# THE ORIGINS OF THE CULTURAL REVOLUTION

3: THE COMING OF THE CATACLYSM 1961—1966

Winner of the 1999 Joseph Levenson Prize for Books on Twentieth Century China, Association for Asian Studies

RODERICK MacFARQUHAR

## THE ORIGINS OF THE CULTURAL REVOLUTION

### 3 THE COMING OF THE CATACLYSM 1961–1966

RODERICK MACFARQUHAR

Published for

The Royal Institute of International Affairs Studies of the East Asian Institute

by

Oxford University Press and Columbia University Press

1997



Oxford University Press, Great Clarendon Street, Oxford 0x2 6DP Columbia University Press, New York Chichester, West Sussex

#### Oxford is a trade mark of Oxford University Press

First published in 1997

Published in the United States by Columbia University Press, New York

© Royal Institute of International Affairs 1997

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press or Columbia University Press in the United States.

Within the UK, exceptions are allowed in respect of any fair dealing for the purpose of research or private study, or criticism or review, as permitted under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, or in the case of reprographic reproduction in accordance with the terms of the licences issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside these terms and in other countries should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

> British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data Data available

> > ISBN: 0-19-2149970

#### 13579108642

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data MacFarquhar Roderick. The Origins of the Cultural Revolution (Studies of the East Asian Institute)

Includes bibliographic references and index. Contents: 1. Contradictions among the people, 1956-1957-

2. The great leap forward, 1958-1960-

3. The coming of the cataclysm, 1961-1966.

1. China—Politics and government—1949-1976.

2. China—History—Cultural Revolution, 1966-1969. I. Royal Institute of International Affairs. II. Columbia University. East Asian Institute. III. Columbia University. Research Institute on Communist Affairs. IV. Columbia University.

Research Institute on International Change. V. Title. VI. Series. 73-15794

DS 777.75.M32 1974 951.05

> ISBN 0-231-03841-0 (v.1) ISBN 0-231-08385-8 (v.1,pa) ISBN 0-231-05716-4 (v.2) ISBN 0-231-05717-2 (v.2,pa) ISBN 978-0-231-11083-9 (v.3.pa)

#### THE ORIGINS OF THE CULTURAL REVOLUTION

3 The Coming of the Cataclysm 1961-1966

The Royal Institute of International Affairs is an independent body which promotes the rigorous study of international questions and does not express opinions of its own. The opinions expressed in this publication are the responsibility of the author.

Studies of the East Asian Institute, Columbia University
The East Asian Institute is Columbia University's center for research, publication, and teaching on modern East Asia. The Studies of the East Asian Institute were inaugurated in 1962 to bring to a wider public the results of significant new research on modern and contemporary East Asia.

Tanksa kang yang salang Z And Tungs sang din

For Benjamin Schwartz

The pioneer in the study of Chinese communism

Latter of scheme and the

The fact of the sale and are suffered and and the sale of the sale

A read to state over the

a elipadija z R.F.

ુન્યુ કુલાઇ લે તેમનું હતા પીઠકો કર્યોનું

Company A A ....

So many deeds cry out to be done,
And always urgently;
The world rolls on,
Time presses.
Ten thousand years are too long,
Seize the day, seize the hour!
The Four Seas are rising, clouds and waters raging,
The Five Continents are rocking, wind and thunder roaring.
Away with all pests!
Our force is irresistible.

MAO ZEDONG, 9 Jan. 1963 (Chinese Literature, No. 5, 1966)

#### **PREFACE**

Scanning the shelves of the main Shanghai bookshop in the summer of 1990, I happily noted out of the corner of my eye that a new translation of the first two volumes of this work was prominently displayed on a table. A Chinese who was glancing through one of the volumes was approached by my escort from the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS) and told that if he bought the book he could get it signed by the author. The reader replied: 'I'm waiting for volume three.' I have often thought of that canny consumer since I slunk mortified out of the shop, and I hope he, and all my kind colleagues and friends in China and the West who have questioned me about the imminence of this final volume, will be satisfied that it is at least, and at last, out.

I have persisted in my original purpose, formulated over a quarter-century ago, to examine the impact of the main events of the decade prior to the Cultural Revolution on the thinking, actions, and interaction of the Chinese leaders in order to understand why Mao decided to tear down and rebuild a regime he had done so much to create. Readers of the earlier volumes may remember that I have been particularly interested in the human tragedy represented by Mao's purge of his longtime comrades of the Long March and the base areas, his dissolution of the Yan'an 'Round Table'.

As in the case of Volume Two, a bonus from, and an important cause of, the delay in the production of this book has been the vast increase in the availability of Chinese sources. What was a rushing mountain torrent a decade ago is now the broad Yangtze River, and I am acutely conscious that in attempting to cover so wide a canvas, I will inevitably have missed important materials, perhaps ones that would have cleared up questions which still puzzle me; some issues, however, will be resolved only when the party archives are eventually opened up.

