414 |
| EC—Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products, WT/DS135/AB/R, 12 March 2001 | .107, 327 |

| | |
|--|---|
| EC—Protection of trademarks and geographical indications for agricultural products and foodstuffs, WT/DS174/R, 15 March 2005 | 42, 43, 53, 55, 57, 186, 227 |
| EC—Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas, WT/DS27/AB/R (1997) | 480 |
| EC—Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas—Recourse to Arbitration by the European Communities under Article 22.6 of the DSU, WT/DS27/ARB/ECU, 24 March 2000 | 47, 480 |
| India—Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products, WT/DS50/R | 5, 109, 474, 475, 477, 484, 485, 487, 492 |
| India—Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products, WT/DS50/AB/R, 19 December 1997 | 28, 474, 483, 485, 489 |
| India—Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products, WT/DS79/R, 1998 | 483 |
| Indonesia—Cars WT/DS54/R, WT/DS55/R, WT/DS59/R, WT/DS64/R, 2 July 1998 | 57, 62, 201 |
| Korea—Dairy Safeguard, WT/DS98/AB/R, 14 December 1999 | 17, 18 |
| United States—Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products, WT/DS58/AB/R (1998) | 18, 50 |
| United States—Imports of Certain Automotive Spring Assemblies, L/5333, BISD 308/107, 26 May 1983 | 64 |
| United States—Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline, WT/DS 52 and WT/DS4 | 64 |
| United States—Restrictions on Imports of Cotton and Man-made Fibre Underwear, WT/DS24/R, 8 November 1996 | 474 |
| United States—Section 110(5) of the US Copyright Act, WT/DS160/R, 15 June 2000 | 5, 6, 27, 30, 49, 51, 54, 137, 139, 144, 145, 146, 148, 149, 150, 154, 157, 159, 194, 195, 308, 310, 484, 487 |
| United States—Section 211 Omnibus Appropriations Act of 1998, WT/DS176/AB/R (Havana Club Case) | 33, 35, 37, 45, 49, 52, 53, 54, 56, 65, 66, 176, 178, 179, 184, 185, 188, 201, 419, 484, 487 |
| United States—Section 301–310 of the Trade Act of 1974, WT/DS152/R (2000) | 480 |
| United States—Section 337 of the Tariff Act of 1930, Panel Report adopted 7 November 1989, BISD 36S/345 | 54, 285 |
| United States—US Patents Code, WT/DS224/1, 7 February 2001 | 286 |

