# REMEDIES IN INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

SECOND EDITION

DINAH SHELTON

# Remedies in International Human Rights Law

Second Edition

DINAH SHELTON



#### OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© D. Shelton, 2005

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence

Number C01P0000148 with the permission of HMSO

and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2005

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Shelton, Dinah.

Remedies in international human rights law / Dinah Shelton. —2nd ed. p. cm.

Includes index

ISBN 0-19-927008-2

 Human rights. 2. Remedies (Law) I. Title. K3240.S53 2005

341.4'8-dc22

2004030776

Typeset by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd., Chennai, India Printed in Great Britain on acid-free paper by Biddles Ltd., King's Lynn

ISBN 0-19-927008-2 (Hbk.)

1 3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

#### REMEDIES IN INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

For Chris, Philip and Elizabeth

此为试读,需要完整PDF请访问: www.ertongbook.com

### Preface to the Second Edition

During the five years since the first edition of this book appeared, attention to its subject matter has substantially increased and there have been extraordinary developments in the remedial jurisprudence of national and international tribunals. States and numerous non-governmental organizations have participated in United Nations efforts to develop principles and guidelines on reparations for gross and systematic violations of human rights. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, with its provisions for victim reparations, has entered into force. The International Law Commission completed its work on the law of state responsibility, including a chapter on reparations. The 2001 World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, convened in Durban by the United Nations, brought to the forefront demands for reparations for the transatlantic slave trade and colonialism. National courts increasingly hear claims for redress brought not only by victims of recent human rights abuses but also by those who have suffered from unrepaired historical injustices. Some national courts, in particular, those of South Africa and India, have made pioneering decisions on the justiciability and redress of violations of economic and social rights. The African Human Rights Commission and Inter-American Court have also addressed this topic. The UN Compensation Commission has almost completed its work on redress for injuries resulting from the Iraqi invasion of Kuwait. The case load of all human rights tribunals unceasingly increases, and has led the European Court of Human Rights fundamentally to change its practice on just satisfaction, after an invitation to do so by the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers. This second edition aims to take into account these developments as well as the constructive remarks of readers and reviewers of the earlier version.

The book originally emerged from discussions about human rights complaint procedures in courses and seminars over a number of years. Students often asked what redress applicants can expect to receive as a result of presenting international claims. The question became a research project that turned into a law review article that evolved into the book. During the research and writing, many persons have assisted by providing materials, discussing issues and criticizing drafts. Without them the book could not have been completed. Barbara Fontana did the first seminar paper and law review comment on damages in the European human rights system in 1991. John Blakeley, Joseph Broussard, Willem Gravett, and Paul Simo provided valuable student assistance in preparing the first edition. I am particularly grateful to those in the various international organizations who answered endless questions and were patient and unstinting with their time. At the Council of Europe, my thanks go to Hans Christian Kruger, Herbert Petzold, Michael O'Boyle, Caroline Ravaud, and the judges of the European Court who discussed the procedures and approaches to remedies in the European system. In the Inter-American system, Jorge Taiana, Robert Goldman, Domingo Azcevedo, David Padilla, Elizabeth Abi-Mershed, Pablo Savaadra, and Christina Cerna were extremely helpful. Manuel E. Ventura-Robles was always responsive to requests for documents from the Inter-American Court. Emmanuel Dankwa, Isaac Nguema, Germain Baricako, and Julia Harrington at the African Commission assisted with information on developments in the African system. A special debt is owed to the late Richard Lillich who insisted that I write this book and to Alexandre Kiss who insisted that I finish it. Finally, I would like to express gratitude to the American Society of International Law, which awarded the first edition its Certificate of Merit in 2000.

