LAW AND PUBLIC EDUCATION: CASES AND MATERIALS

FOURTH EDITION

E. Gordon Gee Philip T. K. Daniel



LAW AND PUBLIC EDUCATION

CASES AND MATERIALS

Fourth Edition

E. Gordon Gee
President and Professor of Law
The Ohio State University

Philip T.K. Daniel
William and Marie Flesher Professor of Educational
Administration
Adjunct Professor of Law
The Ohio State University



Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gee, E. Gordon (Elwood Gordon), 1944-

Law and public education: cases and materials / E. Gordon Gee, Philip T.K. Daniel. — 4th ed.

p. cm

Rev. ed. of: Law and public education / Stephen R. Goldstein, E. Gordon Gee and Philip T.K. Daniel. 3rd ed. c1995.

ISBN 978-1-4224-2175-8 (hard cover)

1. Educational law and legislation—United States—Cases. I. Daniel, Philip T. K. II. Goldstein, Stephen R., 1938- Law and public education, III. Title.

Includes index.

KF4119.G44 2008

344.73°071-dc22

2008044669

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis, the knowledge burst logo, and Michie are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc, used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2009 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 25¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices 744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000 201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200 www.lexisnexis.com

LAW AND PUBLIC EDUCATION CASES AND MATERIALS Fourth Edition

LEXISNEXIS LAW SCHOOL ADVISORY BOARD

Lenni B. Benson

Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development New York Law School

Raj Bhala

Rice Distinguished Professor University of Kansas, School of Law

Charles P. Craver

Freda H. Alverson Professor of Law The George Washington University Law School

Richard D. Freer

Robert Howell Hall Professor of Law Emory University School of Law

Craig Joyce

Andrews Kurth Professor of Law & Co-Director, Institute for Intellectual Property and Information Law University of Houston Law Center

Ellen S. Podgor

Professor of Law & Associate Dean of Faculty Development and Electronic Education Stetson University College of Law

Paul F. Rothstein

Professor of Law Georgetown University Law Center

Robin Wellford Slocum

Professor of Law & Director, Legal Research and Writing Program Chapman University School of Law

David I. C. Thomson

LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

DEDICATION

I dedicate this Fourth Edition to The People of Ohio, who have given me the rare privilege of returning home.

- President Gee

To Tolly, Mae, Thomas, Esther, Henry, Fannie, Jessie, Alice, Charlotte, James, Joan, David, and John. All the best.

- Professor Daniel

Preface

All three branches of government, legislative, executive, and judicial, play a significant role in shaping and influencing the enterprise of American public education. Certainly, since the decision in Brown v. Board of Education, the federal government has reformed educational policy, and much decision making undertaken by local and state school officials has been litigated in the courts. This fourth edition of Law and Public Education represents the authors' efforts to keep pace with the changes in education and the dynamic impact the law has had on this transformation of authority. The changes have been substantial since the publication of the third edition in 1995 and, as a result, much of the current edition represents a rewriting of materials and the introduction of the most recent case law.

In focusing on the institution of public education, an education law course divides the law vertically and therefore intersects horizontal slices of the law, particularly administrative and constitutional law. Law and Public Education can thus serve as an advanced course of study in these areas, enabling students to further develop their analytical and critical skills by focusing on the application of general administrative and constitutional law principles to the particular institution of public education, and, it is hoped, provide occasions for them to rethink such principles in light of this analysis. The book can be used additionally as an introduction to the general areas of the law for students who have not yet been exposed to the horizontal courses. In view of the dynamic development of the challenging field of law, we offer this book to students, attorneys, educators, and others concerned with public education for study and analysis as an end in itself.

Although primarily a legal work, the book also contains historical, pedagogical, economic, and other social science literature as required to understand and analyze the subject matter. Three themes pervade these materials. The first concerns the decision making process and the proper allocation of decision making power among those who compete for it. The other two themes relate to the substance of the decisions made by this process: the conflicts involved in a liberal, democratic society seeking to inculcate values in its young; and the tensions that pervade a nation and an educational system torn between values of national unity, secularism and universalism on the one hand and the desire to preserve pluralism and enhance sectarian and parochial subgroup cultures and values on the other.

The cases and other materials in this book have generally been included in fuller versions than in many other casebooks, as we believe it important for the student to deal with the complexities, ambiguities, and nuances of meaning that can only be experienced when the cases are edited with a slight hand. Where substantive material has been removed from cases or other materials, the deletions are indicated. Citations and footnotes contained in cases and materials have, however, been eliminated without indication. Where such footnotes have been included, they retain their original numbers. The editors' footnotes are indicated by asterisks. Some clearly typographical errors in cases or other materials have been corrected without indication.