Table of International Instruments and National Laws

WTO AGREEMENTS

| | |
|---|---|
| Agreement Between the World Intellectual Property Organization and the World Trade Organization | 476 |
| Agreement Establishing the WTO | 1, 45, 68, 246, 247, 281 |
| Preamble | 89, 92 |
| para 3 | 2 |
| Art II:2 | 57, 110 |
| Art IV:2 | 498 |
| Art IX:1 | 498 |
| para 3-4 | 498 |
| Art X | 325 |
| Art X, para 6 | 519 |
| Annex 1C | 9 |
| Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures | 448 |
| Art 11.9 | 448 |
| Antidumping Agreement | 448 |
| Art 5.8 | 448 |
| General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) | 57, 78, 150 |
| Art VIII | 398 |
| Art IX | 398 |
| General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs 1947 | 4, 5, 484, 485 |
| Art IX.6 | 4, |
| Art XII.3 | 4 |
| Art XVIII.10 | 4 |
| Art X | 472 |
| Art XX(d) | 2, 4 |
| General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs Tokyo Round 1973-1979 | 9 |
| General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs Uruguay Round 1986-1993 | 1, 14 |
| General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs 1994 | 1, 4, 5, 10, 13, 15, 16, 57, 78, 150, 285, 353, 398, 480 |
| Art I | 65 |
| Art III | 6, 56 |
| Art III.4 | 55, 57, 58 |
| Art IX.6 | 5 |
| Art X | 4, 473, 479 |
| Art X.1 | 474 |
| Art X.2 | 474 |
| Art XI | 6, 89 |
| Art XI:1 | 106 |
| Art XIV | 68 |
| Art XIV ^{bis} | 520 |
| Art XIX | 18 |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Art XX | 64, 106, 107, 110 |
| (b) | 106, 107, 109, 316 |
| (d) | 7 |
| (g) | 50 |
| Art XXI | 520 |
| Art XXII | 4, 479 |
| Art XXIII | 4, 479 |
| Art XXIII.1(b) | 488, 490 |
| (c) | 488, 490 |
| Art XXIII.3 | 488 |
| Art XXIV | 68 |
| TRIPS Agreement | 1, 5, 10, 12, 13, 15, 18, 23, 36 |
| Pts I-IV | 45 |
| Pt I | 31, 46, 93 |
| ss 1-7 | 31, 33 |
| ss 2-4 | 92 |
| Pt II | 45, 46, 56, 81 |
| ss 1-7 | 35, 37, 68, 69 |
| s 1 | 92, 115, 139, 259 |
| ss 2-6 | 467 |
| s 2 | 32, 174, 470 |
| s 3 | 237, 246 |
| s 4 | 264, 268 |
| s 5 | 31, 33, 268, 499 |
| s 6 | 352, 353 |
| s 7 | 32, 366, 377, 496, 499 |
| Pt III | 24, 31, 45, 46, 56, 81, 174, 175, 186, 197, 409, 410, 411, 417, 418, 425, 475 |
| s 2 | 432 |
| Pt IV | 45, 46, 56, 81, 183 |
| Preamble | 1, 11, 43, 89, 104 |
| First Recital | 4 |
| para 1 | 7 |
| para 2 | 4, 14 |
| para 4 | 6 |
| Art 1 | 29, 241, 427 |
| Art 1.1 | 4, 9, 22, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 102, 128, 261, 409, 410, 420, 495 |
| Art 1.2 | 31, 33, 34, 35, 37, 38, 46, 62, 126, 366, 375, 399 |
| Art 1.3 | 40, 43, 157, 505 |
| Art 2 | 41, 199, 356 |
| Art 2.1 | 33, 34, 38, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 55, 56, 67, 180, 201 |
| Art 2.2 | 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 126, 138, 144, 157, 179, 352 |
| Art 2.5 | 125 |
| Art 3 | 9, 26, 33, 53, 54, 55, 56, 61, 62, 73, 78, 80, 227, 315, 356, 491, 492 |
| Art 3.1 | 32, 43, 45, 51, 53, 55, 57, 62, 227, 258, 352, 505 |
| Art 3.2 | 52, 63, 64 |
| Art 4 | 9, 26, 33, 61, 65, 70, 72, 73, 78, 80, 315, 356, 491, 492 |
| (c) | 62 |
| (d) | 70, 71, 200, 505 |
| Art 5 | 9, 31, 67, 72, 73, 356, 491, 492 |
| Art 6 | 3, 31, 78, 79, 80, 82, 84, 187, 297, 356, 359, 440 |
| Art 6.3 | 356 |

| | |
|---------------------|--|
| Art 7 | 4, 7, 30, 31, 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, 97, 99, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 108, 109, 110, 282, 286, 309, 310, 356, 400, 485, 486 |
| Art 7.1 | 126 |
| Art 8 | 31, 92, 93, 94, 97, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 108, 110, 310, 318 |
| Art 8.1 | 4, 6, 30, 48, 93, 99, 102, 103, 104, 105, 107, 108, 109, 110, 200, 282, 412, 478, 485, 486 |
| Art 8.2 | 104, 110, 112, 146, 397, 398, 399, 401, 430 |
| Art 9.1 | 47, 55, 116, 118, 122, 126, 138, 144, 146, 147, 148, 267 |
| Art 9.2 | 116, 119, 120, 121, 122, 124 |
| Art 10 | 227 |
| Art 10.1 | 123, 124, 126, 132 |
| Art 10.2 | 38, 125, 126 |
| Art 11 | 128, 129, 130, 136, 137, 165, 512 |
| Art 12 | 131, 132, 133 |
| Art 12a(2)(b) | 227 |
| Art 13 | 30, 92, 130, 131, 134, 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 140, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148, 149, 150, 151, 152, 155, 157, 167, 194, 267 |
| Art 14 | 155, 156, 166 |
| Art 14.1 | 157, 158, 159, 160, 161, 162, 165, 167, 510 |
| Art 14.2 | 156, 162, 510 |
| Art 14.3 | 162, 163, 418, 510 |
| Art 14.4 | 131, 137, 164, 165, 166, 167, 512 |
| Art 14.5 | 166 |
| Art 14.6 | 157, 166, 167, 168, 510 |
| Art 15 | 184 |
| Art 15.1 | 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 186, 188, 202 |
| Art 15.2 | 178, 179, 180 |
| Art 15.3 | 180, 181, 182, 184, 467 |
| Art 15.4 | 180, 182 |
| Art 15.5 | 178, 183, 184, 186 |
| Art 16 | 182, 184, 227, 228 |
| Art 16.1 | 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 197, 266, 418, 419 |
| Art 16.2 | 188, 189, 190, 192 |
| Art 16.3 | 192, 193 |
| Art 17 | 108, 193, 194, 195 |
| Art 18 | 196, 268 |
| Art 19 | 196, 197, 198, 199 |
| Art 19.1 | 197 |
| Art 19.2 | 198, 468 |
| Art 20 | 62, 187, 199, 200, 201 |
| Art 21 | 45, 201, 202, 203, 299, 425 |
| Art 22 | 226, 228, 231, 232 |
| Art 22.1 | 217, 219, 221, 233, 236, 239 |
| Art 22.2 | 221, 223, 231, 233, 375 |
| (a) | 221, 226, 228, 229, 230 |
| (b) | 225, 229 |
| Art 22.3 | 230, 231, 234, 471 |
| Art 22.4 | 231, 234, 239 |
| Art 23 | 216, 221, 234, 241 |
| Art 23.1 | 232, 232, 233, 241, 248 |

