

**CSICL**

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

# **The Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict**



ROGER O'KEEFE

# **The Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict**

---

**Roger O'Keefe**

 **CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521172875](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521172875)

© Roger O'Keefe 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

First paperback edition 2010

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data*

O'Keefe, Roger, 1968-

The protection of cultural property in armed conflict / Roger O'Keefe.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-86797-9 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-86797-5 (hardback)

1. Cultural property—Protection (International law) 2. War (International law) 3.

Art treasures in war. 4. Art thefts. I. Title.

K3791.O44 2006

344'.09—dc22

2006023549

ISBN 978-0-521-86797-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-17287-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To my mother and father, parents of heroic virtue

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following people: my colleague, friend and PhD supervisor Dr Susan Marks, for guiding me through the doctoral version of this work, submitted in 1999 at the University of Cambridge; Tami Rex, for putting up with the same; the Cambridge Commonwealth Trust, the Overseas Research Student Awards and the Leslie Wilson Research Scholarships at Magdalene College, Cambridge, for funding my PhD; Jan Hladík, Programme Specialist, International Standards Section, Division of Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, for his generosity and invaluable assistance in making available to me numerous hard-to-come-by documents; Jake Soll, for introducing me to the seventeenth-century republic of letters; Eyal Rak and Morris Schonberg for translating the Israeli cases; my colleagues at the Faculty of Law and the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge, and those at Magdalene College, for accommodating my sabbatical in 2004–5; Cambridge University Press, for taking on the manuscript and turning it into a book; Dr Roger Bacon, for the third most precious gift of all, health; and my parents, Barry and Jan, for the first and second, life and love.

## Table of cases

- Admission of a State to the United Nations (Charter, Art. 4), Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1948, p. 57 110
- Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (New Application: 2002) (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Rwanda), ICJ General List No. 126, Jurisdiction and Admissibility, 3 February 2006 354
- Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Uganda), ICJ General List No. 116, Judgment, 19 December 2005 97, 307, 309, 318, 321, 333, 336–9
- Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Belgium), ICJ Reports 2002, p. 3 225, 284
- Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus and the Republic of Cyprus v. Goldberg and Feldman Fine Arts, Inc., 108 ILR 488 (7th Cir. 1990) 316
- Candu v. Minister of Defence, 43(1) PD 738 (1989) 341
- Coard v. United States of America, 123 ILR 156 (1999) 308
- Coenca Brothers v. Germany, 4 AD 570 (1927) 27
- Decision on Request for Precautionary Measures (Detainees at Guantánamo Bay, Cuba), 41 ILM 532 (2002) 308
- Decision Regarding the Delimitation of the Border between The State of Eritrea and The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 41 ILM 1057 (2002) 150
- Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary in the Gulf of Maine Area (Canada/United States of America), ICJ Reports 1984, p. 246 127, 316
- Dole v. Carter, 444 F Supp 1065 (1977), affirmed 569 F 2d 1109 (10th Cir. 1977) 164
- Frontier Dispute (Burkina Faso/Mali), ICJ Reports 1986, p. 554 150, 268
- Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia), Judgment, ICJ Reports 1997, p. 7 109

