ALLEN KRAAKWAN

COLLABORS AND CASES

ON THE LAW OF

BUSINESS ORGANIZATION

ASPEN

COMMENTARIES AND CASES ON THE LAW OF BUSINESS ORGANIZATION

William T. Allen Jack Nusbaum Professor of Law & Business New York University Of Counsel, Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz

Reinier Kraakman Ezra Ripley Thayer Professor of Law Harvard Law School





© 2003 Aspen Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Permissions Aspen Publishers 1185 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036

Printed in the United States of America.

1234567890

ISBN 0-7355-3384-9

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Allen, William T.

Commentaries and cases on the law of business organization / William T. Allen, Reinier Kraakman.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-7355-3384-9

1. Corporation law—United States—Cases. 2. Business enterprises—Law and legislation—United States—Cases. I. Kraakman, Reinier H. II. Title. KF1413.A435 2003 346.73'065—dc21

2002034496

COMMENTARIES AND CASES ON THE LAW OF BUSINESS ORGANIZATION

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Erwin Chemerinsky

Sydney M. Irmas Professor of Public Interest Law, Legal Ethics, and Political Science University of Southern California

Richard A. Epstein

James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business Stanford University Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business Columbia University

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law University of Michigan

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law Hofstra University

Kent D. Syverud

Dean and Garner Anthony Professor Vanderbilt University Law School

Elizabeth Warren

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law Harvard University

EMERITUS EDITORIAL ADVISORS

E. Allan Farnsworth

Alfred McCormack Professor of Law Columbia University

Geoffrey C. Hazard, Jr.

Trustee Professor of Law University of Pennsylvania

Bernard Wolfman

Fessenden Professor of Law Harvard University

About Aspen Publishers

Aspen Publishers, headquartered in New York City, is a leading information provider for attorneys, business professionals, and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, our products consist of analytical and practical information covering both U.S. and international topics. We publish in the full range of formats, including updated manuals, books, periodicals, CDs, and online products.

Our proprietary content is complemented by 2,500 legal databases, containing over 11 million documents, available through our Loislaw division. Aspen Publishers also offers a wide range of topical legal and business databases linked to Loislaw's primary material. Our mission is to provide accurate, timely, and authoritative content in easily accessible formats, supported by unmatched customer care.

To order any Aspen Publishers title, go to *www.aspenpublishers.com* or call 1-800-638-8437.

To reinstate your manual update service, call 1-800-638-8437.

For more information on Loislaw products, go to www.loislaw.com or call 1-800-364-2512.

For Customer Care issues, e-mail CustomerCare@aspenpublishers.com; call 1-800-234-1660; or fax 1-800-901-9075.

Aspen Publishers A Wolters Kluwer Company To those from whom I learned this subject:
The late S. Samuel Arsht of the Delaware bar and those still contributing: Andrew B. Kirkpatrick of the Delaware bar; Martin Lipton of the New York bar; Hon. Walter K Stapleton of the Third Circuit Court of Appeals; and my former colleagues on the Court of Chancery of the State of Delaware, with my deep thanks.

-William T. Allen

To those who have made this casebook possible: Especially Victor Brudney, whose generous assistance with materials rescued me during my first year of teaching corporate law, and whose advice and criticism have been invaluable ever since; and my wife, Catherine Krupnick, for her interest, sympathy, and enthusiasm for this project over the years.

-Reinier Kraakman

PREFACE

This book represents our effort to assist students and non-specialist lawyers to achieve an understanding of the basic principles of law that undergird the legal structures within which business is conducted in the United States. Our approach in this effort is premised upon a functional perspective of law. Thus, we attempt to ask how these legal structures function to produce desired benefits to parties who enter into agreements and relationships, or how legal structures (or rules) add costs and can impede sensible business organization. In this second aspect, the analytical or critical perspective, our point-of-view is informed through our understanding of basic principles of economics. The book, however, requires of its readers no formal training or understanding of economics. The concepts are for the most part quite intuitive and easily grasped.

