

**Interregional Migration  
and Public Policy in  
Canada** Kathleen M. Day  
and Stanley L. Winer

# Interregional Migration and Public Policy in Canada

An Empirical Study

KATHLEEN M. DAY AND STANLEY L. WINER



Carleton Library Series 223

McGill-Queen's University Press  
Montreal & Kingston • London • Ithaca

© McGill-Queen's University Press 2012

ISBN 978-0-7735-3744-6 (cloth)

ISBN 978-0-7735-3745-3 (paper)

Legal deposit first quarter 2012

Bibliothèque nationale du Québec

Printed in Canada on acid-free paper that is 100% ancient forest free  
(100% post-consumer recycled), processed chlorine free

This book has been published with the help of a grant from the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences, through the Aid to Scholarly Publications Program, using funds provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

McGill-Queen's University Press acknowledges the support of the Canada Council for the Arts for our publishing program. We also acknowledge the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Canada Book Fund for our publishing activities.

---

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Day, Kathleen Mary, 1958–

Interregional migration and public policy in Canada : an empirical study / Kathleen M. Day and Stanley L. Winer.

(Carleton library series ; 223)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7735-3744-6 (bound). – ISBN 978-0-7735-3745-3 (pbk.)

1. Migration, Internal – Canada. 2. Migration, Internal – Economic aspects – Canada. 3. Canada – Economic conditions – Regional disparities. 4. Canada – Economic policy – 1991– . I. Winer, Stanley L., 1947–  
II. Title. III. Series: Carleton library ; 223

HBI989.D39 2011

304.80971

C2011-905591-0

---

Typeset by Jay Tee Graphics Ltd. in 10/13 Sabon

**INTERREGIONAL MIGRATION AND PUBLIC POLICY  
IN CANADA**

*To Elie and Rima*

K.D.

*To my parents, Albert and Shirley*

S.W.

## Preface

In this book we investigate the empirical relationship between internal migration and public policy in Canada. Each of us has pursued this challenging issue, on and off, for more than two decades, and for one of us, it has been more than three since the study of policy-induced migration began. Our collaboration goes back to 1994 when we undertook a review of the literature for the Ontario Fair Tax Commission. The basic work for the present study was undertaken at Statistics Canada over about a four-year period beginning with our initial proposals for research and ending in 2001 after our results were cleared for publication by Statistics Canada. We completed a long technical report on our work in 2002, and then published a short journal article, which for various reasons appeared in print only in 2006. We sought support for publication of the full study, undergoing the associated reviewing, and once that lengthy process had been successfully completed, we undertook the substantial revisions that are required to turn the technical report into a book. All of this has taken time, and so we are pleased to finally be able to present our work here along with our assessment of the state of the Canadian literature on policy-induced migration.

Our original research was financed by a grant from the federal department of Human Resources, and by many services-in-kind from Statistics Canada under their Visiting Research Fellowship program. Winer's research was also partly supported by the Canada Research Chairs program. The publication of the book itself is supported by the Aid to Scholarly Publications Program of the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences. We are grateful for all of this financial help, without which our research and this book would not have been possible.

Programming was provided by Manohar Surkund. Our debt to him is substantial. He has worked on migration almost as long as we have. Long before he retired, he was the programmer for the study on internal migration

that Stanley Winer and Denis Gauthier completed in 1983 for the Economic Council of Canada, the first study in Canada to use migration data derived from tax files. It was our good fortune that he retired from the Public Service just before we began the present work and that our paths crossed at the right time. Processing the tax tapes to derive the migration data we use for our empirical work is a huge, difficult, and time-consuming enterprise, one that for obvious reasons of confidentiality must be done only at Statistics Canada under its careful oversight. We could not have completed the task without Manohar's expertise. The task was actually enormous for all concerned, and when we reflect on this project now, we are at times amazed that we decided to undertake it.