- Hess v. Commander of the IDF in the West Bank, HCJ 10356/02, Interim decision, 12 February 2003 131
- Hess v. Commander of the IDF in the West Bank, 58(3) PD 443 (2004) 103, 131, 332, 342
- In re von Lewinski* (called von Manstein), 16 AD 509 (1949) 90–1
- Judgment of the International Military Tribunal for the Trial of German Major War Criminals, Nuremberg, Misc. No. 12 (1946), Cmd 6964 81, 88–9, 333, 336, 349–50
- Kiriadolou v. Germany, 5 AD 516 (1930) 27
- Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, ICJ General List No. 131, Advisory Opinion, 9 July 2004 97, 306–8, 321, 333, 339
- Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1996, p. 226 148, 306–8, 318
- Maritime Delimitation in the Area between Greenland and Jan Mayen (Denmark v. Norway), ICJ Reports 1993, p. 4 128
- Military and Paramilitary Activities In and Against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Merits, ICJ Reports 1986, p. 14 247
- North Sea Continental Shelf Cases (Federal Republic of Germany/Denmark; Federal Republic of Germany/Netherlands), ICJ Reports 1969, p. 3 318
- Nuclear Tests (Australia v. France), ICJ Reports 1974, p. 253 150, 268
- Nuclear Tests (New Zealand v. France), ICJ Reports 1974, p. 457, 150, 268
- Padfield v. Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Foods [1968] AC 997 109
- Partial Award: Central Front. Eritrea's Claims 2, 4, 6, 7, 8 & 22, 43 ILM 1249 (2004) 131, 214, 333
- Partial Award: Western Front, Aerial Bombardment and Related Claims. Eritrea's Claims 1, 3, 5, 9–13, 14, 21, 25 & 26, Eritrea Ethiopia Claims Commission, 12 December 2005 129, 205, 318
- Prosecutor v. Blaškić, IT-95-14-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 29 July 2004 318, 328–9, 346
- Prosecutor v. Blaškić, IT-95-14-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 3 March 2000 321, 332–3, 344–5, 347, 350
- Prosecutor v. Brđjanin, IT-99-36-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 1 September 2004 320–1, 344, 347, 350–1
- Prosecutor v. Delalić, Mucić, Delić and Landžo (Čelebići case), IT-96-21-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 20 February 2001 283
- Prosecutor v. Galić, IT-98-29-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 5 December 2003 328–30, 346

- Prosecutor v. Hadžihasanović and Kubura, IT-01-47-AR73.3, Appeals Chamber Decision on Joint Defence Interlocutory Appeal of Trial Chamber Decision on Rule 98 *bis* Motions for Acquittal, 11 March 2005 324–5, 337, 343, 349
- Prosecutor v. Jokić, IT-01-42/1-S, Trial Chamber Sentencing Judgment, 18 March 2004 183, 281, 344, 347–8
- Prosecutor v. Kordić and Čerkez, IT-95-14/2-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 14 December 2004 101, 210–11
- Prosecutor v. Kordić and Čerkez, IT-95-14/2-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 26 February 2001 127, 158–9, 321, 332–3, 344–5, 347, 350–1
- Prosecutor v. Krstić, IT-98-33-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 19 April 2004 356
- Prosecutor v. Krstić, IT-98-33-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 2 August 2001 355–6
- Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Kovač and Vuković, IT-96-23 & IT-96-23/1-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 12 June 2002 99, 350, 352–3
- Prosecutor v. Kupreškić and others, IT-95-16-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 14 January 2000 330–1
- Prosecutor v. Naletilić and Martinović, IT-98-34-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 31 March 2003 321, 332–3, 339–40, 344–5, 347, 351
- Prosecutor v. Plavšić, IT-00-39 & 40/1-S, Trial Chamber Sentencing Judgment, 27 February 2003 348, 351
- Prosecutor v. Rutaganda, ICTR-96-3-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 26 May 2003 99
- Prosecutor v. Strugar, Jokić and others, IT-01-42-AR72, Appeals Chamber Decision on Interlocutory Appeal, 22 November 2002 318, 343
- Prosecutor v. Strugar, IT-01-42-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 31 January 2005 127, 183, 190, 210, 217, 227–8, 232, 281, 312, 321, 325, 333, 343–8
- Prosecutor v. Tadić, IT-94-1, Appeals Chamber Decision on Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction, 2 October 1995, 99, 324–5, 328–9, 333–4, 338–9
- Prosecutor v. Tadić, IT-94-1-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment, 15 July 1999 282–3, 353
- Prosecutor v. Tadić, IT-94-1-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 7 May 1997 346, 350–2
- Queensland v. Commonwealth of Australia, 90 ILR 115 (1988) 312
- Reservations to the Convention on Genocide, Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1951, p. 15 354
- Richardson v. Forestry Commission, 90 ILR 58 (1988) 312