## Table of Treaties and Other International Documents

1648 Treaty of Westphalia400
1794 Jay Treaty56
1814 Treaty of Peace, 24 Dec., Gr. Brit–U.S., 63 Consol. T.S. 421
1862 Treaty for the Suppression of the African Slave Trade, 7 Apr., T.S. No. 126
1885 General Act of the Conference of Berlin Concerning the Congo, 26 Feb., 10 Martens (ser. 2) 414
1899 Hague Convention II with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War By Land, 29 July
1890 General Act for the Repression of the African Slave Trade, 2 July, T.S No. 383
1902 Convention concerning the Rights of Aliens, 29 Jan., 190 Consol.T.S
1904 International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, 18 May, 1 L.N.T.S. 83
1907 Hague Convention (IV) concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land, 18 Oct., 205 Consol.T.S
1910 International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, 4 May, 211 Consol, T.S. 45, 103 BFSP
1914  Treaty for the Settlement of Disputes that May Occur Between the United States and Chile, 24 July 1914, T.S. No. 621
1919 To an f Page of Variables 28 Iune 225 Consul T.S. 189 400, 431, 44

1920
Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Turkey (Treaty of Sèvres), 10 Aug. 1920
1926
Convention to Suppress the Slave Trade and Slavery, 60 L.N.T.S. 253
1928
General Act on Arbitration, Hudson, Int'l Adjudication (1931) 2529191
1933
Convention on the Rights and Duties of States, Montevideo, 26 Dec. 1933
1945
United Nations Charter, 26 June 1945, 59 Stat.1031, T.S. 993, 3 Bevans 1153
231109-0111-2121-2121-2121-2121-2121-2121-
1948
Charter of the Organization of American States, 30 Apr. 1948, 2 U.S.T. 2394, U.N.T.S. 48
American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man, 2 May 1948, O.A.S.
Res. XXX, O.A.S. Off. Rec. OEA/Ser.L/V/I.4 Rev. (1965)
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide,
9 Dec. 1948, 78 U.N.T.S. 277
UN Doc. A/810 at 71 (1948)
1949
Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and the Sick in
Armed Forces in the Field, 6 U.S.T. 3114, T.I.A.S. 3363, 75 U.N.T.S. 31
Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and
Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea, 6 U.S.T. 3217, T.I.A.S. 3363, 75 U.N.T.S 135
Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 6 U.S.T. 3316,
T.I.A.S. 3364, 75 U.N.T.S. 135
6 U.S.T. 3516, T.I.A.S. 3365, 75 U.N.T.S. 287
Statute of the Council of Europe, 5 May 1949, Europ. T.S. No. 1
1950
United States-Panama, 26 Jan. 1950, 1 U.S.T. 685, T.I.A.S. No. 2129,
132 U.N.T.S. 233
European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental
Freedoms, 4 Nov. 1950, E.T.S. 5, 213 U.N.T.S. 221
Protocol 7, E.T.S. 117
Protocol 9, E.T.S. 140
Protocol No. 11, E.T.S. No. 155

1951
Treaty of Peace with Japan, 8 Sept. 1951
1952
Treaty between the Federal Republic of Germany and Israel, 162 U.N.T.S. 265
1954
Hague Convention on the Protection of Cultural Property during Armed Conflict, 249 U.N.T.S. 240
1955
Treaty of Amity, Economic Relations, and Consular Rights (US–Iran), 15 Aug. 1955, 8 U.S.T. 899, T.I.A.S. No. 3853, 284 U.N.T.S 93 122
1958
ILO Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention No. 111
1959
Norway–Federal Republic of Germany, 7 Aug. 1959, 358 U.N.T.S. 185
1960
France–Federal Republic of Germany, 15 July 1960 (1961) 88 J. du Droit Int'l 1200
1961
European Social Charter, 18 Oct. 1961, E.T.S. No. 35
1964
United Kingdom–Federal Republic of Germany, 9 June 1964, G.B.T.S. No. 42 (Cmnd. 2445), 539 U.N.T.S. 187.
Sweden–Federal Republic of Germany, 3 Aug. 1964, [1964] S.O.No. 58
1965
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 21 Dec. 1965, 660 U.N.T.S. 195, (1966) 5 I.L.M.352
575 U.N.T.S. 159
1966
Great Britain–Indonesia, 1 Dec. 1966, G.B.T.S. No. 34 (Cmnd. 3277), 606 U.N.T.S. 125 57 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 16 Dec. 1966,
999 U.N.T.S. 171, (1967) 6 I.L.M. 368
16 Dec. 1966, 999 U.N.T.S. 171, (1967) 6 I.L.M. 383
993 U.N.T.S. 3, (1967) 6 I.L.M. 360
1967
Economic and Social Council Resolution 1235 (XLII), 6 June 1967, 42 U.N. ESCOR,