The book before you is a substantially revised version of Human Resources Development Canada Technical Report W-01-3E, which was made available by them on the web in 2002, and on Stanley Winer's website at [www.carleton.ca/~winers](http://www.carleton.ca/~winers). Selected results from the full study appeared in *International Tax and Public Finance* 13 (2006), 535–64, under the title “Policy-Induced Internal Migration: An Empirical Investigation of the Canadian Case.” We are grateful to editors Michael Devereux and John Wilson for their helpful comments and editorial assistance.

Some of the material in the book is taken from our journal article and some from the review (Day and Winer 1994) that we did for the Ontario Fairtax Commission. We extend our appreciation to Springer and to the University of Toronto Press for permission to use this published work here.

We are also grateful to a great number of people who assisted us in various ways in the course of our research. To Louis Grignon, Marcel Bédard, Patrick Hayes, and Anne Tweddle at HRDC, and to Garnett Picot, Richard Dupuy, Len Landry, Shawna Brown, Lise Champagne, Dan Finnerty, Michel Girard, Pat Grainger, Mark Levesque, Brian Murphy, Ronald Rioux, Abe Tarasovsky, and Karen Wilson at Statistics Canada. (The long gestation period of the manuscript is such that Abe, Garnett, and Len are now retired.) We also want to thank several anonymous referees as well as John Cragg, Ross Finnie, Pierre Lefebvre, Tim Sargent, François Vaillancourt, and Jean-Pierre Voyer for assistance with various aspects of the project. Michael Francis, Jafar Khondaker, Richard Levesque, and Déla Hoyi provided able research assistance in the conduct of the research and in the preparation of the manuscript.

Finally, we would like to express our appreciation to Philip Cercone, Ron Curtis, and Susanne McAdam and the production team at McGill-Queen's University Press for their patience and their help in the preparation of the book.

# CARLETON LIBRARY SERIES

The Carleton Library Series publishes books about Canadian economics, geography, history, politics, public policy, society and culture, and related topics, in the form of leading new scholarship and reprints of classics in these fields. The series is funded by Carleton University, published by McGill-Queen's University Press, and is under the guidance of the Carleton Library Series Editorial Board, which consists of faculty members of Carleton University. Suggestions and proposals for manuscripts and new editions of classic works are welcome and may be directed to the Carleton Library Series Editorial Board c/o the Library, Carleton University, Ottawa K1S 5B6, at [cls@carleton.ca](mailto:cls@carleton.ca), or on the web at [www.carleton.ca/cls](http://www.carleton.ca/cls).

CLS board members: John Clarke, Sheryl Hamilton, Jennifer Henderson, Laura Macdonald, Brian McKillop, Barry Wright

- |     |   |     |   |
|-----|---|-----|---|
| 192 | <i>The Blacks in Canada: A History</i><br>(second edition)<br>Robin Winks   | 199 | <i>A Great Duty</i><br><i>Canadian Responses to Modern</i><br><i>Life and Mass Culture, 1939-1967</i><br>L.B. Kuffert   |
| 193 | <i>A Disciplined Intelligence</i><br><i>Critical Inquiry and Canadian</i><br><i>Thought in the Victorian Era</i><br>A.B. McKillop | 200 | <i>The Politics of Development</i><br><i>Forests, Mines, and Hydro-Electric</i><br><i>Power in Ontario, 1849-1941</i><br>H.V. Nelles  |
| 194 | <i>Land, Power, and Economics on the</i><br><i>Frontier of Upper Canada</i><br>John Clarke  | 201 | <i>Watching Quebec</i><br><i>Selected Essays</i><br>Ramsay Cook   |
| 195 | <i>The Children of Aataentsic</i><br><i>A History of the Huron People</i><br><i>to 1660</i><br>Bruce G. Trigger                   | 202 | <i>Land of the Midnight Sun</i><br><i>A History of the Yukon</i><br>Ken S. Coates and William R.<br>Morrison  |
| 196 | <i>Silent Surrender</i><br><i>The Multinational Corporation</i><br><i>in Canada</i><br>Kari Levitt                                | 203 | <i>The Canadian Quandary</i><br>(New edition)<br>Harry Johnson  |
| 197 | <i>Cree Narrative</i><br><i>Expressing the Personal Meanings</i><br><i>of Events</i><br>Richard J. Preston                        | 204 | <i>Canada and the Cost of</i><br><i>World War II</i><br><i>The International Operation of the</i><br><i>Department of Finance, 1939-1947</i><br>Robert B. Bryce<br>Edited by Mathew Bellamy |
| 198 | <i>The Dream of Nation</i><br><i>A Social and Intellectual History</i><br><i>of Quebec</i><br>Susan Mann                          | 205 | <i>Lament for a Nation</i><br>(Anniversary edition)<br>George Grant   |



