Guidance and Personnel Services in Education

By ANNA Y. REED

Professor Emeritus in New York University Resident Lecturer at Cornell University



Ithaca, New York
CORNELL UNIVERSITY PRESS
1944

COPYRIGHT, 1944, BY CORNELL UNIVERSITY

FIRST PRINTING, AUGUST, 1944 SECOND PRINTING, DECEMBER, 1944

Cornell University Press

London: Humphrey Milford Oxford University Press

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BY THE VAIL-BALLOU PRESS, INC., BINGHAMTON, N. Y.

PREFACE

This volume is the result of the study and experiences which have completely monopolized the author's interest and which have provided her with both work and play, throughout the some thirty-five years during which the theories and practices of the organized guidance and personnel movement have been making their imprint on the social and economic life of the country, and recording their story in the literature of the day.

Preparation of the volume has been a long-anticipated pleasure—a pleasure which has been augmented by the opportunity which delay has given for association with many mature students who were traveling in the same general direction but by a variety of routes. The seminar hours which have been passed in the company of these fellow travelers, where the give and take of true scholarship has always prevailed, have been a continuous spur to achievement and a challenge to maximum effort. The author acknowledges her indebtedness to, and thanks, all those students who, by their own high standards of scholarship and by their critical judgment of hers, have been indirect contributors to the pages which follow.

Obligations to business men and to business publications, which have given her much practical information to share with these same students, have been recognized at different places throughout the book. The benefits derived from business contributions, without which no guidance program and no treatment of guidance procedures can be complete, will be obvious to readers.

The purpose of the book is to present, as inclusively as the limitations of a single volume permit, the whence, how, and where of the guidance and personnel movement and to question its whither: (1) to tell a unified story, from the original records, of how four segments of a guidance movement came into being during the first decade of the twentieth century and are now waiting for co-ordination and integration; (2) to present the universally recognized principles, practices, tools, and techniques which are essential to the proper understanding and performance of the guidance function; (3) to take stock of the present assets and liabilities of guidance and personnel services, to point out fundamentals and permanent values which are progressively facilitating the fulfillment of

the "promise of America," and to note deficiencies which are calling for authoritative attention.

The book does not purport to be a definitive study. The guidance movement has not, as yet, been sufficiently tested by time for any writer safely to attempt a definitive report and to be dogmatic as to best procedures, or egotistical regarding the value of his own contribution. The frequent use of "must" or "should" in some chapters may leave the impression of dogmatism. It was sometimes difficult to find less positive substitutes; and among the many things which experience has taught this counselor none have been more valuable than the knowledge that in dealing with human problems there is no one best way, but many good, or better, or best ways; and that each counselor is personally responsible for never utilizing a good way when there is a better—or a better way when there is a best.

Although the volume is designed primarily to serve as a textbook, handbook, or guide for the use of graduate classes and seminars in universities, it is hoped that college and public-school teachers, social workers, and administrators, as well as general readers, community counselors, and placement officers may find some helpful suggestions for the better performance of their own personnel responsibilities. For all readers, it is hoped that it may be informative, illuminative, and provocative.

Now and then, in connection with the more generally accepted guidance and personnel procedures, the reader will find something new in approach or method of attack, in heretofore unpublished material, in interpretation, or in method of presentation. But the uniqueness of the volume, and therefore its major contribution and its most permanent values, will be found in content which is either entirely omitted from, or very inadequately treated in, other publications dealing with the same subject. Much of the source content of Part I is not elsewhere available. The author is not aware of any other work which traces the origin of the various guidance and personnel activities of the early twentieth century to a common philosophy based on world-wide social and economic conditions. Nor is she familiar with any other publication which has described the agencies fostering these activities in such fashion that interrelationships are revealed and each agency assigned to its proper position in the total picture.

In Part IV, Chapter XV deals with Placement, a topic usually mentioned only incidentally, while Chapter XVI includes a section on Counseling the Superannuated or Older Worker, a topic usually ignored. Part V, "Organization and Administration," presents an old topic in a

new dress. The author is hopeful that its content may be somewhat disturbing to administrative authorities and sufficiently provocative to bring constructive results.

