

Ideen & Argumente

Anna Goppel
Killing Terrorists
*A Moral and
Legal Analysis*

DE GRUYTER

Anna Goppel

Killing Terrorists

A Moral and Legal Analysis



DE GRUYTER

ISBN: 978-3-11-028442-3
e-ISBN: 978-3-11-027727-2

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A CIP catalog record for this book has been applied for at the Library of Congress

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>.

© 2013 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston
Printing and Binding: Hubert & Co. GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen
♾️ Printed on acid-free paper
Printed in Germany

www.degruyter.com



Anna Goppel

Killing Terrorists

Ideen & Argumente

Herausgegeben von
Wilfried Hinsch und Lutz Wingert

Acknowledgments

Various people and institutions have helped me along the way as I completed this project. I am very grateful for their support. First and foremost, I would like to thank Stefan Gosepath who supervised my PhD thesis on which this book is based. His valuable personal and academic support was always forthcoming. I am particularly grateful for his confidence in me and my project right from the beginning which formed my academic path far beyond this book. I am indebted to Georg Mohr and Christian Walter for their examiners' reports. Specifically I would like to mention Christian Walter's comment regarding the territorial scope of non-international armed conflicts which I took into account in revising the book manuscript. I am thankful, too, to Martin Nettesheim for providing me with an institutional home. I profited significantly from several stays at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics at the University of Melbourne. I would like to thank all of my colleagues there for many extremely helpful discussions. I particularly would like to express my gratitude to Tony Coady and Igor Primoratz for their interest in my work and their cordial and encouraging way of engaging with me, and to Emma Larking and Jessica Wolfendale, who not only helped to advance this study during our many conversations, but also ensured that my stays in Melbourne will remain unforgettable experiences. I owe special thanks to the participants of various workshops and colloquia where I had the chance to discuss my ideas. Their feedback has been immeasurably helpful. I would particularly like to mention the summer courses at the Inter University Centre in Dubrovnik, for the regular invitations to which I would like to thank Bernd Ladwig and Georg Lohmann. For inspiring times in and beyond Dubrovnik I would also like to mention and specifically thank Corinna Mieth, Arnd Pollmann and Susanne Schmetkamp. I would like to thank Daniel Messelken, Henning Hahn, and Anne Schwenkenbecher for their constructive comments on parts of earlier versions of the manuscript. I am furthermore thankful to Peter Schaber for his continuous encouragement during the publication process. Particular gratitude I would like to express to Ludwig Siep, who over all the years in many inspiring, encouraging, and caring conversations was a priceless mentor and advisor to me. To Sarah Kelly, Chris Geissler, and Carina Fourie, I owe special thanks for their patient correcting of my English. I am grateful to several organizations for providing financial support for my research and the making of this book: the research programme Global challenges – transnational and transcultural solutions, at the University of Tuebingen; the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD); and the University Research Priority Programme for Ethics (UFSPE) of the University of Zurich.

Writing a PhD thesis and revising it into a book manuscript comes with not only academic, but also emotional challenges. I am grateful to my sister and my brother, to Silja Neumann, Simone Jaeger and Claudia Schrag and to my friends in Berlin who with their great humour, their affection, and their positive outlook on life made my life colourful no matter how much I was struggling with writing. My final thanks go to my parents who taught me confidence in following my ideas and the faith that things do turn out well. I must thank my father in particular for his endless patience and encouragement in innumerable conversations.

Zuerich, August 2012

List of abbreviations

| | |
|--------|--|
| ACHPR | African Charter on Human and People's Rights, 27 June 1981 |
| ACHR | American Convention on Human Rights, 22 November 1969 |
| AI | Amnesty International |
| API | Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), 8 June 1977 |
| APII | Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977 |
| CAT | Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 10 December 1984 |
| CCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 16 December 1966 |
| CIA | Central Intelligence Agency |
| CPPCG | Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 9 December 1948 |
| ECHR | European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 4 November 1950 |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| ETA | Euskadi Ta Askatasuna |
| Fatah | Harakat al-Tahrir al-Watani al-Filastini |
| GA | General Assembly |
| GAL | Grupos Antiterroristas de Liberación |
| GCI | Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field, 12 August 1949 |
| GCII | Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea, 12 August 1949 |
| GCIII | Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 12 August 1949 |
| GCIV | Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, 12 August 1949 |
| Hamas | Harakat al-Muqawama al-Islamiyya |
| HCJ | Israeli High Court of Justice |
| HCIV | Hague Convention respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its Annex: Regulations Concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land, 18 October 1907 |
| HRC | Human Rights Committee |
| ICC | International Criminal Court |
| ICJ | International Court of Justice |
| ICRC | International Committee of the Red Cross |
| ICTR | International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda |
| ICTY | International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia |
| IDF | Israel Defence Forces |
| ILC | International Law Commission |
| IRA | Irish Republican Army |
| KGB | Komitet Gosudarstvennoi Bezopasnosti |
| Mossad | HaMossad leModi'in uleTafkidim Meyuhadim |
| NATO | North Atlantic Treaty Organization |
| OAS | Organization of American States |