| | |
|----------------|--|
| Art 23.2 | 234, 248, 250 |
| Art 23.3 | 234, 235 |
| Art 23.4 | 209, 235, 235, 236, 240, 505 |
| Art 24 | 227, 241, 242, 247 |
| Art 24.1 | 235, 240, 241, 242 |
| Art 24.2 | 246, 247, 505 |
| Art 24.3 | 247, 248 |
| Art 24.4 | 217, 231, 248, 249, 251 |
| Art 24.5 | 231, 249, 250 |
| Art 24.6 | 239, 250, 251 |
| Art 24.7 | 251 |
| Art 24.8 | 252 |
| Art 24.9 | 252 |
| Art 25 | 257 |
| Art 25.1 | 260, 261, 262, 263, 264 |
| Art 25.2 | 264, 265 |
| Art 26 | 257, 266, 268 |
| Art 26.1 | 259, 265, 266, 418 |
| Art 26.2 | 266, 267, 268 |
| Art 26.3 | 266, 268 |
| Art 27 | 282 |
| Art 27.1 | 26, 45, 48, 71, 121, 182, 262, 271, 272, 273, 274, 275, 276, 278, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 287, 295, 307, 318, 512, 513 |
| Art 27.2 | 105, 182, 287, 288, 289, 290, 291 |
| Art 27.3 | 281, 292 |
| (a) | 292 |
| (b) | 25, 33, 36, 37, 246, 287, 293, 294, 410 |
| Art 28 | 7, 79, 80, 86, 102, 283, 295, 299, 485 |
| Art 28.1 | 187, 266, 285, 294, 295, 297, 299, 331, 359, 418, 489 |
| (a) | 82 |
| (b) | 298, 496 |
| Art 28.2 | 295, 299 |
| Art 29 | 300, 301, 302 |
| Art 29.1 | 300 |
| Art 29.2 | 300, 302 |
| Art 30 | 4, 6, 49, 50, 51, 94, 100, 102, 104, 108, 194, 267, 283, 303, 305, 306, 307, 310, 311, 485, 486, 487 |
| Art 30.3 | 381 |
| Art 31 | 48, 100, 104, 109, 283, 299, 311, 313, 314, 315, 318, 320, 332, 333, 425, 508, 512, 513 |
| (a)-(k) | 361 |
| (a) | 320 |
| (b) | 183, 316, 329, 333 |
| (c) | 320, 362 |
| (f) | 2, 85, 86, 321, 325, 332, 337, 340 |
| (g) | 321, 323, 519 |
| (h) | 317, 332, 425, 512, 519 |
| (i) | 323, 342, 471, 472 |
| (j) | 416 |
| (k) | 325, 398 |
| (l) | 317 |