Part VI, "Retrospect and Prospect," summarizes where, and raises a question as to whither. It is the only section which has given specific attention to guidance and personnel problems related to the present war. A conscious effort has been made to avoid reflecting the problems of the moment. Rather has the author tried to present constants which carry over from one period to the next, helping youth to acquire knowledges, skills, attitudes of mind, and emotional controls which have permanent values and which permit him, and those who counsel him, to take depression, or war, or other emergencies in their stride. The role of a firmly grounded, well-poised, currently informed guidance or personnel service does not change materially during emergencies. Fundamentals remain fundamentals; they are dateless, but accents will shift, ultimate objectives may be held in abeyance, and temporary essential informational data must be acquired and intelligently used.

In anticipation of my retirement from active service as Chairman of the Department of Personnel Administration, School of Education, New York University, in 1940, Richard J. Bailey, who had been my colleague at the University, and I planned to collaborate in the preparation of a series of books which had long been under consideration. Three projects were outlined during the winter of 1940. Some progress had been made in the preparation of this, our first volume, when war intervened and Dr. Bailey's acceptance of a commission as psychologist in the U. S. Maritime Service forbade his continued collaboration. The loss of his assistance, together with the great amount of material which was considered in determining what should be included and the rapidly changing national conditions which have necessitated frequent alterations, accounts for the fact that the volume was not completed until April, 1943. In October, 1943, before the final typescript went to the publisher, it was checked with special reference to statements of fact which time might have rendered inaccurate. Should the reader find some such statement which was overlooked, he is asked to accept both the explanation and the apology of the author.

I am under obligation to Lynn A. Emerson, Professor of Industrial Education, Cornell University, for preparing the charts and to A. L. Winsor, Professor of Psychology, also of Cornell University, for advice on, and the reading of, the portions of the text which deal with the Analysis of the Individual.

Finally, I am grateful to publishers and organizations which have graciously permitted me to use copyrighted material. Their names will be found in the footnotes which identify the passages quoted. The American Management Association deserves special mention for its exceptional generosity.

Anna Y. Reed

Ithaca, New York January 1944

Guidance and Personnel Services Prior to 1916

Chapter I Local Experiments in Youth Guidance

CHAPTER II
Guidance and Personnel Services on the College Level

CHAPTER III
Organizations Interested in Guidance and Personnel Services

CHAPTER IV
Interpretative Summary of Source Material

"In using the word modern I refer to the 1930-37 streamlined version since guidance models prior to 1930 are disappearing even in the hands of the second-hand dealers through junking rather than resale."—DONALD G. PATERSON, 1938.

"Documentary evidence is at hand to prove that all the significant principles, practices, and techniques in use in 1940 were also in use in 1908. Progress has been made in the refinement of the old rather than in the introduction of anything new."—Anna Y. Reed, 1940.

CONTENTS

PART I.—GUIDANCE AND PERSONNEL SERVICES PRIOR TO 1916	
I Local Experiments in Youth Guidance Boston, New York, Cincinnati, Grand Rapids, Philadelphia, Chicago, St. Louis, Minneapolis, Hartford, De Kalb, Omaha, southern cities, New Orleans, California, Salt Lake City, Seattle.	PAGE 1
II Guidance and Personnel Services on the College Level Guidance for college women. — Guidance for college men.	30
III Organizations Interested in Guidance and Personnel Services The National Education Association. — Business organizations. — Public employment offices.	39
IV Interpretative Summary of Source Material Time and place of first experimentation. — Motivation. — Nomenclature. — Definitions and aims. — Functions of vocational guidance. — Tools essential for guidance services. — Techniques for counseling. — Leaders in the early period of organized guidance. — Principles of guidance. — Selection, certification, and preparation of counselors. — Organization and administration. — Evaluation in the early period.	46
PART II.—Information on Educational and Occupational Opportunities and Community Resources	
V Information on Educational Opportunities Possible methods of collecting information on educational opportunities. — Sources of information on educational opportunities: preschool, kindergarten, elementary levels, secondary school or youth level, college and adult level, and opportunities for special education.	71
VI Information on Occupational Opportunities General sources of occupational information. — Criteria for determining the value of occupational information. — Classification of occupational information. — Occupational research: the collection of information from the sources.	84
VII Information on Community Resources	128