How has the new material affected this study? The argument still proceeds along the original path, but more easily, thanks to the light shed by Chinese documents and secondary works. Masochistic readers who sat down to read all three volumes in a sitting might find two shifts of perception. My image of Mao is now less the stern but unifying sovereign of the Round Table, more a suspicious Olympian

Jove, ready to strike down with lightning bolts. To some extent, this reflects the changing environment in which Mao found himself (and which he helped to create) in the decade covered by this work, but I am more inclined now to believe in his original sin. Secondly, while the countryside has been evidently a critical factor in the Chinese political process in the earlier volumes, here it emerges as fundamental to an understanding of the origins of the Cultural Revolution.

Another cause of delay in completing this volume, ironically, was my move to Harvard's ivy tower in 1984. As a visiting professor two years earlier, spared of all duties but teaching, I could not understand why scholars were not more productive. Now I know. The pleasures of contributing in various small ways to the running of the institution, and in particular the challenge of following Philip Kuhn to direct the Fairbank Center for six years, have meant that my research and writing have been confined mainly to that bourn from which no academic returns happily, the summer recess.

One great compensation for my change of career has been moving on to a new learning curve as a result of regularly interacting with China scholars and political scientists. Editing the PRC volumes of the Cambridge History of China with John Fairbank enabled me to tap into the knowledge and wisdom of many distinguished specialists, as my endnotes indicate. Fairbank Center seminars—too many to keep up with—have been a constant stimulation. The regular canteen lunches with Center familiars and visitors have been peculiarly valuable, a time when longtime colleagues probe each other's views free of the constraints of the seminar room, or maybe just bemoan the state of the world. In the past, working mainly alone, it was relatively easy for me to acknowledge my debts; today, my mind boggles at the thought of listing everyone from whom I have gleaned an idea or a fact or a reference.

But at the Center, Merle Goldman's pathbreaking works on some of the wretched of the earth—the 'stinking ninth category' of Chinese intellectuals—have informed mine. Stuart Schram's monumental edition of the revolutionary writings of Mao is enriching my understanding of where the Chairman was coming from. Lucian Pye's ever-sceptical vision of Mao has worn the test of time better than most. The works of Jean Oi and David Zweig have helped me perceive the Chinese countryside in new ways. Michael Schoenhals stimulated and enlightened me when he spent a year with us under a generous Luce Foundation grant for the Center's Cultural Revolution project, run by Andrew Walder; Michael and I are collaborating on a book (one volume!) on the Cultural Revolution. Farther afield,

Frederick Teiwes has continued to produce great vintages from a vineyard close to my own. Jonathan Mirsky's essays in the New York Review of Books and frequent conversations have forced me to keep re-examining assumptions.

Another great boon at the Fairbank Center has been the Library, absolutely critical to my gaining access to the mass of new Chinese documentation. My heartfelt thanks go to Nancy Hearst, its devoted Librarian. Since expanding the scope of the collection to include Chinese materials in the mid-1980s, she has built up a network of contacts within China and the West which enables her to learn of and obtain the best new books almost immediately. As so many scholars from all over the world know well, if you tell her your interests, she will seek high and low, only too successfully, to satisfy your needs. Her late summer safaris to China result in Christmas cornucopias, as book packages arrive off slow boats from China.

Since I wrote the previous volumes, all China specialists have gained enormously from much freer access to Chinese citizens. In the summers of 1984 and 1986, I paid two research visits to Beijing under the auspices of the British Academy-CASS exchange scheme, and was attached to the Institute for Marxism-Leninism-Mao Zedong Thought, under the aegis of its kindly director, Su Shaozhi, and had access to the Library of the Chinese Academy of Sciences. Then and later, there and here, I have talked to and learned from a wide range of writers, scholars, and scholar/officials. For reasons best known in the higher reaches of CASS, my requests to interview even retired central committee cadres, prominent in the period I was studying, never bore fruit. (In 1980, I sat in on meetings between former Prime Minister James Callaghan and Deng Xiaoping and Hua Guofeng, but somehow the origins of the Cultural Revolution did not crop up.) Caution begets caution, and I have thought it prudent to allude to all interview data by an alphabetic identification, e.g. Informant A, etc. In place of all those Chinese who were so generous with their time and knowledge, let me mention others who have increased my understanding of their country, our graduate students-Ding Xueliang, Fu Jun, Gong Xiaoxia, Gu Weiqun, Huang Jing, Huang Yasheng, Jing Jun, Pei Minxin, Tian Dongdong, Xiao Yanming, Xu Guoqi, Yang Bingzhang, Yang Jianli, Yin Xiaohuang, Zhang Wei, Zheng Shiping—half of whom are now professors and some of whom have produced their first books. I also owe a large debt of gratitude (even if OUP does not) to the teams who have translated the earlier volumes of this study and the Cambridge History of China; their toil has resulted in my hearing from people all over China, offering information and advice.

