



PUBLICATIONS ON OCEAN DEVELOPMENT

CRIES OF THE SEA

WORLD INEQUALITY,
SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT
AND THE COMMON HERITAGE
OF HUMANITY

Peter Bautista Payoyo

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

Cries of the Sea

World Inequality, Sustainable Development and
the Common Heritage of Humanity

PETER BAUTISTA PAYOYO



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-0504-2

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Layout and camera-ready copy:
Anne-Marie Krens, Oegstgeest, The Netherlands

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1997 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

CRIES OF THE SEA

World Inequality, Sustainable Development and the Common Heritage of Humanity



Publications on Ocean Development

Volume 33

*A Series of Studies on
the International, Legal, Institutional and Policy Aspects
of Ocean Development*

General Editor: Shigeru Oda

To my wife, Au

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research project would not have been possible without the caring support and the considerable encouragement that I have received from several institutions as well as numerous individuals throughout the period of my graduate studies.

I express my deepest gratitude, first, to the institutions: to the University of the Philippines College of Law and the Dalhousie Law School – for having afforded me the time and space to carry out this project; to the Killam Trust for awarding me a three-year fellowship to pursue a doctoral degree; and to the International Ocean Institute for the most meaningful exposure to the *problématique* of my research.

To the extent that these institutions are also the special people with whom I shall with all affection associate this work, I should mention the following individuals. In the UP College of Law, I owe a profound debt of gratitude to Dean Merlin Magallona, former Dean Pacifico Agabin, my colleague Professor Popo Lotilla, Professor Hydee Yorak, and Justice Florentino Feliciano. In the Dalhousie Law School, I thank Dean Dawn Russell, former Dean Joe Ghiz, Professor Bruce Archibald, Dr. Edgar Gold, Dr. Aldo Chircop, Professor Donat Pharand, and the great mentors whose friendship will always be warmly cherished: Professor Douglas Johnston and Judge Ronald St.J. Macdonald. Christian Wiktor and his very able library staff smothered me with the books that became my cozy shelter especially during the winter months in Halifax. I must also acknowledge my cheerful neighbourhood team: “mother” Sheila Wile and fellow-travellers Nahid (and Family), David, and Stuart.

The International Ocean Institute is, certainly, no other than God-sent Elisabeth Mann-Borgese herself. She has assured me of her sustained guidance and love which no sailor in the rough but exciting seas of ocean law and policy can really do without. My adventures with her, in *Pacem In Maribus* or elsewhere, have rewarded me and my wife more lasting memories and friendships

than we could ever have imagined. Thus, I also thank those in the big (and still growing) IOI family who have, in one way or another, prodded me to search for new vistas – in the depths of the ocean or in the depths of the soul: Jan van Ettinger, Christopher Pinto, Abdul Koroma, Alexander Yankov, Hasjim Djalal, Joseph Warioba, Anton Vratusa, Don Mills, Frank Njenga, Tom Fuse, Norton Ginsberg, and the two giants from the tiny Maltese isles: Fr. Peter S. Inglot, and Ambassador Arvid Pardo.

Writing this work away from home would have been unbearable were it not for my surrogate family in Halifax. I was indeed fortunate to have been welcomed in the hearths and hearts of Yolly & Max, Lita & Tante, Norma & Ralph, and Ninong & Ninang – to them all I say *Mabuhay* and *Salamat Po*. Friends in the Netherlands have likewise kept me company there, in their own memorable ways – especially cheering up my wife when I had to tarry a little while longer in Halifax. Thank you Jan & Peet; Chris & Linda; Jan & Anna Marie; Morita & Johan, Orchid & Eddie; Maritza, Baby, Anna, Bea, Tina and Marlie. Finally, my family in the Philippines, by affinity or consanguinity, have given their spiritual comfort and loving assurances without fail. Without the simple joys and peace on the home front which they continuously shared to me, defending the case for harmony and humanity – as I do in this book – would have been quite impossible.

Lastly, I kiss and embrace my wife for having endured those solitary seasons when I had to write up my piece in some far and lonely corner. Now that the living-apart is over, we shall be marching on again, close together.