VIII	Classifying, Indexing, and Filing Informational Material A private personnel library system. — Other suggestions for indexing and filing. — Educational values inherent in indexing and filing.	PAGE 133
	PART III.—Information about the Individual (Individual Inventory)	
IX	Data on Health, Activities, Teachers' Marks, References and Recommendations, and Work Experiences General sources of information about the individual. — General principles for determining the value of information about individuals. — Essential information about the individual.	149
X	Data Secured from Psychological Testing Definition of a psychological test. — Classification of psychological tests: tests of capacity (intelligence, special aptitude); tests of proficiency (trade, school achievement). — Guidance value of recent research based on achievement testing.	162
XI	Data Secured from Personality Measurement and Appraisals The anecdotal record. — Rating scales. — Inventories and questionnaires. — Tests of personality.	187
XII	Classifying, Recording, and Filing Information about the Individual Types of records. — Record forms. — Record content. — Evaluation of record systems.	204
	PART IV.—METHODS OF UTILIZING INFORMATIONAL DATA	
XIII	Group Methods The purposes of group guidance. — Media for group guidance. — Courses designed to offer guidance services. — Topics suitable for guidance courses. — Informal group guidance programs. — Techniques of group guidance.	219
XIV	The Counseling Interview Classification of interviews. — Preparation for counseling interviews. — Material and psychological factors which condition interviewing. — The approach to the interview. — The content and conduct of the interview. — Recording the interview. — Appraising the interview.	271
XV	Placement Interviews Definitions of placement. — Placement functions. — Placement tools and techniques. — Placement procedures.	302

XVI	Postschool Facilities and Methods Guidance services for beginning wage-earners. — Guidance services for experienced or mature individuals. — Guidance services for older or retired persons.	328
	PART V.—ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATION	
XVII	The Lag in the Assumption of Administrative Responsibility	371
XVIII	Principles of Organization Applicable to Guidance and Personnel Services General principles of organization. — Application of the general principles to guidance and personnel services.	377
XIX	Building the Guidance or Personnel Service A centralized organization to serve decentralized operational units. — A service for a single operational unit. — A service for small towns or rural communities.	402
XX	Evaluating the Guidance or Personnel Service	435
	PART VI.—RETROSPECT AND PROSPECT	
XXI	Retrospect	457
XXII	Prospect	473
Index o	f Subjects	485
Index o	f Names	492

CHAPTER I

Local Experiments in Youth Guidance

Social movements as a rule do not originate; they evolve. They are not set down full-fledged among us, even though such may appear to be the case. Rather, from very small and unimportant beginnings, modified as they progress by social and economic conditions and in their tangible form adapted to the cultural milieu in which they find their expression, they evolve very slowly until eventually there are observable evidences that a new movement has come into being. It is these tangible evidences of the crystallization of a movement which are often accepted, and dated, as the genesis or origin of the movement. Hence it is logical that such services as guidance should be credited by the casual student to one or more apparently spontaneous events or happenings which others have accepted as beginnings, or primary causal factors. In reality, they are symbols of a change which has been taking place in the established cultural pattern.

No study of the combination of social and economic factors which eventually found its expression in organized guidance services in various places in this country has as yet been made. The present writer made a cursory beginning in 1922 and a second attempt in 1932. Both resulted in the collection of much valuable historical data and both indicated that the time had not yet come for such a study—that in order to grasp the full significance of the organized movement a longer time perspective was necessary. What had passed was a revealing prologue; but the ramifications and points of contact were found to be many, the subtle influences most difficult to analyze and interpret. The undertaking was deferred for another decade.

For the purpose of this book it is sufficient to state that, both in its inherent and unconscious and in its purposeful and organized forms, guidance, since the dawn of history, has been an important factor in the growth and adjustment of individuals irrespective of the status of scientific thinking or of prevailing social and economic conditions. The fact that for many centuries guidance received no special recognition and was characterized by no distinctive nomenclature does not justify the assumption that it was nonexistent. But it is a long and time-consuming task to review the story of man in his activities as a social being, to trace the emergence of the principles upon which modern guidance and personnel work is

1

advancing, and finally to uncover how, as the nineteenth century was nearing its close, the time was ripe in practically all the civilized nations of the world for the practical expression of these principles in what is today called "guidance." No such task is attempted here. On the other hand, the responsibility of students within the field for approaching the history of the movement from the long-term point of view, rather than from the comparatively recent evidence that somebody, somewhere, was doing something about guidance in a more or less organized way, is recognized.

