

University Textbook Series

# Commentary on the Conflict of Laws

Fifth Edition

*Russell J. Weintraub*

FOUNDATION PRESS

COMMENTARY  
ON THE  
CONFLICT OF LAWS

FIFTH EDITION

By  
RUSSELL J. WEINTRAUB  
Professor of Law Emeritus  
and  
Holder of the Ben H. & Kitty King Powell Chair  
in Business & Commercial Law Emeritus  
University of Texas School of Law

Foundation Press  
2006

THOMSON  
  
WEST

This publication was created to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered; however, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. The publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

Nothing contained herein is intended or written to be used for the purposes of 1) avoiding penalties imposed under the federal Internal Revenue Code, or 2) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein.

© 1971, 1980, 1986, 2001 FOUNDATION PRESS

© 2006 By FOUNDATION PRESS

395 Hudson Street

New York, NY 10014

Phone Toll Free 1-877-888-1330

Fax (212) 367-6799

[foundation-press.com](http://foundation-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

**ISBN-13:** 978-1-59941-072-2

**ISBN-10:** 1-59941-072-9



TEXT IS PRINTED ON 10% POST  
CONSUMER RECYCLED PAPER



To my best friend and dearest love, my wife, Zelda

\*

## PREFACE TO THE FIFTH EDITION

This fifth edition increases coverage of comparative and international issues. Discussions of adjudicatory jurisdiction, choice of law, and judgments include detailed examinations of a Convention and a Regulation in force in the European Union—the “Rome” Convention on the Law Applicable to Contractual Obligations and the “Brussels” Regulation on Jurisdiction and the Recognition of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters. The discussion of rules giving contracting parties the power to choose the law that determines the validity of their contract contrasts proposed new section 1-301 of the Uniform Commercial Code with the Rome Convention. The comparison suggests why to date most states that have adopted revised Article 1 have not included 1-301.

There is discussion of choice-of-law problems in national and multi-state class actions and the effect of the federal Class Action Fairness Bill of 2005, which will move almost all such actions to federal district courts. Also much expanded is the examination of conflicts problems arising from different laws both in the U.S. and abroad concerning same-sex unions.

I am grateful to my colleague and expert on domestic relations law, Jack Sampson, for reading and commenting on a draft of chapter 5.

RUSSELL J. WEINTRAUB

May, 2006

\*

COMMENTARY  
ON THE  
CONFLICT OF LAWS

\*

## SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

PREFACE TO THE FIFTH EDITION .....	v
<b>Chapter</b>	
1. Introduction .....	1
2. Domicile .....	13
3. Pervasive Problems .....	52
4. Jurisdiction to Adjudicate .....	117
5. Marriage, Divorce, Custody, and Support .....	307
6. Torts .....	371
7. Contracts .....	475
8. Property .....	542
9. Constitutional Limitations on Choice of Law .....	620
10. Choice of Law in the Federal Courts .....	687
11. Judgments .....	737
12. International Problems .....	760
TABLE OF CASES .....	779
INDEX .....	849

\*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE TO THE FIFTH EDITION .....	v
<b>CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION</b> .....	1
<b>Sec.</b>	
1.1 Description of the Subject .....	1
1.2 Where Can Suit Be Brought? .....	2
1.3 What Law Will Be Applied? .....	2
1.4 What Is the Effect of a Judgment? .....	5
1.5 Modern Theories .....	7
<b>CHAPTER 2. DOMICILE</b> .....	13
<b>Sec.</b>	
2.1 Introduction .....	13
2.2 The Concept .....	14
2.3 Physical Presence .....	15
2.4 Intention and Capacity .....	18
2.5 Retention of Domicile .....	20
2.6 Wives .....	21
2.7 Service Men and Women .....	22
2.8 Students .....	23
2.9 Government Employees .....	25
2.10 Durational Residence .....	25
2.11 Statutory Construction .....	27
2.12 Intestate Succession to Movables .....	28
2.12A In re Estate of Jones .....	29
2.12B White v. Tennant .....	33
2.12C A More Useful Tool for Rational Analysis .....	35
2.13 Validity of a Will Disposing of Movables .....	36
2.13A An Illustrative Case: In re Annesley .....	37
2.13B A More Useful Approach .....	38
2.14 Capacity of a Wife to Sue Her Husband for Negligence .....	40
2.14A Illustrative Cases .....	40
(1) Haumschild v. Continental Casualty Co. ..	40
(2) Haynie v. Hanson .....	41
2.14B The Harm of the Domicile Concept in this Context .....	42
2.15 A Constitutional Basis for Judicial Jurisdiction .....	42
2.15A Illustrative Cases .....	42
(1) Alvord & Alvord v. Patenotre .....	42
(2) Lea v. Lea .....	43