- Rights of Nationals of the United States of America in Morocco (France v. United States of America), ICJ Reports 1952, p. 176    109
- Rosenberg v. Fischer, 15 ILR 467 (1948)    83
- Ruidi and Maches v. Military Court of Hebron, 24(2) PD 419 (1970)    342
- Sansolini v. Bentivegna, 24 ILR 986 (1957)    80
- Serbian Loans, PCIJ Reports Series A Nos. 20/21 (1929)    150
- Shikhrur v. Military Commander of the Judea and Samaria Region, 44(2) PD 233 (1990)    341
- Temple of Preah Vihear (Cambodia v. Thailand), Merits, ICJ Reports 1962, p. 6    150
- The Marquis de Somerueles, Stewart's Vice-Admiralty Reports (Nova Scotia) 482 (1813)    16, 40
- The S.S. 'Lotus' (France v. Turkey), PCIJ Reports Series A No. 10 (1927) 276, 284
- Trial of Karl Lingens, 9 LRTWC 67 (1947)    89
- US v. List (Hostages case), 11 TWC 757 (1948)    90
- US v. Ohlendorf (Einsatzgruppen case), 4 TWC 1 (1948)    89–90

## Table of treaties and other international instruments

- 1874    Draft International Regulations on the Laws and Customs of War (Brussels Declaration)    18–23, 27
- 1899    Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land annexed to Convention concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land    22, 27
- 1907    Convention concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land  
Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land annexed to Convention concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land (Hague Rules)    5, 22–39, 43–7, 55–6, 63, 74, 83–4, 88–9, 91, 95, 97, 101–2, 126–7, 130–1, 133–6, 317, 321, 323, 326, 331–2, 336–40, 342, 359  
Convention concerning Bombardment by Naval Forces in Time of War    22, 24, 45–7, 56, 117
- 1923    Hague Draft Rules of Air Warfare    44–51, 56–8, 64–5, 131, 204
- 1935    Treaty on the Protection of Artistic and Scientific Institutions and Historic Monuments (Roerich Pact)    51–2, 95, 102, 114, 117, 218, 223, 226, 232, 255, 320
- 1938    Preliminary Draft International Convention for the Protection of Historic Buildings and Works of Art in Times of War    53–61, 80, 93–5, 101, 140–1, 151, 195  
Regulations for the Execution of the Preliminary Draft International Convention for the Protection of Historic Buildings and Works of Art in Times of War    54, 58–9
- 1943    Inter-Allied Declaration Against Acts of Dispossession Committed in Territories Under Enemy Occupation or Control    77, 82
- 1945    Charter of the International Military Tribunal, Nuremberg annexed to Agreement by the Government of the United

- Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the Government of the United States of America, the Provisional Government of the French Republic and the Government of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics for the Prosecution and Punishment of the Major War Criminals of the European Axis 88, 336, 348–51
- Constitution of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation 92, 139, 176, 178, 184–7, 236–7, 291
- 1947 Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of Specialized Agencies 171
- 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide 95, 353–6
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights 305
- 1949 Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (Geneva Convention I) 4, 96–8, 119, 148, 166–7, 182, 190, 195, 197, 202–4, 221, 224–5, 228–9, 233, 245, 276, 284, 294–5, 302, 304, 324
- Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea (Geneva Convention II) 4, 96–8, 119, 148, 166–7, 182, 190, 195, 197, 202–4, 221, 224–5, 228–9, 233, 245, 276, 284, 294–5, 302, 304, 324
- Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Geneva Convention III) 4, 96–8, 119, 148, 166–7, 182, 190, 195, 197, 202–4, 221, 224–5, 229, 233, 245, 276, 284, 294–5, 302, 304, 324
- Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Geneva Convention IV) 4, 96–8, 119, 130–1, 133, 148, 166–7, 182, 190, 195, 197, 202–4, 221, 224–5, 228–9, 233–4, 245, 276, 284, 294–5, 302, 304, 324, 331, 339, 341
- 1954 Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 92–198, 200–2, 204–5, 208–14, 217, 219, 221, 223–4, 226–7, 229–32, 234–5, 302–4, 310, 316–27, 331–6, 338–41, 348, 357–9
- Regulations for the Execution of the Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 93, 115, 117, 119–20, 163–72, 237, 289–90