During the closing years of the nineteenth century the civilized world replied affirmatively to the age-old question, Am I my brother's keeper? Society had accepted the theory of the unity of humanity and the brother-hood of man and was ready to begin translation of the theory into practice. During the same years psychologists were busily engaged in translating into practice the theory of individual differences. Thus it happened that on the eve of the new century two theories—the one sociological and the other psychological, and both fundamental to the introduction of organized guidance activities—had crystallized sufficiently to attract attention to the desirability of their practical application, and a number of experiments had already been undertaken.

The years 1900 to 1910 were banner years for the expression of these newly accepted theories in terms of social and philanthropic efforts to service humanity better, especially the "ill-fed, ill-clothed, and ill-housed" segment of humanity. Although New York and Boston have been rather generally credited with pioneering leadership, when the complete story of the guidance movement is written it will reveal that between 1900 and 1916 a number of other cities were thinking and working along the same lines and recording their efforts in the annals of women's clubs, chambers of commerce, city clubs, the Association of Collegiate Alumnae, and other service organizations. A comparison of the history of these local interests reveals the fact that much of the early experimentation in these United States, as well as in foreign countries, owed its origin to similar economic and social conditions which tended to reveal similar guidance opportunities and needs. These identical problems, arising simultaneously in widely separated communities, were in some cases responded to by similar but entirely unrelated programs; in other cases, publicized programs were transplanted in toto or with modifications. Part I is concerned with the presentation of basic data upon which to determine to what extent there were fundamental principles and characteristic features common to all

¹ A history of the guidance and personnel movement from its inception to the present time is in preparation. A few points of particular significance to educators are presented in this volume.

guidance experiments; which of these have proved their worth and been continuously retained and which have been discarded; and what new principles and practices have come into being with the passage of time.

In order to satisfy the demands of various types of students two approaches to the beginnings of the organized guidance movement are offered. Chapter I presents the beginnings through the media of contemporary documents dealing with a series of experiments in different sections of the country, thus offering the reader an opportunity to interpret some of the original records for himself. This is the scholar's way. But the presentation of a sufficient volume of source material to reconstruct the history of the movement would be space-consuming and inappropriate in the light of the purpose of this work. Hence Chapters II and III are largely condensations of factual data taken from the sources. The second approach is offered in Chapter IV wherein the author's interpretation of the sources cited in previous chapters has been supplemented by the interpretation of such other source material as is essential to round out the picture.

The experiments chosen for presentation in Chapter I have been selected to represent all sections of the country, to show motivating influences, fundamental principles, uniformity and variation in tools, techniques, and procedures, character of sponsorship, outstanding personalities and agencies, and types of problems involved in organization and administration.

The year 1908 is the first milepost in the history of guidance as a conscious process in the United States. By that date, two programs, one in Boston and one in New York, had made sufficient progress to result in local organization, to focus national attention upon the beginnings of a tendency to recognize the desirability of assistance in personal adjustments in all the areas of life, and to indicate the necessity of including occupational information and early work experience, accompanied by employment supervision, as factors in twentieth-century education.

BOSTON

The Boston experiment was social-philanthropic in character; the Civic Service House was the center of its activities; Mrs. Quincy A. Shaw was its financial sponsor; and Frank Parsons was its guiding genius. Parsons described its origin, purpose, methods, and early development in detail in a volume published in 1909 after his death.² This book gave us our first

² Choosing a Vocation (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1909). Much of the same material appeared in the Arena, XL (1908), 3-16, 171-183. All references in this book, however, are to the 1909 edition.

definition in the guidance field (vocational guidance is "the choice of a vocation, adequate preparation for it, and the attainment of efficiency and success" 3) and touched upon practically every phase of modern guidance service. Periodic rereading of the volume leaves one ever more impressed with the wide range of Parsons' knowledge and experience 4 and with his unusual understanding of the individual as well as of the strengths and weaknesses of education and industry. He showed thorough familiarity with co-operative courses, the places where they had been tried, and their results, and he recommended the extension of such "Public Half-Work High Schools" as a means of guaranteeing youth both a practical and an academic education. He anticipated what recent years have so strongly emphasized that today neither the man in the street nor the educator in the school can have failed to recognize its importance:

A man cannot be fully successful, nor secure against the changes constantly occurring in industry, unless he knows a good deal besides the special knowledge immediately applicable to his business.⁵

Parsons was also thoroughly informed regarding the status of the testing movement and knew where the most reliable experimentation was going on. He made several pronouncements on the value of tests; he indicated how, when, and what tests might be used by counselors; and he added:

Nevertheless it must not be forgotten that all such indications are only straws, hints to be taken into account with all the other facts of the case. The handicap of slow decision or imperfect memory may be more than overcome by superiority in industry, earnestness, vitality, endurance, common sense, sound judgment, etc.⁶

Parsons' conception of vocational guidance was based on the broadest possible interpretation of the term; all-round manhood was the true aim, "making a living only one arc of the circle." His general suggestions for an individual if he were to attain success were in keeping with this conception: systematic and scientific training of body and brain, memory, reason, and character according to individual differences. Broad general culture, industrial education, and some practical experience were considered to have both individual and social values. His conception of guidance procedures and the relation of the adviser to the advisee were

³ Choosing a Vocation, p. 4.

⁴ Parsons was a graduate of the engineering college of Cornell University; he had served on the engineering staff of a railroad; and he had been a teacher in a district school, a city director of art instruction, a practicing lawyer in Boston, a writer of legal textbooks, a university lecturer on English and law, a professor of history in a western agricultural college, and a lecturer on municipal government.

⁵ Parsons, op. cit., p. 12.

⁶ Ibid., p. 8.

definitely expressed. Three procedures on the part of the person seeking advice were involved: (1) the getting of a clear understanding of himself—an understanding of his abilities, aptitudes, interests, ambitions, resources, and limitations and their causes; (2) the getting of a knowledge of occupations and their opportunities and requirements; and (3) true reasoning on the relationship between these two series of facts. The major function of the counselor was to render skilled assistance in securing accurate information and to aid the counselee in "true reasoning" so that he would make wise decisions for himself: "No person may decide for another what occupation he should choose, but it is possible to help him so to approach the problem that he shall come to wise conclusions for himself." 8

If counselors were to perform their functions adequately, Parsons felt that they must be experts, "trained as carefully for the work as men are trained for medicine and law," and that they must be equipped with "every facility science can devise for the testing of the senses and capacities and the whole physical, intellectual and emotional make-up." Parsons specifically mentioned the use of schedules, questionnaires, self-analysis, personal records, case studies, employee efficiency records, forms and weighted rating scales, descriptive material for traits, and minimum hiring specifications. A second series of equipment comprised lists of community resources; tables of training opportunities with date, length of course, admissions, costs, and opportunities to earn while studying; tables showing the location of industries and the movement of demand; classifications of industries showing the human traits essential for general and special groups; apprenticeship possibilities; employment agencies, including news ads and employers' forms; and hiring specifications and rating systems.¹⁰

The major technique whereby Parsons' entire guidance procedure was brought to a focus was the counseling or integrating interview. Such an interview, repeated as often as necessary, was similar in character to the final step in 1943 clinical guidance procedure, while the modern "case conference" was an integral part of Parsons' program for the preparation of counselors. Group conferences, forerunners of present-day "career conferences," were approved, conducted, and found to be valuable both as sources of vocational information and in opening the way for personal interviews.

Meyer Bloomfield was Parsons' colleague in instituting the Boston ex-

⁷ Ibid., p. 5.

⁸ Ibid., p. 4.