The first edition of this book was written by Professor Stephen R. Goldstein while teaching at the University of Pennsylvania Law School. He is currently the Edward Silver Professor of Civil Jurisprudence at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The following former students provided valuable research assistance in developing the first edition: Rita L. Bernstein, Ellen Josephson, Linda Lipton, Roderick R. McKelvie, Helen M. Pomerantz, Sherri E. Raiken, Stephen A. Saltzburg, Stephen J. Shapiro, and Diana J. Simon.

President Gee, who assumed major responsibility for the second edition of the book, would like to thank Jeanne Bryan, a former student at the J. Reuben Clark Law School, Brigham

Preface

Young University, and Susan Marks, a former student at the West Virginia University College of Law, who acted as research assistants.

Professor Daniel and President Gee, who authored the third edition, extend appreciation for research assistance to Patrick Pauken, J.D., Ph.D., a former student in both law and educational administration at The Ohio State University. They also thank Suzanne Cupp, Angela Doerschlag, Marianne L. Johnson, and Dina M. Minton for their contributions toward preparing the manuscript for publication.

The fourth edition is authored by Professor Daniel and President Gee. We are grateful for the research assistance of Jill Meinhardt, Chris Montgomery, Rachel Shapiro, and Lisa Whittaker, all former students at The Ohio State University Moritz College of Law.

E. Gordon Gee Philip T.K. Daniel Columbus, Ohio September, 2008

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART O	HISTORY, STRUCTURE, AND CURRICULUM	. 1
Chapter	HISTORY AND STRUCTURE OF AMERICAN PUBLIC EDUCATION	. 3
Α.	INTRODUCTION	. 3
В.	HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF AMERICAN EDUCATION	. 4
	Massachusetts (Colony) Laws and Statutes, Ch. 88, (1647) ("Old Deluder Sata	ın
	Act")	. 4
	Colonial Records of the State of Georgia, compiled and published under author of the Legislature by Allen D. Candler, Vol. 18 (1904–1910), pp.108–09,	rity
	136	5
	Jefferson, Notes On Virginia, in Four Works of Thomas Jefferson (Federal	, ,
	Edition 1904), pp. 60–65 (Jefferson's Explanation of his "Bill for the More	6
	General Diffusion of Knowledge")	
	p. 1085 (Jefferson's idea about education for girls in the year 1818)	
C.	CURRENT STRUCTURE OF PUBLIC EDUCATION	
1.	The School District	
2.	The State Education Agency and Intermediate Units	
3.	The Fiscal Structure of Public Education	
4.	The Federal Government and Educational Policy	11
Chapter	UNIVERSAL AND COMPULSORY EDUCATION	13
Α.	RIGHT OF UNIVERSAL EDUCATION	13
1.	Foundations of the Right in Gaining an Understanding of the Present Structure	of
	American Education	13
2.	Expanding Boundaries of the Right — Educational Accountability	15
	B.M. v. STATE OF MONTANA	17
B.	RESIDENCE AND CITIZENSHIP REQUIREMENTS — LIMITATIONS ON	
	THE UNIVERSAL RIGHT	20
	PLYLER v. DOE	
	LAMPKIN v. DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA	27
C.	COMPULSORY EDUCATION	34
	PIERCE v. SOCIETY OF SISTERS OF THE HOLY NAMES OF JESUS	
	MARY SAME v. HILL MILITARY ACADEMY	
	WISCONSIN v. YODER	36

Chapter	3 CURRICULUM 45
A. B.	STATE AND LOCAL CONTROL OF CURRICULUM
C.	PARENT CONTROL OF CURRICULUM
D.	TEACHER CONTROL OF CURRICULUM
PART T	WO STUDENTS' RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES 1
Chapter	4 STUDENT CLASSIFICATION BY SEX, AGE, AND RACE 83
A.	STUDENT CLASSIFICATION BY SEX
1.	Academic Opportunities
2.	Athletics
3.	Remedies
В.	STUDENT CLASSIFICATION BY AGE
C.	STUDENT CLASSIFICATION BY RACE 120 GRUTTER v. BOLLINGER 121 GRATZ v. BOLLINGER 127
Chapter	SCHOOL CONTROL OF STUDENT CONDUCT AND PROCEDURAL PROBLEMS IN ENFORCING STUDENT CONDUCT
Α.	STUDENT CONDUCT AND SCHOOL AUTHORITY 133 MEYER v. AUSTIN INDEP. SCH. DIST. 133

