

China's Changing Welfare Mix

Local perspectives

Edited by
**Beatriz Carrillo and
Jane Duckett**



Routledge Studies on China in Transition

China's Changing Welfare Mix

Local perspectives

Edited by
Beatriz Carrillo and
Jane Duckett



First published
2011 by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

First issued in paperback 2014

© 2011 Editorial selection and matter, Beatriz Carrillo and Jane Duckett;
individual chapters, the contributors

The right of Beatriz Carrillo and Jane Duckett to be identified as editors of
this work has been asserted by them in accordance with the Copyright,
Designs and Patent Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or
utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now
known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in
any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing
from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

China's changing welfare mix: local perspectives / edited by Beatriz Carrillo,
Jane Duckett.

p. cm. – (Routledge studies on china in transition; 37)

Includes bibliographical references.

1. Public welfare – China. 2. China – Social policy. 3. China – Economic
policy. I. Carrillo, Beatriz. II. Duckett, Jane, 1964-

HV418.C444 2011

361.951 – dc22 2010031448

ISBN 978-0-415-59731-9 (hbk)

ISBN 978-1-138-01691-0 (pbk)

Typeset in Times New Roman by Taylor & Francis Books

Figures

2.1	Financial responsibility relations between government and enterprises in the pre-reform period (urban)	21
2.2	Central–local relationships within the governmental system	25
3.1	Number of participants in the MLG (<i>dibao</i>) 1997–2007	43

Tables

2.1	Central–local division of expenditure responsibility in the tax reform of 1994	23
2.2	Key responsibility relationships	24
3.1	Cross-city comparison of MLG (<i>dibao</i>) norm and per capita GDP, 1998	42
3.2	Cross-city comparison of MLG (<i>dibao</i>) line and average wages, 1998	43
3.3	Government spending on MLG (<i>dibao</i>) as a share of total spending and GDP, 1999–2007	44
3.4	Number of participants in MLG (<i>dibao</i>) 1997–2007	44
3.5	Cross-city MLG (<i>dibao</i>) line and average disposable income, July 2002	45
3.6	Cross-city comparison of MLG (<i>dibao</i>) line and average wages, 2004	46
3.7	Cross-city MLG (<i>dibao</i>) line and average disposable income, March 2004	47
3.8	Cross-city MLG (<i>dibao</i>) line and average disposable income, September 2005	48
3.9	Interviewees' household size, <i>dibao</i> allowance and income	51
7.1	China's public education expenditure as a percentage of GDP	130
7.2	International comparison of public education expenditure as a percentage of GDP, 2003	130
7.3	Characteristics of the survey sample	136
7.4	Primary and secondary school staffing and student enrolment, Beijing and Lanzhou, 2008	137
7.5	Share of household spending on education in the previous year	138
7.6	Families reporting after-school tuition and activities (primary and secondary education students)	138
7.7	Hardship related to education for households with children studying in primary or secondary school	139
7.8	Hardship related to education for households with children studying in post-secondary education	140
7.9	Non-state educational grants in selected region, 2003	141

7.10 Education funds per student across regions, 2006	142
7.11 Allocations of places of study in Guangdong, 2003	143
7.12 Annual school fees for migrant children in the Fengtai, Haidian and Chaoyang districts of Beijing, 2002	145
8.1 Migrant employment distribution by industry sector	156
8.2 Housing characteristics	158
8.3 Satisfaction by quality	159
8.4 Housing quality and income	159
8.5 Descriptive statistics for the models	163
8.6 Housing choice logistic regression results	165
8.7 Standard for housing choice	167

China's Changing Welfare Mix

This book draws attention to two neglected areas in the growing body of research on welfare in China: subnational variation and the changing mix of state and non-state provision. The contributors to this volume demonstrate the diversity of local welfare provision that lies behind broad national policies and programmes. Their focus on local diversity is particularly relevant to understanding the welfare system in China because national state programmes are so often organized by local governments in line with the specifics of their economic and social development. At the same time that economic and social development is itself independently creating an array of different conditions that shape non-state (family, business and third sector) welfare roles.

Through chapters that draw on original research in eight provinces, the book adopts a 'local' perspective to illustrate and explain some of the transformations that are under way and discuss not only local government initiatives and programmes, but also the services and support provided by families, informal social networks and community or third sector organizations, as well as those delivered by private businesses on a commercial, for-profit basis.

This book will be of interest to students and scholars of Chinese society, social policy and Chinese studies more widely.