- (First) Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 3, 94, 132, 172, 174, 179, 182, 187, 195–201, 234, 250, 260–1, 267, 342
- Final Act of the Intergovernmental Conference on the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 99, 115–16, 176, 179
- Draft Code of Offences against the Peace and Security of Mankind 95
- 1956 Draft Rules for the Limitation of the Dangers incurred by the Civilian Population in Time of War 131, 200
- Recommendation on International Principles Applicable to Archaeological Excavations 138, 261–2
- 1958 Geneva Convention on the Continental Shelf 127
- 1966 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination 310
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 277, 306–7, 310
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 305–10
- 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 106, 108–9, 126, 147, 189, 227, 232, 242–3, 245, 285
- 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property 3, 260–1, 314–16, 342–3, 357
- 1972 Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage 108, 223, 226, 248–9, 265–6, 268, 288–94, 310–14, 348, 357
- 1977 Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts 4, 100, 128, 132, 148, 202–35, 251–9, 272–7, 282, 284, 286, 294, 299, 302–3, 316, 318–20, 323, 327–31, 334–5, 345
- Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts 4, 202–3, 229–35, 245–6, 251, 253, 255–6, 272–3, 294, 299, 303, 324–6, 328, 330, 333–4, 337

- 1980 Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Mines, Booby-Traps and Other Devices to the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May be Deemed to be Excessively Injurious or to have Indiscriminate Effects 302–4, 318–19, 328
- 1993 Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia 274, 281–3, 332, 336–7, 345–7, 349–52, 354
- 1994 Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda 281–3, 350–2, 354
- 1996 Amended Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Mines, Booby-Traps and Other Devices to the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May be Deemed to be Excessively Injurious or to have Indiscriminate Effects 304–5, 318–19, 328  
Draft Code of Crimes Against the Peace and Security of Mankind 354–5
- 1998 Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court 128, 190, 281–2, 322, 324–6, 328–9, 332–3, 337–8, 344–7, 349–52, 355, 360
- 1999 Second Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 108, 139, 234, 236–301, 317, 322, 325–6, 328–31, 333–5, 343, 360  
Final Act of the Diplomatic Conference on the Second Protocol to the Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 243, 285
- 2001 Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 148, 295
- 2002 Statute of the Special Court for Sierra Leone 281
- 2003 UNESCO Declaration concerning the Intentional Destruction of Cultural Heritage 356–9  
Agreement between the United Nations and the Royal Government of Cambodia concerning the Prosecution under Cambodian Law of Crimes Committed During the Period of Democratic Kampuchea 193, 350, 356
- 2004 UNESCO-Italy Joint Declaration for the Safeguarding, Rehabilitation and Protection of Cultural and Natural Heritage  
Statute of the Iraqi Special Tribunal 292

## List of abbreviations

AD	<i>Annual Digest of Public International Law Cases</i>
AIDI	<i>Annuaire de l'Institut de Droit International</i>
AJIL	<i>American Journal of International Law</i>
AJIL Supp.	<i>Supplement to the American Journal of International Law</i>
BFSP	<i>British and Foreign State Papers</i>
BYIL	<i>British Yearbook of International Law</i>
CICI	Commission Internationale de Coopération Intellectuelle (International Commission on Intellectual Co-operation)
Dept St. Bull.	<i>Department of State Bulletin</i>
EJIL	<i>European Journal of International Law</i>
FRUS	<i>Foreign Relations of the United States</i>
ICA	International Council on Archives
ICBS	International Committee of the Blue Shield
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCROM	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICOM	International Council of Museums
ICOMOS	International Council on Museums and Sites
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IFLA	International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions
IICI	Institut International de Coopération Intellectuelle (International Institute for Intellectual Co-operation)
IMT	International Military Tribunal