We have organized the book into two segments. The first (and shorter) of these segments—Chapters 1-5—deals with the fundamentals of organizational law in a business setting. Here the briefest chapter—Chapter 1—addresses the most basic questions: the role of efficiency as a yardstick for evaluating business law, and the fundamental tension between the perspectives of doctrine and policy analysis that most experts (including judges) bring to the analysis of business law. We place these topics first because they come first logically. This does not mean, however, that they must come first pedagogically. Some users of this casebook might wish to circle back to Chapter 1, as students become more familiar with the legal problems posed by business organizations.

Chapters 2-4 deal with the elemental forms of business organization. Chapter 2 focuses on agency law, which is no less a predicate for modern enterprises functioning in a market economy than contract or property law. Chapter 3 addresses the partnership form and its modern variants: the limited partnership, limited liability company, and limited liability partnership. Chapter 4 introduces the corporate form, explicitly contrasted against the partnership and its variants, such as the LLC.

Chapter 5 steps outside the usual progression of a text on business organizations to address rudimentary concepts in valuation. As with Chapter 1, our placement of Chapter 5 seems logical to us, but we recognize that it might also have come earlier or later in the book. On the one hand, valuation issues gain salience as the materials progress further into corporate law, which argues for a later discussion. On the other hand, the basic concepts in financial economics are arguably useful throughout, and so might come at the outset of a course. Again, we are confident that individual instructors can best decide when, and whether, to work through this brief valuation chapter.

The larger segment of the book, Chapters 6-14, addresses the legal regu-

xxii Preface

lation of a variety of actions, decisions, and transactions that involve or concern the modern public corporation. Chapter 6 explores relationships among shareholders, corporations, and corporate creditors. Chapters 7 and 8 explore what we term "normal governance"—that is, the legal framework that regulates the vast majority of the corporation's ordinary business activities. Chapter 7 addresses the routine functioning of the voting system including the proxy rules. Chapter 8 explores the duty of care, together with the multiple legal devices that insulate corporate officers and directors from shareholder liability, including, most notably, the business judgment rule.

Chapters 9-13 are devoted to particular classes of corporate actions and related shareholder transactions that are subject to more specialized regulation by corporate law. Chapter 9 deals with self-dealing and other potential duty of loyalty issues arising from the conduct of corporate officers, directors, and controlling shareholders. Chapter 10 extends this discussion to issues of procedure and enforcement by reviewing the law and practice of shareholder derivative suits. Chapter 11 examines transactions in corporate control, including sales of control blocks and tender offers. Chapter 12 addresses the specialized legal treatment of so-called fundamental corporate actions, with special attention to merger and acquisition transactions. Chapter 13 turns to conflicts for corporate control, including hostile tender offers and proxy contexts. And finally, Chapter 14 examines the regulation of transactions in shares on the public markets, including such topics as insider trading and fraud on the market.

While we have structured these materials in a way that conforms to the simple insight that much of corporate law can be divided into general governance, on the one hand, and discrete areas of specialized governance on the other, we expect some teachers will present the materials in a different sequence. We have taken care to facilitate alternative approaches by recapping in later chapters points more exhaustively made in earlier ones and by supplying cross-references for further review.

The book contains a number of notes that are perhaps a bit longer and more openly explanatory than other authors prefer. In this we have been motivated by our experience as teachers to want to provide a rather full textual basis for a general understanding of each subject. Our aim is to provide for those happy occasions when class gets deeply involved in an interesting discussion. In this event we are comforted by the knowledge that we can move on to the next class knowing that all of the basic information and insights have been made available to the class in the reading assignment.

In the end, what makes this branch of law so interesting (and frustrating) to students, practitioners, and scholars alike is the vital role played in it by the open-textured concept of fiduciary duty. From the early study of agency, to its conclusion with corporate mergers and acquisitions, the field and these materials offer myriad puzzles arising from the admixture of morality and efficiency that is often encountered when courts are required to fill in the specifics of a fiduciary's obligations. In approaching this subject, the book places primary emphasis upon the Delaware statute and decisions, as that law grows in its dominant importance for publicly financed corporations in the United States. Opinions by the Delaware Court of Chancery and the Delaware Supreme Court tend to outnumber cases from other jurisdictions.