ABBREVIATIONS

AFRICAN J INT & COMP L	African Journal of International and Comparative Law
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
ASIL Proc	American Society of International Law Proceedings, Annual Meeting
AUSTRALIAN YBIL	Australian Yearbook of International Law
BOSTON COLL INT & COMP L R	Boston College International and Comparative Law Review
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CAL L REV	California Law Review
CASEWESTERN RES J INT L	Casewestern Reserve Journal of International Law
CLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea With Index and Final Act, UN Sales No. E.83.V.5
COLUMBIA J TRANS L	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
I COMMENTARY	M. Nordquist (Ed.-in-chief), <i>United Nations Convention on the Law of</i>

the Sea 1982: A Commentary Vol. 1 (1985)

II COMMENTARY

S. Nandan, S. Rosenne & N. Grandy (Eds.); M. Nordquist (Ed.-in-chief), *United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea: A Commentary* Vol. 2 (1993)

IV COMMENTARY

S. Rosenne, A. Yankov & N. Grandy (Eds.); M. Nordquist (Ed.-in-chief), *United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea: A Commentary* Vol. 4 (1991)

Dept of State BULL

US Department of State Bulletin

ECOLOGY L QTLY

Ecology Law Quarterly

ECOSOC Off Rec

Official Records of the UN Economic and Social Council

EJIL

European Journal of International Law

EPL

Environmental Policy and Law

GEORGETOWN INT ENV L REV

Georgetown International Environmental Law Review

HARV INT L J

Harvard International Law Journal

HDR


Human Development Report (UNDP)

House Interim Report

US Congress, House. Interim Report on the United Nations and the Issue of Deep Ocean Resources, together with hearings by the Subcommittee on International Organizations and Movements of the Committee on Foreign Affairs

(US Government Printing Office,
1967)

HUMAN RIGHTS QTLY	Human Rights Quarterly
ICJ Rep	International Court of Justice Reports
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
IJMCL	International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law
ILC YRBK	Yearbook of the International Law Commission
ILM	International Legal Materials
INDIAN J INT L	Indian Journal of International Law
JOHN MARSHALL L R	John Marshall Law Review
JWTL	Journal of World Trade Law
LOUISIANA L REV	Louisiana Law Review
LoS BULLETIN	Law of the Sea Bulletin (published by the Division of Ocean Affairs and the Law of the Sea, UN Secretariat)
LSI	Law of the Sea Institute
MICHIGAN L REV	Michigan Law Review
NAT RES L	Natural Resources Lawyer
NETH INT L REV	Netherlands International Law Review
NETH YRBK INT L	Netherlands Yearbook of Inter- national Law

NILOS DOCUMENTARY YRBK	International Organizations and the Law of the Sea Documentary Yearbook (Netherlands Institute for the Law of the Sea)
NORTHWESTERN J INTL L & BUS	Northwestern Journal of International Law and Business
NYU J INT L & POL	New York University Journal of International Law and Politics
OCEAN & COASTAL MGMT	Ocean and Coastal Management
OCEAN YRBK	Ocean Yearbook
ODIL	Ocean Development and International Law
PV # 	United Nations General Assembly Official Records, First Committee (Provisional Verbatim Records); number and date of First Committee meeting indicated
SAN DIEGO L REV	San Diego Law Review
SBC Rep	Report of the United Nations Seabed Committee 1969- 1973 (Ad Hoc SBC Rep, the 1968 Report of the Ad Hoc Committee)
UNCLOS III Off Rec	Official Records of the Third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea
UNCLOS I Off Rec	Official Records of the First United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea
UN GAOR	United Nations General Assembly Official Records

UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
VA ENV L J	Virginia Environmental Law Journal
VA J INT L	Virginia Journal of International Law
YALE L J	Yale Law Journal
YRBK INTL ENV L	Yearbook of International Environmental Law
ZaöRV	Zeitschrift Für Ausländisches Öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xiii
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
INTRODUCTION	1
PART 1 – INTERNATIONAL LAW IN AN UNEQUAL WORLD	13
I INEQUALITY IN THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY	15
A. Widening Global Disparities on the Large	16
B. Wither Global Inequality?	22
C. International Law	28
D. Inequality	31
E. Growing Disparities	36
F. The International Law of Global Disparities	41
Conclusion	45
II WORLD INEQUALITY AND THE 1982 UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA	49
A. Domains of Disparity in the Law of the Sea – Old and New	49
B. Disparity and the 1982 Convention: Preambular Aspects	53
C. UNCLOS III: The North-South Agenda in the Traditional Domains	58
1. Institutional Context	60
2. Substantive Law Context	67