1968
European Convention on Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters, 27 Sept. OJ 1998 C 27/1
1969
American Convention on Human Rights, 22 Nov. 1969, OEA/ser.L/V/II.23,
Doc. 21, rev. 6 (1979), O.A.S.T.S. No. 36
1970
Procedure for Dealing with Communications Relating to Violations of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 27 May 1970, E.S.C. Res. 1503 (XLVIII), 48 U.N. ESCOR, Supp. (No. 1A) 8, U.N. Doc. E/4832/Add.1 (1970)
1971
Resolution on War Criminals, G.A. Res. 2840 (XXVI), 26 GAOR Supp. (No. 29), U.N. Doc. A/8429 (1971)
1976
OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises
1977
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of August 12, 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts, June 8, 1977, 1977 U.N. Jurid. Y.B. 95, (1977), 16 I.L.M. 1391
1979
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women,
Dec. 18, 1979, U.N.G.A. Res. 34/180 (XXXIV), 34 U.N. GAOR, Supp. (No. 46) 194, U.N. Doc. A/34/830 (1979), (1980) 19 I.L.M. 33 105, 115, 118
1981
African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights, 27 June 1981, O.A.U.  Doc. CAB/LEG/67/3 Rev. 5, (1982) 21 LL.M. 58
1982
United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, U.N. Doc. A/CONF.62/122, (1982) 321 I.L.M. 1261
1983
European Convention on the Compensation of Victims of Violent Crimes, 23 Nov. 1983, E.T.S. 116 (1983)
1984
Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment, 10 Dec., U.N. G.A. 39/46 Annex, 39 U.N. GAOR, Supp. (No. 51) 197, U.N. Doc. A/39/51 at 197, (1984) 23 I.L.M. 1027 105, 115–16, 394

Council of Europe, Recommendation No. R(84) 15 on Public Liability, Committee of Ministers, 18 Sept
1985
Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture, 9 Dec. 1985 O.A.S. T.S. 67
1987
European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 26 Nov. 1987, E.T.S. 126
1988
Additional Protocol to the American Convention in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, O.A.S.T.S. 69
1989
Convention Concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries, I.L.O. No. 169, 27 June 1989, (1989) 28 I.L.M. 1382
Study concerning the Right to Restitution, Compensation and Rehabilitation for Victims of Gross Violations of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Preliminary Report submitted by Theodoor van Boven, Special Rapporteur, E/CN.4/Sub.2/1990/10
1991
U.N. Security Council Resolution 687 of 3 Apr. 1991, on the Establishment of the United Nations Compensation Commission, (1991) 30 I.L.M. 864
1992
Treaty on European Union, (Maastricht) 7 Feb. 1992, (1992) 31 I.L.M. 247
1993
North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation, (1993) 32 I.L.M. 1480