Beatriz Carrillo is Lecturer in Asian Studies at the University of Technology, Sydney, Australia.

Jane Duckett is Professor of Chinese and Comparative Politics at the University of Glasgow, UK.

Routledge studies on China in transition

Series Editor: David S. G. Goodman

1 The Democratisation of China

Baogang He

2 Beyond Beijing

Dali Yang

3 China's Enterprise Reform

Changing state/society relations
after Mao

You Ji

4 Industrial Change in China

Economic restructuring and
conflicting interests

Kate Hannan

5 The Entrepreneurial State in China

Real estate and commerce
departments in reform era Tianjin

Jane Duckett

6 Tourism and Modernity in China

Tim Oakes

7 Cities in Post Mao China

Recipes for economic development
in the reform era

Jae Ho Chung

8 China's Spatial Economic Development

Regional transformation in the
Lower Yangzi Delta

Andrew M. Marton

9 Regional Development in China

States, globalization and inequality

Yehua Dennis Wei

10 Grassroots Charisma

Four local leaders in China

*Stephan Feuchtwang and
Wang Mingming*

11 The Chinese Legal System

Globalization and local legal culture

Pitman B. Potter

12 Transforming Rural China

How local institutions shape
property rights in china

Chi-Jou Jay Chen

13 Negotiating Ethnicity in China

Citizenship as a response to the state

Chih-yu Shih

14 Manager Empowerment in China

Political implications of rural
industrialisation in the reform era

Ray Yep

15 Cultural Nationalism in Contemporary China

The search for national identity
under reform

Yingjie Guo

16 Elite Dualism and Leadership Selection in China

Xiaowei Zang

17 Chinese Intellectuals between State and Market

Edward Gu and Merle Goldman

18 China, Sex and Prostitution

Elaine Jeffreys

**19 The Development of China's
Stockmarket, 1984–2002**

Equity politics and market
institutions

Stephen Green

20 China's Rational Entrepreneurs

The development of the new private
business sector

Barbara Krug

21 China's Scientific Elite

Cong Cao

22 Locating China

Jing Wang

**23 State and Laid-Off Workers in
Reform China**

The silence and collective action of
the retrenched

Yongshun Cai

24 Translocal China

Linkages, identities and the
reimagining of space

Tim Oakes and Louisa Schein

**25 International Aid and China's
Environment**

Taming the yellow dragon

Katherine Morton

26 Sex and Sexuality in China

Edited by Elaine Jeffreys

**27 China's Reforms and
International Political Economy**

*Edited by David Zweig and
Chen Zhimin*

28 Ethnicity and Urban Life in China

A comparative study of Hui
Muslims and Han Chinese

Xiaowei Zang

29 China's Urban Space

Development under market
socialism

*T.G. McGee, George C.S. Lin, Mark
Y.L. Wang, Andrew M. Marton and
Jiaping Wu*

30 China's Embedded Activism

Opportunities and constraints of a
social movement

*Edited by Richard Louis Edmonds
and Peter Ho*

**31 Marketization and Democracy
in China**

Jianjun Zhang

32 The Chinese State in Transition

Processes and contests in local China

Edited by Linda Chelan Li

33 China's Governmentalities

Governing change, changing
government

Edited by Elaine Jeffreys

34 China's Cotton Industry

Economic transformation and state
capacity

Björn Alpermann

35 Serious Crime in China

Policing and politics

Susan Trevaskes

**36 The Chinese State's Retreat
from Health**

Policy and the politics of
retrenchment

Jane Duckett

37 China's Changing Welfare Mix

Local perspectives

*Edited by Beatriz Carrillo and
Jane Duckett*

Contributors

Anna Boermel is Research and Teaching Fellow in Contemporary Chinese Society at the University of Cambridge. Trained in Chinese Studies and Social Anthropology at the University of Oxford, she has conducted fieldwork in urban China and Taiwan on law, science, governance, sexuality and ageing. She is currently revising her manuscript on the politics of old age in urban China.

Beatriz Carrillo is lecturer in Asian Studies at the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS) and a member of the UTS China Research Centre. She researches social change in contemporary China and is currently working on two projects: one on problems of health-care provision; the other on the evolution of the interaction between the new rich and the state. Her book *Small Town China: Rural labour and social inclusion* is also published by Routledge (2011).