	DOE v. YUNITS	138
В.	SCHOOLS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT	143
	SALAZAR v. LUTY	143
C.	VAGUENESS AND THE NEED FOR PRE-EXISTING RULES	147
	PRO-LIFE COUGARS v. UNIVERSITY OF HOUSTON	147
D.	RIGHT TO AN ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING	151
1.	Due Process Requirements	151
	DIXON v. ALABAMA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION	151
	GOSS v. LOPEZ	155
	GONZALES v. McEUEN	162
2.	Liability of School Authorities for Failure to Provide Procedural	
	Protections	167
	WOOD v. STRICKLAND	167
E.	SEARCH AND SEIZURE	172
1.	Reasonable Suspicion	172
	NEW JERSEY v. T.L.O.	172
2.	Randomized Searches: Athletes	179
	VERNONIA SCH. DIST. 47J v. ACTON	179
3.	Randomized Searches: Extra-Curricular	184
	BOARD OF EDUCATION INDEP. SCH. DIST. NO. 92, POTTAWATOM	IIE
	CNTY. v. EARLS	184
4.	Sweep Searches	189
	THOMPSON v. CARTHAGE SCH. DIST	189
5.	Locker Searches	192
	STATE v. JONES	192
6.	Automobile Searches	
	STATE OF WASHINGTON v. SLATTERY	197
7.	"Sniff Searches"	199
		199
8.	Strip Searches	204
	THOMAS v. ROBERTS	
9.	Search and Seizure Issues in the Technological Era	208
	MATOS BY & THROUGH MATOS v. CLINTON SCH. DIST	208
Classic	CCHOOL CONTROL OF CTUDENT EVADECCION	212
Chapter	6 SCHOOL CONTROL OF STUDENT EXPRESSION	213
A.	POLITICAL AND OTHER STUDENT EXPRESSION	213
	TINKER v. DES MOINES INDEPENDENT COMMUNITY SCHOOL	
	DISTRICT	213
	FRAIN v. BARON	221
		225
	PYLE v. SOUTH HADLEY SCHOOL COMMITTEE	229
	CROSBY v. HOLSINGER	231

В.	HAZELWOOD SCHOOL DISTRICT v. KUHLMEIER Shari Golub, Tinker to Fraser to Hazelwood — Supreme Court's Double Play Combination Defeats High School Students' Rally for First Amendment Right Hazelwood School District v. Kuhlmeier, PLANNED PARENTHOOD OF SOUTHERN NEVADA, INC. v. CLARK COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT SETTLE v. DICKSON COUNTY SCH. BD.	233 233 233 237 240 245 249 1 252
Chapter	7 SANCTIONS FOR BREACHES OF RULES	261
Α.	SUSPENSIONS AND EXPULSIONS	261
	Philip T.K. Daniel, Violence and the Public Schools: Student Rights Have Bee	en
	Weighed in the Balance and Found Wanting	261
1.	Suspension	262
	JENNINGS v. WENTZVILLE R-IV SCHOOL DIST	262
2.	Expulsion	266
	RIPPY v. BOARD OF SCH. TRUSTEES	266
	TUN v. WHITTICKER	270
В.	CORPORAL PUNISHMENT	273
	INGRAHAM v. WRIGHT	273
	GARCIA v. MIERA	281
	FLORES v. SCHOOL BD. OF DESOTO PARISH	285
C.	ACADEMIC SANCTIONS	288
	STATE EX REL. BARNO v. CRESTWOOD BD. OF EDUC	288
PART T	HREE TEACHERS' RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES	293
Chapter	8 TEACHERS AND THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP	295
A.	TEACHER COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	295
1.		295
	JERSEY SHORE AREA SCHOOL DISTRICT v. JERSEY SHORE	
	EDUCATION ASSOCIATION	295
	TEXAS STATE TEACHERS ASSOCIATION v. GARLAND	
	INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT	300
2.	Statutory Protections and Public Sector Bargaining	305
	ABOOD v. DETROIT BOARD OF EDUCATION	305
	CHICAGO TEACHERS UNION LOCAL NO 1 AFT AFT CIOV	