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
2.15B	A Substitute for Domicile as a Basis for Judicial Jurisdiction .....	45
2.16	Recognizing that the Meaning of “Domicile” Changes with the Context is Not Sufficient to Make it a Useful Tool for Conflicts Analysis .....	46
2.17	Habitual Residence .....	49
<b>CHAPTER 3. PERVASIVE PROBLEMS</b> .....		52
<b>Sec.</b>		
3.1	Introduction .....	52
3.2	Characterization .....	53
3.2A	The Substantive Label .....	53
3.2B	Interpreting Choice-of-Law Rules .....	55
3.2C	“Substance” and “Procedure” .....	59
3.2C1	Functional Definition of “Procedure” .....	59
3.2C2	Statutes of Limitations .....	63
3.2C3	Privileged Communications .....	78
3.2C4	Damages .....	81
3.2C5	Admiralty Proceedings: Limitation of Damages and Choice of Law .....	83
3.3	Renvoi .....	89
3.4	Dépeçage .....	96
3.4A	Interstate Results that Differ from Intrastate Results: Dépeçage Broadly Defined .....	97
3.5	Beyond Dépeçage: A “New Rule” Approach .....	104
3.6	Public Policy .....	106
3.7	Notice and Proof of Foreign Law .....	112
3.8	Conclusion .....	116
<b>CHAPTER 4. JURISDICTION TO ADJUDICATE</b> .....		117
<b>Sec.</b>		
4.1	The Meaning of “Jurisdiction to Adjudicate”: Scope of the Chapter .....	117
4.2	The Relationship Between Jurisdiction to Adjudicate and Choice of Law .....	120
4.3	Due Process Limits on Jurisdiction .....	122
4.4	Notice and Opportunity to be Heard .....	125
4.5	Waiver of Notice and Opportunity to be Heard .....	140
4.6	Continuing Jurisdiction .....	142
4.7	The Contact that Makes It Reasonable to Adjudicate (Nexus): Comparison of State and Federal Courts .....	144
4.8	Nexus: The Supreme Court Cases .....	147
	A. Cases Before 1977 .....	148
	B. Cases Since 1977 .....	152
4.8A	Confusion Resulting from Supreme Court Jurisdictional Decisions and Proposals for Change .....	192
4.8A(1)	Tripartite Test for Specific Jurisdiction .....	192