Sarah Cook is Head of the United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) and a former Research Fellow at the Institute of Development Studies at the University of Sussex. From 2000 to 2006 she was a Programme Officer with the Ford Foundation in Beijing. Her research addresses issues related to the social impacts of economic reform in China, including issues of social policy, employment and gender. She recently directed a multi-country research programme on 'Social Protection in Asia' and is engaged in comparative research on informal employment in China and India. Recent publications include papers on social policy in East Asia, rural health reform in China and social protection.

Jane Duckett is Professor of Chinese and Comparative Politics at the University of Glasgow. She has recently completed a book, *The Chinese State's Retreat from Health: Policy and the Politics of Retrenchment* (Routledge, 2010), and has published papers on China's health reforms, unemployment policies and social welfare in such journals as *The China Quarterly*, *Pacific Review* and *Social Policy and Administration*.

Mark Duda is an independent scholar specializing in public policy aspects of homeownership and the single family mortgage market in the US and China. Mark is a Research Affiliate of the Harvard Joint Center for Housing Studies, where he previously held positions as a Research Analyst and Research Fellow.

Karen R. Fisher is Associate Professor at the Social Policy Research Centre, University of New South Wales, Sydney. Her research interests are the organization of social services in Australia and China, including disability and mental health services and community care; participatory evaluation methodology; and social policy process.

Xinping Guan is the head and Professor at the Department of Social Work and Social Policy, Nankai University, China. His main research areas are poverty and social policy, mainly social assistance. His main research topics in recent years include China's social policy transition in the background of globalization, poverty and social assistance in urban and rural China. He is the author of *Urban Poverty in China* (1999), *Introduction to Social Policy* (2003, 2008), and many papers published within and outside China.

Daniel R. Hammond recently gained his PhD at the University of Glasgow. His research interests include social assistance policy in China and theories of the policy process.

Bingqin Li is a Lecturer in Social Policy at London School of Economics. She is also a research associate of CASE (The Centre for Analyses of Social Exclusion) at LSE. Her research is focused on social policies in China. The main string of research includes social exclusion faced by rural to urban migrants, long-term unemployed people and informally employed people. She has also worked on the relationship between urbanization and social policy changes and the relationship between fiscal reform, urban governance and social policy.

Jieyu Liu is an Academic Fellow in the White Rose East Asia Centre, University of Leeds. She is the author of *Gender and Work in Urban China: Women Workers of the Unlucky Generation* (Routledge 2007) and the co-editor of *East Asian Sexualities: Modernity, Gender and New Sexual Cultures* (Zed Books, 2008). She is interested in gender, sexuality, work and organization, and labour-market changes, and is currently working on a project examining the sexualization and aestheticization of white-collar work in urban China.

Anna Lora-Wainwright is a University Lecturer in the Human Geography of China, School of Geography and School of Interdisciplinary Area Studies, University of Oxford. Her research concerns perceptions of health and health-care provision and, more recently, their interplay with experiences of environmental pollution in the Chinese countryside. Her forthcoming

monograph offers a bottom-up account of how families strive to make sense of cancer and to care for sufferers in the context of changing social and economic relations in contemporary rural China.

Ka Ho Mok is Chair Professor of Comparative Policy and Co-Director of the Centre for Governance and Citizenship at the Hong Kong Institute of Education. He has researched and published extensively in comparative education and policy studies in East Asia and Contemporary China. He is also Editor of *Journal of Asian Public Policy* (Routledge) and Book Series Editor of *Comparative Development and Policy in Asia* (Routledge).

Xiaoyuan Shang is a Senior Research Fellow in the Social Policy Research Centre, University of New South Wales. She specializes in research about the social welfare provision to orphans, and other vulnerable children, people with a disability and older people in China.

Dorothy J. Solinger is Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Irvine. She is beginning a project on the urban poor and the state's treatment of them. Her most recent publication is *States' Gains, Labor's Losses: China, France and Mexico Choose Global Liasons* (Cornell University Press, 2009).

Yu Cheung Wong is Assistant Professor in the Department of Social Work and Social Administration, University of Hong Kong. His major research interests are digital inclusion, social welfare and education in China. He is also Programme Leader of the Master of Social Work programme at the University of Hong Kong.

Jiawen Xie is a doctoral student at Beijing Normal University. Her research interests are in the experiences and welfare status of children with disabilities in rural China.

Bing Xu is a PhD candidate at the Department of Social Work and Social Policy, Nankai University, China. Her academic area is China's social policy, particularly its social assistance and child welfare.