- 206 *Confederation Debates in the Province of Canada, 1865*  
(New edition)  
P.B. Waite
- 207 *The History of Canadian Business, 1867-1914*  
R.T. Naylor
- 208 *Lord Durham's Report*  
(New edition)  
Based on the Abridgement by  
Gerald M. Craig
- 209 *The Fighting Newfoundlander  
A History of the Royal  
Newfoundland Regiment*  
G.W.L. Nicholson
- 210 *Staples and Beyond  
Selected Writings of Mel Watkins*  
Edited by Hugh Grant and  
David Wolfe
- 211 *The Making of the Nations and  
Cultures of the New World  
An Essay in Comparative History*  
G  rard Bouchard
- 212 *The Quest of the Folk  
Antimodernism and Cultural  
Selection in Twentieth-Century  
Nova Scotia*  
Ian McKay
- 213 *Health Insurance and Canadian  
Public Policy  
The Seven Decisions That Created  
the Canadian Health Insurance  
System and Their Outcomes*  
Malcolm G. Taylor
- 214 *Inventing Canada  
Early Victorian Science and the  
Idea of a Transcontinental Nation*  
Suzanne Zeller
- 215 *Documents on the Confederation  
of British North America*  
G.P. Browne
- 216 *The Irish in Ontario  
A Study in Rural History*  
Donald Harman Akenson
- 217 *The Canadian Economy in the  
Great Depression (Third edition)*  
A.E. Safarian
- 218 *The Ordinary People of Essex  
Environment, Culture, and  
Economy on the Frontier of  
Upper Canada*  
John Clarke
- 219 *So Vast and Various  
Interpreting Canada's Regions  
in the Nineteenth and Twentieth  
Centuries*  
Edited by John Warkentin
- 220 *Industrial Organization in Canada  
Empirical Evidence and Policy  
Challenges*  
Edited by Zhiqi Chen and  
Marc Duhamel
- 221 *Surveyors of Empire  
Samuel Holland, J.F.W. Des Barres,  
and the Making of The Atlantic  
Neptune*  
Stephen J. Hornsby
- 222 *Peopling the North American City  
Montreal, 1840-1900*  
Sherry Olson and Patricia Thornton
- 223 *Interregional Migration and Public  
Policy in Canada  
An Empirical Study*  
Kathleen M. Day and  
Stanley L. Winer

# Contents

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| Tables   | xi    |
| Figures  | xvii  |
| Preface  | xxiii |
| 1 Public Policy and Interregional Migration: An Introduction to the Issues         | 3     |
| 2 Regional Dimensions of Public Policy in Canada                                   | 26    |
| 3 A Review of Four Decades of Empirical Research                                   | 50    |
| 4 An Empirical Model of Interprovincial Migration                                  | 82    |
| 5 From Theory to Measurement   | 104   |
| 6 Estimation   | 153   |
| 7 Exploring the Effects of Marginal Policy Reforms                                 | 185   |
| 8 Simulating Counterfactual Policy Regimes and Other Scenarios                     | 208   |
| 9 What We Have Learned   | 254   |
| APPENDICES   |       |
| A Data Sources   | 267   |
| B Construction of the Migration Data   | 279   |
| C Construction of the Unemployment Insurance Variables                             | 288   |
| D Measuring the Probabilities of the Employment States by Age and Sex              | 304   |
| E Correlation Coefficients, and Additional Estimates by Age, Sex, and Income Class | 315   |