In the final stages of preparing the manuscript I accumulated fresh obligations. I owe Nancy Hearst another great debt for proofreading the manuscript with typically meticulous care, a considerable labour which involved matching up the bibliography and the notes, supplying missing references, and putting it all into OUP style. On receiving his copy, Michael Schoenhals opened up a fusillade of e-mail messages from Stockholm, correcting and supplementing my findings, particularly on Part Four; Nicholas Lardy read the chapters on the economy to try to keep me from gross error; Timothy Cheek shared with me the final draft of his manuscript on Deng Tuo, and commented perceptively on Chapter 11; Fu Jun checked the translations of Chinese works in the Bibliography and proof-read the manuscript; Huang Jing, whose dissertation on party factionalism has taught me much, examined Anhui newspapers and the output of Liao Mosha. The revised text was submitted to the Royal Institute of International Affairs, at Chatham House, where it was received by Margaret May, Chief Editor of Publications, with gratifying warmth, doubtless tinged with surprised relief. At OUP, the MS was carefully prepared for publication by Anna Illingworth, Michael Belson, and Jeff New. Anne Holmes brought professional and China skills to preparing a complex index.

Emily MacFarquhar, to whom the first volume was dedicated and who has lived patiently through the production of the second and third, read the whole manuscript with her customary sharp editorial pencil, and asked probing questions based on a store of China lore stretching back over her years as a correspondent for *The Economist* and *US News & World Report*; as usual her input added weeks to the work, but with the replacement of typewriters by computers, I have found that I can bear such spousal abuse with equanimity, responding to rewrite orders with sweetness and light, even if I still have to take sole responsibility for the final product.

I dedicate this volume to Benjamin Schwartz, teacher, colleague, and friend, who did so much to bring me to Harvard, and whose sceptical intelligence, broad knowledge, deep wisdom, and wry wit shine through his writings and conversation and continue to inform my understanding of China.

RODERICK MACFARQUHAR

Cambridge, Mass. October 1995

#### ABBREVIATIONS\*

ACFTU All-China Federation of Trade Unions APC Agricultural Producers' Co-operative

CAS Chinese Academy of Sciences

CASS Chinese Academy of Social Sciences

CC Central Committee

CCP Chinese Communist Party

CONEFO Conference of the New Emerging Forces

CPPCC Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference

CPSU Communist Party of the Soviet Union
CRG Central Cultural Revolution Small Group

FYP Five-Year Plan

GANEFO Games of the New Emerging Forces

GLF Great Leap Forward

GPD General Political Department

GZAR Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region

KMT Guomindang

MAC Military Affairs Commission
NEFA North-East Frontier Agency
NPC National People's Congress
PLA People's Liberation Army
PRC People's Republic of China
PSC Politburo Standing Committee
SEM Socialist Education Movement

SMC Supply and Marketing Co-operative

SSC Supreme State Conference

SSTC State Science and Technology Commission

UFWD United Front Work Department YCL Young Communist League

<sup>\*</sup> For abbreviations used in notes, see pp. 474-8 below.

List of Tables	хi
List of Plates	xv
Abbreviations	xvi
Introduction	1
Appendix 1: Birth and Death Rates	7
Part One: The Third Bitter Year	
I The Central Committee's Ninth Plenum	11
2 Emergency Measures	23
3 A New Course in the Countryside	39
4 A Plethora of Plans	72
5 Reds and Experts	90
6 China's Isolation	121
Part Two: False Dawn	
7 The Seven Thousand Cadres Conference	137
Appendix 2: The Changguanlou Incident	182
8 Economic Crunch	184
9 The Dispute over Collectivization	209
10 Resuscitating the United Front	234
11 The Curious Case of the 'Three-Family Village'	249
Part Three: Class Struggle	
12 Mao Changes the Signals	261
13 War in the Himalayas, Crisis in the Caribbean	297
14 Mao in Charge	324
Appendix 3: Comparative Dictatorial Roles and Styles	331
15 The Socialist Education Movement	334
16 The Sino-Soviet Rupture and the Vietnam War	349
Part Four: The End of the Yan'an Round Table	
17 Woman Warrior	381
18 From Grey Eminence to Red Leader	399
19 Mao Stoops to Conquer	431
20 The Coming of the Cataclysm	461