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
4.8A(1)	Examples of Confusion in Jurisdictional Decisions .....	192
4.8A(1)(A)	Suits Between Merchant Buyers and Merchant Sellers ..	192
4.8A(1)(B)	Suits against Hotels, Resorts, and Cruise Lines .....	193
4.8A(1)(C)	Defamation over the Telephone.....	195
4.8A(1)(D)	A Proposal for Major Changes in Jurisdictional Doctrine: Fairness Without Contacts.....	196
4.8A(1)(E)	A Proposal for Modest Changes in Jurisdictional Doctrine.....	199
4.9	Forum Contacts Sufficient for Jurisdiction In Personam: Introduction: Survey of Long-Arm Statutes .....	202
4.9A	Survey of Long-Arm Statutes .....	203
4.9B	Retroactive Application of a Long-Arm Statute .....	205
4.9C	Distinction between General and Specific Jurisdiction ...	207
4.10	Presence .....	207
4.11	Domicile, Residence, and Nationality or Citizenship .....	209
4.12	Consent .....	211
4.13	Appearance .....	215
4.14	Doing Business .....	216
4.15	Causing Consequences in the Forum.....	222
4.16	Causing Consequences in the Forum by Tortious Conduct .....	223
4.17	Jurisdiction Based on Internet Activities .....	237
4.18	Contractual Transactions in the Forum.....	240
4.19	Ownership and Use of Property .....	246
4.20	Long-Arm Jurisdiction in Matters of Alimony, Support, and Custody .....	247
4.21	In Personam Jurisdiction Over Corporations.....	249
4.22	Partnerships and Other Unincorporated Associations....	252
4.23	The Time at Which a Basis for Jurisdiction Must Exist	253
4.24	In Rem and Quasi In Rem Jurisdiction Defined .....	255
4.25	The Nexus That Makes the Exercise of In Rem or Quasi In Rem Jurisdiction Reasonable .....	256
4.26	When Property Must Be Attached or Otherwise Brought Under the Court's Control .....	259
4.27	Uses of In Rem Jurisdiction That Survive Shaffer v. Heitner.....	260
4.28	Use of Quasi In Rem Jurisdiction to Apply the Defendant's Interest in Property to a Claim Unrelated to the Property: Shaffer v. Heitner.....	264
4.29	Rush v. Savchuk .....	268
4.30	The Commerce Clause as a Limit on State-Court Jurisdiction .....	270
4.31	Other Federally-Imposed Limitations on State-Court Jurisdiction .....	273
4.32	Self-Imposed Limitations on Jurisdiction .....	273
4.33	Forum Non Conveniens .....	274

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
4.33A	The United States Is A Magnet Forum .....	277
4.33B	Federal Forum Non Conveniens: Piper Aircraft Co. v. Reyno.....	279
4.33C	Shopping Between State and Federal Courts.....	284
4.33D	Conditions for Dismissal .....	287
4.33E	Transfer Under 1404(a) .....	289
4.33F	Internal Affairs of Corporations .....	290
4.33G	Enjoining Suit in Another Jurisdiction.....	290
4.33G(1)	United Kingdom and Canadian Decisions on Enjoining Suit Abroad.....	294
4.34	Immunity from Personal Service .....	296
4.35	Consent to the Exclusive Jurisdiction of a Foreign Court .....	298
4.36	Force and Fraud .....	301
4.37	Special Appearance .....	302
4.38	Stay Because of Pending Action .....	304
4.39	Local Action .....	305
<b>CHAPTER 5. MARRIAGE, DIVORCE, CUSTODY, AND SUPPORT.....</b>		<b>307</b>
<b>Sec.</b>		
5.1	Marriage.....	307
5.1B	Distinction between Validity and Incidents .....	310
5.1C	Is Validation Under the Law of the Place of Celebration Desirable? .....	310
5.2	Divorce.....	316
5.2A	Jurisdiction Based on Domicile .....	317
5.2B	Ex Parte Divorces: Full Faith and Credit and Collateral Attack .....	320
5.2C	Ex Parte Divorces: Full Faith and Credit to a Successful Collateral Attack .....	322
5.2D	Bilateral Divorces.....	327
5.2E	Alimony and Support.....	330
5.2E1	The Need for In Personam Jurisdiction Over the Other Spouse.....	330
5.2E2	The Need for In Personam Jurisdiction Over the Other Spouse: "Divisible Divorce".....	330
5.2E3	Full Faith and Credit to Alimony and Support Decrees .....	334
5.2E4	Uniform Interstate Family Support Act.....	336
5.2E5	Enforcement of Support Obligations Incurred in Foreign Countries .....	337
5.2F	Estoppel to Make a Collateral Attack on Divorce .....	338
5.2G	Divorce Jurisdiction not Based on Domicile .....	340
5.3	Custody .....	343
5.3A	Is Personal Jurisdiction Over Custody Contestants Necessary for a Valid Custody Determination? .....	343
5.3B	Bases for Custody Jurisdiction .....	349