Acknowledgements

This book grew out of a workshop held in late October 2008 at Nankai University in Tianjin. The workshop was jointly organized by the China Research Centre of the University of Technology Sydney (UTS), the Scottish Centre for Chinese Social Science Research (based at the University of Glasgow), and the Department of Social Work and Social Policy at Nankai University. We are grateful to Louise Edwards, Director of the China Research Centre at UTS for supporting the workshop, and to its administrator, Claire Moore, for her hard highly efficient work organizing it. We are equally grateful to Nankai University, our hosts, and to all the colleagues and students in the Department of Social Work and Social Policy, led by Professor Xinping Guan, for all the work they put into its smooth running. Finally, we would like to thank all those who participated in the workshop for their very valuable contributions as discussants and paper givers, and for lively discussions around all the papers. Notably, David S.G. Goodman provided sound guidance and, along with Tim Oakes, Louisa Schein, Sun Wanning and Carolyn Cartier, brought wisdom and experience from long leadership of and involvement in Provincial China workshops. We would also like to thank the contributors to this book for so quickly and professionally revising their papers and so enabling a speedy publication. Finally, we are grateful to Sarah Cook for both her valuable contribution to the workshop discussions and for agreeing to write this book's concluding chapter.

In organizing the workshop and producing this book, our aim has been to draw attention to two relatively neglected areas in the growing body of research on welfare in China: sub-national variation and the changing mix of state and non-state provision. We wanted to highlight the local, or sub-national, variation that lies behind broad national policies and programmes, and that is growing from divergent local government and non-state activities. In doing this, we hoped to contribute to the 'localizing' project pioneered for over a decade at UTS through a series of annual Provincial China workshops and publications. But we also felt this approach to be particularly relevant to understanding welfare provision in China because national state programmes are so often organized by local governments in line with the specifics of their economic and social development, while at the same time that social and

economic development itself is independently creating differential conditions for non-state (family, business and third sector) provision.

In organizing the workshop we hoped to develop understanding not only of welfare provision but also of people's 'responses' to any gaps in state or societal programmes. As Sarah Cook rightly notes in her chapter, this tends to lead us to focus on the weaknesses in the state system and the problems people in China face as they experience both industrialization and marketization. She is right to point to the many signs of progress and the commitment of people within and outside the Chinese state to tackling problems and meeting the needs of the most vulnerable. We think, too, that many of the contributions to this volume are valuable not just for giving us insights into the local welfare picture across China but also for their revealing portrayals of ordinary people and the stoicism, persistence and initiative with which they face often difficult circumstances, as well as the generosity, compassion and dedication they bring to helping others. We hope that together these nuanced accounts contribute to understanding China as it is experienced locally by its people, and that in doing so this book might in some small way contribute to developing new means of identifying and assisting those least able to cope with the upheavals of rapid economic and social change.

Jane Duckett
Beatriz Carrillo
Glasgow and Sydney
June 2010

Glossary of Chinese terms

Pinyin terms are in bold, followed by the English translation.

chengzhen zhigong jiben yiliao baoxian urban employee basic medical insurance

hezuo yiliao zhidu cooperative medical system (CMS)

jiedao banshichu neighbourhood office, or street office

san wu ‘Three Nos’

shehui baoxian social insurance

shehui baozhang social security

shehui fuli social welfare

shehui jiuji social assistance

shequ community

shiye baoxian unemployment insurance

wubaohu ‘Five Guarantee Households’

yanglao baoxian old-age insurance

zuidi shenghuo baozhang (dibao) ‘Minimum Livelihood Guarantee’ (MLG)



Map 1.1 Provincial-level administrative divisions of the People's Republic of China (PRC)

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	ix
<i>List of tables</i>	x
<i>List of contributors</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>Glossary of Chinese terms</i>	xvii
<i>Map of the provincial-level administrative divisions of the People's Republic of China</i>	xviii
1 China's changing welfare mix: introducing the local perspective JANE DUCKETT AND BEATRIZ CARRILLO	1
2 Central–local relations in social policy and the development of urban and rural social assistance programmes XINPING GUAN AND BING XU	20
3 <i>Dibaohu</i> in distress: the meagre minimum livelihood guarantee system in Wuhan DOROTHY J. SOLINGER	36
4 Local variation in urban social assistance: community public service agencies in Dalian DANIEL R. HAMMOND	64
5 Life goes on: redundant women workers in Nanjing JIEYU LIU	82
6 ‘If you can walk and eat, you don’t go to hospital’: the quest for healthcare in rural Sichuan ANNA LORA-WAINWRIGHT	104
7 Regional disparities and educational inequalities: city responses and coping strategies KA HO MOK AND YU CHEUNG WONG	126