XII — List of abbreviations

| | |
|-------|---|
| PFLP | Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine |
| PLO | Palestine Liberation Organization |
| RAF | Rote Armee Fraktion |
| SECED | Servicio Central de Documentación |
| SC | Security Council |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10 December 1948 |

Table of cases

International Court of Justice

Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua, (Nicaragua v. United States of America), (Merits), 27 June 1986. [Quoted as ICJ, *Nicaragua v. United States of America*, (Merits)] — 91–94, 97 f., 146, 159, 169 f., 172, 183 f., 191

Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua, (Dissenting Opinion of Judge Sir Robert Jennings), 27 June 1986. [Quoted as ICJ, *Nicaragua v. United States of America*, (Dissenting Opinion Jennings)] — 94

Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua, (Dissenting Opinion of Judge Schwebel), 27 June 1986. [Quoted as ICJ, *Nicaragua v. United States of America*, (Dissenting Opinion Schwebel)] — 183

Case Concerning Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America), (Judgment), 6 November 2003. [Quoted as ICJ, *Oil Platforms*, (Judgment)] — 169 f.

Case Concerning United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran, (United States of America v. Iran), (Judgment), 24 May 1980. [Quoted as ICJ, *Tehran Hostage Case*, (Judgment)] — 93

Corfu Channel Case, (Merits), 9 April 1949. [Quoted as ICJ, *Corfu Channel Case*, (Merits)] — 179

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, (Advisory Opinion), 9 July 2004. [Quoted as ICJ, *Construction of a Wall*, (Advisory Opinion)] — 72, 172

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, (Separate Opinion of Judge Higgins), 9 July 2004. [Quoted as ICJ, *Construction of a Wall*, (Separate Opinion Higgins)] — 172

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, (Separate Opinion of Judge Kooijmans), 9 July 2004. [Quoted as ICJ, *Construction of a Wall*, (Separate Opinion Kooijmans)] — 172

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, (Declaration of Judge Buergenthal), 9 July 2004. [Quoted as ICJ, *Construction of a Wall*, (Declaration Buergenthal)] — 172

Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, (Advisory Opinion), 8 July 1996. [Quoted as ICJ, *Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons*, (Advisory Opinion)] — 71 f., 74 f., 78, 110, 169

UN Human Rights Committee

Lopez Burgos v. Uruguay, Communication No. 52/1979, 29 July 1981, UN Doc. CCPR/C/13/D/52/1979. [Quoted as HRC, *Lopez Burgos v. Uruguay*, (Communication)] — 73

Rickly Burrell v. Jamaica, Communication No. 546/1993, 28 April 1993, UN Doc. CCPR/C/53/D/546/1993. [Quoted as HRC, *Burrell v. Jamaica*, (Communication)] — 69

Husband of Maria Funny Suarez de Guerrero v. Colombia, Communication No. R.11/45, 31 March 1982, UN Doc. Supp. No. 40 (A/37/40) (1982). [Quoted as HRC, *Suarez de Guerrero v. Colombia*, (Communication)] — 57, 61 f., 65 f.

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic, Appeals Chamber, (Decision on the Defence Motion of Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction), 2 October 1995, (Case No. IT-94-1). [Quoted as ICTY, Appeals Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Tadic*, (Decision on the Defence Motion of Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction)] — 86, 146, 149, 154

Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic, Appeals Chamber, (Judgment), 15 July 1999, (Case No. IT-94-1-A). [Quoted as ICTY, Appeals Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Tadic*, (Judgment)] — 89, 91-94, 97-100, 131

Prosecutor v. Pavle Strugar, Miodrag Jokic, and Others, Trial Chamber, (Decision on Defence Preliminary Motion Challenging Jurisdiction), 7 June 2002, (Case No. IT-01-42-PT). [Quoted as ICTY, Trial Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Strugar*, (Decision on Defence Preliminary Motion)] — 110 f.