	HUDSON	31.
	DAVIS v. HENRY	
	Martin H. Malin, Public Employees' Right to Strike: Law and	
	Experience	325
В.	HIRING AND DISCHARGE	
1.	Age	
4.	DIRUSSO v. ASPEN SCH. DIST. #1	
2.	Race	
200	WYGANT v. JACKSON BOARD OF EDUCATION	
	KRUETH V. INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT NO. 38, RED LAKE,	
	MINNESOTA	
3.	Citizenship	
5.	AMBACH v. NORWICK	
4	Gender	
4.	Sexual Harassment under Title VII	
a.	MERITOR SAVINGS BANK, F.S.B. v. VINSON	
To.	Same Sex Sexual Harassment Under Title VII	
b.	ONCALE v. SUNDOWNER OFFSHORE SERVICES, INC.	36
	Retaliation under Title IX	
C.	JACKSON v. BIRMINGHAM BOARD OF EDUCATION	
5.	Religion	
J.	ANSONIA BOARD OF EDUCATION v. PHILBROOK	
6.	Disability	372
0.	CHALK V. UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT	
	CALIFORNIA	
	CASSIMY v. BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE ROCKFORD PUBLIC	2/2
	SCHOOLS, DISTRICT # 205	377
7.	Due Process	382
, .		383
	PERRY v. SINDERMANN	
		200
Chapter	9 THE TEACHER AS CITIZEN	393
Α.	SCHOOL CONTROL OVER TEACHER EXPRESSION	307
2 % 1	PICKERING v. BOARD OF EDUCATION	
	MT. HEALTHY CITY SCHOOL BOARD OF EDUCATION v. DOYLE	
	CONNICK v. MYERS	402
	WATERS v. CHURCHHILL	408
	GARCETTI v. CEBALLOS	417
В.	SCHOOL CONTROL OF TEACHER CONDUCT	423
1.		423
	KEYISHIAN v. BOARD OF REGENTS	424
2.	Inside the Classroom	429
	BORING v. BUNCOMBE COUNTY BD. OF EDUC.	429

		A STATE OF THE STA	25
PART	FOUR	EQUAL EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY 4	37
Chapte	er 10	RACIAL SEGREGATION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS 4	39
	BROW	N v. BOARD OF EDUCATION	39
	GREEN	v. COUNTY SCHOOL BOARD 4	43
	SWAN	N v. CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG BOARD OF EDUCATION 4	47
			57
	MILLII	KEN v. BRADLEY	63
	BOARI	D OF EDUCATION OF OKLAHOMA CITY PUBLIC SCHOOLS v.	
			68
			76
		URI v. JENKINS	87
		VTS INVOLVED IN COMMUNITY SCHOOLS v. SEATTLE SCHOOL	
			94
Chapte	er 11	ABILITY GROUPING AND ENGLISH PROFICIENCY 5	19
A.	ABILIT	TY GROUPING AND TRACKING 5	19
	HOB	SON v. HANSEN	19
	McN	EAL v. TATE COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT	31
	QUA	RLES v. OXFORD MUNICIPAL SEPARATE SCHOOL DISTRICT . 5.	34
	LARI	RY P. v. RILES	39
	PARI	ENTS IN ACTION ON SPECIAL EDUCATION (PASE) v.	
	HAN	NON	44
В.	ENGLI	SH PROFICIENCY 54	49
			51
	VAL	ERIA v. DAVIS	57
Chapte	er 12	THE EDUCATION OF EXCEPTIONAL CHILDREN 50	63
Α.		DTHY W. v. ROCHESTER, NEW HAMPSHIRE SCHOOL	54
		RICT 50	
B.		APPROPRIATE PUBLIC EDUCATION	71
	BOA	RD OF EDUCATION OF HENDRICK HUDSON CENTRAL SCHOOL	
			71
	POLK	K v. CENTRAL SUSQUEHANNA INTERMEDIATE UNIT 16 57	77
		. MERCER ISLAND SCHOOL DISTRICT	33
C.		DUALIZED EDUCATION PROGRAM	
		CKMON v. SPRINGFIELD R-XII SCH. DIST	
		GS LOCAL SCH. DIST. v. ZELAZNY)4
D.		DED SCHOOL YEAR PROGRAMS 59	8(
	CORI	DREY v. EUCKERT	98