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
	A. Overview .....	349
	B. Original Jurisdiction .....	350
	1. Historical Bases .....	350
	2. The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act (UCCJA) .....	351
	3. The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act (UCCJEA) .....	353
	C. Modification Jurisdiction .....	355
	1. Historical Basis .....	355
	2. The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act (UCCJA) .....	355
	3. The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act (UCCJEA) .....	357
	4. The Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act (PKPA) .....	358
	5. International Conventions .....	359
5.3C	Enforcement of Custody Decrees .....	364
	A. History .....	364
	B. The UCCJA Modification Provisions .....	367
	C. The UCCJEA Modification Provisions .....	368
	D. The PKPA .....	368
	<b>CHAPTER 6. TORTS</b> .....	371
<b>Sec.</b>		
6.1	Scope of Chapter: A Study of the Place-of-Wrong Rule and its Displacement .....	371
6.2	The Choice Between Territorial and Consequences- Based Rules .....	373
6.3	Know the Content of Law before Choosing It .....	374
6.4	Requirements for a Consequences-Based Approach .....	375
6.5	Determine Policies Underlying Conflicting Laws .....	375
6.6	Minimize Consequences that Violate a State's Policies ..	376
6.7	Avoid Unfair Surprise .....	377
6.8	The Foreign Choice-of-Law Rule .....	378
6.9	Choice-of-Law Rules .....	379
6.10	The Second Restatement's Rule .....	382
6.11	The Place-of-Wrong Rule in Operation .....	384
6.12	Interests of the Place of Wrong .....	393
6.13	Interests of the Defendant's Domicile .....	396
6.14	Forum Interests .....	397
6.15	Interests of Plaintiff's Domicile .....	399
6.16	Avoidance of the Place-of-Wrong Rule by Recharacteri- zation: "Tort" to "Contract" .....	400
6.17	More Recharacterization: The Harbingers of Interest Analysis—Grant, Haumschild, and Kilberg .....	403
6.18	Rapid Acceptance of Policy and Interest Analysis .....	408
6.19	Retention of the Place-of-Wrong Rule in Some States ....	421

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
6.20	Place-of-Wrong Rule through Statutory Construction . . .	422
6.21	Retention of Place-of-Wrong Rule for Certainty . . . . .	425
6.22	Neumeier v. Kuehner: New York's Return to a "Rules" Approach . . . . .	426
6.23	Examination of the Neumeier Rules . . . . .	428
6.24	The Rhode Island "Rules" Approach . . . . .	431
6.25	"No Interest" Cases . . . . .	433
6.26	Comparative Impairment in California: Bernhard v. Harrah's Club . . . . .	436
6.27	Objective Bases for a "Comparative Impairment" Method . . . . .	439
6.28	The Nexus Problem . . . . .	441
6.29	The "Better Law" . . . . .	444
6.30	A Post-Accident Change in Residence . . . . .	448
6.31	Products Liability . . . . .	452
6.32	The Multiple-State Torts of Invasion of Privacy, Libel, and Infringement of the Right of Publicity . . . . .	457
6.33	Mass Torts and Class Actions . . . . .	461
6.34	"Conduct Regulating" Rules Versus "Loss Allocating Rules" . . . . .	471
6.35	Workers' Compensation . . . . .	473
	<b>CHAPTER 7. CONTRACTS</b> . . . . .	475
<b>Sec.</b>		
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	475
7.2	The Distinctions between "Validity", "Construction", and "Interpretation" . . . . .	475
7.3	The Confusing Diversity of Rules for Determining Va- lidity . . . . .	476
7.3A	The Law of the Place of Making . . . . .	476
7.3B	The Law Intended by the Parties . . . . .	481
7.3C	The Law Chosen by the Parties . . . . .	482
7.3D	The Law of the State With the Most Significant Rela- tionship . . . . .	499
7.3E	Apply the Law of the Forum . . . . .	506
7.4	Rational Bases for Resolving True Conflicts Concerning the Validity of Contracts . . . . .	511
7.4A	A Rebuttable Presumption of Validity . . . . .	511
7.4B	Anachronism . . . . .	512
7.4C	Is the Difference between the Validating and Invalidat- ing Rule One of Detail or Basic Policy? . . . . .	515
7.4D	Unfair Surprise . . . . .	517
7.4E	How "Commercial" is the Contract? . . . . .	518
7.4F	What Functional Information Can be Derived from the Other State's Choice-Of-Law Rule? . . . . .	522
7.5	A Suggested Choice-Of-Law Rule for Validity of Con- tracts . . . . .	523