D. The North-South Dialogue in the Second Committee of UNCLOS: III: Global Wealth Redistribution Through Extended Coastal State Jurisdiction	71
1. The Significance of the EEZ in Global Wealth Redistri- bution	73
2. The Nature of the General Preference Given to Developing States Concerning Fisheries Access to the EEZ	75
3. The Needs and Interests of Developing Land-Locked and Geographically Disadvantaged States	77
E. The North-South Dialogue in the Third Committee of UNCLOS III: Legal Aspects of International Cooperation for Development and Global Sharing in the Oceans	82
1. Protection and Preservation of the Marine Environment	83
2. Marine Scientific Research	89
3. Development and Transfer of Marine Technology	95
4. International Cooperation and Extended Coastal State Juris- diction as Complementary Principles of the New Ocean Order	102
F. UNCED and Equality of Capacity for Rights and Obligations: The Customary Law of Capacity-Building in the Oceans	108
1. Revitalizing the Unrealized Promise of the EEZ	109
2. From UNCLOS to UNCED: Transforming the Legal Framework of Global Inequality	113
3. The Legal Basis of Capacity-Building for Sustainable Development in the Oceans	119
4. The International Law of Global Disparities versus The International Law of Sustainable Development	140
Conclusion	150

PART 2: – THE COMMON HERITAGE OF HUMANITY AND WORLD INEQUALITY	157
III THE COMMON HERITAGE OF HUMANITY: A LEGAL PRE-HISTORY	159
A. The Common Heritage of Humanity as an Invoked Principle in the 1982 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea	165
B. A Question of Frontiers: The Area and its Resources	167
1. Towards Internationalizing the Deep Seabed	170
2. The Stakes Behind Internationalization	177
3. International Law on the Margins of the Deep Seabed	180
4. The Omnipresence of the Continental Shelf	205
Conclusion	219
IV BEYOND <i>MARE LIBERUM</i> AND <i>MARE CLAUSUM</i> : THE COMMON HERITAGE OF HUMANITY AS A FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW	227
A. The Common Heritage of Humanity Principle and Part XI of the 1982 Convention	232
1. Textual Overview	232
2. The Severability of the Common Heritage of Humanity Principle from the Seabed Mining Regime	237
3. The Special Legal Status of the Area and the Principles Governing the Area	239
B. The Common Heritage of Humanity Principle as Plea for Development and Peace	247
1. New Deep Sea Resources and The Development Imperative	248
2. Developing Countries and the “Race to Grab” the Deep Seabed	251
3. Global Distributive Justice and the Question of Continental Shelf Outer Limits	256
4. The Question of Limits (Again) and the Common Heritage of Humanity Principle	264

5. The Programmatic Law of the Common Heritage of Humanity	295
6. The Reservation of the Common Heritage for Peaceful Purposes	313
C. The Common Heritage of Humanity and the Principle of Benefit-Sharing	320
1. Benefit of Humanity as a Rule of Decision	323
2. Benefit of Humanity and the Special Needs and Interests of the Developing Countries	326
3. The Interests and Needs of Developing Countries under Part XI of the 1982 Convention	329
D. The Common Heritage as Environment	332
1. Overcoming a Sectoral Approach to Marine Environmental Protection	334
2. Existing Environmental Law for the Area and its Resources	337
3. International Responsibility under the Environmental Law of the Area and its Resources	340
4. Scientific Research and the Environmental Protection Regime for the Area	342
5. Institutional Aspects of Sustainable Development of the Area and its Resources	347
Conclusion	349
V THE INSTITUTIONAL ELEMENT OF THE COMMON HERITAGE PRINCIPLE: TOWARDS AN INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT?	359
A. The Institutional Significance of the Common Heritage of Humanity Principle	363
1. Pre-1970 Developments: The Basic Issue in International Organization Defined	363
2. The Issue of International Machinery in the Seabed Committee	370
3. The Developing Countries: The Common Heritage of Humanity Principle as a New Modality of International Organization	372