Preface xxiii

We must offer very real thanks and appreciation to colleagues and friends who have taught from these materials for some years and who have been generous in their comments and suggestions. First among these are Victor Brudney, whose teaching materials provided the starting point for this book, and Henry Hansmann who has commented so richly and so long that it would be difficult to exaggerate our gratitude. Other colleagues have made useful comments and supplied detailed guidance. Among these are Jennifer Arlen, Lucian Bebchuk, Bernard Black, John Coates, Rob Daines, Jill Fisch, Jesse Fried, Jon Hanson, Hon. Jack B. Jacobs, Marcel Kahan, Vic Khanna, Stephen J. Lubben, Mark Roe, Hon. Leo Strine, and Guhan Subramanian. We acknowledge gladly our debt to them. In addition, numerous anonymous reviewers made very helpful comments, and we hope that they will find the book improved because of their efforts. Finally, we each owe a debt of gratitude to student researchers and secretarial associates. Among students, some especially stand out for their glad assistance: Alison Gooley, NYU, 1999, of the Bar of New South Wales; and Ronnie Deutch, NYU, 2002, of the New York bar. Susannah Atkins, Cara R. Conlin, Linell Hanover, and Kimberly Peterson offered cheerful and highly competent assistance. Our gratitude extends to them all.

> William T. Allen Reinier Kraakman

February 2003

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank the authors and copyright holders of the following works for permitting their inclusion in this book:

- Bebchuk, Kraakman, and Triantis, *Stock Pyramids, Cross-Ownership, and Dual Class Equity*, p. 295ff. in Randall K. Morck, ed., Concentrated Corporate Ownership (2000).
- Black, Bernard S., Next Steps in Proxy Reform, 18 J. Corp. L. 1, 4-8 (1992).
- Brownstein, Esq., Andrew R., *Compensation Committees Face New Rule*, New York Law Journal, Dec. 7, 1992.
- Coffee, John C., Business Organization and Finance (3d ed. 1988), pgs. 53-54. Easterbrook and Fischel, *Limited Liability and the Corporation*, 52 U. Chi. L. Rev. 89, 94-97 (1985).
- Easterbrook and Fischel, *Voting in Corporate Law*, 26 J.L. & Econ. 395, 409-411 (1983).
- Easterbrook and Fischel, *Corporate Control Transactions*, 91 Yale L.J. 698, 715-719 (1982).
- Easterbrook and Fischel, *Closed Corporations and Agency Costs*, 38 Stan. L. Rev. 271 (1986).
- Fischel, Daniel, *Insider Trading and Investment Analysis: An Economic Analysis of* Dirks v. Securities and Exchange Commission, 13 Hofstra L. Rev. 127, 131-136 (1984).
- Hansmann and Kraakman, *Toward Unlimited Shareholder Liability for Torts*, 100 Yale L.J. 1879 (1991).
- Moses, Jonathan M., Lawyer Given to Filing Shareholder Lawsuits Comes Under Scrutiny, Wall St. J., Oct. 28, 1992.
- Romano, Roberta, *The Shareholder Suit: Litigation Without Foundation?*, 7 J.L. Econ. & Org. 55-87 (1991).
- Scott, Kenneth E., *Insider Trading: Rule 10b-5*, *Disclosure and Corporate Privacy*, 9 J. Legal Stud. 801 (1980).