F Marginal Effect Formulas 329

G Simulations and Tables 339

Notes 377

Bibliography 389

Index 401

# Tables

- 1.1 Earnings, Unemployment Insurance, and Social Assistance in the Canadian Federation, 1978-2008 5
- 1.2 International and Internal Migration, Canada and the Provinces 9
- 2.1 Changes in Relevant Unemployment Insurance Parameters, 1955-96 29
- 2.2 Changes to Regional Extended Benefit Provision 34
- 2.3 Variable Entrance Requirement, 1977-96 36
- 3.1 A Summary of Empirical Studies of Fiscally Induced Migration in Canada 75
- 4.1 Variable Definitions: Theoretical Model 92
- 5.1 Difference between *MIN* and *MXR* ( $MXR - MIN$ ) 125
- 6.1 Variable Definitions: Empirical Model 155
- 6.2 Parameter estimates by Income Class, 1974-96 160
- 6.3 Summary Statistics for Correlations between Actual and Fitted Migration Rates, 1974-96 166
- 6.4 Correlations between Actual and Fitted Values of In-, Out-, and Net In-migration, 1974-96 168
- 6.5 Difference between 1974-96 Average of Actual and Predicted Migration Flows 170
- 6.6 Parameter Estimates by Income Class, Model 1, 1968-96 173

- 6.7 Coefficients of *INCOME* and *LEISURE* by Age, Sex, and Income Class, 1974-96 177
- 6.8 Coefficients of *DSTAY* and *DISTANCE* by Age, Sex, and Income Class, 1974-96 178
- 6.9 Coefficients of *PQ* and *PQ2* by Age, Sex, and Income Class, 1974-96 180
- 6.10 Coefficients of *FISH* and *FISH2* by Age, Sex, and Income Class, 1974-96 182
- 7.1 Average Own-Province Marginal Effects on Net In-migration of Changes in Selected Variables, 1978-96, Model 1 188
- 7.2 Average Own-Province Marginal Effects on Net In-migration of Changes in Selected Variables, 1978-96, Model 2 190
- 7.3 Policy Changes Equivalent to a \$1 Change in Average Weekly Earnings, 1978-96, Model 1 192
- 7.4 Policy Changes Equivalent to a \$1 Change in Average Weekly Earnings, 1978-96, Model 2 194
- 7.5 Means of Selected Explanatory Variables, 1978-96, by Province 196
- 8.1 Actual and Predicted Values of Average Annual Migration Flows, 1978-96 211
- 8.2a Predicted Effect on Mobility of Eliminating Regional Variation, Model 1 241
- 8.2b Predicted Effect on Mobility of Eliminating Regional Variation, Model 2 242
- 8.3 Hypothetical Unemployment Rates Resulting from Elimination of Regional Dispersion (average 1978-96) 245
- 8.4 Change in Migration Flows Due to Extraordinary Events in Quebec and Newfoundland 251
- A1 Data Sources for Variables Used in Figures in Chapter 2 268
- A2 CANSIM Numbers for Labour Force and Employment Data 268
- A3 CANSIM Numbers for Average Weekly Earnings Data 270
- A4 CANSIM Numbers for Nonwage Income and Population Data 271

- A5 CANSIM Matrix and Series Numbers for data on Government Transfer Payments to Persons, Old Basis 271
- A6 Sources of Tax System Parameters 273
- A7 CANSIM Matrix and Series Numbers for Consolidated Provincial/ Local Government Spending data 276
- A8 CANSIM Matrix and Series Numbers for Federal Government Spending Data 277
- B1 Tuition Fee Amounts for 1995 and 1996 281
- B2 Median Total Income after Exclusions of Tax Filers 283
- B3 Total Outflows by Province, 1968-96 285
- B4 Total Inflows by Province, 1968-96 286
- B5 Total Net Inflows by Province, 1968-96 287
- C1 Relationship between *MXR* and the Regional Rate of Unemployment 292
- C2 Weekly Rates of Benefit Prevailing under 1959 Revisions to the UI Act 295
- C3 Weekly Rates of Benefit Prevailing under the 1968 Revisions to the UI Act 295
- C4 *MIN* by Province, 1966-96 298
- C5 *MXR* by Province, 1966-96 299
- C6 *MINWKS* by Province, 1966-96 300
- C7 *MXRWKS* by Province, 1966-96 301
- C8 Maximum Insurable Earnings, Benefit Replacement Rate, and Maximum Weekly Benefit 302
- C9 *WUI* by Province, 1966-96 303
- D1 CANSIM Numbers for LFS Employment Series 305
- D2 CANSIM Numbers for Number of Recipients of Regular UI Benefits 307
- D3 Listing of Aggregate Probabilities of the Four States of the World, 1966-96 310