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
7.6	The New Rule Approach Applied to Interstate Small Loan Transactions .....	524
7.7	Statutory Choice-Of-Law Rules Concerning Small Loans .....	530
7.8	Choice of Law to Determine the Construction of a Contract .....	534
7.9	Elimination of Conflicts by Unification: The U.N. Convention .....	537
7.10	Conclusion .....	541
<b>CHAPTER 8. PROPERTY</b> .....		542
	I. REAL PROPERTY ("Immovables") .....	542
<b>Sec.</b>		
8.1	The Situs Rule .....	542
8.2	Reasons for the Situs Rule .....	543
8.3	Jurisdiction of the Non-Situs Court: Early Supreme Court Decisions .....	546
8.4	Jurisdiction of the Non-Situs Court: The Clarke and Fall Decisions .....	548
8.5	Full Faith and Credit for Non-Situs Decrees: Proper Constitutional Standards .....	552
8.6	A Functional Approach to Choosing Law for Determining Interests In Land .....	560
8.7	Intestate Distribution of Realty .....	560
8.8	Apportionment of Estate Taxes .....	563
8.9	Equitable Conversion .....	563
8.10	Validity of a Will Devising Realty .....	566
8.11	Applicability of a Mortmain Statute to a Devise of Realty .....	566
8.12	Perpetuities Problems Concerning Realty .....	570
8.13	Formalities of Execution and Revocation of a Will Devising Realty .....	571
8.14	Marital Property .....	572
8.15	Construction of the Will Devising Realty .....	579
8.16	Inter Vivos Transactions Concerning Realty: The Contract-Conveyance Distinction .....	582
8.17	Capacity to Affect Interests in Realty .....	583
8.18	Inter Vivos Transactions Concerning Realty: Formal and Substantial Validity .....	585
8.19	Construction of Inter Vivos Transfers of Interests in Land .....	588
8.20	Servitudes on Realty .....	589
8.21	Rights of Creditors with Security Interests in Realty .....	590
8.21A	Functional Analysis of Conflicts Problems Concerning Realty .....	591
8.22	Conclusion: The Situs Rule is Undesirable .....	594