E.	LEAST RESTRICTIVE ENVIRONMENT
	DANIEL R.R. v. STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION 60-
	SACRAMENTO CITY UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT BOARD OF
	EDUCATION v. HOLLAND
F.	RELATED SERVICES
	IRVING INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT v. TATRO 61
	CEDAR RAPIDS COMMUNITY SCHOOL DISTRICT v. GARRETT F 620
G.	THE "STAY-PUT" PROVISION & BEHAVIOR MANAGEMENT 620
	HONIG v. DOE
	NEOSHO R-V SCHOOL DISTRICT v. CLARK
H.	BURDEN OF PROOF
	SCHAFFER v. WEAST
I.	REMEDIES
	SCHOOL COMMITTEE OF THE TOWN OF BURLINGTON,
	MASSACHUSETTS v. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION OF
	MASSACHUSETTS
J.	IDEA AND THE ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSE
	ZOBREST v. CATALINA FOOTHILLS SCHOOL DISTRICT
K.	THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT
	Ronald Wenkart, The Americans with Disabilities Act and its Impact on Public
	Education
L.	GIFTED AND TALENTED STUDENTS
	BROWNSVILLE AREA SCH. DIST. v. STUDENT X
Chap	ter 13 FINANCING PUBLIC EDUCATION
	SAN ANTONIO INDEPENDENT SCHOOL DISTRICT v. RODRIGUEZ 657
	ROBINSON v. CAHILL
	ABBOTT v. BURKE
	ROSE v. COUNCIL FOR BETTER EDUCATION, INC
	William E. Thro, The Role of Language of the State Education Clauses in School
	Finance Litigation
	CAMPAIGN FOR FISCAL EQUITY, INC. v. STATE
	Bonnie A. Scherer, Footing the Bill for a Sound Basic Education in New York City:
	The Implementation of Campaign for Fiscal Equity v. State
	HOKE COUNTY BD. OF EDUC. v. STATE
	LEWIS E. v. SPAGNOLO
	John Dayton & Anne Dupre, School Funding Litigation: Who's Winning the
	War?

PART F	IVE CHURCH-STATE RELATIONS	729
Chapter	14 THE RELIGION CLAUSES AND PUBLIC EDUCATION	731
A. 1.	RELIGION AND THE PUBLIC SCHOOL CURRICULUM	731
2.	General Restraints LEE v. WEISMAN SANTA FE INDEP. SCH. DIST. v. DOE	746746753
В.	RELEASED TIME FOR RELIGIOUS INSTRUCTION McCOLLUM v. BOARD OF EDUCATION ZORACH v. CLAUSON	765 765 766
C.	RELIGIOUS OBJECTIONS TO PUBLIC SCHOOL ACTIVITIES	771 771 777 780 ICT
Chapter		789 797
	Ralph D. Mawdsley, Tax Exempt Bond Financing for Religious Educational Institutions: What is Required Under the U.S. Constitution?	797
A.	FINANCING PRIVATE SCHOOLS FOR PUBLIC BENEFIT	798
1.	Textbooks, Transportation and Other Special Services EVERSON v. BOARD OF EDUCATION MITCHELL v. HELMS	798 798 803
2.	Payment for Personnel Salaries, Tuition, and Other Tax Benefits LEMON v. KURTZMAN	808 808
В.	EDUCATIONAL CHOICE	826
1.	Public School Problems and Choice Proposals	
	Polemic of Legal Problems be Overcome?	838
2.		846
3.		851

	Julie F. Mead, Devilish Details: Exploring Features of Charter School Statu that Blur the Public/Private Distinction	851
	Joseph O. Oluwole & Preston C. Green, Charter Schools under the NCLB:	
	Choice and Equal Educational Opportunity	
PART S		
Chapter	16 SUPERVISION AND TORT LIABILITY	861
A.	NEGLIGENCE AND STRICT LIABILITY	862
	JOHNSON v. SCHOOL DIST. OF MILLARD	862
	DUBOSE v. AKRON PUB. SCHS	866
	WYKE v. POLK COUNTY SCH. BD.	870
	BROWNELL v. LOS ANGELES UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT	878
В.		884
	HURLBURT v. NOXON	884
		886
	SIEGELL v. HERRICKS UNION FREE SCHOOL DIST	
	JARREAU v. ORLEANS PARISH SCHOOL BOARD	892
	Thomas R. Hurst & James N. Knight, Coach's Liability for Athletes' Injuries of	and
		897
C.		901
		901
		908
	PARKER v. WYNN	
	BURNS v. BOARD OF EDUCATION OF STAMFORD	912
D.	DEFAMATION	915
	BREWER v. ROGERS	
	ROCCI v. ECOLE SECONDAIRE MACDONALD-CARTIER	919
	LIFTON V BOARD OF EDUCATION	022