xii	CONTENTS	hit out
ψģ	Conclusions	mm PA 112.1466
107	Abbreviations used in the Notes	ะพยบริษัท เรายืนรับ <b>474</b>
	Notes	กดารสถานส <b>ี 479</b>
1,	Bibliography	- เป็าเรียกกฤษัก <b>657</b>
	Index : 1897-143400 K	MIT BUT ISAD PICTOR
it	ลักษายน Renthrist	mcDfgn.si3.sdT :
, e	à rith	er 15 pu <del>ngr<b>a</b>ni9</del>
D.	t a <b>Co</b> rtes Court	ge smid Lask J. g
7.25	at a	Ji tugh attala na s
LaGz		in aprili tins algoring
351		edmixi simuligiya
	sr#fi	Mark town Intend
77.1	ระบบ เกราะ (บังกับ รายาย bna	world mean off t
583	f hange and included	erl" mathemagna
pg i		8 Perinantic Critical
6.5		าการ อาการเป็นเปลี่ย
1.55		yr gitte i senn <b>s</b> Aj bri
045	applied throughout arter	ak lan in.€   @\$₹ ii
	April 18	Park Theore Closus
- 13k	Signal,	offrancial to the car
446	appear in the Carlype ab	is Wen in the Henal
400		🙀 Mir in Charge
1,5 5		
4.58		ing The straight fet.
917	Withhalf the Virtham W	I pagendau aut ad Tag
	sign the course that Table	Part four Time Enc
987		ins Women Wani
ŪQ.		th Frein Grey's man
E		Troffquare asM of
3-Q‡	c Catalot Ivan	died almost off the

#### **LIST OF TABLES**

Introduction: 1. Anhui province: grain and population, 1957–1962 2. Number of deaths for selected provinces, 1957	
and 1960	3
3. Chinese provinces with negative population	
growth, 1959–1961	5
Appendix: 1.1. Provincial birth rates, 1957-1962	7
1.2. Provincial death rates, 1957-1962	8
1.1. Per capita consumption of major food items, 1957 and 1960	14
1.2. Major economic figures, 1960–1961	18
1.3. Plan and performance, 1961: major industrial goods	18
2.1. Chinese grain exports, 1958–1960	25
2.2. Grain output and trade figures, 1959–1966	28
2.3. Value of Chinese imports and exports, 1958–1966	29
2.4. Employment figures, 1957-1966	34
2.5. Financial compensation for rusticated workers	35
2.6. Retail price indices	36
2.7. Retail prices of major consumer items, 1957-1962	37
2.8. Agricultural purchase prices, 1957-1962	37
2.9. Agricultural purchase prices index numbers	38
3.1. Numbers of communes and their sub-units, 1959-1961	67
4.1. Handicraft industry: value of output, 1957-1966	78
4.2. Selected industrial output figures, 1960–1962	82
4.3. Mining equipment	84
4.4. Coal output	85
5.1. Expansion and contraction in higher education, 1957-1963	102
5.2. Numbers of students in higher education	104
7.1. Changing proportions of economic sectors in national	
income, 1957-1961	138
7.2. Changing numbers of agricultural and industrial workers,	
1957–1961	139
7.3. Grain output and procurement, 1957-1961	139
7.4. State procurement of other major agricultural products,	
1957–1961	139
7.5. Changing retail prices of consumer goods, 1957–1961	139
7.6. State revenue by major source, 1957–1961	140

#### XIV TABLES

7.7.	State procurement prices for major agricultural products,	
	1957–1961	140
7.8.	Major items of state expenditure, 1957–1961	141
7.9.	State revenue and expenditure, 1957-1961	141
7.10.	1962 ten-year plan targets	150
8.1.	Zhou Enlai's summary of grain figures	185
8.2.	Supplies of grain to centre from main surplus provinces	185
	Zhou Enlai's depiction of the urban problem	185
	Zhou Enlai's summary of China's international liabilities	186
	Chinese financial deficits resulting from the GLF	187
	Key agricultural outputs for a grain surplus province,	,
	Heilongjiang, 1953–1961	201
12.1.	Numbers of communes and their sub-units, 1961–1964	287

#### LIST OF PLATES

#### (Plates between pp. 384 and 385)

- 1. Liu Shaoqi quizzing peasants in Hunan, 1961
- 2. Liu resting with Wang Guangmei in Heilongjiang, 1961
- 3. Seven Thousand Cadres Conference: The PSC in harmony?
- 4. China's active leaders in discussion at the conference
- Mao's leftist guerrillas: Jiang Qing emerges from seclusion to help Mao greet Mme Sukarno, Beijing, September 1962
- 6. Kang Sheng
- 7. The MAC standing committee in Canton
- 8. Deng Zihui addresses cadres in Fujian

NB: Whilst every effort has been made to trace the source of these plates, it has not proved possible to establish their origins.