⁹ Ibid., p. 22. Parsons recommended the use of both psychology and phrenology. 10 Ibid., passim.

periment. When Parsons died in 1909 Bloomfield assumed responsibility for the original bureau and became the chief instrumentality in expanding its local services as well as in spreading the gospel to other communities. Bloomfield did an excellent job. The tangible results of his activities, both in the educational and in the business world, are sufficient proof of the debt which the modern personnel movement owes to his promotional and organizational abilities. Vocational guidance was born at the psychological moment in our economic and social history. It contained a strong practical and emotional appeal. Bloomfield knew how to translate this appeal into terms of educator, employer, and mass action. He was a born promoter at a time when promotional ability was needed. Enthusiasm for vocational guidance spread from coast to coast. Events moved rapidly both locally and nationally. Four specific results of Parsons' program, as fostered and expanded by Bloomfield, were:

1. The establishment of the Vocation Bureau of Boston, 1909. The Vocation Bureau was a co-operative and philanthropic agency, the parent of several other local efforts, especially the Public School Bureau of Boston. There is considerable material available on the functions of the Vocation Bureau, not the least interesting of which is a very attractive brochure, issued in 1915, which describes the character and scope of its services and gives a rather colorful review of its accomplishments in local, national, and international fields. If those who have access to all the original documents think it hardly legitimate to attribute all of these accomplishments to the Vocation Bureau, they will at least concede that by 1910 the Bureau had become the center of much guidance activity and that, judged by modern standards, its basic principles and practices were a fundamentally sound foundation for later development. Boston traveled a long distance in the right direction between 1909 and 1915.

2. The establishment of the Public School Bureau of Boston, 1912. The Public School Bureau was the outgrowth of an earlier Committee on Vocational Guidance, admittedly stimulated and to a large extent directed by the Vocation Bureau. The origin and activities of the Public School Bureau are fully described in the reports of the committee and in those of the superintendent of schools for 1910, 1912, and 1913. A cumulative record card was in use, although its major purpose was not developmental growth. By 1906 the High School of Commerce was giving systematic instruction in business opportunities, with information based on annual occupational surveys, and the committee had recommended "a place for vocational in-

¹¹ See the Vocation Bureau, Boston, Vocational Guidance and the Work of the Vocation Bureau of Boston (Boston: The Bureau, 1915), pp. 8-11; also, the Twenty-fifth Annual Report of the Commissioner of Labor, 1910 (Washington, 1911), pp. 419-497.

formation of an educational character in the regular school curriculum." Placement and employment supervision were operating in 1909 by means of summer "apprenticeship," which gave boys and girls insight into the relation of their school tasks to their life work. In 1913, as one method of providing counselors with accurate vocational information, "moving pictures were used to illustrate the printing and binding of a book." Counselors' duties varied: some individuals were primarily educational counselors; others were more concerned with vocations; one "teacheradviser" was provided for each forty pupils, and "homeroom teachers" had rather definite guidance responsibilities. Nor was provision for the education of parents forgotten. In his 1910 report the superintendent noted that the School and Home Association had made plans for interesting parents in the problem of vocational selection.

3. The First National Conference on Vocational Guidance, 1910. The first national vocational guidance conference was called by the Boston Chamber of Commerce and the Vocation Bureau of Boston and met November 15 and 16, 1910.12 Forty-five cities sent delegates. Manufacturers, employees, businessmen, social workers, and educators participated in the discussions. Among the names appearing on the conference program either as speakers, participants, or sponsors, the following continued to be interested in the guidance movement in subsequent years: Stratton D. Brooks, Superintendent of the Boston Public Schools; E. W. Weaver, Boys' High School, Brooklyn, New York; Florence M. Marshall, Director of the Girls' Trade Education League of Boston; Meyer Bloomfield; David Snedden, Massachusetts Commissioner of Education; Robert A. Woods of the South End House; Frank M. Leavitt, Delegate from the University of Chicago; Frederick P. Fish, Chairman of the Massachusetts Board of Education; A. Lincoln Filene; Henry C. Metcalf; Jane Addams of Hull House; G. Stanley Hall of Clark University; Graham Taylor and George H. Mead of the University of Chicago; and Homer Folks, Secretary of the State Charities Aid Association, New York. Significant attitudes and ideas included the interest expressed by businessmen in the subject of expert vocational counseling; the generally expressed opinion that vocational guidance was a public-school function; the importance of vocational guidance, its aims and fundamental principles; and its ethical and economic implications. Charles W. Eliot restated his views, previously expressed before the National Education Association, on the value of the lifecareer motive 13

¹² The account which follows is based on an original program of the conference.
13 "The Value During Education of the Life-Career Motive," in National Education
Association of the United States, Journal of Proceedings and Addresses, 1910, pp. 133–141.