XXV

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

Pre	tents face nowledgments	xx xx1
		,
1.	INTRODUCTION TO THE LAW OF ENTERPRISE ORGANIZATION	1
2.	ACTING THROUGH OTHERS: THE LAW OF AGENCY	13
3.	THE PROBLEM OF JOINT OWNERSHIP: THE LAW OF PARTNERSHIP	39
4.	THE CORPORATE FORM	81
5.	DEBT, EQUITY, AND ECONOMIC VALUE	111
6.	THE PROTECTION OF CREDITORS	129
7.	NORMAL GOVERNANCE: THE VOTING SYSTEM	171
8.	NORMAL GOVERNANCE: THE DUTY OF CARE	239
9.	CONFLICT TRANSACTIONS: THE DUTY OF LOYALTY	285
10.	SHAREHOLDER LAWSUITS	349
11.	TRANSACTIONS IN CONTROL	393
12.	FUNDAMENTAL TRANSACTIONS: MERGERS AND ACQUISITIONS	423
13.	PUBLIC CONTESTS FOR CORPORATE CONTROL	497
14.	TRADING IN THE CORPORATION'S SECURITIES	577
[ab]	la of Casas	
avi Inde	de of Cases	655
nue	7XV	659

CONTENTS

	Preface Scknowledgments S				
	CODUCTIC ANIZATIC	DN TO THE LAW OF ENTERPRISE	1		
1.1	EFFICIEI 1.1.1 1.1.2	NCY AND THE SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE OF ENTERPRISE ORGANIZATION Wealth Creation and the Corporate Form of Organization What Do We Mean by Efficiency? 1.1.2.1 Pareto Efficiency 1.1.2.2 Kaldor-Hicks Efficiency	N 2 3 3 4 5		
1.2	Law from 1.2.1 1.2.2	OM INSIDE AND OUT: SHARED MEANINGS AND SKEPTICISM The Outside and the Inside Fairness and Efficiency	5 6 7		
1.3		PMENT OF THE MODERN THEORY OF THE FIRM Ronald Coase's 1937 Insight	8 9 9 10		
	NG THRO	DUGH OTHERS: THE LAW	13		
2.1 2.2		FORMATION, AGENCY TERMINATION, AND PRINCIPAL'S LIABILITY Formation Termination Parties' Conception Does Not Control Jenson Farms Co. v. Cargill, Inc. Liability in Contract Nogales Service Center v. Atlantic Richfield Co. Liability in Tort Humble Oil & Refining Co. v. Martin Hoover v. Sun Oil Co.	13 14 14 15 15 16 19 20 23 25 27		

xii			Contents
2.3	THE G	OVERNANCE OF AGENCY (THE AGENT'S DUTIES)	30
5	2.3.1	The Nature of the Agent's Fiduciary Relationship	30
	2.3.2	The Agent's Duty of Loyalty to the Principal	32
		Tarnowski v. Resop	34
	2.3.3	The Trustee's Duty to Trust Beneficiaries	36
		In re Gleeson	36
		3	30
	_		
		M OF JOINT OWNERSHIP:	
THE	LAW OF	PARTNERSHIP	39
3.1	INTROL	DUCTION TO PARTNERSHIP	39
	3.1.1	Why Have Joint Ownership?	40
		Klein & Coffee, The Need to Assemble	10
		At-Risk Capital	41
	3.1.2	The Agency Conflict Among Co-Owners	42
	<i>D</i>	Meinhard v. Salmon	43
3.2	PARTNE	ERSHIP FORMATION	47
J		Vohland v. Sweet	47
3.3	RELATIO	ONS WITH THIRD PARTIES	50
0.0	3.3.1	Third-Party Claims Against Partners	50
	0.0	Professor Brudney's UPA Problems	50
		Munn v. Scalera	51
	3.3.2	Third-Party Claims Against Partnership Property	54
	3.3.3	Claims of Partnership Creditors to Partner's Individual	94
		Property	55
		In re Comark	55
3.4	PARTNE	RSHIP GOVERNANCE AND ISSUES OF AUTHORITY	58
		National Biscuit Co. v. Stroud	58
3.5	TERMIN	ATION (DISSOLUTION AND DISASSOCIATION)	60
	3.5.1	Accounting for Partnership's Financial Status and	
		Performance	60
		Adams v. Jarvis	62
		Dreifuerst v. Dreifuerst	66
		Page v. Page	70
3.6		LIABILITY MODIFICATIONS OF THE PARTNERSHIP FORM	72
	3.6.1	The Limited Partnership	73
		Delaney v. Fidelity Lease Limited	74
	3.6.2	Limited Liability Partnerships and Companies	76
		3.6.2.1 The Limited Liability Partnership	76
		3.6.2.2 The Limited Liability Company	77