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
8.23	Personal Property (“Movables”): The Situs Rule is Less Dominant .....	594
8.24	Intestate Succession to Personalty.....	595
8.25	Validity and Effect of a Will Bequeathing Personalty.....	596
8.26	Inter Vivos Trusts of Personalty.....	600
8.27	Commercial Transactions: The Uniform Commercial Code Will Not Eliminate Conflicts Problems .....	602
8.28	The Debtor and the Secured Creditor: Pre-Code Conflicts Rules .....	604
8.29	The 1962 Code Conflicts Rules .....	609
8.30	Choice of Law Between the Debtor and the Secured Creditor Under the 2000 Code .....	610
8.31	The Secured Creditor and Third Parties: Pre-Code Conflicts Rules .....	610
8.32	The Secured Creditor and Third Persons under Article 9.....	614
8.33	Uncertificated Securities: The 2000 Code .....	615
8.34	Choice of Law for Security Interests Under the 2000 Code.....	615
8.35	The Need for Federalization .....	618
8.36	International Conventions and Model Laws Affecting Security Interests.....	618
 <b>CHAPTER 9. CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITATIONS ON CHOICE OF LAW.....</b>		
<b>Sec.</b>		
9.1	Introduction .....	620
9.2	Due Process Limitations on a State’s Choice of Law .....	621
9.2A	General Considerations.....	621
9.2B	Effect of Procedural Classification on Due Process Limitations.....	650
9.3	Full Faith and Credit Limitations on a State’s Choice of Law .....	656
9.3A	General Considerations.....	656
9.3B	Other Uses of a Proper Full Faith and Credit Standard .....	675
9.3C	Effect of a Procedural Classification on Full Faith and Credit Limitations.....	678
9.3D	Historical Problems in the Application of the Full Faith and Credit Clause .....	680
9.4	Equal Protection Limitations on a State’s Choice of Law .....	682
 <b>CHAPTER 10. CHOICE OF LAW IN THE FEDERAL COURTS.....</b>		
<b>Sec.</b>		
10.1	The Erie Doctrine and State Conflict-of-Laws Rules.....	687
10.2	Development of the Outcome—Determinative Test.....	687

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Sec.</b>		
10.3	Byrd and Hanna: New Light? .....	697
10.4	“Countervailing Considerations”: The Key to Use of State Conflict-of-Laws Rules in Federal Courts.....	704
10.5	The Argument Against the Application of Erie to any Conflicts Problem .....	707
10.5A	The Danger of Interstate Forum-Shopping.....	707
10.5B	The Danger of Intrastate Forum-Shopping.....	711
10.5C	The Loss of Federal Judicial Talent in Developing Con- flicts Rules .....	714
10.5D	Across-the-Board Refusal to Apply State Conflicts Rules Unjustified.....	718
10.6	State Forum-Closing Conflicts Rules .....	718
10.6A	General Diversity Jurisdiction .....	718
10.6B	Constitutional Limitations on Forum Closing.....	721
10.6C	State Forum-Closing Rules in Federal Interpleader Ac- tions.....	722
10.7	Application of State Law on the Merits When the Federal Court Has Wider Jurisdiction Than a State Court .....	724
10.7A	Interpleader Actions .....	724
10.7B	Federal Rule 4(k) .....	725
10.7C	Section 1404(a) Transfers.....	726
10.7D	Pendent Jurisdiction .....	730
10.8	The Proper Scope of Klaxon .....	731
10.9	Does Federal Law Displace State Law?.....	733
	<b>CHAPTER 11. JUDGMENTS.....</b>	<b>737</b>
<b>Sec.</b>		
11.1	Previous Discussion of Full Faith and Credit to Judg- ments.....	737
11.2	Full Faith and Credit: The Constitution and Imple- menting Statute.....	738
11.3	The Effect of Full Faith and Credit.....	741
11.4	Defensive and Offensive Non-Mutual Collateral Estop- pel .....	743
11.5	Full Faith and Credit to the Collateral Estoppel Effects of Sister State Judgments .....	745
11.6	Recognition of the Judgments of Other Countries.....	746
11.7	Nonrecognition of Foreign Tax Judgments .....	751
11.8	Recognition Abroad of United States Judgments .....	753
	<b>CHAPTER 12. INTERNATIONAL PROBLEMS .....</b>	<b>760</b>
<b>Sec.</b>		
12.1	Extaterritorial Application of Antitrust Law .....	760
12.2	Protecting United States Exporters .....	764
12.3	Globalization Increases Effects Abroad.....	766



*TABLE OF CONTENTS*

<b>Sec.</b>		
12.4	Extraterritorial Application of Securities and Other Laws .....	767
12.5	The Act of State Doctrine .....	770
12.6	Protection of Investments in Foreign Countries .....	773
12.7	State Legislation Interfering with Foreign Affairs .....	775
TABLE OF CASES .....		779
INDEX .....		849