Study Concerning the Right to Restitution, Compensation and Rehabilitation for Victims of Gross Violations of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Final Report, E/CN.4/Sub.2/1993/8
1994
Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, S.C. Res. 955, U.N. SCOR, 3453rd mtg., Annex, S/RES 955 (1994)
Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes,  Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization,
(1994) 33 ILM 1144
1995
Additional Protocol to the European Social Charter providing for a System of Collective  Complaints, E.T.S. 158
1996
Agreement between the Government of Guatemala and Unidad Revolucionaria Nacional Guatemalteca (Guatemala City, 29 Dec. 1996), (1997) 36 I.L.M. 258
Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, E/CN.4/1996/38
Question of the Impunity of Perpetrators of Violations of Human Rights (Civil and Political Rights): Final Report prepared by Mr Joinet pursuant to Sub-Commission Resolution 1995/35, Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, ESCOR, 48th Sess., Annex II, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/Sub.2/1996/18
Revised Set of Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law, E/CN.4/Sub.2/1996/17
1998
Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Establishment of an African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights, 8 June 1998, OAU Doc.
OAU/LEG/EXP/AFCHPRPROT(2)
A/CONF.183/9
38 I.L.M. 517.  General Comment to Article 19, Working Group on Involuntary or Enforced  Disappearances, E/CN.4/1998/43, 12 Jan. 1998, at 16
1999
Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment 9,
2000
Erbianian Eviroan Pusca Agramant

Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, GA Res. 54/263, Annex II, 54 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 49) at 6, U.N. Doc. A/54/49, Vol. III (2000)
CERD, General Recommendations 26 and 27 4/56/57
EC Charter of Fundamental Rights and Freedoms
Revised Set of Basic Principles on Reparations, E/CN.4/2000/63
OECD, Revised Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises
ILO, Report of the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and
Recommendations, Forced Labour Convention 1930 (No. 29), Observations 2000 438
2001
ILC Articles on State Responsibility
World War II, 18 Jan., 2001 WL 416465
UN, Report of the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination,
Xenophobia and Related Intolerance
2003
Norms on the Responsibility of Transnational Corporations and other Business
Enterprises with Regard to Human Rights, E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/Rev. 2,
26 Aug. 2003
2004
CCPR, General Comment 31 on State Obligations
UN Study on Best Practices to Combat Impunity

# Table of National Laws

Albania Law No. 7748 (29 July 1992) on Former Victims of Persecution	4
	2
Argentina Civil Code	7 2 2
Austria Act for Payment of Assistance to Victims of Crime, 1972	6
Belgium Civil Code3	6
Botswana Citizenship Act of 1984	4
Brazil Civil Code4	2
Bulgaria Act on Obligations and Contracts, 1950	8
Chile       41         Constitution       41         Decree Law 2.191 of 18 Apr. 1978       39         Law 19.123 of 31 Jan. 1992       424, 44         Law 19.128 of 7 Feb. 1992       42         Law 19.074 of 28 Aug. 1991       42	7 9 5
China Administrative Suits Act	7
Colombia Law 104 of 30 Dec. 1993 Law on Enforcement of Human Rights Decisions, Law No. 00288 of 18 July 1996 Penal Code 3	0

Czech Republic
Civil Code
Laws 119/1980, amended by 47/1991 and 633/1992
Ethiopia
Civil Code
Finland
State Liability Act of 1927
Law on Compensation out of Public Funds for Damages Caused by Crime, 1973
France
Code Civil, art. 1153
Law of 3 Jan. 1977 providing compensation to certain victims of bodily injury resulting
from criminal acts
Germany
Basic Law
Civil Code
Law on compensation of victims of crime, 1976
Greece
Civil Code
Honduras
Constitution of 1982
Hungary
Act XXV of 26 June 1991
Act XI of 19 Feb. 1992
Act XXXII of 12 May 1992
India
Constitution
Iraq
Civil Code
Israel
Civil Wrongs Ordinance
Japan
Constitution
Mexico
Civil Code
Federal Act for the Prevention and Punishment of Torture
Morocco
Code of Obligations and Contracts
Penal Code 26

Nepal
Constitution
New Zealand
Waikato Raupatu Claims Settlement Bill 1995
Norway
Law of Damages, 1973
punishable acts, 1976
Paraguay
Constitution
Peru
Enforcement of Human Rights Decisions, Law 23406
Philippines
Civil Code42
Poland
Civil Code
Portugal
Constitution
Romania
Constitution
South Africa
Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act, No. 34 of 1995
Sri Lanka
Constitution
Sweden
Tort Liability Act
Switzerland
Code des Obligations
Trinidad and Tobago
Constitution