Contents	xii
----------	-----

3		4		
Тн	CORPOR	RATE FORM	81	
4.1	Intro	Introduction to the Corporate Form		
4.2	Creation of a Fictional Legal Entity			
	4.2.1	A Note on the History of Corporate Formation	84	
	4.2.2	The Process of Incorporating Today	88	
	4.2.3		89	
	4.2.4	1	90	
10	4.2.5	Shareholders' Agreements	90	
4.3	LIMITE	D LIABILITY	91	
		Easterbrook & Fischel, Limited Liability		
66	Thursday	and the Corporation	92	
4.4		FERABLE SHARES	94	
4.5		ALIZED MANAGEMENT	95	
	4.5.1	Legal Construction of the Board	97	
		4.5.1.1 The Holder of Primary Management Power	97	
		Automatic Self-Cleansing Filter Syndicate	0.0	
		Co., Ltd. v. Cunninghame 4.5.1.2 Structure of the Board	98	
			100	
		4.5.1.3 Formality in Board Operation4.5.1.4 The Standard Critique of Boards	101	
	4.5.2	Corporate Officers: Agents of the Corporation	102	
	1.7.2	Jennings v. Pittsburgh Mercantile Co.	103	
		Menard, Inc. v. Dage-MTI, Inc.	103 106	
		Duge Hill, Inc.	100	
DEB	т, E QUIT	Y, AND ECONOMIC VALUE	111	
5.1	Саріта	l Structure	111	
,	5.1.1	Legal Character of Debt	112	
	5.1.2	Legal Character of Equity	113	
5.2		CONCEPTS OF VALUATION	114	
	5.2.1	The Time Value of Money	115	
	5.2.2	Risk and Return	117	
	5.2.3	Diversification and Systematic Risk	120	
	5.2.4	The Relevance of Prices in the Securities Market	122	
5.3	ESTIMAT	TING THE FIRM'S COST OF CAPITAL	123	
	5.3.1	Estimating the Firm's Cost of Debt	124	
	5.3.2	Estimating the Firm's Cost of Equity	124	
	5.3.3	The Optimal Balance Between Debt and Equity	126	
		5.3.3.1 Value of Debt in the Balance Sheet	126	
		5.3.3.2 The Risks of Excessive Debt	127	

	_	
37	ತಿ	-
X.	н	w

۲.	

	0	
Тнв	PROTECTION OF CREDITORS	129
6.1	Mandatory Disclosure	130
6.2	CAPITAL REGULATION	131
	6.2.1 Financial Statements	131
	6.2.2 Distribution Constraints	135
	6.2.3 Minimum Capital and Capital Maintenance Requirements	137
6.3	STANDARD-BASED DUTIES	138
	6.3.1 Director Liability	138
	6.3.2 Creditor Liability: Fraudulent Transfers	140
	6.3.3 Shareholder Liability	141
	6.3.3.1 Equitable Subordination	141
	Costello v. Fazio	142
	6.3.3.2 Piercing the Corporate Veil	147
	Sea-Land Services, Inc. v. The Pepper Source	148
6.4	Kinney Shoe Corp. v. Polan VEIL PIERCING ON BEHALF OF INVOLUNTARY CREDITORS	152
0.1	Walkovszky v. Carlton	156
6.5	CAN LIMITED LIABILITY IN TORT BE JUSTIFIED?	157 162
	Hansmann & Kraakman, Toward Unlimited	102
	Shareholder Liability for Corporate Torts	162
	7	
Nor	MAL GOVERNANCE: THE VOTING SYSTEM	171
7.1	THE ROLE AND LIMITS OF SHAREHOLDER VOTING	171
7.2	ELECTING AND REMOVING DIRECTORS	173
	7.2.1 Electing Directors	173
	7.2.2 Removing Directors	174
- 0	Hilton Hotels Corp. v. ITT Corp.	177
7.3	SHAREHOLDER MEETINGS AND ALTERNATIVES	180
7.4	PROXY VOTING AND ITS COSTS	182
	Rosenfeld v. Fairchild Engine &	
7.5	Airplane Corp. Class Voting	183
7.6	SHAREHOLDER INFORMATION RIGHTS	185
7.0		187
7.7	General Time Corp. v. Talley Industries, Inc. Techniques for Separating Control from Cash Flow Rights	189
,	7.7.1 Circular Control Structures	190 190
	Speiser v. Baker	191
	7.7.2 Vote Buying	197
	Easterbrook & Fischel, Voting in Corporate Law	197
	Schreiber v. Carney	199
	•	