| | |
|------------------|---|
| Art 31bis | 324, 325, 518 |
| Art 32 | 342, 343 |
| Art 33 | 268, 343, 344, 491, 495 |
| Art 34.1 | 187, 344, 345, 421 |
| Art 34.2 | 344 |
| Art 34.3 | 344, 413 |
| Art 35 | 55, 352, 354, 356, 357, 359 |
| Art 36 | 355, 357, 358, 360, 418 |
| Art 37 | 360 |
| Art 37.1 | 361, 426 |
| Art 37.2 | 357, 361, 425 |
| Art 38.1 | 362 |
| Art 38.2 | 362 |
| Art 38.3 | 362 |
| Art 39 | 12, 32, 367, 368, 369, 372, 375, 377, 381, 388, 479 |
| Art 39.1 | 32, 366, 367, 368, 383, 387, 388, 389 |
| Art 39.2 | 368, 369, 370, 371, 372, 373, 377, 479 |
| Art 39.3 | 32, 38, 62, 94, 104, 342, 368, 374, 375, 377, 378, 379, 380, 381, 382, 383, 384, 385, 387, 389, 390, 391 |
| Art 40 | 31, 94, 300, 395, 399, 400, 423 |
| Art 40.1 | 398, 399, 400, 401, 402 |
| Art 40.2 | 400, 401, 402, 403, 404, 430 |
| Art 40.3 | 400, 404, 405, 406, 478 |
| Art 40.4 | 405, 406 |
| Arts 41-48 | 432 |
| Art 41 | 430 |
| Art 41.1 | 410, 411, 412, 430, 437 |
| Art 41.2 | 265, 413, 414, 415, 472 |
| Art 41.3 | 414, 415, 416, 442, 444 |
| Art 41.4 | 233, 415, 416, 512 |
| Art 41.5 | 410, 416, 417, 468, 470 |
| Art 42 | 32, 35, 160, 233, 413, 417, 418, 419, 442, 446 |
| Art 43 | 345, 413, 420 |
| Art 43.1 | 421, 422 |
| Art 43.2 | 422 |
| Art 44 | 412, 422 |
| Art 44.1 | 415, 423, 424, 444 |
| Art 44.2 | 317, 333, 424, 425, 425, 437 |
| Art 45 | 412, 426 |
| Art 45.1 | 412, 427, 431 |
| Art 45.2 | 426, 427, 431 |
| Art 46 | 412, 427, 428, 429, 441, 448, 449 |
| Art 47 | 429, 430 |
| Art 48.1 | 430, 431, 432, 437 |
| Art 48.2 | 430, 431, 432, 447, 447 |
| Art 49 | 432, 438 |
| Art 50 | 29, 410, 411, 413, 418, 423, 433, 434, 438, 440, 442 |
| Art 50.1 | 39, 421 |
| (a) | 415 |
| (c) | 444 |
| Art 50.2 | 435 |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Art 50.3 | 94, 430, 431, 434, 436 |
| Art 50.4 | 415, 436, 437, 442 |
| Art 50.5 | 437 |
| Art 50.6 | 437, 445 |
| Art 50.7 | 434, 437 |
| Art 50.8 | 437 |
| Arts 51-60 | 447 |
| Art 51 | 46, 84, 175, 411, 423, 434, 438, 439, 440, 441, |
| Art 52 | 441, 442 |
| Art 53 | 442 |
| Art 53.1 | 443 |
| Art 53.2 | 430, 443, 445 |
| Art 54 | 183, 444 |
| Art 55 | 443, 444, 445, 447 |
| Art 56 | 445 |
| Art 57 | 446 |
| Art 58 | 183, 440, 446, 447 |
| (a) | 447 |
| (b) | 447 |
| (c) | 447 |
| Art 59 | 441, 447, 449 |
| Art 60 | 448 |
| Art 61 | 175, 411, 441, 448, 449, 450 |
| Art 62 | 467 |
| Art 62.1 | 467 |
| Art 62.2 | 468, 469 |
| Art 62.3 | 175, 470 |
| Art 62.4 | 414, 470, 471 |
| Art 62.5 | 416 |
| Art 63 | 227, 472, 492 |
| Art 63.1 | 71, 415, 430, 472, 473, 474, 475, 477, 506 |
| Art 63.2 | 16, 477, 505, 517 |
| Art 63.3 | 475, 478 |
| Art 63.4 | 478, 479 |
| Art 63 ^{ter} (3)(a) | 477 |
| Art 64 | 319, 472, 492 |
| Art 64.2 | 488 |
| Art 64.3 | 490 |
| Art 64.4 | 479 |
| Art 65 | 227, 241, 294, 494, 511, 515, 516 |
| Art 65.1 | 491, 492, 494 |
| Art 65.2 | 246, 491, 492, 493, 494 |
| Art 65.3 | 491, 492, 493, 494 |
| Art 65.4 | 281, 491, 493, 494, 515 |
| Art 65.4 | 9, 507 |
| Art 65.5 | 247, 248, 494, 495, 499 |
| Art 66 | 241, 500 |
| Art 66.1 | 495, 496, 497, 498, 499, 500, 505 |
| Art 66.2 | 9, 500, 501, 502 |
| Art 66.3 | 495, 499 |
| Art 66.4 | 495, 499 |