Prosecutor v. Pavle Strugar, Miodrag Jokic, and Others, Appeals Chamber, (Decision on Defence Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction), 24 July 2002, (Case No. IT-01-42-AR72). [Quoted as ICTY, Appeals Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Strugar*, (Decision on Interlocutory Appeal)] — 110

Prosecutor v. Zenjnil Delalic, Zdravko Mucic also known as ‘Pavo’, Hazim Delic, Esad Landzo also known as ‘Zenga’, Trial Chamber, (Judgment), 16 November 1998, (Case No. IT-96-21-T). [Quoted as ICTY, Trial Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Delalic*, (Judgment)] — 124

International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

Prosecutor v. Jean-Paul Akayesu, Chamber I, (Judgment), 2 September 1998, (Case No. ICTR-96-4-T). [Quoted as ICTR, Chamber I, *Prosecutor v. Akayesu*, (Judgment)] — 154, 158

Eritrea Ethiopia Claim Commission

Prisoners of War – Ethiopia’s Claim 4, (Partial Award), 1 July 2003. [Quoted as Eritrea Ethiopia Claim Commission, Prisoners of War – Ethiopia’s Claim 4, (Partial Award)] — 110

Prisoners of War – Eritrea’s Claim 17, (Partial Award), 1 July 2003. [Quoted as Eritrea Ethiopia Claim Commission, Prisoners of War – Eritrea’s Claim 17, (Partial Award)] — 110

European Court of Human Rights

Drozdz and Janousek v. France and Spain, Plenary, (Merits), 26 June 1992, Application No. 12747/87. [Quoted as ECtHR, Plenary, *Drozdz and Janousek v. France and Spain*, (Merits)] — 73

Loizidou v. Turkey, Chamber, (Preliminary Objections), 23 March 1995, Application No. 15318/89. [Quoted as ECtHR, Chamber, *Loizidou v. Turkey*, (Preliminary Objections)] — 73

Loizidou v. Turkey, Chamber, (Merits and Just Satisfaction), 18 December 1996, Application No. 15318/89. [Quoted as ECtHR, Chamber, *Loizidou v. Turkey*, (Merits and Just Satisfaction)] — 73

McCann and others v. the United Kingdom, (Merits and Just Satisfaction), 27 September 1995, Application No. 18984/91. [Quoted as ECtHR, *McCann v. United Kingdom*, (Merits and Just Satisfaction)] — 65, 69

Vlastimir and Borka Bankovic, Zivana Stojanovic, Mirjana Stoimenovski, Dragana Joksimovic and Dragan Sukovic v. Belgium, the Czech Republic, Denmark, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Italy, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Spain, Turkey and the United Kingdom, Grand Chamber, (Decision as to the Admissibility), 12 December 2001, Application No. 52207/99. [Quoted as ECtHR, Grand Chamber, *Bankovic v. Belgium*, (Decision as to the Admissibility)] — 73

European Commission of Human Rights

Olive Farrell v. United Kingdom, Decision of 11 December 1982, Application No. 9013/80, European Commission of Human Rights: Decisions and Reports (DR) 30, 96–118. [Quoted as European Commission of Human Rights, *Farrell v. United Kingdom*] — 64 f.

National courts and commissions

Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, *H. et al. v. §14 para. 3 Aviation Security Act (Luftsicherheitsgesetz)*, (Judgment), 15 February 2006, BVerfG, 1 BvR 357/05, para. 1–156. [Quoted as Federal Constitutional Court, *H. et al. v. §14 para. 3 Aviation Security Act*, (Judgment)] — 277

HCJ, *The Public Committee against Torture in Israel and Palestinian Society for the Protection of Human Rights and the Environment v. Government of Israel, the Prime Minister of Israel, the Minister of Defence, the Israel Defence Force, the Chief of the General Staff of the Israel Defence Forces and the Israel Law Center Shurat HaDin, and 24 others*, (Judgment), 13 December 2006, (Case No. HCJ 769/02). [Quoted as HCJ, *Public Committee against Torture v. Government of Israel*, (Judgment)] — 1, 12, 30, 79 f., 83, 111–113, 118, 126

Table of treaties

Convention respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its Annex: Regulations Concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land, The Hague, 18 October 1907 — 109 f., 162, 164 f.

Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, New York, 9 December 1948 — 70

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, New York, 10 December 1948 — 57, 61 f., 252

Convention (I) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field, Geneva, 12 August 1949 — 110; as GCI-IV: 85–87, 89, 107, 109, 123, 131, 144–148, 152–159, 161 f., 200

Convention (II) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea, Geneva, 12 August 1949 — 110; as GCI-IV: 85–87, 89, 107, 109, 123, 131, 144–148, 152–159, 161 f., 200

Convention (III) relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, Geneva, 12 August 1949 — 110, 125 f., 129–138, 140; as GCI-IV: 85–87, 89, 107, 109, 123, 131, 144–148, 152–159, 161 f., 200

Convention (IV) relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, Geneva, 12 August 1949 — 110, 122–126, 162, 165; as GCI-IV: 85–87, 89, 107, 109, 123, 131, 144–148, 152–159, 161 f., 200

(European) Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Rome, 4 November 1950 — 57 f., 63 f., 66, 69 f., 73, 78

Convention on Offences and Certain Acts Committed on board Aircraft, Tokyo, 14 September 1963 — 17

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, New York, 16 December 1966 — 57–67, 69–75, 159, 252, 309

American Convention on Human Rights, San José, 22 November 1969 — 57 f., 70, 73

Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft, The Hague, 16 December 1970 — 17

Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation, Montreal, 23 September 1971 — 17

Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes against International Protected Persons, New York, 14 December 1973 — 17

Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), Geneva, 8 June 1977 — 70 f., 83, 85, 109–111, 114 f., 117, 120, 123, 126, 130, 132, 135–138, 140, 145, 162

Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), Geneva, 8 June 1977 — 70, 109, 123, 144–154, 161, 200

Convention on the Physical Protection of Nuclear Material, Vienna, 26 October 1979 — 19

International Convention against the Taking of Hostages, New York, 17 December 1979 — 17

African Charter on Human and People's Rights, Nairobi, 27 June 1981 — 57 f., 70, 73

Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, New York, 10 December 1984 — 70

Protocol for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts of Violence at Airports Serving International Civil Aviation, Supplementary to the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation (With Final Act), Montreal, 24 February 1988 — 17

Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Maritime Navigation, Rome, 10 March 1988 — 17

Protocol for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Fixed Platforms Located on the Continental Shelf, Rome, 10 March 1988 — 17 f.

Convention on the Making of Plastic Explosives for the Purpose of Detection, Montreal, 1 March 1991 — 19

International Convention for the Suppression of Terrorist Bombings, New York, 15 December 1997 — 18

Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, 17 July 1998 — 111, 154

International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism, New York, 9 December 1999 — 18, 22, 24

International Convention for the Suppression of Acts of Nuclear Terrorism, New York, 13 April 2005 — 18

Protocol to the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Maritime Navigation, London, 14 October 2005 — 17

Protocol Supplementary to the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft, Beijing, 10 September 2010 — 17

Convention on the Suppression of Unlawful Acts relating to International Civil Aviation, Beijing, 10 September 2010 — 18

Table of UN documents

Security Council resolutions

SC Res. 237, 14 June 1967 — 72

SC Res. 487, 19 June 1981 — 184

SC Res. 787, 16 November 1992 — 72

SC Res. 1041, 29 January 1996 — 72

SC Res. 1059, 31 May 1996 — 72

SC Res. 1083, 27 November 1996 — 72

SC Res. 1368, 12 September 2001 — 95f., 172f.

SC Res. 1373, 28 September 2001 — 95f., 172f.

General Assembly resolutions

GA Res. 2443 (XXIII), Respect for and Implementation of Human Rights in Occupied Territories, 19 December 1968 — 72

GA Res. 2444 (XXIII), Respect for Human Rights in Armed Conflicts, 19 December 1968 — 72

GA Res. 2546 (XXIV), Respect for and Implementation of Human Rights in Occupied Territories, 11 December 1969 — 72

GA Res. 2625 (XXV), Declaration on Principles of International Law Concerning Friendly Relations und Co-operation among States in Accordance with the Charter of the United Nations, 24 October 1970. [Quoted as Declaration on Friendly Relations] — 179

GA Res. 2727 (XXV), Report of the Special Committee to Investigate Israeli Practices Affecting the Human Rights of the Population of the Occupied Territories, 15 December 1970 — 72