IRRC	<i>International Review of the Red Cross</i>
Isr. LR	<i>Israel Law Review</i>
Isr. YHR	<i>Israel Yearbook on Human Rights</i>
J. Air L.	<i>Journal of Air Law</i>
JNA	<i>Jugoslovenska Narodna Armija (Yugoslav National Army)</i>
JORF	<i>Journal Officiel de la République Française</i>
LNOJ	<i>League of Nations Official Journal</i>
LNTS	<i>League of Nations Treaty Series</i>
LRTWC	<i>Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals</i>
MFA&A	<i>Monuments, Fine Arts and Antiquities</i>
NOB	<i>Nederlandsche Oudheidkundige Bond (Netherlands Archaeological Society)</i>
Mich. LR	<i>Michigan Law Review</i>
OIM	<i>Office International des Musées (International Museums Office)</i>
RAF	<i>Royal Air Force</i>
RCADI	<i>Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International</i>
RDI	<i>Revue de Droit International</i>
RDI (Paris)	<i>Revue de Droit International (Paris)</i>
RDI (2 sér.)	<i>Revue de Droit International (2ème série)</i>
RDI (3 sér.)	<i>Revue de Droit International (3ème série)</i>
RDPMDG	<i>Revue de Droit Pénal Militaire et Droit de la Guerre</i>
RGDIP	<i>Revue Générale de Droit International Public</i>
RHDI	<i>Revue Hellénique de Droit International</i>
RICR	<i>Revue Internationale de la Croix-Rouge</i>
Riv. Dir. Int.	<i>Rivista di Diritto Internazionale</i>
TWC	<i>Trials of War Criminals before the Nuernberg Military Tribunals</i>
UN	<i>United Nations</i>
UNESCO	<i>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</i>
UNTS	<i>United Nations Treaty Series</i>
UNWCC	<i>United Nations War Crimes Commission</i>
USAAF	<i>United States Army Air Forces</i>

# Contents

	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page ix
	<i>Table of cases</i>	x
	<i>Table of treaties and other international instruments</i>	xiv
	<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xviii
	<b>Prologue</b>	1
1	<b>From the high Renaissance to the Hague Rules</b>	5
	The classical law	5
	The French Revolution, the Napoleonic Wars and the nineteenth century	13
	The Hague Rules	22
2	<b>1914 to 1954</b>	35
	The First World War	36
	The inter-war years	44
	The Second World War	61
3	<b>The 1954 Hague Convention and First Hague Protocol</b>	92
	Preamble	94
	Scope of application	96
	General provisions regarding protection	100
	Special protection	140
	Transport of cultural property	162
	Execution of the Convention	165
	Special agreements	195
	The First Protocol	195



<b>4</b>	<b>The 1977 Additional Protocols</b>	<b>202</b>
	Additional Protocol I	203
	Additional Protocol II	229
	The role of the ICRC	234
<b>5</b>	<b>The 1999 Second Hague Protocol</b>	<b>236</b>
	Relationship to the Convention	242
	Scope of application	245
	General provisions regarding protection	248
	Enhanced protection	263
	Penal sanctions	274
	Institutional issues	288
	Dissemination, co-operation and assistance	294
	Execution of the Protocol	297
<b>6</b>	<b>Other relevant bodies of law</b>	<b>302</b>
	Treaties	302
	Customary international law	316
	UNESCO Declaration concerning the Intentional Destruction of Cultural Heritage	356
	<b>Epilogue</b>	<b>360</b>
	<i>Bibliography</i>	362
	<i>Index</i>	393