COL	items		X		
	7.7.3	Controlling Minority Structures	20		
		Bebchuk, Kraakman & Triantis, Stock Pyramids	5.		
		Cross-Ownership, and Dual Class Equity	20		
7.8					
	THE COLLECTIVE ACTION PROBLEM Easterbrook & Fischel, Voting in Corporate Law				
		Black, Next Steps in Proxy Reform	208		
7.9	THE FE	EDERAL PROXY RULES	210		
	7.9.1	Rules 14a-1 Through 14a-7: Disclosure and Shareholder			
		Communication	210		
	7.9.2	Rule 14a-8: Shareholder Proposals	217		
	7.9.3	Rule 14a-9: The Antifraud Rule	227		
7 1 0		Virginia Bankshares, Inc. v. Sandberg	229		
/.10	STATE I	DISCLOSURE LAW: FIDUCIARY DUTY OF CANDOR	236		
		8			
Nor	MAL GOV	VERNANCE: THE DUTY OF CARE	239		
			-37		
3.1		DUCTION TO THE DUTY OF CARE	239		
3.2		JTY OF CARE AND THE NEED TO MITIGATE DIRECTOR			
	RISK AV	VERSION	240		
2		Gagliardi v. TriFoods International, Inc.	241		
3.3	STATUT	ORY TECHNIQUES FOR LIMITING DIRECTOR AND OFFICER RISK			
	EXPOSU		243		
	8.3.1	Indemnification	243		
	0.2.2	Waltuch v. Conticommodity Services, Inc.	243		
6	8.3.2	Directors and Officers Insurance	247		
.4	JUDICIA	L PROTECTION: THE BUSINESS JUDGMENT RULE	248		
	0 / 1	Kamin v. American Express Co.	248		
	8.4.1 8.4.2	Understanding the Business Judgment Rule The Duty of Core in Talanama Control Allerent Public	251		
	0.4.2	The Duty of Care in Takeover Cases: A Note on			
	8.4.3	Smith v. Van Gorkom Additional Statutory Protection: Authorization	253		
	0.4.3	Additional Statutory Protection: Authorization			
		for Charter Provisions Waiving Liability for Due Care Violations	25/		
		McMillan v. Intercargo Corp.	254		
.5	THE TEA	CHNICOLOR CASE AND DELAWARE'S UNIQUE APPROACH TO	256		
	ADITIDIO	CATING DUE CARE CLAIMS AGAINST CORPORATE DIRECTORS	260		
	LLJODIC	Cinerama, Inc. v. Technicolor, Inc.	260		
.6	THE BO	ARD'S DUTY TO MONITOR: LOSSES "CAUSED" BY BOARD	262		
	PASSIVIT	TY	265		
		Francis v. United Jersey Bank	266		
		Graham v. Allis-Chalmers Manufacturing Co.	271		
		In re Caremark International Inc.	-/1		
		Derivative Litigation	276		
7	"Know	ING" VIOLATIONS OF LAW	282		
		Miller v. A.T.&T.	282		