|     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| E1  | Correlation Matrix of Explanatory Variables, Three Income Classes, 1974-96  | 316 |
| E2  | Correlations between Actual and Fitted Migration Rates, 1974-96, Model 1  | 318 |
| E3  | Correlations between Actual and Fitted Migration Rates, 1974-96, Model 2  | 320 |
| E4  | Parameter estimates for Model 1, by Income Class, Age, and Sex, 1974-96   | 322 |
| E5  | Parameter estimates for Model 2, by Income Class, Age, and Sex, 1974-96   | 325 |
| G1  | Variables Affected by Simulations and Numbering of Simulations  | 341 |
| G2  | Estimated Regional Extended Benefits, 1990-94   | 342 |
| G3  | <i>MINWKS</i> for Simulation 1, 1978-96   | 344 |
| G4  | Weeks of Social Assistance Benefits in State 3 for Simulation 1   | 344 |
| G5  | Values of <i>MXYR</i> for Simulation 1  | 345 |
| G6  | Values of <i>MXYR</i> for Simulation 2  | 346 |
| G7  | Values of <i>MINWKS</i> for Simulation 2  | 346 |
| G8  | Number of Weeks on Social Assistance in State 3, Simulation 2   | 347 |
| G9  | Values of Variables for Simulations 6, 7, and 9   | 348 |
| G10 | Probabilities of States of the World for Simulation 10  | 349 |
| G11 | Elimination of Variable Entrance Requirement, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96                          | 351 |
| G12 | Elimination of Regional Extended Benefit, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96                              | 352 |
| G13 | No Regional Variation in <i>UI</i> , Average Annual Change in Migration Flows by Income Class, 1978-96                        | 354 |
| G14 | No Regional Variation in <i>UI</i> , Average Annual Change in Migration Flows by Age, Sex, and Income Class, Model 1, 1978-96 | 356 |
| G15 | Base Case Predicted Average Annual Migration Flows by Age, Sex, and Income Class, Model 1, 1978-96                            | 360 |

- G16 Equal Income Tax Rates, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 363
- G17 Equal Social Assistance Benefits, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 364
- G18 Equal Spending on Education, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 366
- G19 Equal Federal Spending, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 367
- G20 No Regional Variation in Policy, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 369
- G21 No Regional Variation in Average Weekly Earnings, Average Annual Change in Inflows and Outflows, 1978-96 370
- G22 No Regional Variation in Probabilities, Average Annual Change in Migration Flows, 1978-96 372
- G23 No Moving Costs, Average Annual Change in Migration Flows, 1978-96 374



## Figures

- 1.1 Interregional migration, public policy and the allocation of labour services in the national economy 13
- 2.1 Regional variation in labour market variables 31
- 2.2 Regional variation in provincial/local government policies 32
- 2.3 Regional variation in federal government policies 33
- 2.4a Average weekly earnings relative to 10-province average 38
- 2.4b Average weekly earnings relative to 10-province average 38
- 2.5a Unemployment rate, both sexes, 15+ relative to 10-province average 39
- 2.5b Unemployment rate, both sexes, 15+ relative to 10-province average 39
- 2.6a Per capita spending on health relative to 10-province average 40
- 2.6b Per capita spending on health relative to 10-province average 40
- 2.7a Per capita spending on education relative to 10-province average 41
- 2.7b Per capita spending on education relative to 10-province average 41
- 2.8a Per capita other spending relative to 10-province average 42
- 2.8b Per capita other spending relative to 10-province average 42
- 2.9a Social assistance benefits relative to 10-province average 43